Title Page

Career development at depth: a critical evaluation of career development theory from the perspective of analytical psychology

Phil McCash

A thesis submitted for the degree of PhD in Psychoanalytic Studies

Department of Psychosocial and Psychoanalytic Studies

University of Essex

Date of submission: 4th October 2017
Abstract

In this thesis, it is argued that Jungian and post-Jungian perspectives, in contrast to Freudian and Adlerian, have been neglected in classic and contemporary career development theories. This omission is addressed by undertaking a critical evaluation of career development theory in relation to analytical psychology. The primary research strategy adopted is a systematic and critical comparison of the two literatures. Canonical and contemporary texts from within career studies are selected focusing on seven areas of career theory: cultural systems; personality; career types; career strategies; narrative; life course development; and learning. These are critically evaluated using concepts from analytical psychology. Specifically, the work of Jung and post-Jungian scholars is deployed in relation to individuation and the key themes of: projection; persona; typology; archetypal image; personal myth; vocation; and transformational learning. The original contribution is a post-Jungian evaluation and re-imagination of career development theory. It is suggested that cultural career theory can be enhanced by considering the role of projection. In addition, it is argued that self-concept career theory is enriched by Jung’s structural model of the psyche; and the literature on career types can be broadened to include typology. It is further proposed that individuation offers a more critical take on career strategies; and personal myth extends the narrative turn in career studies. Finally, it is claimed that developmental theory is illuminated by an analytical psychological view of vocation; and career learning augmented by transformational learning theory. Overall, it is argued that career means to *carry life*, and through personal myth, weave together the *golden threads* that connect us all.
Appreciation

My appreciation is due to Professor Andrew Samuels and colleagues in the Department of Psychosocial and Psychoanalytic Studies at the University of Essex for providing a wonderfully creative and supportive research environment.

Dedication

I would also like to gratefully acknowledge the unflagging support of friends and family particularly Julia, Rose, and William, to whom this work is dedicated with love and thanks.
Acknowledgment

Grateful acknowledgement is extended to Adam McLean for permission to use his colour-enhanced version of an existing alchemical eagle and toad image, obtained from his website www.alchemywebsite.com (image A112).

A note on referencing style used

Standard author-year format is used for within-text citations throughout. The exceptions to this are citations from C.G. Jung’s Collected Works where, in addition to author-year, the volume number is given for clarity and ease of reference. This follows the method used by Rowland (2005).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapters</th>
<th>Page number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview, rationale, research question and method</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Critical literature review and structure</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Career, culture and systems</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Career and personality</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Career and types</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Career strategies</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Career and narrative</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Career and life course development</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Career and learning</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Conclusion</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overview, rationale, research question and method

Introduction
This chapter begins with an overview highlighting the main arguments of the thesis. In order to provide more detailed context and focus, a brief explanation of the career development profession is then provided. The role that career development theories play in the training of these and other individuals is also discussed. A problem is identified, namely, the absence of career development theory informed by analytical psychology. A research question drawing from this rationale is identified and a research strategy selected and justified. A case is made for the wider value of this work. Epistemology, reflexivity, ethics and limitations are also discussed. The chapter concludes with a synopsis of the remaining chapters.

Overview
This thesis contributes to a wider movement dedicated to democratising and sharing the insights of depth psychology with a range of communities. Specifically, it extends the range and extent of current transdisciplinary
dialogue in career studies, with a particular focus on theories of career development, by deepening and enhancing the conversation with analytical psychology. Through this, it arrives at a more critical career studies.

In a superficial sense, analytical psychology may seem like an inauspicious starting point for an enhanced understanding of career because of its reputation, sometimes deserved, for being elitist, remote, and difficult. Jung is also known for his difficulties in dealing with the world and acerbic views on conventional indicators of success. For example, he discussed his ‘fatal resistance to life in this world’ (Jung, 1961/1995, p. 24) and criticised careerists who seek organisational power and wealth (Jung, 1896/1983, p. 9; 1957, CW10, pp. 253-254). Much more significant, however, is the fact that career-related themes and examples permeate his work and the post-Jungian literature. These have been neglected in standard theories of career development. Even where analytical psychology is acknowledged, there is a marked tendency to draw from a rather restricted range of texts (see the initial critical literature review in Chapter Two for more detail). My thesis addresses this gap by offering a much deeper engagement with the Collected Works, seminars and other writings than has been the case hitherto. It advances the dialogue between analytical psychology and career studies in the following ways.

Career studies lacks a nuanced understanding of the Jungian (and most other) depictions of the unconscious. The notion of the unconscious is highly subversive of traditional dualisms in career studies (subjective and objective;
cause and effect; public and private; inside and outside; agency and structure; secular and non-secular; theory and reality). In analytical psychology, the unconscious is seen as simultaneously child-like and ancient; it is where all the possibilities of life are constantly being born, rising up, and dying. It is regarded as, ‘the mother of all possibilities’ (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 52). These aspects have obvious utility and relevance in career development.

Conceptions of career commonly employed in career studies are somewhat narrow. This is consistent with Jung’s view that there is a persistent devaluation and depreciation of the psyche in Western culture (1957, CW10, p. 271). The word history of career links with the Late Latin terms *carraria* (journey) and *carrus* (vehicle) (OED, 2002). In analytical psychology, however, the word ‘carrier’ has, via the same root, a further and radically different meaning. The individual is seen as ‘the carrier of life’ (Jung, 1955/1956/1970, CW14, p. 167); and individuation means to *carry life* and to bring it to its fullest possible expression. This brings a fresh perspective to the meaning of career and relates it directly to the purpose and goal of an individual’s existence. These aspects are considered in relation to seven inter-related themes: projection; persona; typology; archetypal images; personal myth; vocation; and transformational learning. These themes provide critical tools for understanding and re-interpreting career development theory in relation to: systems; personality; career types; career strategies; narrative; life course development; and learning. The role of theory itself, and how this is handled in career studies, is also explored. Each of these aspects is now briefly introduced.
Culture and systems

The role of culture and systems in career development has been a significant feature of the literature for many years. The role that projection may play in this, and its consequences, has not yet been fully explicated. The profoundly political nature of identification and disidentification processes significantly broadens the scope of career development theory.

Personality

Career studies lacks a nuanced understanding of the differences between personality and individuality. There is a persistent focus on matching people and occupations. Here, the key concept of persona (explained further in Chapter Four) has value in addressing and working through this long-standing difficulty in the field.

Career types

Simplified versions of typology are used in career education. These applications have become detached from the wider body of Jungian thought and, as a consequence, its true value missed. For example, career studies tends to focus on characterology whereas typology provides it with a critical psychology of cultural and epistemological significance. These and similar considerations significantly recalibrate the place of psychological type in career studies.
Career strategies

Career studies has a naïve focus on agency and recipes for career success. Its attention is directed to adaptation. In contrast, analytical psychology makes a liminal space for things to happen to individuals. There is no prescribed route for individuation to follow. Through these means, it provides an antidote to the snappy but rather mechanical success formulas found in certain branches of the literature.

Narrative

The turn to narrative in career studies has been informed by Adler’s work on guiding fictios. There has not, however, been sufficient attention paid to Jung’s notion of the personal myth. This thesis revisits the early work of both men and traces Adler’s profound influence on Jung and the ways in which the latter reworks Adler’s ideas.

Life course development

Life course development perspectives have had a deep and productive influence on career studies. Nonetheless, they are often used and applied in a linear and monolithic fashion. A career studies that engages in closer dialogue with the unconscious is well-placed to re-imagine traditional age and stage models in non-linear and pluralistic ways.

Learning

The dominance of social cognitive perspectives in career studies has resulted
in a limited understanding of learning processes. This is a pressing problem for the field as the career development profession is increasingly seeing itself in pedagogical terms. Analytical psychology has made creative and nuanced contributions to learning theory. There is a vibrant Jungian scholarship on experiential and transformative learning that can enliven and enrich understandings of how people engage in career-related learning.

**Approaching theory-making**

Career studies, with some exceptions, remains wedded to notions of representation, testability, measurability, causation and parsimony with regard to career development theory (D. Brown, 2002, pp. 7-12). Jung was a great champion of theory but, paradoxically, also a great sceptic. It is perhaps because ideas were so important to him that he was a great respecter of every individual’s right to ideational creativity. As a result of his Jamesian influence, he was less interested in the true-false value of theories than their variety and richness in relation to experience. Here, his commitment to enantiodromnia and the ‘yea’ and the ‘nay’ of the unconscious (Jung, 1997a, p. 91) is also relevant. In addition, for Jung, cognition and emotion were connected. There were always feeling and thinking values at stake in relation to ideas and a personal equation in all theory-making (Jung, 1917/1926/1943/1966, CW7, p. 66; 1921/1971, CW6, p. 9 & p. 439).

Analytical psychology, therefore, provides career studies with more nuanced and critical ways of handling theory. It supplies syncretic and constructivist alternatives to objectivist thinking. It speaks to experience and value rather than reductive cause-effect and true-false dichotomies. It enables a *syncretic*
renovation of existing career development theory without depreciating existing contributions.

Summary
In this section, an initial overview of the main argument has been provided. It is argued that analytical psychology offers a dynamic, rich, and critical vocabulary for the creative interpretation of career. All these aspects will be returned to in greater detail in the critical literature review and subsequent chapters.

The career development profession
I work at a university in the UK as a lecturer on postgraduate courses that provide training for career development professionals. The term 'career development professional' was coined relatively recently and serves as a catch-all to encompass a wide range of roles including career guidance advisers, career counsellors, career coaches, career teachers, and so on (Career Development Institute, 2013). Career development professionals work in a wide range of contexts including companies, consultancies, self-employment, schools, colleges, universities, businesses, government agencies, rehabilitation centres, and community groups. Regardless of setting, the contemporary focus of their work is broadly educational with a particular focus on the facilitation of learning (Patton & McMahon, 2014, p. 294). There are significant numbers working in at least 38 countries worldwide including India, Japan, Nigeria, Saudi Arabia, USA, Canada, Peru, Mexico, Canada, Australia, and most European countries (International Association for
Educational and Vocational Guidance, 2015). For example, at the time of writing, approximately 117,000 people were listed as working in the career development profession in the USA (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2015) and approximately 27,000 recorded for the UK (Office for National Statistics, 2016).

**Career development theories**

In academic terms, the training for career development professionals is based on theories of career development drawn from the transdisciplinary field of career studies (M. B. Arthur, Hall, & Lawrence, 1989; Collin & Young, 2000; Gunz & Peiperl, 2007). These theories constitute the intellectual core of the profession and provide the key to its self-definition and future development (Lent & Brown, 2013b; Sharf, 2013b). It is for this reason they provide a focus for this thesis.

The intellectual basis for the study of career can be traced to early American sociology; particularly, although not exclusively, the work of the Chicago School. Influenced by Georg Simmel, the founders of the School, such as Robert Park and Ernest Burgess, developed a city-wide research agenda that included studying the many different forms and patterns of roles occupied by individuals (Barley, 1989; Park, 1915; Park & Burgess, 1921). The explicit study of career began in the late 1920s and 1930s (Davidson & Anderson, 1937; Hughes, 1937/1958; Shaw, 1930/1966). This work was continued into the 1950s and 1960s by a second wave of scholars (Becker, 1963/1966; Goffman, 1959/1971, 1961/1968). These writers revolutionised the way that
career is understood and defined in at least three ways. First, in similar vein to
the appropriation of the term ‘culture’ by cultural studies to embrace both high
and popular culture, career was appropriated from one of its central everyday
meanings linked to high status or middle class jobs and applied to any
occupation; indeed, beyond this, to any social role. A wide variety of work (for
example, pharmacists, doctors, boxers, janitors and estate agents) and non-
work roles were researched (for example, students, parents, criminals,
musicians, drug users, mental patients and other inmates). Second, career
was conceptualised as an inherently social as opposed to individual
phenomenon. Becker (1966: viii), for example, referred to a 'mosaic' approach
to career research; and Hughes (1937/1958: 67) argued that the study of
career is concerned with the ‘nature’ and ‘constitution of society’. And lastly,
career began to be understood in terms of career development theory: a
conceptual language for the interpretation of career behaviour. This technical
vocabulary included: ecology, culture, drama, roles, cycles, turning points,
learning, contingencies and rituals (Becker, 1963/1966; Goffman, 1961/1968;
Hughes, 1928/1958, 1958). In this usage, therefore, career development
theory relates to understanding career behaviour and phenomena itself rather
than specific techniques and interventions (Herr, 1990, pp. 6-7).

Following, and to an extent alongside, these beginnings in sociology, career
development theory also evolved within developmental and differential
psychology (Ginzberg, Ginsburg, Axelrad, & Herma, 1951; Holland, 1958;
Super, 1957). Super is the key linking figure here as he acknowledged
sociological conceptions of career (1957, pp. 71, 29, 121). Subsequently, the
study of career broadened to include contributions from a wider range of fields including organisational studies (Schein, 1978), education (Law, 1996) and literary studies (Cochran, 1990a). Sociological perspectives also resurfaced (Hodkinson & Sparkes, 1997; Law, 1981; K. Roberts, 1977). Today, there are many formalised theories of career development in current use with some estimates varying from five to 20 (Athanasou & Esbroeck, 2008; Lent & Brown, 2013b; Patton & McMahon, 2014). They can be classified in different ways and, for the purposes of this thesis, have been grouped into theories focused on: cultural systems; personality; strategies; narratives; life course development; and learning. This grouping is explained further in the synopsis of chapters at the end of this chapter.

**Statement of problem**

It is against this background that the problem this thesis seeks to address must be seen. There have been a number of important studies that have addressed career-related issues through an analytical psychological lens. Stein and Hollwitz (1992) have discussed workplace applications of analytical psychology. Moraglia (1997) has considered the role of working life and individuation. Gothard (1999) has explored the relationship between career and myth in the context of career counselling. Hammer (2000) has employed a version of typology (the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator) to understand career development. Significant popular works include Hillman’s (1996) exploration of calling in relation to contemporary and historical case studies; and Moore’s (2009) discussion of self-fulfilment and work. There have also been important life course studies with a Jungian flavour (Levinson, Darrow, Klein, Levinson,
& McKee, 1978; Levinson & Levinson, 1996) that have subsequently influenced the careers field (Gothard, 2001). This area is evaluated more systematically in Chapter Two.

Despite these innovative and useful contributions, there have been thus far no attempts at an explicitly Jungian perspective on career development theory. The reasons for this are varied. Psychodynamic perspectives have informed career development theory but largely from Freudian (Blustein, 2011; Bordin, 1990; Ginzberg et al., 1951) and Adlerian angles (Cochran, 1990b, 1997; Savickas, 1988, 1989, 2013; Watkins & Savickas, 1990). With the notable exception of typology, it has proved difficult to translate analytical psychology into career-relevant terms. Jung’s marked ambivalence about organisational life perhaps provides one reason for this (1928/1966, CW7, p. 154; 1961/1995, p. 214 & 375). The history of career studies is also relevant as the Chicago School perspective made little space for a nuanced view of the unconscious. The field has also been strongly influenced by the humanistic approaches of Abraham Maslow, Carl Rogers and Donald Super (Caston, 2007, p. 33; Watts, 1973, p. 5; 1996, pp. 129-130) where psychoanalytic perspectives have sometimes been subject to considerable criticism (Rogers, 1961, pp. 90-106; Super, 1981, p. 12). In addition, in recent years, cognitive behavioural approaches drawing from the work of Alfred Bandura have gained many supporters (Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). Indeed, it has been argued that social cognitive career theory has generated nearly as much recent research as all the other theories combined (Sharf, 2013a, p. 20).
The dominance of these perspectives helps to explain the relatively muted impact of analytical psychology. Consequently, in this thesis, it is argued that there is a need for improved dialogue between the fields of career studies and analytical psychology. Specifically, it is proposed that there is a gap within the literature on career development theories in relation to Jungian and post-Jungian perspectives.

**Research question**

How can selected career development theories be critically evaluated and re-imagined from the perspective of analytical psychology?

**Research strategy**

The research question is addressed by critically evaluating the reception of psychoanalytic studies in broad terms within career development theory and then focusing on selected areas of career theory in more depth. Chapter Two contains a comprehensive review of the reception of psychoanalytic ideas within career theory. This enables a systematic overview of the field and credible conclusions to be drawn about the current state-of-play concerning the relationship between psychoanalytic studies and career studies.

In Chapters Three to Nine, the research strategy chosen is a critical evaluation of literature spanning seven overlapping points of triangulation. Each chapter is dedicated to a selected area of career theory; namely, theories focused on: culture and systems; personality; types; strategies; narrative; life course; and learning. Representative canonical or contemporary
texts are selected from within each area and evaluated using key concepts from analytical psychology. This enables close reading and direct engagement with seminal contributions from career studies and analytical psychology (Belsey, 2005; Dawson, 2008). The selection of Jungian concepts arises from, and is driven by, direct engagement with each career text. A further feature of the approach taken is the careful explication of Jungian concepts from a deep engagement with Jung’s formal and informal writings and post-Jungian scholarship. Each chapter concludes with implications for research, training and practice. Where relevant to the exposition or implications, short extracts from wider classic and contemporary literary sources are used. Following Ricoeur, it is believed the use of such cultural material can, ‘light up our own situation’ and ‘open up the world’ (1971/2008, p. 145). This dimension is also discussed in the section on reflexivity below.

It is recognised that a text can be interpreted in a variety of modes (Crotty, 1998, pp. 109-110). It can be interpreted appreciatively to empathise with the author’s position and read critically against the author’s intentions. It can also be read transactionally to reveal new meanings. These methods of interpreting texts are employed to shape the literature review in Chapters Three to Nine. Each chapter is structured to enable a direct engagement with a canonical or contemporary text from career theory and selected concepts from analytical psychology. Both are interpreted using appreciative and critical modes thus enabling a nuanced reading of both literatures. For example, this enables previously unacknowledged strengths of career development theory to be identified. Nor is it assumed that the interpretation of key concepts in
analytical psychology is a straightforward exercise. This literature is examined anew; and, at times, critical comments are made concerning conventional interpretations. Finally, this process of appreciative and critical engagement is marshalled to produce a series of propositions concerning a more creative and critical career development theory, enriched by a distinctive take on analytical psychology.

**Value**

The production of career development theory informed by analytical psychology is intended to be of value to five principal groups of individuals. First, career development professionals undergoing initial professional training or continuing professional development (and their clients). Second, trainers and lecturers who provide professional courses in higher education and beyond. Third, researchers and scholars in the field of career studies who may or may not be involved in professional training. Fourth, a wide range of other professionals who often work with clients or colleagues to support their career development. Such roles include line managers, trainers, teachers, social workers, therapists, counsellors and coaches. And finally, it is also recognised that a great deal of career helping is also undertaken on a non-professionalised basis through self-help and helping others through family, friendship, citizenship, and community activity. Career development theory is not the sole preserve of career development professionals; and this thesis is designed to be of value to all these groups. In practical terms, it is intended to help individuals understand more about the processes of individuation and the roles played in this by: projection; persona; typology; archetypal image;
personal myth; vocation; and transformational learning. It is envisaged that this will enable greater criticality, creativity, and reflexivity on the part of professionals, trainers, researchers, clients, and other individuals. To avoid an exclusively professional implication, the phrase career development practitioner should be interpreted in a wide sense to denote anyone who self-helps and/or helps others with career development issues.

**Epistemological perspective**

A broadly constructivist and hermeneutic position is taken (Crotty, 1998; Hammond, 2013). The truth or falsity of concepts is consequently not a concern of this thesis and common objectivist and positivist dualisms are eschewed (for example, objective and subjective; words and worlds; pure and applied). Narratives are seen as constitutive of reality as opposed to mere representations (Barthes, 1966/1977, p. 79; Lawlor, 2008, p. 38). This entails interpreting career development theories in terms of genre and viewing them as definitional in relation to career i.e. as constituting and defining career rather than representing some purported external ‘career’ existing outside of language.

It is also relevant that epistemology is discussed within analytical psychology with associated strengths and weaknesses. Jung’s conception of esse in anima and psychic reality enables a critical psychology that focuses on psychological phenomena (1921/1971, CW6, p. 52; 1937/1969, CW8, p. 125). Jung (1940/1968, CW9i, pp. 160-180) also observed that science is based on a myth of mythlessness and the task was to dream the myth onwards. These
aspects are relevant to career development theories as several of these were produced within an objectivist scientific paradigm, and although many contemporary approaches subscribe to a constructivist or constructionist epistemology, there is still work to be done in fully developing this. Consequently, a further contribution of analytical psychology to career studies is to more fully explicate the role of theory within its epistemological understandings. At the same time, it is recognised that there are problematic acultural, ahistorical, and essentialising aspects to analytical psychology (Young-Eisendrath & Hall, 1991, p. 11). In line with the constructivist perspective taken, terms such as archetypal will be used in this thesis to simply denote recurring patterns and similarities rather than imply an objective archetypal reality.

**Ethics**

As the thesis is based entirely on a literature review, there were no fieldwork-related ethical matters to consider. There were, however, two ethical issues that merited attention. The first related to self-care i.e. my own well-being as a researcher in depth psychology and career studies. Here, I felt it appropriate to take steps to ensure relevant supports were in place including regular use of a personal journal and contact with an experienced colleague. The second relates to the well-being of career development professionals and any clients who may be influenced by the dissemination of this work. The profession has a very different training from counselling and psychotherapy. As indicated above, the current ethos is more pedagogic than therapeutic and supervisory support is patchy at best. The typical range of interventions is extensive rather
than intensive and more likely to focus on broadly educational work with groups as opposed to longer term one-to-one relationships. In considering any issues of practice, it is therefore necessary to bear in mind the typical working context and boundaries of the career development profession and the related expectations of its clients.

**Limitations**

In this section, alternative approaches to the overall topic are discussed and potential and actual limitations of the thesis identified. Alternative research strategies were considered including action research, survey and case study. Different methods of conducting the literature review were also debated. For example, it could have been directed towards the tools and techniques of career counselling rather than career development theories. The importance and status of career development theories to the field, however, meant that an evaluative literature review was the most appropriate research strategy for addressing this topic. The number and range of theories could also have been handled differently. For example, the first drafts of Chapters Three and Four included more than one theory; however, this proved to be superficial, and reducing to one theory for each chapter in later versions enabled a deeper engagement with the selected approach. An exclusive focus on the ideas of one seminal thinker (such as Donald Super or Mark Savickas) was also considered. This would have enabled tracing the development of one person’s thinking over a lifetime and covering a much wider selection of publications. On reflection, however, it was felt this would narrow the scope of the thesis unnecessarily. The range of Jungian concepts discussed in detail is also
necessarily limited with a particular focus on key concepts related to individuation i.e. projection; persona; typology; archetypal images; personal myth; vocation; and transformative learning. Clearly, there is much more that could be discussed including fuller discussion of archetypes, alchemy, synchronicity, and/or religion. The research strategy was justified, however, based on a direct engagement (Belsey, 2005) with canonical and contemporary texts in career studies and the selection of Jungian concepts arising from that engagement. The direction of travel is therefore from career studies to analytical psychology, and not the other way around; although, it is acknowledged that the latter route was viable. The final selection and decisions are inevitably something of a compromise; and it must be acknowledged that alternatives were possible and had advantages. It is felt, nonetheless, that the chosen research strategy enabled engagement with a range of seminal ideas in career and Jungian studies appropriate to the scope and range of a typical thesis.

Reflexivity

As indicated above, I work at a university in the UK as a lecturer on courses that provide training for career development professionals. In addition, I occupy a range of other roles including partner, student, friend, parent, and citizen. I recognise that my own experiences of career and those of others are inevitably bound up in this project (Romanyszyn, 2007). The thesis involved relearning ‘my own’ myth and is inevitably a part of it. Consequently, I introduce an explicitly autoethnographic dimension in the form of ‘Postscripts’ at the end of each chapter. These enable me to reflexively situate myself in
the text through the use of more personal narratives i.e. stories about my life; and link these with other cultural stories such as poems, novels, and plays (Ellis & Adams, 2014; Ricoeur, 1971/2008, p. 145).

Summary

In this chapter, an initial overview of the main argument contained in the thesis has been offered. The work of career development professionals has been introduced and the content of professional training in this field discussed. It has been argued that there is a gap in career development theorising in relation to analytical psychology. A range of beneficiaries in relation to filling this gap have been identified including the career development profession and others. A five stage process has been proposed to squarely address this problem. First, a critical overview of the relationship between career studies and psychoanalytic studies in broad terms is undertaken. Second, key genres of career theory and texts are selected. Third, a fresh look is taken at related Jungian concepts. Fourth, these in turn are deployed to appreciatively and critically review the selected career theories. Lastly, the outcome is a synthesis of the existing literature leading to a series of propositions for career development theory. These aspects attest to the value and significance of this thesis and its original contribution to knowledge.

Synopsis of chapters

This section contains a synopsis of the main chapters. The length of each chapter varies depending on the nature of the material.
2/ Career studies and psychoanalytic studies: a critical literature review

The literature in career studies and analytical psychology is critically evaluated with a particular focus on career development theory drawing from: edited and multi-authored collections, monographs, peer-reviewed journal articles; and PhD theses. This comprehensive overview enables the rationale and focus of the thesis to be refined and the identification of key sources.

3/ Career, culture and systems

A number of career development theories focusing on cultural systems influences are identified (Collin, 2012; Law, 1981, 1993, 2009; Patton & McMahon, 2014; Pryor & Bright, 2011). In these approaches, it is held that career is a system subject to the interplay of wholes and parts in a process of discontinuous change. This occurs through the interaction of sub-systems often summarised as: the individual, the immediate community and the societal/environmental. A canonical representative text is selected: The Systems Theory Framework of Career Development (Patton & McMahon, 2014). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian conceptions of projection. It is argued that analytical psychology has much to contribute here as it pays attention to the cultural and societal consequences of projective and introjective processes (M-L. von Franz, 1978; Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, pp. 452-458; Singer & Kimbles, 2004; Yakushko, Miles, Rajan, Bujko, & Thomas, 2016).
4/ Career and personality
A group of career development theories is identified focusing on personality (Gottfredson, 1981; Roe, 1957; Super, Starishevsky, Matlin, & Jordaan, 1963a). These perspectives pay attention to the formation and development of personality and self-concept. A canonical text is selected: Career Development: Self-Concept Theory (Super et al., 1963a). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian conceptions of persona. It is argued that this move has value because analytical psychology is alert to the potential dangers of over-identification with the persona but also the need for healthy persona development (Hopcke, 1995; Jung, 1916/1966, CW7; Pye, 1965). These are potentially valuable contributions to career studies where strong emphasis is given to personality in relation to work roles. It is argued that conceptions of the self commonly used in career studies can benefit from analytical psychological perspectives.

5/ Career types
Several career theorists have developed typologies of career behaviour (Bordin, 1984; Bordin, Nachmann, & Segal, 1963, pp. 26-28; P. Brown & Hesketh, 2004; Clarke, 2009; Marcus, 2017; Tomlinson, 2007). These perspectives seek to classify and describe contrasting career types. As outlined previously, MBTI theory has also had an enormous impact in career studies. Career development theories relating to types are described in general terms; and a classic example of the genre discussed in more detail: Holland’s (1997) Theory of Vocational Personalities and Work Environments. This is critically evaluated and enriched through the work of post-Jungian

6/ Career strategies

This chapter focuses on career strategies found in a wide range of popular and academic texts (D’Allesandro, 2008; Ibarra, 2002; King, 2004; Kuijpers & Scheerens, 2006; Law & Watts, 1977; McKenna, 2008; K. E. Mitchell, Levin, & Krumboltz, 1999). A distinctive feature of this literature is that claims are made concerning how to obtain future career happiness. Contrasting sets of success formulas are proposed for readers to engage in. Career development theories relating to strategies are identified in broad terms and a contemporary example of the genre discussed in more detail: King’s (2004) Career Self-Management Framework. This is evaluated using key concepts from analytical psychology including projection, enantiodromnia, adaptation, individuation, and theory-making (Jung, 1929/1966, CW16, pp. 67-70; 1931/1966, CW16, p. 41).

7/ Career and narrative

Several writers make explicit reference to narrative in order to interpret career behaviour (Cochran, 1990a; Collin, 2000; Inkson, 2007; Savickas, 2013). These approaches are characterised by the adoption of terms from literary theory such as story, metaphor, chapter and genre. A canonical text is selected: Career Construction Theory (Savickas, 2013). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian conceptions of personal myth. It is argued that analytical psychology brings additional value to this area with its

8/ Career and life course development

Career development theories relating to life course development are identified (Cochran, 1990b; Ginzberg et al., 1951; Super, 1957). This area of career theory emphasises the developmental nature of career by paying attention to ages, stages and phases. A canonical text is selected: *The Sense of Vocation* (Cochran, 1990b). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian conceptions of vocation. It is argued that this provides a richer and more nuanced method of understanding life course development through acknowledging the central role played by the unconscious.

9/ Career and learning

The importance of learning in career development is recognised by a number of scholars (Krumboltz, 1979; Law, 1996; Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). Such theories broaden understanding of career beyond simple questions of job choice to the processes of concept formation entailed in understanding career management and the division of labour. A canonical text is selected: *The Social Learning Theory of Career Decision-Making* (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian conceptions of learning (Boyd, 1991; Boyd & Myers, 1988; Cranton, 2006; Dirkx, 1997; Dobson, 2008; R. A. Jones, Clarkson, Congram, & Stratton, 2008; Kolb, 1984, 2015; Mayes, 2005, 2017; Mezirow, 1981, 2000,
2009; Semetsky, 2013). It is proposed, through this, that culture and transformation play a significant role in career learning.

10/ Conclusion

Findings are summarised and synthesised from the preceding chapters. A series of propositions are made concerning the evolution of career development theory informed by analytical psychology.
Chapter One Postscript: Getting Started with Career and Jung Pt 1

Ok, here goes...

So, I've designed these sections, called postscripts, to give space to alternative modes of expression. Alternative kinds of register and voice. Occupation and vocation being part and parcel of career. My purpose is to more fully occupy the thesis (I discuss the polyvocal psyche a bit more in Chapter Eight). You'll note the wavy border and the different font. Ok, a bit tricksy, but it helps. Frees me up a little. You'll also note that sometimes I address you the reader directly. You don't often see that in style guides for writing PhD. I'm sorry if that's a bit of a jolt. Of course, it might also be a relief. It's an issue that Jung wrestled with. He drew a distinction between the Collected Works and more personal material but nonetheless one informed the other. It's a space for me to write slightly differently, more personally, and discuss some additional reading (poetry, novels, plays, etc.) that I engaged with as part of the thesis.

I've supplied a rationale for the work but only partly written myself into that. So, the postscript gives me a space to say more. I encountered Jung's writings before I trained in careers work. It was part of a very mixed range of reading and experiences that I set myself during my twenties when I lost interest in the course I was meant to be on. A kind of a self-designed course if you like. Although that makes it sound more agentic then it really was. It was a more intense version of how I'd always learnt, following lines of interest, seeing what came up. It consisted of novels, plays, poems, sociology, communication studies, psychology, biology. It continues to this day. The thesis is part of it.

(to be continued in Chapter Two Postscript)
Chapter 2

Career studies and psychoanalytic studies: a critical literature review

Introduction

In this chapter, the fields of career studies and psychoanalytic studies are critically evaluated with a particular focus on career development theory. A representative range of classic and contemporary texts is considered drawing from edited and multi-authored collections, monographs, peer-reviewed journal articles, and PhD theses. This overview enables the rationale and focus of the thesis to be refined and the identification of key sources. In terms of chapter structure, four main subheadings are used, namely, psychoanalysis, individual psychology, analytical psychology, and findings. Within the first three sections, a broadly chronological approach is taken covering the last 100 years focused on psychoanalysis, individual psychology, and analytical psychology respectively. Within each of these, the chronology is refined into sub-topics. In the final section, main findings arising from the literature review are summarised and sources identified to shape the direction and structure of the subsequent chapters. My central argument is the pressing
need for revised career development theory informed by analytical psychology. The related question of what such a theory should focus on is also addressed.

**Psychoanalysis**

In this section, the changing relationship between psychoanalysis and career studies is traced. It is organised in terms of the *birth, death*, and *rebirth* of psychoanalysis in the context of career studies. Three overlapping periods are identified: pre-World War One to 1960s; 1960s to 1990s; and 1980s to the present day.

*Birth: pre-World War One to 1960s*

The earliest contributions attended to the relationship between occupations and drives. There was a focus on the sublimation of unacceptable impulses (sometimes termed instincts or appetites) into socially desirable behaviours. Jones (1912, pp. 250-251) provided several examples of individuals who, in his view, successfully diverted unacceptable impulses into a variety of occupations including sadistic (butcher, surgeon), exhibitionist (actor, auctioneer) and anal (architect, sculptor). Brill (1921, pp. 313-336) also discussed sublimation and linked this to the role of work in allowing the pleasure and reality principles to be combined. He broadened the scope of sublimation to include a wide range of early childhood experiences including oedipal strivings, compensation, birth order and aggression. He advocated allowing individuals to follow where their unconscious leads rather than succumbing to the pressures of parents and other authority figures. A case
study was discussed featuring a boy who wanted to grow strawberries and a father who pushed him to become a lawyer. Here, Brill’s motto was ‘try the strawberries’. Although interesting, these accounts drew quite narrowly from Freud and none set out to create a comprehensive theory of career development.

Although, in effect, pre-dating the formal advent of career studies, Robert Park and George Herbert Mead developed the intellectual frameworks that gave rise to the study of career in Chicago. In a seminal paper on the contemporary city, Park (1915, pp. 610-612) argued, citing Sigmund Freud, that the activities of work, sport, and play enabled individuals to find symbolic expression for uncontrolled instinct and appetites. The city was conceived as a psychoeccological phenomenon consisting of moral regions and occupations where contrasting types of moral behaviour were either permitted or taboo. Park stated ‘in the crowd…every moment may be said to be psychological’ (p. 592). Following Simmel, he further argued that the study of delinquent careers and those of other moral outcasts or strangers lends insight to processes of scapegoating and othering (Park & Burgess, 1921, p. 559). In Mind, Self and Society, Mead (1927/1934/1967, pp. 203-211) briefly discussed inferiority complexes, ego and superego. He cited Freud in relating the ego and superego to the ‘I’ and the ‘me’ respectively but questioned the relevance of psychoanalysis to normal or non-pathological individuals.

There are three major career development theories published in the immediate post-Second World War period with at least some psychoanalytic
dimensions (Bordin et al., 1963; Ginzberg et al., 1951; Roe, 1957). The first formalised theory of career development to incorporate some psychoanalytic ideas was developed by a multi-disciplinary team consisting of an economist, psychiatrist, sociologist and psychologist (Ginzberg et al., 1951). They discussed the role of fantasy, latency, identification, models and the movement from a pleasure orientation to a work-orientation (pp. 24-25, 60-65, 206-210). They also made one of the first calls for the integration of psychoanalysis and career counselling (pp. 24-25). Unfortunately, the scope and depth of Ginzberg et al.’s psychoanalytically-informed work was limited and they received criticism for this at the time from the psychoanalytic and psychiatric communities (pp. viii-ix). Part of their initial research included the recruitment of ten psychoanalysts to review patient case histories and explore the relationship with occupational choice but the results were inconclusive and the study not included in the final publication (p. 14). This resulted in a somewhat diluted approach; for example, their discussion of identification was largely restricted to conscious identification (p. 206). Perhaps because of these problems, their work has not been recognised in other reviews (Marcus, 2017; Osipow & Fitzgerald, 1996; Watkins & Savickas, 1990). It seems that the team recognised the importance of psychoanalysis and the weaknesses of the ‘impulse’ approach of Jones and others (Ginzberg et al., 1951, pp. 21-23) but elected to devote resources elsewhere rather than engage in the more systematic exploration into depth psychology that would have been required (pp. viii-ix).

Roe (1957) discussed the relationship between early childhood experience
and vocational choice. Drawing from psychoanalysis and human relations
theory, she argued that the degree of parental emotional involvement,
acceptance and avoidance experienced by the child influenced occupational
choice. Roe emphasised the largely unconscious nature of vocational
behavior and the role of defences. Her ideas are significant in finding an early
place for psychoanalytic ideas in vocational psychology and recognising the
importance of early childhood experiences.

Bordin, Nachman and Segal (1963) developed an explicit theory of career
development based on ten dimensions they felt related to both individuals and
occupations (nurturant; oral; manipulative; sensual; anal; exhibiting; genital;
exploratory; flowing-quenching; exhibiting; and rhythmic). Like Jones and Brill,
they shared an interest in sublimation but broadened this somewhat to include
a wider range of work activities (p. 110).

It is interesting to note just how early the engagement between
psychoanalysis and the study of career began. This review traces the
dialogue back to 1912; a somewhat earlier timeline than found in other
accounts (Ginzberg et al., 1951; Watkins & Savickas, 1990). Nonetheless, the
contributions were exploratory and tentative. Most of the psychological
theories (Bordin et al., 1963; Brill, 1921; E. Jones, 1912; Roe, 1957) were
based on matching personality and jobs. They failed to have any lasting
impact on the dominant matching theory of Holland (1958, 1997) which was,
in any event, superseded by later developmental approaches.
Death: 1960s to 1990s

The ‘death’ of psychoanalysis in career studies can be linked to the work of two important scholars: Donald Super and Samuel Osipow. Super’s developmental self-concept theory is probably the most famous and influential of all career development theories. The significance of Osipow is less as a theorist than as the most important reviewer of existing career development theories from the late 1960s to the early 1990s.

Although in his earlier writings Super (1953, pp. 187-188) acknowledged a role for the unconscious in vocational development, from the 1960s onwards his focus was increasingly towards the conscious aspects. He declared the unconscious to be outside the purview of self-concept theory (Super et al., 1963a, p. 21) and defined the unconscious as a nonphenomena (Super & Bohn, 1970/1971, p. 106). Like Ginzberg et al., he conceptualised identification as a conscious process as opposed to an unconscious one (Super & Bohn, 1970/1971, pp. 135-136). The self, in Super’s view of the self-concept, is always or largely a conscious self. In the early 1980s, he concluded that psychoanalysis had little left to offer.

[Bordin et al.’s vocational framework] like Roe’s and other psychoanalytically-inspired theories of occupational choice, now appears to mark a dead end.

(Super, 1981, p. 12)

In a review of career development theory, Osipow (1968) provided a useful historical overview of psychoanalytic contributions and identified some of their
strengths. More seriously, he criticised the failure of psychoanalytic theory to
develop empirically parsimonious, testable and valid constructs or viable
applications and saw a limited future for the approach.

To date, the analytical model has played only a minor role in vocational
psychology…it does not seem likely that any new, rigorous or
productive formulations will result from the psychoanalytic quarter.
(Osipow, 1968, pp. 114-115)

This rather damning conclusion was repeated over the next 20 years into
three further editions that became widely cited classic texts (Osipow, 1973, p. 127; 1983, p. 57; Osipow & Fitzgerald, 1996, p. 28). Psychoanalysis thus
became skewered on the phenomenological and positivist critiques of Super
and Osipow respectively. These verdicts, in turn, appear to have set the tone
for a sequence of critical comments by other influential individuals in the field.

Psychoanalytical thinking has not contributed as much to career
counselling as other theories have, and it has not been as
heuristic…The present status of psychoanalytical thinking is that it has
relatively few supporters. Unless this changes, the theory will become
of decreasing interest.

(D. Brown, 1990, pp. 353-354)

Analytic theory as it relates to careers seemed to stop some two
decades ago…Perhaps the harshest but seemingly most realistic
statement we could make about a psychoanalytic career theory is that
it is now dead or, at best, moribund.

(Watkins & Savickas, 1990, p. 82)
This pattern of criticisms was echoed well into the 1990s and beyond (Bimrose, 2004, pp. 1-2; Kidd, 1996, p. 190). In some respects, these criticisms were understandable as the approaches available used a much-diluted version of psychoanalysis. In addition, it was reported that many career development professionals found the language of psychoanalysis obscure or even disturbing (Watkins & Savickas, 1990).

Rebirth: 1980s to present

The rebirth of psychoanalysis from the late 1970s onwards can be traced in three parallel developments. First, the growth of organisational studies informed by psychoanalysis. Second, the increasing calls for the integration of career counselling and psychotherapy. And last, the growth in both number and complexity of career development theories informed by psychoanalytic concepts. These developments are discussed in three separate sub-sections.

a) Organisational studies

This period saw a number of important organisational studies informed by psychoanalysis (Axelrod, 1999; Hirschhorn, 1988; Lowman, 1993; G. Morgan, 1986/1997/2006; Obholzer & Roberts, 1994; Orbach, 2008; Socarides & Kramer, 1997). Their focus tended to be on work and organisational effectiveness rather than career development theory per se. Nevertheless, several significant contributions were made. Morgan (1986/1997/2006) identified eight central metaphors of organisations including psychic prisons and transformations drawing from Freud, Becker, Klein, Bion and others (including Jung, see later section on analytical psychology). He explored
repression, defences, anxiety, narcissism and projection; and discussed death and work, goal setting, planning and other organisational rituals in terms of a flight from mortality. Group processes were also summarised including dependency, pairing and fight-flight.

Hirschhorn (1988, pp. 1-15) drawing from Klein argued that, through reparation, people seek to create psychological wholeness at work by overcoming the social defences of splitting, projection and introjection. Roberts (1994), drawing particularly from the work of Bion, discussed the role played by unresolved past issues in the choice of profession and the self-assigned impossible task. Socarides and Kramer (1997) explored the relationships between work inhibitions, narcissistic conflicts, external objects and fears of performance. Axelrod (1999) discussed various dimensions of work satisfaction from a psychoanalytic perspective including work inhibition, sublimation, social connection, object finding and the relationship between work life and adult development. Orbach (2008, p. 1) argued work is ‘where we live’ i.e. a place where many if not all people live their lives. She suggested that psychoanalytically-informed self-examination can give people, in all sorts of work roles, an insight into motivation and purpose.

b) Integration
Since the mid-1980s, and continuing to the present day, there have been growing calls for the integration of career counselling and psychotherapy. Blustein (1987) made a case for such integration by arguing, in similar vein to Freud, that the ability to work and love are hallmarks of mental health and that
work is an individual’s strongest tie to reality. This was followed by Watkins and Savickas’ (1990) overview of psychodynamic career counselling focusing on the work of Freud, Erikson and Adler. They stated that these three perspectives ‘have the most to offer from a theoretical/practical perspective’ (p. 79). Jung was mentioned in passing, and without a full citation, in relation to the work of Henry Murray (p. 101). This reflects a recurrent pattern in the career studies literature i.e. when psychodynamic perspectives are considered there is a tendency to focus on the work of Freud, Erikson or Adler and neglect Jung’s.

The *Handbook of Career Counseling Theory and Practice* (Savickas & Walsh, 1996) represented a book-length attempt to further the integration project. Richardson (1996, pp. 347-360) argued for the relocation of career counselling within counselling and psychotherapy. She diagnosed a number of false splits (e.g. normal vs. pathological, work vs. domestic, public vs. private) that have served to unnecessarily separate the two fields. Richardson suggested a valuable shared agenda for career counselling and psychotherapy by seeking to rebalance each area. Looked at more critically, analytical psychology was entirely absent from her analysis. The role of career education was also neglected. This appears to be a persistent omission in the calls for greater integration between career counselling with psychotherapy. In the same collection, Savickas (1996, pp. 194-200) sought to develop a framework for career support services that linked psychodynamic perspectives on career counselling with others. Using the work of Super, Holland, Hughes, Watkins, Cochran, Bordin and Krumboltz, he attempted to
integrate a number of strands in career studies by developing a framework based on what he termed: drives, career self, vocational self, and life roles. Although Jung was absent from this attempt at synthesis, it was an explicit and ambitious attempt at integrating psychoanalytic conceptions of careers work with perspectives from psychology and other disciplines. More recently, as editor of the *Oxford Handbook of the Psychology of Working*, Blustein (2013a) has asserted that working continues to be neglected in the psychotherapy literature and pressed again for integration. In a supporting chapter within that volume, Franklin & Medvide (2013) offered a synthesis of selected career development and psychotherapy theories; however, the psychoanalytic content was quite limited.

c) Career development theories

At least four major career development theories informed by psychoanalysis have appeared over the last 40 years (Blustein, 2011; Bordin, 1984; Marcus, 2017; Vaillant, 1977). These are now reviewed together with some additional contributions. Vaillant (1977, 2002) drew from Freud and Erikson in conducting and interpreting a series of massive longitudinal studies (initially Harvard men and subsequently high IQ women and blue-collar men). He specified six sequential adult developmental tasks, namely: identity, intimacy; career consolidation; generativity; keeping the meaning; and integrity. He emphasised the importance of three types of defences: mature (e.g. sublimation, altruism, humour); intermediate (e.g. displacement, repression, isolation; and immature (projection, acting out, dissociation). Vaillant’s work is seminal in its contribution to life span psychology. He broadened discussion of
sublimation in relation to a range of defences and brought Erikson’s ideas to a new audience. His work does not, however, engage directly with other career development theories and has tended to be overshadowed in the careers field by the work of Super (1957, 1980; Super, Savickas, & Super, 1996).

Bordin’s (1984, 1990) psychodynamic model of career choice and satisfaction argued for the importance of spontaneity and compulsion in shaping an individual’s approach to play and work and the degree to which one is able to fuse these activities or not. He paid particular attention to the role of play and early parental influences. The theory built on his earlier Freudian-based theorising (discussed previously in this chapter) concerning nurturance and aggression leading to manipulative, sensual, anal, genital, exploratory and exhibiting behaviour (Bordin et al., 1963). It added what he termed a more ego-analytical level focused on curiosity, precision, power, expressiveness and justice. His focus on play can be seen as an implicit revision of Freud’s emphasis on love and work. Consistent with his earlier theorising in the 1960s, however, his approach remained within a broadly matching and positivist paradigm. This led to it being designated as of purely historical interest (Patton & McMahon, 2014, p. 50) although his influence can nonetheless be detected in contemporary scholarship (Marcus, 2017). Bordin (1979) was also responsible for introducing the working alliance to fields outside psychotherapy including career development work.

Blustein (2011) developed a relational theory of career development drawing from Freud, Klein and Winnicott. He highlighted the role of introjection,
identification, attachment, internalised relational objects and the holding role
of culture. Blustein argued that internalisation and internalised relational
objects play a significant part in working life; for example, a worker may
experience supervisory feedback as a recapitulation of earlier bullying events.
He also proposed that culture holds the collective memories and values of
one’s community and may provide a suitable holding space for individuals as
they negotiate the challenges of working life. An emphasis on the importance
of recursive connections between wider relational life and working is also a
feature of his work. Blustein’s work draws from psychoanalysis in distinctive
and innovative ways and is seen as influential (Patton & McMahan, 2014, p.
124).

Marcus (2017) developed a theory of career development drawing from Freud
and Erikson and grounded in some of the more psychological branches of
career studies. He included Bordin’s work on oral, anal and phallic types and
extended this to include workplace behaviour as well as occupational choice.
Marcus argued that Erikson’s eight stage theory provided a helpful framework
for understanding the process of career choice, adjustment and attainment.
He also discussed organisational culture and proposed that people can
flourish at work by engaging in behaviours such as admiration, generosity and
emotional creativity. The theory draws more widely from Freud than the others
and is probably the fullest psychoanalytic account of career development yet
developed in the literature. Some opportunities are missed, however, to
develop a more critical career studies. For example, contemporary Freudian
perspectives on narrative and the super-ego (Frosh, 2010, pp. 69-97; Phillips,
2015) could have been used to critically evaluate the extensive popular and academic literature on career management.

d) Additional contributions

In addition to the four career development theories discussed above, there are further texts devoted to the practical methods and techniques of working with groups and individuals. Lerner (1986/1991) discussed organisational issues from a psychodynamic perspective and extended this to consider all aspects of everyday life. He proposed the formation of compassion groups to engage in individual and social transformation in the workplace, education, unions and communities. Morgan and Skovholt (1979) discussed the use of fantasy and daydreams in career counseling. They proposed a range of guided fantasy scenarios and cited the influence of psychoanalytic perspectives including the work of Scheidler, Singer and Wilkins. Kidd (2006, pp. 52-75) identified the psychodynamic approach as one of four main approaches to career counselling (the others being person-centred, cognitive-behavioural and narrative). Drawing from Freud, she briefly discussed: levels of consciousness; defence mechanisms; introjection; resistance; transference; and counter-transference. Reid (2016, pp. 73-82) discussed psychodynamic therapy in relation to career coaching and counselling including: anxiety; defensiveness; transference; counter-transference; supervision; and transactional analysis. Analytical psychology did not feature as part of these career counselling overviews.
Summary

The story of the birth, death and rebirth of psychoanalysis in relation to career studies takes place over 100 years and the literature reviewed is inevitably selective. Nonetheless, some tentative conclusions can be drawn. There have been at least seven career development theories with some psychoanalytic content (Blustein, 2011; Bordin, 1984; Bordin et al., 1963; Ginzberg et al., 1951; Marcus, 2017; Roe, 1957; Vaillant, 1977). In addition, there have been significant contributions from organisational studies and the practical literature on working with individuals and groups. The dialogue between psychoanalysis and career studies has grown stronger over the years and contemporary perspectives offer a deeper engagement than has been the case hitherto. Blustein (2011) has highlighted the role of culture and processes of introjection and there are opportunities to extend this in the direction of analytical psychology. There remain unresolved issues over: the educational versus therapeutic nature of careers work; the absence of contemporary Freudian perspectives on narrative; and the neglect of psychoanalytic viewpoints in classical developmental and differentialist career theories (Holland, 1958; Super et al., 1963a). Analytical psychology could provide a critical angle on these perspectives through themes such as transformative learning, personal myth and persona.

Individual psychology

There are three writers who have engaged in detail with individual psychology in relation to career development theory (Cochran, 1990b; Savickas, 2013;
Watkins, 1984). These can be further divided into positivist and narratological perspectives.

**Positivist**

Watkins (1984) developed the first career development theory based on Adlerian ideas. This included ten theoretical assumptions based on life style, social interest, family constellation, birth order, early recollections, and other aspects. He discussed these topics in relation to occupational choice, worker representations, work relationships, work productivity, work intensity career decisiveness, and career adjustment. Watkins’ work has value in updating Adlerian psychology in relation to career and emphasising important areas such as life style, early recollections and social feeling. It was, however, framed in a positivist paradigm and neglected the key concepts of inferiority and guiding fiction.

**Narratological**

Cochran (1990b, 1997) developed a theory of career development based on a recurrent plot or story line. The four stages of this plot being: incompletion, positioning, positing, and completion. He stated, ‘the regularity with which a person’s later vocation is the direct result of an initial negative condition is so apparent that it is difficult to understand why Adler’s original work has been so neglected’ (Cochran, 1990b, p. 60). The incompletion phase was defined as ‘a gap between what is and what ought to be’ (pp. 28 & 174) and linked to ‘inferiority’ (p. 85). Cochran’s work is valuable for creating a distinctively Adlerian narrative arc (incompletion through to completion) and highlighting
the importance of vocation (Jung was included in relation to this but as a case study example rather than a conceptual influence). Cochran also re-imagined traditional stage-based life course thinking in career development (Super, 1957) from an Adlerian viewpoint and brought a literary sensibility to bear on career studies.

Savickas explored Adlerian ideas in relation to career development over a long period (1988, 1989, 1995, 2009, 2013). He stressed the importance of ‘guiding lines’ and ‘guiding fictions’ and how these reveal the hidden reasons or meanings behind job choices and interests (Savickas, 2009, pp. 186-188). The guiding fiction, he argued, tells people what is needed to feel less incomplete and more secure; and to move from a felt minus to a perceived plus and ‘reduce their feelings of incompleteness or inferiority’ (Savickas, 2009, p. 192). He developed these ideas into practical recommendations for range of career contexts (Savickas, 2010a, 2013). Savickas helpfully focused attention on guiding fictions, fictional goals, guiding lines, hidden reasons, private sense and private logic. He successfully translated Adler's concepts of inferiority and interest into career development concepts, namely: preoccupations, life themes and occupations. Savickas also linked Adler’s work on style of life with what he termed the subjective or introspective career highlighted in the pioneering work of the Chicago School of Sociology (for example, Everett C. Hughes). Looked at more critically, Savickas focused largely on the work of Adler and appears to have neglected analytical psychology. The potential value of Jungian concepts such as persona, typology, personal myth, vocation, transformational learning, and individuation
has not been realised. Savickas also demonstrated, at times, a rather circumscribed conception of career education. He claimed its role was to foster self-control, agentic attitudes, self-efficacy beliefs and decision-making competencies in those who live for the moment without regard to imposing their own will on the future (Savickas, 1996, pp. 199-200). There is also an over-reliance upon tools and techniques in career education (Savickas, 2010a). The potential contribution of analytical psychology in relation to career education, and a broader conception of career counselling, is yet to be fully realised.

**Summary**

The influence of psychoanalysis in career studies has historically been stronger than individual psychology. In some respects, however, the contemporary careers scene is quite Adlerian due to the influential nature of Cochran and Savickas’s work which features prominently in contemporary collections (Gothard, Mignot, Offer, & Ruff, 2001; Lent & Brown, 2013b; Sharf, 2013b). This suggests it may be useful to evaluate the work of Cochran and Savickas in more depth in relation to analytical psychology and explore the similarities and differences between Adler and Jung’s approaches to narrative.

**Analytical psychology**

In this section, the relationship is traced between analytical psychology and career studies. There appears to have been very little dialogue between the two fields in the period prior to the 1960s. The only point of connection is William James as both Jung and Park met James and regularly cited him as...
an influence although in different ways (Jung, 1937/1969, CW8, p. 125; Park & Burgess, 1921, pp. 119-122). Progoff’s (1953/1981, 1983) work on the social, cultural and historical nature of analytical psychology is also significant but more in terms of practices than career development theory. Since the 1960s, there have been six major contributions with a Jungian flavour focused on the following areas: MBTI theory (I. B. Myers, McCauley, Quenk, & Hammer, 1998); experiential learning (Kolb, 1984); career and myth (Gothard, 1999); character and calling (Hillman, 1996); organisational and workplace applications of analytical psychology (Stein & Hollwitz, 1992); and adult development (Moraglia, 1994). These are now discussed in more detail in turn followed by brief references to additional literature.

**Myers-Briggs type theory**

Myers-Briggs type theory is technically a theory of personality, or perhaps life course psychology, with a very wide range of potential applications from sales and marketing to marriage preparation. Its popularity in career counselling has sometimes led to it being seen as a career development theory (Sharf, 2013b, p. 155); however, its origins and influences are quite different. The theory is explained in general terms in the *MBTI Manual* and *Gifts Differing: Understanding Personality Type*, and several contexts for its use are suggested including the facilitation of occupational choice (I. B. Myers, 1980/1995; I. B. Myers et al., 1998). A number of writers have subsequently related Myers-Briggs type theory more specifically to career (e.g. Dunning, 2005; Greenhaus & Callanan, 2006; Gunz & Peiperl, 2007; Hammer, 2000; Inkson, 2007; Kidd, 2006; Sharf, 2013b, pp. 155-184). The use of the Myers-
Briggs Type Inventory (MBTI) appears to be extensive with one source suggesting over 3.5 million inventories per year are administered (I. B. Myers, 2000, p. 5) and another suggesting usage is popular with career counsellors (Sharf, 2013b, p. 155). It is also a common PhD thesis topic (Proquest, 2017). From this, it may be concluded that the use of Myers-Briggs type theory in relation to career counselling is one of the main ways in which a version of Jung's ideas has entered career studies. More widely, and despite its limitations, the theory has contributed hugely to the popular understanding of analytical psychology.

It is appropriate at this point to make some critical observations on the relationship between Myers-Briggs type theory and Jung's theory of psychological types. First, Katharine Briggs developed her own typology based on an analysis of autobiographies undertaken prior to her reading *Psychological Types* in 1923 (I. B. Myers, 1980/1995, p. 22 & 207). Second, *Gifts Differing* contains several criticisms of Jung's theory and additions to it such as the judging-perceiving dimension (p.21). Third, Myers-Briggs type theory draws from one area of Jungian psychology and relies primarily on one text, namely, *Psychological Types* and, within that, leans heavily on Chapter 10. Fourth, it draws rather selectively from within that chapter; for example, it has been suggested that the extraversion-introversion dimension within Myers-Briggs type theory is based too narrowly on social extraversion (Coan cited in Healy, 1989, p. 487). Lastly, and perhaps most significantly, the development of the Myers-Briggs questionnaire appears to conflict with Jung's intention to develop a *critical psychology* rather than a characterological
method of classifying personalities. This was explained in more depth in the foreword to the Argentine edition of *Psychological Types* (Jung, 1934/1971, CW6, pp. xiv-xv), a private letter to Hans Schäffer (Jung, 1973, pp. 129-130) and the 1936 Harvard lecture (Jung, 1937/1969, CW8, pp. 123-125). Wider aspects of Jung’s thinking are therefore neglected.

*Experiential learning*

Kolb’s (1984) theory of experiential learning is primarily a theory of learning rather than a theory of career development as it locates itself within the educational literature. He cited Jung on at least twelve occasions drawing principally from *Psychological Types* arguing, ‘it is Jung’s theory…with its concept of psychological types representing different modes of adapting to the world, and his developmental theory of individuation that will be most useful for understanding learning from experience’ (p. 16). Kolb stated that *Psychological Types*, ‘must be considered one of the most important books on individual differences ever written’ (p. 62). In the second edition, he re-affirmed his commitment to the analytical psychological roots of the theory (Kolb, 2015, pp. 27-28). Kolb argued that learning takes place via the integration of thinking, feeling, perceiving and behaving; and stated it is a, ‘holistic concept much akin to the Jungian theory of psychological types’ (1984, p. 31). He further proposed that learning takes place by a process of extension and intention closely related to extraversion and introversion (p. 52).

Despite Kolb’s enthusiasm for Jung’s ideas, the level of engagement with the Collected Works and other texts is relatively limited. He was over-reliant on
Psychological Types in the development of the experiential learning theory and Jung’s ideas on education were overlooked (Jung, 1926/1946/1954, CW17). For Kolb, the main focus was on typology and, within that, the processes of introversion and extraversion. In his overall experiential learning cycle, Kolb (1984, p. 41) separated the processes of concrete experience and abstract conceptualisation associating the former with apprehension via feelings and sensations, and the latter with comprehension via concepts and symbols. This overlooked Jung’s insistence that both thinking and feeling are rational functions. Thus, the respective roles of feeling in relation to evaluation and thinking in everyday experience are neglected. Kolb’s ideas, particularly through the popularity of learning styles questionnaires, have had some impact in career education and counselling (Arvanites, 2006, pp. 464-468) and more widely in education (Fry, Ketteridge, & Marshall, 1999, pp. 26-28). Along with Myers-Briggs theory, his theory of experiential learning must therefore count as one of the main routes through which aspects of analytical psychology have entered career studies and education more generally. The scope of this impact in career studies has, however, been limited by the dominance of social learning and social cognitive approaches to learning (Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1990). This may also have prevented other Jungian-influenced learning theories from gaining a foothold such as transformative learning (Cranton, 2006; Mezirow, 1981).

Career and myth
In an article discussing mid-life transition and career counselling, Gothard argued that, ‘the work of Carl Jung deserves particular attention’ (1996, p.
He employed concepts such as stages of life, individuation and polarities to interpret a career counselling case study. In a later article entitled *Career as a myth*, Gothard (1999) went on to discuss the relationship between myth, the dream, narrative and career. He argued that myths are meta-narratives and career dreams are private myths. Jung’s ideas on archetype, personal myth, persona and active imagination were applied in relation to a client case study. Acknowledging the tentative and exploratory nature of his work, Gothard argued there was scope to develop these ideas more fully in relation to career education and counselling. He also sought to integrate Jungian ideas into the initial and continuing professional development of careers professionals in the UK via the production of in-course teaching materials (Gothard, 1998) and a course reader (Gothard, 2001, p. 35).

Gothard’s ideas have value in bringing a distinctively Jungian dimension to contemporary narrative perspectives and making creative links between public and private myths, dreams and stories in relation to career development. He is also distinctive in finding new ways to introduce Jungian psychology into the initial and professional development of careers practitioners. In distilling Jung’s ideas, Gothard made particular use of *Memories, Dreams, Reflections* and the secondary work of Stevens, Storr and Levinson. There is therefore scope to encompass a wider range of Jungian concepts and original texts. He also focused on one-to-one interviews and there are opportunities to extend this in the direction of career education.
Organisational and workplace applications

Stein and Hollwitz’s (1992) edited collection on workplace applications of analytical psychology included chapters on archetypes, typology, groups, organisational effectiveness, the shadow and individuation. It provided a Jungian counterpart to more psychoanalytically-oriented treatments of organisational life (Hirschhorn, 1988; Obholzer & Roberts, 1994). Although the primary focus was organisational, it contained ideas relevant to career development theory. Stein (1992) stated that organisational life can lead to the constellation and enactment of archetypal roles and identified a range of archetypal figures such as Hero, Great Mother, Scapegoat, Guide, and Ritual Master. This, together with other contributions (Corlett & Pearson, 2003; MacAdams, 1993; Mitroff, 1983; Myss, 2002; Pearson, 1991) potentially provide new ways of thinking about the traditional literature on career types.

Stein also discussed the spiritual side of organisational life and this theme has been taken up elsewhere (T. Moore, 2009; Samuels, 2001, pp. 126-127; Smith, 2007; Stein, 2005). In another chapter, Auger & Arneberg (1992, p. 39) traced at least three purposes and meanings of work in Jung’s writings (survival, esteem and individuation); and stated that, ‘work in the sense of career is Psyche’s invitation to transform, to find fulfilment, to individuate’.

They emphasise the role of projection and culture in relation to the workplace, the individual and organisations. This suggests that a Jungian-inflected career development theory could profitably pay attention to these issues.
**Work and adult development**

Moraglia (1994, 1997) discussed work, individuation and adult development. He is unusual in engaging with the literature on career development theory although this is tentative (Moraglia, 1997, pp. 112-113). Most significantly, he criticised Jung’s separation of the life course into two halves because it naturalised conventions and rules of social existence prevalent at the time within Jung’s particular class and milieu. He argued that young people were concerned with wider issues of the human condition as well as the dictates of the labour market; and that older people were able to contribute economically as well as culturally. He also aligned Jungian adult development more closely to contemporary thinking in life course psychology by reducing emphasis on age-linked stages in favour of more fluid understandings of the life course. These ideas have the potential to critically evaluate and re-invigorate stage-based career development theories (Super, 1957).

**Calling and character**

Hillman (1990, pp. 171-172) argued that vocation can be inflationary leading to monotheistic overspecialisation and asserted ‘we have got work where we don’t want it’. He claimed it is important to speak of work as a pleasure rather than an economic necessity or social duty. These ideas were developed in Hillman’s (1996) exploration of calling in relation to contemporary and historical case studies. Although this text did not locate itself in relation to career studies, it is significant for at least three reasons. First, as a popular text it has helped to disseminate post-Jungian ideas to a wider non-technical audience. Second, it focused on issues of relevance to career development
such as occupational specialisation and calling. Third, it took a critical approach to conventional linear interpretations of vocation (including Adler). It could therefore have value in bringing a critical post-Jungian perspective to bear on career development theory.

Additional perspectives


Summary

Ideas from analytical psychology have entered career studies in a number of ways; typically, however, these draw quite narrowly from Jung. In comparison with psychoanalysis and individual psychology, there is no explicit Jungian theory of career development. This suggests there is a gap in the literature that needs to be filled. Specifically, there is scope to connect typology more securely with the wider body of analytical psychology and thereby develop a more critical approach to career studies. Jungian conceptions of learning have had only a limited impact on career development theory and this can be
addressed by critically evaluating social learning and social cognitive career theories in Jungian terms. The handling of personal myth by Jung, and more contemporary scholars, offers new ways of thinking about the Adlerian conceptions of narrative currently dominant in career studies. The role of projection and culture in analytical psychology can enrich understandings of current cultural systems approaches to career. Contemporary post-Jungian perspectives on life course development can also be used to refresh traditional linear and stage-based thinking in career studies.

**Key findings and sources**

In this section, cross-cutting findings from the literature review are discussed and key themes and sources for the remainder of the thesis identified. There are five main points that indicate directions for a post-Jungian re-imagination of career studies. First, the literature tends to be dominated by psychoanalysis. When depth psychology is discussed, it is generally in relation to the work of Freud or Erikson rather than Jung (Kidd, 2006; Marcus, 2017; Osipow & Fitzgerald, 1996; Reid, 2016; Watkins & Savickas, 1990). Second, contemporary career theory is more Adlerian than Jungian through the influential work of Cochran (1990b) and Savickas (2013). There is value in evaluating this aspect in relation to analytical psychology and exploring the similarities and differences between Adler and Jung’s approaches to narrative. Third, there has been limited use of Jungian texts in career studies with a particular reliance on *Psychological Types* and *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*. Where these texts are used, there is often a somewhat restricted view of their value (for example, in relation to Myers-Briggs type theory).
Wider aspects of Jung’s work have been neglected in relation to persona, typology, myth, vocation, learning, and individuation. This indicates that further evaluation of these aspects would be appropriate. Fourth, many of the depth psychology contributions focus on one-to-one career counselling and envisage a limited or non-existent role for career education. The potential of Jung’s work on learning and education has therefore been underexploited. Lastly, and most significantly, there is no explicit Jungian theory of career development. Psychoanalysis is represented by Blustein (2011) and Marcus (2017); and individual psychology by Cochran (1990b) and Savickas (2013); but there is no contemporary equivalent in analytical psychology. There is therefore a strong argument for a career development theory more fully informed by analytical psychology. The remainder of this chapter is focused on defining what themes such a theory should address and the key sources it should use. In making this selection, it is acknowledged that career theory is very wide ranging; and consequently there is a necessary degree of overlap in the identification of themes and sources.

*Career, culture and systems*

There have been several attempts to interpret career and culture through a psychoanalytic lens. As indicated above, Blustein (2011) highlighted the role of introjection, identification, attachment, internalised relational objects and the holding function of culture in understanding working life. This is a valuable addition to existing understandings of culture in career studies (Collin, 2012; Law, 1981, 1993, 2009; Patton & McMahon, 2014; Pryor & Bright, 2011).

Analytical psychology can offer at least two further useful perspectives here.
First, projection helps to understand how cultural systems operate through recursive processes; and secondly, analytical psychology emphasises the profoundly historical nature of culture (M-L. von Franz, 1978; Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, pp. 452-458; 1933/1934, CW10, pp. 148-149; Singer & Kimbles, 2004; Stein & Hollwitz, 1992; Yakushko et al., 2016).

**Career and personality**

As discussed above, career studies has been dominated by developmental theories of the personality (Gottfredson, 1981; Roe, 1957; Super et al., 1963a) that have made it difficult for other ideas to gain traction. For example, Super’s (1970/1971, p. 106; 1963a, p. 21) conception of the self appears to be more or less conscious all the way around. Analytical psychology can enrich this via the key concept of the persona (Hopcke, 1995; Jung, 1916/1966, CW7; Pye, 1965). It can also offer a useful distinction between personality and individuality (explained in Chapter Four) and thereby help career studies develop a more critical understanding of personality.

**Career types**

Several career theorists have discussed types from a psychoanalytic angle (Bordin, 1984; Bordin et al., 1963, pp. 26-28; Marcus, 2017); and, as outlined previously, MBTI theory has had an enormous impact in career studies. There is also a considerable non-psychoanalytic literature in relation to career types (P. Brown & Hesketh, 2004; Clarke, 2009; Holland, 1997; Tomlinson, 2007). There is scope to critically evaluate and enrich this through the work of post-

**Career strategies**

Career strategies are an abiding feature of the careers literature both from psychoanalytic and non-psychoanalytic perspectives (D’Allesandro, 2008; Ibarra, 2002; King, 2004; Kuijpers & Scheerens, 2006; Law & Watts, 1977; Marcus, 2017; McKenna, 2008; K. E. Mitchell et al., 1999; Savickas, 2013). For example, as discussed previously, Marcus (2017, pp. 62-71) argued that people can flourish at work by engaging in admiration, generosity, and emotional creativity. Analytical psychology provides a critical contrast through its preference for richness over parsimony in theory-making and focus on enantiodromia. Jung, perhaps as a result of his Jamesian influence, was less interested in proving a theory right or wrong than extracting its cash value and adding it to the sum of existing knowledge (1913/1961, CW4b, p. 86). For Jung, enantiodromia meant that sooner or later any theory will become its opposite. Indeed, for a psychological theory to be useful it must, in a sense, be both right and wrong. He was highly sceptical of prescriptive success formulas and recipes for living (Jung, 1931/1966, CW16, p. 41; 1961/1995, p. 328). Analytical psychology can therefore have value in developing a more critical career studies in relation to strategies for success.

**Career and narrative**

As discussed, narrative-informed approaches to career development theory have been usefully developed by a range of scholars particularly from an
Adlerian perspective (Cochran, 1990b; Savickas, 1989, 2013). In addition, there have been promising but tentative Jungian contributions in the context of career development (Gothard, 1999). There has also been, in addition to Jung’s (1961/1995) original ideas, important work on personal myth in the wider field of analytical psychology (Bishop, 2014; Giegerich, 2008; R. A. Jones, 2007; MacAdams, 1993; Rowland, 2005). This suggests there is considerable scope to enhance understanding of narrative in career development theory through an analytical psychological lens.

**Career and life course development**

The review of literature argues that there have been many important and relevant contributions to understanding of life course development (Cochran, 1990b; Gould, 1978/1979; Levinson et al., 1978; Levinson & Levinson, 1996; Super, 1990; Vaillant, 1977, 2002). Moraglia (1994, 1997) has considerably revised and improved Jung’s original statements by aligning with contemporary thinking in the field of life course psychology. These perspectives can be used to develop a more up-to-date and less age-linked view of the life course in career development theory.

**Career and learning**

It is argued above that the role of learning and career education has been neglected in the rebirth of psychoanalysis and career studies. Moreover, within career studies, the learning-based career development theories that dominate the field draw from social cognitive approaches and not analytical psychology (Krumboltz, 1979; Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996).
Kolb’s (1984, 2015) work straddles both career studies and learning theory but has been narrowly applied in the former. There is therefore considerable scope to build on this and include a richer span of Jungian approaches from the broader field of education and transformative learning (Boyd & Myers, 1988; Bulkeley & Weldon, 2011; Cranton, 2006; Dobson, 2008; Fordham, 1995; R. A. Jones et al., 2008; Mayes, 2005; Scott, 1997; Semetsky, 2013).
Chapter Two Postscript: Getting Started with Career and Jung Pt 2

I found out about Jung via an entry in a kind of encyclopaedia of psychology that I bought as part of a book club deal. The contributor provided an overview of analytical psychology and finished by quoting Jung on man coming out of God, God coming out of man and God rising like a sun in his heart (Cook, 1987, p. 405). He said that such statements were common in Jung’s writings and that he was a bit Marmite\(^1\) like that i.e. Some psychologists found it embarrassing, others loved it. Well I was intrigued. It didn’t sound like most of the psychology I’d encountered up til then. It was a kind of holistic psychology that included the arts and humanities, all aspects of human experience from the banal to the profound. I decided I wanted more. I couldn’t have known then how much more. But more, for sure.

Around that time, I became more interested in the way that ideas could inform work. Theories of management inform management etc. I met a Careers Adviser as part of my day-to-day job and she talked to me about her job. I read more about it and one of the articles stated that Careers Advisers sometimes use psychometric assessment and one of those assessments (MBTI) was based on the work of Jung. I thought that sounded like an interesting line of work. I liked the idea of job that involved learning more about that.

I discuss typology quite a bit in the lit review and it’s worth saying more about my experiences in that area. In the end, I did train as a Careers Adviser and, shortly afterwards, trained in the British Psychology Society’s psychometric assessment courses. I found these useful but a bit underwhelming. They were followed by Myers-Briggs training and that course did not disappoint. Really got things moving for me.

---

\(^1\) In case that’s obscure, a salty, strong tasting spread made from yeast extract.
There's more that could be said more about my career choices. More prosaic stuff about how I wanted to be a manager but got moved. How I wanted to earn more. How I wanted a more stable kind of job etc. But let the above stand. It's part of the jigsaw.
Chapter 3

Career, culture and systems

Introduction

In Chapters One and Two, it was argued that analytical psychology has been neglected within career development theories based on a reading of a representative range of texts. Here, this argument is advanced by critically evaluating career theory relating to cultural systems. A canonical perspective on this topic is selected: the Systems Theory Framework of Career Development (Patton & McMahon, 2014). A rationale for its selection is supplied and the origins and contents are summarised to aid orientation. A distinctive interpretation of projection² drawn from analytical psychology is provided. This interpretation is then used as the basis for critical evaluation of the Systems Theory Framework. A series of implications for career studies are subsequently developed.

² Unless otherwise indicated, projection is used as an overall term to denote projection and introjection.
Why is this valuable?

Jung’s theory of projection has been identified as one of his most significant contributions to knowledge (Bishop, 1999, p. 225; Homans, 1979/1995, pp. 189-192; Progoff, 1953/1981, pp. 170-171; Samuels, 1993, pp. 24-50). This is, however, poorly understood and applied within classic and contemporary career theory. Some career scholars refer briefly to projection but this is limited in scope and undertaken from a Freudian rather than Jungian angle (Blustein, 2011; Bordin, 1990; Ginzberg et al., 1951; Savickas, 2013; Vaillant, 2002). The present chapter helps to correct this by highlighting an analytical psychological perspective on projection. This offers a richer and more systematic understanding of the range of influences operating between individuals and their contexts. First, projection theory helps to more deeply understand how cultural systems operate through recursive and permeable processes. Second, and related to this, it emphasises their profoundly historical nature. Third, it provides a method of engaging with meta-theoretical perspectives on career. Fourth, it enables new ways of interpreting organisational, media and family influences on career development. Fifth, it highlights projection withdrawal and the consequences for individual and societal transformation. Finally, it also provides a conceptual underpinning for topics addressed in later chapters including persona (Chapter Four) and typology (Chapter Five).

Rationale for selection

As discussed in Chapter One, despite its superficially individualistic overtones, there has been a deeply cultural dimension to the study of career since the
foundational work of the Chicago School of Sociology in the 1920s and 1930s. Career was used to explore and research the thousand ‘Chicagos’ ranging from the gold coast to the slums. The ambition was to use career to construct a mosaic of the city and, more broadly, understand the nature and constitution of society (Becker, 1966; Hughes, 1937/1958; Park, 1915).

Cultural systems resurfaced as a central theme in career studies in the 1980s and 1990s. In an echo of the Chicago School, Law (1981, p. 145) took an ‘ecological’ approach to career and identified an inter-related threefold spectrum of influences: the individual, the community, and the opportunity structure. He related individual influences to self-concept, needs and drives; community influences to parents, family, neighbourhood, peer group; and opportunity structure influences to economic structure, social class and ethnic group. Super (1990) used the image of an archway consisting of two pillars connected by an arch to symbolise: personal determinants, the person, and situational determinants. He argued that biological, sociological and geographical influences act on the individual, and in turn the individual acts on those influences, during the process of growing up and functioning in society. Hodkinson and Sparkes (1997) used a Bourdieusian framework to interpret career development. They emphasised the deeply social nature of career and the role played by habitus, fields, dispositions, pragmatic rationality and horizons for action. More recently, there have been attempts to pay greater attention to the relational-cultural aspects of career development (Blustein, 2011; Schultheiss, 2007). There has also been more focus on the ways that
culture is affected by class, gender, nationality and even hemisphere (N. Arthur, 2006; Arulmani, 2014; Blustein, 2013b; Stead, 2004).

The Systems Theory Framework (Patton & McMahon, 1998, 2006, 2014) provides an exemplar of this tradition. It is argued that career is an open system subject to the interplay of wholes and parts in a process of discontinuous change. This occurs through three interacting sub-systems: the individual system, the contextual system and the societal/environmental system. This framework has been selected as a main focus in this chapter because it is widely cited in the literature and features regularly in the training and education of career development professionals (Arulmani, Bakshi, Leong, & Watts, 2014; Athanasou & Esbroeck, 2008). It covers similar topics to the literature cited above but is distinctive for its meta-theoretical attempt to integrate existing career development theories. It also pays particular attention to the recursive and permeable nature of systems influences such as family, media, and historical trends.

**Overview of the Systems Theory Framework**

drawing selectively from an eclectic range of thinkers including Ludwig von Bertalanffy, Fritjof Capra, Gregory Bateson, Kurt Lewin, Urie Bronfenbrenner, Donald Ford, and Richard Lerner. Linked to this multi-perspectival stance, they developed a constructivist epistemological position arguing that, ‘objectivity and pure knowing is impossible; all knowing is necessarily a process of interpretation’ (p. 225).

Patton and McMahon (2014, pp. 241-276) argued that career development is an open system subject to the interplay of wholes and parts in a process of discontinuous change occurring through three interacting major systems: the individual; the contextual; and the societal/environmental (see Figure 1).

They envisaged that each of these systems contained progressively further sub-systems. The individual system consisting of sixteen sub-systems
including: personality; gender; values; sexual orientation; health; disability; ability; interests; beliefs; skills; personality; world of work knowledge; age; self-concept; physical attributes; ethnicity; and aptitudes. The contextual system consisting of six sub-systems: peers; family; media; education; workplace; and community groups. The environmental/societal system consisting of six sub-systems: political decisions; historical trends; globalisation; socio-economic status; employment market; and geographical location. The three major systems were envisaged as a series of concentric circles with the individual system at the centre, the contextual in the middle, and an outer societal/environmental layer. The Systems Theory Framework includes a further range of concepts including: wholes and parts; patterns and rules; open and closed systems; acausality; recursiveness and permeability; discontinuous change; abduction; story; history; and meta-theory. Three of these elements are now discussed in more detail in view of their relevance to projection, namely: recursiveness and permeability; history; and meta-theory.

*Recursiveness and permeability*

Patton and McMahon (1998, pp. 145-146, 162-163; 2014, pp. 229-230, 254-255) emphasised the role of recursiveness in career development. It was argued that the three major sub-systems interact recursively in a non-linear, mutual and multidirectional fashion influenced by change over time and chance. The boundaries between the various systems and sub-systems were seen as permeable and open to multidirectional influence (Patton & McMahon, 2014, p. 254). In a revision of their earliest formulation (McMahon & Patton, 1995), they stressed that recursiveness was a mutual but not a
reciprocal process in career development. This allowed that many forms of influence, though mutual, are not symmetrical either in size or direction.

History

History was identified as an important influence within the environmental-societal system particularly in relation to historical trends. For instance, it was stated that ‘historical influences may…account for the values held by school leavers at time of high employment compared with those at times of high unemployment’ (Patton & McMahon, 2014, p. 251). The role of change over time was also discussed (pp. 256-259). It was stated that career development is a ‘life-span phenomenon’ taking place within a ‘broader system of time’ containing the past, present and future (p. 256). This system of time was represented as the outermost circle affecting all levels and sub-systems within the overall systems theory framework (Figure 1). They rejected a linear view of time and, drawing from feminist theory, emphasised the recursive interplay of: cycles and phases; shedding and renewal; ebb and flow (p. 257).

Meta-theory

Patton and McMahon (2014) took an explicitly meta-theoretical approach in relation to career development theories. They stated that, rather than ‘refine existing theories’ they wished to focus on developing an ‘overarching framework’ adding ‘the metatheoretical Systems Theory Framework aims to incorporate each of the constructs and process explanations in existing theories’ (p.133). This is a distinguishing aspect of their meta-theoretical
position i.e. concepts within extant career development theories are incorporated wholesale.

Summary

The major elements of the Systems Theory Framework have been described: the individual system; the contextual system; and the environmental/societal system. Further constituent concepts have also been summarised. Particular attention has been paid to the role of recursiveness, permeability, history, and meta-theory in the evolution of career systems.

Analytical psychology and projection

In the next section, the key dimensions of an analytical psychological theory of projection are discussed. The projective system is highlighted together with the complementary nature of passive and active projection. The withdrawal of projections and the role played by cultural history are also explored. The summary concludes by discussing a significant episode from Jung’s own career development.

The projective system

Analytical psychology offers a distinctive understanding of the range of influences operating between individuals and their contexts. This can be illustrated by the following quotation:

All the contents of our unconscious are constantly being projected into our surroundings…All human relationships swarm with these
projections… every normal person of our time…is bound to his
environment by a whole *system* of projections… [emphasis added].
(Jung, 1916/1948/1969, CW8, pp. 264-265)

It is the *systemic* nature of projection that is a particular feature of the Jungian
approach as it is not restricted to the micro level. The projective system
relates to *all forms* of phenomena including: ideas; belief systems; feelings;
states of mind; parts of oneself; individuals; family members; peers; types or
groups of people; nations; media; rumours; social gossip; images; texts;
organisations; ideas; causes; practices; buildings; or landscapes. It also
relates to all aspects of the unconscious and is not confined to introjected
family influences although it does include these aspects.

Jung described projection as ‘the expulsion of a subjective content into an
object’\(^3\) and argued that both positive and negative values may be projected
(1921/1971, CW6, p. 457). A particular distinction was drawn in analytical
psychology between *passive* and *active* projection. The former was seen as
largely unintended and the latter deliberate (see Table 1).

Integral to the theory, but in less detailed form, Jung also sketched ideas on
introjection and defined it as the ‘assimilation of object to subject’ (1921/1971,
CW6, p. 452) with similarly passive and active aspects. Consistent with his
compensatory and homeostatic model of the psyche, Jung saw projection and

\(^3\) It is acknowledged that this may appear to imply an objectivist split between subject and
object. Jung was not wholly consistent on this point. In line with the constructivist position
outlined in Chapter One, my view is that terms such as subject and object can be deployed in
a technical sense without recourse to objectivist dualisms provided they are simply
understood as conveying more nuanced and subtle ways of interpreting the phenomena of
the psyche.
introjection as complementary introverting and extraverting processes respectively. He also identified the importance of what he termed ‘hooks’ and ‘counter-projections’ arguing that these can occur particularly when the ‘object’ is unconscious of the quality projected into it (Jung, 1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 273).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Passive projection and introjection</th>
<th>Active projection and introjection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Passive projection i.e. indiscriminate scattering or expulsion</td>
<td>Active projection i.e. discriminating engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive introjection i.e. indiscriminate hoarding or ingesting</td>
<td>Active introjection i.e. discriminating assimilation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Largely unconscious i.e. automatic or unintended</td>
<td>More conscious i.e. voluntary or intended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited sense of differentiation and evaluation i.e. identification</td>
<td>Clearer differentiation and evaluation i.e. deciding what belongs where leading to the withdrawal and seeing through of passive projections and introjections</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1

Projection is regarded as a natural or normal phenomenon in analytical psychology; it being neither possible nor desirable to completely withdraw all projections. It is also seen as purposive. For instance, it is often only through the sometimes painful or laborious acknowledgement of passive projection that a neglected aspect of oneself such as the inferior function can be acknowledged. It is further held that there is a relationship between cognition and projection. Jung argued that theories are influenced by the personal equation of the observer (1921/1971, CW6, p. 9). For example, astrology was interpreted as an entirely projected theory of personality (Jung,
1934/1954/1968, CW9i, p. 6); and alchemy was seen as, ‘the projection of a drama both cosmic and spiritual in laboratory terms’ (Jung, 1977, p. 228).

Projection is highly relevant to social relationships. Passive projection represents a limited form of relating to others. The other person is, however, misrecognised and the prospect of a deeper kind of relationship compromised.

A person whom I perceive mainly through my projections is an *imago* or, alternatively, a *carrier* of imagos or symbols. (Jung, 1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 264)

This failure to connect can lead to *idealisation* of the familiar and *demonisation* of the strange i.e. the feeling that ‘the dangerous people live on the other side of the mountain’ (Jung, 1997b, p. 741). Conversely, the ‘other’ may be given a fascinating quality with the negative valuation lying closer to home. In either situation, the net outcome is a kind of alienation from oneself and others. This was described as having, ‘no point of view…one doesn’t exist, one is scattered’ (Jung, 1997a, p. 50); and, ‘living outside of ourselves’ (Jung, 1997a, p. 417).

In response to these problems, Jung proposed the ‘self-recollection’ and ‘gathering together’ of scattered contents (1942/1954/1969, CW11, p. 263). He envisaged that these processes of ‘seeing through’ (1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 265) and ‘mutual withdrawal of projections’ (1957, CW10, p. 300) would lead to reconciliation within individuals and between groups. Five
phases of re-collection were sketched (identity, differentiation, evaluation, elucidation and integration) (Jung, 1943/1948/1968, CW13, pp. 199-201) and these have been considerably elucidated by later scholars (M-L. von Franz, 1978, pp. 9-11; Stein, 1998, pp. 179-189). Jung discussed individuals who, having seen through their projections (at least to a degree), can live in the ‘House of the Gathering’ and no longer indiscriminately assign their bad (or good) qualities to others (1938/1940/1969, CW11, p. 83). This links with Jung’s story of the Rainmaker of Kiau Tschou who was invited from another region to help a drought-hit community in crisis. In order to provide assistance, he needed to not only feel the community’s distress, but also re-collect and re-enter into relationship with himself (Jung, 1988, pp. 824-825). The rain that subsequently ensued can be seen as a release of blocked energy in the community. Here, the relationship with the Rainmaker’s ‘inner’ community enabled the wider community it to get (back) into relationship with itself.

Projection and history

A Jungian perspective on projection is also distinctive because of its historical aspects. First, it was argued that a theory of projection helps to more clearly understand historical phenomena.

Wars, dynasties, social upheavals, conquests, and religions are but the superficial symptoms of a secret psychic attitude unknown even to the individual himself, and transmitted by no historian…

(Jung, 1933/1934, CW10, pp. 148-149)
The rise of Nazism in Germany was seen by Jung as part of a ‘mass psychosis’ that gripped the entire country and beyond\(^4\) (1946, CW10, p. 233).

Second, the individual psyche was seen in profoundly historical terms. Developing a positive relation to one’s historical context, through active projection, was envisaged as a necessary condition of individuation.

...we think we are able to be born today and to live...without history. That is a disease, absolutely abnormal, because man \([s/c]\) is not born every day. He is born once in a specific historical setting, with specific historical qualities, and therefore he is only complete when he has a relation to these things. If you grow up with no connection to the past, it is just as if you were born without eyes and ears.

(Jung, 1977, pp. 348-349)

Third, Jung detected the presence of history in the current moment; ‘Oedipus is still alive for us’ (1912/1956, CW5, p. 4). Not only was history within us, it was also around us, ‘all life is living history’ (Jung, 1929/1966, CW16, p. 69). At any one time, it was argued, our imagination is populated by cavemen, classical people and medieval figures (Jung, 1997b, pp. 1133-1134). These historical aspects of identity can be seen in a painting from *The Red Book* featuring a bright mandala surrounded by modern individuals, followed by bewigged figures from the middle ages, then early hominids, and finally skulls and skeletons (Jung, 2009, p. 169). This link between projection and cultural history has also been a feature of contemporary scholarship in analytical psychology. Singer and Kimbles (2004) have discussed the cultural complex;

\(^4\) Jung was also affected by this mass phenomenon. The slightly ambivalent 1938 interview with H.R. Knickerbocker suggests that Jung only partially saw through his fascination with the rise of Hitler (Jung, 1977, pp. 115-135).
and Yakushko, Miles, Rajan, Bujko, & Thomas (2016) have explored the cultural unconscious. For instance, Yakushko et al. (2016, p. 665) provided examples of women required to carry a burden of cultural projections regarding gender, ethnicity, class, and ability; and ‘internalized cultural messages about their worth and place within society’.

**An example: the murder of the hero**

The above points may feel rather abstract but can be grounded in a key moment from Jung’s own career development. Between 1900 and 1909, he was employed at the Burghölzli Clinic as a Staff Physician; and, from 1905 to 1914, he worked as a Lecturer on the Medical Faculty at the University of Zürich. He reportedly suffered from overwork and yet, at the same time, nursed ambitions about a possible professorship. On the 18th December 1913, Jung had an extraordinarily powerful dream that revealed his identification with an historical image. The dream featured the murder of Siegfried, a mythological and heroic figure featured in Wagner’s *The Ring of the Nibelung*. Jung linked the hero with ‘headlong striving work’ (2009, p. 240) and reported a ‘secret identity’ (1961/1995, p. 205) with its intellectual and wilful qualities. There are, in my view, at least four historical dimensions to the dream. First, it related to Jung’s personal family history and the unlived lives of his parents. Second, it linked with his experiences of work and possibly non-work relationships. Third, it related to German political history and the

---

5 Jung complained in his letters to Freud about ‘the shackles of the clinic’ (1974b, p. 214; 1974c, p. 56) and feeling ‘chained to the clinic’ (1974a, p. 163). He also discussed obtaining a chair in psychiatry (Jung, 1974c, p. 56). He resigned as an unsalaried lecturer (*privatdocent*) at Zürich on 30 April 1914 (Maguire, 1974, p. 551).

6 A link between the Siegfried dream and Jung’s extramarital relationships has been proposed by Barreto (2016).
nationalistic atmosphere around the time of the First World War. Finally, it connected with German cultural history, Wagner’s presentation of Siegfried and its subsequent influence on audiences.

The process of seeing through Siegfried enabled Jung to make sense of his feelings about working at the Burghölzli Clinic and Zürich University. It helped him pay attention to the neglected introverted, intuitive and feeling sides of his nature; and use this in his clinical work and writings (Jung, 1989/2012, p. 53). It also assisted Jung’s wider development. He did not see Siegfried simply as a hero; rather, he worshipped him as ‘my lord and God’ (2009, p. 242). This helped him understand the nature of the projected value. The heroic pursuit of work had, in effect, become a religion to him. This is a key part of the evaluation process in projection withdrawal discussed earlier; and it released energy for active projection and introjection. Much later, Jung experienced something he likened to Saint Symeon’s⁷ vision of God rising ‘like a little sun in his own heart’ (1976c, p. 28). He also reported feeling ‘spread out over the landscape and inside things…living in every tree, in the splashing of the waves, in the clouds and the animals that come and go, in the procession of the seasons’ (Jung, 1961/1995, p. 252). This latter passage has been interpreted as a regressive attempt to ‘return to a state of unbornness’ (Giegerich, 2004, p. 47). This, however, misreads the nature of projection in analytical psychology. There is no sense in which a return to participation mystique, or a pre-modern level of consciousness, is possible or desirable following the withdrawal of passive projection. Jung’s experiences of feeling

⁷ The Byzantine mystic known as Saint Symeon the New Theologian (941-1022) (Maloney, 1976).
the divine within his heart and connecting with nature should, in my view\textsuperscript{8}, be interpreted as instances of \textit{active} introjection and projection respectively; and provide concrete examples of what has been referred to as the double secular and religious nature of analytical psychology (R. Main, 2013). The important role of cultural history is also highlighted in the form of the Siegfried and Saint Symeon figures. These illustrate two different modes of historical influence relating to the passive or active nature of projection.

\textit{Summary}

In the preceding section, key aspects of an analytical psychological theory of projection have been identified. Particular attention has been paid to the projective system and the complementary nature of projection and introjection in passive and active modes. The overall process of projection withdrawal has been highlighted together with its constituent phases. The link between cultural history and projection has also been discussed.

\textit{Evaluation}

The strengths and weakness of the Systems Theory Framework are now critically evaluated from the perspective of analytical psychology. A Jungian theory of projection is used to assess and enrich Patton and McMahon's ideas with a particular focus on recursiveness, permeability, history, and meta-theory. Attention then shifts to related areas of the framework including organisational, media, and family influences. The process of projection withdrawal is also discussed.

\textsuperscript{8} It is acknowledged that Jung's remarks on active projection and introjection are brief and his writings contain few, if any, explicit examples of either phenomenon.
Social and holistic

The Systems Theory Framework has contributed to career studies by helping career development practitioners and their clients understand the range of influences on career development. It has helped to counter individualising approaches in the literature by emphasising the social nature of career development. This links to some extent with Jung’s (1989/2012, pp. 142-143) ideas on the social dimensions of individuality that extended to families, nations and groups of nations. Whilst Patton and McMahon’s concentric circles contrast with Jung’s geological model, both images emphasise the social nature of individuality. Patton and McMahon also share aspects of Jung’s syncretic and holistic approach. They eschew reducing individuality to one theory only or atomised elements such as personality, gender, and/or class.

The role of the unconscious and projection

The unconscious is not accorded a significant place in the Systems Theory Framework. The entries on psychodynamic psychology in the index related wholly to the work of Bordin; and neither Freud nor Jung were listed in the index or bibliography. Bordin’s\textsuperscript{9} Freudian-based interpretation of career development was briefly considered focusing on early childhood experiences but found wanting in terms of its empirical base and hypothesis testing (Patton & McMahon, 2014, pp. 50-52). This particular criticism sits uneasily alongside Patton and McMahon’s rejection of positivism and espousal of a constructivist

\textsuperscript{9} Bordin’s work is discussed in more detail in Chapter Two.
epistemology. Furthermore, projection was not identified as playing a significant role in the Systems Theory Framework. It was not discussed in relation to key areas of influence such as recursiveness, permeability, history, media, community, or family. For example, despite the framework’s origins in family systems theory, the introjection of parental influences does not feature in the discussion of family influences on children (pp. 249-250). In my view, Jung’s theory of projection indicates new ways of imagining the social in relation to career development. It highlights that society, and therefore career development too, is held together and in part constituted by a web of group and individual projections and counter-projections. It is the systemic nature of projection in analytical psychology that enlarges the scope of projection to include all dimensions of the Systems Theory Framework: the individual, contextual, societal/environmental, and historical. This represents a significant enhancement of the framework.

*Recursiveness and permeability*

As discussed earlier, the recursive and permeable nature of systems and subsystems is a key part of the Systems Theory Framework. An analytical psychological theory of projection helps to see this in more nuanced ways. Passive projection *collapses* synchronic boundaries between images of self and world. In contrast, the process of projection withdrawal *creates* boundaries within the psyche as the individual gradually sorts out what belongs where. Active projection then *crosses* or perhaps *subverts* boundaries in order to enable the creation of fuller connections and relationships. A key area within the Systems Theory Framework is therefore
revised. A Jungian theory of projection highlights that there at least two modes of recursiveness and permeability: the passive and active forms.

**History**

As previously discussed, the Systems Theory Framework acknowledges the role of history and the passage of time. This is a distinctive contribution that marks it out from traditional approaches in career theory (e.g. Holland, 1997). It does not, however, identify projection as playing a significant role in history. Analytical psychology helps to understand how passive projection collapses diachronic boundaries between the perceived present and past. Individuals are condemned simply to repeat the past. Passive projection is therefore an inherently conservative process in career development. Seeing through, in contrast, serves to create boundaries between the perceived present and the past; and active projection crosses boundaries by opening up history and enabling a wider range of historical connections to be forged. The role of history in the Systems Theory Framework is therefore significantly enriched. The theory of passive projection helps to understand the unacknowledged weight of history and the pressure of cultural conditioning (Yakushko et al., 2016). Active projection, on the other hand, enables individuals to release the historical imagination and make use of the past to illuminate the present.

**Meta-theory**

Patton and McMahon (2014) defined the Systems Theory Framework as a metatheoretical synthesis of existing career development theories. In some respects, this openness to existing theory is commendable. A key argument in
favour of the systems theory is its recognition and acknowledgment of all existing contributions (p. 261). Nevertheless, this method of handling multiple theories should be critically discussed in relation to projection and introjection. There is something indiscriminate about an unconditional positive regard for all theories. It is almost as though, if all theories have equal value, then insufficient judgement has been exercised. It suggests they have been uncritically absorbed but not digested and further evaluation is needed. For instance, areas of conflict and/or duplication need to be refined and renovated rather than glossed over. A further process of reflexivity is also required in relation to the personal equation of each author.

Career as an organisation

Contemporary analytical psychologists have applied Jung’s ideas to the study of organisations. Colman (1992, p. 95) introduced the notion of the ‘organisational self’. This was followed by Corlett and Pearson (2003) on ‘the organisational psyche’ (p. 17) and ‘the organisation unconscious’ (p. 15). These innovative ideas have been useful in extending the scope and reach of analytical psychology. Career or, rather, the career psyche and its correlate the career unconscious, is a special form of organisation. The career psyche is an open system of indefinite extent made up of career-related roles and relationship each with conscious and unconscious dimensions. Occupations, for example, are relatively loose in organisational terms but, nonetheless, provide a focus for significant emotional career investments. Indeed, many people identify with their jobs. I once met a manager of an organisation who would tell his team members, ‘this is my house’. He had become captured by
his leadership role. It would be consistent with Jung’s ideas to suggest that all occupational roles can be linked with projection. There are public or conscious aspects to every occupation (for example, the sales and marketing literature associated with attracting new entrants to the occupation; the lists of knowledge, skills and competencies espoused by professional training bodies and employing organisations; and the demanding ethical standards of professional conduct). At the same time, there are private or below-the-line aspects to every occupation that relate to the occupational unconscious. For example, an occupation may publicly pride itself on being customer-focused and yet, at an unconscious shadow level, resent its customers. Moreover, every occupation is influenced by what others project into it. Any individual in any occupation, whether a cleaner, teacher or entrepreneur, is subject to the projections of others. At the extreme, with regard to passive projection, each person in an occupational role is tied by invisible threads that the community projects into that role and vice versa. This re-emphasises the systemic significance of projection.

The media and the career spectacle

As has been previously indicated, the words career and carrier are linked in terms of word history and derive from carrus meaning wagon or chariot (OUP, 2002). In passive projection, to some extent, career is always happening elsewhere; and in passive introjection, career-related phenomena are indiscriminately absorbed or ingested. In this way, career is reduced to a spectacle (Debord, 1967/2009, pp. 48-49). It is lived vicariously through the fragments of other lives glimpsed through the mass media in sport, politics,
and entertainment. This relates to Jung’s point about ‘living outside of ourselves’ (1997a, p. 417). It follows from this that we are immersed in a sea of career projections and counter-projections. One cannot not influence and one cannot help but be subject to the projections and counter-projections of others. These are the figures, organisations, and images that occupy the popular career imagination. These are the phenomena met by career development practitioners and their clients in day-to-day life and the activities of career education and counselling. For example, *The Daily Mail*, a right-wing newspaper based in the UK, ran front page headlines during the 2012 financial crisis, that demanded ‘put bankers in the dock’ (30th June 2012); and declared judges to be ‘enemies of the people’ following the UK’s referendum on membership of the European Union in 2016 (4th November 2016) (Mailonline, 2017). This illustrates the nature of some media influences; entire groups of workers are subject to scapegoating processes. Returning to the Systems Theory Framework, the role of the media, society and community is clearly identified but an appreciation of projection is necessary in helping to understand, in more detail, how these career-related influences occur.

*Idealisation and demonisation*

A related point is that projection can help to understand the idealisation and envy of certain occupations such as entrepreneurs, firefighters, sports people or film stars. Indeed, this can be extended to any well-known organisations, cultural products or objects. For example, projection may play a role in the highly idealising meanings given to the Apple corporation, its computers and its co-founder Steve Jobs during the first decade of the 21st century (Self,
2013). At a less dramatic level, a certain amount of idealisation or even enchantment is probably at play in relation to joining many occupations. Demonisation is also an aspect of occupational life. Von Franz (1978) discussed the *scapegoating* of an individual soldier in a company or regiment (p. 80); and how an individual can become the butt of all jokes in a group (p. 32). In a university, for example, there may be mutual antipathy between lecturers and managers with both suspecting each side of their worst faults. It is often easier (and more exciting) to blame another person or group rather than engage in a demanding process of self-criticism.

*Family influences*

As previously indicated, Patton and McMahon identified the family as a key dimension of the contextual system but did not link this to projection. Parents, however, often project unrealised career goals and ambitions into their children. Von Franz (1978, p. 17) discussed this in relation to a mother who neglected her spiritual side and projected this into her son in the form of an ambition to pursue an overly rarefied academic career. Similarly, a father may influence his child about office work with his complaints, on returning home, about the ‘demanding’ company or ‘difficult’ co-workers. An experienced work colleague may attempt to welcome a newcomer to a job by saying ‘it’s just like one big happy family here’.

*The withdrawal of projections*

projections is seen as reducing the potency of the influences exerted on the projected ‘object’. One effect of seeing through what is projected into celebrities, parents or members of a peer group is to reduce their influence. I don’t mean to reduce simply with regard to the individual concerned – although I do mean this – more pertinently, I mean to reduce their power over others, free up energy and enable a range of individuals to select alternative responses. There are implications here for the scope of career development work. Withdrawal of projections may aid any one individual in job choice but this by no means exhausts the role of projection withdrawal in transforming career development processes. For example, processes of career idealisation and demonisation can be better understood and responded to whether in relation to international and national figures, organisations, occupations or day-to-day work experiences. Gathering in the angels and demons can have unexpected results. Von Franz (1978, p. 30) discusses the emergence of ‘an intense new interest in life’ from bringing projected contents into consciousness. The withdrawal of projections potentially frees up energy to enrich and nourish the individuation process. As discussed previously, analytical psychology draws attention to the secular and religious aspects of the career psyche. Whilst contemporary working life is often seen in secular terms, it nonetheless provides a site for religious projections with its attention to rituals and heightened emotional investments. It is, in a sense, a secular religion. Seeing through topics like work-life balance and workaholism enables the deeper nature of the projected value to be realised.
**Occupying the house of the gathering**

In career terms, occupying the house of the gathering gives a *new meaning* to occupation. The traditional view of occupation relates to occupying a specific job role. Occupying the house of the gathering, in contrast, can take place regardless of job role and assist with a range of typical work problems. For example, one might notice that a workplace colleague is regularly and unaccountably irritating. This perhaps relates to each person standing in the others’ shadow and ‘the otherness of the other’ (Jung cited in Illing, 1957, p. 80). It is difficult, however, to productively address this until the irritation has been seen through at least to an extent. Speaking from this new space, the house of the gathering, provides alternative and perhaps more auspicious points for engaging in transformative workplace conversations. Individuals who ‘gather’ or ‘re-collect’ by becoming more conscious of projections can change the career weather wherever they are.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

Jung’s key concepts of seeing through, self-recollection, and gathering together, have particular value in relation to career literacy i.e. a *critical* reading of career development. This is relevant for research, training and practice. First, in relation to research, the role of projection should more explicitly inform all career development theories (not just the Systems Theory Framework) and extend to considering the personal equation of career researchers. Second, in relation to training, there is a need for innovation in the professional training of career development practitioners by addressing the role of projection in one-to-one and group work. For instance, a workshop
could be designed to help professionals understand why, despite their best
efforts, they continue to be seen as authority figures by clients. The
fascinating allure of work could also be explored in relation to the secular and
religious nature of the career psyche. Finally, in relation to practice, there are
already a range of innovative techniques, including socio-drama and systems
mapping, that help individuals identify and understand the range of systems
influences in operation (Patton & McMahon, 2014, pp. 323-386). These could
be extended to include discussion of projection and cover many of the topics
identified in this chapter: family, community, history, media, organisations, and
career metaphors. As discussed previously, Jung provided a vivid example of
possession by the hero. The hero is certainly a prevalent career metaphor, but
by no means the only one, as career admits of multiple metaphors. To name
but a few, it can be visualised as: relationship; inheritance; cycle; matching;
journey; ladder; drama; or story (Inkson, 2007). Helping people see through
these images lends an emancipatory and creative dimension to contemporary
careers work.

**Conclusion**

A distinctive take on projection within analytical psychology, drawing from
classic and contemporary sources, has been offered and used to critically
evaluate the Systems Theory Framework. As a result, some key steps
towards a critical and transformative career development theory have been
proposed. My main argument can be summarised as follows.
Patton and McMahon’s emphasis on recursiveness, permeability, history, media, community, and family is a significant contribution to career studies because it opens up a critical space for the identification of influences and what to do about them. A careful appreciation of Jungian projection theory enables an even deeper understanding of career development. Specifically, it enriches the Systems Theory Framework in four ways. First, the projective system helps to understand the relationship between individual, contextual and environmental/societal influences. Second, the distinction between active and passive projection provides an aide to interpreting recursiveness and permeability in active and passive modes. Third, it provides a deeper understanding of cultural history and career. Lastly, it also enables a fuller understanding of idealisation and demonisation processes in relation to career development.

These relatively brief remarks are not intended to exhaust the many dimensions of career development and projection and further aspects will be discussed in later chapters. Rather, they are intended to indicate lines of action for radical and powerful transformation in career development. They shine a light on hidden sources of energy that fundamentally influence our relationships in the workplace, the community and further afield.
Chapter Three Postscript: Ladders and Quilts

Looking back on this chapter got me thinking about the messages about career I may have taken in whilst growing up. I was told I was ‘dead brainy’ – ‘you’re dead brainy you are’. What a phrase that is! For full effect, needs to be said to you in a strong accent by a fine looking Yorkshire girl.

Another time, a less academic boy and I were kicking footballs at each other and laughing uproariously. The P.E. teacher stopped us and shouted, ‘it’s ok for him to be stupid, not you!’. I doubt it helped either of us.

I remember a moment near my final year. I was sitting in a room on the top floor of the main school building looking out across the playground and thinking ‘that’s it – I’m done with it, no more ladders’. Of course, I wasn’t fully done with it. But there was a hint…of seeing through perhaps? I hesitate to overstate it.

Fast forward 20 years and I’m leading a class full of keen trainee career helpers. They’ve been asked to pick a resource, anything, a story, a song, that they and others might find useful. One of these is a poem The Quilt by Jan Sellers containing the lines:

I gave up career ladders long ago
Instead, I make a patchwork, intricate,
with patterns that accumulate and show
paths chosen, chances taken, twists of fate.
(Sellers, 1995, p. 159)

I feel like this poem, more eloquently of course, links with the experiences of my school age self. A Western, middle class cultural stereotype of career – the ladder – is seen through and gradually replaced by a home grown alternative – the quilt.
Not only is the quilt a less traditional career metaphor it also enables a significant degree of customisation by the quilt maker.

Good – I reckon I can do something with that. Perhaps a career education workshop where I can help people identify common images of career and link that to projection.
Introduction

In this chapter, career development theories focused on personality are evaluated using the key Jungian concept of persona. A rationale for selection is provided and this genre of career development theory summarised. A canonical text on this topic is selected: Career Development: Self-Concept Theory (Super et al., 1963a). Analytical psychological perspectives on persona are discussed and a distinctive position argued in relation to debates in that literature. This interpretation is used to critically evaluate self-concept theory. Implications arising from this for developing a more critical approach to career studies are proposed and related to research, training and practice.

Why is this valuable?

This chapter has particular relevance in view of the debates over identity within career studies discussed in the opening literature review (Chapter Two) and the role of projection in career development (Chapter Three). A Jungian
perspective on persona has value for the field of career studies because it enables critical purchase on a range of issues connected with identity and self-fulfilment. It enables the development of a more critical career studies informed by a depth approach to psychology. As a canonical theory, Super’s self-concept theory has, of course, been criticised from a range of perspectives; however, the focus of this chapter is to carry out the evaluation using an analytical psychological perspective on persona. This forms a distinctive contribution to career studies as self-concept theory has not previously been considered from this angle.

**Overview of career development and personality**

The literature on personality and self-concept forms a significant genre of career development theory. It is characterised by a focus on the process of personality formation usually highlighting one or more distinctive features. Three such perspectives are now summarised by way of illustration. Roe (1957) argued that personality was related to the levels of parental emotional involvement experienced by the child. She was interested in the way that these experiences led to interest in non-people or people-oriented occupations. Super (1963) proposed that that career choice and development was essentially a process of developing and implementing self-concepts (discussed in more detail below). The process was described as one of synthesis and carried out through role play with significant others. Gottfredson (1981) argued that personality was a function of gender, social class, intelligence, interest, and occupational images. She paid particular attention to
processes of circumscription and compromise whereby individuals developed views about occupations they saw as appropriate to gender and class norms.

As indicated earlier, Super’s Self-Concept Theory has been selected for a more detailed discussion. His work evolved syncretically over a period of several decades (Super, 1953, 1957, 1980, 1984, 1990, 1992; Super et al., 1996; Super, Starishevsky, Matlin, & Jordaan, 1963b). The theory has been selected for its widespread influence and abiding power within the field of career studies. It is described as one of the ‘big five’ career theories (Leung, 2008, pp. 115-132) and continues to feature prominently in contemporary edited collections (Lent & Brown, 2013b; Sharf, 2013b). It provides a critical contrast with theories of vocational identity focused on measurable traits and interests (Super et al., 1996, pp. 137-138). As a social psychologist, Super’s work is seminal in career studies for providing the bridge between the sociological concept of career (see Chapter One) and the psychology of occupations. His self-concept theory has particular relevance to this chapter because it focuses on social roles and identity and, specifically, the relationship between work roles and self-fulfilment.

**Summary of Self-Concept Theory**

Super defined the self-concept as ‘a picture of the self in some role, some situation, in a position, performing some set of functions, or in some web of relationships’ (Super et al., 1963a, p. 18). As discussed in Chapter Two, Super’s focus was mainly on the conscious aspects of career development accessible via an individual’s self-description. He stated that self-concepts
'are what a self-observing person believes himself to be' (Super et al., 1963a, p. 20). He declared the unconscious to be outside the purview of self-concept theory (Super et al., 1963a, p. 21); and defined the unconscious as a nonphenomenon (Super & Bohn, 1970/1971, p. 106). Following his Jamesian and Meadian influences, Super’s view of the self is always or largely a social and conscious self (Super & Bohn, 1970/1971, p. 106). Self-concept theory is now described in more detail below in relation to: the life-space; the life-span; metadimensions; situational determinants; and the relationship between the self-concept system and work.

*Life-space*

Super defined the life-space as ‘the constellation of positions occupied and roles played by a person’ (1990, p. 218). Nine major roles were identified: child, student, leisurite, citizen, worker, spouse, homemaker, parent and pensioner (Super, 1980). He further identified four principal theatres in which these roles are played out: home, community, education and workplace. He acknowledged there may well be other relevant roles (for example, sibling, reformer, criminal) and theatres (for example, church, club); and that individuals do not occupy all roles and theatres simultaneously. Super’s ideas provide a central link with the earlier pioneering work of the Chicago School of Sociology in relation to the study of career discussed in Chapter One. He stated that both role players and observers have expectations of roles and role performance is influenced by both parties.
Super developed the concept of role salience and observed that roles wax and wane in importance during the course of a life. This occurred in relation to both the temporal importance of a role i.e. the amount of time devoted to it; and the emotional importance i.e. the level of emotional involvement. He suggested that roles serve to either balance and enrich life or conflict and overburden it. He argued that people develop role self-concepts and, taken together, these form an overall self-concept system. Influenced by the life course theory of Bühler (1935), Super envisaged the self-concept system evolving over a life-span or maxi-cycle consisting of five stages: growth, exploration, establishment, maintenance, and disengagement. A significant refinement to the maxi-cycle was the idea that roles can go through mini-cycles of growth, exploration, establishment, maintenance, and disengagement. Indeed, further steps or developmental tasks were envisaged within the five stage model. For instance, in relation to the worker role, the exploration stage was further broken down into the tasks of: crystallisation (clarifying work values); specification (deciding between occupations); and implementation (applying for jobs). Super saw career development as involving multiple sequences and patterns of mini-cycles. This introduced an explicitly dynamic aspect absent from many other approaches to life-span psychology.
**Metadimensions**

Super identified 13 metadimensions of the self-concept system (1963a, pp. 23-30). He listed seven metadimensions that related to any one aspect of a self-concept, namely: self-esteem, clarity, abstraction, refinement, certainty, stability, and realism. He also identified six metadimensions that related to the constellation of dimensions making up the self-concept system: structure, scope, harmony, flexibility, idiosyncrasy, andregnancy. There is insufficient space to include definitions of all 13 metadimensions but three examples relating to the self-concept system provide an indication of his thinking.

Flexibility means the ease with which individuals can modify their role self-concepts and self-concept system. Idiosyncrasy refers to the distinctiveness of the self-concept system particularly in relation to an individual’s perception of others. Regnancy relates to the development of an overall self-concept system within which there is significant investment of meaning in one or more role self-concepts.

**Situational determinants**

Super (1980, pp. 294-296) identified a range of personal and situational determinants that influence the self-concept system. This was later elaborated into what he termed an ‘architectonic’ model of career development (Super, 1992, pp. 38-41). This archway of career determinants included immediate situational determinants such as employment, school, community, peer groups, and family. It also extended to remote determinants such as social structure, economic conditions, historical change, labour markets, socioeconomic organisation, social policy, and employment practices. He
argued that situational determinants influence career preferences, choices, entry into the labour force, and role changes; whilst allowing that some enactment and role shaping is possible by the individual.

*The place of work in people’s lives*

Despite acknowledging a range of socio-economic determinants, Super consistently argued that work roles provided ‘a focus for personality organisation’ for the majority of people (1984, p. 196; 1990, p. 208; Super et al., 1996, p. 125). He maintained that people varied in their abilities, interests and personalities; and this qualified them for occupations requiring a characteristic pattern of such features. ‘Self-concept theory’, he argued, ‘is essentially matching theory, in which individuals consider both their own attributes and the attributes required by occupations’ (Super, 1984, p. 208). In this respect, he explicitly incorporated the matching paradigm central to the foundation of vocational guidance (Parsons, 1909).

*Summary*

The key aspects of Self-Concept Theory have been briefly described, namely: definition; role of conscious / unconscious; the life-space; the life-span; metadimensions; situational determinants; and the relationship between self-concept and work. It is revealing that Super saw Self-Concept Theory as the possible future core of a global or systems theory of career development and in many respects his work anticipates Patton and McMahon’s Systems Theory Framework discussed in Chapter Three. There is also a strong connection between self-concept theory and personal construct theory. Indeed, Super
stated that, on reflection, he should have used the term personal constructs rather than self-concepts (1984, pp. 207-208).

**Analytical psychology and persona**

Jung’s explicit theorising about persona primarily took place in the period 1916 to 1928 and can be found in: ‘The Structure of the Unconscious’ (1916/1966, CW7); *Psychological Types* (1921/1971, CW6); the 1925 *Seminar on Analytical Psychology* (1989/2012); and ‘The Relations between the Ego and the Unconscious’ (1928/1966, CW7). It was a subject he also occasionally returned to in subsequent work. There have been further important contributions by later writers (Hopcke, 1995; Jacobi, 1967/1976; Perlman, 1968; Pye, 1965; Stein, 1998, pp. 105-124). Pye (1965, p. 70) reported finding the topic labyrinthine and ‘peculiarly difficult to grasp’ and my initial reading left me similarly confused. Consequently, this summary starts with a discussion of initial definitions and the role of history and culture. It then moves to areas of active debate in analytical psychology concerning Jung’s view of the persona and its place in the structure of the psyche.

**Definition**

Jung described the persona as a segment of the collective psyche equating to the conscious personality. It was defined as a compromise, ‘a complicated system of relations between the individual consciousness and society’ (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 192). In a diagram discussed in the 1925 Seminar, he located the persona above the ego at the conscious surface of the psyche in contrast to the progressively deeper and more unconscious elements of the
individuality, typology, shadow, anima/us and archetypal images (Jung, 1989/2012, pp. 138-139). Consistent with his overall homeostatic approach, the persona was seen in relation to these elements. For example, Jung described the persona as ‘conscious all round’ (1916/1966, CW7, p. 298); and ‘the ideal picture of a man [sic] as he should be’ (1928/1966, CW7, p. 194). He related the persona to conformity with collective norms and the personality; in contrast to individuality and differentiation from collective norms (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 465; 1928/1966, CW7, pp. 157-158). The persona provided a counterpart to the shadow which contained repressed or inferior aspects. It also had a compensatory link with the syzygy (or anima/us). Just as the persona enabled relationship with the wider world so the syzygy enabled relationship with the archetypal images of the unconscious. Jung’s overall theory of projection is also significant. Recognition of persona identification is often linked to processes of passive projection and introjection. Seeing through, and gathering in, enables the recollection of persona function to the individual and better relating in social contexts.

History
Jung argued that history, as it relates to the lives of public figures, is little more than a history of the persona. He stated that, ‘most of the biography of a public figure consists of the persona’s history and often of very little individual truth’ (Jung, 1936/1977, CW18, p. 579). Jung’s attention was less on the great events and figures of history than on the epoch-making hidden lives of individuals (Jung, 1933/1934, CW10, p. 149). His own approach to writing perhaps provides an example of the return of persona functioning because it
enabled him to inform and irrigate his theory-making with his wider life. In the Collected Works, the main focus was on theory-building where he presented the persona of formal scientist or man of letters. There were, however, autobiographical elements in these and other texts. He also stressed the importance of the subjective confession and personal equation (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 9; 1935/1977, CW18, p. 125). In addition, he provided evidence, through The Red Book, letters, memoirs, seminars and interviews, of intimate thoughts, feelings and fantasies not usually available to the general public.

Culture
Jung argued that the persona manifested in many different forms and stated that there was a ‘limitless variety’ to its representations (1928/1966, CW7, p. 210). He used the image of a ‘mask’ on at least 20 occasions (e.g. Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 192; 1948/1973, p. 484; 1955/1956/1970, CW14, p. 380) and around 40 or so additional images. Jung also located images of persona in classic and contemporary culture; for example, Carl Spitteler’s Prometheus and Epimetheus (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, pp. 166-173). In similar vein, Pye (1965, p. 78) argued that examples of persona can be found in other areas of literature such as the biblical story of Joseph and his coat of many colours. The implication is that persona-related themes are archetypal in the sense that they recur in classic and contemporary culture.

10 These images included: petty god, angel, sacrifice, padding, vehicle, barricade, face, false self, false wrapping, husk, shell, cloak, bridge, bark, skin, gateway, and counterweight.
Suspicion and affirmation

It is sometimes unclear as to whether Jung saw the persona in a negative or positive light. He argued it was a barrier to individual development such that, ‘dissolution of the persona is an indispensable condition for individuation’ (1916/1966, CW7, p. 297). He stated, ‘the persona must be extinguished’ (1916/1977, CW18, p. 453); and, ‘the aim of individuation is nothing less than to divest the self of the false wrappings of the persona’ (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 174). At these points, he seems to argue that loss of persona is an essential precondition for individuation. This can be related more widely to his sceptical statements about organisational life. Jung described his confirmation as a stiff and empty ritual, ‘the greatest defeat of my life’ (1961/1995, p. 73). In his first Zofingia lecture of 1896, he lambasted as ‘careerists’, the educated men who sell their knowledge and skills in order to obtain money and public success (Jung, 1896/1983, pp. 8-9). In New Paths in Psychology, he adopted a classic modernist position in contrasting the contemporary lives of benighted city-dwellers, office workers and machine-minders with the alternating rhythms of the peasant’s life (Jung, 1912/1966, CW7, p. 259). In 1928, he argued that ‘the man of today, who resembles more or less the collective ideal, has made his heart into a den of murderers...’ (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 154). These passages give some indication of Jung’s scepticism in relation to the persona; and this has been noted by several post-Jungian commentators. Homans, for example, argued that Jung’s beliefs about the persona and collective ideals are characterised by ‘a deep suspicion of the social order as a source for authentic living’ (1979/1995, p. 200). Pye stated that Jung’s evaluation of the
persona is ‘almost wholly depreciatory’ (1965, p. 70); and Hopcke suspected Jung of a ‘negative attitude toward the persona’ (1995, p. 19).

It is possible, however, to read Jung as employing both sceptical and affirmative modes in relation to persona. Whilst examples can undoubtedly be found where Jung exhibited scepticism about public life, particularly work roles, these can be contrasted with opposing statements. For example, Jung argued that the persona is necessary so that one can make both a definite impression on others and conceal one’s essential nature (1928/1966, CW7, p. 192). In recalling the period 1913-16 from the vantage point of the late 1950s, his family and professional roles were seen as a ‘joyful reality’, a ‘point of support’, a ‘counterpoise’ and a ‘base’ (Jung, 1961/1995, pp. 214-215); and organisations were seen variously as: ‘shelters’; ‘a home port’; ‘a land of promise’; or ‘a herd and safe fold’ (p. 375). Jung also described occasions when he felt ill-equipped to deal with others and in need of educating the persona. For example, when considering what kind of role to pursue after university, he recalled feeling that a post in a clinic would be difficult to obtain because of his unpopularity and distance from others (p. 125). Jung also associated the persona with highly impressive, numinous experiences. He described a visit with his father to Mount Rigi in Lucerne, when, aged 15 or 16 years of age and wearing a cap and cane in the style of a world traveller, he visited what he termed ‘God’s world’ at the top of the mountain (pp. 96-97). More generally, he also argued that it was important for the individual to learn about how people behave, societal expectations and the meaning of one’s

---

11 It is acknowledged that the persona is not directly identified in the passages referred to from Memories, Dreams, Reflections as technical language is generally avoided in the main text.
conduct for others (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 199). These examples suggest that Jung was, by turns, both affirmative and sceptical about persona. He argued that it was important to both see through identification with social roles and develop and educate oneself concerning the acting of them. Homans’ emphasis on suspicion therefore requires modification. It is necessary to read Jung as employing sceptical and affirmative modes in relation to persona.

Surface and system

There are some additional inconsistencies in Jung’s statements about the persona. In 1928, he referred to the naïve individual, ‘who has not the ghost of a persona’ (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 198). In contrast, Jung stated in 1925 that, ‘Insofar as you live in a world, you cannot [emphasis added] escape forming a persona’ (1989/2012, p. 117). When asked, in 1957, if it were possible for an individual to have more than two personas, he replied ‘rarely’ (Jung, 1977, p. 298). My interpretation of these remarks is that, whilst an individual may not be particularly aware of their persona, it makes no sense to state that one does not have a persona, since everyone exists within a social world. Strictly speaking, an individual can only reduce identification with a particular role such as parent or worker. In these terms, there is really no escaping persona, and no question of destroying it, as it is the means by which individuals communicate and relate to each other. The persona provides a medium for social relating that manifests differently according to culture and local conditions (Samuels, Shorter, & Plaut, 1986, p. 107). This connects with Jung’s emphasis on the persona as a ‘system’ (1928/1966, CW7, p. 192; 1977, p. 297) and ‘functional complex’ (1921/1971, CW6, p.
and his later refinement of the mask metaphor to focus on its role in effecting communication between actor, mask and audience. A viable persona system is of considerable value to the individuating person and wider society as it is the means by which the individuation process reaches out to and receives others, i.e. the function through which the social benefits of individuation are realised.

When Jung stated that an individual usually only has one or two personas he can therefore be seen as referring to persona identification. The ‘spectral Cassandras’ and ‘hopeless dreamers’ he discussed (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, pp. 198-199) may not be particularly aware of how they come across to others; nonetheless, each has a distinctive persona. From a post-Jungian perspective, it may be helpful to employ the term persona carefully to distinguish between these quite different aspects. First, the persona can be used to refer to the occupation of a role with little suggestion of identification. Here, an individual can have as many personas as s/he has roles, for example, worker, friend, citizen or partner. Second, the persona can refer to identification with one or more roles. Third, since everyone has a persona and to occupy any role one must identify with it to a certain extent, the degree of identification is a central aspect to consider. Fourth, the persona manages all the roles one plays. It therefore relates to the overall way an individual

---

12 In 1952, Progoff reported Jung’s denial that persona is derived from the Etruscan meaning mask. ‘Jung said the Latin word persona came from per sonare, to sound through, because masks had a sort of tube inside, from the actor’s mouth into the mouth of the mask, a built-in megaphone to amplify the sound it would carry. The mask came to be called persona after this megaphone’ (Progoff, 1952/1977, p. 210). This definition has been taken up by others, for example, Jacobi (1967/1976, p. 36), Meier (1977/1995, p. 92) and Hopcke (1995, p. 200). Jung’s version of the word history is considered doubtful (OUP, 2002).
integrates, organises and presents a plurality of roles. In these terms, it should not be located exclusively at the surface of the psyche as may be suggested by Jung’s structural model; rather, it is a system or function that permeates the psyche. The persona and the social penetrate deeply into its farthest recesses. Rather than extinguishing persona, as Jung sometimes suggested, it is desirable to develop the recollection and return of persona function to the individual.

Summary

To draw this section to a close, my argument is that Jung’s conceptualisation of the persona is inconsistent at points and inevitably coloured by his wider experience. This contributes to a series of contradictory comments that are hard to interpret coherently. One way of resolving them is to suggest that, on occasion, Jung makes general statements about persona that should be understood specifically to the process of role dis-identification. His highly sceptical comments relate to this too. This suggests that both sceptical and affirmative modes are needed in relation to persona; and that it should be understood as a liminal function or system that permeates the psyche. It has a highly paradoxical set of functions: to appear real but also not real; to manifest as role, object and system; to receive and to transmit; to reveal but also hide. The importance of history and culture in understanding the persona has also been highlighted.
Evaluation of Super’s Self-Concept Theory

This section focuses on a critical evaluation of Super’s self-concept theory using an analytical psychological perspective on persona. At first glance, there are some interesting similarities between the two positions. Super and Jung may have agreed about the role of compromise. Super stated that the self-concept system is a compromise (1984, p. 195); and Jung argued that the persona is a compromise formation (1928/1966, CW7, p. 158). Both identified systemic aspects to their respective approaches. Super drew a distinction between self-concepts and the self-concept system (1963a, p. 19); and Jung defined the persona as ‘a complicated system of relations’ (1928/1966, CW7, p. 192). Both used visual language. Super described the self-concept system as ‘a picture of the self’ (1963a, p. 18); and Jung described the persona as ‘the ideal picture of a man as he should be’ (1928/1966, CW7, p. 194). They may have agreed that that there is a dramaturgical dimension to identity. For Jung, persona was inherently dramatic as it is concerned with the public roles that people play (1921/1971, CW6, p. 465). For Super, the self-concept was also dramatic as it is concerned with roles and theatres (1980, pp. 283-290). Both men also shared a commitment to an experiential approach to theory formation and were mistrustful of purely intellectualising approaches (Jung, 1951/1959/1968, CW9ii, p. 33; Super et al., 1963a, p. 21). There are, however, some important differences and contrasting strengths and weaknesses between the two perspectives. These are now identified in the following sections and implications drawn out for research, training and practice.
Mapping role development

Super’s work provides a rich vocabulary for understanding certain aspects of the persona’s phenomenology. His focus on roles and theatres potentially provides nuanced methods for beginning to understand persona in relation to career. He appreciates that individuals make links between different roles and translate learning from one theatre of life to another. Super’s metadimensions of the self-concept system, such as flexibility and idiosyncrasy, can help trace and understand the development of the persona. His key concept of role salience can be of value in helping individuals begin to assess the degree of role identification. His further development of the role mini-cycle, with its stages of growth, exploration, establishment, maintenance and disengagement, offers a rich vocabulary for understanding the dynamic ways in which roles fluctuate in importance. His work enables individuals to map their changing life roles and theatres. This potentially provides points of orientation and articulation for individuals considering vocational choices. It can therefore act as an aid to greater discrimination and development of the persona. Jung saw value in adapting to collective demands and expectations (1921/1971, CW6, p. 298). In some respects, Super’s ideas provide simple methods of accomplishing this goal.

Socio-economic conditions

Super directly acknowledged the influence of socio-economic conditions on the evolution of the self-concept system. This is a significant absence from Jung’s persona theory. Explicit consideration of dimensions such as gender, socio-economic class, community, labour markets, and ethnicity is
conspicuous by its omission. There is something inherently conservative in Jung’s homely vision of the pastor in his church and the cobbler at his lathe (1928/1966, CW7, pp. 192-193). Perhaps he simply described rather than endorsed this rather static view of the world; nonetheless, limited scope is envisaged for the transformation of the division of labour in society. Jung is a poor guide to these areas and Super, along with several other contributors within career studies, gave much more weight to them (Hodkinson, 2009; Law, 1981, 1993, 2009; Patton & McMahon, 1998; K. Roberts, 1977, 2009). In some respects, these studies complement Jung’s approach because they all explicitly sought to de-centre common sense or stereotypical notions of identity. Jung placed the centre of gravity towards the individuating individual; whereas, the studies listed above emphasised the role of social contexts in the construction of identity.

*The unconscious*

Super and Jung may well have agreed that an individual cannot be reduced to his or her role. A doctor is not just a doctor, a mother not just a mother, a volunteer not just a volunteer; however, they take radically different paths in relation to this. For Super, the individual was more than any one role through occupying a dynamic range of other roles and theatres. He highlighted the range of social roles through which the fruits of individuation may be received and shared with others. For Jung, the individual was more than any one role via the dynamic return and recollection of persona function and integration of wider unconscious contents. His overall model of the self is much richer than Super’s. The latter’s conception of the self appears to be more or less
conscious all the way around (1970/1971, p. 106; Super et al., 1963a, p. 21); and the self-concept is simply seen as what a person believes himself to be (Super et al., 1963a, p. 20). Analytical psychology provides a critical perspective on this by introducing wider elements such as ego, individuality, shadow, and syzygy. It therefore adds a depth psychological dimension to understanding career dynamics that is absent from Super. Jung’s distinction between personality and individuality and can also help career studies develop a more critical understanding of personality.

The place of work in people’s lives

A central danger with Super’s ideas is that they encourage rather than inhibit identification with work roles and this criticism can equally be applied to other career development theories (Dawis, 2002; Holland, 1997). Jung stated that the ‘persona is always identical with a typical attitude dominated by a single psychological function’ (1916/1966, CW7, p. 297) which results in one-sidedness and an obstacle to the individual’s further development. In 1921, he argued that this can result in dissociation, self-alienation, and the neglect of the inferior functions (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 298 & 450). Super’s emphasis on work as providing a focus for personality organisation may compound these problems. Analytical psychology, in contrast, claims that identity cannot be reduced to work role and is sceptical about the role of work in self-fulfilment. For Jung, work could easily become a denial of selfhood and an obstacle to individuation. At points, he went so far as to say that, far from being self-fulfilling, engaging in work involved a significant self-sacrifice (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 193). It is through this sacrifice of the self, or at least part
of the self, that the individual lays the groundwork for individuation. Jung did not specify what constitutes a sacrifice. It could be engaging in a boring, repetitive occupation or it could be engaging in an occupation that requires considerable investment of time and energy in training and role performance. In any event, he clearly saw the function of work in radically different ways to Super. This provides a central contribution to a more critical career studies.

**History**

As has been indicated, Jung argued that history, particularly as it relates to the lives of public figures, is made up of little more than a history of the persona (1936/1977, CW18, p. 579). In this sense, his work adds something highly significant to the *history of career* in the late nineteenth century and the first six decades of the twentieth. Taken together, the Collected Works, *The Red Book*, seminars, letters and memoirs form a unique set of historical documents. They highlight considerable gaps or absences in what is known, or could be known, about the career development of others.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

In relation to conducting and interpreting career research, analytical psychology can add a critical vocabulary in relation to understanding public roles. It suggests consideration and appreciation of a wider range of documents and sources than have been used in career studies hitherto. An analytical psychological perspective on persona has value because it can inform a distinctively reflexive approach. Formal career development theorising should show some appreciation of the subjective confession and
personal equation; and some forms of theorising can be read critically as forms of persona identification. This highlights the importance of the wider experiential context in developing a critical career studies.

The training of career development professionals should be widened to include discussion of persona. Staff training workshops could help develop reflexivity with regard to deeply entrenched beliefs in career studies concerning self-fulfilment through work and the types of services that should be provided to clients. Excessive focus by career support services on self-fulfilment via work may reinforce persona identification. The wider aspects of persona functioning can provide balance: for example, its role in facilitating relating to others and sharing the benefits of individuation.

Jung’s illustration of subjective confession in discussing persona could be used in a variety of ways to help career development professionals discuss the relationship between theory and practice. The blend of autobiography and theory in Jung suggests a need to attend to the autobiographical dimensions present in formal career development theories. As discussed earlier, Super’s theorising unfolded over a long period from the 1940s to the 1990s; and he, at first, used the term ‘Decline’ to describe the fifth and last life stage of career development (1957). He subsequently changed this to ‘Disengagement’ as he drew closer to and experienced that period; and his work expanded to include the concept of the mini-cycle (Super et al., 1996). Super’s (1992, p. 38) archway model of career determinants appears to have been inspired by his time in England and a visit to the Norman door of a church in the village of
Hauxton, Cambridgeshire. There are geographic, religious, and historical dimensions to this choice. These brief examples begin to suggest how career development theory and author can be brought into closer relationship. Career theories should therefore be seen, to an extent, as self-portraits.

The importance of educating the persona function has been highlighted above and questions therefore arise as to how individuals can educate themselves and others as to the malign and benign nature of persona? How can they become masters of affirmation and scepticism in relation to it? A series of suggestions are made below for the practice of careers work.

As discussed earlier, there is a phase in career development termed the crystallisation task of the exploration stage, where the individual seeks to develop and become aware of values (Super et al., 1996, pp. 132-133). Career services usually have some limited resources available to help with this such as personality audits and skill profiles. An analytical psychological perspective on persona is useful here because it reminds us that awareness and development of values cannot be reduced to completing a skills audit or a personality test. These techniques relate to the personality and not the individuality (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 196; 1929/1984/1995, p. 107). This distinction between personality and individuality is a significant one for a critical approach to career studies because personality assessment and self-awareness are frequently held to be synonymous.
Career services usually have many resources available to help with the implementation task of the exploration stage (Super et al., 1996, pp. 132-133). These resources are designed to help individuals write winning CVs or resumés and present well at interview. In this phase, insight into persona may play an important role in facilitating and enabling transformation and change. Jung’s work is valuable in relation to this because it stresses the helpful nature of presenting oneself effectively to others but expresses this in terms of what it may achieve for the broader goal of individuation. In related mode, a careers service or employing organisation that concentrates on implementation to the detriment of other aspects of career development may be in danger of inculcating a form of persona identification.

Super is distinctive within career studies for paying attention to the need to disengage from roles as well as enter them. Career services do not usually provide a great deal by way of resources for this stage. Jung’s work on persona identification and dis-identification is relevant here because it emphasises that individuals may benefit from learning how to disengage from roles in more constructive and productive ways.

The cultural dimension of persona suggests possibilities for the design of career education programmes. An implication is that persona-related themes recur in classic and contemporary culture. For example, in Shakespeare’s *Hamlet*, the courtiers Rosencrantz and Guildenstern are criticised by Hamlet for making love to their employment (Shakespeare, 1970, 5.2.57). Contemporary popular culture is replete with media representations of
extreme persona specialisation: the speech-making politician, the sprinting athlete, the quipping comedian, and the sombre newsreader. The growth of career-related social media, such as Linked-In, has created many opportunities for persona polishing; but, perhaps also, considerable scope for forging connections with others. Such cultural content could be fashioned into materials in a career education workshop designed to help participants explore the relationship between employment, identity, and wider life; and the varied meanings that attach to the persona. It is also significant that Jung used a variety of methods for articulating his thoughts and feelings on the persona including: formal theorising, student polemic, dream work, painting, story, letters, diary, and memoir. This suggests that the design of career education activities could be broadened to make space for a similar range of creative methods.

Conclusion
In this chapter, debates concerning Jung’s conceptualisation of persona have been identified and a distinctive position adopted. This has been used to critically evaluate a canonical theory in career studies: Super’s Self-Concept Theory. I have argued that an analytical psychological perspective on persona has value because it can enable a more nuanced and balanced approach to career research, teaching and practice. Grounded in this, proposals have been made for the development of each area.
As a teenager, I first read Shakespeare's *King Lear* as part of English Literature classes. I loved the themes of insight and blindness that ran through it. Whilst researching, and trying to make sense of the persona, as part of this chapter, I found myself (an apt expression) wanting to visit the theatre. An obvious displacement activity you'd be entitled to think. Nonetheless, on a weekday matinee, I holed up in the Royal Shakespeare Theatre in Stratford-on-Avon to watch *King Lear*, and, on another occasion, *The Tempest*.

There's a court scene right at the start of this staging of *King Lear*. A grand throne occupies the main stage and courtiers mill about and talk informally. Lear enters through the auditorium and walks quietly to the edge of the apron still out of sight of the courtiers. He stops, listens, and watches the court for what feels like five or ten minutes. Nothing is said but he seems to be wondering 'what would it be like if I wasn't king?'; 'what would I be to these people?' 'what would I be to myself?'.

One of Lear's problems is that he wants to give up the trappings of being a king but has no inner king. It seems to me the play is not so much about extreme age per se but transformation at any age. It's about any time in life when things get stale and need to change. Every character in the play is like a voice in the psyche. Following the blinding of Gloucester, Regan's curse 'let him smell his way to Dover' (Shakespeare, 1952, 3.7.92-93), horrible as it is, is a kind of call to individuation. We're all, in our own way, smelling our way to Dover.

I also saw *The Tempest* at Stratford. I had not read it previously, so it was a completely new play to me. In this staging, Prospero is played with a distracted air. It's a highly self-contained performance as if the other figures in the play are not really there; just figments of his very active imagination.
At least three historical parallels have been suggested for the play’s central figure of Prospero including the Elizabethan magus John Dee, the Holy Roman Emperor Rudolf II and Prospero Adorno, a Governor of Genoa (Lindley, 2002, p. 88; Parry, 2016, pp. 17-18). On a less exalted level, the play relates to anyone who has undergone significant role changes.

I think The Tempest can be interpreted as reflecting several of the themes in this chapter. Prospero experiences at least three persona transformations but at no time is he without a persona.

In strictly chronological terms, he is at first imagined as the Duke of Milan costumed in fine robes, hat and rapier and occupying a ducal court with great powers of patronage. For 12 years, he lives as a sorcerer in a simple cell on a faraway island equipped with his magic cloak, staff, and books. He has ambivalent and difficult relationships with the other inhabitants of the island: his daughter Miranda and the island’s original occupants, Ariel, and Caliban. The play concludes with Prospero relinquishing magic, drowning his books, and burying his staff; and his restoration as the rightful Duke of Milan.

This is, however, no mere turning back of the clock, as Prospero has engaged in deep encounter with the unconscious in Jungian terms. His reconciliation with Caliban ‘this thing of darkness, I acknowledge mine’ (Shakespeare, 2002, 5.1.273-4), and release of Ariel and Miranda, symbolise his coming to terms with nature, the divine, sexuality, ugliness, imagination, contra sexuality, mortality, and childlikeness.
Chapter 5

Career types

Introduction

This chapter focuses on a critical evaluation of career types using an analytical psychological perspective on types. It begins by providing an explanation for this selection. Career development theories relating to types are described, in general terms, and a classic example of the genre discussed in more detail: Holland’s (1997) *Theory of Vocational Personalities and Work Environments*. A Jungian and post-Jungian perspective on types (both psychological types and archetypal images) is elucidated. This is used as a lens to guide the evaluation including implications for research, training and practice.

*Why is this valuable?*

As discussed in Chapter Two, the literature on types is a rich theme in Jungian and post-Jungian scholarship. Typology has also only made a limited contribution to career studies through the Myers-Briggs theory (Hammer, 2000). This is despite Jung’s view that it potentially provided a significant
contribution, not only to psychotherapy and psychology, but across the humanities and social sciences (1937/1969, CW8, p. 125). Similarly, the literature on archetypal images has made little impact in contemporary career theory although it has influenced organisational studies (Colman, 1992; Mitroff, 1983; Pearson, 1991; Stein, 1992). This chapter addresses this problem by securing a larger role for an analytical psychological perspective on types within career theory. It develops a more critical career studies by critiquing the traditional matching paradigm in new ways and proposing practical examples. It links with the earlier discussions on projection (Chapter Three) and persona (Chapter Four). It also provides a conceptual underpinning for arguments in Chapter Nine focused on learning.

**Overview of career types**

The literature on career types constitutes a significant genre of career development theory. It is related to the topic of personality discussed in Chapter Four but characterised by the classification and description of contrasting career types with each typology generally containing a small number of career-related subtypes. Career typologies are found in a very wide range of popular and academic texts (Bordin, 1984; Bordin et al., 1963; P. Brown & Hesketh, 2004; Clarke, 2009; Dawis, 2002; Hammer, 2000; Holland, 1997; Marcus, 2017; Schein, 1978, 1996; Tomlinson, 2007). Four such perspectives are now summarised by way of illustration. Holland (1997) argued that people *search* for work environments that provide a match for their personality type (to be discussed in more detail below). He developed a sixfold classification of personality types and work environments consisting of
realistic, investigative, artistic, social, enterprising and conventional types; and designed a coloured hexagon as a method of depicting these types with an accompanying questionnaire and database. Schein (1978, 1996) posited the concept of career anchors consisting of an individual’s self-perceived talents and abilities, values, motives and needs. A career anchor was defined as something that an individual will not give up if forced to make a choice. He identified eight types of anchor: technical/functional competence; general managerial competence; autonomy/independence; security/stability; entrepreneurial creativity; sense of service/dedication to a cause; pure challenge; and lifestyle. Dawis (2002) proposed a theory of person-environment correspondence based on the assumption that persons and environments interact in complex ways linked to typical needs. Needs were conceptualised in terms of six main values: achievement; altruism; autonomy; comfort; safety; and status. Brown and Hesketh (2004) argued that individuals can be classified into two types: purists and players. They stated that players see career as the playing of a game, or the acting of a theatrical role. This involves the construction of story lines that communicate messages about one’s suitability for employment. In contrast, the purists were seen as meritocrats who believed that the job market operates in a fair and effective way. For purists, employability was a technical puzzle involving finding the right fit or match between self and opportunity.

As indicated earlier, Holland’s Theory of Vocational Personalities and Work Environments (hereafter TVPWE) has been selected for a more detailed treatment. His work is an exemplar of the matching or fitting approach to
career development that has been a dominant paradigm in vocational
guidance over the last 100 years. The theory provides a classic example of a
typological approach in career studies. It is described as, ‘a staple among
contemporary career-development professionals’ thinking about the world of
work and…among the most widely researched and applied vocational choice
theories’ (Shahnasarian, 2006, p. 355). It is distinctive within the career types
genre for including the notion of personal career theory (to be explained
below). It also employs a shared vocabulary to describe the interaction of
personality types and work environments.

Summary of the Theory of Vocational Personalities and Work
Environments

John Holland’s research on vocational choice evolved over five decades
music and art and later experiences in military and educational settings. As an
army private, during the Second World War, he worked as a classification
interviewer where he became interested in vocational typologies (Holland,
2008, p. 672). His central argument was that people search for work
environments that provide a match for their personality types. Fundamental to
this is the principle that vocational identity represents a match between
personality and work environment. Towards the end of his career, Holland
revealed that the TVPWE was linked to his personal preferences for
symmetry, elegance, order, simplicity, and utility (1997, pp. 5-7).
Interaction

There is an interactive dimension to the TVPWE that is sometimes overlooked. In addition to the searching behaviour of individuals, Holland (1997, pp. 52-53) argued that work environments attract corresponding personality types. For example, individuals within investigative occupations attract investigative people and repel other types. It is further maintained that each environment reinforces a characteristic set of activities, achievements and competencies. He argued that career development over the life-course ‘can be understood as a long series of person-environment interactions’ as people and environments reject, select, modify and encourage preferred behaviours (p. 61).

Congruence

Each personality type is believed to flourish in its matched or congruent environment. According to Holland, all work environments and personalities conform to some blend or combination of the sixfold typology (commonly abbreviated to RIASEC i.e. realistic, investigative, artistic, social, enterprising, and conventional types). There is a degree of subtlety to this as individuals are seen as being made up of a combination of types and this allows for quite a wide range of possible profiles. For example, a profile of RIE would indicate an investigative, realistic, and entrepreneurial personality type. He further argued that some individuals and environments are more defined than others in terms of the six types leading to high or low levels of differentiation. In his view, a person with clear typological preferences has high differentiation.
Together, greater congruence and differentiation lead to a well-defined sense of vocational identity. The six types are now explained in more detail.

**Realistic**

Realistic types like to work with hands, plants, animals, tools, machines or electronic equipment (for example, technician or chef); and, generally, avoid social activities like teaching, healing, and informing others. This type has good skills in working with hands, tools, technical drawings, electronic equipment, machines, plants, or animals; and values practical things that can be seen, touched, and used. Realistic types generally see themselves as practical, mechanical, and realistic.

**Investigative**

Investigative types like to engage in the investigation of physical, biological and cultural phenomena (for example, biologist or medical technologist); and, generally, avoid leading, selling, or persuading people. This type is good at seeking challenging problems; and values independence, science or scholarship, and logic. Investigative types generally see themselves as analytical, curious, and open-minded.

**Artistic**

Artistic types like to engage in imaginative and creative activities like art, drama, crafts, dance, music, or creative writing (for example, writer or interior decorator); and, generally, avoid highly ordered or repetitive activities. This type has good artistic abilities in creative writing, drama, crafts, music, or art;
and values aesthetic experiences and creative arts like drama, music, dance, art, or writing. Artistic types generally see themselves as expressive, original, and independent.

**Social**

Social types like to do things to help people such as training, nursing, and providing information (for example, teacher or counsellor); and, generally, avoid working with machines, tools, or animals to achieve a goal. This type is good at advising or giving helpful information; and values helping people and solving social problems. Social types generally see themselves as helpful, friendly, and trustworthy.

**Enterprising**

Enterprising types like to lead and persuade people; sell things and ideas (for example, salesperson or manager); and, generally, avoid activities that require careful observation and analytical thinking. This type is good at leading people and selling things or ideas; and values controlling others and being ambitious. Enterprising types generally see themselves as energetic, confident, and sociable.

**Conventional**

Conventional types like to work with data, numbers, records, or machines in a set, orderly way (for example, book-keeper or librarian); and, generally, avoid ambiguous, unstructured activities. This type is good at working with written records and numbers in a systematic, orderly way; and values success in
business by being ambitious, obedient, and polite. Conventional types generally see themselves as orderly and good at following a set plan.

*Personal career theory*
As has been indicated, Holland’s work evolved over many decades. In the final, complete presentation of his theory, he introduced the concept of personal career theory, revealing it came from ‘constructivist outer space’ (Holland, 1997, p. 176). It does indeed show the influence of constructivist thinking, to an extent, and is based on the idea that everyone has a theory about careers or work whether it is simple or comprehensive. Holland felt that the personal career theory was likely to consist of a ‘do-it-yourself typology’ of personality and environments (p. 206).

*Summary*
In brief, Holland’s position was that individuals search for congruence between personality type and work environments. He maintained that both these latter elements can be classified in terms of realistic, investigative, artistic, social, enterprising, and conventional types. This was supported by further subsidiary concepts including interaction, differentiation, and personal career theory.

*Analytical psychology and types*
In this section, an analytical psychological perspective on types is discussed. In view of the focus of the chapter, the phrase ‘types’ has been interpreted to include both psychological types and archetypal images. Naturally, both are
large topics and so the material has been harnessed quite tightly. A second reason for grouping typology and archetypal images together is that Jung initially conceived of his overall constructive method in terms of locating *typical* parallels and analogies (1914/1991, CW3, p. 187). His arguments about both typology and archetypal images were partly constructed by assembling historical comparisons and similarities. *The Psychology of the Unconscious* and *Psychological Types* were informed by wide ranging reviews of classical, medieval, and contemporary literature.

**Typology**

Jung’s first lectured on typology in 1913 with the fullest description in *Psychological Types* (1921/1971, CW6). It is a topic he periodically returned to throughout his career; and its continued importance to him is suggested by its inclusion in his final work *Man and His Symbols* (Jung, 1964/1978, pp. 45-56). As is well known in Jungian circles, he posited two contrasting attitudes: extraversion and introversion; and four contrasting functions: thinking, feeling, intuition, and sensation. Definitions of these different dimensions are widely available and, for the sake of brevity, will not be discussed in detail here.

**The function attitudes**

Of particular relevance to this chapter is Jung’s description of the eight function attitudes (1921/1971, CW6, pp. 342-407). They are seen as providing points of orientation in a similar way to the points in a compass. Very briefly, in the extraverted attitude, the thinking function is concerned with logical consistency and generally accepted opinions and ideas; feeling seeks to...
develop harmony by connecting with the feeling of others; sensation is attuned to the present moment and the quality of outer concrete facts; and intuition explores relations and possibilities in the wider world. In the introverted attitude, thinking is concerned with the pursuit of internal consistency and personally significant ideas; feeling seeks harmony between action and inner values; sensation links past and present concrete impressions including those of the body; and intuition pursues inner possibilities, visions, and meanings.

Abstraction and concretism

Jung (1921/1971, CW6, pp. 409-421) drew an important distinction between abstraction and concretism. He argued that individuals generally have use of one well-developed primary function and some access to the others to varying degrees. He posited that an individual can use the primary function in the abstract with a high degree of skill but that the less differentiated functions are progressively more concrete and less susceptible to conscious manipulation. This aspect can be illustrated below by the paradoxical alchemic image of the chained eagle and toad (Figure 2). Here, the more developed functions fly swiftly like an eagle; whereas, the less developed functions move slowly like the earthbound toad. The paradoxical element is indicated by the chain joining the two animals. It suggests that individuation involves a synthesis of the abstract and concrete functions. The eagle may need to learn to crawl and the toad sprout little wings.

13 A black and white version of this image appeared in Michael Maier’s sixteenth century alchemical text *Symbola Aureae Mensae*. It is discussed by Jung in relation to the classical elements of air and earth (1955/1956/1970, CW14, pp. 4-5).
The transcendent function

Jung (1921/1971, CW6, p. 115) linked the transcendent function to this process of mediation between the opposites. He defined it as ‘a complex function made up of other functions’ with ‘sovereign power’ over them (p. 480). Later, he argued that the transcendent function arises from the union of opposites, the joining of the conscious with the unconscious, and liberation from identification with the functions (Jung, 1928/1966, CW7, p. 223). He stated that, ‘no truth can be established without the four functions’; and use of a single function could only result in understanding a quarter of the world with the remaining three quarters lying out of reach (Jung, 1935/1977, CW18, p. 57). This process of synthesis has also been linked, by later scholars, to the transcendent function and the operation of active imagination (M-L. von Franz, 1986; Meier, 1977/1995; S. Myers, 2016). An impressive empirical example is provided by Margot Cutner (1959), who, following three years of analytic work with patients taking LSD-25 in carefully controlled conditions, argued that
individuals can experience the working together of all functions\textsuperscript{14}. This, she suggested, can lead to a sense of synaesthetic wholeness and temporary realisation of the self (p. 721). For instance, Cutner discussed a woman with a predominant thinking function who, on connecting with her less differentiated sensation, intuition and feeling functions, experienced a greater sense of wholeness, meaning and connection with all things (pp. 754-756). The transcendent function may also help to explain the reportedly introverted or extraverted nature of many mystical experiences (M-L. von Franz, 1986, p. 44; Stace, 1961). Seamus Heaney's evocation of ‘sleeping beauty time’ below may provide an example of the functions working together and the operation of the transcendent function. His poem \textit{Ballynahinch Lake} depicts a moment when the poet and a companion are out driving in the Irish countryside\textsuperscript{15}.

So we stopped and parked in the spring-cleaning light
Of Connemara on a Sunday morning.
The freshly surfaced tarmacadam road,
The stockpiled peat on the verge, the sunstruck bonnet
Seemed to enter sleeping beauty time
As a captivating brightness held and opened
And the utter mountain mirrored in the lake
Eked into us like a wedge knocked sweetly home
Into core timber.
(Heaney, 1999)

\textsuperscript{14} The patients were treated in the United Kingdom at Powick Hospital, Worcester. It is acknowledged that Jung was highly sceptical about the untrained use of LSD because he feared it may lead to individuals experiencing the unconscious without the corresponding knowledge to deal with it (1976b, pp. 172-173).

\textsuperscript{15} This is an earlier, slightly longer version of the poem of the same title that appeared in the collection \textit{Electric Light} (Heaney, 2001). Lines three to five were omitted in the later version.
Eight function model

In most of the Jungian and post-Jungian literature discussed so far, the operation of the functions has been seen, implicitly or explicitly, in terms of a four function model. Beebe’s (2004, 2006) development of an eight function model offers a significant refinement. He identified four ego-syntonic function attitudes (consisting of the superior, auxiliary, tertiary, and inferior functions) complemented by four opposing shadow functions.

Table 2 is designed to provide an illustration of the eight function model. The first column features the eight function attitudes in descending level of consciousness. The second column depicts the order of the eight functions within ENTP (John Beebe’s Myers-Briggs type); and the third within INTP (my Myers-Briggs type). This shows that a difference in one letter can make a big difference to the distribution of the functions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EIGHT FUNCTIONS</th>
<th>ENTP</th>
<th>INTP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1/ Primary function</td>
<td>1/ Extraverted intuition</td>
<td>1/ Introverted thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/ Auxiliary function</td>
<td>2/ Introverted thinking</td>
<td>2/ Extraverted intuition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/ Tertiary function</td>
<td>3/ Extraverted feeling</td>
<td>3/ Introverted sensation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/ Inferior function</td>
<td>4/ Introverted sensation</td>
<td>4/ Extraverted feeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/ Shadow of superior function</td>
<td>5/ Introverted intuition</td>
<td>5/ Extraverted thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/ Shadow of auxiliary function</td>
<td>6/ Extraverted thinking</td>
<td>6/ Introverted intuition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/ Shadow of tertiary function</td>
<td>7/ Introverted feeling</td>
<td>7/ Extraverted sensation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/ Shadow of inferior function</td>
<td>8/ Extraverted sensation</td>
<td>8/ Introverted feeling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2

The model suggests that the transcendent function operates across eight function attitudes rather than four; and, consequently, the ‘middle realm’ to
use von Franz’s (1986, p. 73) expression, is somewhat ‘lower’ than might be thought in conventional understandings of typology. Knowledge of the eight function model deepens the extent of what is shadowy within but also raises the prospect of becoming more aware of this; although, with the caution that this means stooping to meet the lower functions not bringing them up to the level of the primary function. The lower functions, and the transcendent function itself, are not amenable to the same high degree of conscious control that is available to the primary function. Indeed, one of the problems with a well-differentiated primary function is that it becomes rarefied and desiccated with increasing remoteness from the nourishing life of the unconscious. The model suggests that an individual can only comprehend one eighth of the world using the primary function; and seven eighths lies out of reach (to extend Jung’s formulation). The individuation process gathers in and recollects the missing pieces. To return to the image of the eagle and the toad, despite the great skilfulness, vision, and strength of the eagle, individuation builds its ‘golden house’ closer to the toad (Jung, 1955/1956/1970, CW14, p. 4).

Reflexivity

From the 1930s onwards, in both formal works and correspondence, Jung sought to clarify that, in writing Psychological Types, his intention was to develop a critical psychology rather than a characterological method of classifying personalities (1935/1977, CW18, p. 19; 1936/1971, CW6, p. 555; 1973, p. 129; 1976a, p. 551). He explained this in more depth in the foreword to the Argentine edition of Psychological Types:
My typology is...a critical apparatus serving to sort out and organize the welter of empirical material...It is not a physiognomy and not an anthropological system, but a critical psychology [emphasis added] dealing with the organization and delimitation of psychic processes that can be shown to be typical.

(Jung, 1934/1971, CW6, pp. xiv-xv)

In a 1936 Harvard lecture, and following a very brief sketch of psychological type theory, he stated:

It is my belief that the problem of opposites, here merely hinted at, should be made the basis of a critical psychology [emphasis added]. A critique of this sort would be of the utmost value not only in the narrower field of psychology, but also in the wider field of the cultural sciences in general.

(Jung, 1937/1969, CW8, p. 125)

Jung felt that typology could provide a useful reflexive tool (1936/1971, CW6, pp. 554-555). It was primarily designed to help researchers more fully appreciate the range and quality of individual experiences and the reasons for differences between contrasting theoretical positions. He also maintained that it could help practitioners become more aware of their personal equation.

Archetypal images

Jung first developed a background understanding on archetypes when writing the Psychology of the Unconscious (1916). His first published use of the term appears to have been in a paper delivered at a symposium on ‘Instinct and
The topic was returned to in: *Psychological Types* (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6); the *Two Essays on Analytical Psychology* (Jung, 1917/1926/1943/1966, CW7); *The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious* (Jung, 1934/1954/1968, CW9i); *Aion* (Jung, 1951/1959/1968, CW9ii); and other writings. Jung used the term archetype in two ways, and sometimes interchangeably, to refer to, on the one hand, the archetypal image, and on the other, the ‘archetype as such’ (1947/1954/1969, CW8, p. 213). Archetypal images were seen as commonly encountered cultural figures, situations, experiences, symbols, and places; whereas, the archetype-as-such was sometimes, although tentatively, accorded an objective reality by him. In keeping with the epistemological stance outlined in Chapter One, it is the former usage that provides the focus here.

**Archetypal figures**

The range and scope of archetypal images is very wide indeed. Jung (1934/1954/1968, CW9i, pp. 37-38) drew a distinction between archetypal images that can be directly experienced as personified figures like hero, mother, father, child, or trickster; and others that may relate to situations, events, objects or places. The former aspect has been a particular focus of the post-Jungian organisational and personal development literature (Colman, 1992; MacAdams, 1993; Mitroff, 1983; Myss, 2002; Pearson, 1991; Stein, 1992). For example, Mitroff (1983) identified four archetypal figures including Warrior, Fool, and Chief; and Pearson (1991) delineated 12 including Innocent, Lover, and Sage.
Containers and safe spaces

In related vein, Stein (1992) discussed a range of archetypal figures such as Hero, Great Mother, Scapegoat, Guide, and Ritual Master. He emphasised the importance of creating organisational containers for working with the shadow, ‘where personal confrontation and the working through of conflict is given a safe space to happen’ (p. 8). This can allow the energy, otherwise tied up in competition, envy, rivalry, and conflict, to be released. He argued that working through individual and group archetypal identifications, can enable individuals to re-occupy roles with greater consciousness and transform mere labour ‘into meaningful work’ (p. 13).

Process

Colman (1992, pp. 93-100) drew an important distinction between the archetypal figure and the archetypal process in the life of the organisation. In relation to the scapegoat, for example, the priority is to help the organisation and individuals understand the process of scapegoating and reduce its reliance on the nominated scapegoat. The focus is on the process of personification rather than the individual. This suggests that, regardless of whether the figure is a scapegoat, hero, or mother, organisational and individual healing can take place through developing deeper understanding of the process of creating and maintaining archetypal figures.
Range

Myss (2002, 2003) identified 74 archetypal figures, each with contrasting dark and shadow aspects. This emphasises that no one figure should be seen in idealised terms. She argued that each individual carries an archetypal constellation made up of 12 figures including: Child, Victim, Prostitute, and Saboteur. Whilst the details of this latter arrangement may be too prescriptive, Myss considerably broadened the range of archetypal figures compared with other similar approaches. She also developed an attractive deck of archetypal cards to accompany her book. These features potentially open up a wider range of cultural stories for individuals to engage with; and provide an accessible means to do so.

Linking typology and archetypal figures

Beebe (2004) developed the eight function model in an archetypal direction by linking each function with an archetypal figure. The inferior function, for example, was linked to the syzygy; and the trickster figure to the shadow of the tertiary function. It may be that this is a little too neat. In 1925, for example, Jung (1989/2012) linked his anima (Salome) with the inferior, tertiary and shadow tertiary functions (p. 100); and related his hero (Siegfried) to the superior function (p. 66) and the shadow of the superior function (p. 61). Nonetheless, this approach has value in developing a shared vocabulary for understanding typology and archetypal figures. For instance, it revises Jung’s gender essentialism in relation to the anima (1921/1971, CW6, pp. 470-472).

The eight function model suggests that the characteristics of the syzygy
manifest differently depending on one’s typological make up rather than gender.

Reflexivity

Jung (1947/1954/1969, CW8, pp. 216-219) emphasised that an awareness of the archetypal aspects of the psyche is needed to fully appreciate the nature of the personal equation. Since psychology is the science of the psyche observing itself, an awareness of the role played by archetypal representations is an important aid to a critical psychology. The role of projection is also explicitly acknowledged. For example, Pearson argued that an individual may become possessed by an archetype (1991, p. 18); and Stein stated that organisational life can lead to the constellation and enactment of archetypal roles (1992, pp. 9-10).

Summary

In the foregoing section, selected analytical psychological perspectives on types have been summarised. In terms of typology, the focus has been on: the eight function attitudes; the transcendent function; abstraction and concretism. In relation to archetypal images, particular attention has been paid to: the range of archetypal figures; the importance of organisational containers and safe spaces; and the process of allocating archetypal roles. In relation to both areas, links have been identified between typology and archetypes; and reflexivity has been highlighted in terms of developing a critical psychology.
Evaluation of Holland’s theory

Holland’s theory is now evaluated using the analytical psychological perspective on types described above. Areas of similarity are briefly described. The focus then shifts to critiquing the traditional matching paradigm in new ways. This critique is used to inform practical examples and the development of a more critical career studies.

A point of connection

Holland’s work provides, at least to a degree, a point of connection between career studies and analytical psychology. He cited Jung, along with wider literature on psychological traits and types, in the construction of his typology (Holland, 1997, p. 6). There also appear to be areas of crossover in the construction of the RIASEC typology. For instance, there are aspects of extraversion to Holland’s social and enterprising types; and elements of introversion to his artistic and investigative types. One advantage of Holland’s approach lies in making the realistic, investigative, artistic, social, enterprising, and conventional types more explicit. Jung (1973, p. 129) was quite clear that alternative perspectives on typology may be possible, and provide useful points of orientation, in addition to his own. Holland’s ideas, along with the wider career types literature, may be of value in helping career development practitioners, and general readers, develop a more subtle and textured appreciation of career types. Suitably mediated, this can be used to make career types discussable as a topic within career education. Holland’s work potentially offers individuals some simple techniques for differentiating between contrasting work environments. It can therefore provide an aid to
greater discrimination and the development of consciousness. Holland also offers a map of occupations that relates directly to a personality typology. This quite deliberate step provides points of orientation and articulation for individuals considering vocational choices. Jung saw advantages in providing people with methods of best adapting to collective demands and expectations (1921/1971, CW6, p. 450; 1928/1966, CW7, pp. 192-193). In several respects, Holland provides techniques for delivering on this objective.

**Matching**

Holland’s matching approach has been adopted by the Myers-Briggs community as a central method in relation to career helping. The regularly updated MBTI Manual, whilst acknowledging other techniques, provides a guide to occupational selection linking modal types with specific occupations (I. B. Myers et al., 1998, p. 297). Hammer (2000, p. 12) has matched each of the sixteen Myers-Briggs types with a list of ‘the ten most attractive occupations’ derived from a database of over 60,000 cases. An ISTJ, for example, is linked with the roles of: small business or factory manager, accountant, executive manager, law enforcement, school principal, school bus driver, purchasing agent, IT professional, dentist, and steelworker (p. 14). This matching method of using MBTI has been adopted by Sharf (2013b) where, although alternative uses are envisaged, it is interpreted for practical purposes as basically ‘a trait and factor theory’ (p. 144). All these techniques strongly echo Holland’s approach and, as discussed in Chapter Two, provide one of the most obvious areas of existing overlap between career studies and analytical psychology. The matching approach is one of the most traditional
approaches to career theory and has already been criticised within career studies from a number of angles (Hodkinson, 2009; K. Roberts, 1977). It has, further, been the focus of criticism within Chapter Four in relation to the persona and the dangers of identification. The sections below indicate further aspects that can be evaluated with specific reference to an analytical psychological perspective on type.

**Vocational identity**

Holland saw vocational identity as being achieved when an individual finds an occupation that matches his or her personality type. Analytical psychology provides an alternative lens on this via typology. Vocational identity can be seen in terms of alignment with the eight function attitudes and the operation of the transcendent function. Exclusive use of the primary function limits understanding to one eighth of the world and, therefore, one eighth of career development. A fuller appreciation of the depth and richness of career experience is made possible through greater sensitivity to the eight function attitudes. This suggests that work environments can provide sites for type development as opposed to, or in addition to, matching.

**Projection**

Projection is not explicitly considered by Holland in the construction of the RIASEC typology; indeed, in general, this is an absence in the career types literature. It is here that contemporary post-Jungian perspectives have value in enabling a critical angle (Colman, 1992; Myss, 2003; Pearson, 1991; Stein, 1992). These can help in more fully appreciating the interaction of the
environment and individuals in the construction of career types; for instance, the processes of scapegoating and hero-making. A process of gathering in career types can enable individuals to see types, not merely as descriptions of a hypothesised external reality, but as positive and negative aspects within the psyche.

In terms of interpersonal work relationships, the eight function model can help in understanding ‘the otherness of the other’ (Jung cited in Illing, 1957, p. 80); and this aspect was discussed previously in Chapter Three. Table 2 suggests that the shadow personality is located deep in functions five to eight, yet in most workplace situations, individuals are naturally surrounded by high functioning versions of their shadow type. The difference between the intrapersonal shadow type and its well-differentiated interpersonal equivalent can be likened to the difference between a toddler and an adult or, better perhaps, a tiger and a domestic cat. Encountering one’s opposite in this way is not easy. Von Franz (1986, p. 64) suggested that individuals with opposing function attitudes do ‘not know how the wheels go round’ in the other. There is a feeling, often mutual, that the other person is a kind of living affront to oneself and should not be allowed to exist. This suggests that all types, and particularly opposite types, can potentially learn a great deal from each other. The workplace can simultaneously be a place of conflict and education in typology.

Range

A further advantage of looking at career types from an archetypal perspective
is the wider range of archetypal 'types'. Holland’s typology, and other
typologies developed in the career studies field, feel rather narrow when
compared with the richer ones developed in Jungian studies. The 12
archetypal roles developed by Pearson (1991), the 15 archetypal characters
envisaged by MacAdams (1993), and the 74 figures in Myss’s (2003) model,
are open to a much broader range of human experience. Even these
perspectives may be somewhat limited. Jung was slightly sceptical about the
development of characterologies, and conceived of archetypal images as
simply representing the range of human experience. In these terms, there is
probably no strict limit to the range and number of career types.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

An analytical psychological perspective on types can provide researchers with
an aid to reflexivity in at least two ways. First, the archetypal angle suggests
that career types should be seen as part of a broader historical canvas. Types
are a recurrent topic in the contemporary field; indeed, Holland (1997, p. 206)
felt that one reason for the widespread acceptance of the TPVWE was its
similarity to the personal career typologies of ordinary individuals. Typologies
can also be detected in classical literature. In Plato’s (1974) *The Republic*, for
example, it was argued that, ‘we have different natural aptitudes, which fit us
for different jobs’ (p. 118) and individuals in the ideal society should be
classified into producers, traders, labourers, guardians, auxiliaries, and
philosophers (pp. 115-195). This suggests that the construction of typologies
is a recurrent aspect of human experience. In addition, the production of
career typologies can be interpreted as portraits of each author’s respective
psychic constitution. As indicated earlier, Holland’s theory grew out of his early interests in music and art and abiding concerns with symmetry, elegance, order and utility. The TVPWE and the RIASEC hexagonal matching system can be seen as part, and product, of his personal equation. Further research in career types can usefully take account of these two aspects: the archetypal nature of the topic and the importance of the personal equation.

Course providers can be encouraged to re-design training for career development professionals. A training session on working with the whole person in careers work, for example, could be adapted to include archetypal motifs. Myss’s (2003) 74 archetype cards could be used to enable participants to identify a range of archetypal figures. Individuals could be asked to consider these in relation to their own experience and how they may be used with clients. To develop the exercise, blank cards could be included that would enable individuals to select alternative archetypal stories; and open up classic and contemporary culture as potential resources. For example, the Scholar-Gypsy story, in Glanvill’s seventeenth century text and Matthew Arnold’s poem of 1853, relates to disengagement from traditional employments and re-engagement with society in new and transformative ways (Arnold, 1853/2017; Glanvill, 1661, pp. 195-201). A more contemporary example is provided by Colman’s (1992, pp. 106-107) discussion of the ‘interpretor’. This figure lives on the boundary of the organisation with, ‘one foot in the wilderness, and another in the town square’, and helps the group by addressing social injustice and taking a stand on difficult issues. Stein (1992, p. 16) also
discussed the ‘ritual master’ who helps the organisation, and the individuals within it, towards transcendence and understanding the wider context.

Career development practitioners can also be assisted in developing career education in new ways. Stein (1992, p. 11) recommended psychological education for all on the grounds that ‘good psychological concepts increase the possibility of containment’. For individuals participating in workplace career management programmes, a traditional typology from within career studies could be contrasted with a perspective from analytical psychology. Holland’s RIASEC types could be set alongside a range of archetypal figures such as Hero, Great Mother, Scapegoat, Guide, and Ritual Master (Stein, 1992). The latter perspective equips individuals with an additional lens through which to view career development and organisational life. In a suitably safe space, participants could be invited to consider their feelings about each type; and the extent to which the typologies help to understand both themselves and the people and behaviours they see around them at work. Colman’s ideas on the process of creating archetypal figures could be used to help participants understand the workplace history that may have led to the creation of heroes or scapegoats. For example, it is sometimes the case that a workplace bully may have been the victim of bullying; and perhaps played a heroic role in getting rid of a previous office martinet. Newer colleagues can gain an insight into this, often unwritten, workplace history. Older colleagues can reconsider their roles in that history and their current relationships. This can lead to the transformation of workplace practices.
The traditional matching approach has the advantage of enabling people to consider the degree of congruence between work role and personality; however, it is dependent upon the availability and continued supply of congenial employment. The integration of function types potentially provides individuals with new ways of looking at working life. The workplace can provide an informal education in type function through the observing the behaviour of others and monitoring one’s own responses to *the otherness of the other*. In addition, examples of work-related transformations, such as those found in novels and stories, can be used as resources in career education.

**Conclusion**

A significant genre of career theory, focused on career types, has been identified; with a particular focus on Holland’s theory of vocational personalities and work environments. This has been evaluated in relation to analytical psychological perspectives on psychological types and archetypal figures. Five steps towards a more critical career studies have been argued. First, a new way of looking at vocational identity has been proposed based on the eight function attitudes and the transcendent function. Second, it has been suggested that projection plays a role in the constellation and enactment of career types. Third, the scope and range of the career types literature has been considerably extended. Fourth, the importance of type theory in developing reflexivity has been highlighted. And finally, a series of suggestions have been made for innovation in research training and practice.
Chapter Five Postscript: the Prisoners and the Monsters

For a term, I audit one of the taught Master’s modules at the University to broaden my understanding of analytical psychology.

A guest speaker talks about beauty. The first thing I notice that he is wearing red trousers, red shoes and a red shirt. Too much! Is my initial reaction. He delivers an interesting talk and recites a poem called The Sky Hunter by Hafiz, the fourteenth century Persian poet and Sufi master. It kind of takes us somewhere and there’s a nice feeling in the room. I decide red shoes work with red trousers after all.

Later, I buy a copy of Hafiz’s poems. There’s one called Dropping Keys that touches on one of the themes discussed in this chapter.

The small man
Builds cages for everyone
He
Knows.
While the sage,
Who has to duck his head
When the moon is low,
Keeps dropping keys all night long
For the beautiful
Rowdy
Prisoners
(Hafiz, 1999, p. 206)
Suniti Namjoshi’s short story *Saint Suniti and the Dragon* contains a poem on a related topic. It features an encounter with ‘the little monsters’.

And all the little monsters said in chorus:

* You must kiss us...
* But the evil you do.
* The endless ado.
* Why bless you?

You are composed of such shameful stuff.

Because said the monsters, beginning to laugh,

Because, they said, cheering up.

You might as well. You are part of us.

(Namjoshi, 1995, pp. 176-177)

The archetypes are an important topic in analytical psychology but it doesn’t lend itself to accessible explanations. Perhaps these poems can help me, and others, get a handle on them?
Chapter 6

Career strategies

Introduction

This chapter focuses on a critical evaluation of career strategies from the perspective of analytical psychology. It begins by providing an explanation for this selection. Career development theories relating to strategies are described in general terms and a contemporary example of the genre discussed in more detail: King’s (2004) *Career Self-Management Framework*. Jungian and post-Jungian perspectives on projection, enantiodromnia, adaptation, individuation, and theory-making are selected; and used as lenses to guide the evaluation including implications for research, training, and practice.

*Why is this valuable?*

This chapter has two main functions. First, it critically questions the role and status of the career strategies genre and its relationship with practice. This is accomplished by developing a more nuanced distinction between the tasks of
adaptation and individuation; and recalibrating the role of theory within the
geno. It is argued, as a result, that analytical psychology has value in
developing a more critical career studies in relation to strategies for success.
Second, this chapter makes use of concepts introduced in earlier chapters,
specifically projection (Chapter Three) and archetypal images (Chapter Five).
It also underpins arguments marshalled in later chapters in relation to
personal myth (Chapter Seven), life course development (Chapter Eight) and
learning (Chapter Nine).

**Overview of career strategies**

Career strategies are a significant genre of career development theory. The
distinguishing feature of this genre is the production of claims concerning how
to engage in career management by following certain predefined success
formulas. In *The Encyclopedia of Career Development*, a career strategy is
defined as follows:

> A career strategy is any behavior, activity, or experience designed to
> help a person meet career goals. A career strategy represents a
> conscious choice by an individual as to the type of investment he or
> she is willing to make in attempting to reach career objectives.
> (Callanan, 2006, pp. 146-148)

There is a strong emphasis on recommended behaviour and the pursuit of
future goals. There is also a focus on engagement in processes of conscious
and rational planning.

---

16 The terms career strategy and career management tend to be used interchangeably.
Career strategies are found in a wide range of popular and academic texts (D’Allesandro, 2008; Ibarra, 2002; King, 2004; Kuijpers & Scheerens, 2006; Law & Watts, 1977; Marcus, 2017; McKenna, 2008; K. E. Mitchell et al., 1999). They also constitute a recurrent theme in popular self-help books. In Career Warfare, for example, D’Allesandro (2008) claimed to have identified ten rules for building success on the business battlefield. In I Can Make You Rich, McKenna (2008, p. 15) proposed a range of top tips such as ‘your mind is like a computer…it’s only as effective as the software it’s running’. The high visibility of such guides can mean that, to the casual observer, career development theory is nothing but career strategy i.e. synonymous with it.

Career strategies are also represented in a considerable academic literature that has developed over many years. Law and Watts (1977) argued, for example, that individuals should develop learning in four areas: self-awareness; opportunity awareness; decision-making; and transitioning. Mitchell, Levin & Krumboltz (1999) posited that individuals should engage in planned happenstance by developing five skills: curiosity; persistence; flexibility; optimism; and risk taking. King (2004) argued that individuals should master three career self-management behaviours: positioning; influencing; and boundary managing (to be discussed in more detail below). Kuijpers & Scheerens (2006) proposed four career competencies for the modern career: reflection; exploration; control; and self-presentation. Marcus (2017, pp. 62-71) argued that people should flourish at work by engaging in: admiration; generosity; and emotional creativity. It can be seen from these examples that,
although the claims differ in terms of content, they share a concern for prescribing actions designed to secure successful career outcomes.

As indicated earlier, King’s Career Self-Management Framework has been selected for a more detailed treatment. Her work provides a contemporary example of the genre and is regularly cited as a key contribution to the literature (Inkson, Dries, & Arnold, 2015, p. 345; Lent & Brown, 2013a, p. 558). It is distinctive for providing, from the perspective of organisational and management studies, a critical alternative to the more traditional career strategies in vocational psychology (Law & Watts, 1977; K. E. Mitchell et al., 1999).

Summary of the Career Self-Management Framework

Zella King’s (2001, 2004) work on career self-management evolved partly as a response to growing interest in this topic in organisational studies (DeFillippi & Arthur, 1996; Ibarra, 2002). The intellectual background to her approach lay in the vocational adjustment theory of John Crites; and concerns about the decline of traditional career structures and the increasingly unpredictable nature of organisational life (King, 2004, pp. 113-116). King paid attention to the experiences of women and, recognising that career incorporates the non-work sphere, was interested in the way that individuals negotiate work and non-work domains. She also acknowledged that individuals do not have complete freedom of choice over desired outcomes and that career is inevitably influenced by others. Such people were termed ‘gatekeepers’ (p. 118) and included: supervisors, senior managers, prospective employers,
clients, project managers, or other contractors. King argued that people should engage in three interlinked forms of career self-managing behaviour.

**Positioning**

Positioning involves making strategic choice of mobility opportunity through initiation of job moves or acceptance of changes made by another party; and engaging in strategic investment in human capital by participating in training or education. It entails active network development through having relationships with gatekeepers and making innovative changes in own job content.

**Influencing**

Influencing involves self-promoting through manipulating how job performance is perceived and ingratiating by making oneself more attractive to others. It entails upwardly influencing through increasing gatekeepers’ understanding of one’s desired outcomes.

**Boundary management**

Boundary managing involves maintaining boundaries by negotiating with boundary-keepers such as line manager or spouse. It entails navigating the transition between work and non-work roles by, for example, reading the business press over breakfast or creating a physically distinct workspace at home where family members are not welcome.
Summary

The Career Self-Management Framework is a contemporary example of the career strategies genre. Its central concepts relate to the three career self-management behaviours of: positioning; influencing; and boundary managing.

Analytical psychology

There are several concepts and themes in analytical psychology that are relevant in relation to career strategies. Some of these have already been discussed in detail in previous chapters including projection (Chapter Three) and archetypal images (Chapter Five). For brevity, the main features are not repeated here except where they relate to the focus of the chapter. This section focuses on three main areas: adaptation and individuation; projection; and theory-making.

Adaptation and individuation

As has already been indicated in the discussion over the persona (Chapter Four) and types (Chapter Five), Jung saw advantages in adapting to collective demands and expectations. This was particularly the case for individuals who experienced difficulties in successfully adapting to normality (Jung, 1929/1966, CW16, pp. 67-70). In relation to individuation, on the other hand, he was sceptical of prescriptive success formulas and argued ‘there is no universal recipe for living (Jung, 1931/1966, CW16, p. 41) and ‘may each go his [sic] own way’ (Jung, 2009, p. 231).

You may be quite certain that if you imitate somebody else you will go wrong; when you follow another person’s conviction or principle you will
most certainly go astray inasmuch as that principle does not fit with your own pattern.  

(Jung, 1997a, p. 419)

...when one follows the path of individuation...one must take mistakes into the bargain; life would not be complete without them...We may think there is a sure road. But that would be the road of death. Then nothing happens any longer - at any rate, not the right things. Anyone who takes the sure road is as good as dead.  

(Jung, 1961/1995, p. 328)

It is possible that Jung overstated the differences between adaptation and individuation as improved relations with others are a necessary part of individuation. Whilst it has been noted, by some scholars, that Jung could be quite prescriptive in his dealings with patients (Papadopoulos, 2006, p. 47); in general terms, he was clear that imitation and compliance would simply lead to a facsimile or caricature of individuation. (Individuation will be discussed in more detail in Chapters Seven to Nine).

Projection

Projection was discussed earlier in relation to systems (Chapter Three). An analytical psychological perspective on projection provides a means of taking a reflexive stance in relation to naïve or idealistic ideas about assisting others. Jung stated that, 'those people who are very helpful need help' (1988, p. 825). Von Franz (1978, p. 16) took this a step further and argued that projection can lead to a form of psychological ‘rape’ arising from our concern to improve the other. Jung warned that projection can lead to, ‘assigning one’s own good
qualities to moral highwaymen with an eye to the main chance’ (1920/1948/1969, CW8, p. 309). This is related to the phenomenon of popular ideas becoming a hook for projections including archetypal images. The inner hero, saviour, mother or father can be projected into another person, organisation or cause. Jung also acknowledged that, within limits, there can be positive dimensions to projections; stating they can act as ‘agreeable …bridges to the world’ (1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 265). Generally, however, insight into projection enables a more critical and reflexive approach to the psychology of everyday life.

Theory-making

Analytical psychology provides a critical lens through which to view career theories, indeed any theories, through its preference for richness over parsimony in theory-making and focus on enantiodromnia. Jung, as a result of his Jamesian influence, was less interested in proving a theory right or wrong than extracting its cash value and adding it to the sum of existing knowledge (1913/1961, CW4b, p. 86). Theories are treated syncretically as opposed to reductively. There can be no final answer to any psychological question including how one should behave. In addition, enantiodromnia means that sooner or later any theory becomes its opposite (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, pp. 425-427). Indeed, for a psychological theory to be useful it must, in a sense, be both right and wrong. This relates to what Jung referred to as the ‘yea’ and the ‘nay’ of the unconscious (1997a, p. 91).
Summary

This relatively short section has focused on selected topics within analytical psychology that impinge upon career strategy. The interplay of adaptation and individuation has been discussed and the role of projection highlighted. The role given to theories in analytical psychology has also been explored.

Evaluation of the Career Self-Management Framework

In this section, the Career Self-Management Framework is critically evaluated using the perspectives on analytical psychology described above. The evaluation initially focuses on positive aspects in relation to enabling individuals to build bridges to the wider world. The remainder is devoted to the development of a critical approach to career strategy.

Bridges to the world

Career strategies may provide bridges to the world, in Jung's terms, and help individuals relate to others. Their use can enable career helpers to communicate their vision to others and feel competent. Clients can also feel nurtured and looked after. As discussed earlier in this chapter, Jung advocated adaptability and became convinced of its importance through his own early career experiences and the lives of his patients (1961/1995, p. 214). In this sense, the Career Self-Management Framework, and others in the career strategies genre, may provide sensible points of orientation particularly for individuals who find ordinary adaptation problematic. One of the advantages of the career strategies genre lies in making the various dimensions of career management more explicit. For instance, as can be
seen in the brief summaries provided at the start of this chapter, each author identifies between three and five aspects of career behaviour. Collectively, there are five distinct approaches containing, in total, 19 individual competencies. In this sense, these contributions can help career helpers, and general readers, become more explicit about their own approach to career strategy. Suitably mediated, they could be used to make career management discussable as a topic within career education.

**Reflexivity**

Knowledge of projection may enable reflexive consideration of thoughts and feelings in relation to career strategies, and possible reasons for this. Jung argued that popular ideas can become a hook for our projections (1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 273). Strong feelings of acceptance or rejection in relation to particular strategies may provide an indication of something that is indigestible within one’s psychic constitution. For example, when I first read King’s ideas, I felt slightly queasy in relation to some of them, particularly the focus on ingratiation. This reaction was valuable because it helped me acknowledge that there was something in her approach I was unwilling to recognise in myself; and this manifested itself in a physical reaction. I had, perhaps, a rarefied view of myself as a rather autonomous and independent individual and was reluctant to acknowledge the multiple ways in which I rely upon the good opinion of others. The implications of this for the design of career education are significant. It suggests that the role of the career helper does not lie in the advocacy of favourite or pet ideas; rather, it lies in enabling...
individuals to encounter a range of approaches, some of which may be
difficult or challenging to the participants.

Self-recollection

Jung’s warning about projection and moral highwaymen can help individuals
in seeing through the career strategy claims that surrounded them. Such
claims are encountered in: graduation ceremonies; workplace conversations;
and, as has been indicated, self-help books and academic publications. Whilst
it is possible that a particular author has divined the secret of career success,
knowledge of projection can enable a sceptical stance to be adopted.
Assigning successful career behaviour to others may serve a temporary
purpose; but the self-recollecting of one’s own abilities can be more helpful in
developing a distinctively personal approach. This suggests a need for the
gathering in of career strategy.

Knowledge of projection enables the reader to ask critical questions
concerning the production of career strategies. What does it do for the author?
What purpose might it serve? For example, the Career Self-Management
Framework is clear and rational. It does, however, raise the question of how
one could possibly live in such a logical way. Is this perhaps more of an
espoused theory rather than a lived theory? Here, one might speculate that
theory-formation is providing a place for a highly idealised approach that
would otherwise meet difficulty in finding a home. How does the Career Self-
Management Framework relate to the earlier life experiences of the author,
including the first organisation, the family? Here, in the language of powerful
gatekeepers and boundary managers there is, perhaps, the echo of strong parental figures dishing out rewards to children; and otherwise busy in the study or reading the *Financial Times* over breakfast.

**Nature of claims**

The nature of the claims made within the career strategy literature can also be subject to scrutiny from an analytical psychological angle. First, the future orientation of career strategies can be questioned because the withdrawal of projection is always a retrospective glance. The exclusive focus on future goals may run counter to processes of seeing through, gathering in and self-recollection. It may be necessary to step back and consider past career experiences; both in relation to one’s own actions, and the actions of others; as a preliminary to considering future actions. Second, it can be questioned just how strategic career strategies really are. Analytical psychology focuses on the overall goals and purposes of individuation. Its attention is to ends not means; whereas, career strategies are concerned almost exclusively with means. This suggests that career strategies need to be enriched by contact with the unconscious and the broader purposes of individuation. Or, put another way, they can only become strategic if they engage with, and attend to, the whole of career. Third, in relation to enantiodromia and the Career Self-Management Framework, one might accept that positioning, influencing and boundary managing are useful in certain situations; whilst also allowing that, if pursued to excess, they are likely to result in problems. In such a scenario, it would be wise to reverse the behaviours and undertake opposite or complementary activities. And finally, analytical psychology suggests the
career strategies genre can be seen as archetypal. This has already been hinted at in the earlier discussion on contemporary self-help literature. There is an older seam of didactic texts that includes: *How to Win Friends and Influence People* (Carnegie, 2006) from the first part of the twentieth century; *Self-Help* (Smiles, 2008) from the mid-nineteenth century; and *The Prince* (Machiavelli, 2009) from the early sixteenth century. The recurrence of similar topics and themes in classic and contemporary texts indicates possible resources for an enriched career education curriculum.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

There is a need for a more critical approach in relation to the design, production, and handling of future research on career strategy i.e. a method of handling and classifying competing claims about career management. Success recipes are perhaps some of the *grand narratives* of career studies. This is true wherever career studies are seen as synonymous with career strategy; and whenever individuals (whether career helpers or not) are narrowly focused on one particular version of it. This may be the narrative of warfare (D'Allesandro), the machine narrative (McKenna), or the myth of agency (King). It is here that Jung’s theory of projection has particular value in seeing through such claims.

In relation to training, there is a need for innovation in professional training and the facilitation of career development. Workshops on reflective practice can be extended to enable career helpers to make sense of their own thoughts, feelings, and experiences in relation to career strategy claims.
Contrasting sets of claims could be introduced as way of introducing some debate and discussion. The differences between adaptation and individuation could be discussed. This could include consideration of Jung’s rejection of the sure road and universal recipes for living.

Projection can lead to a kind of didacticism whereby individuals become possessed by particular career strategies. This inappropriate use can lead to the creation of closed systems within which alternative claims struggle to find a voice. In relation to career helpers, the use of a single career strategy to design career education programmes is a case in point. A programme designed in this way ends up prescribing career development to its participants. Career education then becomes didactic; and decision-making is inhibited. In such a situation, it is the career helper who ends up taking over or colonising the participants’ decision-making leading to a mild form of authoritarianism or, in Von Franz’s terms, psychological rape. In addition, it can lead to interventions focused on one particular form of career strategy and therefore lead to a form of stereotyping. In this sense, I am seeing the strategy as a potential hook for the career helper’s evolving sense of competence. A step forward in seeing through such claims would be to relinquish standing behind any one of these strategies; and take up a position slightly to the side, as it were. The adoption of such an explicitly pedagogical stance would be intended to assist career helpers in the facilitation of their participants’ career projection work and evolving self-understanding. This approach would, in turn, necessitate the re-design of training to enable the seeing through, gathering in, and self-recollection, of career strategies.
There is also a need for innovation in the facilitation of career education. This can include broadening existing workshops on career strategy to include an analytical psychological dimension. Classic and contemporary texts can be used to illustrate and discuss this archetypal theme.

**Conclusion**

In this chapter, it has been argued that analytical psychology has value in developing a more critical approach to career strategies. I have sought to see through career studies by attending to the field’s least malleable preoccupations and paradigmatic beliefs relating to career strategies. These are some of the grand narratives the field researches by, teaches by, and within which career development is practised. A distinctive take on analytical psychology drawing from classic and contemporary sources has been offered and used to critically evaluate the selected areas. As a result, some steps towards a critical and transformative career studies have been proposed.

Analytical psychology enables a fuller understanding of idealisation and demonisation processes in relation to career management behaviour. Projection highlights the significance of the retrospective glance that enables the re-collection of possible pasts; and questions the determinedly future-orientation of career management theories. Knowledge of projection may also enhance career literacy i.e. the careful and critical reading of career strategies. Through this, a less didactic approach can be developed in the design of career education.
Chapter Six Postscript: The Inner and Outer Captain

I’d like to return to the Myers-Briggs course I mentioned earlier in the Chapter Two Postscript.

I said it got things moving for me, and it did; but I don’t mean that it was an easy course. Far from it. There was a moment where I realised that I’d learnt to engage in quite a wide range of extraverted behaviours but it sometimes felt forced. It was a shock. I had an association to that video footage of John F. Kennedy’s assassination and felt very uncomfortable. Like I’d lost part of myself. (See Jung’s Siegfried dream discussed in Chapter Three for a comparison).

Later, attempting to make sense of this, it helped me to think about my parents, one more introverted (mother) and the other more extraverted (father). Perhaps because of my own gender bias and the early death of my father, I’d got tied up with the extraverted, paternal side and not paid enough attention to the introverted, maternal side? I admired my lost father, idolised him perhaps, but I was actually more like my mother. It helped me rebalance and value both parents more equally.

David Whyte discusses a time in *Crossing the Unknown Sea* when he realised that the ship’s crew, including himself, had become dependent on Raphael, the charismatic captain.

The great irony was that in his all-knowing alertness, we had allowed Raphael to lull us subtly into a lack of responsibility at the very core: we were alert as crew members, but Raphael had so filled his role of captain to capacity that we ourselves had become incapacitated in one crucial area: We had given up on our own inner sense of captaincy. Somewhere inside us we had come to the decision that ultimate responsibility lay elsewhere.

(Whyte, 2001, p. 43)
Whyte concludes, that to awaken the inner captain, ‘we have to be faithful to our own eccentric nature, and bring it out into conversation with the world’ (2001, p. 51).

Ok, I like that. I’m beginning to see how I could use stories from classic and contemporary texts to illustrate and discuss archetypal themes.
Chapter 7

Career and narrative

Introduction

This chapter focuses on narrative-informed approaches in career studies. Career development theories relating to narrative are identified and described in general terms; and a contemporary example of the genre is discussed in more detail: Savickas' (2013) *Career Construction Theory*. This is critically evaluated using an analytical psychological perspective on personal myth. Implications for research, training and practice are developed.

*Why is this valuable?*

This chapter has particular relevance in view of the Adlerian turn in contemporary career studies discussed in the literature review (Chapter Two). Jung’s reception of Adler is assessed and points of similarity and difference identified, particularly relating to guiding fiction and personal myth. The outcomes are threefold. First, this chapter argues for a *more Adlerocentric* reading of Jung. Second, it provides a contemporary take on *personal myth*. 
Lastly, it supports the development of a more critical approach to narrative in career studies.

**Overview of career and narrative**

Career and narrative have been intertwined since the inception of career studies in the Chicago School of Sociology. One of the foundational texts in career studies, *The Jack-Roller*, took the form of a life history containing chapters and poetry written by a young man from the Chicago slums (Shaw, 1930/1966). More recently, the narrative turn, or return, in social studies (Polkinghorne, 1988) has stimulated a number of contributions in relation to career (Cochran, 1990; Collin, 2000; Gowler & Legge, 1989; Inkson, 2007; Mignot, 2000; Pryor & Bright, 2008; Savickas, 2013). Six of these are now summarised by way of illustration.

Cochran (1990) proposed narrative as a new paradigm for career research and developed a four stage framework for interpreting career (discussed in more depth in Chapter Eight). Gowler & Legge (1989) examined the use of rhetoric in bureaucratic careers and the role of reputation in the construction of success. Collin (2000) made use of the literary terms epic and novel to explore the rhetoric of career. Inkson (2007) interpreted career in terms of nine dominant metaphors: inheritances; cycles; action; fit; journeys; roles; relationships; resources; and stories. Pryor & Bright (2008) proposed seven narratives for understanding careers: overcoming the monster; rags to riches; quest; voyage and return; comedy; tragedy; and rebirth. Savickas (2013) understood career in terms of three narratives: a reputational narrative; an
adaptability narrative; and an identity narrative (explained in more detail below).

The work of Savickas has been selected because his work features prominently in most contemporary collections and textbooks (D. Brown & Associates, 2002; Lent & Brown, 2013b; Sharf, 2013b). Perhaps most significantly for the purposes of this chapter, his work has been profoundly influenced by the work of Alfred Adler; and therefore represents an exemplar of a contemporary narrative approach to career theory informed by this psychoanalytic perspective. This chapter also links with the earlier discussion on career strategies and the nature of theory (Chapter Six). The detailed exploration of personal myth in this chapter helps to underpin later discussions on life course development in Chapter Eight and learning in Chapter Nine.

**Summary of the Career Construction Theory**

Savickas’ Career Construction Theory represents the culmination of over 30 years work (1988, 1989, 1995, 2009, 2013). His work is wide ranging and a full treatment of the theory beyond the scope of this chapter. In brief, the theory is an ambitious attempt to synthesise existing career theories and update them for the modern day. Savickas identified three layers to the self: self as object; self as subject; and self as project. Each of these layers links with three narratives. The self as object links with a reputational narrative; the self as subject with an adaptability narrative; and the self as project with an identity narrative. The reputational and adaptability narratives are based on a
renovation of the classic career theory of Holland and Super. Both these approaches have been discussed in detail elsewhere (Chapters Four and Five). The focus of this chapter is on Savickas’ conception of the identity narrative and its origins in individual psychology.

*The influence of Adler*

Savickas has been influenced by the work of Alfred Adler throughout his career. For example, one of his early articles interpreted a career case study from an Adlerian perspective (Savickas, 1988). In a later article, exploring how individuals may bridge from interests to occupations, he stated:

I believe Adler (1956) provided a workable answer to this question when he portrayed the ‘line of movement’ in an individual life as proceeding from a felt negative to a perceived plus…From this perspective, interests symbolically portray how one intends to transcend limitations and overcome personal deficiencies. Occupational interests implicitly state how individuals plan to use their work as a way of making up for something that was missing in their childhoods. Interests are to some degree, “yearnings”.

(Savickas, 1995, p. 192)

This extract indicates Savickas’ interest in Adler’s key concepts of inferiority and social interest. He has also provided a regularly updated chapter on career counselling within an edited collection entitled *Adlerian Counseling and Psychotherapy* (Savickas, 2009).
Preoccupations, life themes and occupations

Savickas argued that narrative identity is made up of three main components: preoccupations; life themes; and occupations. He stressed the importance of ‘guiding lines’ and ‘guiding fictions’ and how these reveal the hidden reasons or meanings behind job choices and interests (Savickas, 2009, pp. 186-188). It is the guiding fiction, he posited, that indicates the individual’s conclusions about what is needed to feel less incomplete and more secure; and to move from a felt minus to a perceived plus. He provided examples of individuals who shared the same occupation (doctor) but attached distinctive guiding fictions to this role, including: being in control; overcoming clumsiness; playing with winners; being right or pleasing father (Savickas, 2009, pp. 186-188).

Savickas developed these ideas into practical recommendations for a range of contexts including career education (2010b, 2013). He stated that interests can manifest in: admired role models; preferred magazines, television shows and web sites; favourite stories; trusted mottos; and earliest recollections. He posited that, in identifying role models, individuals actually describe themselves. These role models provide an indication of the problems that individuals wish to solve above all else; and thereby ‘reduce their feelings of incompleteness or inferiority’ (Savickas, 2009, p. 192). Savickas argued that an overarching life story or identity narrative may be constructed that links three smaller stories: the preoccupation; the life theme; and the occupation. Two examples of such life stories are provided in Table 3 below (Savickas, 2013, p. 165).
Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Life theme</th>
<th>Preoccupation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I will become a psychiatrist</td>
<td>so that I may heal families in crisis</td>
<td>and reduce my own feelings of helplessness about my own family's suffering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I will become a neurosurgeon</td>
<td>so that I may perform delicate operations</td>
<td>and prove to my father that I am not clumsy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is argued that the identity narrative enables ‘individuals to actively master what they passively suffered as they turn private preoccupations into public occupations’ (Savickas, 2013, p. 165). The central dimension, the life theme, is embedded in the guiding fiction that relates to deep, personal meaning and sense of purpose. Preoccupation relates to a sense of inferiority usually arising from painful childhood experiences. Occupation refers to a public role, such as a job title, that provides a vehicle for the life theme and the resolution of the preoccupation.

**Summary**

The Career Construction Theory has been outlined and the identity narrative discussed in more detail. This has been related to the influence of individual psychology. The three main dimensions of the identity narrative have been described (preoccupations, life themes and occupations) and examples given.

**Analytical psychology and personal myth**

In order to provide a basis for a Jungian evaluation, this longer section traces the evolution of Jung’s thinking from his first encounters with Adler’s ideas through to the personal myth discussed in *Memories, Dreams, Reflections.*
From this, it is suggested that a more Adlerocentric reading of Jung is required. This interpretation links with related contemporary contributions (Hillman, 1994; Watsky, 2002). It is further argued that Jung’s work on personal myth accommodates Adler’s master narrative; and, in so doing, undermines its master status. This aligns the personal myth more clearly with contemporary thinking on the relationship between psychoanalytic studies and narrative (Frosh, 2010, pp. 69-97; Phillips, 2015).

**Jung’s reception of Adler**

Jung was exposed to Adler’s ideas through the meetings of the *International Psychoanalytic Association* (IPA), the *Jahrbuch*, and Adler’s early books. Adler spoke at the IPA on sadism in 1908, and psychic hermaphroditism in 1910. He wrote a paper in the *Jahrbuch* on the neurotic disposition in 1909 (McGuire, 1974, pp. 563-577). The private catalogue of Jung’s personal library indicates it contained copies in German of Adler’s *Study of Organ Inferiority* and *The Neurotic Constitution* but not his later works (Bibliothekskommission, 1967). Jung appears to have first read *The Neurotic Constitution* in the summer of 1912 (1913/1961, CW4b, p. 87). Adler was cited regularly throughout the Collected Works and particularly in the period 1916-1928 (Forryan & Glover, 1979, CW20, p. 9).

Jung’s observations on Adler are both appreciative and critical. In 1917, he attempted to explain a typical patient example from both Adlerian and Freudian perspectives, concluding, ‘it is unquestionable that the urge to power plays an extraordinarily important part. It is correct that neurotic symptoms
and complexes are also elaborate “arrangements” which inexorably pursue their aims, with incredible obstinacy and cunning. Neurosis is teleologically oriented. In establishing this Adler has won for himself no small credit’ (Jung, 1917/1926/1943/1966, CW7, p. 40). In 1921, he credited Adler with introducing the concept of compensation into the psychology of neuroses. He stated that inferiority gives rise to compensation i.e. a guiding fiction to balance the inferiority. ‘The “guiding fiction is a psychological system that endeavours to turn an inferiority into a superiority’ (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 428). He acknowledged this compensating function was, ‘undeniable and empirically demonstrable’ (p. 419). He then outlined his own views on compensation, arguing that it is an inherently self-regulating function of the psyche that seeks to balance the conscious and unconscious attitudes. He added that Adler recognised the anticipatory function of the unconscious (p. 422). In an undated note found in his posthumous papers, Jung praised Adler’s, ‘meticulous elaboration of the psychology and phenomenology of the urge for significance…[he] was the first to illuminate the social context of the problem of neurosis…Adler’s life work constitutes one of the most important keystones for the structure of a future art of psychotherapy’ (Jung cited in Jaffé, 1979, p. 65).

Turning to more critical examples, in a letter to Freud of 1910, Jung criticised Adler for his ‘total absence of psychology’ (Maguire, 1974, p. 364). Two years later, again in a letter to Freud, he plotted with him to review On the Neurotic Constitution in a negative light and claimed ‘the man really is slightly dotty’ (Maguire, 1974, p. 531). In 1955, in an interview with Michael Schabad, Jung
is quoted as saying ‘Adler had only one idea. It was a good idea, but he did not get beyond schoolmaster psychology’ (1977, p. 269). Perhaps the ambivalent nature of Jung’s reactions is best captured by his argument that Adler’s individual psychology cannot be considered psychoanalytic; and, in the following paragraph, that everyone interested in psychoanalysis should study Adler’s writings (Jung, 1930/1961, CW4, p. 328).

Adler as a point of triangulation
Jung’s reading of Adler appears to have provided him with a key point of triangulation in relation to Freud and played a role in the development of several of his signature concepts. From 1913 onwards, Jung developed a style of argument, whereby Adler and Freud were compared and contrasted, in order for Jung to establish his own position. This was adopted from 1913 onwards and continued throughout his life. It can be illustrated by three examples.

In 1924, Jung argued that, ‘Freud and Adler can easily be reconciled if only we will take the trouble to regard the psyche not as a rigid and unalterable system, but as a fluid stream of events which change kaleidoscopically under the alternating influence of different instincts. Hence we may have to explain a man on a Freudian basis before his marriage, and on the Adlerian basis afterwards…’ (Jung, 1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 82). Here, Jung made the case for a more nuanced understanding of the psyche; and argued that the master narratives of Freud and Adler can be employed more provisionally to interpret particular episodes or periods in a life. This was developed further in
1940, when Jung argued that conscious megalomania can be compensated by unconscious inferiority just as conscious inferiority can be compensated by unconscious megalomania (Jung, 1940/1968, CW9i, p. 180). Here, Jung inverted Adler’s master narrative to suggest an alternative line of movement from superiority to inferiority.

In 1933, Jung stated that Adler and Freud believed the human psyche is everywhere the same, and can be explained in the same way; whereas, ‘it was one of the greatest experiences of my life to discover how enormously different people’s psyches are’ (Jung, 1933/1934, CW10, p. 137). Again, Jung contrasted Freud and Adler, in order to propose a more textured and pluralistic psychology.

In 1934, Jung compared Adler and Freud and argued they both explain neurosis from an infantile angle and place the therapist in the position of an expert. They ignore, he suggested, the will to adapt and the potential for growth and creativity in the neurosis and enable the therapist to hide behind technique (Jung, 1934/1970, CW10, pp. 160-161). Here, Jung found both Freud and Adler didactic and proposed a less technique-driven style. Related to this, in 1935, he suggested that patients may benefit from reading books by both Freud and Adler and making their own choices (Jung, 1935/1977, CW18, p. 128). In 1955, he argued that, ‘psychology has also the aspect of a pedagogical method in the widest sense of the word…It is an education. It is something like antique philosophy. And not what we understand by a technique’ (Jung, 1977, p. 255). This hints at a distinctively Jungian
pedagogical strategy\textsuperscript{17} whereby grand narratives become key concepts i.e. \textit{sit within} the method rather than drive it.

So it was that Jung repeatedly framed his argument by contrasting the viewpoints of Freud and Adler (as he saw them) and developing a third position. He emphasised the value of both approaches but consistently refused to hang his developing sense of analytical psychology around either. Jung, it seems to me, argued for a textured approach to understanding the almost infinite varieties of psyche. He refused to explain it by using any one single theory as this would constitute a form of reductionism; and wrote, ‘criticism of the psychological assumptions upon which a man’s [sic] theories are based becomes an imperative necessity’ (Jung, 1951/1966, CW16, p. 114); and ‘the stubborn application of a particular theory or method must be characterized as basically wrong’ (Jung, 1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 113). He consequently refused to use psychotherapeutic techniques based on a single theory as this would approximate to a kind of therapeutic fundamentalism. Jung believed that some individuals may have an Adlerian psychology just as others may have a Freudian, or both, or neither. He also inverted their master narratives; for example, he argued that the inferiority complex may be relevant to some individuals but a form of superiority complex more relevant to others. In short, analytical psychology is analytical, at least in part, because it eschews master narratives. It is a comparative approach to psychology that honours the grand myths of Freud and Adler but refuses reduction to either or both. Jung, in my view, is \textit{not} attempting to replace the Oedipus complex or

\textsuperscript{17} It is acknowledged that Jung regarded Adler, in a slightly different sense and somewhat disparagingly, as a pedagogue.
inferiority complex with a third grand narrative of psychological theory. One reason for this, as discussed in Chapter Six, is his interest in enantiodromia and the play of opposites. In a limited sense, Adler’s approach is enantiodromiatic because he saw inferiority turning into its opposite, namely, success; Jung, however, was more fully committed to this line of thinking and seemed to believe that all grand narratives eventually succumb to their opposites.

\textit{Adler’s theory of fictions}

Adler developed an explicit theory of fictions by drawing selectively from Hans Vaihinger’s \textit{Philosophy of As-If} (Adler, 1912/1921, pp. 15, 18, 38, 81). Whatever its merits, by 1912, Adler possessed a wide vocabulary of critical terms including: ‘guiding line’ (p. 24); ‘guiding fiction’ (pp. 27, 28); ‘anti-fiction’ (p. 40); and ‘fictitious guiding goal’ (p. 57). At that time, Jung had nothing of similar scope or depth, and was largely dependent on Adler in beginning to develop his own approach. It seems to me that Jung took on Adler’s ideas to inform his own thinking. In 1916, he started using terms such as: ‘lines of psychological development’ (Jung, 1916/1966, CW7, p. 291); ‘life-line’ (p. 293); ‘life-line’ (Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 170); and ‘healing fiction’ (Jung, 1932/1969, CW11, p. 331). In 1957, he used the expression ‘fiction of oneself’ to describe the persona (Jung, 1977, p. 297). The resemblance between these phrases, and Adler’s language of guiding lines and fictions, is quite marked.
Jung’s adaptation of Adler’s ideas

Jung did not borrow from Adler wholesale, he adapted and modified the latter’s theory of fictions in his own way. In relation to life-lines and guiding fictions, Jung acknowledged Adler’s use of the term guiding fictions and sought to distinguish between it and life-lines.

The construction of life-lines reveals to consciousness the ever-changing direction of the currents of libido. These life-lines are not to be confused with the ‘guiding fictions’ discovered by Adler, for the latter are nothing but arbitrary attempts to cut off the persona from the collective psyche and lend it an independent existence. One might say that the guiding fiction is an unsuccessful attempt to construct a life-line. Moreover – and this shows the uselessness of the fiction – such a line as it does produce persists far too long; it has the tenacity of a cramp.

(Jung, 1916/1966, CW7, p. 294)

Here, Jung explicitly criticised Adler and dismissed the guiding fiction as a failed life-line. The position in analytical psychology is that the life-line constructed by the hermeneutic method enabled a synthesis with the collective psyche. It entails the elaboration of analogies and similarities to enable individual and collective lines of development to appear. To Jung, the guiding fiction was too narrow a concept to accommodate the collective psyche. There is an explicitly historical dimension to Jung’s critique here that contrasts with Adler’s focus on the contemporary period (1912/1921, p. 24).

The life-line has both synchronic and diachronic aspects; and it is the latter that provide a counterweight, or point of comparison, to contemporary events.

---

18 This passage from 1916 was omitted from the re-worked sections of *The Structure of the Unconscious* that appeared in *The Relations Between the Ego and Unconscious*. 
and influences. This suggests there is an archetypal dimension to Jung’s critique.

Jung also made the criticism that the guiding fiction lasts too long. The role he envisaged for the life-line is more provisional and dynamic. Here, Jung may have been concerned that the guiding fiction can solidify into persona identification; indeed, its grounding in the resolution of a felt inferiority may make this more, rather than less likely, and therefore difficult to shake off. For Jung, the heroic overcoming of childhood problems may only be one stage in individuation and itself an obstacle to further growth. He was also interested in the dynamic nature of libido; the ways in which it can ebb and flow. For Jung, an individual may pursue several lines of development at one time, and indeed, over the course of a life. An absorbing plot can become a tiresome bore.

Adler argued that individuals wear a ‘persona’ or ‘mask’ determined by their guiding fiction just like classical actors (1912/1921, p. 39). This indicates Adler’s dramaturgical sensibility; and, importantly, predates Jung’s first use of the term persona (1916/1966, CW7, p. 281). For Adler, the guiding fiction determines the persona’s character traits which then come into conflict with the anti-fiction of societal influence; whereas, for Jung, the persona is a blend of these two aspects with the accent on the latter. Adler stated that the guiding fiction is an idol, a deity, a God, holy, and divine (1912/1921, pp. 23, 41, 55). Jung acknowledged this and seems to incorporate it within his description of the persona as a petty-god (1916/1966, CW7, p. 281).
Adler, influenced by Charcot, argued that the guiding fiction determines all perceptions, ideas, actions, and judgements, including the ideas of science and philosophy (1912/1921, p. 28). In this way, he anticipated Jung’s elaboration of the personal equation (1921/1971, CW6, p. 9). Adler also argued that the guiding fiction can appear as a second self, an inner voice, or daemon which encourages, punishes and accuses (1912/1921, p. 47). In 1932, Jung argued that the vocation is the voice of the inner individual and a ‘daemon whispering…of new and wonderful paths’ (1934/1954, CW17, p. 176). Adler’s signature concept of individual psychology as ‘the entire psychic life’ (1912/1921, p. vii) bears some similarity to Jung’s evolving sense of individuation and individuality (1916/1966, CW7, pp. 296-298).

Adler stated that the neurotic is nailed to the cross of his own fiction (1912/1921, p. 33). Jung subsequently argued that it is necessary to carry one’s own cross i.e. in order to avoid being nailed to it (1932/1969, CW11, pp. 340-341; 1977, p. 440; 2009, p. 310). As indicated above, Adler incorporated Vaihinger’s threefold division into fiction, hypothesis, and dogma. Jung seems to have picked up on the idea of living out one’s own hypothesis; and argued this is integral to the project of individuation (Jung, 1977, p. 98). Finally, Adler argued that the guiding fiction is an individual’s answer to the question of life (1912/1921, p. 23); whereas, Jung stated that the personal myth is the answer given to the question which an individual addresses to the world (1961/1995, p. 350).
Conception of the personal myth

This section focuses on the personal myth and seeks to specify the key features of it. Jung wrote only very briefly on personal myth, in an explicit way, and this took place in the 1950s when he was already in his mid-seventies. Personal myth is therefore very late work, possibly Jung’s last. It may be one of his most significant contributions but it is not entirely clear what he meant by it. Huskinson (2008, p. 3) is perhaps right to argue that Jung, and some other Jungians, have been more drawn to the analysis of classic myths than myth as personal narrative; although there have been some significant contributions on this theme (Giegerich, 2008; MacAdams, 1993; Rowland, 2005; Stevens, 1995).

In a widely quoted passage in Memories, Dreams, Reflections, Jung stated he was undertaking to tell his ‘personal myth’ (1961/1995, p. 17). Elsewhere in that text, he referred to ‘an explanatory myth which has slowly taken shape within me in the course of the decades’ (p. 371). In addition, Jung discussed a dream featuring part of Liverpool that took place on 2nd January 1927; and a related painting (started the week following) sometimes called Window Opening on Eternity. He stated that, ‘out of it emerged a first inkling of my personal myth’ (p. 224). Jung also alluded to a personal myth (‘my myth’) in the introduction to Symbols of Transformation (1950/1956, CW5, p. xxv).

According to this account, written around 1950, the completion of the manuscript of the Psychology of the Unconscious in 1911 provided the spur to the development of his personal myth. In a letter to J.A. Gilbert of 1929, he referred to enabling his patients to develop their own mythology (Jung cited in
Shamdasani, 2009, p. 216). These clues indicate that Jung developed a sense of personal myth over a long period; indeed, that the personal myth could evolve over a lifetime.

**Scope of the personal myth and wider life**

The personal myth is seen as profoundly connected with wider life. Jung insisted on the indivisible connection between his formal writings and his life.

The ‘autobiography’ is my life, viewed in the light of knowledge I have gained from my scientific endeavours. Both are one…My life has been in a sense the quintessence of what I have written, not the other way around. The way I am and the way I write are a unity. All my ideas and all my endeavours are myself. Thus, the ‘autobiography’ is merely the dot on the i.

(Jung, 1961/1995, p. 14)

This appears to be one reason why Jung was reluctant to write an autobiography and tended not to regard *Memories, Dreams, Reflections* as one (1976d, p. 550). The personal myth cannot be reduced to a short statement or pat formula. Although there are several points where Jung appears to offer a pithy summary19, the personal myth should be seen as encompassing both Jung’s work and wider life (‘all my ideas and all my endeavours are myself’). Linked to this, the personal myth has an explicitly theoretical or ideational content20. Jung wrote that making theory should be seen as an *integral* part of his identity, ‘as vital a function of mine, as eating

---

19 ‘My life is story of the self-realisation of the unconscious’ (Jung, 1961/1995, p. 17); and, ‘My life has been permeated and held together by one idea and one goal: namely, to penetrate into the secret of the personality’ (p. 232).

20 In this respect, it is relevant that Giegerich (2008, pp. 125, 191) referred to the soul’s logical life as ‘living thought’.
and drinking' (1961/1995, p. 359). In his case, the personal myth encompassed psychology, religion, literature, and philosophy. This subverts conventional distinctions between theory and practice and suggests ideas should be seen as key components of narrative. It also indicates that the scope of the personal myth is vast as it potentially integrates all areas of a human being’s experience.

Despite Jung’s statements about telling his myth in Memories, Dreams, Reflections, it would be a misreading to interpret that text as the personal myth. Memories, Dreams, Reflections is, ‘merely the dot on the i’. It is more of a guidebook to the personal myth; and an occasionally unreliable one at that. There is also a sense in which the personal myth is always a work in progress. Shortly before his death, Jung found that he needed to re-visit unresolved childhood experiences and consider their significance (1961/1995, pp. 8-9). The personal myth, then, is never complete. Its final extent is not known, and in this sense, there must remain a mysterious element to any personal myth.

The personal myth fails to wholly conform to the conventional storyline of a beginning, middle, and end; and nor does it form a purely linear plot. Jung stated, ‘there is no linear evolution; there is only a circumambulation of the self’ (p. 222); and apparently suggested that the frequent repetitions in Memories, Dreams, Reflections represented his peripatetic or circular modes of thinking (Jung cited in Shamdasani, 1999, p. 39). Jung’s abiding interest in enantiodromia is also relevant i.e. the view that everything turns into its
opposite. These clues suggest that there may be more than one way of understanding personal myth. It may be read linearly, episodically, thematically, or cyclically. It seems to me there is an implicit invitation, on finishing *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*, to return to the start; and compare the similarities and differences between the nature visions of the old man and the child (Jung, 1961/1995, pp. 21, 252, 392). Indeed, given that Jung viewed his entire scientific works as autobiographical, one is almost invited, on finishing the last volume of the Collected Works, to return to Volume One and start again; a somewhat more daunting challenge!

*Personal myth and epistemology*

In developing a personal myth, Jung appears to have embraced a more thoroughly mythic or mythopoetic epistemological position.

…I have now undertaken, in my eighty-third year, to tell my personal myth. I can only ‘tell stories’. Whether or not the stories are true is not my problem. The only question is whether what I tell is my fable, my truth.

(Jung, 1961/1995, p. 17)

Here, Jung seems to reject objectivist and positivist positions. He did not see his role as proving theories true or false; rather, he argued for the mythic nature of reality. He rejected ‘critical rationalism’, ‘the intellect’ and ‘scientific man’ in favour of the healing power of ‘mythologising’, ‘the emotions’ and ‘mythic man’ (pp. 330-331). This links with earlier statements where he argued that science was a myth (Jung, 1940/1968, CW9i, pp. 179-180); and a mere ‘corner’ of the world (Jung, 1997b, p. 611). Jung implies here that a belief in
mythlessness *is itself* a myth i.e. the myth of scientific materialism. This appears to be what he meant by referring to living ‘without’ a myth (Jung, 1950/1956, CW5, p. xxv). In a more fundamental sense, it is not possible to live outside myth. There are only two options: to recognise one lives in myth or to live in myth unconsciously. In this sense, Segal (2011, pp. 75-76) overstated his case when he argued that, for Jung, science is not mythic.

The idea that myths can be personal is, on the face of it, profoundly problematic. One definition of myth is that it is not individually authored. Myths come to us as the work of many hands. Jung downplayed the sense of personal authoring by repeatedly emphasising the creative role played by myth itself. It is not so much a question of writing one’s myth as getting ‘to know’ one’s myth and becoming acquainted with it; perhaps getting on speaking terms with it. He also counsels against living one’s myth; and by this he means a non-agentic living out of one’s fate through blind unconsciousness. It appears that the personal myth is a sort of middle way through the respective reefs of agency and fatalism. Jung saw the personal myth as the living out of one’s ideas and the testing of one’s hypothesis in the fire of existence. It entailed developing one’s own philosophy of life, an inevitably error-strewn process.

We must make our experiment. We must make mistakes. We must live out our own vision of life. And there will be error. If you avoid error you do not live; in a sense even it may be said that every life is a mistake, for no one has found the truth.

(Jung, 1977, p. 98)
On this basis, as discussed in Chapter Six, there can be no prescribed plot or route. Any prefabricated model would be an error, the surest way of avoiding individuation. Individuation is a narrative without a predetermined plot. Or, to put it in unlovely prose, the personal myth is a meta-narratological strategy.

Summary

In this section, I have explored Jung’s reception of Adler and argued that a more Adlerocentric reading of Jung is required. Adler provided a key point of triangulation for Jung and influenced the development of his signature concepts. This enabled Jung to develop an analytical psychology that is subversive of grand narratives. For example, he argued that the master narratives of Freud and Adler can be employed more provisionally to interpret particular episodes or periods in a life. Jung also inverted Adler’s master narrative to suggest an alternative line of movement from superiority to inferiority. In addition, Jung contrasted Freud and Adler to propose a more textured and pluralistic psychology. He developed a distinctively Jungian pedagogical strategy whereby grand narratives could become contents i.e. sit within the method rather than drive it.

Jung slowly developed a theory of fictions from his encounter with Adler’s system. Adler’s central concepts of guiding lines, guiding fiction, anti-fiction, and fictitious guiding goal influenced the development of key ideas in analytical psychology including lines of development, life-lines, personal myth, personal fable, persona, vocation, and individuation. Jung added a distinctively historical dimension to Adler’s approach and placed more of an
emphasis on the provisional, dynamic, and pluralistic nature of life-lines. It is in the personal myth that Jung’s theory of fictions matures. The key characteristics of the personal myth are its lifelong and life-wide nature; and inclusion of explicitly ideational elements. It does not conform to a narrowly linear structure nor can it be reduced to a simple formula. It resists the contrasting pulls of extreme agency and fatalism and is, at all times, a work in progress. It represents Jung’s arrival at a critical, comparative psychology based on a meta-narratological and mythopoetic epistemology.

**Evaluation of the Career Construction Theory**

As indicated at the start of this chapter, the debate between Jung and Adler has significance for career studies because of the Adlerian turn in contemporary career theory. The Adlerian identity narrative in Savickas’ Career Construction Theory is now evaluated from an analytical psychological angle.

**Integrative approach**

Savickas explicitly attempted an integrative approach by seeking to bring together psychoanalytic conceptions of careers work with perspectives from differential and developmental psychology and other disciplines. His work has been valuable in focusing attention on guiding fictions, fictional goals, guiding lines, hidden reasons, private sense, and private logic. With some refinements, he has successfully translated Adler’s concepts of inferiority, guiding fiction, and interest into the career development concepts of preoccupations, life themes, and occupations. The Career Construction
Theory provides a critical contrast to the dominant matching paradigm prevalent in twentieth century career studies. For example, its focus on linking preoccupation, life theme, and occupation subverts the matching approach to personality type and jobs discussed in Chapter Five (Holland, 1997). Contrary to Holland, Savickas believes that interests do not determine career direction; rather, the direction in which an individual moves determines interests (1988, p. 214). To use some of his favourite examples, Savickas discussed the way a sickly person could become a champion body-builder, a stutterer become a news anchor, or a coward a brave fighter (2013, p. 166). Perhaps most significantly, Savickas has placed depth psychology centre stage in contemporary career studies. He has rescued it from the dead end described by Super, Osipow and others; albeit, from a predominantly Adlerian perspective.

*Emotional literacy*

Savickas has made a space for failures and wounds in what is sometimes seen as a literature of success. He has developed methods that enable individuals to name their problems and potentially transform these into practical solutions. In so doing, he has brought a greater emotional intelligence and literacy to career theory. The sometimes clinical or scientistic language of occupational psychology has been enriched by his use of terms such as yearnings, inferiorities, and fictions. In connection with this, he has also placed an emphasis, to some extent at least, on the inner wisdom of the client (Savickas, 2010b, p. 16). Savickas has also enabled career development professionals, and their clients, to look below the surface of
career narratives and develop a deeper understanding of vocational
behaviour. In this sense, he has contributed to the development of a more
critical career studies. Linked to this, he has enabled career development
professionals to develop reflexivity about their own investments and
motivations for participating in this, indeed any, line of work. For example, a
deeper appreciation of one’s own personal career development can help see
*through* projections made in relation to the client.

*Under plotting*

Career Construction Theory, and similar approaches in career theory, suffer
from under plotting. In epistemological terms, Savickas identified himself as a
social constructionist with a particular interest in language, stories and the
recursive interplay between self and society. He criticised the classic career
development theorists with their grand stories of career development
(Savickas, 2013, pp. 148-150). He drew from Ricoeur to argue that
*emplotment* arises from arranging small stories in a sequence directed
towards a conclusion which in turn produces a higher-level narrative termed
‘the larger grand story of a life’ (p. 164). In my view, Savickas’ critique of the
grand narratives typical of traditional career theory is fair, but the detail of its
construction is indicative of a weakness in his narratological stance. Grand
narratives are not critiqued *per se* and consequently the concept of a grand
narrative survives intact in his key concepts of career adaptability,
preoccupations, life themes and occupations. Savickas’ life stories always
feature the same, single plot: a movement from inferiority to success.
Moreover, as the quotation directly above reveals, he holds that a life *should*
be a grand story and potential difficulties with these assumptions are not addressed.

As discussed earlier, Savickas and Adler argue that guiding fictions are distinctively plotted and always feature a single line of movement from inferiority to success. A key weakness is that, despite the infinite variety of fictions, only one possible plot for these fictions is allowed: inferiority to success. This plot has therefore the status of a grand narrative. It is this approach to master narrative that has been imported more or less completely, and somewhat uncritically, into the work of Savickas and his contemporaries (Cochran, 1997; Watkins, 1984). To be clear, Career Construction Theory allows for reputational and adaptability narratives, but the identity narrative must conform to the same plot of inferiority to success through social contribution.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

Career Construction Theory, it will be recalled, proposed a threefold plot structure consisting of: preoccupation; life theme; and occupation, with a concomitant Adlerian movement from felt inferiority to perceived plus, and from private failure to public success. From an analytical psychological perspective, this movement is too heroic and at risk of persona identification. It is also underplotted; analytical psychology enjoins us to imagine a range of alternative plots. It therefore contributes something significant to contemporary career theory research: a richer and more nuanced narratological literacy.
In relation to training career helpers, Jung’s approach has merit because of its non-didactic nature. He was highly critical of idealised educational provision in which exemplary standards or behaviours were espoused. Neither students nor educators, he suggests, can live up to these high ideals and they fail to address, ‘the secrets of private experience’ (Jung, 1961/1995, p. 362). This enables the design of critical career education in relation to contemporary narrative career theory. For example, workshop participants could be invited to imagine alternative plot lines leading from public success to private failure i.e. the sense that one has successfully climbed a ladder but realised it is against the wrong wall. Equally, they could be asked to discuss preoccupations, life themes, and occupations proceeding in parallel, rather than in linear form. Participants could be invited to explore and debate the advantages and disadvantages of attempting to resolve one’s inferiorities via occupation.

Broadening this out slightly, Jung’s subversion of master narratives can also be applied to other classic career development theories (e.g. Cochran, 1997; Holland, 1997; Levinson et al., 1978; Super, 1980). Analytical psychology presupposes a life of multiple plots, that any one life exceeds definition by any one master narrative. As indicated earlier, this hints at a distinctively Jungian pedagogical strategy within which grand narratives devolve to concepts. The latter sitting within the strategy and informing curriculum and syllabus construction; rather than dictating the strategy itself. An analytical psychological approach can engender a kind of playfulness in relation to
these theories; whilst, at the same time, honouring the value of each. Each key concept, it will be recalled, speaks to lived experience; the triumphs and tears of ordinary lives. It is insufficient to hang an entire curriculum around any one master narrative such as inferiority (Savickas) or matching (Holland). A critical career education curriculum should enable individuals to identify more than one possible career plot; and go on to compare, evaluate, and apply them. This indicates a pedagogy for possibility in relation to future plot development.

Jung’s focus on the historical dimensions of individuation indicates a need for a career education curriculum with an explicitly historical component. He saw individuation as history-making, as constitutive of world history. Here, Progoff’s ideas for life study focused on the lives of individuals selected from recent or distant history are relevant (1983, p. 47). These could be extended to include a wider variety of phenomena such as historic events, cultural movements, objects, literature, or music. Such activities need not be superficial or historically naïve; indeed, should not be so in order to avoid the criticism that Jungians play fast and loose with cultural material. As indicated in Chapter One, Ricoeur perhaps indicated a way forward here when he discussed using cultural artefacts to, ‘light up our own situation’ or ‘open up the world’ (1971/2008, p. 145).

Jung’s approach has value because of its explicit ideational content. This links well with contemporary constructivist approaches to career studies that have emphasised the role of the individual as a theory-maker (Holland, 1997; L. K.
Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996; Patton & McMahon, 1998). Jung takes this somewhat further to encompass an individual's overall philosophy of life and religious point of view. This considerably and helpfully enlarges the scope of a career education curriculum. In addition, the gradually evolving, lifelong nature of personal myth suggests a move away from career education workshops in which participants are enjoined to craft snappy success formulas. It indicates a move away from didactic techniques that fit individuals to pre-cooked plotlines; towards drawing from a deeper range of contemporary and historical sources in the service of nourishing lifelong myth work.

**Conclusion**

Contemporary perspectives on narrative in career theory have been critically evaluated from the perspective of analytical psychology. This has been accomplished by tracing the role of Adler on the evolution of Jung's thought and the nature of the debate between the two. In addition, a distinctive interpretation of personal myth has been offered and its nature more clearly delineated. These points have been brought to bear on career studies. It has been argued that career theory draws from an impoverished repertoire of narrative frameworks. Finally, practical recommendations have been made for the evolution of research, training and practice.
Chapter Seven Postscript: On Chasing a Deer

The current narrative ideas in career studies probably do need some criticism but I need to acknowledge that they are very accessible. Personal myth is richer but, perhaps for that reason, more complex. People need a way in and poems can maybe provide a stepping stone.

This is an extract from the poem *Unfold Your Own Myth* by Rumi, the thirteenth century Persian poet. I find it speaks to the historical and archetypal nature of personal myth.

Chase a deer and end up everywhere!
An oyster opens his mouth to swallow one drop.
Now there’s a pearl.
A vagrant wanders empty ruins.
Suddenly he’s wealthy.
But don’t be satisfied with stories, how things have gone with others. Unfold your own myth...

(Rumi, 2004, pp. 40-41)

Rumi’s poem anticipates many of the themes developed by Jung. In particular, the need to avoid a wholly rational approach to life and the importance of our own myth work. I like that word ‘unfold’. Strikes a nice balance between agency and passivity. What do you think?
Career and life course development

Introduction

In this chapter, career development theories relating to life course development are identified. A canonical text is selected: *The Sense of Vocation: a Study of Career and Life Development* (Cochran, 1990b). This is critically evaluated using Jungian and post-Jungian perspectives on life course development. Implications for research, training and practice are developed.

*Why is this valuable?*

This chapter has particular relevance in view of the importance of life course development to career studies discussed in the initial literature review (Chapter Two). It is argued that analytical psychology provides a richer and more nuanced method of understanding life course development through acknowledging the central role played by the unconscious. The outcomes are threefold. First, a re-appreciation of Cochran’s work. Second, a fresh look at
life course development within analytical psychology. And lastly, a re-

imagination of life course development within career studies in the light of

these two aspects. This chapter also makes use of concepts introduced in
earlier chapters, specifically career strategies (Chapter Six) and narrative
(Chapter Seven). It also, in some respects, anticipates the discussion on
learning in Chapter Nine.

Overview of life course development literature with a career focus

Life course development is an important area of career studies. This genre of
career theory emphasises the developmental nature of career by paying
attention to ages, stages and phases. There have been many important and
relevant contributions to the understanding of life course development from a
career angle (Cochran, 1990b; Ginzberg et al., 1951; Gould, 1978/1979;
Levinson et al., 1978; Levinson & Levinson, 1996; Super, 1957; Vaillant,
1977, 2002). Four such perspectives are now summarised by way of
illustration. Ginzberg et al. (1951) proposed a three stage model consisting of:
fantasy; tentative; and realistic; stages with the latter two stages broken down
into further substages. Super (1957) developed an overall theory, with several
subsequent refinements, based on five stages: growth; exploration;
establishment; maintenance; and disengagement (discussed in Chapter
Four). Cochran (1990) proposed a model based on four stages: incompletion,
positioning; positing; and completion (to be discussed in more detail below).
Levinson et al. (1978) created a seven stage model made up of: early adult
transition; entering the adult world; age thirty transitions; settling down; mid-
life transition; entering middle adulthood; and late adulthood; with each stage punctuated by processes of structure making and structure breaking.

Cochran’s work on life course development has been selected because of his major contribution to career studies. His status was described as ‘seminal’ in a recent review of career development theory (Patton & McMahon, 2014, p. 234). His work features in many contemporary collections and textbooks (D. Brown & Associates, 2002; Gothard et al., 2001; Sharf, 2013b). The principal reason for selection, in terms of this chapter, is his integrative approach to life course development, career, and vocation; undertaken from an explicitly post-positivist perspective.

**Summary of The Sense of Vocation**

Larry Cochran’s main work on career development took place, relatively late in his own career, in a concentrated period in the 1990s (1990a, 1990b, 1997). For *The Sense of Vocation*, he selected over twenty life stories of individuals who, he believed, had a mission in life. He declared an interest in researching ‘exemplary cases’ (Cochran, 1990b, p. 4); and argued that vocation represents ‘career at its best’ (p. 10). The individuals selected included: Lincoln Steffens, Henry James, Gordon Liddy, Anthony Trollope, Yehudi Menuhin, Conrad Hilton, Loren Eiseley, Norman Vincent Peale, St Augustine, Carl Rogers, Emily Carr, Christopher Milne, Andre Maurois, Carl Jung, and Eileen Garrett.
**Intellectual influences**

Cochran’s central theoretical influence was De Charms’ work on motivation. At several points, he cited De Charms’ theory of personal causation as the main basis of his thinking (pp. 60, 84, 117). This focused on the role of the individual as causal agent i.e. seeing the individual as a point of origin rather than a pawn on a chessboard. Cochran was also, to a degree, influenced by Alfred Adler. He stated, ‘the regularity with which a person’s later vocation is the direct result of an initial negative condition is so apparent that it is difficult to understand why Adler’s original work has been so neglected’ (p. 60). He linked this with the lives of Norman Vincent Peale, Gordon Liddy, and Anthony Trollope, who became the exact opposite of what they were in their youth; and identified the importance of ‘inferiority’ in their lives (p. 85). Cochran inserted some caveats, however, suggesting that this may oversimplify (p. 62) and that the line of movement from incompletion to completion can be from positive to negative as well as negative to positive (pp. 17-18, 29, 56, 42). Nonetheless, in most of the examples he provides, incompletion is more a felt negative than a positive; and this is hinted at in the recurrent phrase ‘a gap between what is and what ought to be’ (p. 28, 174). Both these aspects link closely with Adler’s key concept of inferiority. The form of narrative analysis Cochran favours (incompletion through to completion) is also distinctively Adlerian.

**Cochran’s criticism of traditional life course development approaches**

Cochran criticised stage-based developmental accounts of the human life-span such as those of Abraham Maslow, Erik Erikson, Daniel Levinson, Donald Super, Lawrence Kohlberg, and Jean Piaget. He rejected
neopositivism and took an explicitly interpretivist, analogic, and literary approach to understanding the human life cycle (pp. 187-190). Cochran distanced himself from what he regarded as mechanical stage-based approaches preferring to emphasise the loose, provisional, and phase-based nature of his approach. Phases were not regarded as strictly time bound; and one phase could last decades depending on the nature of the individual’s experiences. Cochran was critical of the exclusive use of scientific language to discuss the life course arguing that, ‘the task is aesthetic’ (p. 194). For example, he described Jung’s depiction of his life story as, ‘staggering’ and ‘a drama of great beauty’ (p. 158).

The four phases
Cochran argued that, ‘any story manifests incompleteness, positioning, positing, and completion, in order’ (p. 30). These four phases can be very briefly summarised as follows. Incompletion is a reflective phase in which an individual identifies, ‘a gap between what is and what ought to be’ (p. 28). Positioning is a more active phase concerned with planning, rehearsing, and refining general direction. Positing is the phase of vigorous action designed to bring something about. Completion is another reflective phase in which one is a spectator on the completed action and its consequences.

There is more complexity to this than perhaps first appears as the characteristics of the cycle, and each element within it, can vary according to the flow of seasons (winter, spring, summer and fall) and generic plots (comedy, romance, tragedy and irony). Here, Cochran was influenced by
Daniel Levinson et al.’s *The Seasons of a Man’s Life* and Northrop Frye’s *Anatomy of Criticism*. He identified comedy with the myth of spring, romance with summer, tragedy with fall, and irony with winter. All the above elements, he suggested, interact to create patterns of repetition and rhythm in people’s lives.

Cochran argued that the incompletion-completion cycle relates both to single episodes and to entire lives (p. 37). He stated that, ‘the rhythmic progression from incompletion to completion is common to all who have unified their lives in a vocation’ (p. 43). The detail of how Cochran saw this working is quite dense; and I have attempted to simplify it in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall phases of life</th>
<th>Characteristic pattern of multiple episodes within each overall phase of life</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Winter-like</strong></td>
<td><strong>Spring-like</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incompletion</strong> down</td>
<td><strong>Summer-like</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Positioning</strong> down</td>
<td><strong>Fall-like</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Positing</strong> down</td>
<td><strong>Winter-like</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Completion</strong></td>
<td><strong>Fall-like</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Completion</strong></td>
<td><strong>Winter-like</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the far left hand column, the four overall phases of the life course are depicted with arrows indicating time advancing down the table. In the remaining columns, the typical characteristics of the incompletion-positioning-positing-completion cycle are mapped with time moving across the table. For
instance, within the *overall life phase of incompleteness*, Cochran argues that people with a vocation typically experience *several episodes* that follow a pattern from spring-like incompleteness (comedy, idealism) through to winter-like completion (irony, disillusion). As an example, he discussed an individual (the journalist Lincoln Steffens) who, in his youthful experiences of corruption within the California state legislature and the horse-racing industry (and many other similar episodes), moved repeatedly from exciting promise and idealism through to disillusionment and agonised questioning (pp. 15, 32). Cochran stated that, ‘as a pattern of experience is repeated in different circumstances, more and more of life is bound into a certain kind of drama’ (p. 47). Here, the line of movement from incompleteness to completion is characterised by spring through summer and fall to winter i.e. comedy through romance to tragedy ending in irony.

This, Cochran suggested, is typical of episodes within the first phase of life i.e. incompleteness. These episodes progressively lead to metaphoring. For Steffens, these experiences might lead him to conclude that ‘life is a sham’ (p. 48). Cochran argued that such ‘dramatization is world-building in scope…the symbolic dramatic context a person develops is a worldview…’ (p. 21). To return to the example, whilst Lincoln Steffens was experiencing and noting corruption in government and racing contexts, he was practising another role, he was becoming a reporter. Cochran stated that, ‘there is a personal context or constellation in which a particular problem becomes pivotal…[leading to]…centering upon a problem that is so significant that it is as if their very existence were at stake’ (p. 58). This birth of yearning leads to goal-setting
that may in turn manifest in three modes: reversing or transforming a negative state; use of models; and a foretaste of the future.

**Roles**

Cochran drew a distinction between ostensive and dramatic roles, ‘the ostensive role is only really the housing for a dramatic role, and for a dramatic role, there might be a number of suitable houses’ (p. 65).

A vocation involves a dramatic role within a dramatic or symbolic structure. An occupation involves an ostensive role within an actual setting with its own ostensive role structure. One of the major differences is that one can leave an occupation, but one cannot leave a vocation without a radical change of personhood.

(p. 139)

He suggested, for example, that Yehudi Menuhin’s ostensive role was a world class violinist and yet his dramatic roles were Cerkessian warrior, peacemaker, and enchanter (p. 89). To Cochran, the ostensive role was simply the setting. It was possible for him to imagine Norman Vincent Peale or Carl Rogers outside the setting of the clergy or clinical psychology; whereas, the dramatic role was ‘the work of life’ (p. 109) without which it would be difficult to conceive of such individuals. Here, Cochran warned against ‘engulfment’ in glamorous or prestigious occupations (p. 139).

Cochran stated the existence of dramatic roles means, ‘that the role one adopts has been played before’ (p. 106). Through this, one can become a participant, ‘in a timeless drama of human existence’ (p. 106). In some cases,
he believed, citing Carl Rogers and Loren Eiseley, people do not simply profess but *live* the nature of life, ‘such persons seem to be selfless and filled with self at the same time, perhaps since there is no longer a clear boundary between self and nonself’ (p. 108). The work of life can be enormous in breadth and staggering in its scope (pp. 108-9). For some, he suggested, ‘the personal is elevated to the cosmic and one’s vocation is a particular expression of a universal’, and a re-enactment of, ‘the very nature of the world’ (p. 111). He argued that the completion phase, in particular, is marked by flow-like, numinous and peak experiences. There is a merging of being, doing, means, and ends (p. 160).

Cochran argued that vocation is a journey, not a terminal destination. Here, he was critical of those who argue that vocation must end with retirement from paid work. He states that an individual with a vocation is not simply a, ‘well-fed hog’ (p. 175) or ‘contented pig’ (p. 195). Cochran claimed that individuals can catch a glimpse of, ‘a timeless cycle of human nature’ (p. 196). He stated, ‘a vocation is not so much something one has as a pattern of meaning one lives’ (p. 172). He added:

Beneath the unique dramatic pattern of meaning in a life, there is another pattern, what appears to be a natural cycle common to everyone who makes a vocation of life.

(p. 179)

His case studies reveal individuals who continued to be productive in their *work of life* well beyond conventional retirement dates.
A vocation involves terminal goals of all sorts, completions along the way that one can rest in and look back on. However, a vocation is a normative goal. One cannot rest in a vocation. Rather one strives unceasingly to realize it.

(p. 160)

Cochran concluded by drawing a distinction between those who live a vocation and those who do not (p. 196). The former make of life a single act, that is to say, one story that makes a whole of life. The latter construct many divergent and episodic stories i.e. many scattered stories with no unifying structure.

**Summary**

In the section above, the key aspects of Cochran’s perspective have been described. His intellectual influences and criticisms of traditional life course development theories have been explored. The four phases of incompletion, positioning, positing, and completion, and their interaction, have been explained together with Cochran’s views on roles and vocation.

**Analytical psychology and life course development**

In this section, an analytical psychological perspective on life course development is discussed. The sources used include relevant passages within Jung’s writings (1934/1954, CW17, 1961/1995, 1997b). A range of post-Jungian sources have also been consulted (Boyd & Myers, 1988; Marie-Louise von Franz, 1978/1997; Hillman, 1996; Moraglia, 1994; Stein, 1983/2014).
Life and stages

Jung famously divided the stages of life into the morning, afternoon, and evening; with a first half of life focused on nature and a second focused on culture (1917/1926/1943/1966, CW7, pp. 74-74; 1929/1967, CW13, p. 14; 1930-31/1969, CW8). Although this position has some merits, it is somewhat simplistic, and has attracted criticism from later scholars. Fordham (1995) argued that traces of individuation could be detected in the lives of infants. Moraglia (1994) also proposed a less-age-linked view of adult development on the grounds that both young and old people are concerned with wider issues of the human condition as well as earning a living. He aligned Jungian adult development theory more closely to contemporary thinking in life course psychology by reducing emphasis on age-related stages in favour of more fluid understandings of the life course (Mintz, 2015; Zittoun, Valsiner, Vedeler, Salgado, & Gonçalves, 2013). In addition, Stein (1983/2014, p. 52) criticised a strictly linear approach; arguing that the unconscious, ‘resists being boxed into fixed temporal contexts and causal sequences’.

The imposition of linearity is, in a sense, an act of consciousness and it may unwittingly do violence to the flow of life. Jung seemed to be aware of this and acknowledged that there were limitations to any one metaphor (1930-31/1969, CW8, p. 397). He argued that individuation was not simply a question of years and could happen at any time, ‘there is the same possibility at any moment of life’ (Jung, 1997b, p. 761). This suggests that, whilst stage-based theories of the life course have value, they simply form part of the picture. There is a danger that over-concretised life course schemes lose touch with the life of
the unconscious. The notion that consciousness can comprehend life though sequences and structures is, in the end, an act of hubris. There may even be a form of projection at play; the intention being somehow to hold life at bay or push it out of the psyche. It is not so much about the ego understanding life as allowing life (in the sense of the wider self) to create meaning with or from the ego. Jung emphasised that individuation, ‘is both the beginning and the end of life, it is the process [emphasis added] of life itself’ (p. 758); and Stein (1983/2014, p. 59) equated the psyche with this life-force. In analytical psychology, individuation is the process of life becoming conscious of itself. It reminds me of Dylan Thomas’ line about, ‘the force that through the green fuse drives the flower’ (1988, p. 13). Jung (1929/1967, CW13, p. 52) put it another way when he stated, ‘it is not I who live, it lives me’. This is not life in any general or generic sense but a specific, unique form of life, ‘each of us carries his [sic] own life-form within him – an irrational form which no other can outbid (Jung, 1931/1966, CW16, p. 41). As indicated in Chapter One, this connects with the role of the individual in carrying life and suggests a radically new way of understanding career.

*Agency and the unconscious*

Analytical psychology pays attention to the role of the unconscious in vocation and is cautious about an exclusive reliance on agency. Jung argued that vocation is thrust upon individuals by the unconscious and that, by definition, one cannot choose and desire something that one does not know (1956, CW5, p. 65). He referred to:
…that all-powerful, all-tyrannizing necessity that is his [sic] own and his people’s affliction…he has resolved to obey the law that commands from within…it is the law, the vocation for which he is destined, no more 'his own' than the lion that fells him…

(Jung, 1934/1954, CW17, p. 178)

This is one of several references to vocation in the Collected Works and Memories, Dreams, Reflections. Jung described it variously as ‘an inner law' (1961/1995, p. 390); ‘the innate idiosyncrasy of a living being' (1934/1954, CW17, p. 171); ‘the inner voice’ (pp. 180, 182, 183, 184, 186); ‘the law of one’s own being’ (p. 173); ‘the life-will’ (p. 183) and ‘the law of his [sic] life’ (p. 179). These can, in turn, be linked to his use of the terms life-line and line of development. As was argued in Chapter Seven, these are all stations on the way towards Jung’s conception of the personal myth in the 1950s.

In the main quotation above, the key words are ‘law' and ‘resolved to obey'. Jung contrasted what might be termed inner law with societal conventions and expectations. He suggested that it is important to subvert the latter and have fidelity to the former. Jung also drew a distinction between fate and fatalism.

The phrase ‘resolved to obey’ refers to conscious acceptance of one’s fate as opposed to blind passivity. In this light, it seems that, for Jung, an excessive emphasis on agency is itself a kind of neuroticism; it is a defence against vocation (p. 183). He also expressed scepticism about a purely cognitive approach, ‘we are so accustomed to thinking these problems out until everything is clear as twice two makes four. But in practice it does not work like that, we do not reach a solution in principle as to how we should always act’ (Jung, 1959/1970, CW10, p. 462). One way of reading Jung’s favoured,
and much-cited dictum, *vocatus atque non vocatus deus aderit* (called or not called the god will be present) is as a caution *against* over-reliance upon agency in relation to vocation (1977, p. 258). In similar vein, von Franz (1978/1997, p. 276) equated vocation to ‘the powers that manifest within the psyche’. Romanyshyn also argued that vocation can choose an individual, ‘as much as, and perhaps even more than, he or she chooses it’; and, ‘we are encircled by a vocation’ (2007, pp. 112, 366).

*Discernment and dreams*

Discernment plays a key role in analytical psychological perspectives on the life course: ‘The practice of discernment enables the person to become increasingly sensitive to the unique and intimate constellation of extrarational evidence which from within the person *calls out* [emphasis added] for attention and for response’ (Boyd & Myers, 1988, p. 275). Three aspects of discernment are relevant here. First, the psyche is not monovocal but *polyvocal* (cf. Samuels, 1989). As Jung wrote, ‘...each part of the psyche is a person; it appears actively, with a human personal voice...’ (1997a, p. 451). This emphasises that there are many callings and these differ in terms of source and purpose. Second, an excessive emphasis on calling neglects the role of *listening to* a call. Jung doubted whether a ‘miseducated, civilized human being’ was capable of perceiving a voice (1934/1954, CW17, p. 183); and claimed that ‘our attitude towards this inner voice alternates between two extremes: it is regarded either as undiluted nonsense or as the voice of God. It does not seem to occur to any one that there might be something valuable in between’ (1940/1950/1968, CW9i, p. 132). And lastly, Jung attested to the
importance of dreams in vocational development arguing that they have value ‘in all critical phases of life’ including early childhood, puberty, getting a first job, mid-life, the climacteric and retirement (1977, pp. 456-457). In terms of Jung’s own life, three well-known ones are his dreams of animal bones and a radiolarian (prior to his choice of university degree); and the murder of the hero (as he transitioned to private practice as a psychoanalyst) (Jung, 1961/1995, pp. 104-105, 204-205). Jung also discussed the career-related dreams of his patients. He described a young man who discontinued his studies at university and found the next career choice difficult (Jung, 1913/1961, CW4a, pp. 237-238). He also briefly discussed a young film actress who re-considered her chosen profession (Jung, 1958/1970, CW10, pp. 372-374); and a much lengthier case study of a successful but irritable businessman (Jung, 1984, p. 6). He suggested dreams may have prospective, reductive or compensatory qualities and that, ‘the dream…does not conceal, it teaches’ (Jung, 1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 246).

**Destiny**

Jung occasionally suggested that destiny was laid down before birth. He argued, ‘we are conditioned not only by the past, but by the future, which is sketched out in us long beforehand and gradually evolves out of us’ (1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 110). He also referred to, ‘a predestined vocation’ (Jung, 1934/1954, CW17, p. 184). Later, Progoff related individuation to both the cause and goal of an individual’s life, ‘as though an acorn had a dream in which the leaves of a new oak tree were symbolized’ (1956/1973, p. 177). This rather beautiful image may have inspired Hillman’s ‘acorn theory’ (1996,
p. 6). Hillman argued that, ‘each person enters the world called’ (p. 7); adding, ‘we each embody our own idea’ and this idea *chooses us* (ourselves, our bodies, our parents, our circumstances) for its reasons (p. 12). He declared the, ‘daimon is the carrier of your destiny’ (p. 8). Hillman linked this to the myth of Er. As related in Plato’s *Republic*, Er describes how the three Fates named Lachesis, Klotho, and Atropos, who are the daughters of Necessity (Ananke), oversee the selection, by each recently departed soul, of a new life pattern (*paradeigma*), guardian spirit (*daimon*) and destiny. It is recorded that there are many more life patterns than souls. Before returning to life, each person (except Er) is then compelled to drink from the River of Forgetting; and so, when born, cannot remember this process of fate allocation. Each person thus forgets the selected life pattern, although their guardian spirit remembers it. Hillman argued, therefore, that we are born as *tabula rasa* and the unpacking and understanding of the life pattern, ‘takes a lifetime’ (p. 46). He stressed that this is, ‘a theory that backs [emphasis added] the child from its very beginning’, by providing a mythology that links it with something before it is even born (p. 14). The union of one’s parents, he stated, ‘results from your necessity not the other way around’ (p. 64); and this applies also to other circumstances such as genetics, socio-economic class and so on. All these elements are, it is claimed, selected by the soul before birth.

Hillman did something rather radical here and, in order to comment on it further, I need to bring in Jung’s emphasis on the functional and teleological aspects of individuation. In the 1950s, Jung referred to the, ‘great mystery of human life’; and its *causa efficiens et finalis* lying in the unconscious
These consist respectively of the Shadow (drives, inferiorities) and the Anthropos (the pre-existing wholeness or ‘the greater man within’) (p. 128). Elsewhere, he stated that ‘the psyche cannot be conceived merely in causal terms but requires also a final view’ (Jung, 1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 247) adding that the *causa efficiens* relates to the psychoanalytic reduction and the *causa finalis* to the synthesising, purposive and prospective aspects of psyche.

Hillman, in effect, adds a prequel to the *causa efficiens* by rounding it off with a contemporary interpretation of the myth of Er. In his terms, the starting point for the individual is not the parents, genetics, or socio-economic circumstances, but the soul’s choice of pattern of life, guardian spirit, and destiny. He therefore offers a further point-of-view; in addition to what are perhaps more familiar positions focused on structures, drives, genetics and agency. This stance potentially avoids pathologising the individual; although it may serve to neglect the role of structures and other influences.

Von Franz’s perspective on destiny links with Hillman’s, as she also discussed the role of the Goddess of Necessity and the Fates. She linked Ananke, the individual’s soul, and allotted life-span, with the myth of Aion (Marie-Louise von Franz, 1978/1997, p. 66). Von Franz argued that Aion equated to the life-fluid of living beings, ‘and thus their life-span and allotted fate’ (p. 6). Aion could, she suggested, also mean a time of long dominion and eternity (p. 35) and be commensurate with Oceanos, the divine river of time, and Kronos, the god of time (pp. 5-6). This interpretation is supported, to an extent, by Edinger
who also linked Aion with psyche, soul, life, life-span and destiny (1996, pp. 15-17). This meaning of Aion as life-time is significant in terms of more fully understanding life course development and vocation. Von Franz argued that Aion linked the lifetime of an individual with the life of the universe (1978/1997, p. 35). She therefore forged a link between microcosm and macrocosm in relation to the causa finalis. This interpretation of the myth of Aion suggests that our individual purposes and life patterns form part of the wider universe. Seen in this light, Hillman’s interpretation seems to back the child from its very beginning and Franz’s to the very end.

Ascent and descent
Jung also sometimes referred to a nekyia or night sea journey usually involving motifs of descent and ascent from low or dark places. The nekyia refers to visiting the underworld and the city of the dead. In terms of vocation, it is a call to death and the land of ghosts (Jung, 1946/1966, CW16, pp. 245-246). Jung, however, was at pains to stress its transcendent quality (1917/1926/1943/1966, CW7, p. 99). It is a, ‘perilous adventure…whose end and aim is the restoration of life, resurrection, and the triumph over death’ (Jung, 1937/1968, CW12, p. 329). The nekyia is seen as a meaningful encounter with secret knowledge and mythology leading to the restoration and healing of the whole person. Jung also stated that, ‘a person whose roots are above as well as below is thus like a tree growing simultaneously downwards and upwards’ (1945/1954/1967, CW13, p. 264). In addition, he referred to the ‘knowledge of the heart…[which]…is in no book and is not to be found in the mouth of any teacher, but grows out of you like the green seed from the dark
Jung’s observations on the nekyia relate to Hillman’s emphasis on growing down (1996, pp. 41-62). He defined this as living fully in the world, deepening into life and feeling grounded. He discussed allowing oneself to experience loneliness, yearning, or depression. To Hillman, growing down can mean dropping out of a college course, leaving a fast-track job, or being dumped by a lover. It may mean ‘getting down’ through the use of drinks or drugs (p. 43). He contrasted it with the ‘ascensionist model’ (p. 42) and ‘upward push of career’ (p. 43). Here, it is relevant that the image of ‘climbing a ladder’ is one of the most widespread career metaphors. To Hillman, an individual’s particular style of growing down should be considered as interesting as the way he or she rises. He noted that society pathologises its members by failing to recognise or legitimise the importance of growing down.

Summary
An analytical psychological perspective on life course development and vocation has been described. Traditional conceptions within analytical psychology have been critically discussed and a contemporary take offered, particular attention has been paid to the role of: individuation and carrying life; the unconscious; discernment and dreams; destiny; and the nekyia.
Evaluation of A Sense of Vocation

In this section, *A Sense of Vocation* is evaluated in relation to the analytical psychological perspectives discussed above. Its key strengths and weaknesses are discussed and explored. It is argued that Cochran’s focus on four phases of the life course can be enhanced from a Jungian angle. It is further proposed that his focus on agency neglects the role of the unconscious.

Aesthetics and the life course

Cochran translated his criticisms of twentieth century life span development theories into a deliberately synthetic approach that combined notions of plot, drama, and season to paint a fuller picture of the life course. He observed patterns of disillusion arising from multiple stories over many years; and, in doing so, attended to rhythm, repetition, and the passage of time throughout the human life cycle. Cochran also creatively subverted Levinson et al.’s organising metaphor relating to the seasons of life (Levinson et al., 1978, pp. 6-7; Levinson & Levinson, 1996). Cochran used the seasons of the year, not to dictate a structure or chronology, but simply as colours to paint with. His overall phases of life start in winter and end in fall; and the movement within his final phase of completion, starts in fall and ends in summer. This relates to Cochran’s focus on the aesthetic aspects of interpreting the life course. In related vein, Hillman argues that social, experimental, and therapeutic psychologies fail at what they attempt to study because they cannot, ‘find a place for the aesthetic appreciation of a life story’ (Hillman, 1996, p. 35).

Cochran sought to harvest existing ideas and blend these into a new form. He
anticipated a time when, ‘normative developmental theories might evolve into models of wholeness for human beings’ (Cochran, 1990b, p. 194). He does not, however, fully explain what this might involve. He seems to indicate that existing life course theories need not be rejected as failed or disproved hypotheses; rather, their key concepts can be seen as constituting an extended palette of colours with which one can portray and appreciate the life course in ever richer hues. *The Sense of Vocation* is an innovative attempt at this new direction, although with some limitations, as will now be discussed below.

**Work as self-fulfilment**

Cochran took a more nuanced approach to the relationship between vocation and work roles than exists in traditional career theory. Parsons, for example, worried that unless a person found a vocation by linking a line of work with his aptitudes, abilities and enthusiasm ‘he will only be a fraction of the man [sic] he ought to be’ (1909, pp. 3-5). Similarly, Holland argued that the making of vocational choices must involve achieving congruence between personality type and work environments (1997). As can be seen in the extracts above, Cochran took a different view. To him, the work of life cannot be exactly the same thing as occupying a particular job; although the latter *may* serve to further the former. This position is much closer to Hillman’s who also argued that vocation should not be solely identified with holding a specific kind of job. He stated that ‘character is not what you do, it’s *the way* [emphasis added] you do it’ (Hillman, 1996, p. 252). This Cochran/Hillman position is significant because traditional conceptions of vocation are open to the criticism that they
fail adequately to deal with claims concerning the socio-economic distribution of self-fulfilling jobs. One of Cochran’s key contributions, therefore, is to refresh a rather tired and limited conception of vocation. He considerably broadened the scope of careers work from the issue of job choice to ways of living.

*Elitism*

As indicated previously, Cochran declared an interest in researching exemplary cases and argued that vocation represents career at its best. There is a rather elitist and sexist hue to his selection of case studies pitched towards famous American males. Jung is similarly guilty in drawing a distinction between ‘great’ personalities like Goethe, Napoleon, Cromwell, Christ, Socrates, and the lesser ‘midget’ personalities (1934/1954, CW17, p. 176). Hillman, in contrast, is more robustly democratic. He drew on a slightly wider range of case studies that included more women. He saw vocation in terms of equality, and argued, ‘we are equal because each brings a specific calling into the world’ (Hillman, 1996, p. 273) and, ‘there is no mediocrity of soul’ (p. 256). He explicitly divorced vocation from fame, status, earning power, or expertise (p. 255). In this sense, he returns us to the Chicago School view of career.

*Relationship with analytical psychology*

Cochran’s relationship with analytical psychology is rather indirect. He cited Jung on 11 occasions; however, this was done largely to provide examples of the completion life phase. He occasionally used the term individuation but
without further explanation (Cochran, 1990b, pp. 82, 191). Cochran was influenced by Daniel Levinson et al.’s *The Seasons of a Man’s Life* and Northrop Frye’s *Anatomy of Criticism*, both of which were significantly informed by analytical psychology; Cochran did not, however, reference Jung in relation to them. He considered Jung, to an extent, but more as a case study than for conceptual purposes. In this respect, Cochran was over-reliant on *Memories, Dreams, Reflections* and neglected Jung’s wider work on vocation (1934/1954, CW17).

**Life and stages**

As indicated earlier, Cochran’s approach represents a refinement of traditional perspectives. Nonetheless, Cochran’s framework of incompletion, positing, positioning, and completion, and similar approaches in career theory, have the status of master narratives. He acknowledged that the dramas people live out are highly distinctive and varied but argued that each of those stories conforms to the incompletion-completion scheme (Cochran, 1990b, p. 31). In this light, the master narrative status Cochran gives the incompletion-completion cycle is too narrow. As argued previously in this chapter, a Jungian approach to individuation cannot be reduced to a linear structure. Individuation is a meta-narratological strategy; a narrative *without* a predetermined plot. The analytical psychological perspective is more textured and pluralistic. Hillman (1996) stated, for example, that, ‘the call comes in curious ways and differently from person to person. There is no overall pattern, but only the particular pattern in each case’ (p. 19). Sometimes, he suggested, vocation pounces like a tiger or watches like, ‘a French cat on a
windowsill’ (p. 18); or drifts like the gentle currents in a stream as one floats, ‘to a particular spot on the bank’ (p. 3). Whilst there is value in the structure of the incompletion-completion cycle and its constituent elements, individuation is much wider and richer than this. Cochran’s insistence on a unifying single story over many different stories privileges one narrative form over another. The personal myth of individuation may involve a range of forms and genres. Analytical psychology sees individuals as the carriers of life. This suggests that the key issue in career theory is not so much whether one’s career leads to a successful life (or not) but whether one can carry a particular vision, or form of life, to its fullest extent and help others to do the same.

Agency and the unconscious
Cochran’s central intellectual influence related to De Charm’s ideas on agency. The unconscious was mentioned in relation to Cochran’s use of Memories, Dreams, Reflections as a case study to illustrate the ‘completion’ phase (Cochran, 1990b, pp. 157-159); and briefly in relation to the ‘pattern’ of vocation (p. 179). It was not, however, a general feature of his account. In contrast, analytical psychology pays particular attention to the role of the unconscious and questions the role of agency in vocation. Specifically, caution is expressed over the place of cognitive rationality; and a middle path is sought between the extremes of agency and fatalism. Fidelity to a more personal, idiosyncratic law of life is contrasted with blind obedience to established conventions.
Destiny

Cochran did not discuss the role of destiny in detail and only made oblique references to it. At one point, he argued, ‘there is a sense of inevitability to the vocation, as if one is destined for the role adopted’ (Cochran, 1990b, p. 111) Elsewhere, he stated that ‘we begin life uncomposed, not yet persons’ (p. 38). As indicated earlier, Cochran hinted that vocation links the personal and the cosmic (p. 111) but was not able to extend this. In contrast, an analytical psychological perspective on vocation takes this further. Jung stated:

The realization of the self also means a re-establishment of Man as the microcosm i.e., man’s cosmic relatedness. Such realizations are frequently accompanied by synchronistic events. (The prophetic experience of vocation belongs to this category.)

(Jung, 1954/1977, CW18, pp. 695-696)

Here, Jung suggested that the experience of vocation links the individual with the wider universe. It involves a sense of connectedness with all things.

Ascent and descent

Cochran’s phase of incompletion and notion of growing into the experience (1990b, p. 63) connote some aspects of Hillman’s emphasis on growing down. Cochran’s formulation, however, pays insufficient attention to the meaningful and purposeful nature of the nekyia. Analytical psychology, in contrast, adds motifs of ascent as well as descent and anchors the nekyia in archetypal stories and classical myth. In a sense, this latter aspect helps to compensate for contemporary society’s intolerance of this significant experience.
Discernment

Cochran did not discuss discernment in relation to life course development in any detail. As already discussed, it is a key feature in analytical psychology. Discernment relates to the many callings, listening posts, and dreams of the psyche. These cycles of calling, perceiving, and dreaming form a rotational system; what Jung may have called, 'a perpetuum mobile, an everlasting movement in a circle' (Jung, 1936/1968, CW12, pp. 104-105). This helps to build a distinctively Jungian psychodynamic conception of vocation and career. Hillman provided a clue here when he stated that the, 'daimon is the carrier of your destiny' (1996, p. 8). Unwittingly, perhaps, he returns us to career because ‘carry’ and ‘career’ are connected in terms of word history. As has been discussed previously, both terms are derived from carrus meaning wagon or chariot. The wheels of the chariot can be seen as relating to a rotational system of calling, perceiving, and dreaming. Such a wider view of career potentially provides a vessel for ‘the work’ of modern day alchemists. Or, put another way, career provides a contemporary vehicle for individuation.

Implications for research, training and practice

Research in career and life course development can be redesigned to take account of analytical psychological perspectives. Specifically, researchers can engage in reflexivity in relation to over-concretised conceptions of the life course. Jungian psychology provides a corrective to linear stage and phase models.
The training of career helpers can be enhanced by introducing topics such as career dreams and carriers of life. Jung’s emphasis on the dream (‘it teaches’) suggests a place for dreams in career education. In a suitably safe and stimulating environment, career helpers can be assisted to understand their own dreams, and the dreams of others; and translate suitable aspects into rich educational materials. Career helpers can also be invited to compare traditional understandings of career with an analytical psychological view of the individual as the carrier of life. Perhaps using Jung’s statement below as a starting point:

In the last analysis every life is the realization of a whole, that is, of a self, for which reason this realization can also be called “individuation”. All life is bound to individual carriers who realize it, and it is simply inconceivable without them. But every carrier is charged with an individual destiny and destination, and the realization of these alone makes sense of life.

(Jung, 1936/1968, CW12, p. 222)

In addition to the topics suggested above, career education can be redesigned to include an analytical psychological perspective on the life course. Participants can be helped to consider the role of agency and destiny in career. Stories from classical and contemporary culture can be used to explore themes such as the nekyia. For example, in The Golden Ass, a story from the second century AD, there is an account of Psyche’s descent into the underworld in search of a box of divine beauty (Apuleius, 1950, pp. 154-155). Apuleius’ account of Psyche’s transformations can be related to the process
of ascent and descent in the nekyia. It may provide suitable material to help illuminate these ideas in career education contexts.

**Conclusion**

In this chapter, an important genre of career studies has been critically evaluated from the perspective of analytical psychology. It has been argued that theories of life course development in career studies neglect the role of individuation. This argument has been broken down into more detailed aspects, namely: the relationship between life and stages; the individual as the carrier of life; the role of agency and the unconscious; destiny; the nekyia; and discernment. It is proposed that all these elements enrich developmental career theory. Linked to this, suggestions have been made for research, training and practice.
Chapter Eight Postscript: Career Dreams

In one of my own dreams, I’m sitting in a comfortable room with a friendly professor-type figure and talking about dreams. I tell him that dream theory leaves me kind of cold and is a bit of a turn off. I don’t see how I can use it in my work. He shows me these beautiful dream cards. Each card contains a large picture and a small amount of text. Suddenly, I sense a way to communicate about dreams. I excitedly talk to him about how I could design a dream workshop. I’ll need to spend time carefully creating these dream cards. They need to be card not paper. They need to be in colour. It would be good if there was time and space to engage with the dream cards. I’ll use music to create the right tone and mood...

A few months later, I deliver a workshop at the Career Development Institute Annual Conference. The room is packed. I ask the group if anyone has ever had a career-related dream such as a dream about work. They all put their hands up. I then ask them if they ever talk about dreams with their clients. Only one or two put their hands up. We talk about this apparent disconnect and why. I contract with the group about the progress of the session, boundaries, and comfort.

I give them each three dream cards. One at a time, so everyone is engaging with the same dream. They spend 5 or 10 minutes with each card whilst the music plays. Then we talk about the dream and share responses. Following this, I share the dreamer’s associations and the therapist’s interpretations. We discuss these and the session finish with a few slides and a discussion about the place of dreams in our work. There’s a good working atmosphere in the room. A sense of enjoyment and interest. Some of the participants are very intuitive about interpreting the dreams. Much better than I am. Several come up with ideas about how to take this work forward. People seem to want to stay in the room afterwards talking to each other and me about the experience.
Career and learning

Introduction

This chapter focuses on a critical evaluation of career learning theories. It begins by providing an explanation for this selection. Career development theories relating to learning are described in general terms; and a classic example of the genre discussed in more detail: *The Social Learning Theory of Career Decision-Making* (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). A Jungian and post-Jungian perspective on transformational learning is described. This is used as a lens to guide the evaluation including implications for research, training and practice.

*Why is this valuable?*

This chapter has particular relevance in view of the importance of learning in career studies discussed in the initial literature review (Chapter Two). Learning theory is increasingly is seen as central to contemporary career
helping; and analytical psychology has the potential to considerably enrich the field. The principal sources used for this are relevant passages from Jung's writings and the extensive post-Jungian literature on transformational learning (e.g. Boyd, 1991; Boyd & Myers, 1988; Cranton, 2006; Dirkx, 1997; Dobson, 2008; R. A. Jones et al., 2008; Kolb, 1984, 2015; Mayes, 2005, 2017; Mezirow, 1981, 2000, 2009; Semetsky, 2013). Here, I use the term *transformational* quite broadly to encompass all post-Jungian perspectives on learning; and acknowledge that individual authors use their own preferred terminology (transformative learning, archetypal pedagogy, experiential learning etc.). The outcomes are threefold. First, a re-appreciation of Krumboltz's work. Second, a fresh look at learning within analytical psychology. And lastly, a re-imagination of career-related learning theory in the light of the above.

**Overview of career learning theories**

Career learning theories are a significant area of career development theory. This genre of theory is characterised by a central emphasis on processes of learning in career development. These theories broaden understanding of career beyond simple questions of job choice to the processes of learning inherent to all areas of career development (Krumboltz, 1979; Law, 1996; Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). Three such perspectives are now summarised by way of illustration. Krumboltz (1979) took a social learning approach and focused on the role of: environmental conditions; learning experiences; task approach skills; generalisations and actions (discussed in more detail below). Law (1996) saw career learning as a
progressive and developmental process featuring four key phases: sensing; sifting; focusing; and understanding. Lent’s (2013) social cognitive approach emphasised the development of self-efficacy skills and outcome expectations.

Krumboltz has been selected because he has made a major contribution to career studies and his work features in many contemporary collections and textbooks (e.g. D. Brown & Brooks, 1996; Gothard et al., 2001; Sharf, 2013b). Osipow and Fitzgerald refer to his work as, ‘one of the most significant developments in career theory’ (1996, p. 167). The principal reason for selection, in terms of this chapter, is his interest in learning. Krumboltz, together with his collaborators such as Linda Mitchell, attempted to address an historic lacuna in career development theory identified by Super (1990, p. 204) and others; namely, the absence of an adequate learning theory. Through this, they provided a theoretical rationale for career development work as a fundamentally educational enterprise (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, pp. 252-253) and offered one of the most detailed and influential treatments of this topic available within the literature.

**Summary of the Social Learning Theory of Career Decision-Making**

John Krumboltz and his associates have written extensively on the relationship between learning and career development from the 1970s up to and including the present day (e.g. Babineaux & Krumboltz, 2013; Krumboltz, 1979, 1996, 2009; Krumboltz & Levin, 2004; Krumboltz, Mitchell, & Jones, 1976; Krumboltz & Nichols, 1990; K. E. Mitchell et al., 1999; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1990, 1996). Krumboltz’s starting point was a critique of theories
formerly dominant in career studies based on developmental and differential psychology. His work has evolved over this period and several subtle alterations and changes of emphasis have been wrought.

Some of his later work has been primarily intended for a popular audience (Babineaux & Krumboltz, 2013; Krumboltz & Levin, 2004); and, in terms of the more academically-focused material, perhaps the fullest and most detailed statement is contained in a chapter entitled ‘Krumboltz’s Learning Theory of Career Choice and Counselling’ (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). This was divided into two parts: the first focused on explaining career choice and development in terms of social learning; and the second, drawing from this, concentrated on what career development professionals need to do about career-related problems. Consistent with the approach taken throughout this thesis, the focus of this chapter will be on the first part i.e. the Social Learning Theory of Career Decision-Making (hereafter, SLTCDM).

The origins of the SLTCDM can be found in Bandura’s general social learning theory based on reinforcement theory, classical behaviourism, and observational learning. From this, Krumboltz argued that personality and behaviour are best explained through the learning experiences of the individual rather than genetic or intra-psychic processes. He saw individuals not as passive organisms but ‘intelligent, problem-solving beings’; whilst, at the same time, acknowledging innate and developmental processes and environmental conditions (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, p. 234). In brief, Krumboltz argued that four categories of factors influence any individual’s
career decision-making path: genetic endowment and special abilities; environmental conditions and events; learning experiences; and task approach skills. These categories are now explained below.

*Genetic endowment and special abilities*

Genetic factors were defined as, ‘inherited qualities that may affect people’s ability to acquire certain educational preferences and skills’ (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, p. 237). Krumboltz had in mind, for example, ethnicity, gender, physical appearance, and physical disabilities. It was assumed that people are born with greater or lesser ability to profit from environmental learning experiences. He recognised that genetic factors related to cultural practices such as discrimination against women. He argued that special abilities, such as intelligence, artistic talent, or muscular co-ordination, result from the interaction of genetic factors and exposure to selected environmental conditions and events.

*Environmental conditions and events*

Environmental conditions and events related to social, cultural, political and economic forces, as well as natural disasters and the location of natural resources. These were seen, by Krumboltz, as generally outside of an individual’s direct control and included: the number and nature of job and training opportunities; policies and procedures for selecting trainees and workers; financial and social rewards of particular occupations; labour market legislation; availability and demand for natural resources; technological developments; community influences; and the educational system. Chance
events (sometimes referred to as happenstance) were also included here; and these grew more significant in later versions of the theory (Krumboltz, 2009; K. E. Mitchell et al., 1999, p. 116).

*Learning experiences*

Krumboltz argued that, ‘each person has a unique history of learning experiences that results in a chosen career path’ (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, p. 238). People often do not remember the specific nature and sequence of these learning experiences; rather, they remember the resulting generalised conclusions. For example, a person who believes ‘I love to help people’ has probably had a long history of learning experiences leading to this. Krumboltz identified two major types of learning experiences

a) Instrumental learning experiences

Krumboltz stated that instrumental learning experiences occur when an individual is positively reinforced or punished for a behaviour and its associated cognitive skills: for example, studying hard for a history exam and getting an A (or an F) grade. People tend to repeat behaviours that are positively reinforced. The repetition of behaviour may become so intrinsically interesting that positive reinforcement is no longer necessary. It was argued that individuals tend to avoid engaging in behaviours for which they are punished; indeed, they may learn to dislike these behaviours. On this view, people are engaged in instrumental learning experiences when they learn from the consequences of their own behaviour.
b) Associative learning experiences

Associative learning experiences take place when people associate some previously neutral event or stimulus with an affective charge. For example, an individual who, previously had a neutral feeling about hospitals, might associate the hospital setting with the death of a beloved relative and thus become reluctant to consider medicine or nursing as occupations. Equally, an individual may associate hospitals with treatment that saved a close relative’s life and develop a linked occupational interest in medicine or nursing.

Krumboltz also argued that associative learning can take place through indirect or vicarious experiences. For example, individuals can learn new behaviours and skills simply by observing the behaviours of others and gaining new information and ideas through books, movies, and television. He argued that the decisions to exercise such new behaviours and skills depend on the positive or negative environmental reinforcing contingencies in play.

Task approach skills

Krumboltz stated that the interaction of learning experiences, genetic characteristics, special aptitudes, and environmental influences results in individuals developing task approach skills. Such skills include: performance standards; work habits; perceptual and cognitive processes; mental sets; and emotional responses. For example, an individual studying communication studies may develop task approach skills in public speaking. He also believed there are specific task approach skills appropriate to career development activities such as gathering and analysing career information.
As a result of the interaction of the four types of influencing factors: genetic endowment and special abilities; environmental conditions and events; learning experiences; and task approach skills; Krumboltz argued that people form generalisations in an attempt to represent their own reality and take related actions. He referred to people’s beliefs about themselves as self-observed generalisations; and their beliefs about career and work as worldview generalisations. Actions are defined as the *behaviours* that result from these generalisations.

*Self-observation generalisations*

Krumboltz argued that, overtly or covertly, people observe themselves and assess their performance in comparison to their own and others’ standards. These self-observation generalisations result from prior learning experiences and influence the outcome of new ones. As a result of learning experiences, people draw conclusions and make generalisations about three areas: skills, interests, and values. For example, the statement ‘it’s hard for me to concentrate when I study’ is a generalisation about study skills; the statement ‘I like being outdoors’ is a generalisation about interests; and the statement ‘I must select a prestigious occupation’ is a generalisation about work values. Krumboltz posited that statements about skills, interests, and values are very important in career decision making, not because they cause occupational selection as is sometimes implied in trait-factor theory, but because they provide a summary of individuals’ reactions to their previous learning experiences and relate to the sense of self-efficacy.
World-view generalisations

According to Krumboltz, as a result of learning experiences, people also make generalisations about the wider world to explain what is happening and predict the future. For example, people make generalisations about the nature of various occupations: ‘to succeed in show business, you need to know the right people’; and, ‘all lawyers are sharks’. World-view generalisations, like self-observation generalisations, may be more or less accurate. Their value will depend on the range of experiences on which they are based and the nature of the reflection on those experiences.

Actions

Krumboltz argued that, based on their generalisations about self and wider world, people engage in related behaviours. For example, in relation to career development, this can include: making occupational choices; applying for jobs; seeking promotions; and changing jobs.

Summary

To summarise, Krumboltz’s central argument is that the complex interaction of: genetic endowment and special abilities; environmental conditions and events; learning experiences; task approach skills; self-observation and world-view generalisations; and actions; results in a particular career path for each individual (Figure 3).
Analytical psychology and learning

The principal sources used for this section are the extensive post-Jungian literature on transformational learning (e.g. Boyd, 1991; Boyd & Myers, 1988; Cranton, 2006; Dirkx, 1997; Dobson, 2008; R. A. Jones et al., 2008; Kolb, 1984, 2015; Mayes, 2017; Mezirow, 1981, 2000, 2009; Semetsky, 2013). Since this long section focuses on post-Jungian transformative and experiential learning theories, additional perspectives, including Jung’s, are not summarised here; and are, instead, threaded through the evaluation (Finger & Asun, 2001; Fordham, 1995; Jung, 1926/1946/1954, CW17).

Transformative learning

Transformative learning, and associated key concepts such as disorienting dilemmas, habits of mind, and frames of reference, are particularly associated with the pioneering work of Jack Mezirow (1981). Many Jungian influenced learning theorists in the field of transformative learning have taken a critical, yet appreciative, approach to Mezirow’s work and sought to reduce or refocus what they see as an excessive emphasis on rationality.
Boyd and Myers (1988, p. 263) emphasised, in addition to the rational ego, the role played in learning by archetypal images, the shadow, syzygy, persona, and the collective unconscious. Boyd and Kondrat (1991) discussed the role of the anima and animus in learning. They argued that anima and animus are present in the psyche of both men and women i.e. that these are not gender specific terms. They also emphasised the dual quality of the anima/us i.e. contrasting negative and positive poles. Anima development entails: an elementary aspect that leads from giving versus depriving, to integration versus disintegration; and, a transformative aspect that leads from accepting versus rejecting, to wisdom versus inanity. Similarly, there is an elementary aspect to animus development that leads from energising versus enervating, to uniting versus fractionalising; and a transformative aspect that leads from exploring versus restraining, to guiding versus misleading others.

Boyd and Myers (1988, p. 274) emphasised the role of discernment in learning; and contrasted this with Mezirow’s preference for critical reflectivity. They defined discernment in relation to receptivity, recognition, and grieving. The latter, grief work, was identified as the central dynamic of discernment and defined as a, ‘psycho-spiritual adjustment to loss’ (p. 276) [that enables] ‘people to arrive at synthetic judgements concerning what they are to let go of and surrender to the past and what they are to hold on to and bring forward into their future’ (p. 279). They claimed this can lead to new ways of interpreting and appreciating oneself. Boyd and Myers referred to the feeling of ‘being carried’ and ‘swept along’ by some ‘inner mandate’ (p. 280). For
them, *to learn is to become bereaved* (p. 283). Scott (1997) also attended to the role of grieving in learning. This was not purely in relation to the death of friends or relations; ‘grieving is also an existential phenomenon that occurs any time a person’s meaning perspectives…are challenged’ (p. 46). Grieving therefore allows the learner to discern between the essential and the trivial. Here, learning is about *saying goodbye*. It is concerned with working out what to keep and what to let go.

Cranton (2006) critically engaged with transformative learning theories (e.g. Boyd & Myers, 1988; Mezirow, 1981). She argued their ideas should be re-interpreted through the lens of Jungian typology. She proposed that individuals are likely to take different approaches to revising habits of mind depending on typological preferences; and that reactions to disorienting events will also be different for the same reason. She further argued that individuals take contrasting approaches to critical reflection and participation in discourse. In addition, Cranton proposed that individuals take different, typologically-inflected approaches to extrarational ways of knowing; for example, individuals who have a preference for extraverted or introverted intuition, are more likely to experience transformative learning extrarationally. She also argued that relational transformative learning is more likely to be experienced by individuals with extraverted feeling preferences. Such people, she suggested, experience transformation through trying to more fully understand those they disagree with i.e. entering into another individual’s frame of mind with empathy. This, she claimed, contrasted with Mezirow’s notion of critical questioning.
Linked to the above, Cranton argued for a connected and relational dimension to transformative learning (2006, p. 43). She posited an extrarational dimension to complement what she saw as Mezirow’s focus on critical rationality. The extrarational was defined as entailing imagination, intuition, spirituality, soul work, and emotion. Dirkx agreed that some approaches to learning focused excessively on critical reflection, reason, and rationality (2000, pp. 3-4). He focused on differentiating the multiple selves and voices that make up identity. His emphasis was on images rather than concepts; and he defined this as a mytho-poetic view of transformative learning. He focused, more specifically than Boyd, on imagination, spirituality, fantasy, imagination, and soul-work. He emphasised the role of emotion, myth, image, symbols, and contemplation in learning (Dirkx, 1997, pp. 80-83). Dirkx defined learning ‘as a process that takes place within the dynamic and paradoxical relationship of self and other’ (p. 83). The other, it was argued, sometimes serves as a, ‘repository for rejected parts of ourselves’; and ‘learning through soul involves understanding the value of our rejected parts’ (p. 85). Jones sounded a slightly cautionary note in relation to this (2013, p. 14). She highlighted the coercive dimension of some approaches to depth psychological education (p. 16). She also cautioned against uncritical ‘soul-speak’ in transformative education which, she argued, risks becoming, ‘entrenched in the myth of a mythos-versus-logos dichotomy’ (p. 18).

**Individuation and learning**

Many of these ideas come together in Saul’s (1991) discussion of
individuation in learning situations. She argued that a person’s daily learning experiences can be understood as observable events in the process of individuation. She stated that individuation is a non-linear process entailing: progress and regress; flux and stagnation; death and re-birth. It is a spiralling through certain problems and motifs within a person’s life experience that gradually offers repeated opportunities to deal with issues at different levels of meaning and significance. She argued that individuals can form a meaningful bond between aspects of their prior experience and cultural material. For example, she discussed a woman bonding with the Artemis myth because, through it, she found alternative versions of femininity not necessarily involving child-bearing.

Experiential learning

As discussed in Chapter Two, Kolb drew from Jung’s ideas in developing a theory of experiential and transformational learning (1984, 2015). Kolb argued, ‘it is Jung’s theory…..with its concept of psychological types representing different modes of adapting to the world, and his developmental theory of individuation that will be most useful for understanding learning from experience’ (1984, p. 16). He argued that experiential learning is a, ‘holistic concept much akin to the Jungian theory of psychological types’ (p. 31). He further argued that learning takes place by a process of extension and intention which is best described by the concepts of extraversion and introversion (Kolb, 1984, p. 52). Within his overall experiential learning cycle, he linked active experimentation (transformation via extension) to extraversion; and reflective observation (transformation via intention) to
introversion. Kolb’s interest was less on extraversion and introversion as personal characteristics than on their epistemological significance in resolving the tension between nominalism and realism. He quoted from *Psychological Types* to argue that the dynamic integration of the introverted and extraverted attitudes results in the living, psychic reality of fantasy and imagination; where sense impression and idea formation take place. It is where the apparently irreconcilable claims of objectivism and subjectivism are resolved. For Kolb, his main focus was on the processes of introversion and extraversion. He therefore neglected the respective roles of the thinking, feeling, sensing, and intuitive functions. His commitment to a typological understanding of epistemology was, consequently, somewhat half-hearted. Jung, on the other hand, was quite clear that psychic reality is holistic and integrative as is indicated by the quotation below.

The psyche creates reality every day. The only expression I can use for this activity is fantasy. Fantasy is just as much feeling as thinking: as much intuition as sensation. There is no psychic function that, through fantasy, is not inextricably bound up with the other psychic functions. Sometimes it appears in primordial form, sometimes it is the ultimate and boldest product of all our faculties combined. Fantasy, therefore, seems to me the clearest expression of the specific activity of the psyche. It is, pre-eminently, the creative activity from which the answers to all answerable questions come: it is the mother of all possibilities, where, like all psychological opposites, the inner and outer worlds are joined together in living union.

(Jung, 1921/1971, CW6, p. 52)

Jung’s imaginal and mythic sense of epistemology involved all the functions in their respective extraverted and introverted modes. In addition, Kolb defined
concrete experience as grasping experience via apprehension i.e. feelings and sensations. He also defined abstract conceptualisation as grasping experience via comprehension i.e. concepts and symbols (Kolb, 1984, p. 41). This overlooked Jung’s insistence that both thinking and feeling are rational functions. Thus, the respective roles of feeling in evaluating, judging and appraising; and of thinking in moment-to-moment experience were neglected. Kolb also omitted the concrete and abstract dimensions of the function attitudes (discussed further in Chapter Five).

Summary
A range of post-Jungian perspectives on learning theory have been described. Particular attention has been paid to transformative and experiential learning theories as both are informed by analytical psychology although in quite different ways.

The strengths and weaknesses of Krumboltz’s social learning theory are now considered from an analytical psychological angle. The following strengths are discussed: lifelong learning; non-institutional learning; and adaptation. A range of weaknesses are then explored including: reception of depth psychology; typology; cognitive learning; observational learning; symbols; epistemology; scientific paradigm; and political change.
Lifelong learning

For Krumboltz, the social learning process was seen as lifelong and therefore not age-linked. He stated that learning takes place throughout life and this formed part of his critique of stage-based developmental theories (Krumboltz, 2009, pp. 138-139; Krumboltz et al., 1976, pp. 73-75; Krumboltz & Nichols, 1990, pp. 166-168). Whilst Jung might, in general terms, have agreed with this, he saw learning in the first and second half of life in quite different terms. As discussed in Chapter Eight, he contrasted sharply the first half of life focused on nature (work, earning money, child care) and the second focused on culture (meaning, purpose, endings). Jung argued that the main problem for children was one of adaptation to their surroundings; and the knowledge derived from analytical psychology was, ‘definitely for adults, not for children’ (1928/1954, CW17, p. 51). To a certain extent, this division has been carried over into the post-Jungian literature on learning. Boyd and Myers argued that the first half of life was focused on differentiation and looking outwards; and transformation was of secondary importance to finding a place in society (1988, pp. 265-267). They saw the second half as focused on integration and looking inward; where transformation assumed prime importance. Dobson explicitly agreed with Boyd and Myers on this issue (2008, pp. 21-22). From a slightly different angle, Cranton also argued that adult learning differed from child learning because it was voluntary, self-directed, and focused on the self-concept and meaning-making (2006, pp. 6-18).

---

21 As was noted in Chapter Eight, there are contradictory currents in Jung’s writings on this topic.
There are clearly a number of problems with this position; and perhaps the most significant is that it oversimplifies by neglecting young people’s needs for meaning and purpose, and older people’s needs for money, role and relationship building\textsuperscript{22}. It also relegates many career-related topics to the category of nature and neglects the extent to which those and other topics are relevant to culture. It results in a rather thin, instrumentalised conception of learning in the first half of life; and a disembodied, idealised vision of learning in the second. Krumboltz, therefore, indirectly draws attention to a recurrent flaw in Jungian conceptions of learning and education; and indeed, adult education more generally. Transformational career learning can take place throughout life.

\textit{Non-institutional learning}

Krumboltz argued that learning takes place all the time and in all places (2009, pp. 135-140). He disagreed with the assumption that learning takes place only in educational institutions. He stated that learning is always happening in countless minute-to-minute encounters and split-second decisions. He was also sceptical about the type of learning that is believed to take place in formal education. Too often, he suggested, this is where people learn to feel inadequate, see failure as humiliating, despise teachers, and hate books (Krumboltz, 2009, p. 140).

Jung, too, was sceptical of institutions. He avoided equating religion with organised religion; and, in similar terms, did not assume that learning takes

\footnote{\textsuperscript{22} Moraglia (1994, pp. 69-70) argued that concern for occupational achievement, family life, the human condition, and the meaning of life, may co-exist and not necessarily be age-linked.}
exclusively place in schools. He argued that the education of children should follow, ‘the natural path of development and eschew dead prescriptions’ (Jung, 1910/1946/1954, CW17, p. 33). He saw individuation as a wild process in the sense that it can happen outside of formal institutional structures and interventions. He stated that analytical psychology, in contrast to experimental psychology, ‘is far more concerned with the total manifestation of the psyche as a natural phenomenon’ (Jung, 1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 92).

Jung argued that, ‘each one of us is, for better or worse, the educator of his fellow man [sic]. For so morally bound up with another are we human beings that a leader leads the led, and the led mislead the leader’ (1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 80). This illustrates neatly his understanding of the non-institutional nature of learning; and the ways in which he saw individuals simultaneously as teachers and learners. Linked to this, Semetsky and Ramey have argued that Jung defined individuation as self-education; a process through which conscious and unconscious life experiences are progressively and completely integrated (2013, p. 63). This emphasis on the non-institutional aspects of learning can be linked with radical perspectives on education. For example, Finger and Asun posited there must be a deinstitutionalising aspect to learning to avoid its co-option by forces such as transnational capitalism (2001, pp. 171-180). To be clear, I am not arguing that Krumboltz, or even Jung, were radicals as will be obvious in the section below; however, their institutional scepticism provides a clue as to a way forward. These aspects will be discussed in more detail in a later section on political change.
Adaptation

Whilst there are interactionist dimensions of Krumboltz’s work, there is nonetheless an emphasis on adaption in the SLTCDM. The processes of instrumental learning and modelling, for example, are largely adaptive. To an extent, this was also valued by Jung; indeed, he saw adaptation as one of the goals of analytical work. He defined the outcomes of analytical psychology as confession, explanation, education, and transformation (Jung, 1929/1966, CW16, p. 55). Here, Jung defined education quite narrowly to mean adaptation. Citing Adler, he emphasised the social and adaptive role of education in making, ‘the crooked plant grow straight [by training it] upon the trellis of the norm’ to achieve ‘normal adaptation’ (p. 68). Jung argued that what he termed collective education (i.e. conformity with collective norms and established rules, principles, and methods) was sufficient and necessary for most people. There is an undeniably elitist and conservative hue to this. It is, however, based on the idea that a rich sense of how society works is necessary to transform it; and that individuals in any society, no matter how ideal, would still benefit from learning to adapt. Jung also saw adaptation in relation to the wider goal of individuation (as discussed in Chapter Six).

Reception of depth psychology

There are relatively few references to depth psychology, or the unconscious, in Krumboltz’s writings. In this respect, it is necessary to look slightly outside his work. Bandura, the key intellectual influence on Krumboltz, was dismissive of psychodynamic theories arguing they were conceptually inadequate and empirically limited. He likened them to believing in the existence of phlogiston
and the action of humours. Indeed, these points provide a conceptual starting point for his overall social learning theory (Bandura, 1971, pp. 1-2). Krumboltz appeared to follow this line of thinking as his focus remained very much on the conscious aspects of learning rather than the unconscious (Krumboltz, 2009, p. 137). When he did refer to the 'non-conscious', he tended to use Bandura's terminology such as, ‘habitual regulatory thought processes’ (Krumboltz & Nichols, 1990, p. 181). It is also relevant that Waldemar Unruh, in a supporting chapter on the theoretical basis of SLTCDM, criticised psychoanalytic theories for their selectivity and neglect of environmental factors (1979, pp. 10-11). An argument that Krumboltz subsequently revisited and affirmed (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1990, p. 147). In a sense, Krumboltz’s work is one of the many reasons depth psychology has made little headway in career studies. He rarely discussed it, and when he did, it was in rather critical terms; and in relation to psychoanalysis rather than analytical psychology. This is consistent with a broader trend in the literature identified in Chapter Two.

**Typology**

Krumboltz acknowledged personality differences but paid little attention to this in his social learning theory; possibly, because he was trying to carve out a separate position from trait-factor approaches. Cranton, in contrast and discussed above, has stressed the role of psychological type in transformative learning (2006, p. 80). She emphasised the importance of considering all eight functions, in relation to each individual, in order to avoid focusing purely on the two dominant and auxiliary functions. Here, she avoided some of the
oversimplification inherent in the widely popular learning styles and MBTI-based approaches. Her critique can also be applied to Krumboltz’s SLTCDM. Learning experiences, for example, are likely to be encountered differently depending on typology. Individuals with a preference for extraverted sensing are less likely to make generalisations than those with extraverted thinking. Individuals with a preference for introverted feeling are less likely to learn from the actions or values of others in comparison to those with extraverted feeling. Cranton would also argue that the typological preferences of Krumboltz himself, as the author of the SLTCDM, should be considered. For example, his emphasis on cognitive restructuring might suggest an introverted thinking preference (Babineaux & Krumboltz, 2013, p. 177; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, pp. 242-245). Taking this a critical step further, it may be that this results in a typological skewing of SLTCDM by neglecting the remaining seven function attitudes.

*Cognitive dimensions of learning*

As indicated above, there is a strongly cognitive focus to the SLTCDM. Whilst Krumboltz acknowledged the role of emotion, there is a distinctively cognitive aspect to task approach skills and generalisations (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, pp. 242-245). He also recommended a wide array of cognitive strategies and behavioural techniques (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, pp. 259-262; Sharf, 2013b, p. 374). The former included cognitive restructuring, reframing, and countering troublesome beliefs. The latter included role modelling, role-playing, desensitisation, and paradoxical intention. Krumboltz’s conception of the self that engages in this cognitive processing appears to be
rather one-dimensional and egoic. There are many approaches in the
transformational learning literature discussed earlier that provide a contrast to
Krumboltz; and these relate to: irrational and non-egoic learning; the role of
discernment and grieving; and relational and mytho-poetic aspects. Viewed in
this light, there are a number of weaknesses in Krumboltz’s SLTCDM. First,
the conception of self is rather narrow and fails to take into account its
intrapersonal and structural properties. Second, his focus on the cognitive
neglects the role of discernment and grieving in learning. And lastly, there is
also neglect of image, imagination and the role of ‘the other’. These aspects
are discussed in more detail in the section below.

Learning as observation and transformational learning
Krumboltz stated that associative learning experiences occur when people
associate an event or stimulus with an affective charge. A related aspect is
that associative learning can take place through indirect or vicarious
experiences i.e. observation. He believed, for example, that individuals can
learn new behaviours and skills simply by observing people, books, movies, or
television programmes. To an extent, Krumboltz’s discussion of observational
learning and affective charge can be linked with ideas on learning from
analytical psychology. In identifying transformation as the goal of analytical
psychology, Jung defined it as ‘self-education’ (1929/1966, CW16, p. 73). This
entails a reciprocal mixing of at least two psyches (for example, doctor and
patient, teacher and student, parent and child, reader and author). Here, S.
Main’s adaptation of an alchemical diagram used by Jung (Figure 4) is helpful
in appreciating the unconscious interactions that take place in learning (2013, pp. 76-77).

![Diagram showing the mixing of conscious and unconscious psyches](image)

There is always a mixing of conscious and unconscious psyches taking place in learning, even between reader and text. Jung proposed that people learn from the lives of those immediately around them such as parents, teachers, friends, colleagues, and more distant others represented in books or other media. In addition to immediate family, he also detected an historical aspect to each individual life (discussed in Chapter Three). These ideas link with Saul’s (1991) conceptualisation of individuation in learning situations introduced earlier. Her argument is that individuals can form a meaningful bond between aspects of their prior experience and cultural material. To Krumboltz, this would, no doubt, be seen as an example of observational learning; however, there is more to it than that. The bond, as Saul presented it, suggests immersion in the material. There is a meaningful connection and investment made. In related vein, Jung wrote of reading Meister Eckhart and feeling ‘the breath of life’ (1961/1995, p. 87). In this example (and in the case of the woman and the Artemis myth discussed by Saul) a transformation of identity is implied. It is also, in a sense, a dialogue with the dead. By bonding with such material, the individual changes, becomes something other. This is indeed learning by observation in Krumboltz’s sense; however, the term
transformational learning captures this more fully and vividly than indirect or vicarious learning. It evokes a deeper appreciation of the unconscious dynamics, identity development, and grief work involved. It is something more akin to Fordham’s description of the deintegration and reintegration process; a reaching out and unfolding, followed by a taking back in and incorporating (1995, pp. 3-78).

Personal myth, learning and the golden threads
In similar vein, there is a further highly significant aspect to discuss related to transformational learning and the personal myth (this latter topic was introduced in Chapter Seven). Jung suggested, in 1944, that he felt disconnected; and as though he were a, ‘historical fragment, an excerpt for which the preceding and succeeding text was missing’ (1961/1995, p. 322). He needed to find out, ‘what historical nexus or my life fitted into…what had been before me, why I had come into being, and where my life was flowing’. In relation to this, he dreamt of a figure framed by a golden chain (p. 322). Towards the end of his life, in an echo of his earlier use of the term life-line, he referred to seeing, ‘the line which leads through my life into the world, and out of the world again’ (1961/1995, p. 352). He is also reported to have experienced a final dream featuring ‘golden threads’ encircling the world (M-L. von Franz, 1972/1998, p. 287). This can be linked with Stein’s (2004, p. 221) moving evocation of the connecting ‘threads in a great fabric’; and Giegerich’s (2008, pp. 77-78) discussion of the personal myth as a golden chain connecting individual lives of all ages. This suggests to me that the personal myth, for Jung and potentially for everyone, entails learning about our deep
historical connections with others and the wider world. It is woven from the golden threads that connect, and re-connect, the individual with culture. A social learning theory that encompassed these elements would become a more explicitly cultural career learning theory.

*Symbols*

In distinguishing their approaches from classical behaviourism, both Krumboltz and Bandura acknowledged that learning involved the use and manipulation of symbols and images. This is linked with their view that learning takes place through observation as well as direct experience. Unruh argued that, ‘concepts and expectations are formed through the symbolic representation of such activities and this coded covert behaviour becomes the guide for overt action’ (1979, p. 16). This connects, up to a point, with the role played by the symbol in Jungian and post-Jungian learning. As discussed earlier, Dirkx argued for the role of image, symbol, imagination, and fantasy in his mytho-poetic view of transformative learning (1997, pp. 80-83; 2000, pp. 2-4). Jung saw the symbol as transformative (Jung, 1956, CW5, p. 232) because it conveyed the unknown by way of the known. His ideas on enantiodromnia are also relevant here; the living symbol is always in the process of becoming something else. Jung associated the mandala symbol with a quotation from Faust; ‘Formation, transformation, eternal mind’s eternal recreation’ (1961/1995, p. 221). He equated this with, ‘the wholeness of the personality’ (p. 221); and stated the goal of individuation and, ‘psychic development is the self’, defined as ‘the centre’ and ‘exponent of all paths’ (p. 222). To Jung, dream symbols, in particular, were alive and transforming. So
a steamroller making a labyrinthine road turns into the dreamer’s own feet making a spiral foot path (Jung, 1984, pp. 97-102). A major road turns into a minor country road not even indicated on special maps (p. 302). An individual stripe becomes a huge river permeated with liquid light (p. 432). A heroic charioteer is murdered on a narrow mountain path (Jung, 1961/1995, p. 204). The dreamer’s path in a dark wood peters out and becomes a circular pool containing a pearlescent radiolarian (p. 105).

For Jung, a symbol could not be directly inserted by an individual, or by someone else, it arose as a spontaneous psychic product of immersion in a culture (1921/1971, CW6, pp. 475-476). There is therefore a cultural-historic aspect to the symbol, referred to above as the known element. To illustrate, behind the examples given above, lurk two of the oldest images of career: the pathway and the vehicle. This suggests that people’s dreams may be populated by images of career, and that these images, as they transform, may indicate lines of development. Indeed, this may be a hint of individuation in career development. Individuation is what happens when the psyche transforms images of career.

Epistemology

Krumboltz’s saw learning as taking place when individuals develop generalised conclusions and beliefs in response to instrumental and associative learning experiences. He tended, however, to conceptualise self and world-view generalisations in rather simplistic terms. For example, a self-observation generalisation might extend to, ‘I’m good in math but lousy in
English’; and a world-view generalisation to, ‘counseling is a suitable occupation only for those who are naturally warm and intuitive about others’ (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, pp. 243-244). He also stated that these generalisations may be more or less accurate. This highlights two problems with his approach from the perspective of analytical psychology. The first is that the scope of the generalisations is far too narrow. Jung saw the personal myth on a much bigger scale. A personal myth extends to a whole philosophy of life and religious point of view (this is discussed in more detail in Chapter Seven).

The second problem is that the personal myth is not susceptible to accuracy testing in the way that Krumboltz believed. Here, Krumboltz’s implicit objectivism comes to the surface. Kolb’s discussion of typology, epistemology, and learning is relevant to this problem. As discussed earlier, he drew from Jung’s ideas in developing a theory of experiential learning. His argument about the psyche resolving objectivism and subjectivism begins to offer a solution to the objectivism of Krumboltz. Kolb’s approach has some advantages but still neglects Jung’s wider understanding of typology. The latter’s epistemology involved all the functions in their respective extraverted and introverted modes. In summary, Krumboltz’s epistemological stance is thinly theorised and largely implicit. It is proposed that Jung’s approach provides a more robust basis for a transformational approach to career development learning.
As indicated above, Krumboltz’s SLTCDM appears to be based on the scientific paradigm. Individuals are seen as continually carrying out scientific experiments via learning experiences, developing self and world view generalisations, testing them, refining them, and then engaging in new experiments. In a radical critique of learning theory, Finger and Asun argued that education has been, ‘modelled on the scientific experiment: scientists have an idea (theory), carry out an experiment in reality, receive a feedback and consequently modify their idea model or theory’ (2001, p. 35). Here, they had in mind the tradition of American pragmatic education including John Dewey, Eduard Lindeman, Kurt Lewin, David Kolb, Chris Argyris, Donald Schon, Peter Jarvis, and Jack Mezirow.

Jung was familiar with the scientific method and its advantages but did not seek to elevate it to an overarching theory. It is here that his focus on enantiodromnia is relevant. Sooner or later, he felt, whatever the advantages of the scientific model, it will undo itself. Jung proposed a quite radical and interesting alternative. He argued that ideas have scientists; that life is an experiment and we are the data. Or put another way, that each of us is a new life form, a distinct variation on life. In a sense, what is distinctive about us is the particular form of life each of us represents (see Chapter Eight). In analytical psychology, the challenge is not greater objective accuracy; rather, a kind of faithfulness or loyalty, ‘to the law of one’s own being’ (1934/1954, CW17, p. 173).
The scientific method aims at ever greater clarity and truth in its generation and refinement of hypotheses. One of the effects of individuation, however, is not so much consciousness raising but consciousness lowering. For example, von Franz (1986, pp. 73-85), discussed lowering the floor or threshold of consciousness to the middle realm. The price of connecting with, and integrating unconscious contents, is a dimming of the bright light of consciousness. It is this that enables the operation of active imagination and the transcendent function. Turning to typology again, von Franz stated that, ‘the world is, as it were, rediscovered [emphasis added] through the inferior function’ (p. 15). The consequence for lifelong learning is profound. Self-education means nothing less than relearning the world. This realisation is illustrated by the unnamed anti-hero at the conclusion of Jay McInerney’s novel Bright Lights, Big City.

You get down on your knees and tear open the bag. The smell of warm dough envelops you. The first bite sticks in your throat and you almost gag. You will have to go slowly. You will have to learn everything all over again.

(McInerney, 1984, p. 182)

The implication here is that learning does not simply accumulate like building blocks; rather, that everything learnt must be consistently re-evaluated and re-appraised. In these terms, lifelong career learning entails a continuous creative and critical interrogation of experience.
Political change

Krumboltz acknowledged, to an extent, a relationship between politics and learning. He listed political forces as one of the environmental conditions that affected career development (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, p. 238). He argued that social justice was unequally distributed across the globe and saw a role for psychologists in overcoming this in work with clients and educational institutions (Krumboltz, 2009, pp. 140-141). The political dimension to learning was, however, somewhat weakly theorised. He listed such things as: political forces; the number and nature of job, education and training opportunities; social policies; and employment pay and conditions; as phenomena that were generally outside of people’s control (L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996, p. 238). There was also a disconnect between, on the one hand, his espousal of social justice concerns; and, on the other, the social learning theory of career development and the practices of individuals. It was not made clear how these three areas linked up.

Mayes, in contrast, referred to political change occurring via ‘the sharpened spade of the individuated psyche [emphasis added]’ (2005, p. 88). In these terms, individuation is the cutting edge of social transformation. It leads to fuller relationships between individuals and the development of civic society. It is world-making i.e. constitutive of human history. Jung argued that dream analysis, ‘is an eminently educational activity, whose basic principles and conclusions would be of the greatest assistance in curing the evils of our time’ (1926/1946/1954, CW17, p. 104). Here, he saw the wider societal consequences of passive projection and introjection i.e. cycles of blame and
self-blame. It is clear that he saw transformation as self-education thus widening the scope of analytical psychology from treating the sick to treating the healthy; and healing the individual patient to healing the whole civilisation (Jung, 1929/1966, CW16, p. 75). This insight entails a radical revisioning of Krumboltz’s learning theory. It requires seeing environmental conditions and organisations as being transformed by learning experiences.

In brief, there are four ways in which transformational learning and political change come together. First, individuation entails disenchantment, the withdrawal of projections, and naming of introjections (see Chapter Three). Second, it involves typological development and overcoming the ruling powers of the psyche. Third, it includes archetypal learning and engaging with points of reference outside of contemporary norms and viewpoints. Lastly, it is non-institutional: enabling scepticism of the prevailing institutional order.

**Implications for research, training and practice**

Transformational learning considerably broadens the scope and depth of career learning theory. This enables researchers of career and learning to engage with much wider aspects of human experience than envisaged in the standard social learning and cognitive accounts currently dominant in career studies (Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996). It is proposed that researchers in the field of career studies need to engage in a significant renovation of existing learning theory; and that a new cultural career learning theory drawing from analytical psychology, in the ways set out above, would provide a satisfactory way forward.
The training of career helpers can be redesigned to enable supportive engagement in transformational learning. As indicated earlier, Saul (1991) suggested this could involve forging a meaningful connection with cultural material. This is perhaps suggested by the passage below from Alan Bennett’s play *The History Boys*.

The best moments in reading are when you come across something – a thought, a feeling, a way of looking at things – which you had thought special and peculiar to you. Now here it is, set down by someone else, a person you have never met, someone even who is long since dead. And it is as if a hand has come out and taken yours.

(Bennett, 2004, p. 56)

Bennett’s evocation of a significant moment in reading could be used in professional training to aid in understanding this important aspect of transformational learning.

As discussed, transformational learning can help the learner to discern between the essential and the trivial (Scott, 1997). Such learning is about saying goodbye. It is concerned with working out what to keep and what to let go. In career terms, this can be related to the experience of the central character in Sheenagh Pugh’s poem *The Bereavement of the Lion-keeper*.

...who knew how it felt to plunge fingers into rough glowing fur, who has heard the deepest purr in the world.... but who knows no way to let go of love, to walk out of sunlight,
to be an old man in a city
without a lion.
(Pugh, 2005, p. 26)

Pugh’s poem, with its moving evocation of a zookeeper caring for a dying lion, may provide material for the exploration of grief and work in a career education context.

Conclusion
In this chapter, Krumboltz’s social learning theory has been critically evaluated using key concepts from analytical psychology. The strengths of his approach have been discussed. These include his emphasis on lifelong and non-institutional learning; and the significance of adaptation. The weaknesses of Krumboltz’s perspective have also been considered. These relate to: the reception of depth psychology; typology; cognitive learning; observational learning; symbols; epistemology; the scientific paradigm; and political change. It has been argued that Krumboltz’s work is quite typical in its neglect of depth psychology in career studies and consequently these aspects have been considered in some detail.

A central theme within this critique has been typology. This has been discussed in relation to: key concepts within the SLTCDM; epistemology; the scientific paradigm; and political change. The importance of non-egoic learning has also been highlighted drawing from Jung’s structural model of the psyche. The role of discernment and grieving in learning has further been identified as a particular feature of the transformational learning literature.
Learning by observation has also been contrasted with learning by transformation. It has been argued that unconscious dynamics, grieving, and identity development are particular features of the latter. Such learning is also a dialogue with history, culture, and personal myth. In addition, the importance of the symbol has been argued. This has implications both for career theory and individual lives. The transformation of career images entails new ways of looking at the archetypal symbols of career: pathways, vehicles, ladders, and stages. Career is not reducible to any one of these images; indeed, their dissolution and reformation lies at the heart of individuation. An exclusive emphasis on consciousness raising has also been questioned as a learning goal and consciousness lowering offered as an alternative method of relearning the world. This relearning has been explicitly extended to institutional transformation.

A further feature of this chapter has been a strategic focus on the transformational learning literature. A distillation of varied perspectives has been achieved particularly drawing from experiential (Kolb, 1984, 2015) and transformative learning (Boyd & Myers, 1988; Dirkx, 1997). These traditions rarely cross reference each other in relation to their shared Jungian heritage. The literature has also been handled critically. This has delivered on the stated objective of taking a fresh look at transformational learning.
Chapter Nine Postscript: the Workers in the Cathedral

I’ve always found Raymond Carver’s short story Cathedral very moving. From an analytical psychology angle, it seems to be about a work-related experience of transformational learning linked to the archetypal figure of the blind seer.

The story is narrated from the perspective of a slightly depressed husband. The husband is grumpy about meeting for dinner a recently bereaved man who is also blind. The man is an old friend of his wife and the initial conversation is stilted and desultory. Following food, drinks and a few smokes, the wife falls asleep and there is not much to talk about, so they turn on the TV. Turns out it’s a programme about cathedrals. The two men talk about the hundreds of workers who worked together over many generations to build them and who never lived to see the completion of their life’s work. They reflect on this silently in relation to their own lives. The blind man asks the husband to draw him a cathedral. The story ends with the husband drawing, his eyes closed, and the blind man’s hand resting on his drawing hand.

So we kept on with it. His fingers rode my fingers as my hand went over the paper.

It was like nothing else in my life up to now.

Then he said, ‘I think that’s it. I think you got it,’ he said. ‘Take a look. What do you think?’

But I had my eyes closed. I thought I’d keep them that way for a little longer. I thought it was something I ought to do.

‘Well?’ he said. ‘Are you looking?’

My eyes were closed. I was in my house. I knew that. But I didn’t feel I was inside anything.

‘It’s really something,’ I said.

(Carver, 1983/2003, p. 214)
Conclusion

Introduction

In Chapters One and Two, it was argued that analytical psychology features relatively rarely within career development theories and in limited ways. There is often an over-reliance on certain texts such as *Psychological Types* and *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*. Even where these texts are used, there is a somewhat restricted view of their value and a focus on tests and tools such as personality and learning styles questionnaires. Wider aspects of Jung’s work on individuation tend to be neglected. Lastly, many contributions focus on one-to-one career counselling and envisage a limited or non-existent role for career education. The potential of analytical psychology in relation to career education has therefore been significantly underexploited.

Chapters Three to Nine focused on seven principal areas of career development theory: systems; personality; types; strategies; narrative; life course development; and learning. Key themes from analytical psychology were progressively discussed in relation to these, namely: projection; persona; typology; archetypal images; personal myth; vocation; and transformational
learning. It has been argued that the outcome is the development of a more critical and creative career studies. In this chapter, and drawing from this, nine interconnected propositions are made concerning a post-Jungian approach to career development theory and practice.

**Proposition one: projection plays a significant role in career development.**

Accounts of projection do not feature strongly in classic and contemporary theories of career systems. Some career scholars refer to introjection and identification but this is limited in scope. Projection theory offers a richer and more systematic understanding of the range of influences operating between individuals and their contexts. Jung stated that, ‘every normal person of our time…is bound to his environment by a whole system of projections’ (1916/1948/1969, CW8, p. 265). In career terms, this means that all individuals, in any occupation, are both the subject and object of projections. We are tied by these invisible threads to every other member of the community; and immersed in a sea of career projections, counter-projections, introjections, and so on. One cannot not influence, and one cannot help but be subject to the influences of others.

This helps to explain processes of idealisation and demonisation in career development. These relate to local, national or international figures including chief executives, religious leaders, singers, actors, and sports stars. Indeed, they can be extended to include any well-known organisation, cultural product, or physical object. These are the figures, organisations, and images that
occupy the popular career imagination. These are the phenomena met by career helpers and their clients in day-to-day life and the activities of career education. To be clear, the role of the media, society and community is clearly identified in contemporary career theories but an appreciation of projection is not. This is necessary in order to better understand how career influences manifest and may be transformed.

Projection indicates new ways of imagining the social in relation to career development. This entails re-calibrating common understandings within career studies by stressing that society, and therefore career development too, is held together and, indeed partly constituted, by a web of group and individual projections and introjections. A further aspect is that, with regard to projection, there is no clear boundary between society, community, and the individual. Projection links the highly personal, or indeed intrapersonal, with the highly societal. It indicates the global implications of what might be seen as a purely intrapersonal process and vice versa. This collapses traditional boundaries and dualisms in career studies between: the global and the personal; the internal and external; and the subjective and objective career.

Projection represents a particularly helpful addition to the concept of recursiveness in career systems. Patton and McMahon (2014, pp. 254-255) defined recursiveness as the mutual, multi-directional but unequal influences that exist between individuals, organisations, and society. They commented little, however, on its psychodynamic aspects. A key point is that processes of projection demonstrate one way in which recursiveness happens. A second is
that *seeing through* reduces the potency of influences. One effect of withdrawing projections from celebrities, parents, or peer group members is to change one’s relationship with these figures. This has consequences for the individual concerned but also affects his or her social milieu; and considerably expands the scope of career development work.

**Proposition two: the persona enriches understandings of the personality and self-concept in career studies.**

Traditional conceptions of personality and self-concept in career studies are somewhat limited in scope. Holland’s (1997) theory of vocational personalities and work environments, for example, focuses rather narrowly on fitting personality types to job roles. Super’s (1992) self-concept theory is richer but confined to the constellation of role self-concepts. In analytical psychology, the persona is defined as a system of adaptation and relationship between the individual and the wider world. This has particular value in relation to a post-Jungian career development theory for the following reasons.

The persona is an integrative concept that brings together subject and object or, what might be termed the subjective and objective career; the familiar problematic dualism of career studies. It also enables career development theory to operate in both affirmative and sceptical modes in relation to occupations. It highlights the importance of *seeing through* identification with occupational roles whilst at the same time making appropriate *investments* in them. It is a richly paradoxical concept as it relates to both revealing and
concealing oneself. The range of metaphors and images for persona is also wide. Jung referred to its, ‘limitless variety’ (1928/1966, CW7, p. 210).

The persona is the medium for social relating, communication, drama, and interpersonal interaction. It has therefore considerable political and relational value to the individuating person and wider society. It is the means by which the individuation process reaches out to and receives others i.e. the function through which the social benefits of individuation are realised.

A related point is that it enables the development of a more critical career studies. An exclusive emphasis on work as an expression of personality in traditional career theory may compound persona identification. A theory of persona therefore adds a depth psychological dimension to the understanding of career dynamics. It highlights the range of social roles through which the fruits of individuation may be received and shared with others. It also emphasises that individuals may benefit from learning how to disengage from roles in more constructive and productive ways.

Projection is also relevant to the persona system. Passive projection has the effect of throwing persona out into one or more roles; and passive introjection indiscriminately absorbs external figures. Seeing through, and gathering in, enables the recollection and return of persona functioning to the individual. The persona relates to the overall way one integrates, organises, and presents a plurality of roles. In these terms, it should not be located at the surface of the psyche as may be suggested by Jung’s structural model; rather, as a process or function that permeates the psyche.
Proposition three: analytical psychological perspectives on typology and archetypal images can enhance understanding of career types.

The existing literature on career types provides individuals with some points of adaptation and orientation but is otherwise a little narrow. Analytical psychological perspectives on psychological types and archetypal images enhance understandings of type in new ways. First, they indicate new ways of looking at vocational identity based on the eight function attitudes and the transcendent function. Vocational identity can be enhanced by the progressive alignment of the eight functions. Through this, individuals can appreciate and understand career more fully and more richly. Second, it is proposed that projection plays a role in the constellation and enactment of career types. Processes of scapegoating and idealisation can be named and seen through. This can lead to the re-occupation of career roles with greater meaning and purpose. Third, the scope and range of career types is considerably extended by analytical psychological perspectives on archetypal images. At least 80 archetypal roles were identified in the review of literature and there is scope for individuals to broaden this still further. Fourth, it is argued that typology and archetypal images are useful tools for developing reflexivity. This can aid in enhancing workplace cooperation and mutual understanding.

Proposition four: career strategy is illuminated by analytical psychological perspectives on individuation.

The existing literature on career strategy has some advantages in helping
individuals climb the corporate ladder. It is, however, excessively rational and didactic. It is argued that analytical psychology has value in developing a more creative and meaningful approach to strategies for career success. An analytical psychological approach lies not in the advocacy of favourite or pet ideas; rather, it entails enabling individuals to encounter a range of contrasting approaches some of which may be difficult or challenging. It involves questioning whether a particular author can really divine the secret of career success. Assigning successful career behaviour to others may serve a temporary purpose but the self-recollecting of career strategy can better inform an individual response. This suggests a need for the seeing through, and gathering in, of career strategy. It also entails asking critical questions concerning the production of career strategies. Is this an idealised approach? An espoused theory rather than a lived theory? What would happen if one did the opposite? In addition, analytical psychology focuses on the overall goals and purposes of individuation. Its main attention is to ends not means. This suggests that career strategies need to connect with the broader purposes of individuation.

**Proposition five: an analytical psychological perspective on personal myth enriches career theories relating to narrative.**

Classical developmental career theorists generally interpret career in terms of a master narrative (Ginzberg et al., 1951; Super, 1957). Contemporary narrative-based career theories nuance this somewhat but retain several elements of master narrative; and an emphasis on agency particularly by focusing on authoring (Savickas, 2013). In addition, although there is a
psychodynamic thread running through the developmental literature, it is more Freudian and Adlerian than Jungian. Analytical psychology is analytical, at least in part, because it is a comparative psychology that eschews master narratives. It acknowledges the theories of Freud and Adler but refuses reduction to them. Jung was profoundly influenced by Adler’s ideas on guiding fictions but gradually evolved his own approach through his work on life-lines, lines of development and vocation. These gradually evolve into Jung’s conception of the personal myth in the 1950s. An analytical psychological perspective on personal myth adds considerable value because it provides an alternative to current narrative theories in career studies. It introduces a profoundly historical and cultural dimension to narrative and considerably expands the scope of careers work.

**Proposition six: developmental career theories can be enhanced by an analytical psychological perspective on life course development and vocation.**

Developmental approaches in career studies are limited by stage and phase based approaches. Individuation is a narrative without a predetermined shape. It involves a rich range of genres, plots, stories, callings, and metaphors. This means that the linear structures and systems of career theory need to be viewed in much more provisional terms. Individuation is textured and pluralistic. It relates not so much to what people do as the way they do it. This considerably broadens the scope of career theory from the issue of occupational choice to ways of living.
Individuation does not place exclusive emphasis on agency and authorship and, through this, it finds a place for the unconscious. Jung questioned the role of agency in vocation. He argued that, to an extent, vocation is thrust upon individuals by the unconscious and this limits the scope of rational choice. For Jung, an excessive emphasis on agency is a kind of defence against vocation.

Individuation makes space for destiny; the view that each person has been chosen to embody an idea. This links the *causa efficiens* with the *causa finalis* and potentially integrates the life of each individual with the life of the wider universe (Marie-Louise von Franz, 1978/1997). In addition, individuation does not conform to an exclusively upward linear path. This relates to the nekyia or night sea journey that involves motifs of descent and ascent from low or dark places. It may entail visiting the underworld and the city of the dead. In vocational terms, it is a call to death and the land of ghosts. It is also, however, a transcendent and meaningful encounter with secret knowledge and mythology, leading to restoration and healing.

Individuation suggests the psyche is not monovocal but polyvocal and contains many types of callings and listening posts. This emphasises the role of discernment in hearing and discerning calls. These cycles of calling and perceiving form a rotational system. This helps to build a distinctively Jungian *psychodynamic* conception of vocation and career. In addition, analytical psychology sees the individual as the carrier of life. This provides a radical new perspective on traditional meanings of career.
Conventional developmental accounts suffer from under plotting. Analytical psychology enjoins us to imagine a range of alternative plots. It therefore contributes a richer and more nuanced narratological literacy to career theory. Analytical psychology presupposes a life of multiple plots and that any one life exceeds definition by master narratives. At best, they may nurture individuation.

**Proposition seven: transformational learning is central to understanding career-related learning**

Analytical psychological perspectives on learning have generally been neglected in theories of career-related learning (Law, 1996; Lent, 2013; L. K. Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1996); and currently, social cognitive psychology is in the ascendancy. Projection is relevant to transformational learning as individuals learn their career through passive projection and introjection. Enhanced career learning, from an analytical psychological angle, entails seeing through these to some extent.

Typology is also relevant because it introduces an explicitly dynamic aspect to career-related learning. Overcoming the ruling powers of the psyche is a continuous process of re-adjustment. It entails loss, grieving, and engaging in a process of discernment to differentiate between competing voices. Knowledge of typology also avoids fundamentalism in learning theory. Any learning theory must take typological differences into account since ideas, emotions, sensations, and intuitions are held, evaluated and understood
differently by the thinking, feeling, sensing, and intuitive functions in their respective introverted and extraverted modes.

Transformational learning involves paying attention to less egoic and cognitive forms of learning. Consciousness raising is complemented by consciousness lowering. It also entails engaging with points of reference outside contemporary norms and viewpoints. This brings in an explicitly historical aspect (Hillman & Shamdasani, 2013, pp. 96-98) to career-related learning. Indeed, Jung’s focus on the historical dimensions of individuality indicates a need for a career education curriculum with an explicitly historical component. Loosening the scientific paradigm in learning enables alternative visions of learning to come to the fore. The person at the centre of traditional learning theory is a hypothesis-testing scientist. Transformational learning theory allows for different possibilities. Individuals may have ideas but ideas also have individuals. Our hypotheses form part of our identity and our personal myths.

Transformational learning is sceptical of purely institutionalised learning in schools, colleges, universities, and workplaces. It sees individuation as the cutting edge of social transformation and political change; leading to fuller relationships between individuals and the development of civic society. Typological development leads to scepticism about the prevailing institutional order and, through this, a process of re-learning the world.
Myth and symbol play an important and unacknowledged role in career-related learning. The transformation of career images entails new ways of looking at the archetypal symbols of career such as pathways, vehicles, ladders, and stages. Career is not reducible to any one of these images; indeed, their dissolution and reformation lies at the heart of individuation. The personal myth enables individuals to weave and re-weave the golden threads of culture; indeed, contribute to and become part of this evolving, transformational process.

**Proposition eight: the role and purpose of theory in career studies can be illuminated by analytical psychology.**

This proposition relates to how career development theories should be formulated, regarded, and used. There have been several moves to synthesise theories of career development. Law (1981) argued that he wished to unify and not supplant existing theory; and subsequently offered ‘a more general explanatory frame for a variety of theories about who-gets-to-do-what’ (Law, 1993, p. 26). Super (1990, p. 205) stated that he offered a segmental synthesis of current ideas. Patton and McMahon (2014, p. 133) defined their approach as a meta-theoretical synthesis of existing career theory. Savickas (2013, p. 148) also took a meta-theoretical stance. The role, however, that analytical psychology may play in informing such moves has not been explored and is discussed below.

Career theories should be seen not as master narratives but in more provisional and bounded terms. This point also relates to expectations, hopes,
and fears about career development theory i.e. what it can be legitimately expected to do and the weight it can be expected to bear. Seeing through career studies means attending to some of the field’s least malleable preoccupations and paradigmatic beliefs relating to contextual frameworks, career strategies and career types. These are the dominant narratives the field researches by, teaches by and within which career development is practised.

Career theories (like all theories, including this one), should be seen as confessions. They do not come from outer space but are produced by individuals influenced by their particular preoccupations, priorities, and investments. All interpretations of career need to make space for the personal equation. Career theories are also influenced by the typological makeup of their authors. This influences their content and scope; and the attention given to emotion, cognition, and the passage of time. Since projection relates to all types of cultural and social activity, career theories can be read critically as the products of their authors’ projected material. Career theories are also lightning rods for the projections of others. In relation to the practice of careers research, there is a need for a greater criticality in relation to projection. Analytical psychology provides an epistemological basis for handling career theories. They can be seen as manifestations of psyche and examples of imagination and myth. Jungian psychology is distinctive in regarding other fields as manifestations of psyche; and the syncretic, constructive harvesting of philosophy, comparative religion, literature, science, and other areas, potentially offers a much richer engagement with other disciplines than has
been the case hitherto.

**Proposition nine: the training for career helpers and design of career education can be improved from an analytical psychological angle.**

Chapters Three to Nine conclude with suggestions for the enhancement of training for career helpers and career education. Whilst they do not address every possible dimension of analytical psychology, they are proposed as entry points for career helpers and their clients. Several workshop ideas are developed in outline. In relation to projection, it is proposed to extend socio-drama and systems mapping exercises to include processes of career-related idealisation and demonisation (Chapter Three). With regard to persona, celebrity culture and social media are proposed as potential materials for an exploration of persona in a career context (Chapter Four). It is proposed to use archetype cards to open up a discussion on working with the whole person (Chapter Five). An exercise on the ‘inner captain’ is suggested as a way of thinking about career strategies differently (Chapter Six). The use of Rumi’s poem *Unfold Your Own Myth* is proposed to help participants get a handle on personal myth (Chapter Seven). It is suggested that Jung’s statements about the individual as the carrier of life can bridge to a discussion on career and meaning (Chapter Eight). Finally, it is proposed that the importance of grieving and loss in transformational learning could provide a focus for a workshop (Chapter Nine).

**Concluding remarks**

This thesis has engaged in a searching evaluation and re-imagination of
career theory. This has been accomplished using a distinctive, contemporary take on analytical psychology. It is, as discussed in Chapter One, likely to be of interest to career helpers and their clients. It is also possible that the contemporary interpretations of projection, persona, typology, personal myth, life course development, and transformational learning will be of interest to the Jungian community. With some adaptation, the thesis will provide an intellectual framework for articles in academic journals and books related to both fields. A chapter on employability and depth psychology has already appeared in an edited collection in the careers field (McCash, 2016). In more practical terms, it also underpins a series of workshops with learned societies, professional bodies, training centres and members of the public. These are focused on: Career Dreams: Signs and Symbols in Our Career Imagination; Getting Started with Archetypal Dialogues: Working with the Whole Person in Careers Work; and Possible Plots, Possible People: Depth Psychology and Career Development. None of these steps would have been possible without the detailed re-conceptualisation of career theory provided by this thesis.
Chapter Ten Postscript: The Scholar-Gypsy and the Golden Threads

It’s time to say goodbye. I’ve spent my life learning how to say goodbye better and I’m still not very good at it. So, here’s two attempts.

Ending One: The Scholar-Gypsy
Throughout my twenties, several times a week, I used to go past a pub in Kennington, Oxfordshire, called the Scholar-Gypsy. It was on my bus route and I didn’t know anything much about the poem of the same name. I just liked the picture of the Scholar-Gypsy that adorned the outside of the pub (the building’s now been demolished to make way for housing). It showed a young man lying down leaning against a tree and reading a book. He may also have been smoking a clay pipe, I’m not sure. By his side was a knapsack on a stick. I was always drawn to the image. It spoke to me somehow - gave me a viable role model when other attractive role models were thin on the ground.

Coming to the end of the thesis, I came across the poem by Matthew Arnold and learnt more about how the Scholar-Gypsy learnt the ‘strange arts’ of the ‘gipsy-tribe’. There’s an extended simile at the end where Arnold compares the Scholar-Gypsy to a Tyrian sea trader who flees his enemies and sails away.

O'er the blue Midland waters with the gale,
Betwixt the Syrtes and soft Sicily,
To where the Atlantic raves
Outside the western straits; and unbent sails
There, where down cloudy cliffs, through sheets of foam,
Shy traffickers, the dark Iberians come;
And on the beach undid his corded bales.

(Arnold, 1853/2017)
Like Arnold’s Scholar-Gypsy, I too found a place to untie my corded bales. A game to deal myself in on. I now realise that my egoic ‘I’ may not have known what I was doing but something did and that was all that mattered.

I’d like to say thanks to the Scholar-Gypsy. So long, my friend.

**Ending Two: The Golden Threads**

I’ve mentioned Daniel Levinson’s book *The Seasons of a Man’s Life* (Levinson et al., 1978) a few times in the thesis. I loved that book when I first read it twenty years ago. The interviews were incredibly powerful and moving. The men came alive on the page as they talked about their lives in response to Levinson’s biographical interviewing method. Although of course dated, it’s still worth reading now for the interviews, along with its companion text *The Seasons of a Woman’s Life* (Levinson & Levinson, 1996).

Levinson devised a staged theory of the life course. He said he wasn’t expecting to, it just came to him from reading the interviews. Not his fault of course but one of the problems with his model is that using it in relation to your life becomes a bit mechanical. I remember checking my age and life experience against the model to see if I was ‘behind’, ‘on’ or ‘ahead’ of schedule. Perhaps I took it too seriously? This approach works against the ideas I’ve been discussing about individuation and the notion of the individual as the carrier of life. Life cannot be pinned down like a butterfly to a board.

Again, quite late in writing the thesis, I had the pleasure of hearing George Vaillant talk in London as part of a conference the University organised with The Tavistock Hospital. I had recently read and enjoyed his *Aging Well* (Vaillant, 2002) which covers similar ground to Levinson but from a much wider range of people and ages. This time I was less interested in the stage model that Vaillant designed and simply enjoyed the wonderful interviews.
Leafing through it today, on my last writing day, I find a quotation which links with the personal myth and golden threads discussed in Chapter Nine. The study participants were asked, at age 75, what they felt about wisdom and one replied:

“A sense of the connectedness of all things; or as the wise old guru said to the Coney Island hot-dog seller, ‘Make me one with everything’”


So, with that, I say goodbye to my thesis, and farewell to you, reader.

Postscript to a postscript

Oh, one more thing. You see, I told you I was no good at leaving.

A few years ago, I had a dream about a large house with many different rooms and corridors. I walked through them, and near the centre of the house, was a room with no windows. It was brightly lit and coloured white. It seemed to be a changing room, a kind of bathroom. There were pipes connecting it with a water supply and drains. Later, this turned into a dream sequence featuring the changing room. I associated to a children’s TV programme called Mr Benn. The main character would walk into a special fancy-dress shop on the high street and be invited, by a fez-wearing shopkeeper, to try on an outfit, open the magic door at the back, and go on an adventure. The dreams felt very significant. Although the room had no windows, it was for sure connected with a great source of energy. It also gave me a sense of well-being. I no longer dream about it much today. Possibly because the changing room just became part of my life, my identity. I don’t need to dream it any more. It’s where I live.
List of references


Lawrence (Eds.), *Handbook of career theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.


