

## Appendix 1 Literature review summary

Author and date	Methodology	Findings	Comments
Allan et al 2008	Literature study exploring leadership for learning in clinical setting, plus 10 qualitative interviews, which were thematically analysed	Leadership for learning has moved from ward sister to mentor and this presents challenges for clinical learning	High quality, clearly written UK study
Andrews and Chilton 2000	Student and mentor perceptions of mentoring effectiveness Used questionnaire, based on MMP scale,	Need clear criteria for selection of mentors  More discussion required regarding nature and purpose of mentorship, including a range of different mentorship models	Response rate good, purposive sample
Andrews and Wallis 1999	Literature review of mentorship in nursing in relation to the supervision of students in practice settings	Confusion regarding role of mentor and concept of mentorship  Problems with lack of preparation for mentors  Relationship between student and mentor key	UK focus  An old study, but many of the issues highlighted have not yet been resolved, so it remains relevant. Methodology of review not discussed.

		<p>and not everyone should be a mentor</p> <p>Mentoring team might be a better model</p> <p>Essential to have good communication between all stakeholders</p>	
Barr et al 2014	Review of interprofessional education over 16 years		High quality review undertaken by experts in the field, highlighting the need for a better understanding of interprofessional education
Bradbury-Jones et al 2007	109 descriptions of critical incidents provided by 66 students relating to empowerment and disempowerment in clinical placements. Data analysis through inductive classification and construction of a hierarchy of categories	<p>Consequences of empowerment for students include high self-esteem, motivation for learning, positive regard for placement.</p> <p>Supportive mentors are pivotal in practice learning and must be supported in their role</p> <p>Poor learning environments can cause students to leave</p>	Limitations of study – only one nursing school in Wales and many descriptions lacked depth, but these limitations are acknowledged by the authors
Bray and Nettleton 2007	Multi professional study to investigate mentee and mentor perceptions of mentorship, using questionnaires, quantitative and	<p>Role confusion over mentorship, and conflicts/tensions involved in being both teacher and assessor in practice setting</p> <p>Training and development needs of mentors</p>	Limitations of this UK study include low response rate to questionnaires and small geographical sample, but are acknowledged by authors

	qualitative data, plus interviews. Data analysed through content analysis		
Cahill 1996	Qualitative analysis of student nurses' experiences of mentorship Group discussions and individual interviews Thematic analysis	<p>Perceived importance of fitting in to ward led to them accepting less than ideal learning conditions and felt powerless to change the situation, they can be exploited</p> <p>Work has to be completed before the students' learning needs are addressed</p> <p>Mentors need good preparation and support</p> <p>Student-mentor relationship fundamental and students should be allowed to choose their mentors</p>	Small study n=16 Methodology discussed in detail – very transparent UK
Carnwell et al 2007	Qualitative study to explore managerial perceptions of mentor, lecturer practitioner and link tutor roles - 4 focus groups, participants from 3 NHS Trusts and 2 HEIs in Wales n=22 Data analysed through qualitative content	<p>A theory-practice continuum exists along which mentors, lecturer practitioners and link tutors have different positions</p> <p>Role conflicts and lack of clarity around roles</p> <p>Need new model to support students in clinical practice</p> <p>Need close collaboration between</p>	Small sample, limited geographical area in Wales

	analysis	practice and faculty	
Clemow 2007	Qualitative evaluation of process of learning through skills rehearsal (simulation). 3 focus groups, 15 students Data analysis through thematic analysis, participant checking was used and audit trail through personal diary	Skills rehearsal is challenging and enlightening  Good that they draw on real life experience and involve working collaboratively with others (paramedics) to problem solve,  Help to develop assessment skills and confidence	Although this is a small scale local study, as there is still a lack of evidence in literature about suitable pedagogies for mentorship programmes, it is very important
Congdon et al 2013	Process evaluation of the role of learning environment managers. Focus groups with key stakeholders Analysis through content analysis	Role helped to establish organisation-wide benchmarks for practice learning  Provided high level of support for mentors  Led to consistent and positive learning experiences for student	Sample size unclear and a local study in England only. Focus group topics generated by researchers
Cope et al 2000	Situated learning in practice placements explored through interviews with newly registered nurses. Random sample of 10% of 2 cohorts Data examined for emerging categories, informed by theoretical	Acceptance into community of practice is important for students  Placement learning brings together theory and practice  Explicit use of mentoring techniques derived from situated learning and cognitive apprenticeships might be beneficial e.g. modelling, scaffolding and	Undertaken in Scotland Semi-structured interviews, with pre-set questions Research methods described in detail and appears very robust and good links back to theory

	perspectives derived from situated learning	<p>coaching</p> <p>Mentors and students need to be prepared for placements with the above in mind</p>	
Courtney-Pratt et al 2011	<p>Mixed method study of quality of clinical placements from supervisor and student perspective - 2 5 point Likert Scale questionnaire, with some free text n=363</p> <p>Data analysis descriptive statistics</p> <p>Key words highlighted in free text.</p>	<p>Placements are generally regarded positively and provided opportunity for great learning for students</p> <p>Interpersonal relationships important</p> <p>Organisation of placement experience important</p>	<p>Pre-existing survey tool used targeting 4 domains of learning environment: belongingness, teaching and learning, feedback, confidence and competence</p> <p>One geographical area – Tasmania and on hospital only</p>
Crombie et al 2013	<p>Ethnographic case study to explore student attrition</p> <p>50 second year students, non participant observation, interviews and focus groups</p> <p>Thematic analysis</p>	<p>Practice placement mentors very important in terms of why students stay</p> <p>Clinical placements also key, but need to feel that they belong there</p> <p>Resilience is required by students to remain</p>	<p>Small ethnographic study from one cohort at one HEI in London, however, part of larger study</p>
Darling 1984 Darling 1985			<p>These 2 articles despite being outside the time frame for the search were included as they are perceived as being seminal</p>

			articles on mentorship and the term 'toxic mentor' is still in use today and the characteristics of a 'good mentor' are still referred to today
Del Prato 2013	Phenomenological study to look at incivility in nurse education from student perspective In depth interviews and 5 re-interviewed Symbolic interactionism guided data analysis	<b>Incivility included demeaning experiences, subjective evaluation, rigid expectations, and weeding out practices</b>  <b>The above resulted in less learning, lower self-esteem, confidence and self-efficacy in students</b>	Small scale qualitative USA study n=13, but findings very important and worrying for nursing
Duffy et al 2000	Survey of 150 mentors to investigate preparation and support for mentors	<b>Need close collaboration between university and practice</b>	Research undertaken in Scotland by expert in the study of mentorship Response rate 47% only Many actions taken following the results of the survey
Duffy 2003	Grounded theory research Identified the concept of 'failure to fail'	<b>Mentors need good preparation and support for their role</b>	Seminal research as led to introduction of NMC Standards to support learning and assessment in practice
Dunn and Hansford 1997	Mixed methods exploration of nursing students' perceptions of clinical learning environment Data collection using 5 subscales of CLES –	<b>Attitudes of staff important - warmth, keen to teach, all nurses should be involved in teaching students</b>  <b>Organisation and culture of learning environment important</b>	Students in Australia participated in clinical placement for just 1 day per week, for 8 weeks, so need to be careful with transferability to UK

	staff-student relationship, patient relationships, student satisfaction, hierarchy and ritual Interviews n=229	Need close collaboration between university and practice  Tension between patient needs and learning  Students' attitudes very important	
Earnshaw 1995	Exploration of mentorship from students' point of view	Mentor role highly regarded by students  Mentors seen as fulfilling a professional socialization role  Relationship with mentor changed over time – became more equal	N=19 pilot study Questionnaire UK
Field 2004	A literature review of learning in clinical practice	Practice educator can bring together clinical and educational worlds They can also act as coaches and help students to develop critical thinking skills	Methodology of literature review not explicit, but strong theoretical base evident – how do constructivist (Benner) and sociocultural approaches (Lave and Wenger) to learning promote nursing expertise
Foster et al 2015	Mixed methods study (online questionnaire and semi-structured focus group) to explore students' expectations and experiences of mentorship Analysis using Framework and SPSS	Mostly positive responses from students regarding teaching and assessment by individual mentors, second finding very different from other research on this topic  There needs to be closer collaboration between university and practice, with the link lecturer role needing improvement	Limitations include - one university in London only, although n=129 Convenience sampling and research conducted by lecturer known to students. Mentors views not included
Gidman et al	Mixed methods approach	Students needed support with clinical	Study funded n=174, in one HEI,

2011	(questionnaires and focus groups) to explore student perceptions of support in practice, particularly regarding student retention Quantitative data analysed with Excel, qualitative with thematic analysis	<p>skills (students often had narrow view of competence), placement situations, documentation and personal issues</p> <p>Values in mentor include personal attributes, being knowledgeable, newly qualified mentors</p> <p>Other students can be very supportive</p> <p>Students need to take responsibility for their own learning and teaching part of their role</p> <p>Need to feel part of the team</p> <p>Need collaboration between HEI and practice</p>	with placements in Cheshire and Merseyside Data collected by research assistant not lecturer
Gleeson 2008	Literature review Facilitating student nurses through a mentorship role	<p>Clinical learning environment essential for development of student attitudes, psychomotor skills, problem-solving</p> <p>Role of mentor – teacher, assessor, role model, very important</p> <p>Characteristics of mentor – friendly, knowledgeable, motivated, good communication skills, gives feedback</p> <p>Mentors need good training and support</p>	Review does not add anything new to evidence. Also mentors are referred to as preceptors - Republic of Ireland



		Need close collaboration between practice and HEI	
Gray and Smith 2000	Longitudinal qualitative study from student perspective of the qualities of an effective mentor Grounded theory Data analysed with NUD.IST, and constant comparative analysis	Identified characteristics of a good mentor Mentorship role very important to student experience Relationship between student and mentor crucial, but students do have some control over this	Seminal study of 10 students in Scotland, interviewed on 5 occasions during their 3 year training, also kept diary, 7 others kept diaries only
Grealish and Rance 2009	Study of nursing students' learning in clinical workplace 49 written narrative accounts analysed, high levels of critical reflexivity clear Thematic analysis	Dedicated Education Unit Belongingness very important – community of practice Participation in tasks in clinical setting important Challenging situations in practice can generate high levels of learning Role modelling important for learning Role of mentor less important than the community of practice	Conceptually very interesting piece of work, informed by Wenger's social theory of learning – community of practice Australian study
Hasson et al 2012	Perceptions of unregistered healthcare workers in student nurse training Sequential exploratory	Need to pay attention to expanding role of unregistered healthcare staff, as they have large part to play in student learning in practice placements, as there is a lack of boundaries between registered and	4 hospitals in Northern Ireland NHS and independent nursing home sector Very thorough piece of research

	<p>mixed method research 3 phases – interviews and focus groups (n=45) Questionnaire to student nurses (460) Semi-structured interviews (111)</p>	<p>unregistered staff, which could lead to confusion and role conflict</p>	<p>– methodologically robust and large scale</p>
<p>Hegenbarth et al 2015</p>	<p>A qualitative study - establishing and maintaining the clinical learning environment</p>	<p>Experience of clinical learning essential for students, as it consolidates knowledge and professional socialization</p> <p>Need a positive learning culture, where students feel welcome</p> <p>Students need to take some responsibility for their learning</p>	
<p>Henderson et al 2011</p>	<p>Describes a framework informed by literature, to develop a clinical learning culture in health facilities</p>	<p>Leadership, management and partnership between HEI and practice are essential for good learning environments</p> <p>Positive team dynamics essential</p>	
<p>Hood et al 2014</p>	<p>Study to explore nursing students' perceptions of learning about roles, identity and teamwork in an interprofessional clinical placement Qualitative and</p>	<p>Ward-based interprofessional clinical placements offer an ideal learning environment</p>	<p>N=23 nursing and medical students, in Australia</p>

	quantitative programme evaluation, using focus groups and student satisfaction survey Analysis using descriptive and inferential statistics and thematic analysis		
Houghton et al 2012	What factors affect implementation of students' clinical skills in practice Data collected from 43 semi-structured interviews and non participant observation Qualitative analysis - Morse	<p>Students need to be prepared for placements</p> <p>Students need to be well supported and to be allowed to practice their skills</p> <p>Students need to become part of ward team</p>	Multiple case study n=5 in Ireland Well described methodology Part of a larger study
Jinks and Williams 1994	A critical review of 19 reports that have clinical mentors as their target population in UK	Problems noted in previous mentorship research include sampling issues, small sample sizes, poor response rates, not all have ethical approval,	Clearly described methodology
Jokelainen et al 2011a	Systematic review of mentoring students in clinical placements	<p>Facilitating students' learning in clinical placements</p> <p>Supportive, well organized placements are essential</p> <p>Enabling individual learning</p>	Data collected from 23 research articles (1986-2006) Excellent methodology Part of larger Finnish – British study Nordic mentors not all necessarily trained

		<p>Supporting students' professionalism  Empowering development of professional attributes and competencies  Treating students as individuals, caring for students</p>	
Jokelainen et al 2011b	<p>Study looking at organisational capacity for mentorship  Semi structured focus groups  Data analysed with phenomenographic approach</p>	<p>Capacity building important for effective mentorship, including financial and operational procedures, need positive learning environments and mentorship culture</p> <p>Also need to prepare individual mentors, as they are key stakeholders, but they are not solely responsible</p>	<p>Purposive sample of mentors  n=22 (Finland) n=17 (UK)</p>
Jokelainen et al 2013	<p>Finnish and British mentors' conceptions of facilitating nursing students' placement learning and professional development  Focus groups n=22 (Finnish) n=17 (British)  Analysis using a phenomenographic approach</p>	<p>Students should be focus and respected as individuals with personal learning goals</p> <p>Students' placements must be fit for learning – make students feel welcome</p> <p>Facilitation seen as guided co-working and spurring</p> <p>Ongoing assessment of student and feedback</p> <p>Mentors need to be well prepared for these roles</p>	<p>Methodology well explained  Only the mentors' perspectives  Interesting as cross-country  Small scale study</p>

Jones et al 2001	Examined extent to which students had contact with mentor and implications of this Students and mentors kept activity diaries for 1 week (only 46.3% return rate) and focus groups SPSS for quantitative data	<p>Mentor is important for maximizing benefits of placement</p> <p>Without mentors, students just hang about, tag along and work with unregistered practitioners</p> <p>Students like 1 to 1 with mentor</p> <p>Mentors can be good sponsors for students to enter world of nursing – legitimate peripheral participation</p>	Study included midwifery students Sample size 125 students and 117 mentors, only 81 returned diaries for same week UK
Jonsen et al 2013	Part of longitudinal Nordic study of student nurses' perceptions of first clinical placement Focus groups n=22 Analysed with qualitative content analysis	<p>Mentors who are enthusiastic and produce sense of security</p> <p>Permissive atmosphere leads to empowerment</p> <p>Reflection is natural</p> <p>Connect between theory and practice, but this is often lacking and a tool to bridge this gap is required</p>	Small sample in Finland and Sweden Mentors not necessarily trained
Kelly and McAllister 2013	Descriptive phenomenological 2 year study exploring essence of building a supportive learning culture through mentorship N=13 Data analysed using	<p>Confidence can be increased through good role models</p> <p>Social capital</p> <p>Friendliness</p> <p>Being thrown in at the deep end – good</p>	This Australian study calls for more research into nurse education, or it will become irrelevant, devalued, or overlooked and be based on tradition, intuition and expert opinion Small sample, but very detailed

	NVivo	mentors do not do this  Peer support important Lack of support – need new models of support	data
Killam and Heerschap 2012	Qualitative descriptive Canadian study of challenges to student learning in the clinical setting 2 focus groups n=11 Thematic analysis	Need a systems approach to supporting students in practice to maximise safe and meaningful learning opportunities. Need to consider individual level and programme level approach	Detailed description of methodology used
Koontz et al 2010	Study of elements of learning environment impacting on learning Descriptive and exploratory, qualitative N=10 focus groups Data analysis through general inductive approach	Individual qualities of mentors very important – compassion, acceptance, support  Students identified strategies for enhancing learning – reverse shadowing	USA Participants were self selecting
Levett-Jones and Lathleen 2007	Mixed method study looking at belongingness Semi-structured interviews n=18 Data analysis through constant comparison	A sense of belonging to the nursing team is crucial to a positive and productive learning experience	Participants from 3 universities in Australia and 1 in UK Findings are from qualitative phase of study Very theoretically sound paper
Lewallen and DeBrew 2012	Qualitative descriptive design to identify characteristics of successful and	Successful students positive, eager to learn, think critically, prepare, accept feedback, and adapt to clinical setting	USA study

	unsuccessful students 24 telephone interviews with nurse educators		
Luhanga et al 2010	Literature review of one to one mentorship model	<p>Advantages include – consistency, a safe space for learning, availability, can adjust to individual student, give immediate feedback</p> <p>Challenges include – difficult relationship, only experiencing one way of doing things</p> <p>Workforce challenges (balancing needs of patients with teaching, lack of time, nursing shortages) – might be better to have Collaborative Learning Units, or team mentorship. Also better for interprofessional learning</p> <p>Mentors need to be well prepared and supported and appreciated</p>	<p>Conclude that we need a combination of one to one and team mentorship, need more research into macro factors</p> <p>Methodology only briefly described and only 57 articles included</p>
Mamhidir et al 2014	<p>Mentors' experiences of 2 clinical models</p> <p>Descriptive design and qualitative approach</p> <p>Purposive sample n=18</p> <p>10 representing peer learning and 8 traditional supervision</p> <p>Semi structured interviews</p> <p>Data analysed using latent qualitative content</p>	<p>Mentor creates room for student to assume responsibility for their own learning – peer</p> <p>Mentor's ambitions and knowledge are stressed and taught – traditional</p> <p>Choice of clinical learning model is important and maybe a mix of the 2 is best</p>	Mentors on medical and surgical wards in Sweden

	analysis		
Moscaritolo 2009	Literature review to explore interventional strategies to decrease nursing student anxiety in clinical learning environment Literature search from 2001-2006 n=10 articles	3 strategies described in literature to alleviate stress and anxiety in clinical setting: Use of humour Peer support Mindfulness training	Conceptual framework used – Neumann Systems Model; 'health' is the best possible wellness state, with greatest degree of stability
Moseley and Davis 2008	Study to explore what mentors find difficult Thurstone scale to assess role satisfaction n=86 89% response rate and 2 Likert scales to assess where problems, if any, lay	Mentors enjoyed their role  Organisational constraints were problematic – workload, skill mix  Interpersonal factors also important  Mentors need to give more attention to the cognitive and not just interpersonal aspects of their role	One university in Wales Good response rate Findings not in line with other research, much more positive
Murray and Main 2005	Literature review to explore role modelling as a teaching method for student mentors	Role modelling is a useful, if under-utilised method of teaching in the clinical area, particularly when mentors are faced with increased workloads	Methodology not describes, but this is a frequently cited article
Neary 2000	Qualitative and quantitative methods used to explore student's learning through process of continuous assessment and mentorship	Mentors should be selected  Mentor and assessor roles should be separated, too much is asked of mentors – teacher, assessor, delivering patient care Need 'named practitioners' who are	2 studies undertaken over period of 6 years 1991-1996 – so old study, but a seminal one



	Questionnaires and interviews	supernumerary to nursing team and given status of teacher, supervisor, assessor	
Nettleton and Bray 2008	Current mentorship models may be doing students a disservice Questionnaires and semi-structured interviews (mainly telephone) Data analysis SPSS and Framework Study included midwifery, medicine and nursing	Current provision for mentoring relationship is insufficient. Lack of recognition of importance of role, resulting in poor commitment for time and resources, creating relationship that is neither beneficial for mentor or mentee	Low response rate to questionnaires from some groups  1 geographical area only UK
Nielsen et al 2013	Description of the Oregon Clinical Education Model	Literature review revealed a need to consider alternative clinical education models, as less time for teaching, need for more focused learning, and need to address the individual learning needs of students	USA Still to be formally evaluated
Nursing and Midwifery Council 2006/2008	Most important grey literature are the NMC Standards to support learning and assessment in practice	States role of mentor  Advocates one to one mentorship model  Focuses on responsibilities of mentor  Mentor is both assessor and teacher	At the same time very prescriptive and very generic – open to interpretation. Not supportive of inter professional learning Based on traditional view of teaching – expert to novice Evidence base unclear for some of the standards
O'Driscoll 2010	Study to find who is responsible for student nurses' learning in	Mentors lead learning on a day to day basis, but do not always have the necessary support, training, or capacity to	Large scale UK multi method research project

	<p>practice</p> <p>Ethnographic case study</p> <p>4 case studies in 4 NHS trusts in England using online questionnaire</p> <p>Ethnographic fieldwork and curricula analysis</p>	<p>do so</p> <p>Weak link between link lecturers and practice and supremacy of workforce culture over learning culture have led to an uncoupling of practice and education creating a deficit in leadership</p>	
O'Mara et al 2014	<p>Experiences' of students in challenging clinical learning environments</p> <p>Qualitative design using interpretive description</p> <p>Data collected through focus groups and clinical journals</p> <p>Data analysed through constant comparison and thematic analysis</p>	<p>Many challenges:</p> <p>Organisational</p> <p>Relationships, particularly mentor</p> <p>Impact led to stress, loss of confidence</p> <p>Student responses to challenges:</p> <p>Rebuilding</p> <p>Redirecting</p> <p>Retreating</p> <p>Reframing</p> <p>Learning environments crucial and must be positive and students need to develop resilience</p>	<p>Canada</p> <p>Participants were self selecting</p> <p>Research led to development of a conceptual model of students' perceptions of a challenging clinical learning environment</p>
Papp et al 2003	<p>Student nurses perceptions' of clinical learning experiences</p> <p>N=16</p> <p>Qualitative, phenomenological study</p>	<p>Student nurses need to feel appreciated and supported</p> <p>Relationship between mentor and student important, and student has some responsibility for this</p>	<p>Finland</p> <p>Small numbers, one geographical area</p>

	Analysis using Colaizzi Unstructured interviews and non participant observation	Need close liaison between university and practice  Mentors need to be good role models	
Pearcey and Elliot 2004	Phenomenological, qualitative study to explore student nurses' impressions of nursing Focus groups Thematic content analysis	Ward culture very important in shaping students' views of nursing  Role of mentor essential – mentors who were good communicators, enthusiastic, delivering high quality care, were a source of inspiration for students. They could be strong role models.	N=14, so small numbers, one university and self-selected participants
Pellatt 2006	Literature review of role of mentors supporting students		
Pulsford et al 2000	Survey of mentors' attitudes towards nurse education Questionnaire to 400 mentors, return rate just under 50%, so quite low.	Mentors feel supported by colleagues, but less so by managers and HEI, want extra pay for role  Mentors want more time to carry out role and attend updates  Want closer links with HEI and clearer documentation from HEIs  Feel students should have longer placements and be more motivated	Analysis of data not explicit Asking for money for the role quite unusual in research literature UK
Rassool and	Demographic	A mismatch of learning and teaching	MH Students only in one UK

Rawaf 2007	questionnaire and Honey and Mumford's learning styles questionnaire to purposive sample of 136 81% response rate	styles can have serious consequences, mentors need to be aware of their own preferred learning style, assess students' preferences and then offer individualized teaching	university, results need to be treated with caution, although they do resonate with me
Robinson et al 2012	Research project undertaken by NNRU to explore the capacity for mentorship delivery, from the perspective of staff involved Semi-structured interviews n=37 22 from HEIs and 15 from Trusts	Should all nurse be mentors, or should there be a dedicated career pathway  Could new mentorship models work?  Can mentorship be uncoupled form career progression?	Part of readiness to work project funded by NHS London  Methodologically robust, but only identified areas for further exploration
Roxburgh 2014	Study to explore student nurses' perceptions of 2 practice learning models N=10 Focus groups Thematic analysis	Looked at how belongingness, support, continuity in mentorship and continuity in practice were affected by using a hub and spoke model compared to a traditional rotational model of placements. Hub and spoke model good in first year.	Theoretical framework drew on Tinto's idea of integration both socially and academically being an indicator of whether students stay or leave  Small sample, variable participation rates
Royal College of Nursing 2016	Review of mentorship in UK based on a literature review of international alternative mentorship models and feedback from a number of workshops in the UK and expert opinion	Need to consider new mentorship models, to include interprofessional learning  Mentors need to be selected and valued  Leadership of clinical learning crucial from ward to board	Work is just a starting point for further discussion and action to improve practice placement learning environments in the UK

		Need close collaboration between university and practice	
Spouse 2001	Longitudinal study using constructivist/naturalistic paradigm to discover how students acquire professional knowledge in practice n=8 Data collection through interviews, nonparticipant observation, critical incident analysis, illuminative artwork Ongoing thematic analysis	Successful mentorship relationships are characterised by sponsorship, legitimate peripheral participation, scaffolding, zone of proximal development and therefore there is a need to move from traditional to new mentorship models  Mentors need to develop new ways of working with students – less hierarchical	UK one university Methodologically sound and good conceptual basis
Stacey et al 2010	Narrative approach, unstructured interviews Data analysis collaborative thematic analysis	Master's graduates experience fear, resistance and intimidation from colleagues	Looked at MH nurses, but very relevant in terms of master's level students' experiences One UK university N=8
Taylor 2009	Case study exploring student retention and attrition PhD thesis	Social capital essential if retention rates are to be improved and this is influenced by positive practice placement learning experiences	One university in Scotland
Thomas et al 2012	Systematic review and meta-synthesis of qualitative literature concerning experiences of student nurses in adult hospital settings in UK 1990-2010	Pre-placement anticipation  Realities of clinical environment, including negative attitude of staff  Not fitting in	Methodology well explained

	n=10	<p>Clinical learning – role models important Sequencing of learning important, but does not always happen</p> <p>Stress and coping – peer support important</p> <p>Conflict between patient care and learning</p>	
Thrysoe et al 2010	<p>A phenomenal hermeneutic study of students participation in a community of practice Participant observation and semi-structured interviews Thematic analysis and critical interpretation</p>	<p>Participation in a community of practice is an essential requirement of transition from student to registered nurse</p>	<p>Denmark N=10, all female Lave and Wenger Spouse</p>
Turnbull et al 2014	<p>Collaborative qualitative research project was undertaken to establish the motivation, attitudes, perceptions and experiences of nurses, midwives and managers, who were either training to be mentors, were already undertaking the mentorship role, or who had responsibility for overseeing the quality of</p>	<p>Mentors need to be selected for the role</p> <p>Mentors need to be well trained and supported and valued</p> <p>Mentorship should not be part of compulsory CPD</p> <p>Leadership at ward level essential</p> <p>Collaboration between practice and HEI essential</p>	<p>N=129 Data collected via individual interviews, focus groups and questionnaires Essex only</p>

	mentorship within a number of NHS Trusts	Need alternative mentorship model	
Vallant and Neville 2006	Qualitative study to explore relationship between student and mentor Focus groups Thematic analysis	Being invisible in relationship – seen as ‘the student’, but students have to take some responsibility for this  Not stepping on toes  Lost opportunities for learning – time, busyness, being with patients important to students, but not mentor  Nurturance  Reciprocity	New Zealand N=64 Mentors have little formal preparation in NZ  Need new clinical learning models
Watson 2000	Ethnographic study to explore the support mentor’s receive in practice 13 unstructured interviews of experienced mentors in 1 Trust and questionnaires, closed and open questions, but low response rate	There is a lack of support for mentors and this adversely affects learning and assessment of students.  Need to strengthen link lecturer role	In depth discussion of analysis of quantitative data
Watson 2004	Mentor perceptions and reasons for undertaking the course Data collection anonymous	Mentors need to be well prepared, but training should not be regarded as related to promotion, or be undertaken under duress from manager. Mentors should want to be mentors	Not all on the course who were surveyed had students, so maybe their views would have changed

	questionnaires N=115, 90.6% response rate SPSS		
Webb and Shakespeare 2008	Qualitative exploratory study, on assessment decisions made by mentors on students using critical incidents as basis for interviews n=24 mix of mentors and students Thematic analysis	<p>'Good mentoring' depended on students building a relationship with their mentors and a great deal of emotional labour to do so. Assessment decisions often subjective.</p> <p>Characteristics of good mentors – enthusiasm, attitude, being there, ideal is co-mentoring by an experienced and newly qualified mentor</p> <p>Characteristics of good students – enthusiasm, attitudes, self-confidence, assertiveness</p> <p>Need greater leadership at ward level to support mentors</p> <p>Mentors need to be well prepared for their role</p>	2 HEIs one in north and one in south of UK Small study, convenience sample, but 2 interviewers, one a sociologist
Wilkes 2006	Literature review of student-mentor relationship	<p>Student –mentor relationship complex</p> <p>Mentors need to be well prepared for their role and supported</p> <p>From student perspective, mentors need to be friendly, patient, good sense of</p>	Methodology briefly described



		<p>humour – emotional aspect very important, but also knowledgeable</p> <p>From mentor perspective – competing expectations and difficult to prioritise workload</p>	
Wilson 1994	<p>Qualitative study to explore nursing student perspective of learning in clinical setting</p> <p>Observation and ethnographic interviewing</p> <p>Analysed using Spradley</p>	<p>Mentors need to separate out teaching and assessing and need to use teaching strategies that take into account student perspective – need to move from didactic teacher to facilitator</p>	<p>Good use of relevant theory and concepts – roles (symbolic interactionism), Goffman (looking good in placement),</p>

Relevant themes identified in each article were colour coded as below:

1. Mentor-student relationship
2. Characteristics of a 'good' mentor
3. Conflicts in the mentorship role
4. Preparation and support for mentors
5. Alternative mentorship models
6. Learning environment
7. Student belongingness