1	Integrated record of environmental change and evolution challenges the Cambrian
2	Explosion
3	
4	Rachel Wood <sup>1*</sup> , Alexander G. Liu <sup>2</sup> , Frederick Bowyer <sup>1</sup> , Philip R. Wilby <sup>3</sup> , Frances S. Dunn <sup>3,4</sup> ,
5	Charlotte G. Kenchington <sup>2,5</sup> , Jennifer F. Hoyal Cuthill <sup>2,6</sup> , Emily G. Mitchell <sup>2</sup> , and Amelia
6	Penny <sup>7</sup> .
7	
8	<sup>1</sup> School of GeoSciences, University of Edinburgh, James Hutton Road, Edinburgh EH9 3FE,
9	UK. *email: Rachel.Wood@ed.ac.uk
10	<sup>2</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge CB2
11	3EQ, UK.
12	<sup>3</sup> British Geological Survey, Nicker Hill, Keyworth, Nottinghamshire NG12 5GG, UK.
13	<sup>4</sup> School of Earth Sciences, Life Sciences Building, 24 Tyndall Avenue, Bristol BS8 1TQ,
14	UK.
15	<sup>5</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, Memorial University of Newfoundland, 300 Prince Philip
16	Drive, St. John's, Newfoundland A1B 3X5, Canada.
17	<sup>6</sup> Earth-Life Science Institute, Tokyo Institute of Technology, Tokyo, 152-8550, Japan.
18	<sup>7</sup> Finnish Museum of Natural History, University of Helsinki, Jyrängöntie 2, 00560 Helsinki,
19	Finland.
20	
21	Abstract
22	The 'Cambrian Explosion' describes the rapid increase in animal diversity and abundance,
23	as manifest in the fossil record, between $\sim$ 540 and 520 million years ago (Ma). This event,
24	however, is nested within a far more ancient record of macrofossils extending at least into the

25 late Ediacaran, ~571 Ma. The evolutionary events documented during the Ediacaran–

Cambrian interval coincide with geochemical evidence for the modernisation of Earth's biogeochemical cycles. Holistic integration of fossil and geochemical records leads us to challenge the notion that the Ediacaran and Cambrian worlds were markedly distinct, and places biotic and environmental change within a longer-term narrative. We propose that the evolution of metazoans may have been facilitated by a series of dynamic and global changes in redox conditions and nutrient supply, which, together with potential biotic feedbacks, enabled turnover events that sustained phases of radiation.

In this synthesis, we argue that early metazoan diversification should be recast as a series of successive, transitional radiations that extended from the late Ediacaran and continued through the early Palaeozoic. We conclude that while the Cambrian Explosion represents a radiation of crown-group bilaterians, it was simply one phase amongst several older, and younger, metazoan radiations.

38

### 39 1. Introduction

40 The 'Cambrian Explosion', starting at  $\sim$ 540 Ma, is considered to mark the abrupt 41 appearance in the fossil record of abundant and diverse metazoans. This was accompanied by 42 an increase in complexity of morphologies and behaviours, individual size and disparity, the 43 first representatives of most extant phyla, and the rise of metazoan-dominated marine 44 ecosystems (1). Although most workers acknowledge that metazoans originated considerably 45 before the Cambrian (e.g. 2,3, though see 4), the 'roots' of the 'Cambrian Explosion' are 46 much debated. The initiation of this event is debated; around the Ediacaran–Cambrian 47 boundary (5), in the terminal Ediacaran (6), or even deeper still, at either the appearance of 48 the Nama Assemblage (~550–541 Ma; 7), or at the Avalon–White Sea assemblages boundary 49 at ~561 Ma (2,7,8), or, based on molecular phylogenies, in the Tonian or Cryogenian ~720 50 Ma (1). Furthermore, independent faunal turnover events and metazoan radiations are

51 recognised in the subsequent early Palaeozoic, and so the relationship of these to evolutionary 52 and ecological innovations across the Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary must be understood (9-53 11).

54 Whilst knowledge of individual aspects of these evolutionary developments is advancing, 55 our broader understanding of early animal evolution is often hampered by highly 56 compartmentalised, rather than holistic, study. Insights from diverse palaeobiological records 57 have only recently been integrated with high-resolution geochemical studies and models, 58 revealing much about the operation of the Earth System during this interval, such as the 59 interaction between ecosystem engineers and oceanic biogeochemistry (e.g. 12-16). Global 60 correlation between key sections, aided by accurate and precise radiometric dating, is a 61 continuous work in progress. Yet, holistic integration of datasets across the broader 62 Ediacaran-Cambrian interval may enable us to address profound uncertainties, such as how 63 seemingly different biotas might be related (8,17); whether one or more mass extinctions 64 occurred during this interval (7); the evolutionary response, if any, to changes in oceanic 65 redox conditions and nutrient availability (15,16, 18-20) and, the resolution of conflicting 66 evidence for the origin of major metazoan clades from molecular clock, biomarker, and 67 palaeontological data (e.g. 2,4). Without comprehensive geobiological and temporal 68 integration we risk missing the bigger, and more significant, evolutionary picture. 69 We focus here on integrating the tractable fossil and environmental proxy records of the 70 Ediacaran to Cambrian interval to document the diversification of animals and their 71 behaviour. This integration reveals a record of interactions between environmental change 72 and biological evolution, culminating in the establishment of crown group metazoan phyla. 73 Our compilation enables a re-evaluation of the record, and explores the potential drivers of 74 early metazoan evolution.

75

#### 76 2. Environmental change versus evolutionary innovation

77 The late Cryogenian to Cambrian interval shows evidence for dramatic changes in the carbon cycle (Figure 1b) and ocean redox conditions (Figure 1c) (Box 1). These geochemical 78 79 changes, potentially driven by tectonic readjustment (21), coincide with a series of major 80 biotic innovations (Figure 1a), including the appearance of metazoan motility by ~565 Ma, 81 biomineralisation by ~550 Ma, and bilaterian crown groups and predators by ~535 Ma (Box 82 2). A causal relationship between these records has long been proposed (e.g. 22). In 83 particular, there is a broad consensus that dissolved oxygen provision reached a threshold, or 84 series of thresholds, during the Neoproterozoic, allowing the diversification of metazoans and 85 their increasing metabolic demands (23-25). However, there remains considerable debate as 86 to whether oxygenation was the main driver of early metazoan evolution after this initial 87 physiological requirement was met (e.g. 18,23,26). Indeed, the relationship between oxygen 88 availability and biotic response was likely to have been complicated by the operation of 89 ecological and genetic factors, as well as poorly understood feedbacks between life and the 90 broader Earth System.

91 Different geochemical proxies yield information with varying levels of spatial and 92 temporal resolution. Local marine palaeoredox reconstruction via iron speciation and Rare 93 Earth Element (REE) profiles in several key sequences indicates that Cryogenian to early 94 Cambrian open marine conditions were typified by redox-stratification (e.g. 14, 23). Most, 95 but not all, sampled basins record a shallow and highly dynamic chemocline above deeper 96 ferruginous waters. However, redox proxy data are unavailable for many important 97 successions, most notably Morocco, Spain, Australia, India and the Ukraine. In addition, the 98 targeting of fine-grained facies has led to considerable bias in existing data (27), and the 99 paucity of deep water successions for key intervals during the Ediacaran has prevented 100

101 102 BOX 1: Oxygen and biogeochemical cycles during the Ediacaran–Cambrian 103 The non-uniformitarian nature of the oceans across the Ediacaran-Cambrian interval, 104 continuing into the Ordovician, is evidenced by considerable instability in the carbon isotope 105 record in inorganic carbonates. The magnitude of the largest known negative carbonate carbon isotope ( $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$ ) excursion in the geological record, the Ediacaran Shuram/Wonoka 106 107 anomaly, has a nadir of -12‰ (22). Following recovery to positive values prior to 551–548 Ma,  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  remained relatively unperturbed for the final ~10 Myr of the Ediacaran (the 108 109 Ediacaran positive isotopic plateau: EPIP), before falling again to values indicative of the 110 basal Cambrian negative carbon isotope excursion (BACE) (e.g. 28-30). The BACE pre-dates 111 the first appearance of Treptichnus pedum (31,32), while in South China it correlates with the 112 Asteridium-Heliosphaeridium-Comasphaeridium (AHC) acritarch assemblage and the 113 Anabarites trisulcatus-Protohertzina anabarica (small shelly fossils) Assemblage Zone (33-114 34). A number of further short-lived  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  excursions continue to punctuate the Cambrian (29,35) and Ordovician chemostratigraphic records (36), exhibiting a progressive decline in 115 116 overall excursion magnitude into the Phanerozoic (e.g. 37). 117 Proposed explanations for  $\delta^{13}C_{carb}$  anomalies throughout this interval are variable and remain contentious (e.g. 22, 38), but they may, at least in part, be related to dynamic change 118 119 in redox and nutrient cycling. While selenium isotopes suggest a generally progressive 120 oxygenation through the Neoproterozoic (39), compiled data show that oceanic redox 121 conditions oscillated dramatically over million year timescales, before a permanent and stable 122 oxygenated state was achieved (40). The exact timing of these events, confirmation of their 123 global extent, as well as the drivers for such rapid and global changes, however, remains 124 unclear. Mo and U isotopes show that an increase in oxygenation was punctuated by intervals 125 of expanded anoxic seafloor (41-43); low Th/U ratios show a positive correlation with  $\delta^{13}$ C values at multiple sites across the Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary, suggesting that the BACE 126 127 is a response to the widespread development of shallow marine anoxia (44-45). A shift in the 128 marine sulphur cycle, as recorded by  $\delta^{34}$ S, is possibly consistent with increasingly 129 widespread sulphate reduction under anoxic conditions around ~550 Ma (22,46). Others have argued for intervening late Ediacaran 'oceanic oxygenation events' (OOEs) 130 131 (Figure 1c) at around 575 Ma (OOE2), ~560 Ma (OOE3) - possibly coincident with the start of the Shuram - and at ~540 Ma (OOE4) (40,47), although differing redox proxies are not 132 133 always consistent with the timing of these intervals. For example, on the basis of N isotopes,

oxic intervals have been proposed ~551–543 Ma, ~544–529 Ma, and ~521–517 Ma (see 48).
Diverse proxies suggest that the global ocean became progressively more oxygenated through
the early Cambrian until ~520 Ma, after which time there was a return to more widespread

137 anoxia (49,50). The Sinsk Event, accompanied by a negative CIE, is a further short-lived

138 anoxic interval at ~513 Ma (11). Independent proxies suggest that full oxygenation of the

- 139 deep oceans was not reached until the Devonian (27,51).
- 140
- 141

# 142 BOX 2: The metazoan fossil record between ~571–520 Ma

143 The oldest macrofossils of the so-called 'Ediacaran macrobiota' are known from the 144 Drook Formation, Newfoundland (52), and are dated at ~571 Ma (53). Although their precise 145 phylogenetic position remains unclear, at least some taxa are reasonably interpreted to have 146 been total group metazoans (54). The wider macrobiota includes a range of complex 147 organisms with tubular, frondose, modular, and sheet-like morphologies that likely include 148 multiple clades (e.g. 55). These have been grouped within three proposed biotic 149 'assemblages' (recurrent community compositions) that appear to be predominately 150 controlled by facies rather than age (56): the Avalon (~571–555 Ma), White Sea (~560–551 151 Ma), and Nama (~555–541 Ma) assemblages (57,58). Frondose taxa (e.g. *Charnia*, *Arborea*) 152 dominate the Avalon Assemblage, and are accompanied by rare candidate cnidarians (59), 153 but both the diversity and taxonomic disparity of macroscopic soft-bodied organisms increase 154 significantly after ~560 Ma (3,60). The first identifiable motile, heterotrophic organisms are 155 *Kimberella quadrata, Yorgia* and *Dickinsonia* from Russia, at ~558–555 Ma, the latter being highly likely to have been a metazoan on the basis of ichnological, developmental and 156 157 biomarker evidence (see 54,61). A widespread record of surface locomotory trace fossils 158 exists from at least 560 Ma (62; see also 63), and these diversify in form and complexity 159 through the late Ediacaran (64-67). Latest Ediacaran assemblages show a marked reduction in 160 soft-bodied macrofossil diversity, but witness the appearance of organic-walled (e.g. 161 Corumbella) and skeletal tubular fossils, and a diversification of bilaterian trace fossils (9, 162 62). The oldest skeletal macrofossil, Cloudina, which also shows the first possible evidence 163 for predatory borings (68), is known globally from ~550 Ma (69). Cloudina could form reefs 164 (70, but see 71) and together with the late Ediacaran (~543 Ma) Paraconularia, is plausibly 165 interpreted as a total-group cnidarian (and, therefore, a crown-eumetazoan).

166 The Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary is defined by the first appearance of the complex trace fossil Treptichnus pedum (72), presently dated to 541 Ma based on the inferred 167 168 correlation of successions from Newfoundland, Namibia and Oman. The earliest Cambrian 169 (Fortunian) fossil record shows a marked increase in ichnofossil abundance, size and 170 complexity in shallow marine environments (9). The first probable crown-group molluscs and 171 brachiopods appear in the late Fortunian or early Stage 2 (73). There is also a notable rise of 172 bilaterian predators (74). The Early to Middle Cambrian then hosts a variety of lagerstätten 173 that document crown group representatives of disparate skeletal and non-biomineralising 174 animal phyla (e.g. 33), as well as increases in body size across many animal clades, 175 skeletonization, and the expansion of ecological networks (1). 176 These patterns in the fossil record are yet to be converted into a coherent understanding of 177 the dynamics of how metazoan phyla appeared and evolved (5), but quantitative analysis of 178 lophotrochozoan skeletal species from the terminal Ediacaran to Cambrian Stage 5 (~545-

179 505 Ma) on the Siberian Platform show a disjunct temporal distribution that suggests that the

180 radiation of bilaterian metazoans occurred in two phases, separated by an extinction event.

181 The first was dominated by lophophorate, brachiopod, and mollusc stem groups from ~542–

182 513 Ma, and the second was marked by radiating brachiopod and mollusc crown group

- 183 species from ~513 Ma, extending to the Great Ordovician Radiation Event (GOBE) (73).
- 184

185 unequivocal distinction between global layer-cake redox stratification of the oceans and highly dynamic Oxygen Minimum Zones (OMZs) overlying potentially oxic basinal waters. 186 There is growing evidence for the existence of OMZs in early Cambrian basins (75-77). 187 188 Many global proxies allow only for estimates of expanded seafloor anoxia, and do not 189 differentiate between deep and shallow marine settings. Consequently, it is not clear if such 190 expansions restricted the habitable area of the shallow shelf, where most biodiversity resides. 191 At least some biotas throughout this interval were subject to upwelling incursions of oxygen 192 deficient water, controlled by local changes in relative sea level and productivity (77). Therefore, the entire Ediacaran-Cambrian radiation, and indeed beyond, may have occurred 193 194 under relatively low oxygen levels, but with highly dynamic, fluctuating redox conditions

195 prevalent on local (ecological), as well as global and evolutionary, temporal and spatial scales196 (19).

197

# 198 Biotic response to changing redox: a role for instability?

199 While all extant metazoans need oxygen, their demands are not equal. Modern low-200 oxygen regions are heterogeneous and dynamic habitats that support low diversity 201 communities of opportunistic and non-skeletal metazoans, many of which are meiofaunal: 202 large, skeletal, and motile metazoans, which form complex, biodiverse ecosystems, typically 203 require higher oxygen levels (23). Experimental work has demonstrated that certain early-204 diverging clades (poriferans and ctenophores) may have very low oxygen demands, since 205 they lack hypoxia-inducible factor (HIF) pathways to maintain cellular oxygen homeostasis 206 (78,79). This suggests that stem-group metazoans, and the metazoan Last Common Ancestor, 207 may also have lacked the HIF pathway, and so could have metabolized aerobically under 208 very low environmental oxygen concentrations (79). Animals most likely originated in a 209 non-uniformitarian world of low atmospheric oxygen, and almost certainly before the 210 permanent oxygenation of the deep ocean. However, it remains unclear as to whether animal 211 diversification and increased ecosystem complexity was driven extrinsically by the expansion 212 of permissive oxic niches, or by genetic or developmental innovations that enabled animals to 213 expand into the oxic realm.

Where palaeoredox proxy data are integrated with biotic distribution, metazoans are usually restricted to localised oxygenated habitats, either above a shallow chemocline, or potentially below an OMZ (e.g. 76, 80). The instability of the chemocline would therefore have provided strong anactualistic controls on the distribution of metazoans, and potentially on the taphonomic windows for their preservation. Ediacaran and Cambrian sediments

deposited below the chemocline (or within an OMZ) may therefore be expected to lackmetazoan life assemblages.

221 At least regionally stable ocean oxygenation following the Gaskiers glaciation broadly 222 coincides with the appearance of soft-bodied Ediacaran macroscopic biota in Newfoundland 223 (181). Extensive ocean oxygenation is argued to have occurred coincident with the end of the 224 Shuram event, ca. 560–551 Ma (see review of 75). This event is broadly coincident with the 225 first evidence for probable motile, heterotrophic, and muscular bilaterians, although dating 226 and global correlation are not well constrained, and integrated, local, datasets are not 227 available to establish cause and effect (104). It is also not clear whether the rise of mobile 228 bilaterians and predators required additional ecological triggers (23). Records from the open 229 oceanic Laurentian margin (632–540 Ma), the Nama Group (~550–538 Ma), and the variably 230 restricted Yangtze Block (635-520 Ma), all show continued redox instability after the first 231 fossil evidence for (probable) metazoans (see review of 75). The first skeletal metazoans 232 appear at ~550 Ma, under local conditions of continued redox stratification (80), and before 233 an interval of expanded anoxia (43). However, in the Nama Basin, integrated Fe speciation 234 and Ce anomaly data show that in-situ Ediacaran skeletal metazoans did not occupy low 235 oxygen waters (14).

These dynamic carbon and redox records are also closely tied to probable changes in nutrient cycling, but mechanistic details are far from clear (15,20,48,49). For example, step changes in the burial of phosphorus and organic carbon, driven by evolutionary innovations, have been argued to have progressively lowered marine phosphate concentrations (15). Each step change would result in a pulse of marine oxygenation, but over long timescales the decrease in C<sub>org</sub>/P burial ratios would drive atmospheric oxygen levels down, and slowly deoxygenate the oceans (15).

243 Others have noted that the low total organic carbon content in Neoproterozoic shales 244 suggests that the ocean at this time may have had a lower flux of primary productivity to the 245 seafloor than in the Phanerozoic (20). An expected consequence of this nutrient-limitation is 246 that biotas would have small body sizes, and sparse and heterogeneous global distributions 247 (20). Analysis of N isotopes over the late Ediacaran to early Cambrian interval supports the 248 hypothesis that pulses of oxygenation, punctuated by regional anoxic events of shoaling 249 chemoclines, were closely associated with an increase in nutrients that boosted primary 250 productivity of large-celled, eukaryotic phytoplankton, perhaps in turn stimulating metazoan 251 evolution (49).

252 Individual marine basins continued to record unstable redox conditions over short 253 timescales well into the Cambrian, with dominantly ferruginous and even euxinic conditions 254 particularly in shelf and slope environments (e.g. 40,75,76,80). Adjacent basins can show 255 different redox histories, and the oxic chemocline often shoaled during sea-level 256 transgressions (75,80). While some studies propose regional deepening of the oxycline 257 during Cambrian Stage 2, with an accompanying increase in biological diversity (82,83), others have shown that anoxic or low-oxygen concentrations may have prevailed for 258 259 extended intervals that contain notably biodiverse faunas, such as those recorded by the 260 Chengjiang biota (76). However, just as we know little about the spatial scales of Ediacaran-261 Cambrian redox heterogeneity, we also know little quantitatively about the lateral distribution, 262 and patchiness, of benthic biotas.

In a world with lower atmospheric oxygen than today, the habitability of benthic marine environments may have been governed by oxygen demand, dependent on rates of primary production, rates of oxygen replenishment via atmospheric mixing and diffusion, and the sinking rates of dominant primary producers (76). The distribution of shallow marine

habitable zones would therefore have evolved dynamically as a result of changes in nutrientavailability forced by changes in circulation, upwelling and sea level.

269 The processes driving biotic response to rising atmospheric oxygen levels, which may have 270 manifest as a deepening of the chemocline, an increase in local redox stability, or a reduction 271 of global redox heterogeneity, are not clear. Increasing oxygen levels have been proposed to 272 result in an increase in overall biodiversity, the rise of new, more metabolically-demanding 273 traits such as motility and skeletonisation, or the formation of more complex food webs and 274 ecosystems (23). Increasing areal occupation of seafloor, or changes in biogeography as 275 habitable settings expanded and connected, may also be expected. Globally expansive anoxia 276 is expressed locally as heterogeneous, poorly ventilated basins, but whether habitable shallow 277 shelf space was reduced or fragmented during past anoxic intervals is unknown. This 278 emphasises the need to integrate global and local redox proxies. Notably, integrated 279 geochemical and biotic data show that diverse Cambrian communities were established under 280 dynamic redox conditions in oxic refugia (76), essentially under similar conditions to far 281 lower diversity, terminal Ediacaran ecosystems. Hence, the relationship between the 282 evolution of metazoan ecosystems and increasing atmospheric oxygen and redox stability 283 appears far more complex than direct, linear, cause and effect.

284 It is possible that fluctuations in redox may, in fact, reinforce rather than hinder 285 evolutionary transitions, with variability in near-surface oceanic oxygenation promoting 286 morphological evolution and novelty (19). Several major radiations, including across the 287 Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary, the GOBE, and the mid-late Triassic, follow intervals of 288 protracted or dynamic shallow marine anoxia. These dynamic conditions may have created 289 opportunities for the generation of evolutionary novelty in soft-bodied benthos, which then 290 provided ancestral stock for subsequent skeletonized lineages once oxic conditions became 291 widespread, connected, and stable (19).

292 The period of globally expanded anoxia at ~ 551 Ma has been proposed to coincide with a 293 reduction in diversity of the Ediacaran macrobiota as manifest in the depauperate Nama 294 Assemblage (41). But data from the Nama Group, Namibia, show that the transition towards 295 globally widespread anoxic conditions post-dates the first appearance of both the skeletal and 296 soft-bodied fauna of the Nama Assemblage, demonstrating that this expansion did not 297 coincide with the decline of the Ediacaran biota (43). This expansion may rather reflect a 298 geochemical response to an ecological innovation or change (15,43). We note that the 299 diversification of ichnofossils in Namibia, and the appearance of organic-walled tubular taxa, 300 broadly coincides with the subsequent reduction of global anoxic seafloor conditions. 301 New lineages of crown-group bilaterians appear after Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary 302 anoxia at ~540 Ma, and again after an interval of anoxia at ~520 Ma (50). After this, we see 303 two phases of radiation separated by the Sinsk Event extinction (73). The first is dominated 304 by non-bilaterian and bilaterian stem groups from ~542–513 Ma, and the second is marked 305 by radiating non-bilaterian and bilaterian crown group species from ~513 through to the 306 Ordovician radiation. This second radiation may have been interrupted by the late Cambrian 307 SPICE anoxic event (35), coincident with a negative carbon isotope excursion, which marked 308 a further minor extinction, but also ushered in the GOBE (Figure 1). We thus postulate that 309 waves of metazoan innovation immediately followed intervals of dynamic redox conditions 310 (following the model of 19), throughout the Ediacaran to Ordovician periods.

311

# 312 Understanding ecology and redox at the local scale: evidence for biotic replacement?

The apparent drop in biodiversity between the comparatively diverse White Sea Assemblage and the Nama Assemblage, and the disappearance of Ediacaran soft-bodied macrobiota at the end of the Ediacaran has been suggested to have been mediated by increasing competition and predation following the rise of bilaterian or crown-group animals.

317 The rise of bioturbation, predation, biomineralisation and grazing by bilaterians may also 318 have perturbed sediment stability and reduced the availability of Dissolved Organic Carbon 319 (DOC): the so-called 'biotic replacement' model, involving ecosystem engineering (84-86). 320 Multiple bedding surfaces in late Ediacaran successions from Australia, China and Russia 321 (Figures 2a, b) demonstrate co-occurrence of prominent horizontal burrows, such as Lamonte 322 and Helminthoidichnites, with mobile soft-bodied taxa, such as Yorgia and Dickinsonia, and 323 tubular and frondose macro-organisms (65,66,87). Many such occurrences can be reasonably 324 assumed to record contemporary communities. Such co-existence continues into the earliest 325 Cambrian, where relatively large trace fossils, such as *Treptichnus*, are found alongside 326 putative Swartpuntia-like impressions in the earliest Cambrian Stage 3 (Figure 2c). We see 327 no evidence of direct competitive replacement, but rather of probable sustained co-existence, 328 in both shallow marine carbonate and siliciclastic settings.

For biotic replacement to occur, taxa must be both spatially co-located and have similar resource requirements, yet spatial analyses of contemporary communities find only very limited instances of resource competition. Integrated sedimentological and redox models for key fossiliferous Ediacaran successions in Avalonia (Newfoundland), south Australia, western Russia, the Yangtze Block (South China) and Namibia reveal the diversity of settings occupied by early metazoans (Figure 3).

335 The Drook to Renews Head formations of western Avalonia, eastern Newfoundland

336 (~571–566 Ma), represent the Avalon Assemblage (Figure 3a) and were deposited in deep

337 marine environments (e.g. 88). Benthic colonisation, mainly by sessile, frondose

338 rangeomorphs, occurs after the appearance of stable oxic conditions (53,81). The biota from

the Ediacara Member, South Australia (~560–550 Ma), represents the shallow marine White

340 Sea Assemblage (Figure 3b; based on data in 89), which hosts rangeomorphs, soft-bodied

341 motile taxa such as *Kimberella* (89) and *Dickinsonia* and trace fossils (62). The broadly

342 coeval White Sea region of western Russia (Figure 3c) shows distinct facies-based soft-343 bodied assemblages, with Charnia communities in deeper settings and shallower, pro-deltaic 344 White Sea and Nama-like Assemblages (56). Both assemblages suggest occupation of at least 345 intermittently oxic settings permissible for life habits, potentially with relatively high 346 metabolic oxygen demands (90). The Dengying Formation, China (~551-541 Ma), shows 347 persistent and long-lasting redox stratification, with deep ferruginous waters commonly 348 encroaching onto the shallow platform (e.g.12). The highly fossiliferous shallow marine 349 bituminous Shibantan Member (Figure 3d) bears soft-bodied frond-like taxa, tubular forms, 350 vendotaenids and trace fossils, as well as biota characteristic of the Avalon and Nama 351 Assemblages (65,66,91), and shows intermittent ventilation during storm events (92,93). By 352 contrast, the time-equivalent mixed carbonate and siliciclastic deposits of the Gaojiashan 353 Member of the Dengying Formation record a very different assemblage, dominated by 354 tubular skeletonising forms including Cloudina and Sinotubulites, and non-biomineralised 355 tubular Gaojiashania, Conotubus and Shaanxilithes (94-97). These communities likewise 356 grew under intermittently well-ventilated conditions, but with incursions of anoxia (98). 357 Finally, the mixed siliciclastic and carbonate deposits of the uppermost Nama Group, 358 southern Namibia (Figure 3e), were deposited in a predominantly offshore, storm-dominated 359 shelf environment from ~542–540 Ma (99). These contain the complex trace fossils 360 Streptichnus narbonnei, in addition to soft-bodied macrofossils (86,100). Thinly bedded 361 limestone units recording deposition during highstands host skeletal Namacalathus and 362 *Cloudina*. Palaeoredox conditions are interpreted as dominantly stable and oxic (80,86). 363 These analyses show an increase in morphological and ecological complexity through 364 time, critically with an increase in the co-existence of taxa, particularly trace-makers. Organic 365 tubular and trace fossil taxa co-occur locally, and indeed over millions of years (supporting 4 366 and 8, but *contra* 17). However, where soft-bodied and skeletal biotas co-existed, they

367 predominantly occupied different parts of basins. For example, taxa such as *Cloudina* and 368 *Namacalathus* occupied carbonate sedimentary settings, with pre-existing clades (such as 369 rangeomorphs) generally found in siliciclastic settings. This is noteworthy, since in mixed 370 sedimentary successions clastics dominate transgressive systems tracts, but carbonates 371 dominate highstand systems tracts.

372

#### 373 Changes in seawater chemistry and the rise of biomineralisation

374 The global onset of widespread calcareous biomineralisation at ~550 Ma, probably in 375 low latitudes with supersaturated waters with respect to calcium carbonate (101), may 376 suggest the operation of an extrinsic trigger. Terminal Ediacaran to Cambrian putative 377 metazoan skeletal taxa are morphologically and mineralogically diverse, showing 378 independent acquisition of skeletons in diverse taxonomic groups (102). Many share the 379 inferred presence of a precursor organic skeleton, and possess apparently simple 380 microstructures (101), including the first putative poriferans (103). Some skeletal taxa known 381 from carbonate successions appear to have non-skeletal, organic-walled counterparts in 382 siliciclastic facies e.g. Cloudina-Conotubus; Sinotubulites-Corumbella; and Protolagena-383 Sicylagena (104). Early metazoan skeletal clades commonly co-opted carbonate minerals in 384 concert with ambient ocean chemistry, potentially driven by inferred changing seawater 385 Mg/Ca ratios (105). Fluid inclusion data, models, and early marine cements all suggest that 386 seawater Mg/Ca progressively lowered during the Ediacaran to early Cambrian (106,107). 387 The first skeletal macrofossils coincide with the appearance of widespread high-Mg calcite 388 and/or aragonite early marine cements, implying that calcareous biomineralisation may have 389 been facilitated by increased relative calcium concentrations (e.g. 106).

390

391

392

### 3. Were the Ediacaran and Cambrian biotas distinct?

393 Arguments for mass extinction and ecological replacement across the Ediacaran to 394 Cambrian transition have emphasised taxonomic and ecological differences between the 395 Ediacaran and Cambrian biotas (85). For example, typical Ediacaran and Cambrian trace 396 fossils are claimed to be distinct in size and complexity. While most soft-bodied Ediacaran 397 taxa and some skeletal taxa are lost, the gaps and biases in the record, and the absence of 398 sufficient chronostratigraphic control, preclude definitive statements as to gradual or rapid 399 rates of decline, but do nonetheless support phases of faunal turnover (Figure 4). 400 Potential evidence for a mass extinction at the Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary requires 401 establishing the presence of a severe and global environmental perturbation that is 402 synchronous with a rapid reduction in biodiversity (8). The BACE has been suggested to 403 mark a major perturbation coincident with the mass extinction of soft-bodied macrobiota, but 404 an absence of dateable beds has hampered the construction of sufficiently high resolution 405 correlation schemes to establish global synchronicity of this event (see reviews of 8,9,85). 406 Likewise, frequent unconformities across the Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary at many important fossiliferous sections make this hypothesis difficult to test (see Supplementary Fig. 407 408 1). A literal reading of the record shows the main decrease in soft-bodied benthic 409 biodiversity to have occurred ~5–10 Myr prior to the Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary (3,85). 410 Indeed, despite the abundance of lagerstätten, the current inventory does not provide a 411 continuous record through the interval, and there is also a notable dearth of precisely dated 412 assemblages at and around the Ediacaran-Cambrian boundary. Widespread development of 413 shallow marine anoxia coincident with the BACE would suggest a potential agent for mass 414 extinction, but the mechanisms driving the BACE are poorly known (8). We suggest that 415 such an anoxic episode would appear to be just one of several similar, both preceding and 416 succeeding, redox perturbations.

417

### 418 A case for successive, transitional assemblages

419 At a local scale, Ediacaran biotas can be highly variable and can differ dramatically 420 within successive beds (e.g. 108,109). This community heterogeneity suggests high beta 421 (between community) diversity, suggesting that the representativeness of palaeobiological 422 information may be restricted. In contrast, global, long-term biotic patterns in diversity across 423 this interval have been considered to be tractable, and have statistical support (8,58). 424 Age ranges of key fossil genera, and the minimum ages implied by higher phylogenetic 425 relationships, indicate temporal overlap between taxa typically perceived as 'Ediacaran' or 426 'Cambrian' (Figure 4). First, examples of organisms at least superficially similar to the 427 Ediacaran macro-organism Swartpuntia are known in the Cambrian (110,111), and putative 428 links have been made between frondose Cambrian forms and Ediacaran rangeomorphs (112-429 114). In addition, there are documented late Ediacaran occurrences of complex treptichnid 430 trace fossils, some of which have been convincingly attributed to bilaterian priapulid worms 431 (e.g. 110). 432 Secondly, high-resolution carbon isotope chemostratigraphy and biostratigraphy for a 433 terminal Ediacaran to Cambrian succession on the eastern Siberian Platform show the 434 presence of a succession of diverse fossil assemblages before the start of the BACE (6). Here, 435 a mixed Ediacaran and Cambrian skeletal biota (*Cloudina, Anabarites, Cambrotubulus*)

436 appears in limestones within the EPIP (Figures 2d,e). The co-occurrence of cloudinids with

437 various other skeletal species, representing a number of diverse clades of early Cambrian

- 438 aspect, has also been documented elsewhere in Siberia, South China, and Kazakhstan
- 439 (6,115,116). The agglutinated fossils *Platysolenites* and *Spirosolenites*, which occur globally
- 440 in the Cambrian (117), also co-occur with 'Ediacaran' Cloudina, Vendotaenia, and

441 Namacalathus on the Western Siberian Platform (118). There is, therefore, evidence for 442 considerable diversification of characteristic Cambrian-type skeletal taxa prior to the BACE. 443 Thirdly, trace fossils made by mobile burrowing bilaterians first appear in the latest 444 Ediacaran and continue as identical traces into the Cambrian (e.g. Helminthoidichnites, 445 Archaeonassa). Although their trace makers are unknown and may have changed over time, 446 the continuity of these traces suggests that at least some behaviours of soft-bodied denizens 447 of the latest Ediacaran, and therefore potentially some of the higher-level taxonomic groups 448 to which they belong, continued across the boundary (4,119) (Figure 4). 449 These integrated data show that taxa attributed to so-called Ediacaran and earliest 450 Cambrian skeletal biotas overlap in some localities, without notable biotic turnover. In 451 addition, there may be a close relationship between organic-walled and skeletal tubular taxa 452 (104), further supporting a transitional assemblage acquiring skeletonisation in permissive 453 settings. Extrapolation of radiometric dating from South China (120), the northern Siberian 454 Platform (121), and Oman (122), constrains this transitional skeletal biota to ~545–540 Ma. 455 Rather than distinct Ediacaran and Cambrian biotas, we here make a case for a succession 456 of taxonomically distinct biotas or assemblages (Figure 4b–d), each of which is marked by 457 the appearance of new biological traits and ecological strategies, and which were to a greater 458 or lesser extent governed by facies. First, the Avalon (~571-557 Ma), White Sea (~560-551 459 Ma), and Nama (~555–541 Ma) assemblages (57,58), with frond-dominated Avalonian 460 assemblages later embellished by a 'second wave' (3) of Ediacaran diversification in the 461 White Sea Assemblage. The White Sea Assemblage documents increased diversity and 462 taxonomic disparity of macroscopic soft-bodied organisms, including the first motile 463 bilaterians and trace fossil makers (although we note the global dearth of shallow marine 464 facies coeval with the Avalon Assemblage). By contrast, latest Ediacaran successions from 465 Namibia, Paraguay, Brazil, USA, Siberia and China document lower diversity assemblages of

soft-bodied taxa, but two distinct new body plans also appear: organic-walled tubular taxa in
shallow marine clastic settings, and biomineralising tubular taxa in previously largely
unoccupied shallow marine carbonate environments (17,32,35). After the Ediacaran–
Cambrian boundary we see a radiation of probable stem group members of bilaterian phyla
and non-bilaterians, and then a second radiation of inferred crown group members of
bilaterian phyla, which continue to diversify in the GOBE (73).

As noted in the distribution of Phanerozoic Evolutionary Faunas (EF; Figure 4), the boundaries between these assemblages are not defined by complete replacement of one EF by the next, but rather by the rise to ecological dominance of groups whose origins predate that rise (8).

476

### 477 **4.** Conclusions

478 The Ediacaran-Cambrian palaeontological and geochemical records reveal a progressive 479 addition of biological novelty of form and process, and complexity within the Metazoa. 480 Highly heterogeneous and fluctuating redox conditions throughout the late Ediacaran to early 481 Palaeozoic interval, with successive but temporary expansions of oxic seafloor and possibly 482 changing availability of phosphorous and nitrogen, facilitated the transition from low oxygen 483 Proterozoic oceans to more extensively oxygenated Phanerozoic oceans, and the rise of 484 modern biogeochemical cycles. This geochemical instability may have driven pulses of 485 evolutionary innovation, but biotic feedbacks are poorly understood. Ecological and 486 evolutionary responses to this instability could have wide reaching implications for 487 discussions of gradualistic versus punctuated evolution. 488 We argue that the record can be considered as a succession of assemblages, with the

489 establishment of Cambrian crown-group animal ecosystems built on several successive
490 Ediacaran advances as well as environmental and biotic feedbacks. The oldest record of

491 Ediacara-type macrofossils appears to be dominated by probable non-bilaterian metazoans, 492 with bilaterian metazoans appearing by ~560 Ma. A reduction in diversity occurs at ~551 Ma 493 and this is closely followed by the appearance of the first biomineralised taxa, but a well-494 documented expansion of seafloor anoxia postdates these events. Bilaterians, including 495 predators, diversify after an episode of widespread anoxia at the Ediacaran-Cambrian 496 boundary, immediately succeeded by an inferred 'oceanic oxygenation event' at ~540 Ma. 497 Inferred stem group poriferans, molluscs, and brachiopods were seemingly devastated by the 498 early Cambrian Sinsk anoxic event (~513 Ma), in contrast to inferred crown group bilaterian 499 phyla whose diversification continues through to the GOBE. 500 There is currently no compelling evidence for either significant competitive replacement, 501 or biotic replacement, from the latest Ediacaran to Cambrian. Indeed, we conclude that a 502 discrete "Cambrian Explosion" event is difficult to isolate temporarily or indeed define. The 503 rise of early metazoans can be more simply and holistically recast as a series of successive, 504 transitional radiation events, perhaps mediated via complex environmental change, which 505 extended from the Ediacaran and continued to the early Palaeozoic. 506 507 Author Contributions: All authors were involved in conceiving the work. FB, AL, JHC, 508 EGM, CGK, FD and AP collated data for figures. RW co-ordinated the work, and all authors 509 wrote the paper.

510

511 **Competing Interests statement**: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

512

513 Materials & Correspondence. Please address all correspondence and material requests to
514 <u>Rachel.Wood@ed.ac.uk</u>.

515

- 516 Acknowledgements. This work was funded by the following Natural Environment Research
- 517 Council (NERC) Grants: NE/P013643/1 (BETR Collaboration Grant to RW and AL),
- 518 NE/L002558/1 (E3 DTP studentship to FB), NE/L002434/1 (GW4+ DTP studentship to FD),
- 519 NE/L011409/2 (Independent Research Fellowship to AL), NE/P002412/1 (EGM),
- 520 NEE3849S (NERC-BGS project support to PRW). Also a Leverhulme Early Career
- 521 Fellowship and Isaac Newton Trust Early Career Fellowship to CGK; a Henslow Research
- 522 Fellowship from Cambridge Philosophical Society to EGM; School of GeoSciences
- 523 studentship to AP. We thank the Editor and referees for their valuable input.
- 524
- 525

# 526 **References**

527 Erwin D.H. & Valentine J.W. The Cambrian Explosion: The Construction of Animal 1. 528 Biodiversity. Roberts and Company Publishers Inc. (2013). 529 2. dos Reis, M. et al. Uncertainty in the timing of origin of animals and the limits of 530 precision in molecular timescales. Current Biology 25, 2939–2950 (2015). 531 Droser, M.L., Tarhan, L.G. & Gehling, J.G. The rise of animals in a changing 3. environment: global ecological innovation in the late Ediacaran. Annual Review of 532 533 Earth and Planetary Sciences 45, 593-617 (2017). 534 Budd, G.E. & Jensen, S. The origin of the animals and a 'Savannah' hypothesis for 4. early bilaterian evolution. *Biological Reviews* 92, 446–473 (2017). 535 536 Budd, G.E. The Cambrian Fossil Record and the Origin of the Phyla. Integrative and 5. 537 *Comparative Biology* **43**(1), 157-165 (2003). 538 6. Zhu, M., Zhuravlev, A.Yu., Wood, R., Zhao, F. & Sukhov, S.S. A deep root for the 539 Cambrian Explosion: implications of new bio- and chemostratigraphy from the 540 Siberian Platform. Geology 45, 459-462 (2016). 541 Darroch, S.A.F., Smith, E.F., Laflamme, M. & Erwin, D.H. Ediacaran Extinction and 7. 542 Cambrian Explosion. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution* **33**(9), 653-663 (2018). 543 8. Tarhan, L.G., Droser, M.L., Cole, D.B. & Gehling, J.G. Ecological Expansion and 544 Extinction in the Late Ediacaran: Weighing the Evidence for Environmental and 545 Biotic Drivers. Integrative and Comparative Biology, icy020 (2018). 546 9. Tarhan, L.G. The early Paleozoic development of bioturbation - Evolutionary and 547 geobiological consequences. Earth-Science Reviews 178, 177-207 (2018). Servais, T., Owen, A.W., Harper, D.A.T., Kröger, B. & Munnecke, A. The Great 548 10. 549 Ordovician Biodiversification Event (GOBE): The palaeoecological dimension. 550 Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 294, 99-119 (2010). Zhuravlev, A.Y. & Wood, R.A. Anoxia as the cause of the mid-Early Cambrian 551 11. 552 (Botomian) extinction event. Geology 24(4), 311-314 (1996). 553 Canfield, D.E. & Farquhar, J. Animal evolution, bioturbation, and the sulfate concentration of 12. 554 the oceans. PNAS 106 (20), 8123-8127 (2009). 555 Li, C. et al. Ediacaran Marine Redox Heterogeneity and Early Animal Ecosystems. 13. 556 Scientific Reports 5, 17097 (2015).

- Tostevin, R. et al. Low-oxygen waters limited habitable space for early animals. *Nature Communications* 7, 12818 (2016).
- Lenton, T.M. & Daines, S.J. The effects of marine eukaryote evolution on
   phosphorus, carbon and oxygen cycling across the Proterozoic-Phanerozoic transition.
   *Emerging Topics in Life Sciences*, ETLS20170156 (2018).
- van de Velde, S., Mills, B.J.W., Meysman, F.J.R., Lenton, T.M. & Poulton, S.W.
  Early Palaeozoic ocean anoxia and global warming driven by the evolution of shallow
  burrowing. *Nature Communications* 9(2554), 1-10 (2018).
- 56517.Schiffbauer, J.D. et al. The latest Ediacaran Wormworld fauna: setting the ecological566stage for the Cambrian Explosion. GSA Today 26(11), 4-11 (2016).
- 567 18. Butterfield, N.J. Oxygen, animals and oceanic ventilation: an alternative view.
  568 *Geobiology* 7, 1–7 (2009).
- 569 19. Wood, R., & Erwin, D.H. Innovation not recovery: dynamic redox promotes
  570 metazoan radiations. *Biological Reviews* 93(2), 863-873 (2017).
- 571 20. Sperling, E.A. & Stockey, R.G. The temporal and environmental context of early
  572 animal evolution: considering all the ingredients of an 'explosion'. *Integrative and*573 *Comparative Biology*, icy088 (2018).
- Planavsky, N.J. et al. Late Proterozoic transitions in climate, oxygen, and tectonics,
  and the rise of complex life. *Earth-life transitions: paleobiology in the context of Earth system evolution* 21, 1–36 (2015).
- 577 22. Grotzinger, J.P., Fike, D.A. & Fischer, W.W. Enigmatic origin of the largest-known
  578 carbon isotope excursion in Earth's history. *Nature Geoscience* 4, 285-292 (2011).
- 579 23. Sperling, E.A. et al. Oxygen, ecology, and the Cambrian radiation of animals. *PNAS*580 110, 13446–51 (2013).
- 581 24. Cloud, P.E. Jr. Atmospheric and hydrospheric evolution on the primitive Earth. Both
  582 secular accretion and biological and geochemical processes have affected earth's
  583 volatile envelope. *Science* 160(3829), 729–736 (1968).
- 584 25. Knoll, A.H. & Sperling, E.A. Oxygen and animals in Earth History. *PNAS* 111(11), 3907-3908 (2014).
- Lenton, T.M., Boyle, R.A., Poulton, S.W., Shields-Zhou, G.A. & Butterfield, N.J. Coevolution of eukaryotes and ocean oxygenation in the Neoproterozoic era. *Nature Geoscience* 7, 257–265 (2014).
- 589 27. Sperling, E.A., Wolock, C.J., Morgan, A.S., Gill, B.C., Kunzmann, M., Halverson,
  590 G.P., Macdonald, F.A., Knoll, A.H. & Johnston, D.T. Statistical analysis of iron
  591 geochemical data suggests limited late Proterozoic oxygenation. *Nature* 523, 451–454
  592 (2015).
- 59328.Amthor, J.E. et al. Extinction of *Cloudina* and *Namacalathus* at the Precambrian-594Cambrian boundary in Oman. *Geology* **31**, 431–434 (2003).
- 59529.Zhu, M., Babcock, L.E. & Peng, S.-C. Advances in Cambrian stratigraphy and596paleontology: Integrating correlation techniques, paleobiology, taphonomy and597paleoenvironmental reconstruction. *Palaeoworld* 15, 217–222 (2006).
- 30. Zhu, M., Zhang, J. & Yang, A. Integrated Ediacaran (Sinian) chronostratigraphy of
  South China. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 254, 7–61 (2007).
- Steiner, M., Qian, Y. & Jiang, Z.-W. Early
  Cambrian stratigraphy of east Yunnan, southwestern China: A synthesis. *Acta Palaeontologica Sinica*, 40 4–39 (2001).
- 60332.Smith, E.F. et al. The end of the Ediacaran: Two new exceptionally preserved body604fossil assemblages from Mount Dunfee, Nevada, USA. *Geology* 44 911–914 (2016).
- 60533.Zhu, M. & Li, X.-H. Introduction: from Snowball Earth to Cambrian explosion-606evidence from China. Geological Magazine 154, 1187–1192 (2017).

- Ahn, S.Y. & Zhu, M. Lowermost Cambrian acritarchs from the Yanjiahe Formation,
  South China: implication for defining the base of the Cambrian in the Yangtze
  Platform. *Geological Magazine* 154, 1217–1231 (2017).
- 610 35. Woods, M.A., Wilby, P.R., Leng, M.J., Rushton, A.W. & Williams, M. The
  611 Furongian (late Cambrian) Steptoean Positive Carbon Isotope Excursion (SPICE) in
  612 Avalonia. *Journal of the Geological Society, London* 164, 851–862 (2011).
- 613 36. Saltzman, M.R., Edwards, C.T., Adrain, J.M. & Westrop, S.R. Persistent oceanic
  614 anoxia and elevated extinction rates separate the Cambrian and Ordovician radiations.
  615 *Geology* 43, 807–810 (2015).
- 616 37. Boyle, R.A., Dahl, T.W., Bjerrum, C.J. & Canfield, D.E. Bioturbation and
  617 directionality in Earth's carbon isotope record across the Neoproterozoic-Cambrian
  618 transition. *Geobiology* 16(3), 252-278 (2018).
- 619 38. Shields, G.A. & Mills, B.J.W. Tectonic controls on the long-term carbon isotope mass
  620 balance. *PNAS* 114(17), 4318-4323 (2017).
- 39. Pogge von Strandmann, P.A.E., Stueken, E.E., Elliott, T., Poulton, S.W., Dehler,
  622 C.M., Canfield, D.E. & Catling, D.C. Selenium isotope evidence for progressive
- 623 oxidation of the Neoproterozoic biosphere. *Nature Communications* **6**, 10157 (2015).
- 624 40. Sahoo, S.K. et al. Oceanic oxygenation events in the anoxic Ediacaran ocean.
  625 *Geobiology* 14, 457–468 (2016).
- 41. Zhang, F., Xiao, S., Kendall, B., Romaniello, S.J., Cui, H., Meyer, M., Gilleaudeau,
  G.J., Kaufman, A.J. & Anbar, A.D. Extensive marine anoxia during the terminal
  Ediacaran Period. *Science Advances* 4, eaan8983 (2018).
- 42. Wen, H. et al. Molybdenum isotopic records across the Precambrian-Cambrian boundary. *Geology* 39, 775–778 (2011).
- 43. Tostevin, R., Clarkson, M.O., Gangl, S., Shields, G.A, Wood, R.A., Bowyer, F.,
  Penny, A.M. & Stirling, C.H.Uranium isotope evidence for an expansion of anoxia in
- 633 terminal Ediacaran oceans. *Earth Planetary Science Letters* **506**, 104–112 (2018).
- Kimura, H. & Watanabe, Y. Oceanic anoxia at the Precambrian-Cambrian boundary. *Geology* 29, 995–998 (2001).
- Wille, M., Nagler, T.F., Lehmann, B., Schroder, S. & Kramers, J.D. Hydrogen
  sulphide release to surface waters at the Precambrian/Cambrian boundary. *Nature* **453**, 767–769 (2008).
- 639 46. Tostevin, R., He, T., Turchyn, A.V., Wood, R.A., Penny, A.M., Bowyer, F., Antler,
  640 G. & Shields, G.A. Constraints on the late Ediacaran sulfur cycle from carbonate
  641 associated sulfate. *Precambrian Research* 230, 113–125 (2017).
- Kendall, B. et al. Uranium and molybdenum isotope evidence for an episode of
  widespread ocean oxygenation during the late Ediacaran Period. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 156, 173–193 (2015).
- 48. Wang, D., Ling, H.F., Struck, U., Zhu, X.-K., Zhu, M., He, T., Yang, B., Gamper, A.
  & Shields, G.A. Coupling of ocean redox and animal evolution during the EdiacaranCambrian transition. *Nature Communications* 9, 2575 (2018).
- 648 49. Chen, X., Ling, H.-F., Vance, D., Shields-Zhou, G.A., Zhu, M., Poulton, S.W., Och,
  649 L.M., Jiang, S.-Y., Li, D., Cremonese, L. & Archer, C. Rise to modern levels of ocean
  650 oxygenation coincided with the Cambrian radiation of animals. *Nature*651 *Communications* 6, 7142 (2015).
- 50. Wei, G.-Y., Planavsky, N.J., Tarhan, L.G., Chen, X., Wei, W., Li, D. and Ling, H.-F.
  Marine redox fluctuation as a potential trigger for the Cambrian explosion. *Geology*46(7), 587-590 (2018).
- 65551.Dahl, T.W. et al. Devonian rise in atmospheric oxygen correlated to the radiations of656terrestrial plants and large predatory fish. PNAS 107, 17911–17915 (2010).

- 52. Narbonne, G.M. and Gehling, J.G. Life after snowball: The oldest complex Ediacaran fossils. *Geology* 31, 27-30 (2003).
- 53. Pu, J.P. et al., Dodging snowballs: geochronology of the Gaskiers glaciation and the
  first appearance of the Ediacaran biota. *Geology* 44, 955–958 (2016).
- 54. Dunn, F.S., Liu, A.G. & Donoghue, P.C. Ediacaran developmental biology. *Biological Reviews* 93, 914–932 (2018).
- 55. Dececchi, T.A., Narbonne, G.M., Greentree, C. & Laflamme, M. Relating Ediacaran
  fronds. *Paleobiology* 43, 171–180 (2017).
- 665 56. Grazhdankin, D. Patterns of distribution in the Ediacaran biotas: facies versus biogeography and evolution. *Paleobiology* **30**, 203–221 (2004).
- 57. Waggoner, B. Biogeographic analyses of the Ediacara biota: a conflict with
  paleotectonic reconstructions. *Paleobiology* 25, 440–458 (1999).
- 58. Boag, T.H., Darroch, S.A.F. & Laflamme, M. Ediacaran distributions in space and
  time: testing assemblage concepts of earliest macroscopic body fossils. *Paleobiology*42, 574–594 (2016).
- 59. Liu, A.G., Matthews, J.J., Menon, L.R., McIlroy, D. & Brasier, M.D. *Haootia quadriformis* n. gen., n. sp., interpreted as a muscular cnidarian impression from the
  Late Ediacaran period (approx. 560 Ma). *Proceedings of the Royal Society B* 281,
  20141202 (2014).
- 676 60. Ivantsov, A.Y. Feeding traces of Proarticulata the Vendian Metazoa.
  677 *Paleontological Journal* 45, 237-248 (2011).
- 678 61. Bobrovskiy, I., Hope, J.M., Ivantsov, A., Nettersheim, B.J., Hallmann, C. & Brocks,
  679 J.J. Ancient steroids establish the Ediacaran fossil *Dickinsonia* as one of the earliest
  680 animals. *Science* 361, 1246–1249 (2018).
- 681 62. Jensen, S., Droser, M.L. & Gehling, J.G. A critical look at the Ediacaran trace fossil
  682 record. In *Neoproterozoic geobiology and paleobiology*, pp. 115–157. Springer
  683 Netherlands (2006).
- 684
  63. Liu, A.G., Mcllroy, D. & Brasier, M.D. First evidence for locomotion in the Ediacara
  biota from the 565 Ma Mistaken Point Formation, Newfoundland. *Geology* 38, 123–
  686
  126 (2010).
- 687 64. Carbone, C.A. & Narbonne, G.M. When Life Got Smart: The Evolution of Behavioral
  688 Complexity Through the Ediacaran and Early Cambrian of NW Canada. *Journal of*689 *Paleontology* 88, 309–330 (2014).
- 690 65. Chen, Z., Zhou, C., Meyer, M., Xiang, K., Schiffbauer, J.D., Yuan, X. & Xiao, S.
  691 Trace fossil evidence for Ediacaran bilaterian animals with complex behaviors.
  692 *Precambrian Research* 224, 690–701 (2013).
- 693 66. Chen, Z., Chen, X., Zhou, C., Yuan, X. & Xiao, S. Late Ediacaran trackways
  694 produced by bilaterian animals with paired appendages. *Science Advances* 4(6),
  695 eaao6691 (2018).
- 696 67. Buatois, L.A. & Mángano, M.G. Ediacaran Ecosystems and the Dawn of Animals, *In*:
  697 M.G. Mángano, L.A. Buatois (eds.), The Trace-Fossil Record of Major Evolutionary
  698 Events, *Topics in Geobiology* 39, 27–72 (2016).
- 69968.Bengtson, S. & Zhao, Y. Predatorial borings in late Precambrian mineralized700exoskeletons. Science 257, 367–369 (1992).
- 69. Germs, G.J.B. New shelly fossils from the Nama Group, South West Africa.
  702 American Journal of Science 272, 752–761 (1972).
- 703 70. Penny, A.M. et al. Ediacaran metazoan reefs from the Nama Group, Namibia. *Science*704 344, 1504–1506 (2014).
- 705 71. Mehra, A. & Maloof, A. Multiscale approach reveals that *Cloudina* aggregates are detritus and not *in situ* reef constructions. *PNAS* 115, 201719911 (2018).

707	72.	Landing, E. Precambrian-Cambrian boundary global stratotype ratified and a new
/08	72	perspective of Cambrian time. Geology 22, $1/9-182$ (1994).
/09	/3.	Zhuravlev, A.Y. & Wood, R.A. The two phases of the Cambrian Explosion. Scientific
710		<i>Reports</i> 8, 16656 (2018).
711	74.	Bengtson, S. Origins and early evolution of predation. <i>Paleontological Society Papers</i>
712		<b>8</b> , 289–318 (2002).
713	75.	Bowyer, F., Wood, R.A. & Poulton, S.W. Controls on the evolution of Educaran
714		metazoan ecosystems: A redox perspective. <i>Geobiology</i> <b>15</b> , 516–551 (2017).
715	76.	Hammarlund, E.U., Gaines, R.R., Prokopenkoc, M.G., Qid, C., Houd, X-G. &
716		Canfield, D.E. Early Cambrian oxygen minimum zone-like conditions at Chengjiang.
717		<i>EPSL</i> <b>475</b> , 160–168 (2017).
718	77.	Guilbaud, R., Slater, B.J., Poulton, S.W., Harvey, T.H.P., Brocks, J.J., Nettersheim,
719		B.J. & Butterfield, N.J. Oxygen minimum zones in the early Cambrian ocean.
720		Geochemical Perspectives Letters 6, 33–38 (2018).
721	78.	Mills, D.B., Ward, L.M., Jones, C., Sweeten, B., Forth, M., Treusch, A. & Canfield,
722		D.E. Oxygen requirements of the earliest animals. PNAS 111, 4168–4172 (2014).
723	79.	Mills, D.B. et al. The last common ancestor of animals lacked the HIF pathway and
724		respired in low-oxygen environments. eLife 7, e31176 (2018).
725	80.	Wood, R.A. et al. Dynamic redox conditions control late Ediacaran ecosystems in the
726		Nama Group, Namibia. Precambrian Research 261, 252–271 (2015).
727	81.	Canfield, D.E., Poulton, S.W. & Narbonne, G.M. Late-Neoproterozoic deep-ocean
728		oxygenation and the rise of animal life. Science <b>315</b> , 92–95 (2007).
729	82.	Li, C. et al. Coupled oceanic oxygenation and metazoan diversification during the
730		early-middle Cambrian? Geology 45, 743-746 (2017).
731	83.	Zhang, J. et al. Heterogenous oceanic redox conditions through the Ediacaran-
732		Cambrian boundary limited the metazoan zonation. Scientific Reports 7, 8550 (2017).
733	84.	Muscente, A.D., Boag, T.H., Bykova, N. & Schiffbauer, J.D. Environmental
734		disturbance, resource availability, and biologic turnover at the dawn of animal life.
735		<i>Earth-Science Reviews</i> 177, 248–264 (2017).
736	85.	Laflamme, M., Darroch, S.A.F., Tweedt, S.M., Peterson, K.J. & Erwin, D.H. The end
737		of the Ediacara biota: Extinction, biotic replacement, or Cheshire Cat? Gondwana
738		Research 23(2), 558–573 (2013).
739	86.	Darroch, S.A.F. et al. Biotic replacement and mass extinction of the Ediacara biota.
740		Proceedings of the Royal Society B 282(3), 20151003 (2015).
741	87.	Gehling, J.G., & Droser, M. Ediacaran scavenging as a prelude to predation.
742		Emerging Topics in Life Sciences 2(2), 213-222 (2018).
743	88.	Wilby, P.R., Carney, J.N. & Howe, M.P. A rich Ediacaran assemblage from eastern
744		Avalonia: evidence of early widespread diversity in the deep ocean. Geology <b>39</b> , 655-
745		658 (2011).
746	89.	Gehling, J.G., & Droser, M. How well do fossil assemblages of the Ediacara Biota tell
747		time? Geology <b>41</b> (4), 447-450 (2013).
748	90.	Evans, S.D., Diamond, C.W., Droser, M.L. & Lyons, T.W. Dynamic oxygen and
749		coupled biological and ecological innovation during the second wave of the Ediacara
750		Biota. Emerging Topics in Life Sciences 2, 223-233 (2018).
751	91.	Chen, Z. et al. New Ediacara fossils preserved in marine limestone and their
752	2	ecological implications. Scientific Reports 4, 4180 (2014)
753	92	Ling, HF. et al. Cerium anomaly variations in Ediacaran-earliest Cambrian
754	<i>, .</i> .	carbonates from the Yangtze Gorges area. South China: Implications for oxygenation
755		of coeval shallow seawater <i>Precambrian Research</i> <b>225</b> 110–127 (2013)
,55		or ever an shallow bournater i recumentati (color and and and a color).

756	93.	Duda, JP., Blumenberg, M., Thiel, V., Simon, K., Zhu, M. & Reitner, J. Geobiology
757		of a palaeoecosystem with Ediacara-type fossils: The Shibantan Member (Dengying
758		Formation, South China). Precambrian Research 255, 48-62 (2014).
759	94.	Zhang, L.Y. A discovery and preliminary study of the late stage of late Gaojiashan
760		biota from Sinian in Ningqiang County, Shaanxi. Bulletin of the Xi'an Institute of
761		Geology and Mineral Resources, Chinese Academy of Geological Sciences 13, 67–88
762		(1986).
763	95.	Hua, H., Chen, Z & Yuan, X. The advent of mineralized skeletons in Neoproterozoic
764		Metazoa- new fossil evidence from the Gaojiashan Fauna. Geological Journal 42,
765		263-279 (2007).
766	96.	Xing, YS., Ding, QX., Luo, HL., He, TG. & Wang, YG. The Sinian–Cambrian
767		boundary of China. Bulletin of the Institute of Geology of the Chinese Academy,
768		Special Issue 10, 182–183 (in Chinese with English Abstract) (1984).
769	97.	Cai, Y., Schiffbauer, J.D., Hua, H. & Xiao, S. Morphology and paleoecology of the
770		late Ediacaran tubular fossil Conotubus hemiannulatus from the Gaojiashan
771		Lagerstätte of southern Shaanxi Province, South China, Precambrian Research 191,
772		46-57 (2011).
773	98.	Chen, L.Y., Chu, X.L., Zhang, X.L. & Zhai, M.G. Carbon isotopes, sulfur isotopes,
774		and trace elements of the dolomites from the Dengying Formation in Zhenba area
775		southern Shaanxi: Implications for shallow water redox conditions during the terminal
776		Ediacaran. Science China: Earth Sciences 58(7), 1107–1122 (2015).
777	99.	Saylor, B.Z. Sequence stratigraphy and carbonate-siliciclastic mixing in a terminal
778		Proterozoic foreland basin, Urusis Formation, Nama Group, Namibia. Journal of
779		Sedimentary Research <b>73</b> (2), 264–279 (2003).
780	100.	Jensen, S.M. & Runnegar B.N. A complex trace fossil from the Spitskop Member
781		(terminal Ediacaran-? Lower Cambrian) of southern Namibia. Geological Magazine
782		<b>142</b> (5), 561–569 (2005).
783	101.	Wood, R.A. Paleoecology of the earliest skeletal metazoan communities: Implications
784		for early biomineralization. <i>Earth-Science Reviews</i> <b>106</b> , 184–190 (2011).
785	102.	Murdock, D.J.E. & Donoghue, P.C.J. Evolutionary Origins of Animal Skeletal
786		Biomineralization. Cells Tissues Organs 194, 98–102. (2011).
787	103.	Wood, R. & Penny, A.M. Substrate growth dynamics and biomineralization of an
788		Ediacaran encrusting poriferan. Proceedings of the Royal Society B 285, 20171938
789		(2018).
790	104.	Wood, R., Ivantsov, A.Yu. & Zhuravlev, A.Yu. First macrobiota biomineralization
791		was environmentally triggered. Proceedings of the Royal Society B 284, 20170059
792		(2017).
793	105.	Porter, S.M. Seawater chemistry and early carbonate biomineralization. <i>Science</i> <b>316</b> ,
794	100	1302 (2007).
795	106.	Brennan, S.T., Lowenstein, T.K., & Horita, J. Seawater chemistry and the advent of
796	105	biocalcification. Geology $32$ , $4/3-4/6$ (2004).
797	107.	Wood, R., Zhuravlev, A.Yu., Sukhov, S.S., Zhu, M. & Zhao, F. Demise of Ediacaran
798		dolomitic seas marks widespread biomineralization on the Siberian Platform. <i>Geology</i>
/99	100	45, 2/-30 (2017).
800	108.	Clapham, M.E., Narbonne, G.M. & Gehling, J.G. Paleoecology of the oldest known
801		animal communities: Ediacaran assemblages at Mistaken Point, Newfoundland.
802	100	Paleoblology 29, 527-544 (2003).
803	109.	Droser, M., Genling, J. & Jensen, S. Assemblage Palaeoecology of the Ediacara
804 80 <i>5</i>		Biota: The Unabridged Edition? Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
805		Palaeoecology 232, 131–14/ (2006).

- 806 110. Jensen, S., Gehling, J.G. & Droser, M.L. Ediacara-type fossils in Cambrian
  807 sediments. *Nature* 393(6685), 567 (1998).
- 808 111. Hagadorn, J.W., Fedo, C.M. & Waggoner, B.M. Early Cambrian Ediacaran-type
  809 fossils from California. *Journal of Paleontology*, 74(4), 731–740 (2000).
- 810 112. Shu, D-G., Conway Morris, S., Han, J., Li, Y. Zhang, X.-L., Hua, H., Zhang Z.-F.,
- Liu, J.-N., Guo, J.-F. & Yasui, K. Lower Cambrian vendobionts from China and early
  diploblast evolution. *Science* 312(5774), 731–734 (2006).
- 813 113. Hoyal Cuthill, J.F. & Han, J. Cambrian petalonamid *Stromatoveris* phylogenetically
  814 links Ediacaran biota to later animals. *Palaeontology* 61, 813–823 (2018).
- 815 114. Conway Morris, S. Ediacaran-like fossils in Cambrian Burgess Shale-type faunas of
  816 North America. *Palaeontology* 36(3), 593–635 (1993).
- 817 115. Zhuravlev, A.Yu., Linan, E., Vintaned, J.A.G., Debrenne, F. & Fedorov, A.B. New
  818 finds of skeletal fossils in the terminal Neoproterozoic of the Siberian Platform and
  819 Spain. Acta Palaeontologica Polonica 57, 205–224 (2012).
- Yang, B. et al. Transitional Ediacaran–Cambrian small skeletal fossil assemblages
  from South China and Kazakhstan: implications for chronostratigraphy and metazoan
  evolution. *Precambrian Research* 285, 202–215 (2016).
- McIlroy, D., Green, O.R. & Brasier, M.D. Palaeobiology and evolution of the earliest agglutinated Foraminifera: *Platysolenites*, *Spirosolenites* and related forms. *Lethaia*34(1), 13–29 (2001).
- Kontorovich, A.E. et al. A section of Vendian in the east of West Siberian Plate
  (based on data from the Borehole Vostok 3). *Russian Geology and Geophysics* **49**(12), 932–939 (2008).
- 829 119. Budd, G. E. Early animal evolution and the origins of nervous systems. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B* 370, 20150037 (2015).
- Yang, C., Li, X.H., Zhu, M. & Condon, D.J. SIMS U–Pb zircon geochronological
  constraints on upper Ediacaran stratigraphic correlations, South China. *Geological Magazine* 154(6), 1202–1216 (2017).
- Martin, M.W., Grazhdankin, D.V., Bowring, S.A., Evans, D.A.D., Fedonkin, M.A. &
  Kirschvink, J.L. Age of Neoproterozoic bilaterian body and trace fossils, White Sea,
  Russia: implications for metazoan evolution. *Science* 288, 841–845 (2000).
- 837 122. Bowring, S.A. et al. Geochronologic constraints on the chronostratigraphic
  838 framework of the Neoproterozoic Huqf Supergroup, Sultanate of Oman. American
  839 Journal of Science 307(10), 1097–1145 (2007).
- Love, G.D. et al., Fossil steroids record the appearance of Demospongiae during the
  Cryogenian Period. *Nature* 457, 718–721 (2009).
- Brocks, J.J., Jarrett, A.J.M., Sirantoine, E., Hallmann, C., Hoshino, Y. & Liyanage, T.
  The rise of algae in Cryogenian oceans and the emergence of animals, *Nature*548(7669), 578 (2017).
- Yuan, X., Chen, Z., Xiao, S., Zhou, C. & Hua, H. An early Ediacaran assemblage of macroscopic and morphologically differentiated eukaryotes. *Nature* 470 (7334), 390– 393 (2011).
- Xiao, S., Zhang, Y. & Knoll, A.H. Three-dimensional preservation of algae and animal embryos in a Neoproterozoic phosphorite, *Nature* 391, 553–558 (1998).
- Liu. A.G., McIlroy, D., Matthews, J.J., and Brasier, M.D. A new assemblage of
  juvenile Ediacaran fronds from the Drook Formation, Newfoundland. *Journal of the Geological Society, London* 169, 395-340 (2012).
- Macdonald, F.A., Schmitz, M.D., Crowley, J.L., Roots, C.F., Jones, D.S., Maloof,
  A.C., Strauss, J.V., Cohen, P.A., Johnston, D.T. & Schrag, D.P. Calibrating the
  Cryogenian, *Science* 327, 1241–1243 (2010).

Macdonald, F.A., Strauss, J.V., Sperling, E.A., Halverson, G.P., Narbonne, G.M., 856 129. 857 Johnston, D.T., Kunzmann, M., Schrag, D.P. & Higgins, J.A. The stratigraphic 858 relationship between the Shuram carbon isotope excursion, the oxygenation of Neoproterozoic oceans, and the first appearance of the Ediacara biota and bilaterian 859 860 trace fossils in northwestern Canada. Chemical Geology 362, 250-272 (2013). 861 Canfield, D.E., Poulton, S.W., Knoll, A.H., Narbonne, G.M., Ross, G., Goldberg, T. 130. & Strauss, H. Ferruginous conditions dominated later Neoproterozoic deep-water 862 chemistry. Science 321(5891), 949-952 (2008). 863 864 865

866 Figure legends

867

868	Figure 1. Integrated geochemical and biotic record between 670 and 480 million years ago.
869	A) First appearance of major evolutionary milestones: 713–635 Ma, range of demosponge
870	biomarker (24-isopropylcholestane) (123); Minimum age for marine planktonic algae
871	(Archaeplastida) 659-645 Ma (124); 635-590 Ma, possible stem-group enidarian Lantianella
872	laevis (125), phosphatised proposed animal embryos (126); >570.95 Ma, juvenile Charnia
873	masoni (127); ~565 Ma, candidate for the earliest surface locomotion trace fossil (63); ~550
874	Ma, earliest skeletal animals, Cloudina (69) and earliest possible evidence for predation
875	(borings in <i>Cloudina</i> (68)); First appearance datum of the trace fossil <i>Treptichnus pedum</i>
876	(72); Earliest trilobite Profallotaspis jakutensis. B) Ediacaran C-isotope compilation modified
877	after (128,129), and references therein. Cambrian C-isotope profile conforms to composite
878	curve of (29) (full details provided in Supplementary Information). C) Schematic evolution
879	of redox conditions based on compiled iron speciation data (27,75,130) and proposed
880	widespread anoxic intervals and 'oceanic oxygenation events' (40,41,43,47,50). Diagonal
881	stripes indicate regional differences in redox state. Paucity of truly basinal shale deposits
882	prevents determination of the redox state of the global oceanic deep basin (indicated by white
883	question marks).

885	Figure 2. Key transitional Ediacaran and Cambrian taxa. A) Representative taxa of the
886	Avalon biota of Newfoundland, ~566 Ma, almost uniquely comprised of soft-bodied,
887	frondose members of the Ediacaran biota. B) Ediacaran Arborea with associated trace fossil,
888	Flinders Ranges, South Australia. SAM P49393. C) Corumbella, organic-walled tubular
889	fossil, latest Ediacaran Corumbá Group, SE Brazil. D) Anabarites trisulcatus, Ust'-Yudoma
890	Formation, Kyra-Ytyga River, SE Siberia. Photo credit A. Fedorov. E) Cloudina, S. China,
891	photo credit S. Xiao. F) Transitional small shelly fossil biota, SE Siberia (from (6)). G)
892	Bilobed trace fossils from the Ediacaran Dengying Fm., Wuhe, South China, occurring on
893	beds adjacent to surfaces bearing non-mineralized tubular organisms (e.g. Wutubus) and soft-
894	bodied Ediacaran macrobiota (e.g. Pteridinium and Charniodiscus). H) Cambrian
895	Swartpuntia-like moulds alongside trace-fossils including Treptichnus, Uratanna Fm.,
896	Flinders Ranges, South Australia. SAM P36399/36403. Scale bars: B) = 10 mm, G) = 20
897	mm, C) = 5 mm, D) = $300\mu$ m, E) = 1 mm, H) = 10 mm.
898	

899 Figure 3. Ediacaran ecosystem dioramas for single, conformable sequences from A) 900 Avalonia, B) Australia, C) Western Russia (White Sea Region), D) the Yangtze Block, 901 China, and E) Namibia. Each shows the distribution of contemporary biota within the local 902 sedimentological and redox setting, and the relative water depth. See SI for key to stylised 903 biota.

904

905 Figure 4. A) Temporal occurrence ranges for key soft-bodied, organic-walled,

906 biomineralised, and trace fossil Ediacaran and transitional Cambrian taxa (references in SI).

907 Minimum and maximum duration of hiatus associated with the Ediacaran/Cambrian is

908 shown. B) Key evolutionary innovations. C) Distribution and succession of transitional

909 assemblages. D) Evolutionary dynamics showing the temporal distribution of stem and crown

- 910 groups in non-bilaterians and bilaterians (73), and major anoxic events and 'oceanic
- 911 oxygenation events' (OOEs) (51,52,54,59,62). E/C = Ediacaran/Cambrian. Full details in SI.