To what extent can a cigarette be regarded as a regressed form of infantile 'transitional object' that prolongs into adulthood?

Fung Ko

A thesis submitted for the degree of PhD in Psychoanalytic Studies

Department of Psychosocial and Psychoanalytic Studies

University of Essex

2018

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### **ABSTRACT**

#### 1. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF SMOKING ADDICTION

- 1.1. The perspectives of academic psychology
  - 1.1.1. Addiction as a rational choice
  - 1.1.2. Addiction as an irrational choice
  - 1.1.3. Addiction as an impulse
  - 1.1.4. Addiction as a habit
  - 1.1.5. The diffusion of addiction in population
  - 1.1.6. Integrated theories of addiction
  - 1.1.7. A synthetic theory of addiction
- 1.2. The tobacco industry's research: eight major smoking moments

# 2. ADDICTION AND SMOKING ADDICTION: THE PSYCHOANALYTIC PERSPECTIVES

- 2.1. The Freudian perspective
- 2.2. The Kleinian perspective
- 2.3. Psychoanalytic views after Freud and Klein
  - 2.3.1. Before the 1940s
  - 2.3.2. Late 1950s
  - 2.3.3. 1980s and onwards
- 2.4. Cross-disciplinary perspectives on smoking addiction
  - 2.4.1. Early influence of psychoanalysis on marketing: Edward Bernays (1920s)
  - 2.4.2. The impulse and drive perspective: Motivation Research (1930s-1950s)
  - 2.4.3. The Object Relations perspective (1950s onwards)

# 3. WINNICOTT AND HIS PERSPECTIVE ON ADDICTION AND SMOKING ADDICTION

- 3.1. Winnicott's major contributions to theories
  - 3.1.1. Psyche-soma indwelling
  - 3.1.2. Ego-integration
  - 3.1.3. Absolute dependence to relative dependence, towards independence
  - 3.1.4. The importance of play towards personality integration and creativity
  - 3.1.5. The critical role of the mother in facilitating ego development
  - 3.1.6. Transitional objects and transitional phenomenon
  - 3.1.7. Father and the wider family
  - 3.1.8. Psychopathology
- 3.2. Critical evaluation of Winnicott's major theories
  - 3.2.1. Winnicott's optimism versus Freud and Klein's pessimism towards humanity
  - 3.2.2. The idealisation of mothering, neglecting the role of the father
  - 3.2.3. The nature of illusion
- 3.3. Critical evaluation of the concept of transitional objects and transitional phenomena
  - 3.3.1. Theoretical and clinical validations of a transitional object and phenomena
  - 3.3.2. The nature of a transitional object
  - 3.3.3. Expanding or integrating Winnicott's theory

- 3.3.4. Applications of a transitional object and phenomena in clinical settings
- 3.3.5. Applications of a transitional object and phenomena in other disciplines
- 3.4. The reappearance of an infantile transitional object in adulthood
- 3.5. Winnicott's perspective on smoking addiction

#### 4. RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS

#### 5. METHODOLOGY

- 5.1. The need for a data collection method that can infer the unconscious
  - 5.1.1. Limitations of existing quantitative survey-based research
  - 5.1.2. A turn to qualitative interview-based research
  - 5.1.3. The narrative interviewing approach and the psychoanalytical clinical casestudy approach
  - 5.1.4. The Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI) method
  - 5.1.5. Rationale for adopting a qualitative research design with no control group
- 5.2. Data collection method: Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI)
  - 5.2.1. Interview schedule
  - 5.2.2. Interview questions
- 5.3. The respondents
  - 5.3.1. Sampling frame
  - 5.3.2. Sample size and variations
- 5.4. Data analysis methods

#### 6. ANALYSIS OF THE DATA AND RESULTS

- 6.1. Pen portraits and 'defended smoking moments' of each respondent
  - 6.1.1. Respondent 1: Hank
  - 6.1.2. Respondent 2: Anthony
  - 6.1.3. Respondent 3: Holly
  - 6.1.4. Respondent 4: Anita
  - 6.1.5. Respondent 5: Cooper
  - 6.1.6. Respondent 6: Emerald
  - 6.1.7. Respondent 7: Abyss
  - 6.1.8. Respondent 8: Samuel
- 6.2. Identifying the 'regressive' smoking moments
- 6.3. Resemblance of a cigarette to the qualities of Winnicott's transitional object
  - 6.3.1. Holly's full transcript
  - 6.3.2. The first key transitional object quality as manifested consistently in the interviews: a cigarette is seen as more than merely a lifeless consumable object, but an object that has a life of its own
  - 6.3.3. The second key transitional object quality as manifested consistently in the interviews: the location of the transitional object as in between the internal and external reality
  - 6.3.4. Other transitional object qualities manifested in the different stages of interviews amongst the eight respondents

#### 7. DISCUSSION

- 7.1. Contribution of this thesis to the idea of transitional phenomena and cigarette addiction
- 7.2. Significance and implications of the current study to smokers, public health policy and the tobacco industry
- 7.3. Limitations of the current study
  - 7.3.1. Improving objectivity through cross examination of transcripts

- 7.3.2.Improving interview setup to further improve openness of respondents
- 7.3.3.Improving generalisability and reliability of the results via a larger scale research
- 7.4. Proposed directions for future research
  - 7.4.1.A longitudinal study to understand the impact of the parents' child rearing practices on smoking addiction in adulthood
  - 7.4.2. Researching the entire smoking process including the breathing stage of smoking
  - 7.4.3. Validating the effectiveness of the new approach to reduce dependency on cigarettes

# **REFERENCES**

**APPENDIX 1: FULL TRANSCRIPTS** 

**APPENDIX 2: PROJECT INFORMATION SHEET** 

**APPENDIX 3: SIGNED CONSENT FORMS** 

#### **ABSTRACT**

It is widely known that tobacco contains toxic ingredients; however, despite a conscious awareness of its toxic content, people still continue to smoke. Even Freud could not resist his severe addiction to cigars. Having been diagnosed with oral cancer in 1923 at the age of 67, and subsequently gone through 33 painful operations in the remaining sixteen years of his life, Freud continued to smoke until he died, knowing that smoking would eventually kill him.

The psychoanalytic investigation of addiction began a century ago; of all the theorists, Winnicott has provided a unique perspective by suggesting that 'addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the earliest stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged.' We will focus our investigation within the British Object Relations School, and in particular Winnicott's concepts of regression of the transitional object in the understanding of smoking addiction, with the insight extracted from sixteen one-hour interviews using the Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI) method conducted amongst eight student smokers from tertiary institutions in Hong Kong.

Winnicott has outlined seven special qualities in the relationship between the infant and the transitional objects, and if a cigarette is a regressed form of an infantile transitional object that prolongs into adulthood, then the relationship between the cigarette and the smoker should reflect some of these qualities. The two most definitive characteristics found in all the interviews amongst all the respondents are the location of the transitional object and the illusion of its vitality and liveliness.

Based on the above results, a discussion on the significance and implications of the current study to smokers, public health policy and the tobacco industry are provided, and the limitations of the current study and the proposed directions for future research are also discussed.

# 1. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF SMOKING ADDICTION

# 1.1 The perspectives of academic psychology

Despite the known health risk of cigarette smoking, smoking incidence continues to increase: according to the World Health Organisation (2004), tobacco is regarded as the most dangerous consumer product that kills the most people. While 0.1 billion people died from tobacco use in the twentieth century, it is projected that one billion will die in the twenty-first century. It is widely known that tobacco contains toxic ingredients; however, what makes an addict is not the toxic agent but the impulse for craving despite conscious awareness of the toxic content.

According to Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary, addiction means 'the condition of being addicted to something', and 'addicted' means 'unable to stop taking harmful drugs or using or doing something as a habit' (Oxford University Press, 2010), so there is a compulsive dependence element in the dictionary explanation of addiction. A more comprehensive definition of addiction is provided by the World Health Organisation (2010):

'... repeated use of a psychoactive substance or substances, to the extent that the user (referred to as an addict) is periodically or chronically intoxicated, shows a compulsion to take the preferred substance (or substances), has great difficulty in voluntarily ceasing or modifying substance use, and exhibits determination to obtain psychoactive substances by almost any means. Typically, tolerance is prominent and a withdrawal syndrome frequently occurs when substance use is interrupted. The life of the addict may be dominated by substance use to the virtual exclusion of all other activities and responsibilities. The term addiction also conveys the sense that such substance use has a detrimental effect on society, as well as on the individual; ...

Addiction is a term of long-standing and variable usage. It is regarded by many as a discrete disease entity, a debilitating disorder rooted in the pharmacological effects of the drug, which is remorselessly progressive. From the 1920s to the 1960s attempts were made to differentiate between addiction; and 'habituation', a less severe form of psychological adaptation. In the 1960s the World Health Organisation recommended that both terms be abandoned in favour of dependence, which can exist in various degrees of severity...'

From the above World Health Organisation definition, addiction involves a progressive dosage, compulsive dependence, difficulty in voluntary cessation and the appearance of withdrawal syndrome after cessation.

From a pharmacological perspective, the addictive quality of tobacco comes from the nicotine content found naturally in tobacco leaves. Nicotine is a stimulant and when inhaled with the cigarette smoke it enters the blood stream and travels to the brain, raising the levels of a neurotransmitter called dopamine, which in turns produces feelings of pleasure and reward. These neurotransmitters are normally used by the brain to reinforce positive behaviours, such as acquiring food or succeeding in social interactions. Over time, the smoker's brain gets used to the regular nicotine stimulation and requires a similar level of activation in order to function normally.

The pharmacological drivers for addiction is outside the scope of the current thesis, which is about psychoanalytic theories of addiction, but a literature scan in the psychology database revealed that there is a plethora of psychological theories of addiction in general and smoking addiction in particular. Therefore, we would like to cover the key themes and findings in the psychological theories of addiction before we

proceed further with the literature review on the psychoanalytic theories of addiction. The objective is to review what has already been written about addiction in academic psychology and identify the areas that psychoanalytic perspectives can add value to the understanding of the aetiology of addiction.

In summary, psychological theories of addiction can be categorised into six groups: the rational choice theories, the irrational choice theories, theories focusing on compulsion and self-control, theories emphasising habituation through associative learning, theories focusing on the diffusion of addiction at the population level, and integrated theories of addiction. However, many of these theories are only minor semantic variations of the others, and they only provide a partial explanation of addiction. For this reason, psychological theories of addiction have made little progress in the past forty years.

In view of the above inadequacies, West (2006) has proposed a synthetic theory of addiction that attempts to encapsulate different theories which offer unique insights on the psychology of addiction and provide a unifying construct that is capable of generating new ideas moving forward. This is a good start towards a more unifying psychological theory of addiction, although the synthetic theory will need to gain more widespread support before it can become a paradigm psychological theory of addiction (Kuhn, 1962).

In this chapter, we will firstly provide a summary of the major tenets of the six groups of psychological theories of addiction, according to West's (2006) framework of classification. We will focus on the specific aspect of addiction that each group of theories tries to tackle, and areas that these theories fail to explain. We will also provide

a more detailed description of the synthetic theory of addiction proposed by West (2006), in order to summarise how the psychological theories of addiction have taken us so far on the journey of understanding the aetiology of addiction since the 1970s. Finally, we will conclude this chapter by providing a critique of each of the psychological theories of addiction from a psychoanalytic perspective, i.e. to what extent they take into consideration the unconscious aspect of attitudes, behaviours and motivation, the individual as an agent in his decision-making, as well as the sociocultural factors that influence smoking addiction, and how psychoanalysis can contribute to the understanding of addiction.

#### 1.1.1 Addiction as a rational choice

The rational choice theories belong to the economic theory of addiction that viewed addiction as a rational decision-making process, aiming at maximising total utility based on a cost-and-benefit analysis. There were three main theories in this category: the opponent process theory (Solomon & Corbit, 1973, 1974; Solomon, 1980), the theory of rational addiction (Becker and Murphy, 1988), and the self-medication model of addiction (Khantzian, 1997; Farrel et al., 2001; Gelkopf et al., 2002).

The rational choice theories offered some but not a full explanation of addiction, e.g. as it is unlikely that all human decisions are based on a thorough cost-and-benefit analysis, avoidance of distress seems unlikely to be the only cause of loss of control of addictive behaviour as predicted by the opponent process theory, and psychological disorders do not always predate drug use as hypothesised by the self-medication model of addiction. More importantly, rational choice theories failed to account for the fact that many addicts genuinely choose to exercise restraint, wanting to stop, and yet still

#### 1.1.2 Addiction as an irrational choice

Contrary to the assumptions in the rational choice theories that addicts make a rational choice based on a cost-and-benefit analysis, the irrational choice theories suggested that addiction involved an irrational choice that overvalued the benefits and/or undervalued the costs of the addictive behaviours, and this was mainly driven by biases, personal feelings associated with the behaviours and their outcomes, preference for the present over the future, habituation, sensitisation or physiological changes which further strengthened the addictive behaviours. There were eight prevalent theories in this category, including the expectancy theories (Christiansen & Goldman, 1983; Rather et al., 1992; Tate et al., 1994; Goldman & Darkes, 2004), the transtheoretical model (Prochaska & Goldstein, 1991; Prochaska, et al., 1985; Prochaska & Velicer, 1997), behavioural economics theories (Jones, 1989; Lewit, 1989; Madden et al., 1997; Madden et al., 1999; Bickel & Marsch, 2001; Dixen et al., 2003; Audrain-McGovern et al., 2004), the gateway theory (Kandel et al., 1992; Lindsay & Rainey, 1997; Kenkel et al., 2001; Beenstock & Rahay, 2002; Chen et al., 2002; Tullis et al., 2003), the choice theory (Skog, 2000), cognitive bias theories of addiction (Waters & Feyerabend, 2000; Waters et al., 2003: Bradley et al., 2004), the identity shifts theory (Kearney & O'Sullivan, 2003), and heuristic theory (Slovic, 2002).

The irrational choice theories incorporated the role of biases, feelings, temporal priority, habituation, sensitisation and physiological factors in addiction. However, subsequent validations of these theories mostly generated mixed results, indicating that there was insufficient evidence to conclude that such irrational factors actually

influenced addictive behaviours (Farkas et al., 1996; Etter & Perneger, 1999; Herzog et al., 1999; Whitelaw et al., 2000; Jones et al., 2001; Sutton, 2001; Etter & Sutton, 2002; Littell & Girvin, 2002).

#### 1.1.3 Addiction as an impulse

In order to account for the addicts' failure to exercise restraint despite a genuine and conscious effort to do so, another group of theories emerged and argued that not all addictive activities involved choice, and one had to take into consideration the concepts of disease, impulses, urges, inhibitory forces, self-control, and voluntary restraint in understanding addiction. There were a total of seven theories that fell into this category, including the disease model of addiction (Edwards & Gross, 1976; Gelkopf et al., 2002), the abstinence violation effect (Marlett, 1979), the tri-dimensional personality theory (Cloninger, 1987), the cognitive model of drug urges (Tiffany 1990, 1999; Tiffany & Conklin, 2000), the self-efficacy theory (Marlatt, 1996; Niaura, 2000; Gwaltney et al., 2001), the self-regulation theory (Baumeister & Heatherton, 1996), and the inhibition dysregulation theory (Lubman et al., 2004).

The impulse theories took into consideration the concept of self-control and compulsion in addiction, however, they failed to provide an explanation for those addictive behaviours which seemed to occur without conscious awareness, as well as for the apparent disconnection between the overpowering urge of the addicts to engage in addictive behaviours and the drugs' perceived rewards.

#### 1.1.4 Addiction as a habit

The associative learning theories regarded addiction as a habitual behavioural pattern developed through repetitions that were outside of the addict's conscious awareness. The resultant impulses to engage in addictive behaviours could be so powerful that they overwhelmed any desires and effort by the addicts to exercise restraint despite the lack of pleasure. As such, addiction was not always linked to enjoyment or stress relief. There were six theories that fell into this category, including those that focused on the instrumental learning mechanisms (Lewis, 1990; O'Brien et al., 1992; Schulteis & Koob, 1996), those that emphasised the role of the classical learning mechanisms (Melchior & Tabakoff, 1984; Childress et al., 1988; Drummond et al., 1990; Azorlosa, 1994; Drummond, 2001; Siegel & Ramos, 2002), the theory of independent learning systems (White, 1996), the incentive sensitisation theory (Robinson & Berridge, 1993, 2003), the social learning theory (Bandura et al., 1977), and the theory of differential drug effects (Pritchard et al., 1996; Balfour, 2004).

Learning theories focused on associative learning mechanisms that operated outside of conscious awareness to explain addictive behaviours. Again, they only provided a partial explanation of addiction, and mentalist concepts such as choice, psychological resource, and self-control were still needed in order to provide a more comprehensive explanation of addictive behaviours.

# 1.1.5 The diffusion of addiction in population

Even though the rules underlying group behaviours might not be exactly the same as those underlying individual behaviours, there should be a link between the two, and the observation of group behaviours should, in theory, shed light on the rules governing individual behaviours. The two key theories that focused on studying addiction at the population and social group levels included the diffusion theory (Einstein & Epstein, 1980; Ferrence, 2001) and the trend theory (Agar & Reisinger, 2002). However, both theories only focused on some features of addiction and failed to provide a comprehensive explanation of the spreading of addiction in populations.

#### 1.1.6 Integrated theories of addiction

There were very few theories that attempted to integrate various factors including rational and irrational choice, self-control, habituation and learning, and the diffusion of addiction in populations into a comprehensive framework of addiction, except for the excessive appetite theory (Orford, 2001) and the model of pathological gambling (Blaszcyzynski & Nower, 2002).

Integrated theories of addiction managed to provide a comprehensive account of addiction by recognising the diversity of different factors, patterns, feelings and routes to addiction, as proposed by various specific theories of addiction. However, in order to propel the psychological theory of addiction forward, we need a theory that does more than summarise all the past theories of addiction; the theory needs to provide a unifying framework of addiction that is capable of generating new insights and moving us forward.

To summarise, addiction could be regarded as actions that people take in response to their overpowering desires, urges, and impulses in order to engage in certain activities despite genuine attempts to exercise restraint. There is a sense of loss of control in these addictive activities, and they are not merely an outcome of choices. Choices, be they rational or irrational, are only relevant when individuals consciously weigh the

alternatives based on their informed or ill-informed, stable or unstable preferences. In many cases, addicts do not normally consider alternatives and some activities may not even operate on a conscious level. Activities that can be classified as addictive are those where the desires, urges or impulses to engage with them are abnormally powerful, and/or the restraints are abnormally weak. Various factors could influence the initiation, development and maintenance of addiction, including firstly, the nature of the individuals in terms of their psychological susceptibility, personal traits, beliefs, and values; secondly, the nature of the activity such as the level of pleasure, satisfaction, or relief from stress it provides; thirdly, the degree to which it taps into instrumental and classic learning mechanisms or leads to neuroadaptation that amplifies both the pleasurable and the punishing effects of the activity; and finally, the environmental factors including the opportunities, reminders, cues, situations, and social norms that create needs that could be satisfied by the addictive activities.

Building on the various theories of addiction that were developed so far, West (2006) has proposed a synthetic theory of addiction that does more than summarise various specific theories of addiction, as he also attempts to add value by developing a unifying construct that is capable of generating new ideas in the psychology of addiction.

#### 1.1.7 A synthetic theory of addiction

According to West (1996), addiction is a social construct that involves a chronic condition of the motivational system, in which a disproportionally high priority is given to particular harmful reward-seeking behaviours. Addiction can arise from many different abnormalities, so it should be regarded as a symptom rather than a unitary disorder; it varies in severity and has different manifestations as a result of the

interactions of personality, social and environmental factors surrounding the addicts.

There are three types of pathologies underlying addiction: abnormalities in the motivational system that are not directly caused by the addictive behaviours, abnormalities in the motivational system caused by the addictive behaviours directly, and pathological environments acting on a normal motivational system that are not equipped to cope with them. All these pathologies have a significant impact on human behaviour.

The synthetic theory of addiction (West, 2006) postulated that the development of addiction is driven by the influence of environmental forces on an inherently unstable motivational system. In this unstable system, environmental forces that create an unbalanced input, or the absence of a balanced input, would send that system down an even more entrenched pathway in the epigenetic landscape, leading to the persistent nature of addictive behaviours.

In view of the multiplicity of factors involved in addiction, the psychological theories of addiction have evolved from an abundance of isolated individual theories, each capturing snapshots of some elements of addiction, to West's synthetic theory of addiction (2006), which provides a broad brush of the underlying developmental process and dynamics of addiction. Despite the synthetic theory's effort in providing an answer to major questions in addiction, such as what activities are addictive, who is susceptible to addiction, what circumstances promote addiction, when and how addiction develops, etc., it still fails to answer the fundamental questions of why there would be individual differences in our motivational system (epigenetic landscape) to start with, and what the factors driving such differences are. Furthermore, the synthetic

theory will also need to gain more widespread support before it can become a single paradigm psychological theory of addiction (Kuhn, 1962). All in all, there seems to be no clear winner, and none of the twenty-nine psychological theories described in this chapter can claim to be the truth, though they can claim a bit of the truth.

With its emphasis on the cognitive behavioural aspect of human behaviour and motivation, the academic psychological approach in understanding addiction seems to have paid small attention to the unconscious motivations, some of which neglected the role of the individual as an agent in their own decisions, and many mentioned very little about the socio-cultural factors as a significant force in driving addictive behaviours. Table 1 is a summary of how the twenty-nine psychological theories perform on each of the above three main inadequacies.

	Consideration of unconscious motivations	Individual as an agent	Socio-cultural factors as a significant force						
1. RATIONAL CHOICE THEORIES	1								
1.1 Opponent process theory	No	Yes	No						
1.2 Theory of rational addiction	No	Yes	No						
1.3 Self-medication model	No	Yes	No						
2. IRRATIONAL CHOICE THEORIES									
2.1 Expectancy theories	No	Yes	No						
2.2 Trans theoretical theories	No	Yes	No						
2.3 Behavioural economics theories	No	Yes	No						
2.4 Gateway theory	No	Yes	No						
2.5 Choice theory	No	Yes	No						
2.6 Cognitive bias theories	No	Yes	No						
2.7 Identity shifts theory	No	Yes	No						
2.8 Affect heuristic theory	No	Yes	No						
3. IMPULSE THEORIES									
3.1 Disease model	No	No	No						
3.2 The abstinence violation effect	No	No	No						
3.3 Tri-dimensional personality theory	No	No	No						
3.4 Cognitive model of drug urges	Yes	No	No						
3.5 Self-efficacy theory	No	No	No						
3.6 Self-regulation theory	No	No	No						
3.7 Inhibition dysregulation theory	No	No	No						
4. ASSOCIATIVE LEARNING THEORIES									
4.1 Instrumental learning	No	No	No						
4.2 Classical learning	No	No	No						
4.3 Independent learning systems	No	No	No						
4.4 Incentive sensitisation theory	No	No	No						
4.5 Social learning theory	No	No	Yes						
4.6 Theory of differential drug effects	No	No	No						
5. POPULATION LEVEL THEORIES									
5.1 Diffusion theory	No	No	Yes						
5.2 Trend theory	No	No	Yes						
6. INTEGRATIVE / SYNTHETIC THEORIES	S								
6.1 Excessive appetites theory	No	Yes	Yes						
6.2 Pathways model of pathological gambling	No	Yes	Yes						
6.3 Synthetic theory of addiction	No	Yes	Yes						

Table 1: Evaluation of psychological theories of addiction

Given its emphasis on the experiential aspect of human behaviours and motivations, as well as allowing a place for the unconscious, the psychoanalytic approach seems to be able to address the inadequacies of the psychological approach and provide a unique and valuable perspective in the understanding of addiction, including smoking addiction, which is the perspective we plan to take in the current thesis.

# 1.2 The tobacco industry's research: eight major smoking moments

Since 2013, there have been extensive studies within the tobacco industry on the different types of smoking moments in order to gain a better understanding of the unmet consumer needs in these moments, and more importantly, to build brand equity and product innovations via linking different brands and offers to specific consumer smoking moments, which is of utmost importance for an industry that is losing social currency and is stigmatised in an increasing number of countries. In the following paragraphs, we will provide an overview of the findings of the smoking moment research from the tobacco industry's perspective and identify the 'regressive' moments from a psychoanalytic perspective.

As a result of increasing regulations on the tobacco industry from advertising restrictions in terms of electronic, print and out of home media, plain packaging, retail display ban and point of sale materials ban, to consumption restrictions in the form of increasing excise and price level, a public place smoking ban and indoor smoking ban, to product restrictions in the form of ingredient restrictions, cigarette stick standardisation, and cigarette pack standardisation, the tobacco industry is losing its social currency rapidly. The tightening of the regulatory environment together with an increasing social stigma of smoking led to a fundamental change in consumer consumption behaviours from habitual consumption to more conscious and considered consumption in the twenty-first century. This is characterised by a significant reduction of the average daily consumption amount, from regular consumption every day to consumption at specific moments only, from a high aspirational value of cigarette brand images to a price-driven commodity, from being able to smoke anywhere anytime regardless of others, to choosing to smoke only at a certain time and in certain places. The traditional smoking behaviour is driven by moments of indulgence, which

is purely pleasure seeking, whereas the twenty-first century smoking behaviour is driven by moments of enjoyment with a need to balance pleasure with selfresponsibility.

In view of the above changing consumer smoking behaviours, the tobacco industry started investigating different smoking moments, in order to gain a better understanding of the consumer needs driving these moments. A largescale desktop research was commissioned in order to review cross-category products and understand the type of consumption moments which these product categories and brands are associated with. These product categories include seven focus categories of tea, coffee, beer, spirits, wine and champagne, chocolates, chewing gum and mints, as well as other crosscategories, including aerated and flavoured drinks, energy and functional drinks, cheese, dressings, packaged snacks, frozen foods, fragrance, personal care products, clothes, watches, credit and debit cards, diamonds, greeting cards and cars, covering fifteen countries including six mature tobacco markets (Japan, South Korea, Australia, Germany, Italy and Canada), eight developing markets (Russia, Ukraine, Turkey, Romania, Malaysia, Brazil, South Africa and Mexico), and one emerging market (Indonesia). Secondly, the same study also reviewed categories adjacent to tobacco and understood the type of moods which these product categories and brands are associated with. These product categories include beer, wine and spirits, non-alcoholic beverages, confectionery, food, personal and beauty care, covering the above fifteen countries. In addition, a vigorous approach was undertaken, in order to identify the key moments relevant for the tobacco industry. Another largescale qualitative research plus ethnographic study was conducted interviewing over 220 consumers, and all of them were interviewed three times in order to understand the nuances and depth of their consumption moments in tobacco and other categories. Besides, sixteen experts were

interviewed to further deepen the understanding, and 600 advertisings across eight markets including Brazil, Canada, Turkey, Ukraine, Japan, South Korea, Bangladesh, and Vietnam were analysed with and without the tobacco category to understand each moment's cross-category context, and to explore moments in different regions, cultures and levels of market development.

The above study revealed that there are altogether eight smoking moments that are relevant to the tobacco industry, each of which is rooted in one core human need underpinning the motivation of their behaviours (see Table 2). Out of the eight identified smoking moments, the first six belong to the personal aspects of smoking, and the last two to the social aspects of smoking.

- 1. The 'Pass the time' smoking moment is driven by the core need to occupy empty moments. The smoker wants to fill empty and dull moments, so there is an absence of stimulation or purpose in this moment. The emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel stimulated and entertained, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to keep them occupied and busy. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by mindless smoking, an average draw of the smoke, quick inhalation and exhalation, and a low frequency of puffs.
- 2. The 'Me time' smoking moment is driven by the smoker's core need to have time on their own, which can be further divided into two sub-types of 'time out' and 'time to be myself' moments. In the 'time out' moment, the smoker wants to punctually isolate themselves to free their mind. The emotional benefit of a cigarette is to keep them out of reach from overstimulation, make them feel free to be themselves, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to provide them

with a short period of isolation. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by mindless smoking, a weak draw, inhalation and exhalation, a low frequency of puffs, and they do not always finish the entire cigarette. In the 'time to be myself' moment, the smoker wants to reclaim themselves through isolation; the emotional benefit of a cigarette is to make them feel free to be themselves, liberated and calm, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to allow them a significant period of isolation as a kind of escapism. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by mindless product handling, a weak draw, inhalation and exhalation, and a low frequency of puffs.

- 3. The 'Self-reward' smoking moment is driven by the core need for indulgence. The emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make the smoker feel fulfilled, accomplished and proud, and like they deserve something special, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to give them pleasure and indulgence. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a slow pace, a deep inhalation and exhalation, and product savouring. Often the smoke is kept in the smoker's mouth for a prolonged duration.
- 4. The 'Relax' smoking moment is driven by the core need for self-rebalancing, and it can be further divided into two sub-types of 'revive' and 'de-charge' moments. In the 'revive' moment, the smoker wants to take in positive energy and emotions. The emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel restored and renewed, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to provide inner balance. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a deep inhalation and exhalation, an average to weak number of puffs, longer duration in-between puffs, and product savouring. In the 'de-charge' moment, the

smoker wants to let go of negative energy and emotions. The emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel like they are back in control, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to relieve their stress and allow for inner balance. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a deep inhalation and exhalation, a high frequency of puffs, little time in-between puffs, and a tight hand and mouth grip when they smoke.

- 5. The 'Focus/problem solver' moment is driven by the core need to concentrate and strengthen the thought process, and it can be further divided into two subtypes of 'focus' and 'problem solver' moments. In the 'focus' moment, the smoker wants to reboot their mind by stepping out. The functional benefit of the cigarette is to help them concentrate and reduce external stimulation, and the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel creative. The smoking ritual is characterised by an intense draw, infrequent puffs, taking in a lot of smoke, and not paying attention to ash. In the 'problem solver' moment, the smoker wants to sustain concentration by reducing external nuisance. The functional benefit of the cigarette is to provide a mental reboot and a clearer mind, and the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel capable, sharp, and efficient. The smoking ritual is characterised by a strong first draw, infrequent puffs, a superficial inhalation and exhalation, and the cigarette stick is often left in the ashtray.
- 6. The 'Boost/start up' smoking moment is driven by the need to manage performance and energy levels, and it can be further divided into two sub-types of 'boost' and 'start up' moments. In the 'boost' moment, the smoker wants to refuel when their energy levels are down. The functional benefit of the cigarette

is to provide an immediate surge of energy, and the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel capable and strong. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a strong first draw, a high frequency of puffs, no product savouring, exerting harder pressure on the filter, and intense draws. In the 'start up' moment, the smoker wants to gently wake up and build motivation. The functional benefit of the cigarette is to provide gradual but long-lasting energy, and the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them feel motivated, optimistic and ready. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a weak first draw followed by a weak inhalation and exhalation, a low frequency of puffs, and the smoke is often kept in their mouth for a prolonged duration.

7. The 'Projection of self' smoking moment is driven by the core need to control what others see of the smoker, and it can be further divided into two sub-types of 'impress' and 'blend in' moments. The 'impress' moment is when the smoker wants to be noticed and stand out. The functional benefit of the cigarette is to help them stand out, and the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them powerful, proud, superior and desirable. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by a confident manner, displaying smoking skills, graceful handling of sticks, stick kept in mouth, and playing with the cigarette pack or lighter. The 'blend in' moment is when the smoker wants to comply with the codes and norms of the people around them; the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to make them be accepted by like-minded others and not rejected by them, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to help them blend in and not stand out. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by directing

the smoke away, infrequent puffs, no savouring, and not always smoking the entire cigarette.

8. The 'Socialise' smoking moment is motivated by the core need to feel close, bond and share with others; the emotional benefit of the cigarette is to enable them to connect with others, be light-hearted, and be appreciated by others, and the functional benefit of the cigarette is to help them exchange ideas and things with others, and to provide proximity and connection to others. The smoking ritual in this moment is characterised by infrequent draws, directing the smoke outwards, and mindless smoking.

The above industry study also suggests that habitual and routine consumption is not a moment of its own, but rather a weaker intensity of any of the given moments, which is more habitual and less implicating. The above eight smoking moments can be further clustered into four key categories, including 'connection with self'; 'self-balance'; 'performance'; and 'connection with others'. 'Me time' and 'pass the time' moments both satisfy the smokers' need for 'connection with self'; 'self-reward' and 'relax' moments satisfy the smokers' needs for 'self-balance'; 'focus/problem solver' and 'start-up/boost' moments are about seeking 'performance'; 'projection of self' and 'socialise' moments are both about 'connection with others'. All four categories of smoking moments are universal and can be found in all eight countries with a varied level of prominence for different moments depending on the level of economic development and the extent of social stigma associated with smoking. For example, 'connection with others' and 'performance' moments are more prominent in emerging markets such as Vietnam and Bangladesh when a cigarette is still a social currency, whereas 'self-balance' and 'connection with self' moments are more relevant in mature

markets such as Canada, Japan, and South Korea, where the awareness level of the risk of smoking is much higher, and the social stigma associated with smoking is also higher. Developing markets such as Brazil, Ukraine, and Turkey present an intermediate situation tending towards the mature market scenarios.

A cigarette is very versatile and multi-purposed, and it has different uses including the highly personal types in terms of building a connection with one's self, fostering self-balance and driving personal performance, and the social type of usage such as connecting with others using cigarettes. What we are interested in is the individual and personal quality of smoking addiction, not the social aspect of it. This personal quality of smoking is also a highly irrational one, as smokers choose to continue to smoke despite knowing that it will kill them. If smoking addiction is driven by irrational factors, then what are the unconscious motivations driving such an irrational behaviour? The problem with the 'smoking moments' research from the tobacco industry is that it only addresses conscious experiences and leaves out the unconscious, and therefore cannot explain the paradox that educated and intelligent people who are well aware of the risk of smoking still continue to take unacceptable health risks — illogically addicted, in effect. We are interested in pursuing the unconscious motivation and the reasons for such an illogical and health-risking addiction, and this is the area where psychoanalysis can add value to the understanding of smoking addiction.

	PERSONAL MOMENTS									SOCIAL MOMENTS			
	CONNECTION WITH SELF			SELF BALANCE		PERFORMANCE			CONNECTION WITH OTHERS				
#	1a	1	.b	2a	2b		3:	a	3b		4a		4b
Moments	Pass the time	Me	time	Self-reward	Relax Focus / Boos problem solver		Boost /	start up	Projection of self		Socialise		
Core needs	Occupy empty moments	Time on	my own	Indulge myself	ge myself Rebalancing myself Concentrating a thought process			Manage performance and energy levels		Control what others see of me		Bond and share	
Types	Pass the time	Time to be myself	Time out	Self-reward	Decharge	Revive	Focus	Problem solver	Boost	Start up	Impress	Blend in	Socialise
Benefits: Functional	Occupied, busy	Significant period of isolation, escapism	Short period of isolation	Pleasure and indulgence	Stress relief, inner balance	Inner balance	Concentrati on, reduction of external stimulation	Mental reboot, clearer mind	Immediate surge of energy	Gradual but long- lasting energy	Stand out	Blend in, not stand out	Exchange ideas and things, proximity, connection to others
Benefits: Emotional	Stimulated, entertained	Free to be myself, liberated, calm	Out of reach from over stimulation , free to be myself	Fulfilled, deserving, special, accomplished, proud	Soothed, calmed down, back in control,	Restored, recharged, renewed	Capable, sharp, efficient	Creative	Capable, strong	Motivated , optimistic, ready	Powerful, proud, superior, desirable	Accepted by like- minded others, desirable	Connection with others, light-hearted, appreciated

Table 2: Type of smoking moments

# 2. ADDICTION AND SMOKING ADDICTION: FREUD AND KLEIN'S PERSPECTIVES

# 2.1 The Freudian perspective

The psychoanalytic investigation of addiction began a century ago with a common objective to identify the psychodynamic factors that predispose certain groups of individuals to addiction. Addiction was first mentioned by Freud (1890) in his early paper on the effectiveness of hypnosis in curing various kinds of addiction. Seven years later, in his letter to Fliess, Freud (1897) suggested that all forms of addiction including alcohol, morphine and tobacco addiction were only substitutes for masturbation, the 'primal addiction', which was a key factor contributing to hysteria. In his paper 'sexuality in the aetiology of the neuroses' (Freud, 1898), Freud further stated that addiction was associated with the lack of a normal sexual life, and it was bound to relapse unless a normal sexual life could be re-established. In the Freudian framework, masturbation is regarded as an infantile autoerotic sexual activity, which is considered as perversion or neurosis if it persists into adulthood, and that the reactions of the mother to the infant's masturbatory behaviours are one of the key determinants of its personality in adulthood.

Freud himself is well known for his helpless addiction to smoking (cigars). The famous quote attributed to him, 'sometimes a cigar is just a cigar' (Marcovitz 1969, p. 1083), suggests how much Freud enjoyed smoking, to the extent that he was willing to deny all the symbolic meanings of smoking. In fact, cigar smoking is a running theme in Freud's diary and he was unable to work unless he smoked a cigar (Larsen, 1997). Peter Gay, who authored a major biography of Freud, wrote that Freud once told his nephew Harry, aged 17, when he declined a cigarette offered to him by his uncle, 'my boy,

smoking is one of the greatest and cheapest enjoyments in life, and if you decide in advance not to smoke, I can only feel sorry for you' (Gay, 1988, p. 178). In 1923, Freud, at the age of 67, was diagnosed with oral cancer and he went through a total of 33 exhausting and painful operations in the remaining 16 years of his life (The oral cancer foundation, 2010). Despite numerous ultimatums issued by his doctor to stop smoking, Freud continued to smoke until he died, knowing that smoking would eventually kill him.

In his 1897 paper, Freud said that all forms of addiction are substitutes for masturbation, the 'primal addiction', and that smoking addiction is a result of infantile 'oral fixation' caused by pre-mature or delayed weaning (Freud, 1905). In his seminal paper 'Three essays on the theory of sexuality' (Freud, 1905), Freud put forward his theory on psychosexual development stages, which suggested that humans developed through five sequential stages based on various erogenous zones: from oral to anal to phallic to latency and finally to the genital stage. Successful completion of each stage led to health, whereas unsuccessful completion led to a fixation on that particular erogenous zone, and the child would grow up either over- or under-indulging himself as a compensation for the developmental fixation. Specifically, Freud suggested that oral fixation caused by pre-mature or delayed weaning was the contributor of smoking addiction in adulthood.

In the Freudian framework, masturbation is regarded as an infantile autoerotic sexual activity which is considered as a neurosis if it persists into adulthood, and the reaction of the mother to the infant's masturbatory behaviour is one of the key determinants in its personality development in adulthood. Hence, although Freud did not mention the role of the mother in the psychodynamics of addiction, it can be inferred that if the

infant experiences an outright rejection by the mother for its masturbatory behaviour, it could be predisposed to addiction or an addictive personality if the infant is deprived of a normal sexual life in adulthood. In addition, Freud also attributed oral fixation caused by pre-mature or delayed weaning by the mother to a smoking addiction in adulthood, where, again, the mother plays a key role in determining an addictive behaviour of the infant in adulthood.

# 2.2 The Kleinian perspective

Although Klein did not publish any paper on addiction, Rosenfeld (1960) did draw on the Kleinian framework and postulated a Kleinian view on drug addiction. In examining the nature of drug addiction, Rosenfeld (1960) suggested that because the drug addict's ego is too weak to bear the pain of depression caused by losing the good internal object, in order to deal with his anxiety, he will use drugs as an artificial aid to help him regress to the paranoid-schizoid position, so that he can strengthen his manic defence mechanisms, such as idealisation, identification with ideal objects, and denial of persecutory and depressive anxieties (Hinshelwood, 1991; Klein, 1935, 1940) in the drugging states. Rosenfeld stated in his 1960 paper that this regressed state is:

'...a phase of infancy where the infants use hallucinatory wish-fulfilment phantasies in dealing with their anxieties. This state is closely related to the manic mechanisms and defences, and the drug effect being used as an artificial physical aid in the production of the hallucination, in the same way as the infant uses its fingers or thumb as an aid to hallucinating the ideal breast'.

(Rosenfeld, 1960, p. 468)

According to Rosenfeld, drug addiction is also closely linked to the defensive aspect of mania, in which all persecutory anxieties are denied, and the bad self is split off. The drug symbolises an ideal object which can be incorporated, and the omnipotence of the denial and splitting are further strengthened by the pharmacotoxic effect of the drug, so the drug is used to strengthen the defence mechanisms against persecutory anxieties. In addition, drug addiction is also related to the destructive aspect of mania in which the drug symbolises a bad destructive substance that can be incorporated. In the drugging state, the addict's good self is denied and split off, so that he can act out the destructive drives without any remorse and control. Apart from manic defence, Rosenfeld suggested that drug addiction is also connected to depression in which the drug symbolises an ill or dead object, and the drugging state involves a concrete introjection of this ill or dead object. The impoverished ego and inability of the drug addict in coping with pain and frustrations is due to oral regression as well as excessive splitting of his ego and objects. In view of the close connection between drug addiction and ego splitting, Rosenfeld believes that the psychoanalytic treatment of addiction involves helping the addict to re-integrate the split-off parts of their ego.

Klein did not write about smoking addiction in particular, but did write a lot about introjection, which is a mental representation of the oral instinctual impulse in a psychoanalytic context. From a Kleinian perspective, introjection is an unconscious defence against the terrifying internal psychic world that is populated by internal bad objects, and when the internal ego is perceived as being threatened by these bad internal objects, an external good object is introjected to protect the internal ego (Hinshelwood, 1991). If smoking addiction is related to oral fixation in the Freudian school, then it could also be seen as a manifestation of excessive introjection in the Kleinian school. If we follow this line of thinking, from a Kleinian perspective, the act of smoking could

be conceptualised as an unconscious defence against the anxiety of the terrifying internal world populated by bad objects, and a cigarette could then be seen as, at least by the smokers, an external good object that can prevent the internal ego from disintegration.

The above is similar to Rosenfeld's account of drug addiction in his 1960 paper, which can be seen as a Kleinian view on drug addiction. Rosenfeld (1960) suggested that because the ego of the addict is too weak to bear the pain of frustrations, in order to cope with the anxieties when confronted with frustrations, he resorts to the introjection of an external substance, i.e. the drug, to help him split off his bad self and hallucinate the symbiotic reunion with his mother in order to feel protected and safe again, where in this state the drug symbolises the ideal object or the good mother. Therefore, the addict uses drugs as an artificial aid to help him produce hallucinatory wish-fulfilment phantasies, in order to split off his bad self and deny all persecutory anxieties in the drugging state, his ego and defence mechanisms have regressed to and fixated at the paranoid-schizoid position, though he has partially reached the depressive position. In accounting for the reason behind the impoverished ego of the drug addict, Rosenfeld only mentioned that it is due to oral regression and excessive splitting of the addict's ego and objects, without explaining the factors driving the oral regression and excessive splitting. Besides, the drug can also symbolise a bad destructive substance or the bad mother, which is introjected to hallucinate the denial and splitting off of their good self, so that their bad self can act out the destructive drives without any remorse. Finally, the drug can be used to symbolise an ill or dead mother who is introjected in an attempt to protect or repair the damage done to the ill or dead mother.

Unlike the Freudian framework which regards the mother as contributing to the development of addiction or addictive personality, the Kleinian framework regards the mother as an object of symbolisation and identification by the addict, where the three types of mothers – the good mother, the bad mother, and the ill or dead mother – represent different aspects of the drug that are introjected by the addict in order to achieve a state of hallucination.

Despite the rich psychoanalytic literature on addiction, very little has been written on smoking addiction after what has been written by Freud and the Rosenfeld. Only nine papers have been found on PEPWeb, where most of them focused on exploring the symbolic meaning of smoking, confirming the oral origin of smoking, or linking it to the expression of a death wish: Brill (1922) supported Freud's view on the oral origin of smoking. Hiller (1922) provided various symbolic meanings of smoking and suggested that cigarettes, cigars and pipes represent a substitute for the penis or the breast that the smokers were deprived of in childhood, hence the smokers started to smoke because of the phallic significance of cigarettes which reminded them of their childhood deprivation. Green (1923), on the other hand, linked smoking to the expression of a death wish, whereas Berent (1961) emphasised the ritualistic aspect and the fore-pleasures of smoking. Marcovitz (1969) postulated that heavy cigarette smoking is a respiratory addiction, rather than an oral addiction comprising the respiratory triad of inhalation – exhalation – visualisation, which was supported by a subsequent comparative study (Grotjahn, 1972). None of these papers attempted to investigate the aetiology of smoking addiction.

# 2.3 Psychoanalytic views after Freud and Klein

There has been a considerable amount of literature published in the psychoanalytic field on understanding the psychodynamics behind addiction, and in particular drug addiction, after Freud and Klein. A total of 78 hits have been found on PEPWeb on 'addiction', and these addiction-related literature works were written mainly before the 1940s and from the late 1950s onwards, the vacuum in-between was likely to be driven by the then commonly held belief that psychoanalysis was not a suitable cure for addiction.

#### 2.3.1 Before the 1940s

The first group of psychoanalytic literature on 'addiction' was written before the 1940s, where addiction was regarded mainly as an expression of drive derivatives. Rado (1926) was the first one to publish a paper that systematically approached the problem of addiction as a whole in its own right. In order to summarise the theoretical development of addiction in psychoanalytic literature before the 1940s, Rado (1926, 1928), Daniels (1933), Robbins (1935), and Benedek (1936) confirmed oral factors in addiction, Abraham (1926) and Riggall (1923) linked drug addiction and alcoholism to latent homosexuality, Abraham (1926) explored the psychological relations between sexuality and alcoholism, Rado (1933) reviewed the vicissitudes of the ego and emphasised on narcissistic factors in drug addiction, Menninger (1934) explored the psychoanalytic origin of surgical compulsion and linked it to a gratification of the patient's unconscious needs for surgical castrations, Abraham (1908), Glover (1932), and Simmel (1948) emphasised on aggressive factors and the early oedipal conflict in addiction, and Freud (1917), Rado (1926), Benedek (1936), Simmel (1948), Glover (1932) and Crowley (1939) explored the paranoid aspect of addiction.

# 2.3.2 Late 1950s

The second group appeared after the late 1950s, where addiction was regarded mainly as an ego function: Rosenfeld (1960) connected drug addiction to a manic-depressive illness. Khantzian's (1987) 'self-medication hypothesis' suggested that addiction is a manifestation of an early failure to internalise self-care from parents, and due to the lack of these internalisations, addicts are unable to regulate and tolerate affects such as self-esteem or relationships, and therefore, they use drugs to self-medicate and compensate for their inability to tolerate effects. Other ego functions of drug addiction include using the drug as a substitute for a lost object or idealised object (Schur, 1963; Frosch, 1970, Volkan, 1994, cited in Stuart, 1996), to compulsively re-create or deal with an early trauma or dangerous situation in a controllable environment in order to gain mastery over it (Szasz, 1958; Robertson, 2003; Johnson, 2003), to serve as a method of self-punishment to ease the sense of oedipal guilt (Harris, 1964), to defend against the super-ego (Ramos, 2004) and to serve as an external soothing agent (Fleming, 2005), to combat feelings of intolerable helplessness and disintegration (Savitt, 1963; Dodes, 1990, 2003; Johnson, 1999; Khantzian, 2005), to deal with failure in internalisation (Khantzian, 1978), and to re-establish a symbiotic fusion experience as a result of disturbed early object relationships and the fear of good internal objects being overpowered by bad ones (Woollcott, 1981). Some writers, such as Zinberg (1975), investigated the impact of social settings on ego function and drug effect.

# 2.3.3. 1980s and onwards

From the 1980s and onwards, many writers moved away from addiction to drugs and started to explore addiction to various behaviours and mental states, including addiction to alternative belief systems (Cath, 1982), addiction to near death (Joseph, 1983; Gottdiener, 2006), addiction to perfection (Lief, 1983), and addiction to the love relationship (Haaken, 1992). Others explored the processes and casual relationships in

addiction (Adler, 1986; Khantzian, 1987; Lane, et al., 1991; Hopper, 1995; Gabbard, 2002), and the relationship between creativity and addiction (Knafo, 2008).

Some writers tried to re-conceptualise addiction from different theoretical perspectives. In an attempt to understand addiction from a self-psychology perspective, Ulman and Paul (1990, p. 154) suggested that addiction is a manifestation of dependence on 'Addictive Trigger Mechanisms to produce a dissociative and altered sense of self and to provide desperately needed antianxiety and antidepressant self-object functions', Dodes (1996) viewed addiction as a subset of compulsion, Bornstein (1996) reconceptualised addiction based on an integrated object relations/interactionist model of dependency, and Jacobson (2003) regarded sexual addiction as a form of perversion.

To sum up, after Freud and Klein, addiction is mainly regarded either as an expression of drive derivatives related to oral factors, latent homosexuality, narcissistic factors, aggressive factors, and a paranoid aspect; or as an ego function from an object relations perspective, in which manic defence mechanisms are employed to deal with failures in internalisation; or as a form of self-medication to compensate for the absence of an internal good object; or as substitutes for a lost or idealised object; or self-punishment, a defence against the super-ego, as an external soothing agent, or a medium to reestablish the symbiotic fusion experience with the mother. Compared to the drive derivatives perspective, the object relations perspective seems to provide a more comprehensive view of the psychodynamics of addiction.

Amongst the various forms of addiction, smoking addiction is the most unique type: there is an absence of a similar physical withdrawal syndrome that is usually associated with alcohol, sedative, opioid, and stimulant addiction upon smoking cessation, and there is no markedly increased consumption once smokers reach a certain consumption quantity. The above suggests that compared to other types of addiction, smoking addiction seems to be more heavily dependent on psychological factors rather than pharmacological factors.

Added to the intricacy of the dynamics of smoking addiction is that, because a cigarette is a legal fast-moving consumer good, unlike other addictive substances which are either strictly banned from any form of direct sale to consumers or heavily regulated by the government, cigarette consumption has been widely advertised by the tobacco companies as a glamorous and aspirational symbol, and there is also a common belief that tobacco advertising plays a key role in promoting the persistence of smoking addiction.

# 2.4 Cross-disciplinary perspectives on smoking addiction

In spite of the paucity of papers written directly about smoking addiction on PEPWeb, if we turn to the marketing and social science field as a basis for literature search, there has been evidence of an early influence from psychoanalysis on the understanding of smoking addiction and tobacco usage. Such works are Edward Bernays', Freud's nephew and the father of Public Relations in the 1920s; the Motivation Psychology founded by Ernest Ditcher in the 1930s, which is the first systematic attempt to apply psychoanalysis to market research including smoking addiction; Menzies Lyth's landmark ice-cream study in the 1950s to understand the psychoanalytic meaning behind the consumption of 'pleasure food', including ice-cream and tobacco, from an Object Relations school's perspective; and Barry Richards' publication on the psychoanalytic meaning behind consumption and smoking in the 1990s. In the

following paragraphs, we will provide an overview of the above cross-discipline literature review.

## 2.4.1 Early influence of psychoanalysis on marketing: Edward Bernays (1920s)

The application of psychoanalytic concepts in the marketing and advertising field started back in the 1920s when Edward Bernays, the father of public relations and the nephew of Freud, built the theoretical foundation of modern public relations – an important tool in the marketing mix. In his pioneering book 'propaganda', Bernays (1928, p. 37) stated:

'The conscious and intelligent manipulation of the organized habits and opinions of the masses is an important element in democratic society. Those who manipulate this unseen mechanism of society constitute an invisible government which is the true ruling power of our country.'

Bernays made it very clear that the objective of public relations is to manipulate public opinion in order to achieve a certain objective, and those '...who understand the mental processes and social patterns of the masses. It is they who pull the wires that control the public mind' (Bernays, 1928, p. 38). Being the nephew of Freud, it was widely known that he actively made use of Freud's theories of psychoanalysis, especially the impact of the unconscious in forming his public relations strategy.

In the 1920s, Bernays was hired by the American Tobacco Company, one of the original mother companies forming the British American Tobacco Company today, in order to develop a public relations campaign promoting cigarette consumption

amongst women. After consulting the psychoanalyst A. A. Brill (Slater, 2010; Stauber, 2010), Bernays leveraged on the unconscious desire of women to be liberated from their stereotyped role, and launched the legendary 'Torches of Freedom' public relations campaign. He hired a group of beautiful female fashion models to march in the New York City parade, each waving a lit Lucky Strike cigarette and wearing a banner declaring their cigarettes a 'torch of freedom'. The campaign achieved unprecedented media coverage and helped break the social taboo of women smoking in public and establish the cigarette as a symbol of liberation.

Bernays' insight on the power of marketing and advertising in manipulating the unconscious provided a good starting point to understand how people can be driven away from conscious attitudes and thoughts. This makes psychoanalysis a means to understand the unconscious and provide a possible explanation of the apparent irrationality of smoking addiction, although Bernays himself did not publish any related study on smoking addiction.

#### 2.4.2 The impulse and drive perspective: Motivation Research (1930s-1950s)

Due to the general discontent with the failure of conventional quantitative market research to predict consumer behaviours during the 1930s, attempts were made by a group of emigrated Austrian psychoanalysts and psychologists in America, such as Paul Lazarsfeld and Ernest Dichter (Horowitz, 1986), to apply psychoanalytic theories to the understanding of the 'why' of consumer behaviours in the marketing and advertising field. A plethora of qualitative consumer research called 'Motivation Research', which utilised various observation and questioning techniques borrowed from clinical psychology, was conducted and published by these social scientists.

In this chapter, we will firstly provide a general overview on Motivation Research and its evolution, followed by a spotlight on the work of Ernest Dichter – the most controversial Motivation Researcher. Apart from that, we will also provide a topline overview of the main discoveries of Motivation Researchers during the twenty years between the 1930s and the 1950s, when Motivation Research was at its peak, followed by an evaluation of its merits and shortcomings.

#### What is Motivation Research?

Motivation Research, a name derived from the study of human motives, marked the first systematic attempt made by social scientists to apply psychoanalytic theories and knowledge in the understanding of seemingly irrational consumer behaviours. It was triggered by a general dissatisfaction with the perceived lack of depth and analytic subtlety in conventional quantitative market research and economic thinking in the 1930s, which usually failed to explain the motivations behind consumer behaviours. Contrary to conventional experimental-statistical research which made use of large samples, tabulations and statistics to find out the 'what' and 'how' of consumer behaviours, Motivation Research focused on the analysis of unconscious wishes, desires, needs and drives, which was believed to determine why consumers bought one brand and not the other competing alternatives, despite similar functionalities (Williams, 1957).

The underlying assumption behind Motivation Research was that when consumers were asked directly about why a certain purchase was made, they either did not know the reason for their purchase, or did not want to disclose the true reason, hence they tended to provide socially acceptable answers. Motivation Researchers believed that

the most important factor influencing consumers' choices were illogical emotions instead of logical reasons, with repressed drives as the most powerful motivators. As such, Motivation Research was developed as a way to tap into the unconscious of consumers to find out the true reasons for purchase (Samuel, 2011).

Amongst the various borrowed techniques from the social science disciplines, depth interviews and projective techniques were most widely used by Motivation Researchers (Lazarsfeld, 1937; Henry, 1947; Rothwell, 1955). Depth interviews involved hours of one-to-one interviews conducted by a Motivation Researcher with no predetermined question, where the objective of the research was revealed fully to the respondents to gain spontaneous and self-revealing insight. Projective techniques mainly consisted of a word association test, a Thematic Appreciation Test and sentence completion test, and they were used in situations where it was likely for consumers to repress their feelings. Projective techniques involved presenting the respondents with an ambiguous stimulus and asking them to make sense of it, by doing what the respondents would need to fill in the gaps and project part of themselves into the stimulus, hence unknowingly revealed information about themselves (Haire, 1950).

#### The evolution of Motivation Research

Despite its inception in the 1930s, Motivation Research took off in the 1950s. It was legitimised by the American Marketing Association in the early 1950s (Fullerton, 2005), it gained full support from the Marketing Research Techniques Committee in 1951 (Woodward et al., 1950), and was further legitimised by the Advertising Research Foundation in 1952, through a series of publications for advertising agencies. With extensive coverage and publications in the mainstream magazine Business Week in 1954, as well as the release of Packard's highly controversial book 'the hidden

persuader' in 1957, public attention to Motivation Research climaxed and it successfully gained extensive awareness amongst business managers (Fullerton, 2005).

By the mid-1950s, many large-scale organisations were already conducting Motivation Research to deep dive into the consumer psyche. The most prominent Motivation Researchers included many respected social scientists, such as Dr. S.B. Britt, Dr. B.B. Gardner, Dr. H. Herzog, Dr. P. Martineau, Dr. D.W. Twedt, Dr. W.L. Warner and Dr. L. Cheskin (Fullerton, 2005). These Motivation Researchers could be divided into three basic schools of thought, including Dichter from the Freudian one, Warner from a more psychosocial perspective, and Herzog from a more women-inclusive perspective (Samuel, 2011).

Despite its popularity, Motivation Research remained controversial. In 1950, the Market Research Committee of The American Marketing Association alerted the marketing industry that some Motivation Researchers had made unsubstantiated claims and therefore critical assessments of their findings were required. Besides, there was also concern as to the ability and willingness of academic social scientists to work with business executives. Finally, the effectiveness, validity and reliability of the two most frequently employed Motivation Research methodologies, depth interview and projective techniques, were also being challenged (Fullerton, 2005).

To add fuel to the fire, in his international bestseller 'the hidden persuader' in 1957, Packard (1957) challenged the morality of Motivation Research as it enabled marketers to exploit consumers' weaknesses and manipulate them into irrational behaviours by invading into their unconscious thoughts without getting their permission. Worst of all, Motivation Research also attempted to shape the average American's national

character towards the direction of hedonism and self-indulgent materialism (Packard, 1957).

Starting from the 1960s and onwards, there was considerably less media attention given to Motivation Research. Motivation Research started to be de-emphasised when new methods for researching consumer attitudes appeared in the United States. The academic research field started to prefer more quantitative approaches with the advent of computer technology. For example, sophisticated mathematical modelling, simulation, and large-scale multivariate statistical analysis allowed researchers to analyse research results with a new power; besides, newer qualitative research that made use of cultural anthropology in order to develop better questioning techniques also emerged (Fullerton, 2007). In addition, the development of MRI technology has also allowed a new neuromarketing field to emerge, which aims at providing additional insights into cognitive processing that affect consumer attitudes and behaviours (Nelson, 2007).

Having said that, Motivation Research never disappeared in the marketing and advertising industry. In fact, it had been continually reinvented and transformed into various different contemporary research methodologies, such as focus groups, lifestyle studies, and anthropologic and ethnographic research (Horowitz, 1986; Schwarzkopf & Gries, 2010).

## Ernest Dichter – the 'father' of Motivation Research

Ernest Dichter was an Austrian psychologist born in Vienna in 1907. He studied psychoanalysis at the University of Vienna and obtained a doctorate in psychology in 1934. After studying and working with two practising psychoanalysts, Dr. Wilhelm

Steckel and August Aichorn, Dichter opened his own private psychoanalytic practice from 1934 to 1937 at Bergasse 20, which was across the street from where Freud lived, even though Dichter never met Freud in person (Horowitz, 1986; Fullerton, 2007). Dichter emigrated to the United States in 1937. In 1939, he set up a consulting practice that specialised in finding the motivation triggers for consumer purchases, and he named his method 'Motivation Research' (Stern, 2004). In 1946, Dichter founded the Institute for Motivation Research in Croton-on-Hudson, New York and expanded to Switzerland and Germany in subsequent years. Dichter was generally recognised as the 'father' of Motivation Research due to his high public awareness and media exposure, even though he was not the true founder of Motivation Research. He pioneered the application of Freudian psychoanalysis to uncover consumers' hidden motivations, making his unique version of Motivation Research a powerful approach that allegedly could tap into the consumers' 'unconscious', in order to unearth their feelings about brands and products (Williams, 1957).

According to Dichter, true research must be interpretive in nature and it must attempt to identify the true reason behind an attitude or behaviour. However, many attitudes could not be verbalised easily, therefore, marketers must use Motivation Research techniques to go beyond the 'language-inhibited' statements in order to uncover the truth (Bartos, 1977). Dichter swapped the classic 'four P's' of marketing – product, price, place and promotion – with four S's – sustenance, sex, security and status – claiming that these were the universal human drives that determined all consumer behaviours. Dichter was an advocate of the pleasure principle and hedonism, and argued that by freeing the id from rational reasoning, consumers could get rid of their deeply engrained puritanical ethics and obtain the needed moral permission to enjoy the good things in life (Dichter, 1960). Dichter also asserted that all ordinary everyday

goods had a psychic content and were loaded with symbolic meanings grounded with social and cultural significance. Therefore, to Dichter, wood was more than a material, as it signified a symbol of life, glass symbolised uncertainty, ambiguity and mystery, shoes represented strength and independence, hair connoted potency and virility, and all products and brands were extensions of the consumers' personality (Samuel, 2011).

## Dichter's view on why people smoked

In 'the psychology of everyday living', Dichter (1947) devoted a full chapter on why people smoked, though the entire book was dismissed by the psychoanalytic circle and was regarded as of no value to the psychoanalysts, the clinical psychiatrist, or the general practitioner despite its wide circulation (Keiser, 1948). The following is a summary of Dichter's view on smoking and cigarettes.

Through hundreds of direct observations, depth interviews and projective tests, Dichter concluded that taste and quality were not the reason why smokers continued to smoke; it was the psychological pleasure and satisfaction smokers obtained from their cigarettes that counted. According to Dichter, the act of smoking was heavily loaded with childhood wishes, symbolic meanings, and fundamental human needs. The key arguments of Dichter are detailed in the following paragraphs.

Smoking was fun because it served as a substitute for the childhood habit of following the momentary impulses regardless of consequences – it was a legitimate excuse for interrupting work to steal a moment of pleasure. Smoking was also an oral pleasure and there was a direct connection between thumb-sucking and smoking – the satisfied expression on a smoker's face when they inhaled their cigarette was a proof of their sensuous thrill derived from the oral pleasure of smoking.

A cigarette was also a reward that smokers could give themselves any time they wanted. The first and last cigarette of the day had significant symbolic meanings to smokers; the first cigarette represented a consolation prize in preparation of the hectic day ahead, and an excuse to postpone a hard day's working hour; the last cigarette of the day signified the end of the day, where the door could be closed, and the smokers could finally take a rest and safely retreat to their sleep. To many smokers, a cigarette was also used psychologically as a modern hourglass; the burning down of a cigarette resembled a time indicator to the smokers, and it also made time pass more quickly in situations where smokers were forced to be patient. In that sense, cigarettes might even have a psychotherapeutic effect to calm smokers down. Many smokers claimed that smoking helped them think, and this perception could be explained by the fact that smoking provided a smoke-screen to the smokers, which in turn helped shut out distractions so that the mind could best concentrate. At the same time, smoking could also help smokers relax, because it was perceived as rhythmic, like music, and it gave them a legitimate excuse to linger a little longer after meals and to stop working for a little longer. Furthermore, the act of deep inhalation and exhalation in smoking also helped relieve tension and mental depression by forcing a rhythmic expansion of the chest, thus providing a calming function and restoring the normal pace of breathing. This explained why some smokers believed that cigarettes helped provide relief and they could somehow 'blow their troubles away' with cigarettes.

Some of the appeals of lit cigarettes came from the smoke and the fire. Due to its fluidity, the smoke itself was charged with symbolic meanings related to mystery and magic. Many smokers expressed that they enjoyed watching the smoke they puffed out when smoking cigarettes; to them, the exhaled smoke seemed to represent a part of

themselves. The act of smoking represented a co-creation process between the smokers and the cigarettes; the smoke was produced by the smokers, so it satisfied a human's innate and deep-rooted desire for creativity. Fire was regarded as the symbol of life and it was surrounded by much superstition, which in turn was transferred to smoking habits in modern times, e.g. it was bad luck to light three cigarettes with one match, because back in World War I, three soldiers were lighting their cigarettes and the third soldier was hit when the match flared up for the last time.

On a more social front, cigarettes seemed to have a life of their own and appeared to be awakened when lit, so smoking cigarettes was like being with a friend, and one would never feel lonely with a cigarette. In reality, cigarettes also helped break down social barriers and facilitated social conversation; besides, the custom of lighting another smoker's cigarette for them also contained an erotic significance.

Finally, Dichter (1947) concluded in his 'why do we smoke cigarettes?' chapter that, despite general agreement on the health risk associated with smoking, the psychological pleasure derived from smoking proved to be much more powerful than any religious, moral, and legal reasoning, and such a pleasure miracle had so much to offer to the smokers, that one could safely predict that cigarettes were here to stay.

#### A critical evaluation of Motivation Research

From a theoretical perspective, with his overt emphasis on using sexual motivations to provide superficial interpretations and a generalisation of consumer behaviours based on limited evidence, Dichter has violated one of the key scientific theories of psychoanalysis laid down by Freud. In 'wild' psychoanalysis (Freud, 1910), Freud reaffirmed that the word 'sexuality' did not equate genital orgasm in psychoanalysis,

and it was used to denote 'to love', similar to its meaning and usage in German. The expression 'sexual life' had a much wider meaning including (Freud, 1910, p.222-223):

'... all the activities of the tender feelings which have primitive sexual impulses as their source, even when those impulses have become inhibited in regard to their original sexual aim or have exchanged this aim for another which is no longer sexual. For this reason we prefer to speak of psychosexuality, thus laying stress on the point that the mental factor in sexual life should not be overlooked or underestimated.'

With the above remarks, Freud went on to suggest that 'anyone not sharing this view of psychosexuality has no right to adduce psycho-analytic theses dealing with the aetiological importance of sexuality'.

From a methodological perspective, despite the popularity and influence of Motivation Research, it was built on three questionable assumptions: firstly, social science such as sociology and psychoanalysis possessed a body of research readily applicable to advertising and marketing; secondly, researchers in the commercial field had the skills to apply the methods; and thirdly, the results could be generalised to the population. According to Winick (Oxford University Press, 1955), these assumptions were flawed: in the first place, the number of proven laws in social science was small and most of them were undergoing continuous revision; taking projective tests as an example, even in a clinical setting where the patients had a strong motivation to help, the validity was only 30%. Secondly, years of training were required to produce a competent social interviewer, but most of the interviewers used in Motivation Research were either unemployed or recent graduate students who had no training or working experience.

Finally, when different organisations commissioned Motivation Research on similar projects to different research companies, they usually received completely different, sometimes opposite, recommendations from different research companies, hence the results of Motivation Research were highly subjective and its generalisability questionable.

Winick's criticisms on Motivation Research were further reinforced by Roper (Oxford University Press, 1955), who listed seven objections to the Motivation Researchers. These included the Motivation Researchers' selfish attempt to advocate a type of research for personal financial gain; their tendency to present a conclusion based on a partially confirmed hunch with no intention for validation; their failure to present any supporting evidence of their findings and recommendations; their unwillingness to acknowledge other drivers in economic, anthropological, and statistical disciplines and only rigidly and blindly focus on psychology; their inclination to present Motivation Research as a silver bullet to all marketing issues, disregarding all other types of research; their propensity to conceal the limited sample size; and finally, their tendency to distort and dramatise the business results of their recommendations, which could well be a manifestation of the Hawthorn effect (Sonnenfeld, 1985), whereby the increase in sales could be totally unrelated to the recommendations made by the Motivation Researchers.

From a technical perspective, the over-reliance of projective techniques and depth interviews in deriving marketing recommendations in Motivation Research also attracted many criticisms in the research field. To be specific, even in a clinical setting where trained clinical psychologists were aided by a wealth of personal background information about their patients, it was always difficult for them to differentiate

projective test results upon which their patients would really act, and those which merely served as a substitute for action. In a market research context, this meant the 'unconscious' drives revealed in projective tests in order to purchase a product might not lead to real purchase action (Lindzey, 1952). Furthermore, other problems associated with projective tests included firstly, that the produced results were heavily affected by momentary environmental and personal factors of the interviewers and respondents, by the interaction between them, by the time and place of the tests, and by how the results were analysed. To what extent these momentary impulses would last long enough to result in an intention or actual action to purchase a product was therefore questionable. Moreover, there was a lack of normative data for all projective tests except the Rorschach test, which in turn undermined the objective appraisal of the obtained information. Finally, it was debatable whether the interviewers and analysts of commercial market research firms were qualified to conduct proper projective tests, as this issue was further complicated by the fact that the proper administration of projective tests required an unhurried and relaxed atmosphere, and a large number of carefully selected and standardised pictures was required to identify a consistent pattern, which was something that the commercial interviews and analysts lacked (Rothwell, 1955).

Depth interviews, another key technique employed by the Motivation Researchers, could also suffer from serious distortion in interpretation. The risk was intensified with the lack of an evaluation methodology to justify the results yielded by Motivation Research, and what marketers and advertisers obtained from Motivation Researchers could be just a hunch rather than an insight, based on the 'unconscious' drivers of consumers (Rothwell, 1955). An underlying assumption of depth interviews was that the 'unconscious' could be tapped into in these few-hour sessions, leading to the

identification of hidden motives. However, one must recognise that there was a huge difference between a psychoanalytic session and a depth interview session, so the 'unconscious' suggested by Freud could not possibly be the 'unconscious' alluded to by Motivation Research. The main difference is in the motivation context that led to a conversation between two people in these sessions. In the psychoanalytic treatment, the patient went to the psychoanalyst to resolve the acute pain resulting from their neurotic disorder. The aim of the treatment was to allow for re-admission of the repressed elements into the patient's consciousness. This process was extremely painful and it took years of treatment for the patient to accept the painful reality as a lesser evil than the neurotic pain. On the contrary, the motivation context in depth interviews was reversed, i.e. the consumer did not look for help, but it was the interviewer who approached the consumer for a business motive. As such, the consumer who went into a depth interview had much less powerful motives to open up than the patient in a psychoanalytic session, therefore it was highly questionable whether the 'unconscious' could be uncovered in such a low intensity context. In addition, as the 'unconscious' that Freud referred to took years to unearth, it was highly debatable that a few hours' interview session would be able to uncover such materials (Politz, 1956).

Despite the theoretical, methodological, technical, and ethical debates, the ideas established by Motivation Research continue to be a significant influence on the practices of the advertising industry in the twentieth century. First of all, Motivation Researchers were the first ones to stress the importance of image and persuasion, rather than product, in advertising, and it is now commonly known in the marketing and advertising field today that products are an extension of the character traits of consumers, and therefore can be seen as an expression of their personality; Coca Cola

is selling the idea of youth, refreshment; and celebration rather than carbonated soft drinks, and Nike is selling exhaustion, achievement, and success rather than sneakers. Secondly, Motivation Research continues to be used by research practitioners (Levy 2003, 2005), and it is regarded as a pre-cursor to various contemporary research methodologies, such as focus group research, lifestyle studies, and anthropologic and ethnographic research (Horowitz, 1986; Tadajewski, 2006; Schwarzkopf & Gries, 2010). Finally, Motivation Research also lays the foundations of the study of Consumer Behaviour as a discipline today (Fullerton, 2011). Engel, who published an article on the merit of Motivation Research in 1961, later became the lead author on the pioneering textbook on consumer behaviour, in which the organisation of topics was taken directly from Motivation Research (Fullerton, 2011).

In spite of its general adoption in contemporary marketing, advertising and marketing research, and the fact that it did provide some interesting observations on smoking behaviours, such as the act of smoking being heavily imbued with childhood wishes, symbolic meanings, and fundamental human needs, and therefore the taste and quality of the cigarettes were not the reason why smokers continued to smoke, Motivation Research did not explain the origin of such addictive behaviours, e.g. why would a cigarette, out of so many other products, be chosen as an object to satisfy childhood wishes, or why the act of smoking is infused with so many symbolic meanings. More importantly, Motivation Research did not explain why cigarette smoking is addictive. Furthermore, with its over-reliance on sexual impulse and drives in accounting for consumer behaviours, Motivation Researchers neglected the vital role played by social factors in driving consumer behaviours in general and smoking addiction in particular. Therefore, Motivation Research findings do not seem to add much value to the understanding of our research question on smoking addiction.

## 2.4.3 The Object Relations perspective (1950s and onwards)

The 1950s marked the beginning of the psychoanalytic contribution to marketing and advertising from the British Object Relations School, which provided new levers to the understanding of consumption and smoking addiction. To be specific, the analytic framework was shifted from the emphasis of sexual pleasures, derived from the satisfaction of impulse and drive to pre-genital oral and sucking pleasures, derived from relating to objects, as evident in the contributions of Menzies Lyth and Richards, detailed in the following paragraphs.

#### Tavistock Institute of Human Relations (1950s-1970s)

Between 1950 and 1970, the Tavistock Institute of Human Relations (TIHR), a sister institution to the Tavistock Clinic, was approached by many major companies for the development and marketing of their products, which marked the beginning of TIHR's explorations, from a British Object Relations perspective, as to what motivated consumers to buy things. From then onwards, a diversity of pioneering studies on consumer behaviours utilising Object Relations psychoanalytic ideas emerged. Amongst the many research projects undertaken by TIHR, the study on the associative links between ice cream, milk, and the breast by Menzies Lyth using a Kleinian Object Relations approach seems to bear the highest relevance to the understanding of smoking addiction, since both ice cream and cigarettes can be grouped under a special kind of food called 'pleasure foods'.

In 'envy and gratitude and other works: 1946-1963', Klein (1975, p. 95) stated that 'the infant's relations to his first object, the mother, and towards food are bound up with

each other from the beginning'. This view was taken up and further developed by Menzies Lyth in her landmark ice cream study. In 1950, a study was commissioned by an advertising agency and their client to find out how to increase the sales of ice cream in the winter. Using the technique of group discussions derived by Bion and pioneered at TIHR (Miller and Rose, 1997), a random group of potential consumers were recruited for the discussion on their consumption habits of ice cream. The discussion sessions were facilitated by a moderator and the verbatim accounts were transcribed by another researcher in the room. With this technique, a kind of free association by the consumers emerged, starting with practical questions and later on veering off into the underlying unconscious dynamics of ice cream consumption, which involved a lot more complex forces than the ice cream manufacturer had originally imagined, rendering their intention on increasing ice cream's winter sale via penetrating into the family meal system at home, an extremely difficult task.

As reported in Menzies Lyth's paper 'the development of ice cream as a food' (Menzies Lyth, 1989), ice cream could be consumed either at home or on external premises. For home consumption, it was revealed in the group that only three percent of homes had refrigerators and none had home freezers, which made the idea of home consumption of ice cream an unrealistic target. Some respondents even complained about the teasing quality of ice cream advertisements, which encouraged home consumption. In addition, there were also problems for the inclusion of ice cream in the family meal system. For the housewives, providing ice cream as a dessert in the family meal triggered a sense of guilt, because ice cream was an off-the-shelf ready-to-eat item, so the housewives did not need to do anything to prepare it. Therefore, serving ice cream was seen as an attack on their role as the provider of food in the family, and hence in conflict with their wish to sustain their feeding role. Furthermore, ice cream was seen as a competitor

to the custard the housewives made themselves, as serving ice cream involved a visible additional cost, hence an additional financial burden to the family, whereas custard cost nothing in the eyes of the housewives, because it was made from 'free' ingredients already available at home.

Furthermore, Menzies Lyth (1989) also referred to Melanie Klein's work on the 'internal world' and argued that the 'internal society' was the bridge between the psychological and the social, as an external stimulus had to be taken in and experienced inside in order for it to exert any significant influence on the individual. The notion of the 'internal society' had a substantial impact on behaviours related to food and eating, because the experience of feeding and one's emotional relationship with the mother were intimately linked, and these early experiences also formed the major components of the 'internal society'. Therefore, eating was not purely an isolated act to obtain nourishment, and it should be regarded as a major social and emotional activity for all human beings, because people always eat in the context of the 'internal society'.

In the same paper, Menzies Lyth put forward the concept of 'pleasure foods', which was a synthesis between Kurt Lewin's field theory, i.e. the impact of environmental factors, and psychoanalysis, i.e. the internal environment through which the consumers responded to field forces. According to Menzies Lyth:

'Ice cream belongs to a group of products which may be described as pleasure foods. Other products in this group are chocolates and sweets, alcoholic and soft drinks, and many kinds of preserves, sweetmeats and desserts. Closely associated, though not actually eaten or drunk, are tobacco and chewing gum. These products are related to certain psychological and social factors and

characteristic of them is their ability to gratify oral desires and, like the breast with the infant, change depression and anxiety into pleasure.'

(Menzies Lyth, 1989, p.71-72)

To Menzies Lyth, pleasure food involves 'a situation where the realistic nutritional use of food may be submerged by its use to increase pleasure and reduce pain within relationships. Food is used to mediate and to symbolize relationships... food is a relationship substitute... the ritual of the bedtime drink is often linked with the longing for a good internal mother-baby relationship through the emphasis on milk, on the feeding properties of the drink and on its sweetness. The drink establishes the symbol of a good mother inside who will give or protect the good experiences of sleep or even life itself, since many people seem to fear that sleep will deepen into death' (Menzies Lyth, 1989, p. 62-64).

Menzies Lyth pointed out that commercial advertisings are usually able to leverage these widespread social patterns in a sophisticated, sensitive and impactful manner that reinforces these deep-rooted patterns with commercial success. One classic example of how advertising cleverly exploited how we dealt with our relationship gap can be seen in the 'bridge that gap with a Cadbury's snack' advertising campaign; even though the manifest gap is a hunger gap, the latent unconscious gap is in fact a relationship gap, and by eating Cadbury's snack one can temporarily bridge the gap between our internal and external societies using food, which matches how people usually deal with separations in their internal and external societies.

In early mother-infant interactions, the infant learned to establish primitive casual relationships between food, feeding, the mother, and emotional experiences; taking in

good food from a good mother aroused positive emotional experiences and alleviated bad ones; lacking food from a bad mother evoked negative emotional experiences and reduced good ones. These primitive causal connections continued to exert their influences as the infant grew up, even though the memories remained unconscious. Oral gratification through the consumption of 'pleasure foods' triggered both conscious and unconscious memories of the early feeding relationship with the mother, which in turn helped to reduce anxieties and depression derived from the primitive infantile anxiety and depression associated with the loss of the good object, i.e. the breast. Hence, the consumption of 'pleasure foods' was regarded as a compensation for the loss of the breast, and its need was most acute in situations that awakened these primitive needs, so the food value of these 'pleasure foods' was only secondary compared to the psychological pleasure they provided through the oral gratification related to early psychological experiences. This group of 'pleasure foods' included chocolates and sweets, alcoholic and carbonated soft drinks, preserves, sweetmeats and desserts, as well as tobacco and chewing gum even though they were not physically swallowed.

Due to the strong connections between food, interpersonal relationships, and emotional experiences, food was sometimes used as a relationship-substitute to deal with separation anxieties aroused in external and internal societies, resulting in detachment from its nutritional values:

'This kind of oral gratification serves then as a method of alleviating current anxieties and depression which are in part the derivatives of the infantile anxiety and depression connected with the actual loss of the breast. Compensation for this loss is sought in the consumption of substitute objects,

the pleasure foods. Thus, the need for them becomes particularly great when contemporary difficulties awaken again the residues of the earlier situations which to a greater or lesser extent exist in anyone.'

(Menzies Lyth, 1989, p. 72)

Therefore, pleasure foods are used to increase pleasure and reduce pain in an interpersonal relationship, instead of consumed for their nutritional value. The danger of such detachment was manifold. Firstly, it disturbed the control systems that regulated nutritional signals and nutritional needs, resulting in obesity or malnutrition or both. Secondly, the foods that satisfied emotional instead of nutritional needs usually contained high carbohydrates and refined sugar, which caused a rapid elevation of blood sugar, hence creating the experience of immediate physical and emotional uplift. Due to the very natures of these 'pleasure foods', people could easily become addicted to them without being aware of it. The psychoanalytic explanations of such addiction could be that in their attempt to deny the depriving and frustrating internal mother linked with the carbohydrates, the addict wanted to prove that their mother was capable of giving food, therefore they forced her to give what she could not or would not give, which could lead to disastrous results. In the postscript of the same paper, Menzies Lyth said:

'When this paper was originally written, pleasure foods, with the possible exception of alcohol, could be regarded as a relatively innocent way to relieve anxiety and distress, with good nutrition as a bonus. Unfortunately, this is no longer the case; so many of the ingredients of the pleasure foods are now suspect: sugar, animal fats, chocolate; tobacco can actually be a killer, and alcohol can be dangerous expect in small amounts.'

To Menzies Lyth, ice cream was 'the pleasure food par excellence' (Menzies Lyth, 1989) because of its symbolic resemblance to the breast and the mother-infant relationship. The term 'ice cream' itself was associated with a breast that gave cream, something even better than milk. The serving of ice cream in little round blobs in cups or cones made one tempted to lick it, or to bite off the pointy end of the cone and treat it as a nipple through which to suck down the ice cream. Besides, the physical sensation of eating ice cream was so complete and pleasurable that it was capable of annihilating all the anxieties and worries that one had, like the child at the breast, as to the child, the world consisted of only good things. Since ice cream melted in the mouth, there was no need to use teeth in its consumption, hence the breast could be preserved against attack and destruction by greedy devouring bites. Besides, the coldness of the ice cream produced contractions in the stomach walls, as if it went in intact and almost alive in the stomach. Therefore, at every stage, the magical emotion was reinforced and proven to the consumers by the physical sensations they experienced. As such, Menzies Lyth believed that ice cream could be used as a powerful substitute for the breast to ease off anxieties and depression when an individual was confronted with deprivation reminiscent of their infantile experience, and compensation for the loss was sought in the consumption of the substitute objects, i.e. ice cream being the 'pleasure food par excellence'.

As a result of the resemblance of ice cream to the breast, the characteristics of its consumer behaviours were also heavily charged with infantile omnipotent and destructive forces. The infant's emotions were marked with great violence, it was all-happy or all-sad, and it could rapidly swing from one end to the other. The infantile

omnipotence and magical power in its phantasy was contrasted with its powerlessness in reality, hence deprivation of the breast, greed, and envy would trigger immediate and aggressive omnipotent attack against the breast. Because of the concreteness of its thinking, the infant believes that it has really destroyed the breast in reality, resulting in guilt, depression, and anxiety in fear of retaliation from the angry breast. In order to assuage these feelings, the infant needs the magical reappearance of the breast; it needs its wishes to have a magical power to bring back the destroyed breast to a live one again, as if it has re-created the breast by magic with no real effort involved.

Given the psychoanalytically charged emotions behind the consumption of ice cream, Menzies Lyth (1989) pointed out that 'pleasure food' is 'intensely connected with primitive pleasure situations at the breast' and it has a 'great power to act as a substitute for the breast, to wipe out anxieties and depression' (1989, p. 73). Hence, the consumer consumption behaviours are characterised as the overwhelming need to combine all the pleasure foods in order to achieve the greatest pleasure in one go, like the primitive infantile greed, and the need to reassure oneself by having all the good things exclusively for oneself only. There are a few areas to watch out for in the consumption experience of this particular kind of 'pleasure food'. Specifically, ice cream could not be served too cold, for it would turn pleasure into a neuralgic pain, and a good object into a bad object, resulting in hatred and attack. Besides, as a result of consumers' infantile concrete thinking and the lack of the concept of object permanence, the absence of immediate availability of ice cream to satisfy the consumers' impulsive desire would likely trigger violent infantile hostility against the ice cream manufacturer, as such easy availability, i.e. the magic appearance of the breast on desire, was more important than good taste that implied quality.

As suggested by Menzies Lyth (1989), in order to resolve the issue of detachment of the nutritional value of 'pleasure food', there is a need to promote an increase in people's ability to differentiate between nutritional and non-nutritional use of food, so that these different needs are dealt with properly. Moreover, some adjustments are also needed to narrow the gap between one's self and other images in the internal society and their external reflections. Finally, the internal mother who spoils the child by popping a candy into its mouth every time it cries must be replaced by a responsible mother who responds to the emotional needs of the child.

#### The search for objects in consumption and smoking (1990s)

In 'disciplines of delight: the psychoanalysis of popular culture' (1995), Richards suggested that consumption was heavily embedded with a projective quality: consumer goods and their associated imagery attributes could be regarded as a projection system, and the imageries depicted in advertising could be seen as the stimulus materials to evoke the respective projections, which was in turn put into it by marketers via prelaunch market research. According to this line of thinking, consumers should not be seen as totally passive in their purchase decision and hence prone to the 'hidden persuasions' of Motivation Researchers, as they are in fact agents in their own decisions. Richards' view is contrary to the underlying assumption of Motivation Research on the inability of consumers to articulate the true reasons behind their consumption behaviours, leaving room for marketers and advertisers to manipulate their purchase decisions. In fact, one can argue that the persuasive meanings consumers find in advertisings and goods are in part their own creations, though many of them are likely to have been defined and validated by market research respondents, who share similar demographic and psychographic profiles with.

Richards' view is in line with Miller and Rose (1997), who suggested that three preconditions must be met in order for a relation to be formed between the individual and the product. They included firstly, the active desires of the individual; secondly, the qualities, pleasures and satisfactions provided by the product, communicated partly by the advertising and marketing campaign; and finally, everyday routines and habits of the individual. Only when a matching of individuals, products and habits had been achieved, would it be possible to overcome resistance to purchasing particular goods. Therefore, there is no such thing as the unscrupulous manipulation of passive consumers; instead, consumers should be viewed as active agents in their own consumption patterns.

According to Richards (1995), consumptions involved a kind of object search: consumers were continuously searching for either an external manifestation of an ideal object, which was unachievable, or good objects, which were gratifying and containing, but at the same time restraining, representing both the pleasure and reality principles. As such, in their consumption of goods, consumers were trying to introject the goods as good internal objects and to enact a good object relationship with them.

With regard to cigarette consumption, Richards (1995) suggested that cigarette smoking was about dealing with an ambivalent object, and a cigarette could be regarded as both a good and a bad object: a cigarette was about libidinal satisfaction and oral needs; it promoted the formation and maintenance of social bonds, and it projected an image of authority and status in different ways for different brands. It was also a signifier of maturity, because cigarette smoking involved inhaling a harsh and dry smoke, not sucking warm and smooth milk that nourished us. To women, cigarette smoking was an important symbol of female liberation. As such, a cigarette could be

regarded as a good object because it brought the pleasure of gratification and social engagement, as well as the experience of manageable disillusion and symbolic maturation. Furthermore, a cigarette also had a containing function in which during the process of smoking, the pristine, pure and perfect cigarette was transformed into a repulsive stub that could be disposed of. Hence, one could argue that a cigarette is also a kind of containing object that contained the expelled badness of the smokers.

At the same time, cigarette smoking was also about the overcoming of disappointments. Through the act of smoking, the smokers experienced the harshness, emptiness and toxicity of the smoke repeatedly, whilst at the same time they also experienced the sense of achievement by bringing such toxicity under control over and over again. To the smokers, such experiences could be regarded as a key pleasure in smoking, i.e. the experience of introjecting a toxic smoke that firstly hit and irritated the throat, followed by the act of bringing the toxic smoke under control, via taking all of it inside and expelling it with impeccable calmness. In that sense, a cigarette could also be seen as a bad object that was controlled by the smokers through introjection, and it could be argued that addiction to smoking was a compulsive attachment to an enthralling bad object.

Apart from providing an Object Relations view on consumption, Richards (1995) also suggested that advertising had a role to play in managing the guilt experienced by consumers in the consumption of goods. The feeling of guilt was unconsciously linked to the innocent consumption of everyday goods, or through the manufacturing and acquisition of these goods, which in phantasy could be an expression of an endless greed, leading to the destruction of others who lack these goods. This fear was similar to the depressive anxieties experienced when a loved object had been irreversibly

destroyed, or a sibling cruelly deprived, or persecutory anxieties of being castrated, poisoned, devoured, or abandoned as a consequence of an innocent everyday consumption.

Advertising seemed to perform a role in comforting the anxious consumers by resolving such guilt feelings explicitly. This was achieved either through provoking a libidinal revolt by encouraging consumers to let go and spoil themselves, or by luring the guilt out into the open in order to contain it. Richards (1995) believed that advertising itself did not create the primitive themes of insecurity, envy, and guilt, but they were highly proficient in re-articulating these themes to shape the principal experience of one's self and society, and link the resolution of issues to the consumption of goods. Hence, the discharging role of advertising was a very helpful psychological function to the consumers who wanted to consume at a minimum psychological cost.

# 3. WINNICOTT AND HIS PERSPECTIVE ON ADDICTION AND SMOKING ADDICTION

Amongst all the theorists, Winnicott has provided a unique view by pointing out that 'addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 97). In this chapter, we will provide a brief overview of Winnicott's contributions to psychoanalytic theories and clinical practices, as well as a critical evaluation of his work, especially with respect to the transitional object and transitional phenomena which are closely linked to addiction in Winnicott's theoretical framework. Jacobs (1995) provided a very good framework for summarising Winnicott's work. He divided his work into contributions to theory and contributions to clinical practices, and before that, a brief description of Winnicott's life was provided. Jacobs' framework informs the chronological order of presented materials in this chapter.

Winnicott was born on April 7<sup>th</sup>, 1896 in Plymouth, Devon, in a well-off family. His father, Sir John Frederick Winnicott, was a merchant who later became Lord Mayor of Plymouth, a magistrate, and was subsequently knighted. Being the youngest child and the only boy in his family, Winnicott's childhood was surrounded by women; he grew up with his mother, two elder sisters, a nanny, and an aunt who stayed with them, and he did not manage to see much of his father due to his work and civil duties. Both of his parents were leading members of the local Methodist church, and this non-conformist background is believed to have an influence on Winnicott's need to grow out of the restrictive dogma in psychoanalysis (Jacobs, 1995).

In 1909, Winnicott went to the Leys School in Cambridge when he was thirteen years old. It was at Leys School that he discovered Darwin's 'Origin of Species', and from then onwards he started collecting all of Darwin's work (Winnicott, 1957). He was inspired by Darwin on the importance of the environment in shaping human adaptations and was convinced that there exists an innate drive for human development towards health, both physically and mentally (Jacobs, 1995).

In 1914, Winnicott went to study biology at Jesus College, Cambridge at the age of eighteen. At twenty-one years of age in 1917, he joined the Royal Navy as a surgeon probationer until the end of World War One. In 1918, when he was twenty-two, Winnicott went to St. Bartholomew's Hospital to continue his studies in medicine, and he qualified as a medical doctor in 1920 when he was twenty-four. It was during his medical training at St. Bartholomew's Hospital that he met Lord Thomas Horder and understood the importance of listening attentively and carefully to patients (Jacobs, 1995).

During the time when Winnicott was a medical student, for some reason he found it disturbing that he could not recall his dreams, so he started looking for a book to shed light on this. It was at that time that he chanced upon Freud's pioneering book 'The interpretation of dreams', which marked his discovery of psychoanalysis, a subject matter that captivated him for the rest of his life (Winnicott, 1957).

1923 was an important year for Winnicott with three major life events. Firstly, at the age of twenty-seven, he joined the Paddington Green Children's Hospital and Queen Elizabeth's Hospital, Hackney, starting his career as a child physician and staying there for forty years. Besides, he also opened a private practice in the Harley Street area, so

that he could see the patients he was particularly interested in. Winnicott spent most of his time working in these three clinics, and by the time he retired, he had worked with over 60,000 cases. Secondly, in the same year, Winnicott also entered his ten-year personal analysis with James Strachey, who was analysed by Freud and later become one of Freud's English translators. Thirdly, he married his first wife Alice Taylor; their marriage lasted for twenty-five years and ended in 1949 (Jacobs, 1995).

In 1927, when Winnicott was 31 years old, he was accepted by the British Psychoanalytical Society as a candidate for training. He qualified as an adult psychoanalyst in 1934 and as a child psychoanalyst in the following year. According to Paskauskas (1993), Winnicott was the society's only male child analyst as well as a paediatrician at that time.

From 1933 to 1938, Winnicott entered into his second five-year personal analysis with Joan Riviere, who was also analysed by Freud and a loyal supporter of Melanie Klein. At the invitation of Ernest Jones to analyse his wife and his two children, Melanie Klein came to London in 1926 in order to start her child analysis practice, and with her growing number of followers in London, the Kleinians started to dominate the British Psychoanalytic Society in the 1930s. With the recommendation of Strachey, Winnicott became a student of Klein for five years from 1935 to 1940. At that time, Winnicott was an important member of the Kleinian group, and was named by Klein as one of the five Kleinian training analysts during the period of 'the controversial discussions' between 1942 and 1944, whereby a series of meetings were held between the Kleinian school and the Viennese school within the British Psychoanalytical Society, leading to the establishment of a tripartite division of training in the society with the Kleinians, the Anna Freudians and the Middle Group.

During the period of 'the controversial discussions', Winnicott became a psychiatric consultant to the Government Evacuation Scheme in Oxfordshire. It was at this time that he met Claire Britton, a psychiatric social worker in the same scheme, whom he later married in 1951 after his divorce. As suggested by Davis and Wallbridge (1981), the experience of this evacuation scheme further inspired Winnicott to bring in the impact of the environment upon his own theoretical psychoanalytic framework.

After the war and until his retirement, Winnicott played an important role in the British Psychoanalytic Society. He was appointed as the physician in charge of the Child Department of the Institute of Psychoanalysis for twenty-five years, and he was also the president of the British Psychoanalytic Society for two terms from 1956 to 1959, and from 1965 to 1968 (Jacobs, 1995). In addition, he was very active from 1945 until his death in holding various roles and performing various duties in other Societies. He was Chairman of the Medical Section of the British Psychological Society, president of the Paediatric Section of the Royal Society of Medicine, president of the Association of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, and an active member of the UNESCO and WHO study groups (Davis and Wallbridge, 1981). Besides, Winnicott was also in high demand as a lecturer. He enjoyed travelling around the world visiting nonpsychoanalytic groups, and he was always interested in the application of psychoanalysis to other professional disciplines, and presenting ideas derived from paediatrics, child psychiatry, and psychoanalysis in a language appropriate for parents, teachers, nurses, midwives, social workers, etc. (Winnicott, 1965a; Clancier and Kalmanovitch, 1987).

During his lifetime, Winnicott was able to reach a wide audience, especially with his series of broadcast talks on BBC Radio at various times during the Second World War and the second half of the 1940s. The BBC broadcast was subsequently published in 'The child, the family, and the outside world' in 1964, a very popular book that sold 50,000 copies in its first three years and was reprinted four times before Winnicott died in 1971 (Jacobs, 1995).

On the main page of PEPWeb, Winnicott's three landmark papers 'Transitional Objects and Transitional Phenomena—A Study of the First Not-Me Possession' (1953), 'Hate in the Counter-Transference' (1949) and 'The Theory of the Parent-Infant Relationship' (1960) are consistently ranked as the top three most searched papers, ahead of Klein's 'Notes on Some Schizoid Mechanisms' (1946), indicating his widespread popularity in the academic and research field.

Winnicott was a highly creative and original thinker. His ideas of the transitional object and transitional phenomena have attracted pervasive interests inside and outside the academic field, and his squiggle game represents a ground-breaking approach for the clinicians to understand and treat very young children. During his lifetime, he made a significant shift in Freud's concept of illusion and turned it into a positive indicator, and he also adapted Klein's play therapy to include the spatula game with infants and mothers in clinical settings.

Despite all these original contributions to the psychoanalytic field, Winnicott did not see himself as being original, and he was never interested in precedence. He mentioned in his 1975 book 'Collected papers: through paediatrics to psycho-analysis' that:

'I shall not first give a historical survey and show the development of my ideas from the theories of others, because my mind does not work that way. What happens is that I gather this and that, here and there, settle down to clinical experience, form my own theories, and then, last of all, interest myself to see where I stole what.'

(Winnicott, 1975, p. 145)

In his 1965 book 'The maturational process and the facilitating environment: studies in the theory of emotional development,' he said:

'First I wish to acknowledge my debt to my psychoanalytic colleagues. I have grown up as a member of this group, and after so many years of inter-relating it is now impossible for me to know what I have learned and what I have contributed. The writings of any one of us must be to some extent plagiaristic. Nevertheless I think we do not copy; we work and observe and think and discover, even if it can be shown that what we discover has been discovered before.'

(Winnicott, 1965a, p. 11)

In his letter to Rapaport, he said:

'I sometimes come around to feel compelled to work in my own way and to express myself in my own language first; by a struggle I sometimes come round to reworking what I am saying to bring it in line with other work, in which case I usually find that my own "original" ideas were not so original as I had to think when they were emerging.'

(Rodman, 1987, pp. 53-54).

Even though Winnicott did not refer much to others' ideas in his papers, he was aware of the influence that other theorists had on him and he never laid claim to complete originality. This is perhaps one reason why he did not think he was original. As was observed by Jacobs (2008), Winnicott's thinking was influenced by Darwin, Freud, and Klein, in chronological order, but he always transformed their theories with a perspective that was uniquely Winnicott's.

Inspired by Darwin's natural adaptation and selection process in his evolutionary theory, Winnicott sees the mother (the environment of the baby) as continuously adapting to the needs of the baby, by gradually introducing the world in small doses to it, facilitating its progression from absolute dependence to relative dependence. To Winnicott, human development is a struggle against compliance with the environment, and this is the part where Winnicott reversed the Darwin equation (Phillips, 1988).

Despite his admiration for Freud, Winnicott moves away from Freud's father-child relationship to the mother-infant nursing couple, from the centrality of the Oedipus Complex to the early mother-infant relationship, from an over-emphasis on drive and instinct and phantasy to the centrality of needs and environmental provision. He also replaces the psychosexual developmental stages of childhood with an emphasis on the tasks involved in ego development towards maturity and independence.

Winnicott was Klein's student and he was under her supervision for six years from 1935 – 1941 (Jacobs, 2008). In his 1965 book 'The maturational process and the facilitating environment: studies in the theory of emotional development', he detailed

Klein's key contributions to psychoanalysis, including the use of toys and play to understand the child's inner world, introjections and projections, inner and outer worlds, the persecutory internal objects, primitive defences, the capacity for concern, and the reparative outcome of guilt. Notwithstanding the above appreciations, Winnicott rejects the death instinct and opposes the emphasis on constitutional factors and phantasy, believing that it should be the environmental provisions that count.

Winnicott was a prolific writer of short papers and case notes and was not so much an author of extensively argued books, therefore, unlike Freud and Klein, there is a lack of definitive structure in Winnicott's theory. Having said that, one can still form a sequence and distil major areas from his published work. Jacobs (1995) provided a very comprehensive summary on the three main areas of Winnicott's idea, based on his 1965 book 'The maturational processes and the facilitating environment: studies in the theory of emotional development'. These include the developmental journey towards maturity, the task of mothering, and things that can go wrong in this process, which we shall describe in detail in the following paragraphs.

# 3.1 Winnicott's major contributions to theories

## 3.1.1 Psyche-soma indwelling

Winnicott believes that in every child, there is an innate growth towards health and maturity, provided that there is a 'good enough' environment to contain and facilitate the development. To start with, there needs to be a body-mind unity, and a process of 'dwelling of the psyche in the body' (Winnicott, 1988b, p. 123), an essential achievement many people would have taken for granted. The psyche gradually comes

to terms with the body through accumulations of personal experiences, such as the physical impulses, skin sensation and muscular exercise of the baby, as well as environmental experiences, including how the mother holds the baby tightly in order to allow sufficient time for it to adjust to the gravity, something which is very new and alien to the baby. Generally speaking, a normal infant is firmly rooted to the body only occasionally even at one year old, for the psyche of the infant can easily lose touch with its body when, for example, it wakes up from deep sleep. That is also why mothers would gradually wake up the infant before lifting it up to prevent the unspeakable panic that can come with waking up, when the psyche has not caught up with the new position of the body (Winnicott, 1965a). Therefore, the body-mind unity at the beginning of life cannot be taken for granted and the progression towards this unity stage is a major developmental achievement.

## 3.1.2 Ego-integration

Winnicott did not follow Freud's tripartite structural model of the psyche that regards the theoretical constructs of the id, ego and super-ego psychic apparatus, developed at different stages in our lives, whose interactions and activities govern our mental life. In a paper on ego integration, Winnicott even openly contradicted Freud's model and said, 'there is no id before ego' (1965b, p. 56). To Winnicott, the infant is unintegrated at the very beginning, it is without a definitive conscious and unconscious, and all the infant has is 'an armful of anatomy and physiology, and added to this a potential for development into a human personality' (Winnicott, 1988a, 89). Therefore, the ego does not exist at the beginning, its development depends on the good enough mothering of the mother in providing a good enough support for the early ego, in order to hold the infant and contain its unthinkable anxieties including:

- 1. going to pieces,
- 2. falling forever,
- 3. having no relationship to the body,
- 4. having no orientation, and
- 5. complete isolation because there is no means of communication.

(Winnicott, 1965b. p. 58; 1988a, pp. 98-99)

Ego integration relies on good enough holding of the mother, allowing for a development of a sense of time and space, linking the baby with the physical body and the bodily functions, organising these sensory motor events into an internal psychic reality, and finding good objects, such as the breast and the milk in the environment. When ego integration is combined with the feeling of body-mind unity and the psyche is able to dwell within the body sufficiently, then a 'satisfactory personalisation' (Winnicott, 1975, p. 151) is achieved.

As the baby achieves a stronger body-mind unity over time, a growing sense of 'I am' emerges, which leads to a recognition of 'me/not me'. Winnicott believes that becoming 'I am' and recognising the 'not me' as external is a developmental achievement, and 'only those who have reached a stage at which they can make this assertion are really qualified as adult members of society' (Winnicott, 1986, p. 141), although 'it will be understood that in practice these things develop gradually, and repeatedly come and go, and are achieved and lost' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 216). Winnicott believes that human beings are perpetually managing illusion and disillusion throughout life, that 'the task of reality-acceptance is never completed, that no human being is free from the strain of relating inner and outer reality, and that relief from this

strain is provided by an intermediate area of experience which is not challenged (arts, religion, etc.)' (Winnicott, 1975, p. 240).

# 3.1.3 Absolute dependence to relative dependence, towards independence

Winnicott's description of personality development has no explicit links to Freud's threefold psychosexual stages of oral, anal, and phallic, nor to Klein's paranoid-schizoid and depressive positions. Winnicott's emphasis is around dependence and independence, and his scheme consists of three progressive categories, including absolute dependence, relative dependence and 'towards independence' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 84). These three stages are progressive and continuous in nature, and any impingement during the developmental process is doomed to lead to problems in the future.

Absolute dependence is a stage where 'there is no such thing as a baby' (Winnicott, 1964, p. 88). What can be seen is always a nursing couple, because a baby cannot exist alone without its mother, who is in a state of 'primary maternal occupation' (Winnicott, 1964, p. 300) in order to match with the baby's absolute dependence. The baby has a sense of omnipotence at this stage, believing that it has created everything it wants, so the mother's role is to help the baby create the illusion of omnipotence.

Relative dependence is a stage that 'the infant can know about' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 87), when the baby starts to come to terms with external reality. It is time for the mother to gradually introduce small doses of reality to the baby by allowing minor failures in her adaptations, so that the baby starts to be aware of its own dependence, the reality that it is not omnipotent, and the separateness of its mother. It is also a stage where the

baby learns about anxiety and loss when the mother is absent, and comes to understand the mother's personal and separate existence, 'and eventually the child comes to be able to believe in the parents' coming together which in fact led to his or her own conception' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 90). Winnicott believes that it is the development of the baby's intellect by the end of the first year that enables it to allow for failure in maternal adaptations. However, if the mothering is erratic and fails to adapt to the appropriate level of intellectual capacity of the baby, it is the mind of the baby that enables it to survive. In that case, thinking becomes a substitute for maternal care, and intellectualism becomes a defence.

The final 'towards independence' phase can never be completely accomplished, because a healthy individual is not isolated completely. On the contrary, the individual is always interdependent with the external environment, which in turn has a continuous outward movement from the mother, to both parents, to family, to school, to wider society, and eventually to government in the outermost circle. In health, the ego holds the self, and it replaces the holding mother and gradually the wider outer social circle, which acts as a window to the outside world enabling the self to relate to external reality.

According to Winnicott, morality is a natural feature of human development and it does not need to be taught; and guilt is a healthy sign of human development when the mother lets the baby experience its instinctual wishes and then allows it to make reparation for its primitive love impulse. Similar to Klein, Winnicott puts the origin of guilt in the first year of life. However, he reversed the relationship between Klein's guilt and reparation by stating that 'the guilt is not felt, but it lies dormant, or potential, and appears (as sadness or depressed mood) only if opportunity for reparation fails to

turn up' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 77). To Winnicott, the capacity for concern is a more developed form of guilt; guilt in the Kleinian sense is more negative and it is linked to anxiety and ambivalent feelings, but capacity for concern is more than reparation because it involves a sense of making a contribution to the other person; it 'implies further integration, and further growth, and relates in a positive way to the individual's sense of responsibility, especially in respect of relationships into which the instinctual drives have entered' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 73).

# 3.1.4 The importance of play towards personality integration and creativity

To Winnicott, play is a central concept in his theoretical framework, and being able to play is of fundamental importance to the human development; 'it is play that is universal, and that belongs to health: playing facilitates growth and therefore health; playing leads into group relationships; playing can be a form of communication in psychotherapy; and, lastly, psychoanalysis has been developed as a highly specialized form of playing in the service of communication with oneself and others' (Winnicott, 1971a, p. 56). Unlike Freud, Winnicott's play is not associated with erotic pleasure, even though play may arouse a certain level of anxiety. However, too much pleasure and anxiety can destroy playing.

Winnicott divided play into three progressive stages (1971a): the first stage of play starts at the relative dependence period when the baby firstly experiences separation from its mother. In this first stage of play, it is important for the mother to encourage the baby to create a world that is coloured by the baby's phantasy as much as possible, a world that only exists in the potential space between the baby and the mother.

The second stage of play is when the baby has gained the capacity to play alone in the presence of someone. This capacity to be alone is a very important concept and it also shows how Winnicott differs from Klein, as he changes psychoanalytic ideas from negative anxiety-based psychopathology to positive potential. Whilst Klein suggests that the capacity to be alone is dependent on the existence of a good internal object, Winnicott does not deny the importance of the good internal object, but stresses that at least for a limited period of time, the baby does genuinely enjoy the experience of being alone in the presence of a reliable mother, who makes no demands. It is in this limited window that the baby can return to a period of un-integration, a period where sensations and impulses can be experienced as real and personal to the fullest, in the presence of a reliable mother.

The third and last stage of play is when the child allows the mother to introduce her playing and ideas into their play, ideas that have not originated from the child, and with the achievement of this stage, playing together in a relationship is made possible.

Winnicott regards playing as equivalent to art and religious practice in contributing towards the integration of personality, and no communication is possible with the external environment except through playing. Only in playing can the whole personality be used, aliveness be seen, and evidence of creativity be shown. In his theoretical explication of play and creativity, Winnicott managed to take one step further from Freud's anal psychosexual stage explanation of creativity as 'productions', to treating play, creativity and art as the only form of sublimation that combines the internal and external world, the pleasure and reality principle, into an intermediate, third area of experience in the 'potential space'.

Vygotsky, a renowned Russian psychiatrist, once said in his 1933 lecture on play that 'in play a child is always above his average age, above his daily behaviour; in play it is as though he were a head taller than himself. As in the focus of a magnifying glass, play contains all developmental tendencies in a condensed form; in play it is as though the child were trying to jump above the level of his normal behaviour' (Vygotsky, 1966). Consistent with the cardinal role placed on play, Winnicott has pushed it to another new height after Vygotsky.

# 3.1.5 The critical role of the mother in facilitating ego development

In Winnicott's developmental theory, he emphasises the fundamental importance of the mother in facilitating the baby's ego integration and personality development. He uses the term 'primary maternal preoccupation' (Winnicott, 1975, p. 302) to describe a period during pregnancy until after a few weeks after the birth of her baby, when the mother develops an unusual state of heightened sensitivity and preoccupations with the needs of the baby, to the exclusion of her own needs and all other interests. Despite the intensity of this state that is bordering madness, it is only temporary and is completely normal. Once this state is passed and the mother recovers from it, the memory of it is often repressed. However, not all women can enter this state of primary maternal preoccupation, as some of them are unable to let go of their sanity and other concerns, and when that happens, the baby's development will be affected (Winnicott, 1975).

To Winnicott, mothering is special but is also an innate ability that can be performed well by an 'ordinary devoted mother' (Winnicott, 1988a, pp. 3-14), who has been a baby herself before, so her skills come naturally without needing to learn from any

books or other people like doctors, paediatricians, or midwives. The role of this 'ordinary devoted mother' is to be a 'good enough' mother in order to provide a holding environment that facilitates the natural developmental process of the baby (Winnicott, 1965b). 'Good enough' in Winnicott's definition does not mean mediocracy or contain any form of compromise, as there exists a group of 'not good enough' mothers who repeatedly fail to meet the baby's needs by dropping rather than holding it, which is a form of environmental impingement that leads to compliance and pre-mature development of the false self (Winnicott, 1965a).

Unlike Klein who describes the baby's perception of its mother as the 'good breast' that provides and satisfies and the 'bad breast' that frustrates, Winnicott further expands Klein's construct by incorporating the importance of the environment and describes the two different functions, rather than perception or experience as Klein did, of the mother as an 'object mother', who satisfies the needs as well as contains the hate of the baby, and as an 'environmental mother', who holds the baby physically as well as emotionally before the boundaries of time and space are firmly established inside the baby. This maternal holding also protects the baby from external environmental impingements, including the frustrations of the mother in handling the baby (Winnicott, 1964). This early holding gradually evolves into an ego-support that is needed in adulthood, when there is excessive deprivation or stress.

In his 1971 paper, 'Mirror-role of mother and family in child development', Winnicott explicates two important functions of the mother. Firstly, during the mothering process, she serves as a mirror for the baby in order to see itself, and for the mother to see what she looks like to the baby, through a reflection of herself in its eyes. A 'good enough mother' is able to facilitate the following sequence of perceptions by the baby: 'When

I look I am seen, so I exist. I can now afford to look and see. I now look creatively and what I apperceive I also perceive. In fact I take care not to see what is not there to be seen (unless I am tired)' (Winnicott, 1971a, p. 114). Winnicott's mirror is very different from Lacan's, which focuses solely on the baby's discovery of the self in the mirror (the mother's eyes), whereas in Winnicott's framework what the baby sees is a comprehensive experience of the self and a reflection of the self in the mirror.

Secondly, the mother needs to continuously adapt to the needs of the baby; from complete adaptation during the baby's absolute dependence stage, and repeatedly meeting the needs of the baby to facilitate the experience of an illusion of omnipotence, to the gradual introduction of small doses of reality to disillusion the baby via failing to adapt to all its needs during the relative dependence stage. Winnicott asserted that the ability to fail to adapt is vital as 'a mother who cannot gradually fail on this matter of sensitive adaptation is failing in another sense; she is failing (because of her own immaturity or her own anxieties) to give her infant reasons for anger' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 87). Through complete adaptation, it is the mother who first provides the baby with an 'illusion' that it has created the breast, just at the right moment when it needs nourishment. Through this repeated 'creation' of the breast, the baby gradually develops an expectation and confidence that it can find any objects of desire anytime, anywhere, in a magical way. As the baby builds up memories of the image of the breast, it can gradually tolerate the absence of the breast because the baby knows that it can magically create the breast. This is the moment where the mother can start to gradually disillusion the baby by introducing small doses of reality and failing to adapt, in line with the baby's growing ability to tolerate her absence and failure, which also provides the necessary groundwork for weaning to happen at a later stage.

It is worth mentioning here that 'illusion' is an essential concept in Winnicott's theoretical construct, and this is where one can see another radical departure from, if not a complete opposite to, Freud's conception of 'illusion'. To Freud, 'illusion' has a negative connotation and is linked to the pathology and neurosis that needs to be eliminated in the reality testing process. On the contrary, Winnicott attaches a positive meaning to 'illusion' and links it to creativity and a valuable, inseparable feature from infancy to adulthood in human development. Winnicott believes that the movement between illusion and disillusion continues to go on throughout life, that 'the task of reality-acceptance is never completed, that no human being is free from the strain of relating inner and outer reality, and that relief from this strain is provided by an intermediate area of experience which is not challenged (arts, religion, etc.)' (Winnicott, 1975, p. 240). Winnicott's concept of the transitional object, which I will go on to outline, is something that belongs to this intermediate area.

#### 3.1.6 Transitional objects and transitional phenomenon

The transitional object is a different type of illusion and it belongs to the stage during and after weaning, between the ages of four to twelve months. As the infant begins to separate 'me' from 'not me', it makes use of the transitional object to bridge the subjective and objective experience, which belongs neither to the baby nor the mother, but to an intermediate area in between the internal and the external worlds. For the infant, the transitional object is a part of itself, like a mouth or a breast.

One should never ask the baby 'did you conceive of this or was it presented to you from without?' (Winnicott, 1975, p. 235), because the transitional object belongs to an intermediate experience. It is an object discovered or created by the baby, and regarded

as an inseparable part of it, i.e. between the thumb and an external object. The transitional object is more likely to be something soft and pliable, and something readily available and within easy reach of the baby, e.g. a piece of wool pulled off a blanket or napkin, so in a way it is indirectly provided by the mother but it is never deliberately provided by the mother, because it is simply impossible for the mother to provide a transitional object to the baby. What she can provide is only a comforter, a mother substitute that is regarded by the baby as less important than the mother herself.

The transitional object is the infant's first possession, and each infant has its unique way of creating the first possession. The infant believes that it has created the transitional object, and this belief in the creation process is important as it is a necessary illusion of omnipotence. This necessary developmental journey leads to the use of illusion, the use of symbols, and the use of an object.

Winnicott has listed seven special qualities in the relationship between the baby and his transitional object in his 1953 landmark paper:

- 1. The infant assumes rights over the object, and we agree to this assumption.

  Nevertheless some abrogation of omnipotence is a feature from the start.
- 2. The object is affectionately cuddled as well as excitedly loved and mutilated.
- 3. It must never change, unless changed by the infant.
- 4. It must survive instinctual loving, and also hating, and, if it be a feature, pure aggression.
- 5. Yet it must seem to the infant to give warmth, or to move, or to have texture, or to do something that seems to show it has a vitality or reality of its own.

- 6. It comes from without from our point of view, but not so from the point of view of the baby. Neither does it come from within; it is not a hallucination.
- 7. Its fate is to be gradually allowed to be decathected, so that in the course of years it becomes not so much forgotten as relegated to limbo. By this we mean that in health the transitional object does not 'go inside', nor does the feeling about it necessarily undergo repression. It is not forgotten and it is not mourned. It loses its meaning, and this is because the transitional phenomena have become diffused, and have become spread out over the whole intermediate territory between the 'inner psychic reality' and 'the external world as perceived by two persons in common', that is to say, over the whole cultural field.

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

Closely linked to the transitional object is the idea of potential space or transitional phenomena (Winnicott, 1971a), which is an intermediate area between the subjective inner reality and objective external shared reality, a dimension of living that belongs to neither an internal or external reality. It cannot be challenged because we do not know whether it is created by the baby, or it contains a bit of the perceived reality. This intermediate area is a state that parents would allow the baby to be in in childhood, and that society would allow in adulthood, especially when it gradually widens out over time in the intense experience of the areas of arts, religion, imaginative living, and creative scientific work, as long as the person in this state does not force others to share the same personal illusion with him.

Winnicott believes that there is a natural and innate propensity for healthy human development towards maturity. This includes physical and emotional maturity, as well

as moral codes and other cultural phenomena. All these cannot be taught to the baby, nor can they be hurried. The role of the mother is to provide a facilitating environment to encourage her baby, not to take over the baby's natural creative growth and force her values onto it. Similarly, the adolescent needs to discover his own maturation, including his need to challenge and metaphorically murder his parents, and what the parents need to do is to survive, to stay alive no matter how violent the attacks are (Winnicott, 1971).

According to Winnicott, transitional phenomena and the transitional object are the basis of initiation of experience and object relations of the infant, therefore they are signs of healthy development, and are made possible by the presence of a 'good enough mother', who, in a state of 'primary maternal preoccupation', continuously adapts to the needs of the infant by gradually introducing appropriate doses of an external reality to it. This is done through creating a 'holding environment' and an illusion that reinforces the infant's feelings of omnipotence, an illusion that the infant is capable of creating an outer reality that can relieve instinctual tension, and where the breast is part of the infant's creation and is therefore under its magical control. If this illusion can be successfully established, a good internal object is created and the 'good enough mother' can start to gradually disillusion the infant by bringing small doses of the world to the infant, as its capacity to tolerate frustration increases over time.

Furthermore, Winnicott (1965a cited in Abram, 2007, p. 223, p. 243-244) also postulates that apart from the 'good enough mother', there is another group of 'not-good-enough mothers', which can be sub-divided into three different types. The first one is the 'psychotic mother', who is in a state of 'pathological preoccupation', in which she is able to adapt to the infant's need at the beginning, but fails to read the

infant's need to separate from her later on, so she continues to identify with the infant for too long. Another type is the 'mother who cannot surrender to primary maternal preoccupation', probably because she is depressed or preoccupied with something else. The final type is the 'tantalising mother', who is highly inconsistent in her handling of the infant and oscillates between holding and dropping, and this type of mother is the most damaging to the ego development of the infant. All these 'not-good-enough mothers' are the root to maternal failure, as they force the infant to find a way to protect its illusion of fleeting omnipotence by developing a pathological false compliant self, which in turn leads to an ego distortion and schizoid characteristics in later life. Winnicott's view is consistent with Milner's (1952), who suggested that maternal failure is a precursor to premature ego-development and a disturbed illusionary period. Because of this disturbance, the ego is forced into precocious differentiation between the bad and the good object, and the individual can go on in their life searching for the valuable 'resting place' of illusion that they missed in their early childhood.

#### 3.1.7 Father and the wider family

Compared to the mother, Winnicott has placed significantly less emphasis on the role of the father, for which he is often criticised as undermining the importance of the father. To Winnicott, the father 'can help provide a space... properly protected by her man, the mother is saved from having to turn outwards to deal with her surroundings at the time when she is wanting to turn inwards' (Winnicott, 1964, p. 25). Therefore, the role of the father is to provide a secure environment, both physically and emotionally, for the mother in order to allow her to go into the primary maternal preoccupation state, and dedicate her whole self in providing a facilitating environment for the baby during the entire development process. Specifically, this secured

environment includes firstly, a social and financial security through his relationship with the mother; secondly, a moral support by reinforcing the mother's authority and representing a symbol of law and order, as 'he does not have to be there all the time to do this, but he has to turn up often enough for the child to feel that he is real and alive' (Winnicott, 1964, p. 115); thirdly, the father provides a role model for men, how they should behave by going to work each morning and coming back at night, and yet Winnicott said that 'it is mother's responsibility to send father and daughter, or father and son, out together for an expedition now and again' (Winnicott, 1964, p. 118). Finally, Winnicott also later mentioned that the father helps in the process of separation between the baby and the mother through a 'to-and-fro' experience, where the baby moves between the parents and the extended family (Winnicott, 1986).

# 3.1.8 Psychopathology

Winnicott's developmental model is a positive one, and he emphasises the innate normal development process of the baby, and the importance of the mother in providing a good enough holding environment by always adapting to the needs of the baby according to its development stage, through which continuity and a going-on being is being preserved, and the individual is able to feel real and to experience an age-approach emotional life. Unlike Freud and Klein, he does not seem to be very interested in the psychopathology and anxieties of human development. He did write about the false self, which is a defence developed to fence off environmental impingements. He also attributes a psychotic illness to an environmental failure in facilitating the natural maturational process. This type of failure is called 'privation' (Winnicott, 1965b, p. 226), where developmental success has never been achieved. Privation is to be differentiated from 'deprivation', which means that a failure occurs after a certain

development success has been accomplished. It is associated with an 'antisocial tendency' (1975) such as stealing and destructiveness, which can be found in normal individuals. Winnicott suggests that an antisocial tendency needs to be treated by the provision of proper child care to enable the child to experiment again with its id impulses (Winnicott, 1975, p. 315).

In Winnicott's maturational development theory, there is a clear parallel between the growth of the baby and the journey towards an effective psychoanalytic therapy, and between the role of the mother in providing a holding environment, and the role of the psychotherapist in providing space and boundaries so that trust can be experienced in the therapeutic relationship. Primary maternal preoccupation can be compared to the therapist's attentive listening via their evenly suspended attention during the therapy, and via maternal holding with sensitive adaptions to how the therapist carefully allows the patient to experience the internal and external worlds in small doses in a safe environment, protecting from too much and encouraging access when appropriate. Development can only take place at the pace selected by the baby, and in a therapeutic situation, the therapist practises with extreme care how much in the way of interpretation he offers. Preferably, the therapist would allow the patient to discover for himself and come up with the interpretation by himself, as if it is created by him (Winnicott, 1971a). One very refreshing view from Winnicott is that a good technique may facilitate a corrective experience of therapy, but what is more important is that the small failures of the therapists that would trigger hatred in the patient in turn help to bring the original environmental failures into the transference relationship. When this happens, it is imperative for the therapist to survive and stay alive, so in a way the therapist's failure succeeds in helping the patient develop and recover. According to Winnicott, the objective of therapy is to enable the patient to break free from their false

self, and progress towards the development of a less compliant and more integrated true self and personal core (Winnicott, 1975).

# 3.2 Critical evaluation of Winnicott's major theories

Unlike Freud and Klein, who focused on developing grand theories such as Freud's instinct theory, the unconscious, the centrality of sexuality, and the tripartite structure of the mind and the personality, or Klein's notions of paranoid schizoid and depressive positions, Winnicott did not publish a comprehensive theory, despite being a prolific writer of short papers throughout his life. Having said that, Winnicott was a highly creative and original writer. His attempt was to provide insight into the stages of human development that precede object relations. His writing is full of intended paradoxes that provoke curiosity in the reader; most will take inspiration from his ideas to inform their theories and practices, both inside academic psychology and psychoanalysis, as well as outside, including the social work and child care fields.

# 3.2.1 Winnicott's optimism versus Freud and Klein's pessimism towards humanity

Winnicott's positive view towards human nature is in sharp contrast to Freud and Klein's bleak and disillusioned view of humanity. Winnicott rejects Freud's death instinct, and he uses 'concern' to replace 'guilt' to mean that the infant develops a sense of concern towards its mother for providing a holding environment, rather than feeling guilty, as in Klein's theoretical construct. Moreover, Klein interprets joy as a manic defence, whereas Winnicott sees joy and creativity as an inseparable part of natural

human experience, and he also disagrees with the Kleinian notion of projection, where the infant projects the undesirable part of itself onto people outside (Eigen, 1981).

There has been some concern over Winnicott's extreme optimism towards humanity in his theories, and that he may not have sufficiently taken into consideration the ambivalence of human relating. In fact, Winnicott's emphasis on the positive features is in marked contrast to the Freudian and Kleinian approaches of treating all positives with extreme caution, and of treating it as a defence against aggression and destructiveness.

## 3.2.2 The idealisation of mothering, neglecting the role of the father

Winnicott's strength lies in his acute observation of the early mother-infant relationship. He did not seem to be interested in the later mother and child relationship after the first six months, although he saw children of all ages in his practices. Central to his work is the relationship of the mother-infant nursing couple, which is also a major criticism on his one-sided emphasis on the mother, neglecting the role the father plays in the development of the child. For example, in Winnicott's 'playing and reality' (1971a), there are only three mentions of the word 'father' in the book, indicating his lack of interest in the paternal role (Rycroft, 1985; Samuels, 1993).

In Winnicott's model, the father always plays a supportive role as a facilitating environment to the mother, allowing her to enter the primary maternal preoccupation mode at the beginning of the baby's life. Afterwards, the father provides an example of a separate person to the infant, and gradually develops into the traditional Oedipus complex role. Winnicott said that infant care 'can be done well by only one person'

(Winnicott, 1964, p. 24). He did mention that it is possible for the father to play the role of the mother, however he performs what is not exactly the role of the father but rather that of a mother substitute (Winnicott, 1965a). This view is a significant departure from the Kleinian one, which suggested that the father protects the child from the mother, and the mother from the child, so the father's support is perceived by the child as instrumental in restoring the emotional health of the mother after the baby's phantasised attack on her (Segal, 1992).

#### 3.2.3 The nature of illusion

Different from Freud's view of illusion, which is regarded as erroneous thinking that is emotionally charged by the early wish-fulfilment desire and is to be replaced by reality testing and rational thought (Freud, 1927), Winnicott transforms the term 'illusion' radically, by attributing a positive nature to it, and giving it a positive place in human development. Winnicott suggests that illusion is instrumental for a child to gradually relate to the outside world. By 'creating' the world through illusion, the child is gradually being disillusioned by the mother as she slowly introduces external reality in small doses to the child. When that happens, a different illusion is formed, and the cycle continues. The capacity for illusion remains a positive trait for the child, as it is a means for it to experience and assimilate new situations throughout life. In order to push Winnicott's thinking one step further, since we all live in a world of shared illusions, the absolute reality is in fact an unknown. This is in line with Bion's 'O', which denotes the absolute truth that cannot be known (Bion, 1977).

Winnicott points out that the key difference between illusion and delusion is that an illusion can be shared with others and it can change as new experiences and reality

impinge, whereas a delusion is a personal reality that one imposes upon others. Winnicott's conceptualisation of delusion can be regarded as similar to Freud's, in which Freud regards delusion as a belief that is extremely improbable and incompatible with what we can observe in objective reality, and unlike the illusion that is religion, the illusion that is psychoanalysis is open to change (Freud, 1927). Usuelli (1992) observes that Freud's idea of transference, with the patient treating the analyst as if he were a figure from the past, can be classified as illusionary. To a certain extent, the therapeutic relationship is also a shared illusion that the therapist participates in, in search of understanding, insight, and change. The therapy session is like a transitional space where new experiences and insights are discovered, and eventually relinquished though not entirely.

# 3.3 Critical evaluation of the concept of the transitional object and transitional phenomena

Winnicott writes in a beautiful and poetic way. His spontaneous style and his fondness towards using paradoxes, and playing with words and ideas, make his work unique in the academic world. As a result of this very creative thinking and writing style, his work is best suited as an inspiration for other theorists, both within and outside of the psychoanalytic field. Like any other psychoanalytic concept, Winnicott's ideas will need to be validated thoroughly and carefully. As Jacobs suggests, '... those who are able to conduct quantifiable research are in a position to see how much of what he writes is verifiable. Those whose interest lies in the world of ideas can pursue the internal logic of psychoanalytic discourse. Those who seek to apply his ideas to practice might test out how transferable they are to their own situations. All such attempts demonstrate the catalytic effect Winnicott has on theory and practice' (1995, p. 120),

and this catalytic effect can be seen in the wide-ranging literature written on transitional object and phenomena after the release of Winnicott's 1953 paper. A PEPWeb subject search on the 'transitional object' and 'transitional phenomena' returned 83 hits, whereas a content search resulted in over 300 hits. The psychoanalytic literature on transitional objects and phenomena after Winnicott range from theoretical and clinical validations, elaboration on the nature of a transitional object, attempts at expanding or integrating Winnicott's idea of transitional objects and phenomena, to applications of these ideas in clinical settings and other disciplines.

## 3.3.1 Theoretical and clinical validations of a transitional object and phenomena

Some writers provided supporting evidence on the existence of transitional phenomena (Kahne, 1967; Anthanassiou, 1991; Burch, 1993). Stevenson (1954) found that a transitional object was more common amongst children living with their families than those in residential nurseries, and the finding was supported by Provence and Lipton (1962). Gaddini and Gaddini (1970) conducted the first systematic study of the transitional object based on maternal interviews in Italy, and found that, compared to urban children, rural children had a significantly lower incidence of having a transitional object, which could be explained by the greater physical contact between the rural children and their mothers, making it less necessary for them to acquire a transitional object as a symbol of their mothers. Gaddini and Gaddini's (1970) study was subsequently replicated by Hong and Townes (1976). By using American and Korean children, they found that the incidence of a transitional object was highest in the American children, followed by Korean children who lived in America, and lowest amongst Korean children living in Korea. Hong and Townes' (1976) finding was consistent with Gaddini and Gaddini's (1970), in which the incidence of a transitional

object attachment was higher when the duration of breast feeding was shorter, and vice versa. By observing forty infants ranging from eleven to nineteen months old, Parker (1979) classified the infants with and without transitional objects into three attachment groups, as defined by Ainsworth and Wittig's Strange Situation Test (1969), including the securely attached group, the anxious-ambivalent insecurely attached group, and the anxious-avoidant insecurely attached group. Parker found that almost all the infants amongst the anxious-avoidant insecurely attached group had no transitional objects, and that infants with transitional objects were weaned earlier, cried less during separations, and were able to be more independent of their mothers when handled by them. On the contrary, mothers of infants without transitional objects encouraged a more prolonged dependence on themselves by the infants. Parker's findings also support the findings of Gaddini and Gaddini (1970) and Hong and Townes (1976) that children who had more close contact with their mothers had a lower incidence of transitional objects.

Busch (1974), Busch and McKnight (1973, 1977), and Busch et al. (1973) found a higher incidence of transitional objects amongst families with a higher education and upper-middle socioeconomic class. Brody and Axelrad (1970, 1978) did a longitudinal study observing 131 infants and interviewed their mothers regularly during the first year, followed by annual interviews for seven years. They found that, compared to the lower-middle and below classes, significantly more children of middle and above socioeconomic status had transitional objects, supporting the findings of Gaddini and Gaddini (1970), Hong and Townes (1976), and Busch and McKnight (1973, 1977).

Horton et al. (1974) found that the majority of the nineteen men in his study, who had severe personality disorders, had poor object relations, and did not have any transitional

object in their childhood, indicating that there seems to be value in the personality and emotional development in the childhood possession of a transitional object, although excessive attachment could be seen as a diagnostic sign for schizophrenia in adulthood (Horton, 1977).

Later studies on transitional objects expanded to include not only the possession of a transitional object, but also the types of objects used, the conditions in which they were used, and parental attitudes toward the attachment. Gay and Hyson (1976) found in their pilot study that children as old as five years continued to be dependent on their transitional objects as a magical weapon after experiencing stress, which in turn pointed to potential problems that can arise with prolonged attachment to transitional objects. Children of five years old should be able to tolerate a temporary separation from a loved object through a more mature form of self-soothing behaviour. An incessant need for a transitional object indicates a lack of resourcefulness from the children, or an inability in symbolisation that is appropriate to their intellectual and emotional development stage.

In a comprehensive review of the papers published on transitional object in the psychoanalytic literature, Hong (1978) concluded that the appearance of a transitional object seemed to be influenced by the child-rearing practices in different cultures, and inversely related to the quantity and quality of physical contact with the mothers. He observed three stages in the appearance of a transitional object during infancy: the third month, the middle of the second half year, and when the baby enters its second year. He concluded that a transitional object facilitates the development of healthy object relations, cognition, symbol formation, creativity, ego integrity and structure, and its appearance in infancy is a sign of a satisfactory relationship between the infant and the

mother. At the same time, a transitional phenomenon plays an important role in adult life, and the proof of these conclusions can only be found in studies involving direct observations rather than retrospective accounts.

Notwithstanding the overwhelming interest and enthusiasm in Winnicott's work on transitional objects, Brody (1980) regarded transitional objects as a phenomenon that has been over-romanticised and idealised by many writers, including Winnicott himself, and there was insufficient evidence to suggest its universality. Research results showed that attachment to a transitional object seemed to be related to the physical contact the infants had with their mothers and the level of maternal nurturing. The prevalence was higher amongst families in the middle and above socioeconomic classes, and its adoption was also influenced by the mother's encouragement or disapproval of such an object. Furthermore, there was insufficient quantitative evidence of correlation between the childhood possession of a transitional object and sound object relations in later life, or creativity in adulthood. Brody pointed out that some of Winnicott's statements about transitional objects and phenomena were merely hypotheses that required further research validations, e.g. the symbolic use of the object to relinquish omnipotence by the infant is a mental capacity deemed to be too advanced for the infant. Segal (1957, 1982 cited in Gaddini, 2003, p. 59) believed that transitional objects and phenomena are early symbols instead of symbol proper, so she equated transitional objects with a 'symbolic equation'.

Despite the challenges towards Winnicott's concept on transitional objects and transitional phenomena, one cannot deny the similarity between the transitional phenomena and the transference reactions in therapy, because the patient finds himself feeling a strong emotion towards the therapist as if the therapist were someone

significant in the patient's childhood, and at the same time the patient is very clear of the present reality and of the identity of the therapist. This is similar to Freud's view on transference when he wrote that 'transference... creates an intermediate region between illness and real life through which transition from one to the other is made' (Freud, 1914, p. 154).

## 3.3.2 The nature of a transitional object

Fintzy (1971) explored the evolution and shifting change in the choice of a transitional object in a borderline child. Busch (1974) examined how the attachment to transitional objects developed and their respective functions. Greenacre (1969, 1970) and Roipie and Galenson (1975) examined the similarities and differences between a transitional object and the fetish. Sloate (2008) indicated that the bulimic patients' self-infliction was more closely linked to the use of food or their bodies as a fetish object instead of a transitional object. Davidson (1976) investigated the difference between a transitional object, and symbols and transference.

## 3.3.3 Expanding or integrating Winnicott's theory

Stevenson (1954) suggested that there are two types of transitional objects that a child becomes attached to at two distinct times in its life, i.e. the first year and the second year respectively. Drawing on Greenson's (1954) discovery on the humming sensation and Winnicott's (1953) view on the auditory component of transitional phenomena, McDonald (1970) hypothesised the existence of a 'transitional tune' as an important early experience to facilitate the development of some musicians. Busch and McKnight (1977) emphasised that the first transitional object should be distinguished from the

second transitional object, the fetish object, objects that have a different locus and origin, and objects that are used to meet a direct libidinal need. Bollas (1979) suggested that the first object or the mother can be conceived of as a 'transformational object', who transforms the self-experience of the infant from symbiotic relating to object representation, and that a transitional object is the heir to the transformational phase when the transformational process is displaced by the transitional object from the mother-environment into other subjective-objects. Summers (1999) discussed how Winnicott's transitional space concept transformed the task of psychoanalyst from that of offering interpretation, to one of adaptation. Vivona (2000) postulated the existence of a 'post-oedipal transitional object', as opposed to the 'pre-oedipal transitional object' formulated by Winnicott and asserted that it helps create an adult mind with mature psychological capacities to harbour neurotic conflicts. Gaddini (2003) argued that 'precursor objects' precede transitional objects, and LaMothe (2005) reformulated Winnicott's 'potential space' into four interrelated dialectical processes of 'surrendergeneration', 'recognition-negotiation', 'care-quiescence', and 'disruption-repair'.

Some writers attempted a theoretical integration of transitional objects and transitional phenomena with other psychoanalytic concepts. Tolpin (1971) applied the concept of Kohut's 'transmuting internalisation' (Kohut, 1975) in order to delineate the role of a transitional object in ego development. Hong (1978) reviewed psychoanalytic, experimental, ethological and cross-cultural studies of transitional phenomena, and attempted a theoretical integration and classification of transitional phenomena. Ogden (1985) re-articulated the concept of 'potential space' as a state of mind based on a series of opposing relationships, e.g. between phantasy and reality, 'me' and 'not me', symbol and symbolised. Adler (1989) regarded the designed ambiguous nature of a psychoanalytic session as a re-creation of transitional phenomena that promotes the

capacity for a creative use of illusion and play. Civin and Lombardi (1990) attempted to synthesise Freud's concept of the 'preconscious' and Winnicott's concept of 'potential space'. Pedder (1992) linked psychotherapy and the experience in the theatre to transitional space. Kuriloff (1998) compared Winnicott's transitional space with Sullivan's interpersonal model. Bram and Gabbard (2001) explored the connection between 'potential space' and reflective functioning (Fonagy & Target 1996, cited in Bram & Gabbard, 2001, p. 685; Target & Fonagy, 1996, cited in Bram & Gabbard, 2001, p. 685). Tibon (2005) conducted a quantitative study to explore the similarity between psychosomatics and psychosis using Winnicott's idea on 'potential space'. Chatterji (2009) explored the conceptual similarities between Winnicott's transitional phenomena and D. H. Lawrence's theoretical framework on the unconscious.

# 3.3.4 Applications of a transitional object and phenomena in clinical settings

Another group of theorists applied the concept of a transitional object and transitional phenomena to the understanding of psychopathology. Modell (1963) and Cooper & Adler (1990) applied the concept of a transitional object to analyse borderline patients. Volkan (1973) used it to analyse narcissistic patients. Straetz (1976) applied it to the understanding of a psychopathologic origin of adolescent behaviour. Downey (1978) used the idea of transitional phenomena in an adolescent analysis to identify the presence of transference neurosis. Ogden (1985) explored the implications on psychopathology of potential space and divided patients into three groups depending on their relationship with phantasy and reality. The first group is defined as having a sense of reality engulfed by phantasy. These are the borderline patients operating on the basis of symbolic equations. The second group is composed of those who use reality as a defence against phantasy. This is the group where there is a foreclosure of

imagination. The third group is composed of those who dissociate phantasy from reality. This is a state of non-experience, as meanings are not created. This is when there is a foreclosure of both reality and phantasy. Dithrich (1991) connected pathological lying to a potential space. Dimen (1991) explored the role of transitional space in transference and counter-transference, when both the patient and the analyst alternate between being gendered and being gender-free. Goldman (1996) examined the dynamics of 'potential space' generated in the therapeutic sessions.

Others (Pizer, 1996; Elkind, 2002) explored clinical techniques that leverage on the therapeutic use of transitional space. Ehrenberg (1976) developed the 'intimate edge' technique in order to enhance the capacity for a creative and imaginative experience in the transitional phenomena in a therapeutic relationship. Resch et al. (1988) attempted a therapeutic re-construction of a transitional object for a ten-year-old girl, which proved to be effective in facilitating significant development in symbolic functioning. Os (1991) discussed the internalisation of the analyst and the analytic relation, and the creation and subsequent internalisation of the transitional object in therapy. Mann (1998) demonstrated how the clinical use of dreams facilitated the creation of transitional space and strengthened the ego capacity to do integration work within that space. Teitelbaum (2003) discussed how the analyst was used as a transitional object in a psychoanalytic therapy in order to facilitate therapeutic progress.

# 3.3.5 Applications of a transitional object and phenomena in other disciplines

Many explored the role of transitional phenomena in art and culture. Modell (1970), Brody (2001, 2002) and Hopkins (2002) connected the art piece and art creation process to the development of 'potential space' shared between the artists and the

recipients. Hanchett (1976) explored the connection between transitional phenomena and cultural and social anthropology. Miller (1992) explored the common 'potential space' between writers and their readers. Jemstedt (2000) built on Winnicott and Bion's theories and postulated that creativity and creative living is the result of the development of inner space and 'potential space'. Grandy (2009) used the metaphors of transitioning into an imaginary space in children's literature in order to explore variations in the affective quality of 'potential space'.

To sum up, most of the transitional object and transitional phenomena literature studies after Winnicott focused on confirming or rejecting the existence of such phenomena, or applying the concepts to the understanding of psychopathology and clinical techniques, or extending the concepts, or integrating them with other existing psychoanalytical frameworks, and more importantly, perhaps, on the study of the remergence of an infantile transitional object in adulthood.

# 3.4 The reappearance of an infantile transitional object in adulthood

Winnicott said that transitional objects typically begin to appear from four-to-six to eight-to-twelve months:

'... in health the transitional object doesn't not 'go inside' nor does the feeling about it necessarily undergo repression. It is not forgotten and it is not mourned. It loses meaning, and this is because the transitional phenomena have become diffused, have become spread out over the whole intermediate territory between 'inner psychic reality' and 'the external world as perceived by two persons in common', that is to say, over the whole cultural field'.

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

In concluding his 1953 landmark paper on transitional objects and transitional phenomena, Winnicott wrote that:

'An infant's transitional object ordinarily becomes gradually decathected, especially as cultural interests develop.

*In psychopathology:* 

Addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged.

Fetish can be described in terms of a persistence of a specific object or type of object dating from infantile experience in the transitional field, linked with the delusion of a maternal phallus.

Pseudologia and thieving can be described in terms of an individual's unconscious urge to bridge a gap in continuity of experience in respect of a transitional object'.

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 97)

After mentioning the relationship between the regressive appearance of transitional phenomenon and addiction in his 1953 paper, Winnicott did not further elaborate his view on addiction. According to Caldwell and Robinson (2016), in the original version of his 'transitional objects and transitional phenomena' paper presented in a meeting

attended by members of the British Psychoanalytic Society on 30 May 1951, Winnicott included a few paragraphs about the abnormalities on the development of transitional objects, which were subsequently removed in the publication of the revisions of the same paper in 1953, 1958, and 1971 respectively:

'Abnormalities. The main abnormality, I suggest, arises out of discontinuity of experience relative to transitional objects and phenomena. As a result there is either no transitional object or else an exaggeration of the dependence on the original transitional object with limitation of spread of interests. I attempt to explain this in Part III, but at this point I wish to refer to one clinical type, the anti-social child, typically a thief.

Psychology of Stealing. The thief is trying, (amongst other things) to fill the gap in experience of transitional objects. While he has hope he steals. He seeks the affectionate relationship which belongs to transitional phenomena. In the lying that goes with stealing is hidden the claim that a story can be both fantasy and fact.

The aetiology of thieving cannot, in fact, be fully worked out expect on a basis of the thief's attempt to recover lost transitional phenomena. It must be remembered that the delinquent is not depressed or mad when delinquent, though depression or madness may in some cases be the alternatives to antisocial behaviour.'

(Winnicott, 1951, cited in Caldwell and Robinson, 2016, Volume 3: 1946-1951, p.450-451)

The antisocial tendency idea was further elaborated in a paper published in 1956 called 'the antisocial tendency' (Winnicott, 1956), in which Winnicott linked the antisocial tendency observed in both children and adults to childhood deprivation. The antisocial tendency may be found in a normal individual, or one that is neurotic or psychotic. According to Winnicott, the antisocial act of stealing, lying, bedwetting, and the making of a mess generally is an enactment that indicates an environmental failure during the relative dependence stage. This means that the infant had experienced good enough mothering during the absolute dependence stage, but it was subsequently lost, hence it is a form of deprivation instead of privation. From Winnicott's perspective, the antisocial act is a sign of hope because the individual believes that he will be able to rediscover the good experience before it was lost. The treatment of antisocial tendencies lies in specialised environmental care instead of psychoanalysis.

However, Winnicott did not further elaborate on the idea around 'no transitional object or else an exaggeration of the dependence on the original transitional object with limitation of spread of interests' in 'Part III', which is more about explaining the differences between transitional object and Klein's internal object.

In the absence of further explication on the relationship between transitional objects and addiction, what we can infer from Winnicott's 1953 paper is that a transitional object is not always as transitional as its name suggests, it can stay for a longer period of time in early childhood to provide a regressive comfort, especially when the child is confronted by stress. In fact, after Winnicott published his 1953 landmark paper, a number of studies have shown that instead of being given up in later life, an infantile transitional object can re-appear in later adult life in a regressed form, and that other

symptoms and rituals are developed as a substitution of the regressed infantile transitional object until it is finally given up.

Fink (1964) regarded the pacifier as a transitional object. Schlierf (1983) examined how prescribed medication was used as a transitional object, and how such insight could contribute to the understanding of the therapist being used as an ego-supportive entity and a magical omnipotent object in patients with anxiety neurosis. Giovacchini (1984, 1987) discussed how children were used as transitional objects by their mothers, leading to a fixation of emotional development in the transitional space and ego, as well as character defects in their adulthood. Turkel (1998) linked female compulsive eating and dieting to how girls were raised through distorted and stereotyped transitional objects.

Coppolillo (1967) reported a young adult using their psychotically depressed mother as a transitional object after she intervened in their use of a transitional object when they were five years old. The patient even perceived the analyst and the analysis itself as transitional objects during his treatment. Williams (1998) reported that the father of a sexually abused borderline patient was used as a regressed transitional object, but this notion was retracted by Williams as a result of a dispute raised by another researcher, who stated that there was not a space for the sexually abused borderline patient to develop a healthy transitional object in their childhood in the first place.

In Kafka's (1969) study, a patient treated his own body as a transitional object and said that he had a sensation of becoming alive, as if he was protected by a security blanket, when he felt the blood flowing out onto his body from the cuts he inflicted himself.

McDonald (1970) asserted that lullabies have a quality of being a transitional object because of the connection between these songs and childhood, leading to the child's belief that the lullabies are created by it and can be reproduced by it at will. Parish (1978) further expanded McDonald's idea by saying that any thought or object could serve as a transitional object to bridge the internal psychic world and the external reality.

Gay and Hyson (1976) observed that when confronted with stress, their five-year-old respondents picked up their infantile transitional objects immediately and displayed increased regressive behaviours during the time when they were holding their transitional objects. According to normal development progress, children after the age of two or three should be able to tolerate the temporary loss of a loved object through diverting their energy towards the use of more developed symbolic objects for selfsoothing. The fact that children of the age of five in Gay and Hyson's study are still dependent on their infantile transitional objects suggests a lack of an age-appropriate capacity to use symbolised objects, and if this is reinforced by the prolonged attachment to infantile transitional objects, neurotic withdrawal may be further strengthened. Gay and Hyson's finding is consistent with Fintzy's (1971) finding where he reported a persistent use of transitional objects as a magical blanket in a borderline child of five years old. On that, Brody (1980) also pointed out that a persistent attachment to the transitional objects during waking hours beyond two years old may reflect weakness and immaturity in ego development, resulting in the child's inability to direct energy to age-appropriate interests and activities.

Downey (1978) suggested that there is a high level of resemblance between some adolescent behaviours and the use of infantile transitional objects. For instance, the

adolescent's wish for clothes versus the infant's wish to attract or disgust parents, the adolescent's fondness of listening to loud music versus the infant's use of early noisy toys, and the adolescent's treatments of their possessions and therapy versus the infant's ambivalent use of transitional objects. Downy argued that these behaviours suggested that the adolescent was trying to re-create his early internal and external worlds through music and his current possessions for a self-soothing purpose.

Grolnick and Lengyel (1978) observed the parallel between the infantile use of a transitional object to overcome separation anxiety before going to sleep, and the Etruscan funerary symbols that are used to defend against the anxiety of death. Volkan and Kavanaugh (1978) observed that borderline patients used their cats as a regressed infantile transitional object and established similar object relations with the cats. Dinnage (1978) suggested that Freud's antiquities were his regressed form of infantile transitional objects.

Sugarman and Kurash (1982) examined the use of marijuana as a transitional object by the borderline adolescent to temporarily transcend developmental limitations and to increase subjective experience of a heightened level of cognitive functioning. In an attempt to examine the relationship between early traumatic object relations and addiction, Miller (2002) argued that the root cause of drug addiction can be explained by approaching a needle as a transitional object.

# 3.5 Winnicott's perspective on smoking addiction

After reviewing the index on 'addiction', 'perverse transitional object', and 'pathological transitional object' in the newly published twelve-volume set 'The

collected works of D. W. Winnicott' (Caldwell and Robinson, 2017), one very interesting and relevant report was found. In 'comments on the report of the committee on punishment in prisons and borstals' (Winnicott, et al., 1984), Winnicott stated that:

"... one does not have to be a psychoanalyst to know that smoking is not just something done for pleasure. It is something which has a very great importance in the lives of many people, and which cannot be given up without substitution of something else. Smoking can be vitally important to individuals, especially when there is widespread hopelessness in a community. The psychoanalyst is able to watch at close quarters the use of tobacco and indeed there is a great deal of research to be done on this subject before it can be properly understood. Without waiting for clear understanding, it is possible already to state that smoking is one of the ways in which individuals can just hold on to sanity, when without smoking and especially if alcohol and other drugs are withheld, the sense of reality is lost and the personality tends to disintegrate. There is of course a great deal more in smoking than this, but I think it should be appreciated by those who deal with the subject of smoking in prisons that the fact that so much trafficking in tobacco goes on in spite of all regulations and in spite of every possible effort on the part of the authorities to curb it, confirms one theory, which is that criminals are on the whole in a state of great distress and a constant fear of madness.'

(Winnicott, et al., 1984, pp. 274-275)

This is very similar to the observed high usage of cigarettes amongst patients with mental disorders in mental hospitals. For instance, in the United Kingdom, 44% of people with psychotic disorders living in community settings were smokers, in which 27% were heavy smokers (Office for National Statistics, 2002). Moreover, among

those with a severe mental illness who use inpatient services, up to 70% of them were smokers (Coultard et al., 2002), and around half of them smoked heavily (Meltzer et al., 1996). R. D. Hinshelwood, a renowned psychoanalyst and emeritus professor at the University of Essex, also observed that instead of speaking to each other, many mental patients used cigarettes for a social connection with each other. This shows that rather than connecting with others via cultural activities, disadvantaged people seem to use cigarettes as a physical, bodily, and concrete object to connect with each other.

The above observation agrees with Winnicott's view that smoking is how this group of disadvantaged people, who are in a state of hopelessness, constant distress and fear of madness, 'hold on to sanity' in an attempt to prevent a disintegration of personality and a complete loss of reality. Having said that, the attempt does not seem to be successful, as is evident in the repeated habit of smoking, and it does seem that some kind of false self-manifestation must keep repeating itself through the repeated use of cigarettes. Unfortunately, after stating that 'there is a great deal of research to be done on this subject (smoking addiction) before it can be properly understood' in the above 'comments on the report of the committee on punishment in prisons and borstals' published in 1951, Winnicott did not publish any further papers on smoking addiction.

If 'addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 97), and since smoking addiction is also a form of addiction, can we say that smoking addiction is also a regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged? And what is the role of cigarettes in this regressive behaviour? A PEPWeb search indicates that no paper has been published on the relationship between smoking addiction and regression or a regressed transitional object or transitional phenomena. The scarcity of papers published in the psychoanalytic field suggests that this is a highly original and under-researched area, which is also where our research interest lies.

If we follow Winnicott's theoretical framework, smoking addiction can be seen as a deprivation-triggered and artificially 'induced but unconsciously sought ego regression' (Wieder & Kaplan, 1969, p. 403) to a primitive state of blissful satiation and symbiotic dyad associated with the first year of life. The institution of the addictive state as transitional phenomena could be regarded as a desperate attempt by the smokers to establish object contact at the expense of physiological decay, and eventually death. As such, a cigarette can be seen as a regressed form of an infantile transitional object for the smokers to cope with the infantile anxiety of separation and the loss of delusional omnipotence. However, these 'benefits' of cigarette usage are only temporary because a cigarette is only a 'transitional' object, and unlike Winnicott's healthy transitional object proper, which facilitates ego growth towards independence and real object relations, the absence of progressive adaptation or 'weaning' from the 'good enough mother' in the addictive state suggests that cigarettes would continue to remain a necessity whenever the smokers need to manage the anxiety of separation. The loss of delusional omnipotence in the face of deprivation, and a prolonged dependence on cigarettes would only render it a substitute for self-sustaining object relationships and prevent the acquisition and internalisation of essential regulatory functions, which are part of healthy ego development. Moreover, because the smokers continue to experience the 'benefits' of cigarettes as coming from the environment rather than from within themselves, this prolonged dependence on cigarettes would eventually lead to a state similar to the one experienced by marijuana addicts (Sugarman & Kurash 1982, p. 535), i.e. 'confusion between inner and outer reality...identity diffusion, disruption of the ego's synthetic function and inability to achieve higher levels of symbolisation'.

Winnicott stated that 'addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 97). The key word here is 'regression', and there is a need to explain what 'regression' means in the context of smoking addiction, i.e. what the 'regressive smoking moments' are and their key characteristics.

# 4. RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS

According to Winnicott, transitional phenomena can be defined as:

'... the intermediate area of experience, between the thumb and the teddy bear, between the oral erotism and true object-relationship, between primary creative activity and projection of what has already been introjected, between primary unawareness and indebtedness and the acknowledgement of indebtedness.'

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 89).

Transitional phenomena, transitional space, potential space, the intermediate area, and the third area are used interchangeably by Winnicott. He believes that this transitional space can only occur through trust and feelings of reliability towards the mother, and therefore towards other people and things. In health, all of us live in this transitional space throughout our entire lives. Our enjoyment in this transitional space will be pursued differently depending on which culture we are born into. This includes reading, playing football, dancing, etc.

There is a very close connection between the concept of transitional phenomena and a transitional object. In his 1953 paper, Winnicott provided a definition of a transitional object by stating that:

'... out of all this (if we study any one infant) there may emerge some thing or some phenomenon – perhaps a bundle of wool or the corner of a blanket or

eiderdown, or a word or tune, or a mannerism, which becomes vitally important to the infant for use at the time of going to sleep, and is a defence against anxiety, especially anxiety of depressive type. Perhaps some soft object or type of object has been found and used by the infant, and this then becomes what I am calling a transitional object'

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

A typical transitional object is a soft object within easy reach of the baby, usually part of a blanket, sheet, or other soft materials used by the mother for the baby. The transitional object serves oral erotism and in a certain way represents the mother. It is something that is 'created' by the baby between the age of four and twelve months. The important point here is that it must be perceived by the baby as its own creation and cannot be given to it by the mother directly, even though in reality it is indirectly given by the mother. The baby becomes attached to the transitional object, and it is demanded when the baby is about to go to sleep or at times of stress, when the object may be pressed against the baby's face and lips or sucked. When the baby is able to walk, it insists on taking it everywhere. The object retains the smell of the baby and the mother and it cannot be washed, and the baby would be in extreme distress if the object was misplaced, taken away, or lost.

Therefore, to Winnicott, a transitional object can be seen as a mother substitute for the baby to deal with separation anxiety and the loss of omnipotence. The early stage of transitional phenomena and the presence of an infantile transitional object represent the existence of an intermediate space of reunion with the mother in the phantasy, and it is 'one of the bridges that make contact possible between the individual psyche and external reality' (Winnicott, 1955, p. 218), and also 'a salient marker of an intermediate

stage of transitional phenomena and functioning during which the baby is helped through good-enough maternal care to separate inner and outer worlds' (Abram, 2007, p. 9-10).

A transitional object usually appears between the age of four to six and eight to twelve months. Winnicott also suggests that a transitional object can be prolonged beyond early infancy when the infant is faced with deprivation:

'Patterns set in infancy may persist into childhood, so that the original soft object continues to be absolutely necessary at bedtime or at time of loneliness or when a depressed mood threatens. In health, however, there is a gradual extension of range of interest, and eventually the extended range is maintained, even when depressive anxiety is near. A need for a specific object or a behaviour pattern that started at a very early date may reappear at a later age when deprivation threatens.'

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

'Addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early state at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged.'

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 97)

We would argue that there is a high level of similarity between Winnicott's 'transitional object' and Menzies Lyth's 'pleasure food' (tobacco), as both objects are used as a powerful mother-substitute to ease off anxieties and depression, when confronted with deprivation reminiscent of their infantile anxieties. Winnicott's view on the reappearance of an infantile transitional object is also very similar to Menzies Lyth's

view when she categorised tobacco as a type of 'pleasure food' similar to ice-cream, and that 'pleasure foods' (tobacco) are used as a powerful mother-substitute (towards whom the infant has ambivalent feelings), in order to ease off anxieties and depression when an individual is confronted with deprivation reminiscent of his infantile anxieties.

'Ice cream belongs to a group of products which may be described as pleasure foods... Closely associated, though not actually eaten or drunk, are tobacco and chewing gym. These products are related to certain psychological and social factors and characteristic of them is their ability to gratify oral desires and, like the breast with the infant, change depression and anxiety into pleasure... This kind of oral gratification serves, then as a method of alleviating current anxieties and depression which are in part the derivatives of the infantile anxiety and depression connected with the actual loss of the breast. Compensation for this loss is sought in the consumption of substitute objects, the pleasure foods. Thus the need for them becomes particularly great when contemporary difficulties awaken again the residues of the earlier situations which to a greater or lesser extent exist in anyone.'

(Menzies Lyth, 1989, pp. 71-72)

One could argue that when the smoker is faced with deprivation, he uses cigarettes as a regressed form of infantile transitional objects, in order to provide a temporary regressive experience of being in a transitional space where the boundary between one's self and object is blurred, and an illusion of a happy reunion with the mother can be achieved.

In our consultations and email exchanges with Jan Abram and Lesley Caldwell, the idea around the re-appearance of an infantile transitional object in adulthood in a concrete form, such as a cigarette, seems to be paradoxical and problematic. The reason is that theoretically speaking, a transitional object belongs to the infantile period, and that it should have already been 'relegated to limbo' in adulthood as suggested by Winnicott (1953, p. 91). Having said that, if we approach the idea from Winnicott's notion of 'regression' and his view that 'addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the earliest stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged' (1953, p. 97), then the re-appearance of an infantile transitional object in the form of a concrete object, i.e. a cigarette, becomes theoretically possible.

To summarise, what we have established from the above are:

- 1. Addiction can be seen as a regression to the infantile transitional phenomena.
- 2. A transitional object is a salient marker of the transitional phenomena, which usually appears at the age of four to twelve months.
- 3. A transitional object can be prolonged beyond early infancy and reappear in later life when deprivation threatens.

Since this is a thesis looking at the value of Winnicott's transitional object as a concept to explain smoking addiction, the perspectives of Freud's drive theory and Klein's splitting concepts are out of the scope of this thesis and hence will not be used. The focus of our research will mainly be in demonstrating the extent to which a cigarette resembles a regressed form of an infantile transitional object that prolongs into adulthood, and how the relationship between the smoker and the cigarette resembles that between the infant and the 'transitional object' within a British Object Relations School. As such, our research hypothesis is:

To what extent can a cigarette be regarded as a regressed form of infantile 'transitional object' that prolongs into adulthood?

# 5. METHODOLOGY

Since the research question of the current thesis requires access to information taken from the respondents' childhoods and potentially beyond their conscious awareness as a result of repression, a research approach different from the conventional quantitative and qualitative approach that has the power to tap into such information and infer the unconscious is required.

In the following paragraphs, we will, first of all, describe the limitations of quantitative survey-based research in providing contextual meanings to the data, and the failure of traditional qualitative interview-based research to address this, including the grounded theory, the interpretative phenomenological analysis, and discourse analysis. Secondly, we will describe how the narrative and psychoanalytic clinical case-study approach can overcome the limitations identified in traditional quantitative and qualitative research. We will explain how the Free Association Narrative Interview (Hollway & Jefferson, 2013), through the incorporation of the psychoanalytic concepts of the unconscious defence against anxiety, 'free association', transference and countertransference, into the narrative interview method, could provide a much fuller picture and deeper insight for emotionally-charged and identity-based issues. Finally, at the end of this chapter, we will propose a methodology of this research thesis based on the Free Association Narrative Interview method.

# 5.1 The need for a data collection method that can infer the unconscious

#### 5.1.1 Limitations of existing quantitative survey-based research

Quantitative survey-based research requires all collected data to be reduced to numerical values in order to facilitate a statistical analysis, therefore quantitative research is good at describing numbers and counts of easily measurable factors generated by closed-ended questions, such as the percentage of smokers in a population or the age distribution and gender split of smokers. However, it fails to answer the 'what does this mean' and 'why is that' questions on more complex and unquantifiable factors, such as why some people smoke but some do not, given the similar level of exposure to tobacco marketing campaign and peer group influence.

With its heavy reliance on quantifying and coding isolated responses on a Likert scale, and subsequent artificial re-aggregation into different demographic subgroups, quantitative survey-based research tends to group everything into a single artificial entity, measured through one hypothetical closed question. It de-contextualises the respondent's answers because it fails to take into consideration the socio-cultural meaning of these responses. Given these limitations, the resultant artificial aggregations would end up having no direct representation in the real world.

#### 5.1.2 A turn to qualitative interview-based research

In response to the weaknesses of quantitative survey-based research, qualitative interview-based research, with its more in-depth, semi-structured face-to-face interview approach, attempts to give voice to the respondents and find out more about the contextual meanings of their experiences. Contrary to quantitative survey-based research, qualitative interview-based research involves collecting data in the form of

verbal reports and the analysis is textual instead of statistical. It relies heavily on the interpretation of the collected text and, as such, there is a theoretical underpinning of the value of language as a fundamental communication tool between human beings. In the following sections, we will describe in detail the theoretical underpinnings as well as the strength of three major qualitative data analysis approaches, including the grounded theory, interpretative phenomenological analysis, and discourse analysis, followed by an overall evaluation of these three analytic approaches.

#### Grounded theory

As suggested by Corbin and Strauss (2008), grounded theory is a technique of analysis developed by Glaser and Strauss back in 1967 aiming at developing theoretical constructs and empirical knowledge from analysing and interpreting qualitative data. It is a comparative and interactive method that encapsulates a set of systematic guidelines for collecting, synthesizing, analysing, and conceptualising qualitative data to build inductive theories, so the resultant theoretical theories are directly 'grounded' in the collected data.

Grounded theory emerged from the symbolic interactionist tradition that emphasises the importance of what the respondents say in forming the analysis. Grounded theorists start with collecting focused data through various methods such as direct observations, life history constructions with the respondents, intensive one-on-one interviews, clinical case histories or autobiographies, whilst simultaneously attempting to make analytic sense of the data through building levels of abstractions, developing working concepts that synthesise the collected data, and continuously fine-tuning the working concepts via further data collection. The inductive nature of grounded theory methodology enables it to provide an open and flexible approach that allows the

researchers to go back and forth between data collection and analysis. Instead of having a planned methodological strategy before data collection, the researcher can continuously shape the methodological strategy while engaging in the research. The power of grounded theory methods lies in its ability to generate new ideas from available data, as well as in transforming collected data into conceptual analyses and theory development, which could then be verified later through other traditional quantitative research methodologies. Because of this characteristic, ground theory excels in theory revisions, as well as providing a useful strategy for researchers to review and reformulate their research methods (Corbin & Strauss, 2008).

#### Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA)

IPA is a qualitative research methodology inspired by the Husserlian phenomenology that aims at exploring how people make sense of their major life experiences. The IPA methodology was first published in Smith's 1996 paper in Psychology and Health in an attempt to argue that psychology should also capture the experiential nature of human experience, on top of the experimental aspect emphasised in mainstream psychology (Smith, Flowers & Larkin, 2009).

The first theoretical keystone of IPA is the 'phenomenon' or 'experience' part. To IPA researchers, experience has a hierarchy ranging from the everyday flow of lived experience to a more heightened and comprehensive experience that has higher significance in the individuals' life, and the latter type of experience is what the IPA researchers are most interested in. More specifically, IPA researchers see these more significant experiences as comprising a range of fragments of life that are separated in time but linked with a common meaning and theme, and the objective of the research interviews is to encourage the respondents' recall of these disconnected fragments,

rebuild their connections and discover the hidden common meanings and themes. The second major theoretical basis for the IPA research method is the 'interpretation' or the 'hermeneutics' part. IPA researchers are in fact engaged in a 'double hermeneutic' (Smith, Flowers & Larkin, 2009), because while the respondents are trying to work through the significant experiences in order to make sense of what is happening, the researchers are also trying to make sense of the respondents' accounts at the same time.

IPA is idiographic in nature and is most suitable for the in-depth examination on how respondents perceive and make sense of their significant experiences in their personal as well as social world. Research questions are usually framed broadly and openly with the aim to explore certain areas of concern, rather than testing predetermined hypotheses. Data is collected via semi-structured interviews in which the researchers follow a flexible interview schedule, allowing the respondents to have a major influence on what is covered in the interviews. Transcripts of interviews are then analysed and turned into a narrative account, whereby the researchers can add their analytic interpretation supported by verbatim extracts from the respondents.

IPA's core strength lies in its ability to shed light on the human predicament and on how human beings engage with the world. As such, it has been widely used in health psychology, clinical and counselling psychology, as well as social and educational psychology. Having said that, IPA is also prone to a few vulnerabilities which are common to interview research-based methods. These include firstly, the possibility of memory errors or intentional deceits from the respondents in their retrospective accounts. Secondly, since the entire data analysis relies solely on the transformation provided by the researchers, its heavy reliance on the researchers' subjectivity results in a lack of total neutral access to the subject matter being researched (Smith, 2008).

#### Discourse analysis

Since the 1980s, discourse analysis has been gaining popularity in the social science qualitative research field, as is evident in the social scientists' turn to the analysis of language or discourse since then. This 'turning to language' movement was driven by the inspiration from other theorists including philosophers, communication theorists, historians, and sociologists, who challenged the long-standing assumption that language provided a set of objective and distinctive signs to describe internal states and external reality. Instead, discourse analysts suggest that language be regarded as productive and constructive in nature, and that it plays a key role in constructing social reality for individuals to achieve personal and social objectives. This movement resulted in a shift of the qualitative research inquiry's focus from individuals and their intentions to language and its productive and constructive potential.

Discourse analysis is not merely a method of qualitative data analysis; it is a way of rearticulating the role of language in the construction of personal, interpersonal and social realities, which in turn helps to shape research questions in a new and productive way. As was suggested by Smith (2008), there are a few fundamental assumptions behind discourse analysis that set it apart from traditional cognitivism-based qualitative research. Firstly, cognitivism assumes that what respondents say in the interviews is a true representation of their mental state. Discourse analysts disagree with this view and they argue that respondents use language within certain contexts to achieve social and interpersonal objectives, therefore their expressed attitudes are not necessarily consistent across different social contexts. Hence, in order to make sense of what the respondents say, the researchers need to take into account the implications and impact of the social contexts. Secondly, rather than seeing the world as made up of mental

representations of objective reality, discourse analysts believe that our grasp of the world is constructed through language, therefore discourse and conversation should be the focus of analysis because that is where meanings are created. Thirdly, contrary to the cognitive theory's assumption that objective perception of reality is theoretically possible, discourse analysts argue that if language constructs rather than represents social reality, then objective reality does not theoretically exist, therefore it is impossible to have an objective perception of it. As such, the key focus of qualitative inquiry should be on how social reality is constructed and how that affects language and conversation. Furthermore, as opposed to the cognitivist's view that there exist consensual objects of thoughts in the social environment and that individuals can disagree on why certain things happen and have different attitudes to them, discourse analysts believe that consensual objects of thoughts do not exist, because the objects themselves are constructed through language. Therefore, different individuals would have different versions of social objects, and their beliefs on why certain things happen and their attitudes towards them are merely aspects of the discursive construction of the given social object. Finally, cognitivism assumes the existence of enduring cognitive structures embedded in the human mind with consistent beliefs and attitudes. However, in line with their fundamental assumption on language as productive and performative in nature, discourse analysts argue that people's beliefs and attitudes are dependent on the social and discursive context, and what they say is a manifestation of how they use words to achieve certain personal and interpersonal objectives within particular contexts, rather than as a representation of the cognitive structure of words used.

With the above assumptions, the focus of discourse analysis is primarily on how respondents use discursive resources to achieve personal and interpersonal objectives in certain social contexts, and the performative, constructive, fluidity and variability of discourse are emphasised in the analysis. As such, discourse analysis can be seen as a special approach in reading a text, underpinned by the fundamental assumption of language as productive and performative in nature. Discourse analysts focus on going beyond the manifest content of the text to trace its action orientation and internal organisation, in order to uncover the underlying meaning and implications of the text. All talk and text are treated as social action and this orientation directs the analytic work of discourse analysis (Smith, 2008).

One major issue with traditional qualitative research, including the above three major qualitative analysis methodologies, is that they assume that words mean the same thing to the researchers and respondents, and there is a commonly agreed shared meaning attached to words used in the interviews, i.e. the meanings of the questions asked by the researchers are assumed to be the same as the meanings that are understood by the respondents, and vice versa with regard to the answers provided by the respondents. This assumption of shared meanings between researchers and respondents is still based on the positivist view of a rational unitary respondent, who carries the same assumptions as those of the quantitative researchers (Hollway & Jefferson, 2013). In addition, traditional qualitative research also suffers from the highly questionable assumptions that firstly, respondents are knowledgeable about their actions and feelings, and secondly, they are willing and able to tell this to a stranger researcher. Due to these limitations of the above methodologies, a different research approach to access respondents' unconscious materials and structure is required to shed light on our research question.

# 5.1.3 The narrative interviewing approach and the psychoanalytical clinical casestudy approach

As opposed to the traditional qualitative interviewing approach which follows a structured or semi-structured interviewing agenda in which the researchers set the agenda and are in full control of the information produced throughout the interview, i.e. the researchers control the theme and topics of the interview, arrange the questions in their preferred sequence, and express the questions in their own meaning-frame, in the narrative interviewing approach, the researchers take a more passive role by only selecting the theme, topics and sequence of the interview. It follows that the researcher's role in the narrative approach is to be a good listener and the respondent's role is to be a story-teller. The agenda is open to development and change by the respondents, and any attempt to impose a traditional question-and-answer interviewing approach would only interrupt the flow and suppress the respondents' stories (Bauer, 1996; Jovchelovitch & Bauer, 2000).

In the narrative story-telling approach, the story-teller naturally assumes the responsibility for making the story clear and coherent to the researcher, so this approach emphasises the narrated story co-created by the respondent and the researcher in the research context, rather than a retrospective account of pre-existing fact. Despite some challenges to the reliability and validity of eliciting narratives as a research method (Bauer, 1996; Jovchelovitch & Bauer, 2000), the elicited stories in the narrative approach still provide a means to a more in-depth understanding of the respondents' lives, which is closer to actual life-events than traditional interviewing methods that tend to produce post-rationalised or socially acceptable explanations.

With regard to the limitations of quantitative and qualitative research in understanding the socio-cultural context of the respondent's answers, Kvale (1999) believed that researchers should look outside the conventional research field and into the clinical area such as that of the discipline of psychoanalysis, which has a model of knowledge that emphasises the psychoanalyst's subjective involvement in understanding and interpreting the patients' accounts. This is in line with the conventional research tradition in emphasising the researchers' reflexivity in the interview, except that the psychoanalytic tradition goes beyond the conscious forces and understands the subjectivity of the researchers through the lens of unconscious dynamics and an associated defence mechanism.

### The biographical-interpretative method

The biographical-interpretative method (Schutze, 1992; Rosenthal, 1993) belongs to the narrative interview tradition that arose as part of the general turn to language in social science in the 1980s. The biographical-interpretative approach was pioneered by German sociologists who attempted to research the lives of holocaust survivors and Nazi soldiers in the early 1990s (Schutze, 1992; Rosenthal, 1993), and it has been adopted mostly in life-story research. The main theoretical principle of the biographical-interpretative method is the notion that there exists a 'gestalt', a meaning-frame, a holistic form or a whole that is greater than the sum of its parts, governing each person's life. In biographical-narrative interviews, the researchers are responsible for assisting the respondents to provide a more intact life story, and hence facilitate the emergence of "gestalt". In this approach, the researcher should not provide interpretations, judgments, impose their own meaning-frame, or follow a predetermined interview agenda that only addresses the researcher's interests, because all these would only destroy the 'gestalt' or the respondent's meaning frame.

The German sociologists have adopted four interviewing strategies that can elicit intact life stories and assist the emergence of 'gestalt'. Firstly, there is the use of open-ended instead of closed-ended questions, so that the real meaning of the subject matter being researched relates to the respondent's life and experiences which can be uncovered. Secondly, 'why' questions are avoided since they trigger intellectualisation and postrationalisations. In addition, the form of the original interviews is preserved by always posting follow-up questions using the respondents' original ordering and phrasing so that their original meaning-frame can be retained. The follow-up questions should also be as open-ended as possible and constructed to invite further stories. Finally, the focus is on eliciting stories instead of explanations from the respondents, because stories are much more powerful because they anchor the respondents in real-life events that actually happened, even when they are compromised by being used for unconscious defensive purposes. Moreover, apart from the content of the stories, the features of the story-telling such as the choice of the story, the manner in which it is told, the emphasis placed on certain sections and the drawn conclusions, i.e. the narrator's 'gestalt', are all representative of unconscious choices made by the respondents, which is usually more revealing and contains a lot more significance beyond their original intentions.

The biographical-interpretative method's principle of respecting and retaining the 'gestalt' of the respondent shares a lot of similarities with the psychoanalytic method of 'free association'. By allowing the patients to say whatever comes to mind, the psychoanalysts are able to elicit narratives that are charged with emotional motivations instead of rational intentions and filled with associations governed by unconscious rather than conscious logic. This points to the possibility that the respondents' unconscious anxiety and defence mechanisms provide the key to their 'gestalt'; hence

by incorporating the psychoanalytic principle of 'free association' into the biographical-interpretative method, one can gain access to the respondent's real concerns, which would not otherwise be accessible using the traditional quantitative and qualitative research methods (Hollway & Jefferson, 2013).

#### 5.1.4 The Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI) method

The FANI method was first developed by Hollway and Jefferson (2013) back in 2000 when they published the first edition of their ground-breaking book "doing qualitative research differently". It is a qualitative research method for the production and analysis of face-to-face interview data that is grounded on the narrative approach and guided by the psychoanalytic principles of 'free association'. The FANI method uses open-ended questions to elicit narratives that are linked to specific events from respondents. Unlike the intellectualised and generalised de-contextualised accounts that are emotionally drained, these elicited stories are highly charged with emotional meanings. According to the principle of 'free association', the emotional significance of these accounts is usually contained in the links, arranged in a certain sequence, between the seemingly inconsistent fragments of elicited narratives, rather than the rational content of these accounts.

The FANI method is grounded on the key principles of psychoanalytic theories. Its data collection method is driven by 'free association' and its data analysis is based on interpretation. There are a few key assumptions that differentiate the FANI method from a conventional qualitative research approach. This includes the notion of the 'defended subject' and the need to view the respondents as psychosocial instead of rational unitary subjects, the emphasis on the use of the researcher's subjectivity as an

instrument of knowing, and the need for respecting the 'gestalt' of the respondents' accounts (Hollway & Jefferson, 2013). These key assumptions will be explained in detail in the following paragraphs.

#### The 'defended subject'

According to the Kleinian notion of unconscious defence against anxiety, the infant's early experience is dominated by acute anxiety in the face of complete dependency, and polarised emotions of 'good' when it is fed and 'bad' when it is hungry. Unable to recognise a whole object, the infant mentally splits between all good experiences, associated with a 'good' part-object that is loved, and all bad experiences, associated with a 'bad' part-object that is frantically attacked. These two part-objects are kept mentally separated for the defensive purpose to protect the 'good' from the 'bad'. Klein called this the 'paranoid-schizoid position', and this position is filled with destructive impulses.

As the infant's ego becomes more developed and integrated, it is capable of realising that both the loved 'good' and the hated 'bad' part-objects actually belong to the same whole object, and a sense of ambivalence develops towards the whole object as the mother begins to be seen as capable of both 'good' and 'bad'. This is when love and hate, external reality and internal phantasy, co-exist in the infant's mind. The infant begins to acknowledge its own dependency and helplessness towards the mother and starts to feel anxious about its previous aggressive impulses, fearing that it may have destroyed the same mother that it loves. This characterises the Kleinian 'depressive position' and is packed with depressive anxiety and guilt feelings.

According to Klein, the self is continuously shaped by unconscious defences against anxiety since birth. The self is not a single unit with clear boundaries separating it from the external world; these unconscious defences against anxieties are inter-subjective and occur in relation to the external objects, e.g. splitting is achieved through the projection of a 'bad' internal object and the introjection of a 'good' external object. Anxiety is inherent in the human condition, and people constantly move between the 'paranoid schizoid position' and the 'depressive position' when faced with deprivations in the threatening world, depending on the perceived level of threat and the level of development of the ego, even though different people do have a tendency to respond with one or the other position.

The ideas of unconscious anxieties and the 'defended subject' suggest that both the quantitative and qualitative research traditions' view of the research respondents as rationally driven and socially constructed unitary individuals is problematic. The internal world of the respondents should not be viewed as simply a reflection or a rational interpretation of the external world; rather it needs to be understood through the lens of their unconscious anxieties and defences, which operate at an unconscious level exerting a significant influence on their lives, their relations with others, and their everyday actions. These unconscious defences determine how the respondents experience their external world, or how they interpret events and extract meanings in the research context.

### The use of the researcher's subjectivity as a key instrument of knowing

The FANI method assumes that all research respondents are meaning-seeking and anxious defended subjects who may not share the same meaning-frame as the researchers or other respondents, and they are also invested in particular 'positions' as

a defence mechanism for ego protection purposes. As such, they may not know the reasons behind their feelings and behaviours, and they are unconsciously motivated to disguise the meanings of at least part of their feelings and behaviours.

The researchers, at the same time, share many similarities with the respondents. They are also anxious and defended individuals who are subject to projections and introjections of emotions and feelings coming from the respondents in the research context. This means that the impressions that the research pair has of each other should not be seen as deriving from a real and objective relationship, but instead they are coloured by unconscious phantasies derived from significant relationships in the past, assessable only through feelings, not rational understanding and conscious awareness. As such, the researcher is encouraged to make use of their emotional responses to the interview in data analysis, as they are of value in understanding the dynamics of the research relationship, which is aided by keeping a record of detailed reflexive field notes. Given the above theoretical starting point, all data in the research context is coproduced by the research pair, in which unconscious inter-subjective dynamics, transference and countertransference are in full operation.

Hollway and Jefferson's (2013) notion of 'defended subject' is both psychic and social. It is psychic because its development is driven by a unique biography of anxiety-provoking life events that have been unconsciously defended against. It is also social because of its intimate relationship with the external events and objects, and the associated interpretations and experiences of these external entities. It is this psychosocial nature of the anxious and defended subjects that would provide additional depth and insight into the 'what', 'how', and 'who' of the research results.

For instance, as reported by Hollway and Jefferson (2013) in their 'fear of crime' study, demographic and geographic clustering failed to account for the differences in the respondents' perceived risk of crime. However, when positing the respondents as biographically unique 'defended subjects' investing in specific discourses and 'positions' that shielded them against unconscious anxieties, a more complete picture emerged, and an understanding of differences between respondents that were not explainable by demographic and geographic clustering was obtained. Therefore, identical demographic and geographic profiles should not be a basis for generalising the research findings because they could be achieved as a result of very different biographies. In order to get the full picture, any attempt at generalisation must be based on a combination of biographic, demographic and geographic factors.

#### The emphasis on the 'gestalt' of the respondent's accounts

When analysing narrative data using the FANI method, it is important not to interpret the respondents' account based on face value, since it is likely to be driven by the respondents' post-rationalisation in order to appear consistent and coherent. In order to understand the meaning of the narrated stories and make sense of the seeming inconsistencies, it is important to firstly, have a broader look at the whole of the evidence through an understanding of the entire transcript materials. This is very different from the 'code and retrieve' data analysis system adopted by the traditional qualitative researcher, which would lead to a fragmentation and de-contextualisation of the information. Secondly, it is important to utilise the theory of the 'defended subject' in order to understand the respondents' investment in a particular discourse, as a result of the activation of an unconscious defence mechanism against anxieties. Finally, the researchers are encouraged to leverage on their reflexivity by investing effort and time in recording notes containing their subjective experiences and feelings

right after each interview. If used properly, reflexivity can help reinforce a theoretical conviction or alert the researchers to a potential misreading of the information. With the above three principles in mind, together with the gathered information from the respondent's narrated stories through 'free associations', unconscious inter-subjective dynamics involving transference and countertransference, and the application of psychoanalytic knowledge, the next step is for the researchers to start making links to re-join the disconnected elements from the data and provide the form to the respondents' account.

#### Critical evaluation of the FANI method

#### Objectivity and reliability of the results

As suggested by Hollway and Jefferson (2013), a positivist epistemology requires that all knowledge must be directly linked to observable events, with objectivity and reliability as the definitive criteria. In relation to the principle of objectivity, with its heavy reliance on intuition, emotion, feelings, researcher subjectivity, the research pair's inter-subjectivity, and the use of unconscious dynamics as a technique to derive insight, it is commonly acknowledged in the psychoanalytic field that psychoanalytic interpretation is an art, not a science, so the principle of objectivity is outside the scope of the psychoanalytic principle and the FANI method. Faced with criticisms and doubt on the validity of the knowledge generated by psychoanalysis, one useful defence is the integrity of the methodology and persuasiveness of the clinical evidence contained in the narratives and interpretations of the research data.

With regard to the second principle of reliability, which requires consistency, stability, and repeatability of results, it is an invalid principle for psychoanalysis and the FANI

method because it assumes that meanings can be controlled in every single application of a question. In psychoanalysis, the situations and respondents for each psychoanalytic encounter will never be the same, and meanings are unique to the respondents and the relational encounters. Therefore, the results generated by the FANI method should be regarded as reliable, as long as the interpretations are grounded on sound theoretical principles, the results are firmly empirical with supporting evidence, and similar interpretations can be obtained by different researchers.

#### The ethics of researching psychosocial respondents

As stipulated in the ethical principles published by the British Psychological Society (2009), ethical issues in social science research primarily concern ensuring the welfare and interests of research respondents and require the researcher to report his findings truthfully and accurately. When translated into research practice, these ethical standards mean an informed consent must be obtained from the respondents, no harm must be inflicted, and all information obtained must be treated in strict confidence to ensure the anonymity of the respondents.

However, as pointed out by Hollway and Jefferson (2013), the above ethical principles may not be applicable for researching psychosocial subjects in the FANI method due to a number of reasons. Firstly, due to the nature of the FANI method where there is no pre-determined list of questions to go through in the interview, it is the respondents who are in control of what and how the narrated stories are told in the interview. Hence, it is not possible to predict how each respondent would experience the interview, and it is also impossible to inform the respondents in advance accordingly in a meaningful way. Secondly, whilst it is against human rights for the researchers to inflict harm on the respondents, a key question is whether it is necessarily harmful for the respondents

to experience distress in the interview, given the known therapeutic effect of talking about disturbing events in a safe and controlled psychoanalytic environment. In the realm of psychoanalysis, unconscious defence protects the respondent against the painful 'truth', therefore it follows that a 'truthful' analysis may indeed inflict distress and anxiety on the respondents, but such distress and anxiety should not be automatically linked to 'harm'.

Given the co-creation nature of the FANI method, both the researchers and respondents are active co-participants in the produced data, and what is said and revealed in the interview can only be known during, not before, the interview. Therefore, the fundamental criterion to determine the ethical standard for the FANI method should not be informed consent, but rather on the issue of avoiding harm, which in turns relies on the researchers' responsibility to create a safe interviewing environment based on honesty, sympathy, and respect. Finally, with regard to the ethical requirement to ensure the anonymity of respondents, the likelihood of concealing the respondents' identities in published biographical research is extremely difficult without significantly distorting the original data, especially for those having a certain distinctive combination of attributes. Furthermore, the use of data from members of the same family, neighbourhood, or organisation poses even more challenges to the confidentiality requirements. The only way to ensure anonymity is to refrain from publishing casebase studies, but that would be against the wider interest of making the knowledge publicly available. As such, it is imperative for the researchers to ensure that any potential objections on the publication of the results, alternative interpretations of the data, and views of the respondents have been thoroughly examined and considered in the final research report, and that no greater level of harm than might be predicted is inflicted on the respondents, compared to the level they have already been exposed to.

#### Revised ethical principles for researching psychosocial subjects

In view of the limitations of the current ethical principles in researching psychosocial subjects, Hollway and Jefferson (2013) proposed a more suitable set of ethical principles that is built around the values of honesty, sympathy and respect. To be specific, honesty means approaching the collected data in the spirit of inquiry instead of advocacy, leveraging on a sound theoretical framework that is justified, and making only interpretations that can be supported by solid evidence. Sympathy refers to the researchers' capacity of taking the perspective of the respondents and sharing their feelings and emotions. The ethical principle of respect refers to the notion of carefully observing the research subjects with our full attention to ensure that there is a realistic appraisal that is independent of our own defences, as well as analysing the collected data using our theoretical, empirical, and experiential knowledges in order to notice what might be too painful to notice.

#### 5.1.5 Rationale for adopting a qualitative research design with no control group

According to Hinshelwood (2013), research in psychoanalysis can be broadly divided into two types. The first type is outcome research of clinical trials with the objective of measuring the effectiveness of psychoanalytic treatments. This type of research is mostly quantitative, and it arises as a result of financial pressures from healthcare institutions, hence the need to justify the effectiveness of psychoanalytic treatment versus other types of treatment. The second type is conceptual research about basic theoretical ideas in psychoanalysis which comes before clinical work, similar to the Menninger Psychotherapy Research Project pioneered by Wallerstein between 1954 and 1982. This is also the type of research that Freud used to derive psychoanalytic

knowledge based on single-case study, rather than from massed and aggregated samples of large numbers of subjects. In fact, a majority of psychoanalytic knowledge has come from clinical cases based on a single-case study approach that have no control group.

This single-case study research tradition used by Freud is also advocated by Winnicott, as seen in the talks delivered to the Eighth Form of St Paul's School in London, and to students of psychology and social work at the London School of Economics:

'Psychology simply means the study of human nature, and that it is a science, just as physics, physiology, and biology are sciences.'

(Winnicott, 1945, p.381)

'True intuition can reach to a whole truth in a flash (just as faulty intuition can reach to error), whereas in a science the whole truth is never reached. What is important in science is a construction of a satisfactory road towards the truth... If, in a subject that is being approached through the scientific method, there is a gap in our knowledge, we just record it as a gap in knowledge, a stimulus to research, but the intuitive person's gaps are unknown quantities with somewhat terrifying potential... The scientific approach to the phenomena of human nature enables us to be ignorant without being frightened, and without, therefore, having to invent all sorts of weird theories to explain away the gaps in knowledge.'

(Winnicott, 1945, p.383)

'No wonder it is difficult to learn about psychology. What is the answer? One thing is to go slow. Another is to get relief from the fact that some of what is taught is bound to be wrong, although psychology can teach a good deal about human nature that is true as far as it goes.'

(Winnicott, 1950, p.426)

In the rapidly changing context of healthcare requiring a systematised method of testing theories, there has been an increasing emphasis on an evidence-based approach for outcome research in psychoanalysis. The contested nature of the current debates within psychoanalysis around themes of quantitative versus qualitative research can be seen in the debate between Kernberg and Perron published in the International Journal of Psychoanalysis in 2006 (Scott, 2018).

As suggested by Scott (2018), despite the differences between the inductive tradition of qualitative research and deductive reasoning and testing required for quantitative research, they should not be regarded as mutually exclusive. This can be seen in the increasing number of mixed-methods research that uses elements of both qualitative and quantitative approaches. An example is the Tavistock Adult Depression Study between 2002 and 2013, which used a combination of a pragmatic, randomized controlled trial to compare the treatment effectiveness of a group of patients who received eighteen months of weekly psychoanalytic psychotherapy, versus a control group who received other forms of treatment approved by the NICE depression guidance administered by their General Practitioner. This outcome trial was completed by a two-year follow up after treatment completion using clinical research and qualitative research methodology (The Tavistock and Portman NHS Foundation Trust, 2018).

Having said that, it is also possible to conduct clinical research in a classically Freudian tradition, as demonstrated by Hinshelwood's cogent logical model to test psychoanalytic theories clinically (2013). As suggested by Hinshelwood, it is a model that enables us to:

'forget the suspicion of single-case studies which can prove to be more definitive than large sample testing, given the right conditions;

acknowledge the subjectivity of the field of investigation without being apologetic about it, since it is the unique contribution of psychoanalysis;

retain causality and the possibility of prediction, while simultaneously keeping the subjective meaning and narrative to the fore; and

face the challenge of developing facts that are not biased to one or another psychoanalytic school.'

(Hinshelwood, 2013, pp.33-34)

In the long run, psychoanalysis as a unique body of knowledge centred around understanding a subjective human experience can benefit from an evidence-based approach for research. A two-pronged strategy for research design in psychoanalysis can help our engagement with the conversations outside the psychoanalytic community, through the use of an outward-facing quantitative approach; and at the same time, we can also remain loyal to the tradition of conceptual research based on

inductive reasoning through an inward-facing approach advocated by Freud, and further developed by Hinshelwood (2013).

This thesis falls under Hinshelwood's second type of basic conceptual research of psychoanalytic theories, in which a qualitative approach is commonly used. We have decided not to include a control group in the research design because firstly, there are limited resources and time for a PhD thesis. One needs to rush through the research in order to get it done in the time stipulated by the university. Secondly, our research is only a pilot study. Research on a larger scale is required to improve the generalizability and reliability of the results. Therefore, it is not practical to find a matched control group similar to the longitudinal study and randomized controlled trials conducted by Lynn Murray, which takes a lot longer and requires more resources to complete.

# 5.2 Data collection method: Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI)

In view of the strengths of the Free Association Narrative Interview (FANI) method (Hollway & Jefferson, 2013), compared to the traditional qualitative research method in accessing the unconscious and embodied emotional experiences through eliciting free associations from the participants, smoker interviews using the FANI method is our primary data collection method in order to explore the relationship between smokers and cigarettes, and how that resembles the one of the infantile transitional object that extends into adulthood in a regressed form. Contrary to traditional qualitative research, the role of the researcher in the FANI method is to be an attentive

listener, and the respondents assume the role of story-tellers who tell the stories of their lives.

#### **5.2.1 Interview schedule**

Following the FANI approach, a total of two one-hour interviews, one to two weeks apart, for each participant were completed. Consent forms on research participation, and voice and video recording for each interview have also been obtained with the agreement of all eight respondents. The first interview was meant to establish a preliminary reading of the elicited narratives, to critically interrogate what is said, and to pick up the contradictions and inconsistencies, defensive avoidances, and changes of tones. The second interview was for the researcher to seek further evidence and clarifications from the respondents in order to confirm the provisional hypotheses and analyses.

The one- to two-week gap between the two interviews would also allow for time for the researcher to reflect on what was said in the first interview, which is critical in the FANI method, as it involves using the researcher's subjectivity as an instrument of knowing, and without reflection it would be difficult to correctly grasp the emotional factor and transform that into useful insight.

#### **5.2.2 Interview questions**

In consultation with Professor Wendy Hollway, the co-developer of the FANI method, it is found that there is value in asking some fairly open, but specific, narrative questions. Responses may have significant bearing on our main research questions. The

interview questions are open-ended and intentionally designed to elicit experience-near narratives that require a psychological depth from the participants, and at the same time allow for free associations to emerge, and to minimise the occurrences of opinion-based generalisation and post-rationalisation. The objective is to uncover the emotional footings of the remembered experiences mentioned by the participants in the interviews.

#### Narrative questions in the first interview

- 1. Can you tell me about a recent happy moment in your life and how you felt about it?
- 2. Can you tell me about a recent distressing moment in your life and how you coped with it?
- 3. I am interested in smokers' embodied experiencing of cigarettes. Can you tell me how it felt yesterday to smoke your favourite cigarette of the day?
- 4. Can you tell me the most disappointing cigarette that you remember smoking recently?
- 5. Can you tell me the ideal cigarette that you remember smoking recently?

#### Narrative questions in the second interview

In the first interview we established a preliminary reading based on a critical interrogation of what was said, and identified inconsistences, contradictions, avoidances, hesitations, and changes of emotional tones. Following that stage and after reviewing the recordings of the first interview and reflecting on them, in the second interview, which was one to two weeks later, we followed up on the themes and issues that appeared to be suggestive of tensions. The second interview also gave us the

opportunity to seek further evidence in order to test the hunches and provisional hypotheses established in the first interview.

## **5.3** The respondents

#### 5.3.1 Sampling frame

In order to minimise the social factors contributing to smoking addiction, including sociocultural factors such as the awareness of the public health campaign, the level of exposure to the risk of smoking, and generational factors, we have tightened the recruitment criteria to students aged between eighteen to twenty-four, who are studying in any tertiary institution in Hong Kong, and whose parents are non-smokers.

The above criteria have been chosen because firstly, tobacco advertising on electronic media was banned in Hong Kong on December 1<sup>st</sup>, 1990, which is many years before the participants were born, hence their exposure to the most powerful form of above-the-line tobacco advertising should be limited, therefore minimising the sociocultural factors affecting smoking addiction as much as possible. Secondly, students in tertiary institutions are assumed to have a better understanding than the general public of the risks of smoking cigarettes. Thirdly, by choosing participants whose parents are non-smokers, a generational influence on smoking can also be minimised.

#### 5.3.2 Sample size and variations

In line with the principle of the FANI method, the sample size of this research is not meant to correspond to the requirements of statistical generalisability. In order to enable extrapolations of concepts and potential explanations from qualitative case data and, to some extent, identifying patterning amongst single cases, we aim to maximise the variation amongst the respondents within the above sampling frame. Within the limitations of a sample size that will permit sufficient depth, depth trumps breadth as a criterion in this research, and the aim is to maximise variation amongst participants. The criteria for dimensions of variations in order to optimise the strength of our sample include the gender of the participants, whether they have siblings or not, and whether they were raised by both parents or a single parent.

A total of eight smokers from tertiary institutions in Hong Kong were recruited through Field and Tab Research Services Limited to reflect the above sample variations. This is to ensure that we gather sufficiently rich data in order to generate suggestive ideas to take forward from hypothesis substantiation to a theoretical concept development. The respondents were then invited by Field and Tab Research Services Limited to the main meeting room at their office for the interviews. Each respondent was given a project information sheet (see appendix 2) that contains information related to the objectives, duration, and frequency of the interviews. They were informed that all the interviews would be video recorded and transcribed for research analysis purposes. They were reassured of the anonymity and confidentiality of their interviews, and that they could withdraw at any time without giving any reasons for doing so. All of the respondents were required to sign a consent form upon agreement to take part in the interviews.

The following is the profile of the eight recruited and interviewed respondents:

Respondents' Profile						
Age range	18-24, students in tertiary institutions in Hong Kong					
Gender	4 Male	4 Female				
Parents' smoking status	All are non-smokers					
Parents' marital status	4 married 4 divorced					

Name (Disguised)	Gender	Age	Regularly Smoked Cigarette Brand	Average Daily Consumption (no. of sticks)	Parents' Marital Status	With Sibling?
Hank	Male	19	Marlboro Medium Red	20	Married	1 brother
Anthony	Male	21	Lamhorghini	10	Married	1 brother
Holly	Female	20	Marlboro Ice Blast	10	Married	Single child
Anita	Female	21	Mild Seven	5	Married	Single child
Cooper	Female	20	Marlboro Blue Ice	10	Divorced	1 sister
Emerald	Female	23	Pianissimo	8	Divorced	1 sister
Abyss	Male	21	Marlboro Black	20	Divorced	Single child
Samuel	Male	21	Marlboro Double Capsule	10	Divorced	Single child

## 5.4 Data analysis methods

In order to answer the research question, 'To what extent can a cigarette be regarded as a regressed form of infantile 'transitional object' that prolongs into adulthood?', we will be using three levels of analysis to examine the collected interview data. Firstly, we will be using the FANI method in order to identify the 'defended smoking moments' as manifested in the interviews. This will be followed by comparing themes extracted from the data with the 'smoking moments' from the tobacco industry research, in order to identify the highly personal and regressive smoking moments out of the six personal moments, i.e. 'pass the time', 'me time', 'self-reward', 'relax', 'focus/problem solver',

and 'boost/start up' moments (please refer to the literature review for a more detailed description of the 'smoking moments' research conducted by the tobacco industry). Finally, we will be using Winnicott's seven criteria of transitional objects identified in his landmark paper in 1953 to find specific instances of the occurrence of the regressed transitional object in the interviews:

- 1. The infant assumes rights over the object...
- 2. The object is affectionately cuddled as well as excitedly loved and mutilated.
- 3. It must never be changed, unless changed by the infant.
- 4. It must survive instinctual loving, and also hating...
- 5. Yet it must seem to the infant to give warmth, or to move, or to have texture, or to do something that seems to show it has vitality or reality of its own.
- 6. It comes from without from our point of view, but not so from the point of view of the baby. Neither does it come from within...
- 7. Its fate is to be gradually allowed to be decathected, so that in the course of years it becomes not so much forgotten as relegated to limbo...

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

# 6. ANALYSIS OF THE DATA AND RESULTS

Each of the eight respondents have their own very unusual and unique story. This very private information was revealed to the researcher despite the limited number of interview sessions available and limited duration of each interview as per the FANI research set up, i.e. two one-hour interviews one to two weeks apart for each

respondent, indicating the power of letting the respondents decide the flow of their narratives, and getting the researcher to take a back seat. Compared to general commercial qualitative research which the researcher has been exposed to in the past 22 years of her marketing career in a global tobacco company, the FANI method is able to evoke rich narratives of the emotionally charged smoking moments, as well as providing in-depth insights on what smoking and cigarettes really mean to the smokers and the relationship between them. The wealth and depth of information revealed by the FANI method is unprecedentedly powerful, compared to the commercial qualitative research that is conducted by the tobacco industry.

In the following paragraphs, a pen portrait of each respondent based on the field notes written by the researcher immediately after each interview will be provided. Each pen portrait covers the demographic information of the respondents, their family and school lives, how they started smoking, and their relationship with cigarettes. Since this is a thesis about smoking addiction, a more detailed elaboration on the respondents' relationship with smoking will also be included in the pen portraits. In order to provide a more systematic description of the respondents' relationship with cigarettes, a piece of tobacco industry commercial research examining the smokers' key smoking moments across different countries will be used to provide a framework to summarise how cigarettes are used by the respondents across different moments. In line with our research interest, we will be focusing on the highly personal smoking moments of these respondents, rather than the more generic social moments of smoking, which is outside the scope of the current thesis.

### 6.1 Pen portrait of each participant

#### 6.1.1 Respondent 1: Hank

Hank is a nineteen-year-old Year 1 university student majoring in Surveying at the Polytechnic University of Hong Kong. Hank comes from a middle-class family in Hong Kong and has a brother who is one year younger than him. His father is a businessman, but strangely enough, Hank does not know what kind of business his father has. The only thing he remembered was that his father was always out of town when he was a child, and sometimes his mother also travelled with his father, so he and his brother always ended up ordering take-outs for dinner. Hank's mother used to be the shop manager at a Chanel cosmetic store, but she decided to quit her job and become a full-time housewife when Hank sustained a fever and was diagnosed with acute meningitis two months after birth. Hank was immediately sent to the emergency room and went through a major operation to remove his bone flap, in order to relieve the pressure off the brain. Hank was told by his mother that he went through a skull fraction transplantation operation with his bone flap replaced by the chest bone of his cousin who was fifteen to sixteen months old. These major operations resulted in a prolonged hospitalisation and separation from his mother for months right after his birth. This also explains why his mother was willing to give up her career in order to become a fulltime housewife and look after Hank from that incident onwards.

Hank was expelled from Pui Ching Middle School, a renowned elite high school in Hong Kong, when he was in Form 4, due to truancy. He did not like his school, feeling suffocated and caged by the rules and regulations. He also did not like any of his classmates at Pui Ching and preferred to hang out with another group of friends that he met on Facebook. Many of them were from elite boys schools and all of them were smokers. That was also the time when Hank started smoking – five years ago, when he

was fourteen, out of peer influence and curiosity. Hank did not like Pui Ching at all; he felt that the school was suffocating and restraining for him, so he said he felt relieved and happy after being expelled. During that time, he stopped studying for a whole year and what he did every day was to wait for his friends outside their schools to go to game arcades, snooker clubs, and smoke together after school. However, after a while, under the influence of his girlfriend, he decided that he needed to go back to school in order to have a better future. Therefore, he went to Australia for six months, but he didn't like it, so he came back to Hong Kong and entered an international high school. Later on, he was finally admitted to the Polytechnic University of Hong Kong.

For Hank, smoking is an enjoyment, not something to be done in a hurry. He chooses high tar, full flavour cigarettes, as he enjoys the kick and the sensation, and he will not switch to low tar cigarettes and will never compromise on taste and satisfaction. He smoked his favourite cigarette of the day at noon the day of our interview, when he was alone, sitting outside his school and eating his lunch. The sensation of the sun washing over his whole body while he was smoking was so comfortable, and the sensation of euphoria was inexplicable through words. Hank spoke of the most difficult and saddest moment of his life when he found out that his girlfriend cheated on him with his best friend a year ago. That also happened during his open exam time, when he only had his cigarettes and guitar to console him. Hank also likes to bite the cigarette filter, as he feels that he can draw more smoke into his lungs while smoking, so the front ends of his cigarettes would always be soaking wet and have deep tooth marks all over every time he finishes smoking.

Hank uses his cigarettes mainly for the 'time out' moments: he spoke about his recent ideal cigarette at the harbour front at lunch time, when he felt very comfortable and free from all the unhappiness when he was enjoying his smoke. Smoking a cigarette is

like swallowing an 'air' of anger to him, and when this 'air' of anger is swallowed, it

then disappears completely. Besides, he also mentioned a few times in the interviews

that smoking is a wonderful feeling, and it allows him a short period of isolation from

the outside world, so he can ponder over life. Furthermore, cigarettes also serve a

'decharge' function for Hank: he smoked a lot more during the open exam when

pressure was high, and that is also when he got really addicted to smoking; he had a

few moments of smoking alone at the harbour when he broke up with his girlfriend; he

immediately reaches out for a cigarette when he is wronged or gets angry, e.g. when he

found out that his girlfriend cheated on him with his best friend; he also mentioned that

cigarette smoke has the power of taking away all the anger from his chest when he

exhales, making him feel relieved.

A note on the researcher's subjective emotional experience after the interviews with

Hank: despite the openness displayed by Hank, the researcher felt that Hank's

demeanour was covered by a layer of darkness. This could be due to the traumatic

experience in his childhood when he had to go through major surgery two months after

his birth, and how his life story developed afterwards; he was expelled from his high

school and betrayed by his best friend and girlfriend. The researcher had a nightmare

after the first interview with Hank. She dreamt that something had caught fire in the

basement of her apartment, and she had to run for her life. This made her wonder if that

is how Hank has been feeling all these days, i.e. running away from something that is

on fire in his unconscious, i.e. the basement in the researcher's dream.

6.1.2 Respondent 2: Anthony

Anthony is a twenty-one-year-old final year student majoring in Business Administration at the Baptist University. Anthony came into the interview room with an artist hat and trendy outfit. With unconventional long hair which is quite unusual for guys in Hong Kong, he looked more like a fine art student than a business student. Later on, he mentioned that the bachelor's degree he is studying has no honours, and he got into this program indirectly via different interim schools, instead of straight from the high school, and it is clear from our conversation that he is not confident in finding a decent job after graduation.

Anthony is the younger of the two boys in his family. His brother is six years older than him and the two of them are very close to each other, even though his brother no longer lives with him and their parents. His brother did not go to university and, according to Anthony, his brother looks and behaves very differently from Anthony. Anthony's father works a nightshift, so he rarely sees his sons, and his mother has been a full-time housewife since she married their father. Anthony said that he loves old stuff; he is a very nostalgic person and does not want anyone to 'touch' his childhood memories. For instance, he won a Disney piglet stuffed toy with a bell at the AIA Carnival when he was five or six years old, and until today he still keeps the toy on his bedside and cuddles it every night. Because of the toy's old age, it is very worn out now, but he has only put it in the washing machine once or twice in the past fifteen years; most of the other times he just wiped it using a wet cloth. Anthony is very afraid that too much washing would cause damage to his piglet toy, and that it would lose its eyes, ears, mouth, and nose. He would also cry if that really happened to his toy.

Anthony started smoking regularly in Form 5 when he was under a lot of pressure studying for his open examination. He picked up smoking under the influence of his

girlfriend at that time. He regarded smoking as a very 'comfortable action', so comfortable that words fail to explain it. It is not a physical comfort, but more like a psychological comfort, something that gives him an excuse to rest and take breaks. He likes to smoke with his friends for social bonding, and when he smokes alone, he usually uses cigarettes to pass his time, especially when he is in-between things, or waiting for a bus and has nothing to do, i.e. when he starts to feel lonely. Smoking is seen as a habitual 'action' in order to keep him company, and a cigarette is something that keeps him company and makes him feel less lonely, very similar to the role of a pet. He also loves to smoke after meals, because it gives him a very comfortable feeling, and he feels that a meal is not complete without the cigarette.

He also spoke of his recent distressing moment when he broke up with his girlfriend. Apart from talking to friends, he mainly used cigarettes to cope with the separation from his girlfriend. His most disappointing cigarette was the one that smelled and tasted completely different from his regular one. He suspected that the cigarette was dated, and he got rid of the entire pack immediately after smoking only half a stick, despite the high price of a pack in Hong Kong. His favourite cigarette was the one that he smoked after his open exam in Form 5, when he knew that he did well enough to secure a place in the university, and that he could take a break from studying and exams for a little while.

Tony uses cigarettes frequently to 'pass the time'. He usually smokes while taking breaks or in between things, and a cigarette is always used as a filler to fill the empty space and time when he feels lonely. Besides, 'time out' is also an important smoking moment for Tony, as he mentioned more a few times that cigarettes give him an opportunity to take breaks, something that he always looks forward to. Whenever he

feels exhausted or overwhelmed by work or his study, he will always reach for a smoke, which allows him to relax and not think about anything else for a short while. Finally, cigarettes help Tony to 'de-charge' and are a stress relief function after finishing a project or after an exam, which make him feel comfortable and relaxed. Tony also expressed that he usually has a very strong desire to smoke whenever he is unhappy, like breaking up with his girlfriends. A cigarette is like a loyal companion who is always there for him no matter how he feels.

#### 6.1.3 Respondent 3: Holly

Holly is a twenty-year-old Year 2 university student majoring in Management Studies at the Hang Sang Management College. When asked to introduce herself, she mentioned spontaneously that she is an immigrant from mainland China and only came to Hong Kong when she was ten, which is a secret she had been keeping away from her classmates and friends (note: mainland Chinese immigrants are usually discriminated against by the local Hong Kong people, and often they are the target of bullying and social isolation at school, especially for those immigrants who come from outside the Guangdong Province, where their mother tongue is Mandarin, not Cantonese, the language spoken by the Hong Kong people.) After a brief moment of silence, she carried on and said that she is two years older than her classmates in the same class, because she repeated one year in Primary 5 and another year in Form 5 due to her bad conduct and grades. Holly felt the gap between her and her Hong Kong classmates was not only because of her older age, but also because generally speaking, she does not like Hong Kong people, as she thinks that they are very mean and cold compared to mainland Chinese people, and she does not want her Hong Kong friends to know that she is from mainland China. Because of that, Holly has always felt strange

and out of place in Hong Kong, and yet she does not want to get in touch with her old mainland Chinese friends, because she also feels inferior to those locals who have their own houses.

Holly is the only child in her family and stayed with her mother in Dong Guan in China before moving to Hong Kong. Her father is a cross-border truck driver between Hong Kong and China, he works a night shift, so he is usually not at home one day per week. Her mother used to be a full-time housewife when they still lived in China, but she hardly looked after Holly due to her preoccupations with her own social life. After she moved to Hong Kong two years ago, Holly's mother started working as a dishwasher at the Hong Kong Jockey Club, and she used most of her salary to pay for Holly's tuition in Hong Kong.

Holly started smoking when she was twelve years old under the influence of a group of friends she met through an online game community. Holly felt excluded from her friends as she was the only non-smoker in the group, so she decided to buy her first cigarette in secret to find out how it felt like to smoke. From then onwards, Holly fell in love with smoking and she has been unable to separate herself from her cigarettes, as her heart would convulse and beat faster if she could not smoke. She did not tell any Hong Kong classmates that she smokes due to social pressure, as smoking is seen as a bad habit.

A cigarette is like a toy or mobile phone to Holly, something that she wants to be around all the time, something that she would feel extremely agitated about if it were absent. Her favourite cigarette was the Marlboro Ice Blast (her regular brand) which she smoked right after crossing the Hong Kong border the day before our interview, when

she went to China with her friend as parallel traders. Holly had been seriously deprived of smoking when she ran out of all her cigarettes at home the night before that trip. She could not find her regular Marlboro Ice Blast brand on the China side, so she was offered a Capri Superslims cigarette by her friend, which was a complete disappointment and made her feel 'unstable' and 'unsafe', as she described that cigarette as 'hopeless'. She felt 'awesome' after finally getting to smoke her regular brand after she went back to the Hong Kong border, which was a 'real cigarette' in her opinion. Her most disappointing cigarette was the one she smoked inside her friend's car, which made her feel very dizzy and stuffy, and she came to the conclusion that she would feel extremely uncomfortable smoking in a dark and suffocating entrapped environment, and it is not clear to what extent this entrapped environment reminds her of her father's truck. Holly has an inseparable relationship with her cigarettes; her strong desire to smoke when her cigarettes are not available is like her heart being clutched, which only makes her desire stronger. There was a time when she was rushing and knew that she was already late for school, and she suddenly had an urge to smoke a cigarette as a consolation, after knowing she would be late for school anyway, but she had run out, so she approached a stranger to ask for a cigarette. She compared her desire to smoke to her longing to see a boyfriend whom she had not seen for a long time.

Cigarettes are very multi-purposed for Holly, as she uses cigarettes in the 'time out' moments when she decides to enjoy her smoke outside of the campus, as a consolation, in order to take her away from the stressful awareness that she was late for school. She also uses her cigarettes to 'de-charge', when she manages to achieve a sense of calmness and stability by smoking her regular cigarette brand after a very bad experience of smoking an extremely disappointing cigarette, an experience that made

her feel unstable and unsafe. Holly always has cigarettes around her, as she believes that smoking enables her to feel more settled, restored, and recharged, so a 'revive' function of smoking also exists for Holly.

A note on the researcher's subjective emotional experience after the interviews with Holly: the researcher had a dream about her best friend, Ming, whom she has known for more than 30 years (since primary school). Ming was the researcher's only and best friend in primary school. She left Hong Kong thirty years ago after being rejected by the Chinese University of Hong Kong due to bad open exam results. Ming told the researcher that the Chinese University of Hong Kong gave her an offer in the Chinese history department, but it came too late as she had already decided to go to New Jersey to study nursing. The researcher was not sure whether this was true or something that Ming had made up to cure her ego. Ming finally got a masters' degree in nursing from Columbia University and she is now a nurse practitioner residing in Brooklyn. The researcher had an argument with Ming when she came to Hong Kong for holiday a while ago about her choosing to stay with someone whom the researcher hates. The researcher got angry with Ming and they no longer talk to each other after that. The researcher was disappointed and still could not understand why a thirty-year friendship would end up like this, with no commitment from either party to salvage it. She felt helpless in seeing her friendship with Ming fall apart. It almost felt as if her entire high school days were eradicated because of that. This may well be the helplessness experienced by Holly when she had to part with her more genuine friends in mainland China as she moved to Hong Kong with her family.

### 6.1.4 Respondent 4: Anita

Anita is a twenty-one-year-old final year student majoring in Business Administration in the YMCA College of Careers. Anita was born in Indonesia and she moved to Hong Kong when she was five. Anita is the only child to her Indonesian Chinese parents. However, her parents were both very poor, and they had to go to work every day, leaving no time to look after Anita. Because of that, Anita was 'given away' to her wealthy aunt (her father's younger sister) and uncle as a god daughter when she was a baby, so she literally grew up in her uncle and aunt's big house without seeing her biological parents much in her childhood. Throughout the years, Anita has built up a very strong and deep relationship with her adoptive parents. She still remembers how she looked at her Indonesian adoptive father every day in his office through the side stream and exhaled smoke from his cigarette, the aromatic tobacco smell from him, and how her adoptive mother bathed her every day until she was quite grown up, and the warmth and sense of security she had when she was held in her adoptive parents' arms. According to Anita, when she was five years old, she was suddenly taken away ('kidnapped') by her biological parents from her Indonesian adoptive parents, and the whole family moved to Hong Kong afterwards. Anita's father worked in a bank as an errand boy in Hong Kong, and he lost his job when Anita was in Primary 3. In her father's words, he was 'replaced by computers' and has been unemployed since then. Anita's mother is a masseur and a beautician, and she used to have a shop in a commercial building, but the government took the entire building back for redevelopment. Since then her mother has been running a private (illegal) facial parlour at home.

In Anita's recollection, she was not happy in her school days and did not have many friends. Most of her classmates were from rich families, so she felt very distant from them. She also attributed her lack of good friends to her parents' unwillingness to socialise with her classmates' families, especially in her primary school days.

Anita started smoking when she was in Form 3. At that time, she met a group of friends at school who taught her how to smoke and drink. She started skipping school and not going back home. She admitted that she has done a lot of things that broke her parents' hearts at that time. Cigarettes have the power to bring back fond memories of her childhood in Indonesia, when she was still the darling daughter of her Indonesian adoptive parents. Her Indonesian father smoked a kretek (clove) cigarette brand called Dji Sam Soe 234, which has a unique and aromatic smell. Until now, Anita still loves to light the same Dji Sam Soe 234 cigarette and let it burn, whenever she can get hold of one. She loves to smell the side stream smoke of the cigarette to remind her of the good old days she had with her adoptive father, those happy days when he held her in his arms loving her every day. The smell of the side stream smoke of Dji Sam Soe 234 cigarettes gives Anita a strong sense of security, especially the ones that produce a still and calm line of side stream smoke when burnt, which was just how it looked in her Indonesian father's office. The smoke also soothes Anita whenever she is unhappy. She was promised a shop from her rich adoptive Indonesian parents before, but they turned their back on Anita after the birth of their biological grandchildren a few years ago. Anita felt extremely hurt and disappointed, and she still does not understand why people would change so drastically and suddenly, and why her adoptive parents would turn their back on her so easily and quickly. Anita considered cigarettes to have an equal value with her friends, as they both give her a sense of security. However, the only difference is that, unlike friends who can leave Anita at any moment they wish, cigarettes will not leave her, and only she has the power to leave them. To Anita, a cigarette is a very good ice breaker with strangers, and it also has a dual function of providing relaxation and picking her up. The smoke produced by a cigarette is a carrier for bad stuff, and smoking is a distillation process to filter out the bad stuff through exhalation, leaving only the good stuff inside the body. Despite her fondness for smoking, she also regards the inhaled smoke as dangerous, and she stated explicitly that she does not want the inhaled smoke to have direct contact with her stomach, which is also why she would never smoke with an empty stomach, the latter reason being more psychological than physiological in meaning for her.

The single most important smoking moment for Anita is the highly personal 'decharge' moment for stress relief and achievement of inner balance: smoking during breaks is an enjoyment, as it helps her exhale all the fatigue and grudges from customers. Smoking also gives her time to think things over and through, especially when she is stressed. The recent ideal cigarette, she mentioned in the interview, was the one she smoked on the campus, a smoke that made her feel very relaxed after a stressful day at school. She loves to sniff the Dji Sam Soe 234 kretek cigarette for soothing purposes when she is unhappy, and she enjoys watching the burning cigarette producing a still and calm line of side stream white smoke, which reminds her of the good old days when she watched her Indonesian adoptive father smoking it in his office at home. Anita always smokes when she is unhappy; she sees the cigarette smoke as a way to remove all the bad stuff, leaving only the good stuff inside her, as all the bad stuff is extracted in the exhalation process. Closely linked to the 'de-charge' moment is the 'revive' smoking moment that Anita spoke of in the interviews, where the tobacco smell that stays in her hand after finishing each cigarette made her feel secured and restored. She also actively uses cigarettes in the 'time out' moment when she wants to have a short period of isolation from the world, like sitting on a massage chair relaxing completely, as she put it.

### 6.1.5 Respondent 5: Cooper

Cooper is a twenty-year-old Year 1 student majoring in Hotel Management in Compass College. Cooper grew up in a single-parent family. Her parents quarrelled all the time in her childhood and her father ran away after a row with her mother when she was in primary school, leaving her mother, her elder sister, and her living alone together. Cooper still remembers that the row was about her school textbook fee, so she has always felt extremely guilty of her parents' quarrel, believing she was the one who caused their separation. Her father went to Italy as an illegal worker after the separation, where he got caught by immigration and was sent back to Hong Kong for a while, and then he disappeared again. Her father never actively got in touch with the three of them, and sometimes he would just suddenly show up for a while and then disappear again. Cooper does not know where her father is, nor does she miss him, because she is very used to living with her mother and sister, just the three of them, without needing a father. In fact, she even mentioned explicitly that she prefers her father not to come back to their life anymore. The only thing she remembers of her father was that he beat her and her sister all the time for small things in the past, and there was a time when she was six or seven years old, when she tried to fight back but ended up being lifted up by the arm and beaten even harder and then thrown off by her father. He finally came to a stop when her mother came and rescued her. In Cooper's memory, her mother only beat her once, when she found out that she smoked. Other than that, one of the happiest moments in her life was when her mother brought her and her sister to Disneyland when she was twelve, and the three women had a lot of fun together. Cooper also enjoys spending time with her mother alone, without her sister. She recalled a time when she was the only one helping her mother deliver the goods to the shop, a task that her sister was too lazy to do, and Cooper enjoyed the vanity of being seen as the only useful and helpful darling daughter of her mother. Cooper's mother works in the Chinese medicine wholesaling business, but her income is very unstable. Cooper's elder sister is unemployed and relies on her boyfriend to support her financially. She behaves like a little princess at home and is highly addicted to costume play and TV games, she has been emotionally unstable since her father ran away and has a disposition to violence. For example, three years ago, when their mother refused to give her sister money since she herself also had no money, her sister lost her temper and started to smash and hit things at home, and she also physically attacked her mother, causing bleeding in her mother's mouth. When she was little, and the family still had a maid, there was also a time when her sister went out of control and pointed a knife at the maid who threw her boxes away by mistake. Cooper could not teach her how to behave during an argument and her mother did not want to make a big fuss about it, so they let go of the incident. Cooper works part-time in the finance industry while she's studying, so she is the only one supporting her family financially and she always feels pressured by this heavy burden on her shoulders. She does not like to stay home and prefers to hang out with friends, because her mother and sister always ask her for money whenever she is at home.

Cooper had a very unsteady and fragmented high school life. She was transferred from one school to another seven times during her high school years: after repeating Form 2 for three years, Cooper was finally expelled from her first high school when she was fifteen years old. After that, she just quit school and ran away from home to stay with her best friend who was also expelled from school at that time. During that one year away from home, she simply hung out and played with her friend every day, and she moved back home after one year when her friend lost a place to stay. After three years

of playing around and doing nothing, one day she suddenly realised that she did not want to follow her mother and elder sister's footsteps by quitting school in Form 2, so she decided to go back to an evening school for Form 3. After two months, she quit again and started working part-time in a bar. Then she met a friend who referred her to a high school, so she applied and went straight to Form 4 in that high school, and then she was transferred to a resident home to attend a special school for social development after being caught smoking in the campus. After spending half a year at that special school for social development, she was admitted back to the original high school for Form 4, and then she got transferred again to another high school for Form 5, and back to the original school again for Form 6. Because of her interrupted and sporadic high school life when she was a teenager, Cooper was not able to establish any stable and meaningful friendships with any of her classmates, and she feels that there is always a generation gap with them due to her older age and the working experience that her classmates lack.

Cooper started smoking when she was in Form 1 due to peer influence, but she only started to smoke more frequently after she was expelled from her high school in Form 2. During that period, she stayed with her friend and did not return home for almost a year. She spoke of the first smoke in the morning as the most satisfying cigarette of the whole day, a cigarette that she needs desperately to wake her up. To Cooper, smoking is like 'blowing out' all the bad emotions, it makes her feel that she is not alone; a cigarette is like 'food for her mind', it is an object that will never disappoint or abandon her, both in happy and difficult times. She never finishes smoking the entire cigarette when she is happy; she enjoys lighting one cigarette after the other, and she only smokes half of each cigarette and stubs it out and lights another. This action of lighting and stubbing out one cigarette after the other makes her feel strangely satisfied. On the

contrary, she will definitely smoke out the entire cigarette when she is not happy, a behaviour that she is aware of but never understands. Cooper regards the cigarette's role as similar to that of her mother, someone who is always there with her when she needs her but forgotten easily when she has other temptations or friends around. Related to this mothering role of the cigarette, she also finds the cigarette smoke to be a very good protection against the external environment, as she used the cigarette smoke as a protective shield against her boyfriend when they quarrelled: she chainsmoked and kept blowing out the smoke, so he could not get near her. Cooper is very afraid of other people's criticising looks and judgements when she smokes; her fear of the judging eyes or attracting any kind of attention is so overwhelming that she does not even dare to call out to stop a minibus. She feels that her voice is strange and a bit hoarse, and she admitted that she lacks confidence to listen to her own recorded voice, and it remains unknown whether this belief has anything to do with her parents' incessant quarrelling in her childhood. Overall, she has no trust of minibus drivers stopping the bus upon her calling out, so she always waits for the others to call out for the minibus to stop, so sometimes she ends up walking for hours back home if nobody calls out to stop it! Cooper always has a nauseous feeling when she smokes, but instead of hating it, she loves the sensation of taking out something from her mouth. That is also one of the reasons why she loves to smoke cigarettes, in order for her to have that nauseous sensation. At the end of the second interview, she revealed to the researcher that she always gets oesophageal bleeding resulting from frequent self-induced vomiting.

Cooper smokes mainly to 'de-charge', especially in emotionally difficult moments: she has a habit of chain-smoking whenever she is unhappy, e.g. when she broke up with her boyfriend. Smoking cigarettes makes her feel that she is capable of blowing out all

the bad emotions, so she does not have to think about them anymore, and she is not

alone anymore because her cigarette is her companion, a companion who will always

be there for her. She also chain-smokes when she is happy. She feels like doing

something with her hand, so she just lights one cigarette after another without smoking

the entire cigarette. Cooper went for a smoke immediately after a chaotic presentation,

and that cigarette was regarded by her as her favourite cigarette of the day, as she felt

extremely relieved after the smoke, as if nothing concerned her anymore and she could

finally have a moment to calm down and restore her inner balance. Another important

moment for smoking is the 'time out' moment, where Cooper intentionally used the

blown-out smoke from her cigarette to form a smoke screen, in order to shield herself

from her boyfriend when she had a fight with him.

A note on the researcher's subjective emotional experience after the interviews with

Cooper: compared to other respondents, it took much longer for Cooper to warm up to

the interviewer. She was reserved and spoke very little at the beginning. As rapport

developed during the interview, there was a dramatic change in behaviour and she did

not seem to want to leave even after the researcher indicated repeatedly that the

interview was over. Cooper stayed on for another 25 minutes eventually. After the first

interview, the researcher felt unusually hungry and she ate a lot at dinner afterwards.

This was very out of character for the researcher as she normally skips dinner. She

wonders if it has anything to do with Cooper's revelation that she experiences

oesophageal bleeding due to frequent self-induced vomiting. Perhaps this reflects an

unconscious wish for Cooper to stop vomiting and start taking in more nourishment.

6.1.6 Respondent 6: Emerald

Emerald is a twenty-three-year-old recent graduate from Hang Sang Management College majoring in Commercial Translation. She used to live in Kuala Lumpur and only came to Hong Kong for university studies four years ago when she was nineteen.

Her parents were separated when she was three years old, and her mother got the custody of Emerald and her elder sister who is two years older than her. Despite fighting hard for her custody, her mother was very career minded and she preferred to hang out with her friends rather than looking after her children at home. Out of convenience and personal comfort, she sent Emerald and her sister to Kuala Lumpur to live with their grannies, but in Emerald's words, her mother 'dumped' them and left them with their grannies. Emerald felt that her mother did not really care much about her and her sister, as evident in the careless and sloppy way she took care of her two daughters. On the contrary, Emerald felt that they were treated very well by their grannies and all their relatives in Kuala Lumpur. Her mother rarely visited them in Kuala Lumpur; at most she would just make long distance calls to chat with the sisters for a while whenever she felt like it. In order to make up for the lost bonding time, starting from the age of seven or eight years old, Emerald and her sister would normally go back to Hong Kong for a month at the end of every year to visit their mother. There is a lack of emotional closeness and attachment between Emerald and her mother, as Emerald believes that her mother was very irresponsible for dumping her and her sister in Kuala Lumpur. When she was thirteen years old, she even told her mother straight to her face, in a very calm manner, that it would be impossible for her to compensate for the horrible things she did to her daughters years ago, and that she has no feelings for her mother, even though she would still provide for her mother when she gets old; but she will not love her, because her mother simply asked for it herself. Her mother used to live with a boyfriend in Hong Kong, and Emerald revealed to the researcher

that she was sexually abused by this man when she was fifteen years old during the summer holidays when she came to Hong Kong to stay with her mother. After a few years, when Emerald moved back to Hong Kong for good, she kicked this man out of their home by changing the door locks while her mother was out of town, and she helped her mother to divorce this man. Emerald has never been close to her father, nor her father's family in Hong Kong.

Emerald smoked her first cigarette when she was sixteen years old under the influence of a friend she met via Facebook, but she stopped smoking after that first stick because she felt she was despised by a mother and her baby on the street when she smoked. When she was eighteen, she broke up with her boyfriend, and she started to work parttime in a bar where everybody smoked, so she picked up smoking again. To Emerald, cigarettes can take her to a world where she can rest and enjoy a brief moment of quietness and peace. A cigarette is most important to her when she is unhappy. It calms her down when she is angry, and it stops her from venting her anger at other people, therefore a cigarette is a medium for stress absorption and it has a cushioning and stress relief function for her. At the end of the second interview, Emerald revealed to the researcher that the friend who gave her the first cigarette was actually a tomboy in love with her at that time, and she associates smoking with romantic love instead of friendship, because a cigarette is seen as a substitute for her lover who is willing to spend time with her and console her sadness at times. A cigarette is also compliant and available, allowing Emerald to use it any time, like her own mother who let her do whatever she wanted. She smokes less these days since she started practicing yoga a year and a half ago, and in fact at the time of the interview, she was about to get her yoga instructor licence.

Emerald spoke of her most satisfying cigarette as the one she smoked a day before the interview, when she knew she had passed her motor vehicle written exam, and after she had sent her aunt off at the airport (she was not able to smoke freely when her aunt visited her the past few days because she did not want her aunt to know that she smokes). The smoke was extremely comfortable and relaxing, almost like the sensation of stretching after a yoga practice. This is what smoking can do to Emerald: transport her to a world with short moments of quietness and peace, a world where she can finally take a rest. Emerald had the most disappointing cigarette just before the interview. When she was standing beside a rubbish bin on the street to get a quick smoke before she came up to the interview room, she felt that she was being stared at by those lower class and blue collar people on the street, and she was also preoccupied with being caught by the police when she threw the cigarette butt on the ground, so she just quickly dragged a few puffs, dumped the cigarette and left quickly.

The two most important smoking moments for Emerald are the 'time out' and 'decharge' moments. Her 'time out' moments include sitting alone in an outdoor café, smoking a cigarette while observing passers-by on the street. She uses this brief smoking moment to pull herself out of reality and assume the role of a bystander, so she can steal a short moment of rest in a place where she can enjoy quietness and peace. She also likes to stand still when she smokes on the street in order to better isolate herself from reality, so that she can see people and things more clearly. When she was on a trip to Thailand with her friends, she stole a private moment to smoke alone after her swim, away from her noisy non-smoker travel companion, where she enjoyed the space, the peace and the quietness, and she was grateful that there was nobody there to disturb her, finally. When Emerald had a fight with her boyfriend, she kept smoking and blowing out cigarette smoke in order to create a shield and a moment of calmness

for herself, and when she broke up with her boyfriend, she cried and chain-smoked for hours. Cigarettes gave her a space to be alone by herself, so she could contemplate. In her 'de-charge' moments, she smoked her ideal cigarette right after sending her aunt to the airport and finishing the driving license written exam. She felt very relieved and comfortable when smoking that ideal cigarette, almost like stretching at the end of each yoga practice. To Emerald, a cigarette is a soother and a buffer that has a cushioning and stress relief function when she is very unhappy and angry. It helps her absorb her tantrums and stops her from taking it out on others, and she uses cigarettes to transform her anger and sorrow into calmness when she has just had a fight with her boyfriend or she has been rejected by someone who she likes.

## 6.1.7 Respondent 7: Abyss

Abyss is a twenty-one-year-old Year 1 student majoring in Image Design at the Technological and Higher Education Institute of Hong Kong. When Abyss was born, the doctor suspected that he had Down's syndrome because he displayed some of the symptoms. He also had a low birth weight, and therefore was put into the incubator for a period of time before being released from the hospital. Abyss was told by his granny that at that time, his mother's sister came to the hospital and said to the whole world that baby Abyss was an oaf because his palm lines were broken off! Abyss still hates his aunt for that still.

Abyss's parents were separated when he was three and were divorced when he was six. Since then, Abyss had been living with his granny and father in Hong Kong. He has a very bad relationship with his mother, actually detesting her, so he never spent time with her and only saw her when she 'sometimes dropped by for free meals.' Besides,

Abyss also remembered very well that when he was two to three years old, his mother gave him a big slap on his face when he was caught using bad language on a school bus by the driver. He only started to live with his mother unwillingly after he moved back to Hong Kong from the China boarding school in order to continue with his university studies a few years ago, since his father had already re-married and moved to China. Despite being beaten brutally as a kid every time his father got home drunk in the middle of the night, around 2 am to 3 am in the morning, or when he was kicked out of kindergarten when he was six years old and out of high school, Abyss still admires his father, saying that he is the most talented designer in the world, and he proudly told the researcher that his father is the Design Director of Disneyland in Shanghai.

Abyss was kicked out of school for the second time when he was in Form 4 at the age of fifteen, after being caught smoking on campus a few times and taking almost half his class to an illegal rave party he organised. After he was expelled from school, he worked as a full-time party organiser, with his income based on the total number of invited people who show up in the parties. He managed to earn a lot of money at that time, sometimes up to more than HK\$100,000 per month, as a result of his good connections and the number of people he knows who are willing to come to these parties. However, he decided to leave the industry after two years as law enforcement by the police started to tighten, leaving no room for him to organise big scale parties which often exceeded the maximum number of people allowed by the Fire Safety Ordinance in Hong Kong. He was then sent to a boarding school in China by his father. However, he did not like China and he felt very stressed studying there due to the cultural differences between him and his classmates. Abyss ended up burning himself

out after two years, so he was sent back to Hong Kong to continue with his tertiary education.

Abyss had his first cigarette when he was fifteen years old under the influence of a group of westerner boys and American Chinese classmates that he hung out with in an international school, and he coughed badly and did not like it the first time. However, he accepted the cigarette the second time he was offered it in order not to feel excluded and he wanted desperately to fit in to their circle. All of his friends smoked and there was not much he could do while they were smoking. From then onwards, he became 'severely addicted' to smoking, as he put it himself, and he grinds his teeth if there is no cigarette, or when he has no money to buy cigarettes. He has a strong desire to smoke, a desire that is similar to an insatiable hunger and can never be satisfied no matter how much he smokes.

Abyss thinks the first cigarette in the morning is always the most satisfying smoke, and he is very obsessed with getting a cigarette first thing in the morning with an empty stomach. To him, cigarettes are like his mental food, and he would go a long way to ensure that he has his morning smoke. He likes to chain smoke and thinks that smoking magnifies his emotions and feelings and makes him feel even happier when he is happy, and sadder when he is upset.

There are two smoking moments when Abyss indulges in chain-smoking, the 'time out' and the 'de-charge' moments. Abyss will chain-smoke when he wants to get into thinking mode, and the cigarette helps him enter this 'thinking world', while observing outside reality at the same time. When his brain is at war and stuffed with many chaotic things, smoking helps him isolate himself from this insecure world immediately, pretty

much like finding a hole to wiggle in, or going under his blanket to isolate himself from the outside world. In the 'de-charge' moment, cigarettes play a significant role when he is anxious and unhappy: he chain-smokes when he is not happy, and holding a cigarette makes him feel more secure and calm. Cigarettes also help contain his anxieties and soothe him when he feels apprehensive, e.g. when he was trying to borrow money from his friends to pay off his credit card bill.

A note on the researcher's subjective emotional experience after the interviews with Abyss: despite his problematic childhood when his parents started having marital problems when he was three, and officially separated two years later, Abyss is a very mature and charming boy. He is someone that any company would want to recruit as a brand ambassador. He talked in a confident and charismatic way. The researcher wondered how a boy with such a traumatic childhood could become a person like he is today. Is the real Abyss hidden under a mask? The researcher had a dream after the first interview: a zombie was with the researcher's mother on the other side of a door. The researcher was desperate to feed her mother, so she negotiated with the zombie and asked him to feed her mother on her behalf. The zombie agreed but the researcher was still very scared of the zombie. Does the zombie represent a part of Abyss? Is Abyss conflicted between feeding and killing her mother?

## 6.1.8 Participant 8: Samuel

Samuel is a twenty-one-year-old final year student majoring in Business Studies at the Hong Kong University: School of Professional and Continuing Education. Samuel was nursed by his granny since childhood, because both his parents had to work and therefore had no time to look after him. Samuel was always sent to China during the

summer holidays with his granny, so he was well taught by his mother how to take long-haul buses, and how to take care of his illiterate granny when he was merely six years old. His mother started her own business as the owner of a cleaning company when Samuel was in Primary 5 aged eleven, and she started to come home later and later every night because of work. Samuel's parents got divorced in the same year, and he had some memories of his parents fighting with each other and his mother crying frequently, but they are quite blurry as he was very little when that happened. After the divorce, Samuel chose to stay with his mother and moved out to a new apartment, as his mother managed to save enough to buy her own apartment. At that time, he did not understand what a divorce meant, and he just thought that his parents lived in different places and it was no big deal to him. In fact, he even felt happy as he could play TV games at his mother's place, and football at his father's place. When he entered Form 1, Samuel started to notice the difference between him and his classmates and wondered why his classmates lived with both their parents at home. He sought counsel from his class teacher, and he finally got to know what divorce was all about: that when two people stop loving each other, they would be better off separating from each other.

Samuel was a very active boy and he played a lot of sports including basketball, football, and volleyball on the school teams in his high school days. Samuel injured his knees in Form 3, a year when he had to sit for the open examination. Knowing that being a professional athlete in Hong Kong cannot make ends meet, he let go of his dream to be a professional athlete, took the advice from his family, and gave up all sports after his major injury when he was in Form 3. Now he only plays football occasionally.

Samuel started smoking in Form 2, when he was offered a cigarette by his classmate three times, and he finally accepted the cigarette the third time. At first, he only smoked after his training sessions, perhaps a few sticks a month, as he was afraid that his mother would find out about him smoking. He started to smoke more frequently when he started working part-time in Form 4. For Samuel, smoking makes him feel soothed and satisfied, and sleepy at times, similar to the sensation after a full and satisfying meal. Cigarettes give him a momentary feeling of extreme satisfaction without all the discomforts. This smoking moment belongs to Samuel completely; time would suddenly stop, the world would also disappear when he smoked, and the cigarette becomes an ideal companion that makes this quiet and ideal world perfect for him, so in a way, smoking is very much like sleeping to Samuel. Samuel also associated smoking out a cigarette with finishing a task and accomplishing something. A cigarette is similar to a human who is willing to give a helping hand to him, he does not like to waste a cigarette, and he would rather miss the bus and wait for another one than stub out a half-finished cigarette.

He likes the softness of the cigarette, and he always smokes after a full meal, and ensures that he smokes very slowly to savour the lingering sensation. Samuel spoke of his most enjoyable smoke as the one when he was on holiday in Japan with his friends, when they loitered on the balcony watching the sunset facing the ocean, as smoking while watching the open sea always gives him a heightened sense of relaxation and enjoyment.

Two most prominent smoking moments for Samuel are the 'time out' and 'de-charge' moments. In the 'time out' moments, Samuel loves to smoke alone at home quietly, doing nothing, and thinking of nothing. Time seems to stop, and that moment belongs

to him completely, and a cigarette makes the world complete to him in that special space. Samuel managed to steal a chance to smoke when he was hanging out with his non-smoker girlfriend in Stanley Market. During those few minutes, he sat by the seaside watching the sunset alone; it was a very surreal and yet enjoyable experience, and he felt very content in those few minutes and the world looked perfect to him. In Samuel's 'de-charge' moments, a cigarette soothes him when he gets stressed out, so he always uses cigarettes to de-stress. He usually smokes for relaxation purposes after he gets through a journey, or when he has finished writing an important paper for school. When he gets agitated and annoyed, he uses cigarettes to calm him down, and he always smokes during school recess to feel recharged and restored.

A note on the researcher's subjective emotional experience after the interviews with Samuel: the researcher felt unusually tired during the entire interview with Samuel. Her eyelids were so heavy that they almost closed. For a few moments, the researcher felt that her mind was wandering, and she almost fell asleep in the interview! This made the researcher wonder if it was Samuel's way of telling her how sleepy and relaxed he felt when he smoked his cigarettes.

# 6.2 Identifying the 'regressive' smoking moments

The commercial research conducted by the tobacco industry is based on a conscious level of processing, therefore it is of limited use to this thesis. However, what is worth pointing out is that out of the eight smoking moments, only two of them are related to the social moments of smoking, the remaining six are all related to the personal moments of smoking, and amongst these six personal moments, there are two moments where tobacco usage is the 'core agent' driving the smokers' behaviors, where they

have a high engagement level with their cigarettes: these are the 'me-time' and the 'relax' moments. What is interesting to note is that these two moments account for a lion's share of 30% to 50% respectively of all the smoking moments globally, indicating the importance and prevalence of these two highly personal moments of cigarette consumption. Both of these two personal moments involve a temporary detachment from external reality and a fluid movement between internal and external reality, two important characteristics that have been completely ignored by commercial research in the tobacco industry, whose focus is more on the extraction of insight based on a conscious level of functioning. These distinctive and unique 'regressive' characteristics of the 'me-time' and 'relax' moments reveal a whole new world of meanings from a psychoanalytic perspective.

There are many triggers and moments for smoking, but not all are regressive moments in which smokers display an increased level of regressive behaviour or feel these to be very special moments. Our objective is to identify the smoking moments that are 'regressive' in nature, moments that move away from mature to more primitive levels of functioning, moments that are characterised by the infantile merged state and the concreteness of the smokers' thinking and behaviours, and moments that move away from the reality principle towards the pleasure principle. The above three criteria will help us separate the 'regressive' smoking moments that are highly personal, from the 'non-regressive' smoking moments which are mainly the social aspect of smoking and other low involvement forms of the personal aspect of smoking. We are not claiming that a cigarette is a regressed form of transitional object in moments of social aspects which are 'non-regressive' in nature. In fact, what we are interested in is how a cigarette becomes a regressed form of an infantile transitional object in the 'regressive' smoking moments that are highly personal in nature. Since this thesis is about Winnicott's

transitional object aspect of cigarettes, our focus will be on these very personal and 'regressive' moments of cigarette consumption that are characterised by:

- 1. Regression to dependence, to moments of infantile merging with the mother, and to moments of merging between the infant's lips and the mother's nipples, so that the smoker can re-experience the illusion of omnipotence. This is physically reinforced by the perceived merging between the smokers' lips and the filter of the cigarette when he smokes the cigarette. This sense of magical merging is further strengthened by the convenience of smoking, as the cigarettes are always in the smoker's pocket, and he just needs to reach out almost effortlessly and the cigarettes would miraculously appear, just like magic. This is also the moment where the smokers move from a reality principle to a pleasure principle.
- 2. A very **concrete relationship** between the smoker and his cigarettes, resembling an early stage of infantile relationship. This is the moment when the smoker interacts with the cigarettes in a very physical and bodily manner, which is different from an ordinary relationship with other people where facial expressions and words are used, rather than more tactile ones.
- 3. A fluid sort of regression, which means that the regressive moments kick in immediately whenever the smokers experience stressful feelings, so the cigarette consumption is closely connected with the emotional state of the smoker. What is important here is the speed and the magical appearance of the cigarette whenever it is needed, which is strengthened by the physical convenience of carrying a pack of cigarettes in the smoker's pocket at all times;

this is very similar to the magical appearance of the transitional object in the infant's world.

A comparison of the themes of the respondents' smoking moments with the tobacco industry's 'smoking moments' research suggests that out of the six highly personal smoking moments, two moments emerged consistently across all the eight respondents (see Table 3), which are as follows:

- 1. The 'time out' sub-type under the 'me time' moment where the respondents have a short period of isolation from the outside world, a short moment where they can be out of reach from overstimulation and free to be themselves.
- 2. The 'de-charge' sub-type under the 'relax' moment, where the respondents can enjoy a short duration of stress relief and inner balance restoration, a moment where they can calm themselves down from over-stimulation and feel soothed and back in control again.

All of the eight smoking moments described in the literature review chapter do contain signs of infantile merging with the mother and a concrete relationship between the smoker and his cigarettes, both of which are mainly driven by how cigarettes are physically consumed, i.e. a merging of the smoker's lips and the filter of the cigarette and a merging of the smoke with the smokers' body through inhalation and exhalation of the smoke, and a type of interaction that is highly tactile, physical, and bodily. However, only the 'time out' and 'de-charge' moments involve a fluid sort of regression and movements between internal and external realities triggered by stressful feelings of the smokers. This is an interesting piece of revelation that may not be of any interest to the tobacco industry, but it could contain important information and

insight on the understanding of smoking addiction from a psychoanalytic perspective, especially when it comes to understanding the special qualities of these two personal moments of smoking and why they are different from the rest of the other six major smoking moments. All of this requires further studies which are outside the scope of the current thesis. As was mentioned in the earlier chapter, the tobacco industry research on smoking behaviours and motivations are of limited use to us in this thesis, because all of the extracted insights focus on the conscious level of operation. The reason we made reference to it is to provide a framework of describing the different smoking moments of the respondents and their relationships with their cigarettes and smoking.

Smoking is an irrational behavior, but smokers still continue to smoke despite consciously knowing the dangerous nature of cigarettes. From the above observations and analysis, we know that smoking is not just about peer influence or social pressure, but something very personal about the relationship between the smoker and the cigarette that goes beyond social pressure. Smoking is an intense and intimate experience between the smoker and their cigarettes. The fact that smokers continue to smoke despite knowing that cigarettes will kill them suggests that there must be unconscious forces behind the addiction, and this is where our research interest lies: to understand the unconscious forces behind smoking addiction. Winnicott stated that 'in psychotherapy: addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged' (1953, p. 97). Therefore, according to Winnicott, cigarette addiction is a pathological phenomenon, a regression that happens in adulthood when the transitional object usually fades away after twelve months. The persistence of the transitional object into adulthood in a regressed form is due to the personality still needing a transitional object even in adulthood. In the following

paragraphs, we will move on to look at how Winnicott's model of the 'transitional object' and 'transitional phenomena' can help account for the unconscious motivations to perpetuate smoking addiction, which is the main area of interest in this thesis.

	PERSONAL MOMENTS											SOCIAL MOMENTS		
	CONNECTION WITH SELF			SELF BALANCE			PERFORMANCE				CONNECTION WITH OTHERS			
#	1a	1b		2a	2b		3a		3b		4a		4b	
Moments	Pass the time	Me time		Self-reward	Relax		Focus / problem solver		Boost / start up		Projection of self		Socialise	
Core needs	Occupy empty moments	Time on my own		Indulge myself	Rebalancing myself		Concentrating and thought process		Manage performance and energy levels		Control what others see of me		Bond and share	
Types	Pass the time	Time to be myself	Time out	Self-reward	Decharge	Revive	Focus	Problem solver	Boost	Start up	Impress	Blend in	Socialise	
Hank			2	1	4						1	1	4	
Anthony	1		2	1	2							1	2	
Holly	1		1	1	1	1			1			3	1	
Anita	1		1		5	2	1		1			1	1	
Cooper	1		1	2	3					1		1	1	
Emerald			5		3	1	1		1			1	2	
Abyss	1		2	1	2	1		1		1	1	1	1	
Samuel			2	2	4		1		1			3	1	

Table 3: Summary of respondents' smoking moments

Note: The numbers in the matrix indicate the number of occurrences of these smoking moments in the interviews.

# 6.3 Resemblance of a cigarette to the qualities of Winnicott's transitional object

A typical transitional object is a soft object within easy reach of the baby, usually part of a blanket, sheet, or other soft materials used by the mother for the baby. The transitional object serves oral erotism. This can be clearly seen in Cooper's interview when she said that a cigarette is an object that will never disappoint or abandon her, both in happy moments and sad moments, a cigarette is like food to her mind and feeding the needs of her mind.

'... (a cigarette) keeps me company when I am alone. It helps me when I am unhappy, happy, or when I've had a full meal. It's around all these times, it helps me whenever I need it... happy and unhappy, I will smoke, I will keep smoking. Its role is to stand by me whenever I have quarrels with my folks, break up with my boyfriend, or go out drinking with my colleagues, all these occasions it is always next to me... it is food to my mind... it is feeding the needs of my mind.'

(Cooper, second interview)

In a certain way, the transitional object represents the mother. This was vividly demonstrated by Emerald when she equated a cigarette with a friend who let her use it, very much like her own mother, a mother whom she is very afraid of being too dependent on:

'... a cigarette is like a friend who always sits beside me, it won't talk to me, but it lets me use it and helps me relax. I also feel that it's quite mighty, it won't talk back, and it won't criticise me, but it would let me... I mean it devotes its whole life to me, lets me burn it all to ashes, in that sense it is really quite mighty...'

'... I was scared of it when I used to smoke too much... it's the fear that I would become ... I mean more and more dependent on it in the long run! Because when I light my cigarette by myself, it would sit beside me, I feel comfortable when it sits beside me when I am unhappy, but I don't want to be dependent on it! I don't want to be always detached from the reality and indulge in smoking everyday... I have to control myself, like using external measures such as not buying it, or not putting it in my pocket. And you can't ask for too many puffs from your friends' cigarettes, I will feel embarrassed. That's why I have to use this kind of external measures to reduce the dependence.'

(Emerald, second interview)

The transitional object is something that is 'created' by the baby between four to twelve months of age. It must be perceived by the baby as its own creation and cannot be given to it by the mother directly, even though in reality it is indirectly given by the mother. When the baby is able to walk, it insists on taking it everywhere. The object retains the smell of the baby and the mother and it cannot be washed, and the baby would be in extreme distress if the object is misplaced, taken away, or lost. The baby becomes attached to the transitional object, and it is demanded when the baby is about to go to sleep or at times of stress, in which the object is pressed against the baby's face and lips or is sucked. From waking to sleeping, the infant jumps from an objectively perceived world to a subjectively apperceived and self-created world. In between these

two worlds there is a neutral territory in which all kinds of transitional phenomena happen. The infant uses the transitional object to bridge these two states, which explains why there is a strong need of the transitional object particularly at the time of going to sleep, when the infant is living in this intermediate area. This can be seen in Samuel's remarks on how a cigarette made him feel in the second interview. Samuel compared cigarettes with alcohol and said that cigarettes made him feel soft and peaceful, unlike alcohol which is heroic and masculine, the cigarette is the quiet type:

'... it (a cigarette) is kind of soft, a cigarette makes me feel soft, gives me a sense of peacefulness, it belongs to the quiet type... liquor, on the contrary, is very masculine and heroic. The ambiance I like is the quiet type, so I need something soft to go with me, then I will feel satisfied...'

(Samuel, second interview)

"... when you get to a place which is quiet, like the seaside, or the peak, the country park, you feel so relaxed, so comfy, the whole body is unwounded, then you will get that "the world has stopped" feeling when you smoke."

(Samuel, second interview)

When asked about what else would make him feel as relaxed as smoking a cigarette, Samuel immediately replied that it is sleeping!

In his landmark paper, Winnicott has outlined seven special qualities in the relationship between the infant and the transitional object, which includes the infant assuming rights over the object; the object being affectionately loved as well as excitedly hated; the absolute unchangeable nature of the object unless it is changed by the infant; the survival of the object after instinctual loving and destruction; the object being perceived by the infant as having a life of its own; the location of the object being in an intermediate space between the internal and external reality; and its fate to lose meaning and its importance over time as the infant grows up.

- 1. The infant assumes rights over the object...
- 2. The object is affectionately cuddled as well as excitedly loved and mutilated.
- 3. It must never be changed, unless changed by the infant.
- 4. It must survive instinctual loving, and also hating...
- 5. Yet it must seem to the infant to give warmth, or to move, or to have texture, or to do something that seems to show it has vitality or reality of its own.
- 6. It comes from without from our point of view, but not so from the point of view of the baby. Neither does it come from within...
- 7. Its fate is to be gradually allowed to be decathected, so that in the course of years it becomes not so much forgotten as relegated to limbo...

Winnicott (1953, p.91)

This is a thesis looking at the explanatory values of Winnicott's transitional object as a concept to explain smoking addiction. If a cigarette is treated by the smoker as a regressed form of an infantile transitional object that extends into adulthood, then the relationship between the cigarette and the smoker should reflect some of the above special qualities as described by Winnicott. This thesis used the FANI method to identify the defended smoking moments from the interviews of the eight respondents, followed by the use of Winnicott's seven criteria to find specific instances of cigarettes assuming the role of regressed transitional objects. A careful examination of the defended smoking moments in the interviews suggests that all these seven

characteristics of transitional objects mentioned by Winnicott can be found in the interviews.

Before proceeding with summarising the results, we will be reviewing one full transcript in its original order from Holly to show the nature of the FANI interviews, and to demonstrate how the three key psychoanalytic elements (the unconscious, transference, and countertransference) unfold. Potential interviewer bias may also be indicated. We will be telling the story of Holly as it happened in the right order of the interviews, and selecting from it points of significance as we progress.

## 6.3.1 Holly's full transcript

Holly started off with an introduction of herself as a new immigrant from mainland China, a secret that she has been trying to keep from her classmates in Hong Kong. She fears that she would be discriminated against and looked down upon. Her father is a cross-border truck driver and her mother used to be a full-time house-wife before moving to Hong Kong. The interviewer was taken by surprise by the brave and honest admission of Holly about her being a mainland immigrant at the onset of the interview. It is a fact that mainland immigrants are sometimes discriminated against by local Hong Kong people because China is perceived to be a less developed place. The interviewer could resonate with the struggle that Holly is experiencing because she was also a mainland immigrant.

A = Alice, the interviewer

H = Holly, the interviewee

- Hi, nice to meet you. Let me introduce myself. I graduated from the Chinese University of Hong Kong, majoring in Business Administration, back in 1992. I am working full time in the marketing field now. I am currently doing a PhD part time degree in psychoanalysis at the University of Essex in England, and I have recruited a few students like you to help me with my thesis, which is related to the embodied smoking experiences and its related feelings. In this interview, I hope to understand not only your smoking experiences, but also your story. Just say whatever that comes to your mind, there is no right or wrong answer.
- My name is H and I am studying at Hang Seng Management College. But I am older than other students. I am twenty. Because I was a new immigrant from Dong Guan, China, I repeated a year when I came to Hong Kong for primary school. When I was in high school, because... eh... there were many things. It was due to my conduct and grades, and then when I got to Form 5, I felt that I wasn't ready for the DSE (Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education) exams. So I chose to repeat another year. That's why I am two years older than my classmates.
- A I see...
- Yeah, because my dad is a Hong Kong-China cross border truck driver, so he spent most of his time in mainland China. In mainland China, people led a slower-paced lifestyle, and so did my parents. This is only my guess ... if it was not because of my studies, I don't think they would come back here (Hong Kong). But then, yeah, I had always been living with my mum because sometimes dad had to do night shifts, so he might not be home one day a week... I used to have many friends in that housing complex ... those childhood friends who grew up with me. But all of them have moved to Hong Kong, so I don't really know anyone there anymore. I rarely contact them nowadays. We used to live in the same housing

complex, but now that we've all moved to Hong Kong... eh... many of them live in different districts, and all of them live very far... Therefore I rarely contact them... I played with my primary classmates in Hong Kong when I was in primary school. Right, I didn't contact any mainland Chinese friends at that time, and I only played with my classmates in the primary school, my newly met friends.

Holly went on to describe her first smoking experience when she was twelve years old, under the influence of a group of friends she met through an online game community.

- A Ok, H, now can you tell me something about when and how you started smoking?
- H Smoking... I think when I was in Form 1 or 2, after I came to Hong Kong. At that time... I was really naughty, and I was naughty when I was in high school. Then I got interested in playing online games, and there was a very popular game, for some unknown reason. It was like a... eh... the game was meant to be a game but everybody used it for social networking purposes. So, it became almost like a social networking site!
- A Can you tell me more about that?
- H It's an online music game called 'Audition'. I prefer music games and it so happened that Audition is a music game, so I started playing it back then. But the nature of the game is very unusual. You get to know many different people in that game. I mean, you don't just play the game, yeah, it's really strange. And you won't play the game with your friends only. You get to know different people, and many of them would actually go out and meet each other.
- A Huh.

- H So I met some friends who were in the game, through chatting when we were playing the game. I lived in Tai Wai back then, and one person also lived in the same estate in Tai Wai. What a coincidence!
- A Ah.
- H So, we just hung out together and he asked me to play ball games with him. I lived in Sheung Shui when I first arrived in Hong Kong, so my high school was in Fan Ling. After a while, we got into public housing and moved to Tai Wai, but it was too late to switch to another high school.
- A Ah.
- H That's why I have no friends in Tai Wai.
- A Ah.
- And then all my classmates were in Fan Ling, so I was quite happy to have met some friends from Tai Wai. Often, we went down (to the playground) to play, so we basically grew up together in the same estate. They also brought their own childhood friends to play with us, and we played ball games together. That was how I managed to meet other friends. None of my friends smoked; they only went to school... but their childhood friends didn't go to school and they smoked. Then I started hanging out and playing with them, and then I saw that all of them were smoking. Then I felt ... I don't know ... I felt like I was rejected by them, and it felt strange. I mean, all of them smoked, and I was the only one who didn't smoke, so I felt very strange. So, I bought a pack of cigarettes to try. I just bought it quietly by myself, and then I tried one. But you know, I didn't really know anything. I don't remember exactly what brand I bought...I think it was Marlboro Red. Most people smoked Marlboro Red on TV, so I bought a pack of Marlboro Red. And then after I drew in the first whiff of smoke ... I didn't know how to draw the smoke

into my lungs at that time, so I just drew in and then expelled it immediately. I still felt that it was very irritating. I mean, the stink hit me really badly. So I wondered why they liked smoking so much, and then I felt that I was really strange because I was the only one who didn't smoke amongst all my smoker friends. It felt really weird. Afterwards I started to pay more attention to the brands they smoked. It was very fashionable to smoke green Lucky back then.

- A I see...
- H So I went and bought a pack of green Lucky. At first, I didn't know how to drag, and then there was one time when I was talking to someone on the phone... I didn't know how to draw the smoke into my lungs the first few times, and then I tried to smoke a few puffs, and all of a sudden I drew a deep breath into my lungs, and then the smoke went inside. I mean, it was dragged inside, and I felt a bit dizzy afterwards. Then I thought, well, maybe this is what smoking is supposed to be like! And then I continued to smoke, and have been smoking like that since then, yeah.
- A So you don't smoke because of that dizzy feeling?
- Not at all! Hmm... in fact not many people smoke because of that feeling. That was just how I felt. One time I was with my friends and they had cigars. Well, I didn't know that you are not supposed to draw in the cigar smoke into your lungs! I smoked regularly at that time, so when I saw that cigar I just drew the smoke into my lungs as I would with cigarette smoke, and oh my goodness! I was so dizzy ... it was beyond words! And then I realised that you are not supposed to draw in the cigar smoke into your lungs. I would have that same feeling when I smoke those strong tasting cigarettes!
- A Do you still smoke cigars now?

What? Of course not! I did that just for fun at that time because my friend smoked it. He was from a rich family and said that his family got some gifts which were those very thick and fine cigars. Then he cut it ... I can't remember how he did it, but he just divided the cigar and let us try. So I only wanted to try it. I won't smoke it anymore, the smoke is very stinky!

As Holly described her first smoke, she mentioned for the first time how she became dependent on cigarettes after she had learnt how to draw in the smoke properly.

- A Can you tell me more about that feeling of your first smoke?
- I coughed! And then I blew the smoke out immediately, but then it was really interesting to me! Why was it like that? I hadn't experienced anything like that before! And I realised what it felt like to draw in smoke, so I tried again. And then I realised that was how smoking was supposed to be, so... eh... but I felt that it was ok ... I could take it ... it would be ok ... and then I just continued to smoke.
- A Do you still feel dizzy when you smoke?
- H Not anymore. It was only the first time, and I have also tried different brands of cigarettes. There was a period when I wanted to quit. It was when I felt I had to repeat a year before taking the DSE (Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education) ... when I felt that I wasn't ready. So, I decided to repeat one year. And in that year, none of my classmates smoked. I mean my classmates in the same year smoked but not those in the class I was repeating. They were good students and they didn't smoke. So I thought about quitting at that time, and I didn't smoke for almost two weeks! And then, I couldn't stand it anymore so I went and bought a pack to smoke. I had that same feeling (dizziness) when I started

smoking again that time. But not anymore now. But I don't smoke because of that (dizzy) feeling, I mean I really don't know why I am unable to separate myself from it! I mean I don't have that feeling anymore when I smoke nowadays, but I don't know ... maybe I would if I smoked Marlboro Red. But then I feel that... eh... Marlboro Red is really unbearable ... it's so stinky! And then I think it is purely a matter of daily habit. It's got nothing to do with that feeling.

About half way through the first interview, after the establishment of a good rapport with the interviewer, Holly started to talk about how she got hold of smuggled cigarettes from illegal channels at half the retail price.

- A Mm... which cigarette brand do you smoke now?
- I smoke Marlboro Ice Blast now, the one with a capsule. I crush it before I light the cigarette! Many of my friends are like me. Some of them just do it for fun, because those duty paid cigarettes are so expensive! I usually buy cigarettes when I go to China, or just order it!
- A How do you order cigarettes?
- H Eh... this is in fact... anyway, those cigarettes are not from the legal channel, right? Is it ok to talk about these things here? I mean, some of them focus on doing business in... how do you call it... something like smuggled cigarettes, and then... I usually order a carton each time. They are sold by the carton. They are probably retailing at HK\$55 per pack outside. I don't know if they've increased the price lately. I haven't bought any "Hong Kong flag" cigarettes for a long time, but those smuggled ones are around HK\$350 each carton (10 packs).
- A Oh! Almost half the price.

- H Yes, HK\$200 cheaper each carton. I normally order those cigarettes. And some of my friends ordered but they ran out... I normally order two cartons each time, and I would order again when I almost run out, so I wouldn't need to buy those duty paid ones! But some of my friends buy those "Hong Kong flag" ones, those with two capsules.
- A What does "Hong Kong flag" mean?
- H Mm... those sold in Circle K and 7-11. Those duty free ones are called "China flag", there is this "Hong Kong Duty Not Paid" wording on the pack, so it is duty free and different.
- A Do they taste different from those duty paid ones in Hong Kong?
- H Yes they do! In fact there are two types of duty free cigarettes! When you buy it as you cross the border, there is one that has no logo (graphic health warning) and one that has a logo, and they are different. I am not sure if it's because I am used to smoking "China flag" or not, because "Hong Kong flag" tastes strange to me.
- A How so?
- I just feel that... "Hong Kong flag" cigarettes have a high menthol content, and its tobacco taste is not as strong. It's like if I smoke green Lucky again, I'll find that green Lucky doesn't have much taste. I feel that the tobacco taste of "Hong Kong flag" is not as strong as that of "China flag"... I used to smoke green Lucky, but to be honest for some reason ... green Lucky these days ... many people used to smoke them, and then all of a sudden, they were gone. People just stopped smoking them all of a sudden! And then they started smoking Marlboro Crisp Mint, and I smoked that for a long time too, and then they launched Marlboro Ice

Blast. I tried it and found it quite good, and I've just kept smoking Marlboro Ice Blast until now.

- A I see...
- I am not sure if they got stale more easily or what, because the taste could be very different even if you bought the same brand. I like to smoke menthol cigarettes, and I would feel that without the menthol taste, the cigarette would taste like lights cigarette. And I find the taste of lights cigarette unbearable. Green Lucky was like that ... the menthol taste would always have disappeared when I bought them, and then it felt like I was smoking lights cigarettes! And also, I felt that the tobacco taste was becoming thinner and thinner. I don't know whether it's indeed lighter than Marlboro Crisp Mint, but I felt that Marlboro Crisp Mint has more tobacco flavour after I switched to them. But green Lucky had none.
- A Mm.

Apart from not wanting to be known as an immigrant from mainland China, Holly did not want any of her high school and college classmates to know that she is a smoker, for fear of being rejected and discriminated against.

- H In fact, it was purely about seeing what my friends smoked. It's all about mainstream popularity. But I didn't always follow the mainstream. A while ago, Marlboro Black Menthol was really popular. Do you know which one it is?
- A The black Marlboro pack without capsule?
- H Yes, yes! But I don't know why I didn't really like the taste of that one. So I didn't smoke it no matter how popular it was. I tried some back then, but I felt the taste was unbearable. And then even my friends... that was before Marlboro Ice Blast

- was launched, all of my friends smoked Marlboro Black Menthol, but I continued to smoke Marlboro Crisp Mint.
- A Mm, do they taste similar?
- H Mm, those two brands taste similar, but Marlboro Ice Blast has more menthol because I crush the capsule.
- A So what kind of pleasure does crushing the capsule give you?
- In fact, there isn't any pleasure. At first I thought it was really fun, and then after a while I would think... well, people said that the capsule is toxic, so you shouldn't smoke Marlboro Ice Blast. And then I thought, "So many people smoke them and they seem fine. After all, smoking is harmful to us anyway, so the capsule doesn't really matter. It would be fine as long as I get pleasure when I smoke." And then a while ago... there was a period when... I only smoked very rarely back then, because I got used to it... back then I was in a day school, during high school, and my classmates didn't know that I smoked. And I couldn't smoke at school, and sometimes I hung out with classmates after school so I couldn't smoke. I also couldn't smoke when I got home. So at that time, it might take a week for me to finish a pack. I would sneak in a cigarette during my train ride home. I probably smoked one or two cigarettes a day. So at that time, if I had bought other cigarettes, their menthol taste would have long gone!
- A Did you ask your online friend out for a smoke?
- I wouldn't ask him out for a smoke, but we are still friends until now. We would normally go drinking when we hang out ... drinking, smoking and chitchatting. I mean we wouldn't just come out for a smoke. I would do that in the past, because back then... my family... they were really strict on me when I was little. They didn't allow me to go home late. Sometimes I would go home after school, finish my

homework and dinner ... and then... eh... I would just laze around. Later, I would just ask one or two friends to go down (to the playground) to have a smoke and chitchat with me. I would go home after around twenty minutes.

- A I see.
- H Yeah, we went out for a chat ... well, we used to do that. These days, it's really... well sometimes we still do, but it's changed. Whenever I think of smoking, it means we have to leave... they would go, "Ah, don't go yet, let's have a smoke!" And we chatted a bit and then we left after the smoke.
- A Do you have more space and opportunities to smoke now that you are in university?
- In fact, until now, none of my classmates know that I smoke. I mean all of those I know are... I don't know if it's because people from Hang Sang Management College are mostly good boys and girls, and not many of them smoke. Amongst those I know, I'm not sure if they are hiding things from me, but only a very few smoke, really. I've seen people smoking on campus, but I've only seen a couple of them after almost a year! I mean it was within the campus area, and I knew they are students from Hang Sang Management College judging by their age.
- A I see.
- H Basically there is almost none, only a few of them in a year... and they dare not tell anyone. Nowadays, the school has its own Facebook page... people have secrets right? And smokers would be scolded by others. I saw some people scolding other people (the smokers) at the pavilion outside the school. I mean, it was already outside the school, but everybody knew that they were from Hang Sang Management College. They got scolded by others by smoking there! They said they were a disgrace to the school, and they should just move further away

- if they wanted to smoke. Those people are really evil, and that's why I wouldn't tell others (that I smoke).
- A So you didn't tell others in primary school, high school and college?
- H Mm, I did tell others in high school, before I repeated Form 5. But I started (smoking) a little earlier. I mean my high school wasn't too bad. It was a Band 2 school with pretty decent school ethics. And it was towards the end of Form 1... I started smoking towards the end of Form 1, and then I continued to smoke... but my friends knew about that, but they didn't say anything. At that time, they didn't say anything. And then when I was in Form 3... end of Form 2 beginning of Form 3, they also started smoking, until the moment when I repeated... I mean the group of friends before I repeated ... that group I hung out with every day, that group. Those who were closest to me already became smokers, ah... except one of them. It's so funny that he never budged! But I hang out with them less these days, because all of us have been busy with our further studies. But they live nearby. All of them live in Sheung Shui or Fan Ling, I still see them every day, but that boy still doesn't smoke! I feel that it's very funny, and I am really impressed with him!
- A So there aren't any friends at Hang Sang Management College who can smoke with you?
- H Eh... I am not the kind of person who needs company when I smoke. But I wouldn't want non-smokers to know that I smoke, unless we are really close, really, really close. And then... to be honest, I am not as close to my current classmates as my high school classmates. They are just different ... I probably won't tell them, and also I feel that there isn't a need to go out and tell everybody about it. But... then... I don't want to lie to them either. If they really asked me, I

would just tell them that I used to smoke. I won't tell them that I still smoke now. I don't feel like telling them about that ... I am concerned about how they see me!

For Holly, smoking is still something that is forbidden to be discussed or seen at home. Her parents should already know about Holly's smoking habit, but they just pretend that they do not, as if verbalising it would destroy their wishful thinking that Holly is not a smoker.

- A When do you normally smoke nowadays?
- H Mm... I normally... I am a bit strange... many people like to smoke first thing in the morning, but I don't like that. I feel really uncomfortable to smoke right after I wake up. Perhaps I am just weak and I am the type who wakes up feeling dizzy, so I don't really like that moment. I usually... I mean, after I brush my teeth and have eaten something ... I really want to smoke after eating something ... every single time after eating ... I would want to smoke as soon as I have eaten something and feel satisfied. Also before a shower, and then I would smoke a lot. I usually smoke a lot when I am lazing around and have nothing to do, and I would usually call my friends to kill time. It's those moments that I smoke the most, yeah. I wouldn't smoke much when I have things to do, yeah.
- A Do you like to smoke before you sleep?
- H Before sleep... yes I would, but these days... since it's really hot now, I wouldn't want to go outside to smoke after I've showered. It's not that convenient to smoke at home. I could smoke facing the exhaust fan in the toilet if I wanted to, but I usually go outside to smoke in the corridor. But I am not so desperate that I'd go outside to smoke in such hot weather, yeah!

- A Do your parents know you smoke?
- I think they know, but they wouldn't allow me to smoke in front of them. I mean sometimes they talk about it, but then I know they wouldn't let me smoke in front of them ... definitely not ... and they would scold me if they see that. But they wouldn't be furious about that ... they would in the past, but they can't do anything about it after so many years. They wouldn't know what to say anymore.

Holly's mother did not spend much time taking care of her when she was little. But she changed from a full-time housewife in China to a full-time worker washing dishes in the Jockey Club after they moved to Hong Kong. Holly did not mention the trigger for this change. Holly's father used to work every day and he was usually very tired after work, so he had asked a friend to look after Holly a few times over one to two weeks when she was 'very, very little'. Her father has a lighter workload now, which also means a lower income. This could explain why Holly's mother has to work full-time to help pay for her tuition.

- A Does your mum work?
- H Yes, for now, but she didn't work in the past. A while ago, two years ago, her friend told her that it was quite good to work in the Jockey Club and the salary was also not bad. So she started from washing dishes at about HK\$50 per hour. At that time, the minimum wage was only around HK\$28 per hour! And then she said, "OK, I'll try working there then."
- A Ah, that was two years ago. That means before that, she took care of you full time?

- H Not really looking after me on a full time basis... she likes to play mah-jong ... I mean occasionally... but the wager isn't big. My mum likes to laze around at home and binge-watch TV series, and she also likes to play computer games like monopoly or poker games. She just likes to play them, yeah, and she cooks too, but she didn't work back then. She did look after me sometimes, perhaps when my mum went home, and at that time my dad had to work every day ... he had to drive, so he couldn't look after me. So he would ask a friend to help take care of me, yeah, but it was only for a week, not more than that. I needed someone to look after me when I was little, when I was very, very little.
- *A* How frequently did that happen?
- H It was only once or twice, not many times. And then after I grew up and moved to Hong Kong, since mum was still a two-way-permit holder (no right to reside in Hong Kong), she had to go back to mainland China for some time every three months, like at least one to two weeks every time. And they just left me at home alone, as they wouldn't find anyone especially to look after me.
- A Who cooked for you?
- Well, I didn't think I was very little back then. At that time, my dad would still look after me, but it wasn't something like cooking for me. I mean he would sometimes, his workload is lighter now. Sometimes my mum would work until late and wouldn't come back for dinner, so he would cook for me now, just the two of us. Back then, he was really tired after work. We used to live in a remote village, and I had to make a few transfers to get to Sheung Shui. And my father would buy a lot of Bubbles (ready-to-eat bento box) home, and I would microwave the Bubbles meal boxes for dinner with my dad.

Holly's favourite cigarette of the day was the one she smoked across the border the day before the interview, and she subsequently admitted that it was during a trip when she smuggled parallel goods into mainland China with her friend. She had her favourite cigarette after being seriously deprived of smoking her regular cigarette brand, Marlboro Ice Blast, a 'real cigarette' that soothes her and makes her feel comfortable. The Capri Superslims cigarette offered by her friend failed to soothe her and made her feel really weak and 'unsafe'.

- A Ah, that's quite interesting... now if I may, let's continue to explore your experience of cigarettes. Can you tell me how it felt yesterday to smoke your favourite cigarette of the day?
- Huh, it was yesterday... I finished my pack of cigarettes yesterday, and I wanted to smoke, but I didn't want to spend so much money on buying 'Hong Kong flag', and then afterwards... I went to mainland China to see my friend yesterday... and I was in mainland China... and bought some cigarettes when I crossed the border, and then... but in fact... ok, I will just tell you this ... I smuggled parallel goods into mainland China!
- A Haha.
- Ha... and I forgot to buy cigarettes in my first round! I have a friend who smokes Capri Superslims... it is still a menthol cigarette, but the menthol content is very weak. I asked her to give me one cigarette, and then I smoked it, sigh. I felt it was no good. Then, I went back again a second time around, and I bought Marlboro Ice Blast immediately, and I smoked that. Sigh, finally, A REAL CIGARETTE! I could really feel it!
- A Hmm.

- H I already had an urge to smoke, as I had already run out of cigarettes the night before. And then I got a Capri Superslims and that cigarette was really hopeless!

  So, I still couldn't satisfy my desire to smoke. That's why the Marlboro Ice Blast tasted extra awesome!
- A Can you describe how you felt when you smoked that cigarette?
- Huh.... I felt comfortable! I mean, it was my regular cigarette. It felt as if I hadn't Hreally smoked that first cigarette (Capri Superslims) at all, and the Marlboro Ice Blast was my first cigarette. And when I smoked it ..., I wouldn't say things seemed to look different, but I felt satisfied... I don't know. It was like you really want one thing, and you waited a whole night, and then you got it the next day! Yeah, something like that. I wasn't particularly happier because of that, but it really felt satisfying. When I don't have any cigarettes, I would always... I mean, whenever I ran out of cigarettes, you know I keep ordering cigarettes right, I would look everywhere, maybe there would be one pack left in a corner of my home, yeah, I always did that. But I couldn't find any cigarettes after looking for it from a long time. And then... eh... I got to smoke the following day, and when I did, I felt ok ... I found what I wanted ... I can finally smoke, and I had a very comfortable feeling ... it's like the cigarette has taken a load off my mind, something like that. In short, I felt like finally I could have a proper smoke! So I smoked one stick, and then I smoked the second stick very quickly. Well you know sometimes... I am not sure if it's psychological, it's really strange you know. I've always smoked Marlboro Black Menthol, even the same pack would taste different at different times. Sometimes I felt that one stick would taste very good, but sometimes another stick would taste very bad. For those bad tasting cigarettes, I wouldn't want to smoke it anymore after smoking slightly more than half a stick, and then

I would throw it away. But for those that taste really good, I would quickly smoke a second stick after I've finished the first one. It's that kind of feeling.

When describing her most disappointing cigarette, Holly said that she felt extremely uncomfortable smoking inside her friend's car, but she did not know why. An image of her father's truck came to the interviewer's mind. Is that feeling of suffocation somehow related to her father's truck?

- A I see... Can you tell me the most disappointing cigarette that you remember smoking recently?
- H Well I can't say that I was upset... last night, it was also last night. I got home after going out for a walk. I had a dinner appointment with an ex-classmate who is a smoker, and he drove his car to pick me up. Since it was so hot outside, I only smoked after getting into his car, and I felt extremely uncomfortable smoking inside the car. And I discarded the cigarette after finishing only half a stick. That stick made me feel really uncomfortable, but I don't know why. In short, I felt really awkward smoking in the car. Maybe it was very stuffy ... maybe it was too stuffy. And then I smoked again after dinner, and then... usually I would smoke after dinner, and then we went back to the car, and it was very hot you know, so we went back inside the car again. We wound down the windows to smoke, and then it happened again! I really didn't want to smoke that cigarette when I was in the car; I don't know why!
- A Did he turn on the air conditioning in the car?
- H Yes, he did. In fact, it wasn't hot inside the car, but I don't know why I just felt that I had no appetite to smoke! Maybe it was because of the smell inside the car

... I really don't know. Maybe it was a mixture of the smell of the car which made me not want to smoke anymore. I really don't know why I had that feeling inside the car. That happened before ... I didn't really pay much attention to it, but I think it happened before. The most troublesome thing is I... I don't know how to smoke inside a car ... I mean when the car is moving! The best I can do is to ask him to wait for me to finish the cigarette before he drives again, because there is wind when the car is moving. There was a time when I was with another friend, and the ash was blown back into the car when I tried to flick them out! It was extremely exhausting. So, I don't want to smoke when the car is moving.

- A Ah, so the reason is because you don't want the ash to be blown back inside the car?
- H That's one of them. But he stopped the car that time ... I don't know why I still didn't want to smoke. I just couldn't smoke the cigarette in a relaxing way. I mean sometimes when I smoke, I would feel relaxed, but... I didn't feel comfortable last time, even when the car stopped there and wasn't moving at all.

When asked about the role of cigarettes in her life, Holly mentioned for the second and third time her love towards cigarettes; a love that is almost equivalent to romantic love.

- A What role does a cigarette play in your life?
- H Eh... huh... what... I don't know how to describe it! But I feel that eh... I know that I want this thing (a cigarette), not because I am addicted to it, but it's purely because I feel that I really love it, I love to see it and I love to eat (smoke) it. I mean it's not a matter of whether I need it or not, it's love! ... In short, it's like I have this habit... So, I feel that I've always had this habit with me. Although

- sometimes I feel that I really don't want to smoke it, but apart from those moments, I just love it.
- A Is there anything comparable to cigarettes?
- H Not really. I also drink, but I feel that eh... I mean I can... how do I say it, I don't need to drink when I smoke, but when I drink, I must smoke. Do you understand?

  It means cigarettes are more important than alcohol. I also like alcohol very much ... I love to drink, but I love cigarettes more, yeah.
- A Can you tell me more about that comfortable feeling when you smoke?
- H No, not really, not that type of feeling... My heart would twitch if I don't have my cigarette, and then once I have it back I would feel... so comfortable! I just want this thing (a cigarette), so when I have it I would feel very comfortable. It's just like that, it's a real feeling you know?
- A I see..
- H I can tolerate... I can... if I cannot smoke for two to three days, but only under the condition that nobody smokes in front of me. If... I mean if I have to stop smoking for two or three days, I would feel extremely uncomfortable if there is someone smoking beside me ... and that twitchy feeling would be significantly intensified! Yeah. But I can really... can.. eh... I mean maybe not smoke for two or three days! I mean I am not really physiologically addicted to it; it's purely psychological. I feel that I want to smoke, and I would feel uncomfortable if I can't smoke, yeah. It's purely because I love it, that's why I want it.

In the following part of the interview, Holly mentioned a few times how disgusted she feels about a wet cigarette filter. A strong hatred was displayed by her when a cigarette is 'changed' or deformed when the filter becomes wet after being bitten. Escalated emotion was observed when she spoke about her hatred towards a wet filter for the

fourth time in the interview. She likens it to a 'deformed' monstrous object that needs to be got rid of immediately. So, the wet and soft and yellowish filter seems to have turned into a (deformed) monstrous object that attacks her with its heat. In addition, it was also noted that there was quite an abrupt discontinuation of the first interview by the interviewer, as if she was also attacked by the deformed monstrous object and felt disgusted about that.

- A Your regular brand is a King Size cigarette. Would the Capri Superslims you bummed from your friend be too slim and that makes you feel uncomfortable?
- H Eh... uncomfortable in my hand... mmm... eh... in fact that's true for those Superslims cigarettes, and long cigarettes too. I need to insert the filter deep into my mouth to smoke those long cigarettes, which means I have to bite the filter deeper in order to draw in the smoke... (in order to get) a larger mouthful of smoke. But those regular size ones are more normal. You only need to put the filter into your lip a little and it's good to go. I don't like those long cigarettes, because I don't like to wet the filter. Some people would make the filter soaking wet when they smoke. Many people bite the filter, but I don't like that; I really hate it, I don't know why. I mean I would wipe it dry when I wet the filter accidentally, because holding it feels really uncomfortable... and then you know, for those long cigarettes, it's very difficult not to insert the filter deeper into mouth and get it wet! And it's also very difficult to draw in the smoke, so I don't really like that size. I feel that they are really awkward to handle, and I prefer the normal sized ones.
- A I see.

- I usually just use my lips to hold the cigarette! Lips are dry, like that (demonstrating). I wouldn't make a special effort not to wet the filter, but I would try... mmm... but I guess I'm just used to that ... I've always been like that ... maybe that's true for everyone ... they would smoke like they did their first cigarette ... I guess it's like that. I don't know, but for me I would just put it (the filter) between my lips, and the filter wouldn't touch the wet part inside my mouth! But some people... I have really seen people who bit the cigarette so hard that I didn't even know how they can smoke at all! A classmate told me that you wouldn't get stained teeth if you bite the filter while smoking. But I don't know where he heard that from, I have been smoking for a while (without biting the filter) and I don't have stained teeth.
- A Have you ever accidentally dropped the cigarette on the ground because it was too loosely attached to your lips?
- I won't hold it too loose, but just not very deep (inside my mouth). I mean, if I just loosely hold the cigarette between my lips then the filter won't get wet. It wouldn't leave the filter too detached from my lips. I feel like I won't be able to smoke the cigarette if it's too detached. But.... I don't know, my classmate used to... because we are pretty close, and he told me that I should bite the cigarette to avoid stained teeth. But I just ignored him. I've been smoking like this for a long time and I haven't got any stained teeth yet. So, I just ignored him... even if I have to bite it out of necessity, I wouldn't make it wet! I could bite it once but I won't make it wet! Yeah. I don't know why, some people are like me and they also don't like the filter to be wet. It's really disgusting!
- A So it turns yellow when it gets wet?

- Not really, it isn't dirty. But... eh... it's a piece of cotton, right? I mean once it's Н wet and after you've smoked it, the entire filter would turn yellow! Eh... it would become yellow even if it's not wet, but it's not as bad. It gets really yellow when it's wet, and it also becomes soft, I mean the entire filter will be extremely soft. And then when I have to touch it again for another smoke... I mean I wouldn't suck in the entire filter, but I feel extremely uncomfortable to touch a wet filter with my dry lips! And then when I think again, that is actually saliva, and then you just can't stand it anymore, it's just not good! Some people's cigarettes are very weird! Back then... when I was at school, we were pretty crazy, and we would gather to smoke in the toilet, and we had to smoke in a hurry and so many people would share a cigarette. Then if anyone got the filter wet, the cigarette would become very soft... the filter would become very soft and very hot. I mean the moment you suck the smoke in, the filter would be flattened because it was wet and soft. It would be deformed! It's really ugly and disgusting and it burns your fingers too!
- A Oh, does it burn your fingers?
- Exactly! You feel really hot when you suck in the smoke ... I mean when the filter is flattened, it just burns your fingers... because you are holding the cigarette with your fingers. You can feel that it's really hot when you are holding that cigarette ... it's really, really hot... if the filter is flattened. And also, it's really disgusting, the entire cigarette is deformed, I feel really disgusted and I don't like it! I feel that it's really disgusting! It's unacceptable to me! I mean I really don't like the filter to be soaking wet!
- A How much of a cigarette would you normally smoke?

- Н Leave a little bit ... just a little bit. I wouldn't go all the way to the filter. I would just leave a tiny bit... maybe a tiny bit, this short (gestures). I mean if this is the filter, and then the distance between the butt and the filter is like this, usually... unless there are some cigarettes that I don't really want to finish after smoking a few puffs, like when I smoked inside a car, I would... sigh, throw away the cigarette after smoking only half a stick, coz I would feel very uncomfortable, yeah! I don't know whether they're related or not, but sometimes I would go to Internet bars to play online games with my friends, and then it would happen again! You know Internet bars are quite dark, and then it is also very dark when we go outside to the corridor to smoke. I would feel very uncomfortable. I don't know why but I feel that I must smoke when I drink. I don't know, so I would smoke despite being uncomfortable. But if I play online games... I mean under normal circumstances... I don't like to smoke in that kind of environment. I would feel uncomfortable smoking that cigarette; I don't know why ... it's just suffocating.
- A That's interesting. I think it's about time for today. I will review the recording for this interview and jot down some follow-up questions that I would like to know more about. So do you have any questions after this interview?
- Huh, not really. But I think it's quite interesting, because I wouldn't think about so many things when I smoke. Like when you asked me to think of one thing to describe a cigarette ... these are the things that I wouldn't normally think about. But now that I have thought about it, I realise how I feel about it, and that I can verbalize it. I mean it's like I have a better understanding on how I feel about smoking. But... I don't really think about these things normally, wouldn't...

really... In fact it's indeed difficult to verbalise ... really difficult to verbalise and describe that feeling. So it may not be very accurate, but I've tried my best.

#### A Thank you H.

In the second interview, the interviewer shared a dream about her best friend Ming, someone she has lost contact with because their friendship fell apart. The dream triggered Holly's association with her love of cigarettes, which is similar to romantic love; a feeling that blurs the boundary between what's inside and outside as Holly becomes more inseparable with cigarettes as her love towards cigarettes deepens over time. Cigarettes have become a necessity to her, and she would feel unsettled and agitated when her cigarettes are not around. Listening to Holly expressing her love towards cigarettes, the image of Ming came to the interviewer's mind again, and the whole session felt like a discussion about lost friendship for the interviewer (with Ming) and Holly (with her forgotten friends in Dong Guan).

A Before we start the interview, I want to let you know that I had a dream after our first interview. It was an interesting dream. I am not sure if it's related to what you told me about your childhood in Dong Guan. I used to have a very good friend in high school. I met her when we were in the same class in Form 1. She was my only friend in high school and I had no other friends back then. She left after Form 5 because she couldn't get back into Pui Ching Middle School. She then got into another high school. After that, we applied for the Chinese University of Hong Kong together. I was in science class and she was in arts class. She couldn't get into the CUHK but I got in. We weren't really on good terms at that time, and then she decided to go to the States to study

nursing. She's living in the States now, and she rarely comes back to Hong Kong, only once every few years. Well, she was my high school friend, and I've known her for the longest time, and we had always been in contact with each other until recently. And the other night, I dreamt of this friend. She came back to Hong Kong a few months earlier this year, and we had a big fight because of where she was staying during her trip to Hong Kong. I told her that she could stay in my room at my parents' apartment, but she decided to live at someone else's place ... someone I hate, so we had a big argument because of that, and I said we shouldn't be friends anymore since she chose that person over me. She went back to the States and we haven't contacted each other since then... so I guess our friendship is over. And I hadn't dreamt about her for a long time, and I had a dream about her after that first interview with you. Her name is Ming. I can't remember what she did in the dream, probably something quite ordinary. Somehow, our interview reminded me of this friend again. Well the reason I told you about this is because I want to know if you've had any thoughts or feelings after our first interview... before we start, I have jotted down some questions from last time...

- H Eh... I didn't think about smoking much before the interview, but I started to think more after that interview, and then sometimes... these few days... I had a much better feeling when I smoked. I don't know ... I seem to feel more when I smoke my cigarettes, or I think more about smoking ... therefore I have a much better feeling towards it, yeah. It's like that ... my feeling towards smoking/cigarettes has deepened.
- A Is it like something or someone you used to ignore, and now you suddenly pay more attention to it?

- I mean, well, I used to only want to smoke a cigarette, but now when I smoke I feel like... eh... because I have never thought of my feelings towards cigarettes is equivalent to love, and then I feel like I love my cigarettes! I mean, that feeling is very novel to me, yeah. So my feeling is stronger, but I don't want to smoke more because of that.
- A Can you tell me more about that 'love' you just mentioned?
- H That kind of love... eh... in fact it's like... it's like you love.... I won't say it's a habit, but habit is also driven by love, and that's why you have this habit to start with! I love playing online games, so I would go and play online games. When I am unable to play when I want to because I am busy, I would be unhappy. That kind of love... like when you want to do something because you love doing that, but because of whatever reason, you can't do it. Then you feel unsettled and agitated.
- *A Mm*...
- H Like I love playing online games, or... ah... it's like I love to play on my phone
  ... love to do that! And I would feel extremely uncomfortable if I ran out of
  battery! You know, I just like to play on my phone when I have nothing to do. I
  mean, it's nothing really special or purposeful ... I just love to play on my phone
  and then I get agitated when I can't, and then I get really happy when I can
  again! Yeah, something like that.
- A So a cigarette is like a phone or a toy to you?
- H You can say that, I mean... eh... in short, it's not that I can't live without it, but... eh... it would be much better if I have it near me all the time. I mean, I would feel more comfortable that way, more settled, no matter what, I just feel that I need it (a cigarette) around!

Holly mentioned in the first interview that she does not like smoking in a car as she feels suffocated smoking in an enclosed and dark area, with the exception of smoking in her mainland Chinese friend's car in Dong Guan. She attributed it to the soft-top, as the car is more open and spacious, and the quiet and peaceful environment in China compared to Hong Kong. However, the interviewer had an association that Holly probably had a better relationship with her father when she was in China, hence the absence of the suffocating feeling when she smoked in an enclosed area, like her friend's car (which could symbolically represent her father's truck).

- A What role do cigarettes play in your life?
- Н Cigarettes... are not something very special to me, but I feel that if you are with a group of smokers and you are the only non-smoker in that group, sometimes you would feel that you don't really understand what they are talking about. I mean, for example, when everybody is worried about cigarettes, and that is a common topic that resonates within the group. Or when the topic of cigarettes is brought up, like when they need to buy cigarettes, other people just won't understand! I mean you won't understand if you don't smoke. You won't understand how troublesome it is to buy them when the 'Hong Kong flag' cigarettes are so expensive. You simply won't understand! I mean, you won't understand it if you don't smoke. I think this is one of the topics that resonate within the group. And then... there is this... it's really funny ... when I went back to mainland China, something happened. It was my first time but many other people have had a similar experience. I have a friend who has a car and he told me that for some unknown reason, he loves to drive to a quiet and peaceful place with his friend to smoke and chat inside the car. But then I mentioned

earlier that I feel uncomfortable smoking inside a car, but I didn't have that feeling when I was with him at that time. Maybe because his car was a convertible and the soft-top could be open... you could just remove the top of the car, and then you would feel comfortable. So we just chatted and smoked together, but his objective was purely to smoke, and then he told me that many of his friends are like that. He and his friends do that all the time, irrespective of whether they have a car or not. If they have a car, they would just drive to a place and park there and then have a smoke inside the car. It's quite interesting. He said he likes that ... he likes going out with friends (who don't have cars) in the car, cruising by, and see what places they fancy ... anywhere they think is beautiful and they would just stop and take a cigarette out, smoke and have a chat. Right.

- A I remember you have said that you don't like smoking inside the car. It feels suffocating, and you don't like smoking in that kind of environment.
- H Hmm. I feel crammed, very uncomfortable. It also could be that the smoke got blown back inside. Err ... could be, possible. I don't know ... possibly the environment is not comfortable here. Like my friend in mainland China, he really would just drive on until he finds a good place to stop, and then enjoys a smoke. Sometimes, it just can't be done in Hong Kong. Really, not many places in Hong Kong are comfortable enough for you to stop the car. Unless you deliberately drive a long way. But my friend from the mainland, he really keeps driving on, until he sees a place that he feels good about, then he would stop the car and smoke. He is really like that.

Holly expressed a strong preference for the good old days in mainland China. She feels that Hong Kong people are mean and rigid. On the contrary, mainland people are nicer

because they always remember and care for her. Most of her Dong Guan friends are smokers and they know she smokes, but Holly did not tell any of her Hong Kong classmates that she smokes. Holly feels out of place in Hong Kong, and yet she also feels inferior to those mainland locals who have big houses. She prefers to keep her Hong Kong and Dong Guan friends as separate as possible, almost fearing that the meanness and rigidity of Hong Kong people would contaminate her nice Dong Guan friends. Despite the nostalgic and positive feelings towards Dong Guan, Holly also seemed conflicted as there was a deep rooted fear of rejection by her Dong Guan friends as she stays longer and longer in Hong Kong. It may seem that she herself has already been 'contaminated' by the meanness and rigidity of Hong Kong people.

- A You are still in touch with friends in Dong Guan, aren't you?
- H Rarely. Once a year, maybe. But they are the nostalgic type. Not sure if it is because the people in mainland China are generally more nostalgic, and they just continue to keep in touch with me. Sometimes I am so busy, and I suppose we are not that type of friends who would see each other all the time, so there isn't a need to talk so much. But they don't think like that. They believe that even though we may not see each other every day, we can still contact each other every day using WhatsApp or WeChat. They mostly use WeChat. I don't like it, but they like that. Every one of them likes to hold on to a relationship. But that's not me. I would only get in touch with them when I return to the place... I prefer those good old days. Actually, I wonder if it is related. Memory from childhood is always good. I don't know if it is the reason. So my memory about the past goes back to aged eleven or ten. Then I was ten years old and I had such a good time when I was little. But I don't know. It's like ... let me give

you an example. I came here when I was in primary five. At that time, the school I went to ... the people there were nice, as there were many mainlanders there, and there was no rejection of anyone at all. But in high school, I did experience some unpleasant rejection by local students. So, I suppose mainlanders are nicer (than Hong Kong people).

### A Really?

H Yes, the female schoolmates in particular. From childhood to now, I have always had a lot more boy friends than girl friends. I got here in the middle of a term, so it was natural for me to attract more attention because I was admitted mid-term. Luckily, I studied in a village school in Sheung Shui with lots of mainland Chinese immigrants. That's why they won't reject me because we are all new immigrants. But then, because I have always got along better with boys than girls, after a while, the girls started to get a bit upset with me. It wasn't like that on the mainland. People there are very nice and very nostalgic. I really like the nostalgic type ... I don't know how to put it. It seems HK people are more mean. For example, when we meet each other, some would say they know me if I am doing well. But if I'm not doing so well, they might pretend not to know me. This is the impression I have about Hong Kong people. Frankly speaking, that's how I feel.

#### A Hmm.

H People in mainland China are nicer. No matter how you are doing, they will...
they will think about you for old times' sake. When you see your primary
schoolmates, they will care about you. I just think that they are nicer.
Sometimes they do come to Hong Kong, but then to be honest, they normally
won't come to Hong Kong for sightseeing; they come for shopping. So, I don't

see them that often. For example, they would come to Hong Kong Apple shop when they have a new product launch. Basically they are very familiar with Hong Kong and don't need me to take them around. They would come to see me... only occasionally. Sometimes when they are not well, they come here for doctors' appointments. Of course, that is when they have more serious illnesses, and not mild ones. So sometimes they would look for me when they have more serious illness that requires coming to Hong Kong to see doctors. But then I am usually... actually... quite busy. Before, I had to go to school, and I also need to join the executive committee meetings of my school societies ... busy with so many things, so I am not that free really. Also, sometimes I do feel that ... err ... the fact that we met in a particular place before, we should meet up for fun in that same place. We should go back to that place. So I don't feel like hanging out with them in Hong Kong.

- A That's interesting. In other words, for friends you met in Dong Guan, you would keep the bonding in Dong Guan. Friends you met in Hong Kong, you would bond in Hong Kong. It is better that Hong Kong friends won't go to Dong Guan for fun, and Dong Guan friends don't come to Hong Kong for fun.
- Yes. Coz sometimes... I would be a different person when I am with different groups because the culture of the two places is different. When I chat with my friends in Dong Guan, the subjects are different. Now I am in Hong Kong, I haven't got used to the fact that the topics we talk about are different here. I find it very awkward. Therefore, I much prefer to bond at where we first met. My friends in Dong Guan know that I smoke, but not some friends in Hong Kong. Those in Hong Kong, like my schoolmates ... they don't know, coz they don't smoke. So, I wouldn't bother telling them at all. At the very beginning, I

didn't mind at all. If you know, you know. If you don't, so be it. Anyway, I won't smoke in front of you. But later on, I heard that, err... I have a classmate, he is studying business subjects and he is a member of the Commerce Society. One time, he told me, "Those students doing commercial subjects are not as simple as you think. They are rather complicated, rather bad." Then I asked, "Bad? Why?" He said, "Most of them smoke!" So, smoking is really considered "a bad thing" to some people. I thought it was rather strange to have that kind of impression. In that case, I'd better not let them know I smoke. I suppose ... err ... it's not so good to let them know. But I don't really think I am... I don't think I am the kind of bad person they are speaking of. I smoke; it is just a habit, purely because I like smoking. I am not that kind of people in their minds. But I don't want my habit of smoking affect their judgement of my own personality. On another occasion, I heard some students chatting. Suddenly, out of the blue, they would say something like they found out that one of their friends was a smoker, and that they found that to be very shocking! Then I think maybe it's not such a good idea to let them know that I smoke too. I guess not letting them know is better. I guess I prefer my friends on the mainland, because life there is so different ... how should I put it? Anyway, it is so different ... err ... I suppose ...err ... after all, it is the lifestyle I grew up with. Hong Kong people are so rigid about certain things. For example, something very simple, like err... when you go to Chinese restaurant, the table is clean, and then you dropped some food on the table carelessly. I would normally pick it up and eat it. If you are in the mainland, it is a fairly normal thing. But in Hong Kong, it becomes so abnormal.

A Ah, so they don't pick the food up when it's dropped on the table?

- H Oh they don't, they don't. I wonder if it is laziness or what. Like they think they are of a "high class" ... anyway, they are very different from people on the mainland. There, we don't mind. My friends back in Dong Guan are really rich, but they are locals and they never think themselves as superior to others. They just don't do that. Sometimes, I asked my Hong Kong classmates if they wanted to go to Chang Long (water park). They would say the water in the mainland is so dirty, and said that they really can't accept it. A lot of people go and have fun there. Why is it they have to say things like that? I never get these comments on the mainland. There is no such problem. So I think, people on the mainland are more easy going, more carefree. Whatever you do or say about many things, they don't really think it's a big deal. On the contrary, in Hong Kong, people do.
- A Those friends in Hong Kong ... do they know you come from Dong Guan?
- H Err, some, but not all of them. Right. Coz most of them wouldn't be interested anyway. Then, some of them did say something about coming to my home when they go to China for fun for a few days. But my home on the mainland isn't a big one. Well, I am not a local who lives in a house. Our home, the one my father and mother have, coz we are not the locals, we only live in an estate. The locals have their own land, and they build their own houses. If I had those kinds of big houses, I wouldn't mind taking them there to stay, but I don't. So, I don't think it's necessary to mention anything. Unless someone brings that up, then I would say, well, I have also lived in Dong Guan for ten years. I mean, unless people bring it up, I wouldn't just tell them upfront. When someone else brings up the subject, I may talk a bit more about it.
- A Have you taken them to visit your residence in Dong Guan?

- No, I haven't, not with the present classmates. I did with some others before.

  There were three of them, four including me, and we went back there. I got in touch with my friends on the mainland and we had fun together. Right, we kind of got along. But it's just different. Everyone seemed to be OK, they think people are quite nice. As simple as that, nothing special, but the culture is really different.
- A Just like dropping food on the table...
- H This is just a very superficial example. But... actually in reality, I don't know how to put it, err ... right, like this ... I feel that sometimes, err ... people will do certain things under particular circumstances. For example, when people go to Chimelong Safari Park, they would play in the water park. But some Hong Kong people will not, not even when they are actually there. I don't know if every one of them really has mysophobia! One friend did go there and didn't go into the water. Many of them had said even before they went, that they wouldn't go into the water. So, in other words, they think the water is dirty there. I felt that it's so strange. Mainlanders and Hongkongers just have different acceptance levels of different things in life. So I suppose basically we can't quite get along, as we don't have too many things in common. It is really difficult to have fun together.
- A If you have a choice, do you prefer living in Dong Guan or in Hong Kong?
- H Err ... this ... I have thought about this, I did think about this before. So, if I go back, then it will be a very comfortable life. There, the pace of living is much slower. When I went back, I was err ... I slept until two or three in the afternoon. Once out of bed, I lolled on the couch, watched television. There are many channels on the mainland. Once a TV programme finishes, I would switch

to another, watched and switched, watched, watched, watched. Later on, when I got hungry, I ordered a take-out. They would deliver even for a ten-dollar order. So, I called for a take-out, and that means I didn't need to leave home at all. Then until night time, I might call for a take-out again, like BBQ food, which is very popular on the mainland, and then I went to bed. I feel that this kind of life is so comfy; it's like a retiree's life. Afterwards, but err ... I suppose it is not too good to live like that every day. Also it's... like you may not be able to find... people usually will find a companion, a partner, and then they will decide to live like that. So if I really... if I really decide to stay there, then I will find someone there too. I suppose we may have a slight difference in culture, but the gap won't be that big. It's not a small one either, so it could be difficult to accept our differences.

- A Do you identify yourself as a local Hongkonger or as someone from Dong Guan?
- H Err ... I suppose I will say I am a Hongkonger, because it's where I am living now. It's what I am getting used to... and doing the same as everything that other Hong Kong people are doing. So if you ask me to go back, they probably will consider me a different species. Therefore, I am not sure ... coz it is really not the same anymore. I really think that what I am doing now is more like what Hong Kong people would normally do, yeah.

When asked to elaborate more on what 'unstable' means when she spoke about her most disappointing cigarette in the first interview, Holly burst into anger and said that Capri Superslims completely failed her, and it was totally bad, like a phone without Internet connection when she wanted to use WhatsApp very badly. A strong emotion

of disappointment and urgency filled with desperation and an unsettled feeling was observed.

- Hmm. I have another question. After listening to the recording in our first interview, I have some follow up questions I want to ask. It's about your favourite cigarette of the day. You told me that you went through immigration and smoked a Capri Superslims, and you found that the taste was off. Then you went back to your regular Marlboro cigarette. I heard you illustrate the sensation when you smoked Capri Superslims, and you felt that the taste was "unstable". Can you tell me more about what you meant by "unstable"?
- H Err ... what was it like? I was like ... I suppose it didn't satisfy my need... I felt that "wow, this cannot satisfy my needs at all!" Completely not what I wanted!

  Then I felt that this cigarette was really unstable, and that all Capri Superslims cigarettes are "unstable!" Anyway, it means it didn't satisfy my needs at all, it failed completely!
- A So their quality can't be trusted, or not up to standard?
- H I won't say they can't be trusted. It's not good enough. I feel that it's totally bad! Right, something like that, can't really compare to Black Ice, right? It's like that.
- A Let's use a mobile phone as an example, since you mentioned before that cigarettes are a bit like mobile phones. What kind of a phone is Capri Superslims? What kind of a phone is Marlboro Black Ice?
- H Err... Capri Superslims is like a phone without Internet connection. Then Black

  Ice is a phone with Internet and call functions ... right.
- A So, Capri Superslims is very "unstable?"

- *H* Exactly!
- A So Black Ice is more stable... Can you tell me more about that feeling?
- It feels like... it satisfies my needs perfectly and completely! I mean it can satisfy my needs at a particular time. Say, I crave for a smoke at a certain moment, and suddenly it gives me this... like you want to use WhatsApp so much, but they give you a phone that has no Internet connection. And then you know you can get Internet connection later on. And then, that feeling is very "unstable", very uncomfortable, it makes me even more uncomfortable. You should know that feeling right? Just imagine you want to use WhatsApp so much, but err... you've been given ... err... a phone without Internet connection! It's that kind of feeling.
- A So it is totally "unstable!" Last time you said how a person smokes his first cigarette determines how he smokes all cigarettes afterwards. Can you tell me more about this?
- I don't know about the others, but I am like that. The first cigarette I smoked, I didn't wet the filter. Then, but someone... I really don't know why one would wet the filter. I have been smoking for so many times, and not once have I smoked like that. So err... some people may put the filter right into their mouths when they first smoked it. But I don't. I remember I only put a very small part of the filter into my mouth the first time I smoked, but that's... so I think, but maybe err ... I guess, I'm not sure, I think it is possible that if I had wet the filter like that on my first cigarette, then I probably wouldn't have minded wetting all other cigarettes I smoked afterwards. But I guess because my first cigarette was dry and neat, personally I just cannot accept a wet filter. I suppose it is like that. You smoke like you did during the first smoking experience. Right.

- A The filter of the cigarette turns yellow after you've finished smoking. How do you feel about this?
- H That I don't mind; I can accept it. Unless... if the filter is wet and the whole thing becomes yellow, then it would be really gross... it would be really gross to smoke that... err... I think that err... it (yellowish dry filter after smoking) is really unavoidable. Sometimes I would look at it after smoking. Well, usually I wouldn't do that. I would just throw it away once I finish smoking it. But if I happen to take a look at it... err... I feel that it's really unhealthy, but I have already smoked a lot of it ... inhaled all the bad stuff into my body. Sigh, it's ok ... don't look back, just let it be!

On one hand, Holly seemed to hate the idea of blowing out smoke from her nose as it looked repulsive for girls to do that in public. On the other hand, she seemed to enjoy the sensation, saying one could feel quite 'high', not unlike the 'milder feeling of water getting into your nose.' Smokers generally feel less control hence more vulnerable when they release cigarette smoke through their noses rather than their mouths. This 'milder feeling of water getting into your nose' does sound a bit like a feeling of mild suffocation, which is the kind of feeling that Holly gets when she smokes in an enclosed and dark environment. The combination of 'vulnerability' and 'mild suffocation' gave the interviewer a feeling of drowning under water in the interview.

- A Do you blow the smoke out though your mouth or your nose?
- H Err ... I don't blow it out through my nose on purpose. But err ... I suppose I do both... unavoidably. So err ... unless, oh yes, even if you blow the smoke out through the nose, some will still come out from your mouth. I think smoke comes

- out of both places. But I don't mind, I would need to make an effort to blow it out from my nose only when I have a blocked nose.
- $A \qquad Mm \dots$
- H Coz, in fact it is quite uncomfortable. But I heard that blowing out from the nose is no good... it is no good to blow smoke out from the nose. So I... err... usually wouldn't make an effort to blow it out through the nose. Sometimes when I have a blocked nose, it feels more comfortable to blow it out from the nose. Coz I smoke menthol cigarettes. Black Ice is the one with even more menthol. I can't feel the menthol in the mouth, but I can feel it once I blow smoke out from the nose. You can feel that it has menthol in your nose.
- A Like clearing a blocked nose?
- H I won't say it will clear the nose completely, but it helps. Actually, it does clear the nose. But I, err ... rarely (do that), coz I heard that it's really easy to have... also it looks rather repulsive for girls to blow smoke from the nose. So, sometimes I only do this at home, or in front of my closest friends. I suppose no one will do it among strangers on the street ... girls blowing smoke out from their noses ... I usually wouldn't do it. Right, I err ... sometimes if I have a blocked nose, then I would blow it out from my nose at home.
- A Um. So you blow it out through the mouth in most cases. You won't blow it from the nose on purpose.
- H No, I won't. It's not good for my appearance. In fact, it is quite weird to see a girl mindlessly blowing smoke out from her nose!
- A It is not a problem for boys?
- H Boys, well, ...err ... not really. It's just that I feel that girls ... girls already don't look good when they smoke, and it gets worse if they blow smoke from the noses.

- I feel that it would really look very weird. But I suppose it's more acceptable for boys, not so unacceptable if boys are doing it, yeah.
- A What's the difference between blowing out from your nose and from your mouth, from an image perspective?
- H The image, hm, hm I don't know, it's just gross to blow smoke from the nose.
- A Is it like blowing your nose?
- H Oh yes. It's like girls doing this openly on the street. That's really not good. Also, really, the look of it is so gross. Normally you wouldn't suddenly just ... err... mindlessly blow it out from the nose. But at home when I'm all by myself, it could be quite fun. But I only do it occasionally though. It is really comfortable to do that. I don't feel much of the menthol when I blow smoke out from my mouth, but if I blow it from the nose, then the whole nose smells of menthol.
- A Actually you can get it from chewing gum.
- H Not enough menthol... err ... it's not the same feeling. I suppose you can only get it from smoking ... this feeling. It is so funny to blow smoke from the nose. Have you tried it before? Sometimes, it is so uncomfortable when water gets into the nose right? But, it's so comical to blow smoke from your nose. It gives you a milder feeling (compared to when water gets into your nose), but it's a little like that feeling.
- A Ah.
- H So, it is like when water gets into the nose, but that feeling is quite "high". It won't be too agonising, the first blow of cigarette smoke through the nose... err... err... it's only slightly uncomfortable. But later on, you can feel the menthol (cooling sensation). It's only on the first blow that you get a feeling of "high".
- A Will this get you sneezing?

H Oh, it won't, it won't, I won't. I only think that the feeling is quite fun, but I won't do that all the time,

The interviewer asked Holly what it was like to feel her heart being clutched when she was deprived of cigarettes. After some probing, Holly told the researcher the story where her heart was broken when her boyfriend disappeared and did not want to see her after knowing that his best friend also fell in love with Holly. A sense of abandonment and disappointment filled the interview room as Holly told her story.

- A The feeling of "high"... OK ... You once said that sometimes you want to smoke, but can't. That feeling is like the heart being clutched due to smoking deprivation.

  Can you tell me more about the feeling of being clutched?
- H Like now I am using iPhone 5S, but I crave for an iPhone 6 when it was first launched. I really wanted to buy iPhone 6. When I took my phone with me when I went out, I saw people using iPhone 6, and I really wanted an iPhone 6... that feeling is completely the same as that (the heart being clutched, the desire to smoke).
- A So that's the feeling of the heart being clutched...
- Well, I won't say it is like being clutched... it just feels uncomfortable. Like longing for it more and more, longing for an iPhone 6. When I can't smoke, and I see people smoking on the street, my heart would feel clutched, yeah, just by seeing other people smoke. Sometimes, I would even have an urge to go over there and ask for a smoke! But that will be a difficult psychological barrier to cross. But in fact, I have really done that before. I really went over to ask a stranger for a smoke! Well, that person looked like he would do the same thing

- as me, so I managed to muster up enough courage to do it. But generally speaking, I wouldn't just ask people (for a smoke) so abruptly.
- A Did he sell you the cigarette or did he give it to you?
- H I said, "Can I buy a stick of cigarette?" He just gave it to me right away.
- A Did that happen in Dong Guan or Hong Kong?
- H Hong Kong.
- A Can you tell me more about it?
- That time I was at school. There was another high school next to mine; a worse Н one. In our school, arriving at eight o'clock was regarded as late. The other one, you have students arriving at a quarter past eight. I was running to my school one time and on the way, I could hear the school bell already. So, I thought it was over (no need to rush anymore since I'll be late anyway) so I just gave up (hurrying). I thought I would have breakfast nearby, but I had forgotten to bring my cigarettes. Then afterwards, when I was walking towards the school... I could choose between a regular thoroughfare which would take longer, or a hill path which is a shortcut but there aren't many people there. When I was walking slowly towards my school, I saw a student from the neighbouring school. He was smoking while walking. So I thought he would be willing (to give me a cigarette) since we were both students in the same area. I thought he would agree. So I actually approached him and asked him to sell me a stick, and then he just gave me one for free! On that occasion, I was confident that he would give a cigarette to me, so I asked. But generally speaking, I wouldn't do that on the streets.
- A That was when you were walking on the hill path, the time you were going to have breakfast?

- H Oh yes. But I was craving for a smoke. I was supposed to go to school, and then suddenly... well you shouldn't bring any cigarettes to school, but suddenly (I just wanted to smoke), err... and then I could take my time... I didn't have any cigarettes with me, and I was craving for a smoke. Then I happened to see a guy smoking, which made me crave even more. Then I asked him to sell me a stick of cigarette; asked him to lend me one, yeah.
- A Was that a menthol cigarette?
- H Err ... yes. It's common among high school students.
- A So you knew he was smoking menthol?
- H Not really. I merely tried... and then he really gave one stick to me.
- A Do you remember the cigarette brand?
- H Can't remember. Marlboro something ... something like that ... it was okay.
- A Would you have minded if it was a Capri Superslims?
- H Err ... I would still take it, but it would not be so enjoyable ... no kick. But at least it was a cigarette, even though it was not the same thing, yeah... I was not the only one being late. There was me and my classmate and both of us were late. Then later on, he gave us two cigarettes, one each. We didn't speak, and in fact I don't think I can recognise him even if I passed him again on the street.
- A It was quite an interesting experience.
- *H* It was quite amusing.
- A So, that feeling of being clutched is like you want to upgrade from iPhone 5s to iPhone 6. If it were a human relationship, what kind of relationship would make your heart feel clutched?
- H Err ... Something like I haven't seen that person for a long time. Like my boyfriend, if I haven't seen him for long time, then afterwards err ... I would very

much want to see him and contact him. But if I'm not allowed to find him, I mean perhaps we haven't seen each other for a long time, but he would not really let me see him, then I would feel, err ... not comfortable, and I'd really want to see him.

- A Has it ever happened to you?
- Actually no. However, in fact there was another situation ... that rarely happens, Hand it was really a sentimental glitch. Before, I was very close to two boys. Later on, I fell in love with one of them. However, I found out later that both of them fancied me. Then I said to the one I fell in love with that I wanted to be with him, and he said yes. Afterwards, the other one was not happy and he lost his temper, coz he was not good at handling this kind of situation. His relationship with my boyfriend turned bad, and they had a feud. Later on, the boy I loved also got upset. He really didn't want to think about our situation, so he hid at home for a long time. I tried to reach him, but he didn't answer my calls. Then afterwards, I got that feeling, the feeling of longing to contact him. But he didn't reply to my calls. I was very eager to know what had happened to him. But he was silent... regardless of how I pressed him and reached out to him every day ... he just didn't reply. Just like that kind of feeling... not so intense ... I mean smoking is not that intense. Craving for a smoke is a bit like the feeling I had on that person back then.
- A So how long did this "you can't find me, but don't find me" episode last?
- *H* Two whole weeks.
- A And the two boys used to be buddies?
- H Hm. Initially they were very close. Afterwards they... later on... but now everything is fine. Then, the two of them argued. Yeah, I felt so depressed back

then. I really wanted to know what was on his mind, but he didn't care about my feelings, and shut me out from his thoughts. That time, I kept reaching for him, looking for him, but he didn't respond, didn't care about me. Anyway, I couldn't find him, so I felt so topsy-turvy inside my heart.

Towards the end of the second interview, Holly came to an opinion that she no longer wanted to lie to her Hong Kong classmates about her smoking anymore. She wanted to be herself and step out from the shadow.

- A I see... now let's go back to this question again ... you have mentioned once that you think cigarettes are something you cannot part with. Have you ever attempted to part with your cigarette and stop smoking?
- In fact I have. Last time I did say that. The year when I repeated, nobody (in my class) smoked, so I did consider stopping. Actually I am facing the same situation at the moment. I smoke, but not when I am with my schoolmates. I can't even let them know that I have a smoking habit! It feels quite agonising. Why can't I just drop this habit, so that I could be one of them ... be the same as them? But then I found that no matter what I did... well, I really didn't smoke for a period of time, but in the end... in the end, I couldn't resist the temptation and went to buy a pack! Therefore, I feel that what I have become, now I am to continue smoking, I can let my classmate know, and it really doesn't matter. So I thought ... I've already come to this stage ... I don't really care anymore if my classmates know I smoke. I don't care anymore as long as I am happy, as long as I like it. I suppose for now, the only reason that would make me quit smoking

- is when they increase the cigarette price to HK\$200 per pack. If that happens, I really don't know how I can afford to smoke anymore.
- A I suppose you can still go and buy "China flags"?
- H Well the price of those will increase too. I remember it was HK\$10 per pack the first time I bought duty free cigarettes. Now, it already costs HK\$20. They increase the price according to the price in Hong Kong. So when "HK flag" is increased to HK\$200, "China flag" won't be cheap either, so it's useless. The price of cigarettes is outrageously high. Or maybe when I have a baby in future ... if I have a baby I will definitely quit. But I won't rule out the possibility that I may pick up smoking again after I've given birth. Or if I have found my love, planning to get married, then I may quit. But I suppose I will secretly have a smoke occasionally. It is really hard, oh yes.

Holly's story started to unfold more towards the end of the second interview. She did not talk much about her relationship with her parents in the interviews, unless explicitly asked by the researcher. It became clear from Holly's following response that her mother was her father's second wife, and that her father is much older than her mother. Holly may have preferred to hide this fact from the interviewer at the beginning. The disclosure that her mother was only nineteen years old when she gave birth to Holly explains why her mother indulged in other social interests and did not spend much time taking care of Holly when she was very little. Because of this, it is also possible that Holly felt neglected and to a certain extent abandoned by her mother, until they moved to Hong Kong and her mother started to work full-time to pay for Holly's tuition.

A I see. One last question, can you tell me more about your mum?

- H Err ... My mum ah, she is like me, or I'm like her. We are very similar, like err ...

  I have inherited a lot of things from her ... completely, it's good family education, from when I was little until now. Money is very important to both of us. But we won't do illegal things like stealing or committing fraud even though money is very important to us. Both of us have an insatiable desire for petty advantages. We will buy discounted stuff immediately when they are on sale. So we are very much alike, actually it... it is quite good. I suppose my mum is great.
- A Anything that really touched you?
- H Err, on the contrary, no. I don't think there is any such event. I don't know. Maybe it happens all the time, since we see each other day and night. She helps me with a lot of things, so there is nothing in particular, or so special that I would remember.
- A Um ... Um ...
- H But now what touches me most is that ... in fact our family is not rich, and my tuition is expensive. In the past my mum did not need to work, but then she started working. She was thinking of earning some pocket money for herself, but then later on... now... she worked so she could pay my tuition. My dad continued to work to pay the household expenditure, and my mum looks after my tuition ... using her salary to pay for my tuition. So I feel grateful and touched by that, yeah.
- A Do you think you are closer to your mum or your dad?
- Ah hmm... in fact, I think I must be closer to mum. I don't know why. Sometimes, my parents discuss some private matters ... I don't know. They talk about certain things and then they tell me. They talk about who should play the good guy, who should play the bad guy. Always, my dad plays the good guy and he won't scold

me. My mum scolds me about things. But my mum is so... she will always chat with me after scolding me. For example, when I went out with boys ... my dad is the stubborn type, even up to now ... he cannot accept the fact that I am dating boys. He still hasn't come to terms with it. But he won't tell me. Instead, my mum will talk to me, and we chat about those sentimental stuff. Right, so I must be closer to mum.

- A When you were little... did your parents beat you when you were little?
- H Oh yes, mum hit me. However, I think she stopped hitting me when I got to two or three years old. Coz by that time mum would say sorry to me... coz my family is slightly complicated. Coz my dad divorced before I was born, so my father is quite old, and my mum is relatively younger. My mum was nineteen years old when she gave birth to me.
- A Wow, so young. Now she is only thirty nine years old!
- H So then it turned out that she told me she loved to have fun when she was young, and she had no idea how to raise a kid. At that time, her temperament was still not stable, not mature enough to deal with a kid like me. She really felt I was intolerable. Therefore she hit me all the time when I was little. Later on, I suppose my father had talked to her, maybe telling her not to be like that. Afterwards, they mainly... talked to me (when I was naughty). Yeah, usually it was my mum who hit me when I was little. My father didn't hit me. He never hit me.
- A Um, do you have any half-sisters or half-brothers?
- H Yes I do. I have an elder sister and an elder brother.
- A Are they much older than you?
- *H Much older. They are now thirty.*

- A Thirty ... that means ten years older. Have you been in touch with them?
- H I have, but rarely, very rarely. Err ... but they have been very nice to me, like they would give me treats. But after all, we don't live together, so we don't really have that sibling relationship. But they really treat me like their own sibling. Very often, like on my birthday, they would give me presents. Then, on many things, they would offer assistance. They are very proactive, very caring towards me.
- A They are Hongkongers?
- H Yes.
- A That's quite interesting, just hearing about it. Oh. I think I have taken up a lot of your time today, and I am done with all my questions. Thank you so much for your openness in these two interviews.
- H Thank you.

The above summarises the full transcript of Holly in both interviews and the observations made by the interviewer. A similar level of analysis has been carried out for all the interviews of the remaining respondents and will be included in the following section.

Amongst the seven qualities listed out by Winnicott, the two most definitive qualities that differentiate a transitional object from a regular soothing object are the illusion of its vitality and liveliness, something that seems to have a life and reality of its own, and the location of the transitional object, which is neither from within nor from without, but in the intermediate area. The significance of these two qualities is also reflected in the interview results, as is seen in the fifth and sixth quality described by Winnicott, appearing consistently in all the interviews of the eight respondents (see Table 5).

Qualities of Transitional Object		Hank	Anthony	Holly	Anita	Cooper	Emerald	Abyss	Samuel
1	Assumes rights					√			
2	Loved & mutilated	√		√					$\checkmark$
3	Remains unchanged		√	√	√	√			√
4	Survive loving & hating	√		√				√	√
5	Vitality or reality of its own	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	$\sqrt{}$	
6	Comes from within & without		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
7	Gradually de-cathected								

Table 5: The presence of the specific quality of the transitional object in the interviews Note: ' $\sqrt{}$ ' represents the presence of the specific quality of cigarettes in the interviews

The two-stage interview design is created to build rapport and establish a preliminary read in the first interview, followed by the second interview to build on the specifics mentioned in the first interview. Presentation of the interview results is combined for both interviews as respondents differ in their level of openness to strangers and time needed to warm up to the research to build rapport and be open about sensitive topics. Some respondents maintained a very conservative stance by speaking as superficially and as little as possible in the first interview, and were only willing to reveal more in the second interview after a prolonged warm-up and efforts in building rapport and trust by the researcher in the first interviews; some revealed a significant amount of private information to the researcher even in the first interviews. Hence, a different level of details and information was obtained in each of these interviews across different respondents, rendering it unnecessary to split the results based on a different stage of the interviews, and this approach is also adopted by Hollway and Jefferson in their 2013 FANI method book.

We will examine each of the above seven special qualities of the transitional object as outlined by Winnicott and discuss how these are manifested in the smoking behaviours, both from our own observations of smokers in the numerous qualitative focus group discussions and consumer interviews we have attended in our past twenty-two years with a global tobacco company, as well as from the sixteen interviews we conducted personally with eight respondents for the purpose of this thesis. Not all seven qualities are found in the interviews, and this could be due to firstly, the very open nature of the FANI method in which the content of the interviews is shaped by the respondents, hence some might prefer to cover more of the important events in their personal lives, rather than every single aspect of their smoking behaviours; and secondly, the limited time allocated for each interview, hence not all the respondents managed to cover all aspects of their smoking behaviours.

In the following paragraphs, we will be providing relevant snippets of the respondents' verbatim statements when they spoke about these emotionally charged smoking moments that resemble the qualities of the transitional object as described by Winnicott.

6.3.2 The first key transitional object quality as manifested consistently in the interviews: a cigarette is seen as more than merely a lifeless consumable object, but an object that has a life of its own

'Yet it must seem to the infant to give warmth, or to move, or to have texture, or to do something that seems to show it has vitality or reality of its own.' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

In the above description, Winnicott mentioned four key components contributing to the transitional object being perceived as having a life of its own: it must be perceived as giving warmth, or to move, or to have texture, or to be doing something by itself. A cigarette and its consumption satisfy all the above four features: by the time the

cigarette smoke hits the smoker's lips, its temperature will have dropped from 400 to 900 degrees Celsius between puffs at the burning tip of the cigarette, to around 40 degrees Celsius at the mouth end of the filter, giving the smoker a warm sensation in their mouth, throat and lungs. Moreover, an entire smoking ritual is involved when people smoke; there is movement in their hands to light the cigarette, hold the cigarette towards their mouth while inhaling, and flicking the ash between puffs. The entire smoking process involves a fluid movement of the smoke from being drawn into the mouth and the lung through inhalation, circulating around the lungs and being removed from the body and mouth via exhalation of the smoke. It also involves a visual component where the stick gradually shortens as one draws in each puff of smoke from the cigarette, where there is a visual burning zone of the cigarette stick and the building up of white ashes on the cigarette, leaving only the cigarette rear end at the end. All of the above add to the perception of the cigarette having a life of its own. This special quality of the transitional object appeared consistently in all the eight respondents' interviews, as is evident in the following snippets of their interview transcript.

#### Hank's interviews

A cigarette is not just a cigarette but is equivalent to a person in Hank's world, and smoking is similar to getting to know and building a relationship with that person. With the bad experience of his girlfriend cheating on him with his best friend, Hank seems to have lost a lot of faith in people. Sometimes he would rather not light his cigarettes, so he can preserve its life longer, and just like friendship which will eventually end, each cigarette will eventually get burnt out and 'die'.

"... smoking a cigarette is like knowing a person... there is an end to it, this relationship will end... like when you know someone, that means it will end...

the relationship will eventually end... I'd rather not know that person at all... yeah, I don't even need to light the cigarette...'

# Anthony's interviews

(Hank, second interview)

Anthony struggled with verbalising what his cigarette represents in his life: its role changed from being a 'partner' who accompanies him when he is unhappy, to just another 'hobby' to accompany him, to a 'useful object' that he can rely on to do things. Then the description suddenly changed into 'animals' like cats and dogs, and finally it turns into a person like a 'friend', but perhaps not a very good friend, and is afterwards downgraded to a 'pet' because he only plays with it when he needs it. Anthony did not mention much about his mother during the interviews, nor his family in general, and one wonders if the above contradictions depict his feelings towards his mother.

'... I want to smoke when I am unhappy... I feel like there is a partner with me when I smoke, yeah, it's like when you are unhappy, as a non-smoker you would weep sitting by the waterfront, but as a smoker like me, I would smoke a cigarette and weep sitting by the waterfront.'

(Anthony, first interview)

'... so that a (smoking) moment is like another hobby to accompany you, it's not a human, I mean you can't describe it as having a life or soul, yeah, but it's an object, yeah! Something you can use to do things, something you can rely upon... if it's not a person, perhaps it is an animal, yes! Like those cats and dogs, your pets.... it's very difficult to describe what it is, it is like a partner, or friend, but maybe not a very good friend... it's more like an animal than a

person, it's not as important as a person... like a pet, you only play with it when you need it, you wouldn't normally play with it when you have something else to do.'

(Anthony, second interview)

# Holly's interviews

Holly displayed an extreme hatred and disgust towards a wet filter, as not only did it burn her fingers, but was also perceived almost like a monstrous object that needs to be got rid of immediately:

'...I would just put it (the filter) between my lips, and the filter wouldn't touch the wet part inside my mouth!... I mean once it's wet and after you've smoked it, the entire filter would turn yellow!... It gets really yellow when it's wet, and it also becomes soft, I mean the entire filter will be extremely soft... but I feel extremely uncomfortable to touch a wet filter with my dry lips! And then when I think again, that is actually saliva, and then you just can't stand it anymore, it's just not good!... you feel really hot when you suck in the smoke, I mean when the filter is flattened... it just burns your fingers... because you are holding the cigarette with your fingers. You can feel that it's really hot when you are holding that cigarette, it's really, really hot... if the filter is flattened. And also, it's really disgusting, the entire cigarette is deformed, I feel really disgusted and I don't like it!... Ah, I feel that it's really disgusting! It's unacceptable to me! I mean I really don't like the filter to be soaking wet!'

(First interview)

# Anita's interviews

The drawn in cigarette smoke was seen as being able to take away all the bad things from Anita, such as fatigue and grudges from customers. To Anita, a bad smoke is like troops of monsters made of newspapers and waste paper rushing down her throat.

"...when I sat down and lit the cigarette, I sighed, I blew the smoke out, like blowing out all the fatigue, the grudges from customers, all were expelled..."

(First interview)

'What should a good (cigarette) taste like? When you smoke it, it should be so smooth, so slippery that it wouldn't choke your throat, you can draw it in smoothly. For cigarettes with a foul taste, you feel lots of impurities there when you draw it in, many strange things there, the smell would be very strange, you can't swallow it, you really can't draw it in, and you want to blow it out immediately. There is no way you can smoke another one, but there are no other choices, so I had to smoke that... I do feel lots of monsters in my throat. Before, people said they used newspapers and waste paper to make the China flag (smuggled) cigarettes, so when I smoke those China flag cigarettes, I thought of many newspapers and waste paper in my throat.'

(First interview)

# Cooper's interviews

A cigarette is equivalent to food for Cooper's mind and is seen as someone who is there and will always be there whenever it is needed, during bad times and good times.

'(A cigarette) keeps me company when I am alone. It helps me when I am unhappy, happy, or when I've had a full meal. It's around all these times, it

helps me whenever I need it... Oh yes, happy and unhappy, I will smoke, I keep smoking. Its role is to stand by me whenever I have quarrels with my folks, or break up with my boyfriend, or go out drinking with my colleagues, in all these occasions, it is always next to me... It is food to my mind... I think it is feeding the need of my mind.'

(Cooper, second interview)

# Emerald's interviews

The inhaled smoke of her cigarette seems to have a life of its own and is able to move around inside Emerald's body, including her lung and her brain. It makes her confused as it is able to destroy her, but also comfort and stimulate her.

'... when I start smoking the cigarette on a normal day, it feels like it is injected into and then circling around my lungs, and then it comes out again, so my lungs would be inflated, the bone would be inflated! And then... I would feel very confused, I would think that I am going to die, my lungs are getting darker and darker, and the smoke that is injected into my lungs is really strong... and then I blow it out. On the other hand, it's really stimulating... a big cloud of smoke getting inside, it's really comfortable, and then it comes out again... just like that... sometimes when I am in a rush, I would draw in a bigger puff... if I want it to feel stronger, I just hold it and wait for it to get to my brain, to go around in my body, and then blow it out!'

(Emerald, first interview)

Emerald also personified the inhaled and exhaled smoke as someone of the opposite sex who is highly unpredictable and changeable, who can fall passionately in love with you at one moment and leave you mercilessly at another moment, and all that can happen within a very short period of time.

'... it (inhaled smoke) is like a person of the opposite sex, he is interested in you and you've just known him for a short while, and then he falls passionately in love with you, the emotion is very strong, the feeling that he gives you is very strong, very sweet and very happy. And then only after a short while, he suddenly leaves mercilessly... after a short while, bye bye and he's blown out (exhaled smoke) ... it cools down immediately, cools down and drifts away! (Emerald, first interview)

A cigarette is seen as Emerald's uncriticising friend and soulmate who is always around and who has a life of its own; it is an ideal friend who knows exactly what she wants, and someone who is willing to devote all its life to her.

'... a cigarette is my friend, yes, it is my friend! I mean when nobody understands me, it is the only one who understands me, it is at my beck and call. Whenever I am upset, it can always be lit whenever I find it, but I have to use money to buy it... I would hide it when my family is around, but when I am with my friends then of course I don't mind, I would bring it out to meet my other real friends. Mmm... we don't communicate, haha, but I feel that it would understand. I mean when I cry really hard, I don't really need to say anything, sometimes when I sing I would light a cigarette, and it would hear me, hahaha, yeah, so I feel that it's... it's like my soulmate, we don't need to talk to each other but it knows what I am thinking about... it's invisible, because it's my soulmate, it's my friend inside my heart and soul. It wouldn't come out to meet people

unless it's necessary, I smoke by myself... It won't be there under normal circumstances, but it will be there when I am very unhappy... When my phone is gone, when there is nobody around me, I want to have a friend who wouldn't care about anything else but just sit beside me, and a cigarette is that friend... A cigarette is like a friend who always sits beside me, it won't talk to me, but it lets me use it and helps me relax. I also feel that it's quite mighty, it won't talk back, and it won't criticise me, but it would let me... I mean it devotes its whole life to me, lets me burn it all to ashes, in that sense it is really quite mighty.'

(Emerald, second interview)

#### Abyss's interviews

Abyss saw cigarettes as his mental food. It hurts his throat and yet he is hopelessly addicted to this useless and harmful mental food.

'... I take it (cigarette) as my mental food, it's really like food... it's like a mouthful of bad air getting in... a mouthful of bad air. I know it's bad air, it sometimes tastes strong, I have a dry throat after excessive smoking... everyone knows that it is a mouthful of bad air, but the demand is still there!'
(First Interview)

'... (a cigarette is like) a drug, yeah, as an analogy, and of course to me, stopping drugs is easier than stopping smoking... I think stopping smoking is much more difficult than stopping drugs, right... It (a cigarette) is something you draw in, something useless and harmful to you, so I can't find any analogy other than drugs.'

(Second interview)

#### Samuel's interviews

Samuel is fascinated by the fluidity and changeability of the cigarette smoke's movement, and despite its malleability, Samuel also feels its transient and fleeting nature.

'So foggy, with clouds of smoke, so... err... the smoke and the fog, I feel the changes, it changes all the time like a kaleidoscope of shapes. You can play it in whatever form and shape you like. Like my friend is very good at blowing smoke circles, after drawing in the smoke, he blows out the smoke in the shape of circles. When many people smoke at the same time, the place gets foggy and it's covered in smoke, some people would write characters, or draw patterns in the smoke. Of course, it will disperse instantly, but they get to play with it first. I don't really play with the smoke. Yeah, but what kind of feeling I have with that? It changes all the time, you can play it in whatever form or shape you like, but it can't be touched, it is transient and fleeting, it disappears the moment it appears. This thing will disappear very quickly, it only stays there for a while, (seeing) the smoke rises up, or drifts off, and it's vanished, gone!' (Samuel, second interview)

# 6.3.3 The second key transitional object quality as manifested in the interviews: the location of the transitional object

'It comes from without from our point of view, but not so from the point of view of the baby. Neither does it come from within.' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

One unique characteristic of the complicated cigarette smoking process is that not only is the smoke inhaled by the lungs of the smoker, but the smoke also comes out from the lungs through the exhalation process. The entire inhalation and exhalation process happen for each puff of smoke, with seven puffs of smoke for each cigarette and an average daily consumption of eleven sticks per day for an average smoker. This movement between 'outside' and 'inside' happens seventy-seven times each day during less than one hour per day's smoking time. Moreover, the smoke that is exhaled from the lungs is no longer the same smoke that is inhaled, because it was once 'merged' with the smoker when it entered his body, and 'separated' from the smoker after it left his body through exhalation. Hence, the exhaled smoke is no longer the same as the inhaled smoke because it has already passed through the smoker's body and hence was once part of the smoker. No other food product has similar consumption characteristics, and this makes a cigarette a unique type of 'food' that has a special quality of frequent movement between what is external and what is internal, and the merging with and separating from the smoker from both a physical sensation and psychological perspective. This special quality of 'me' and 'not me', merging between the smokers and their cigarettes, appeared consistently in all the eight respondents' interviews, as seen below.

### Hank's interviews

Smoking seems to have taken Hank to a world that belongs entirely to him, this world gives him unspeakable comfort, a comfort that feels extremely relaxing. This magical world resembles the unchallenged transitional space described by Winnicott (1953). A cigarette can be seen as a very special form of an infantile transitional object in this unchallenged world, because it is not only an object, it is an object that requires the smokers to draw in the smoke to their body and blow it out to the environment, a state

where 'me' (Hank) is merged with the 'not me' (the cigarette smoke). In phantasy, the consumption of a cigarette has a remarkable similarity with the infant sucking the mother's breast for milk and at the same time breathing out (projecting) their unspeakable anxieties to the mother (environment):

"...I feel that smoking is an enjoyment... How to say it... I mean it's like today I had lunch by myself, in Tsimshatsui East, I ate in an outdoor environment, I had a cigarette and some drinks by myself, I felt very comfortable, I don't know how to express that feeling. I mean, I was very free, very... I mean the sun... the sun was beaming down on me... I mean when I smoked this cigarette, I felt really enjoyable..."

(Hank, first interview)

'I don't know how to say it, I am not sure if it's my own problem, I mean I normally wouldn't tell others about my unhappiness... smoking a cigarette makes me feel that nothing has happened, I mean it's like swallowing an 'air' of anger... I smoke immediately whenever I am wronged, I mean I smoke whenever I get angry...'

(Hank, first interview)

'... I don't know, maybe it's my family education and training, I don't normally tell others about my problems and difficulties, so I feel that... how to say it... it's like maybe I have become dependent on cigarettes... maybe when you exhale the smoke... it's like... I don't know how to say it, it's a feeling... it's like when you exhale and blow out the smoke, it feels like you just get everything you want to say off your chest in one go... mmm... it's like you feel completely

relieved after you finish the cigarette, and you feel that maybe you've overthought things... it feels like the smoke takes away everything in one go, things like pressure... yeah, you blow everything out after you inhale, and then nothing has ever happened, it's all gone like magic!'

(Hank, second interview)

'... (when I smoked my ideal cigarette earlier today) I felt like I was the only one who existed in this entire world... I didn't need to worry about what others were doing, it was when I listened to music through headphones, and then I ate lunch by myself, so that world... at that time it completely belonged to me. It was also a very quiet world, I was the only one left in this world... (the cigarette) didn't really have a specific role in that world, it was a pure enjoyment, like when you are holding a wine glass... or when I play the guitar... you feel like you are the only one left in this world.'

(Hank, second interview)

#### Anthony's interviews

To Anthony, smoking is the equivalent of breathing, an act that requires him to draw in the smoke to his lungs and exhale through his nose or mouth – pointing to a clear process of merging of the 'me' (Anthony) and the 'not me' (cigarette smoke). The inhalation of mentholated smoke from a menthol cigarette gives him a cooling sensation around his throat, and the exhalation gives him another wave of intense sensation, and only after he has experienced this intense sensation can he qualify as 'smoking for real.'

'I've tried it (smoking a cigar) before, but I don't know what to do with it, because you tend to inhale the smoke into your lungs if you are used to smoking cigarettes, but if I just suck it in my mouth and I can't really talk, what do I do with it if I can't inhale it into my lungs?... I don't understand the kind of enjoyment people get by sucking and shaking it in your mouth (without inhaling it into your body) ... if you only suck the smoke into your mouth without inhaling it into your lungs... what's the purpose of doing that? You are just holding some gas in your mouth, I mean would you hold the air in your mouth when you breathe? If you do that, your mouth wouldn't be comfortable, and you also can't speak!... I feel that it's a complete process only when you inhale it into your lungs, because if you don't inhale, you... you simply... don't know how it tastes like! If you don't get it down to this position (point to the level of his lung) ... it doesn't get down, only your tongue would have the cigarette taste, and you also won't have that cooling sensation, the cooling sensation around that area when you smoke menthol cigarettes... I don't feel (the cooling sensation) much in my lungs, only around the throat area, and there is another wave of sensation when you exhale... after you inhale, you can exhale via your nose or your mouth. Yeah, and then when you exhale, you smoke (for real) ... because you have to exhale after inhaling, right?... and when you exhale, it's ... it's very important, this process!... I mean you would... you would be able to taste it (the smoke). If you exhale with your nose, then its taste is even stronger!... you will feel the taste of the cigarette... yes, there is taste when you exhale, and the taste is even stronger if you exhale via your nose...'

(Anthony, second interview)

#### Holly's interviews

The relationship between Holly and her cigarette is one that is similar to romantic love, a feeling that is very novel to her, a feeling that blurs the boundary between what's inside and outside as she becomes inseparable from her cigarettes, as if a pair of lovers become more inseparable as the love deepens over time. She loves to have her cigarette around, she loves to see it, she loves to eat (smoke) it, and she feels extremely unsettled and agitated whenever her cigarette is not around.

'... but I don't smoke because of that (dizzy) feeling, I mean I really don't know why I am unable to separate myself from it!... Eh... huh... what... I don't know how to describe it! But I feel that eh... I know that I want this thing (a cigarette), not because I am addicted to it, but it's purely because I feel that I really love it, I love to see it and I love to eat (smoke) it. I mean it's not a matter of whether I need it or not, it's love! ... in short, it's like I have this habit... So, I feel that I've always had this habit with me... my heart would convulse and beat faster if I don't have my cigarette, and then once I have it back I would feel... so comfortable! I just want this thing (a cigarette), so when I have it I would feel very comfortable. It's just like that, it's a real feeling you know?' (First interview)

"... I mean, well, I used to only want to smoke a cigarette, but now when I smoke I feel like... eh... because I have never thought of my feelings towards cigarettes is equivalent to love, and then I feel like I love my cigarettes! I mean that feeling is very novel to me, yeah... that kind of love... like when you want to do something because you love doing that, but because of whatever reason you can't do it, then you feel unsettled and agitated... in short, it's not that I can't live without it, but... eh... it would be much better if I have it near me all the

time. I mean, I would feel more comfortable that way, more settled, no matter what, I just feel that I need it (a cigarette) around!'

(Second interview)

#### Anita's interviews

To Anita, the smoking process makes the smell of the cigarette blend into her hands and her body, and when that happens the smell of the cigarette becomes the smell of her hands and her body. This familiar double experience gives her a feeling of intimacy with her Indonesian godfather whom she loves deeply, and an illusion of her still being together with him, which in turn provides her with a sense of security. Metaphorically, smoking feels like drawing in all the negative energy from the environment and using her own body to separate the bad from the good; the bad things get blown out from her body, leaving all the good things inside, so the good part of the drawn in cigarette smoke merges with Anita in the smoking process.

'... smoking is not about whether the taste is good or bad, it makes you feel at ease... so smoking is like sitting on a massage chair, so comfortable. So ... a cigarette is an indispensable item... The tobacco smell stays in the hand. Several hours after the smoke, you sniff your hand, it (the cigarette smell) gives you a feeling of intimacy... smoking... smelling the smoke gives me a sense of security!... smoking gives you a moment to rest, to think, to think things over, those things that are usually not thought of... so I bought one stick (of my Indonesian dad's clove cigarette), and burned it, then smelled it... I want to get that smell, that smell is the source of my sense of security, it helps me recollect how much he was fond of me when I was little, the time he was holding me in

his arms, that sense of security feels so good. I want to feel it again through the (cigarette's) smell...'

(First interview)

"...like when you draw in (the smoke), it is like you suck in all the negative energy. Being in the world, sometimes you cannot speak your mind, something unhappy, you won't say it out loud, you let it stay inside your mouth. So when you draw in the smoke, you suck in the unhappy stuff which you want to say out loud but you cannot. Then you wait for it to be filtered, so the good stuff can be sucked in, the bad stuff gets blown out. What I blow out is what I don't like. Those blown out... to the air, vanish in the air, it's pointless to think too much of it. Every issue needs a solution. So once you find the solution, it will be so nice. So smoking is a kind of a concept that there is always a way, a solution. If (the issue is) not solved, it will get stuck, and I won't be happy. So I must have a solution, (I must) force myself for this... those that can't be comprehended, can't be understood and can't be solved, I just blow them all out...'

# Cooper's interviews

(Second interview)

Cooper established a strong link between smoking and her emotions. In her phantasy, she is always alone when she smokes in this space; the cigarette smoke becomes a part of her and it merges with her body when she draws it in. The smoke also helps absorb all the badness and unhappiness in moments when she is sad, e.g. after breaking up with her boyfriend, the bad emotions will be expelled from her completely when she blows out the cigarette smoke. This is a strong indication of the smoke merging with

Cooper as one, and its function which is to take away all the badness from Cooper and project it onto the environment.

'... when I was unhappy, like after breaking up with my boyfriend, I just smoked, smoked, and smoked, and then blew the smoke out. Afterwards I just cried, cried and cried. I felt like ... how should I put it ... maybe there is only me in the world (of smoking) ... I really don't know how to express it, probably just want to blow it (the smoke) all out, then all would be gone, out! I think smoking and emotions are closely linked together...'

(First interview)

#### Emerald's interviews

Emerald vividly described the world of smoking as equivalent to a resting place, a place where she can detach herself from the outside world for a brief moment in a separated and yet connected place, as seen in the transparent protective shield analogy used by Emerald to describe the connectedness and yet separateness of the two worlds. In this world that is connected and yet separated from the real world, Emerald can sink in completely (merging of 'me' and 'not me') and enjoy a moment of quietness and peace before returning to the real world.

'... I mean I feel like I can take a rest there (when I smoke), but I need to go back after I finish the smoke... I only went there to take a rest, mmm... and after taking a rest I will need to... eh... do whatever I need to do afterwards. So, it (smoking) gives me a moment of quietness and peace... (this world of smoking is connected and yet separated by) a transparent protective shield (from the real world) ...'

#### Abyss's interviews

The world that smoking can transport him to is a world that is hidden under Abyss's blanket in his bed, somewhere he can wiggle in or crawl under, somewhere that does not have any contact with the outside world. This secret world seems to resemble a regression towards an inter-uterine life. In Abyss's phantasy world, smoking a cigarette brings him back to the womb of his mother, a place where Abyss is buried in his mother's body and therefore does not have any contact with the real world, a place where he can once again merge with his mother where the 'me' and 'not me' experience becomes blurred. Abyss crawls in deeper and deeper as the sense of insecurity increases in the real world, as manifested by him drawing in more and more smoke in.

'... that world (with the most disappointing cigarette) is none of my business anymore, I just wanted to leave, don't think (anymore), just jump over it... I wanted to find a hole to wiggle in, yeah, wanted to find a hole to wiggle in... there was no sense of security, I felt insecure at that time, just wanted to find a hole to wiggle in, or crawl under my blanket in bed. So, in a word, just don't let me have any contact with the (outside) world... (the drawn in smoke) made me feel decadent, feel sorry for myself...decadent... that made me feel so insecure. Just like suddenly shut down from the outside world. Yeah, so I drew one more puff, I knew that it wouldn't give me any particular sensation (satisfaction), anyway, I just couldn't think of anything at that moment, I was so scared and insecure, I just didn't want to be in contact with the outside world.'

(Second interview)

#### Samuel's interviews

Smoking can bring Samuel to an ideal, dream-like world that is purely enjoyable, a world where he doesn't have to think about what's happening outside, a world that belongs solely to him that he can fully immerse in, and a world where he can feel content. This world is partly detached from and yet partly connected to the real world: partly detached because there is no one else apart from Samuel in that world, partly connected because Samuel is conscious that he will need to go back to the real world after a few minutes of pure indulgence and enjoyment in this dream-like world. To Samuel, a cigarette is something that exists in both the real world and the ideal, dream-like world; it is something that makes the ideal, dream-like world perfect: it is both an object that can transport Samuel to the ideal, dream-like world, as well as an object that takes him back to the real world, when the cigarette is smoked out. In the dream-like world, the cigarette ('not me') is merged with Samuel ('me') as one unit as he travels in the space between the two worlds.

'... the ideal cigarette I had was yesterday in Stanley. I was with my girlfriend in Stanley. Unlike me, she doesn't smoke. So, I stole a chance, told her that I wanted to go to the toilet, and in fact I went to smoke instead. Sitting by the seaside watching the sunset, this is what one calls ""truly enjoyable!" ... I felt very content. The world was purely wonderful during those few minutes. The feeling was gone when I finished the smoke, and I had to go back again... returning to the real world again... I love smoking in a comfy environment. When I'm watching the open sea, it gives me a feeling of calmness, very comfy... I don't like being hectic, I like the comfy feeling, I like to feel free, so... maybe it's because of my personality, I would feel content as long as the

environment can give me a sense of comfort and relaxation... so I would feel peaceful even when I am standing next to a trash bin while I am smoking!'

(Samuel, second interview)

"... if there is no one at home, I enjoy sitting in the living room quietly smoking my cigarette... do nothing, think of nothing, no need to use my brain, time seems to have stopped. That moment belongs to me completely, and I have to return to the real world again a few minutes after I finish smoking... so it's that feeling... which is not easy to describe...I like smoking in a comfy environment, not necessarily beautiful, but comfy, with no one there to both me, as simple as that... (In there, time) stopped for a short while... (I guess) I would still feel comfy even without a cigarette in that quiet environment, but something is missing, that's what a cigarette can give me... with a cigarette there (in that quiet and comfy space), the world becomes perfect!... it (a cigarette) is kind of soft, a cigarette makes me feel soft, gives me a sense of peacefulness, it belongs to the quiet type... liquor, on the contrary, is very masculine and heroic. The ambiance I like is the quiet type, so I need something soft to go with me, then I will feel satisfied... a cigarette belongs to the real world, but I'd love to take my cigarette to the other (ideal, dream-like) world, and when the cigarette is smoked out, I know it's time to return to reality!'

(Samuel, second interview)

6.3.7 Other transitional object qualities manifested in the different stages of interviews amongst the eight respondents

'The infant assumes rights over the object...' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

The strong sense of ownership of their cigarettes can be seen in the following transcript from Cooper and Anita:

'I have a god-brother, we are very close. We were very poor when we first met, the whole gang was penniless, no job, but we still went out for fun, to an extent we only had a few pennies left for bus, then we rallied for money. At that time, it was HK\$29 a packet (of cigarettes). After fund rallying, we just got enough to buy one packet. Well there weren't enough cigarettes to split among so many of us, so we could only take it by puffs. And sometimes, some people just took away the cigarette without returning it to the group. So, when I was smoking, I was so afraid that he would just take it away, so I just held the cigarette for him to draw in, and then he would suddenly turn away and take the cigarette away in his mouth! ... I was really angry then, because I was really penniless, and I didn't have enough cigarettes for myself!'

(Cooper, second interview)

'No, it (the cigarette) won't (leave me). At most, you leave cigarettes. They won't leave me for no reason... Cigarettes have a lower status than workers. Of course, the partner comes first. Only a minor difference between the partner and workers. Because you can own the partner, but you can't own the workers... you can own cigarettes, but cigarettes can also affect others...' (Anita, first interview)

'The object is affectionately cuddled as well as excitedly loved and mutilated.' 'It must survive instinctual loving, and also hating...' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91) Peter Dobson, the global principal product developer at British American Tobacco, once mentioned in a conference dated on July 5<sup>th</sup>, 2017 that 'the relationship between the smokers and the cigarettes is very personal, people kiss this product ten to twelves times a day (ten to twelve sticks per day) and six to seven kisses each time (six to seven puffs for each stick of cigarette) ... you kiss the cigarettes more than your friend... you drink cigarettes every day!' The above quotation illustrates the intimate loving relationship between the smoker and their cigarettes; the smoker kisses and drinks the cigarettes multiple times a day, an act that is a lot more intimate than cuddling. This is a very interesting coincidence with respect to the famous quote by Freud in his letter to his fiancée Martha Bernays during the time when he was very preoccupied with all the kisses he could not give her because of the distance between them. In one letter dated Jan 22<sup>nd</sup>, 1884, Freud attributed his addiction to cigars to her absence and said, 'smoking is indispensable if one has nothing to kiss' (Gay, 1988, p. 39). The following verbatim transcription of the interviews illustrates how the respondents demonstrate their love towards their cigarettes.

Hank dropped into a world of his own when he talked about how beautiful his empty cigarette pack collection was, as if he was describing a piece of art created by him. The emotion displayed by Hank on his 'cigarette art' could be seen as an indication of the object being affectionately cuddled and excitedly loved:

"... I collect empty cigarette packs! Yes, empty packs, I arranged them all in the room, in the cabinet, they are very beautiful! ... I only started doing that in the past six months... so beautiful, I think... they all lined up together in a row, very beautiful!"

(Hank, first interview)

A strong desire of love for her cigarettes was seen when Holly talked about how much she is unable to separate herself from them:

'I don't smoke because of that (dizzy) feeling, I mean I really don't know why I am unable to separate myself from it!... I don't know how to describe it! But I feel that eh... I know that I want this thing (a cigarette), not because I am addicted to it, but it's purely because I feel that I really love it, I love to see it and I love to eat (smoke) it. I mean it's not a matter of whether I need it or not, it's love!'

(Holly, first interview)

'... my heart would convulse and beat faster if I don't have my cigarette, and then once I have it back I would feel... so comfortable! I just want this thing (a cigarette), so when I have it I would feel very comfortable. It's just like that, it's a real feeling you know?'

(Holly, first interview)

'... when I smoke I feel like... eh... because I have never thought of my feelings towards cigarettes is equivalent to love, and then I feel like I love my cigarettes! I mean that feeling is very novel to me, yeah, like... that kind of love... eh... in fact it's like... it's like you love.... I won't say it's a habit, but habit is also driven by love, and that's why you have this habit to start with!'

(Holly, second interview)

Instinctual loving of his cigarette is seen in the insatiable hunger that is triggered when Abyss smokes:

'Everything, every single incident... when it happens, there is always a beginning and an end.... once you've reached the end you would feel satisfied. But smoking is not like that. I desire to smoke, but when I finish smoking, I would smoke a second one, a third one, a fourth one, a fifth one. So, smoking will never fulfil the desire for satisfaction. It won't ... unless smoking can give me a great sense of success... I think smoking could give me satisfaction only under one condition, when I stop smoking! Right, if I want to get satisfaction from smoking, I probably need to take this step, and stop smoking!'

(Abyss, second interview)

The instinctual loving of a cigarette is seen in Samuel's enjoying it as an equivalent to a 'full feed':

'... (my ideal cigarette is) the cigarette after a full meal... yesterday... we usually smoke after we feed our stomach, so the feeling is "full", very satisfying. A bit drowsy after the meal, in full stomach, smoking makes us feel soothed, very relaxed, so comfy after the full meal, so full, in this sleepiness, smoking a cigarette makes me feel soothed and satisfied... the cigarette after a full meal is so relaxing, I smoke slowly, very slowly... the cigarette after a meal is a slow smoking (moment), savouring it... I feel very relaxed, comfy.'

(Samuel, first interview)

On the other hand, when a smoker smokes his cigarette, the cigarette is shortened during the consumption process, but it is never completely destroyed, for there is always a cigarette stub remaining. Therefore, symbolically it resembles the cigarette being mutilated (shortened) and yet surviving the attack (the remaining cigarette stub). Another obvious sign of mutilation of the cigarette is the filter biting behaviour which is very common in countries like South Korea and Japan. The filter biting behaviour of Hank could be seen as an act of mutilation and the cigarette surviving the hate of Hank:

'... I didn't feel it myself, but I have a habit of biting the (cigarette) filter... which means my cigarette filter will be all wet after I smoke it, and I would bite it and hold it in my mouth after I finish smoking it... I mean I just bite it while I smoke... it's easier to suck if you bite it...'

(Hank, first interview)

'... sometimes the filter would fall off... just throw the cigarette away!... can't smoke it anymore, I mean the filter becomes very soft and wet after I have bitten it... and then I just throw the cigarette away!'

(Hank, second interview)

'... when my friends ask me to share my cigarette with them, they would immediately know that the cigarette is mine because my filter would always be flat and wet, yeah, I only realised that I have this filter biting habit when my friends told me about it, I didn't know everybody else did not bite the filter! ... do you understand what I am talking about? ... because I feel that there is no taste if you just smoke the cigarette without biting the filter, the filter will

become firmer when you bite it, and you can inhale more, such a wonderful experience!'

(Hank, second interview)

Instinctual hating of the most disappointing cigarette by Holly can be seen below:

'... I suppose it didn't satisfy my need... I felt that "wow, this cannot satisfy my needs at all!" Completely not what I wanted! Then I felt that this cigarette was really unstable, and that all Capri Superslims cigarettes are "unstable!" Anyway, it means it didn't satisfy my needs at all, it failed completely!... It's not good enough. I feel that it's totally bad!'

(Holly, second interview)

'It must never be changed, unless changed by the infant' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

Amongst all the other fast-moving consumer goods, the cigarette is probably the one single product that has not changed much over the past century: a cigarette today still pretty much looks the same as the first machine-made commercial cigarette in 1881. Major innovations in the tobacco industry include the introduction of the perceived 'safer' filtered cigarettes by the 1960s, after the US Surgeon General linked smoking to lung cancer in 1964. Apart from the filter, there are different tar levels of the cigarettes, slightly different lengths and circumferences of the cigarettes, and some have different shapes of filter and some add different flavours to the cigarette using different technologies. There have been numerous attempts from the tobacco industry to introduce new innovations in the market in the past century, but very few of them are accepted by consumers. Generally speaking, smokers are very resistant to change,

both in terms of the cigarette brands they smoke as well as the actual product itself. For instance, tobacco brands enjoy more than a 90% loyalty level, which means that more than 90% of the smokers have already made up their mind on which brand to purchase when they walk into a shop, and there is not much anyone can do to change their mind on brand choice. Moreover, there have been quite a few classic case studies from the tobacco industry where a small change in the filter design caused a sharp market share drop, indicating the extreme anger demonstrated by the loyal smokers to such a small change in design, who believed that the product taste had changed. Such violent reactions can be seen in the following transcripts from the respondents.

Anthony believed that all the changes to his cigarettes in the past made them taste worse and he did not like any of these changes. Marlboro Black was the first cigarette brand he used to smoke regularly, and he believed that its taste has got stronger and stronger. In reality, cigarettes usually contain lower rather than higher tar as time goes by, driven partly by tar ceiling regulations imposed by the government, and partly by a natural smoking progression from high to low tar. So, the following account could only be a perception rather than a reality:

'There was this Marlboro Black, its packaging was in black and green colour, I used to smoke it regularly, my classmates also bought it all the time, but now... really... I wouldn't smoke it even if it was free! ... because I felt that the taste is different... maybe they changed the taste after market research! ... I used to think that Marlboro Black was really tasty, and gradually I felt that... oh, how come it seems to taste more and more disgusting? And then... yeah, I just stopped smoking it! ... Because it used to taste quite mild, and then I felt that the smoke smelt worse every day, like it's penetrated into your body, you feel

like an old and seriously addicted chain smoker after smoking it! ... your whole body is contaminated by that smell, and it never goes away! So, I didn't want to smoke it anymore after finishing one stick, and I could still smell the bad taste even after walking outside for a long time!'

(Anthony, second interview)

To Anthony, any change to his cigarette is equivalent to a deterioration of its quality, so, only the original one is the best, and no change is allowed!

'Good (quality of cigarettes) means... the taste is the same with the first time I smoked it!'

(Anthony, second interview)

Here is Cooper's irrational belief that Marlboro Ice Blue's taste has changed:

'... Marlboro Ice Blue, it has changed! All of a sudden it tastes differently! No matter where I buy it, I just feel that it tastes differently! I don't know what exactly the difference is, anyway, the taste is just different! ... I wondered if it is a counterfeit, because I am concerned with what stuff they put in there... once I realise the difference in taste, it makes me nervous, not sure if it is a counterfeit, I don't know what stuff they've added to the cigarettes! ... but I even bought it in 7-11, there is no way that 7-11 would sell counterfeit cigarettes! ... Yes, I did (get very angry). I stopped smoking it for one, two packs, but I smoked it again afterwards as its taste just miraculously came back ... despite the anger... maybe it has not changed at all!'

(Cooper, first interview)

And here is the hatred displayed by Holly when a cigarette is 'changed' by having a deformed and wet filter:

'...it's a piece of cotton, right? I mean once it's wet and after you've smoked it, the entire filter would turn yellow!... you feel really hot when you suck in the smoke, I mean when the filter is flattened... it just burns your hand!... you can feel that it's really hot when you are holding that cigarette, it's really really hot... if the filter is flattened. And also, it's really disgusting, the entire cigarette is deformed, I feel really disgusted and I don't like it!'

(Holly, first interview)

Below follows the rage exhibited by Samuel when he talked about the change of price (due to government excise increase), the change of the form (due to rain), and the change of mind of the manufacturer of his cigarettes (due to production cessation):

'... it's not fair! Tax on red wine and cigars is reduced but increases on cigarettes! But red wine and cigars are for rich people, and cigarettes are for commoners... commoners smoke cigarettes and drink beer. But those items used by the upper class got reduced (tax), and the commoners' increased. It makes me angry! ... I will get angry, I feel that it's not fair. Why did you reduce excise on red wine and cigars? If you want to increase excise, increase it on all of them, you can't be that partial! ... because it is not the first time. When they increased (the cigarette price) it from \$29 to \$39, there was a reduction on red wine! When it (the cigarette price) was increased to \$55, tax reduction continued on red wine! I didn't mind it much when it was increased from the

twenties to thirties, it might only be just that time, but you did it time and again!

You are doing it on purpose!'

(Samuel, first interview)

'My cigarette was soaked in rain!... (after a whole day of meaningless open day program at school) once the recess came, I ran out to smoke in no time, to relax, to get comfy. I lit the cigarette, then came the rain! The whole stick got soaked in rain!... the rain just came down on me before I finished drawing the first puff! The whole stick was completely wet. No more smoking. I was wet too, then I went back in... I just wanted to smoke, why on earth did they do that to me! That's how I felt (furious)!. Afterwards, I walked back in to borrow an umbrella from someone, and I smoked while holding the umbrella! ... I didn't want it to end (finish) like that! I lit the cigarette and I was not done with it yet, and it ended! So, I smoked the second one to compensate for that! ... when it's pouring rain, the cigarette easily gets soaking wet, and it breaks apart, then I am really angry!'

(Samuel, second interview)

"Winfield menthol was my first cigarette... the taste was very minty, like eating mint candies. Then they stopped producing them. Then I got so angry for a period of time!... very angry, because they stopped producing them, they were irreplaceable! It was my first encounter of this thing (smoking). I might change to another taste (cigarette) later, god knows, but I didn't want to at that point in time, I kind of felt like "why are you forcing me to change?"... I was much angrier about Winfield (being discontinued, compared to his cigarette being soaked in rain)! ... I was so angry that I wanted to blow Winfield's office into

pieces!... that time when I began to look for my cigarettes and found that they were out of stock. I didn't pay much attention to it at first, because I thought they was were only temporarily out of stock... afterwards, I kept looking for them, and one day, they just stopped producing them completely, no production, no stock! So, they were not out of stock! So, no stock because no production, then I got furious!"

(Samuel, second interview)

Its fate is to be gradually allowed to be decathected, so that in the course of years it becomes not so much forgotten as relegated to limbo...' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

In Cooper's everyday life, the cigarette is forgotten and taken for granted when she is happy and enjoying her time with her friends, so the cigarette is like a loyal companion to Cooper to comfort her only when she is unhappy.

'...when you are happy, you won't stop to smoke. However, it takes about five minutes to smoke a cigarette - it is impossible to sit still for five minutes to finish that cigarette. You look around at the people around you, and you are compelled to join them. Therefore, I would smoke only a little of the cigarette, perhaps just half of it, then stub it out and join the group. Then afterwards, when I crave for a smoke, I would just get another one and the process repeats. On the other hand, when I am unhappy, the cigarette is like a companion keeping me company and I don't want to waste it. It is the only thing there for me and so I will focus on it and won't leave it aside.'

(Cooper, second interview)

### 7. DISCUSSION

# 7.1 Contribution of this thesis to the idea of transitional phenomena and cigarette addiction

Based on the results of our research, the smoking experience has a high resemblance to the highly intense and private experience of the transitional space as described by Winnicott in his 1953 landmark paper. In this very special type of transitional space experienced by the smokers, the cigarette is consistently used as an instrument to facilitate the immediate entrance into the transitional space and the intense experiencing. The characteristic of this instrument (a cigarette) has a striking similarity to the infantile transitional object described by Winnicott: despite the limited time allocated to the interviews, two out of the seven special characteristics of the transitional object are consistently manifested in the respondents' interviews, i.e. the object being perceived as having a life of its own, and the location of the object being in the intermediate area between internal and external reality. Given the above results, I would argue that these two special qualities of transitional object are the most definitive qualities that are able to differentiate a transitional object from a normal soothing object.

Furthermore, the idea of the re-appearance of the transitional object in adulthood may sound paradoxical at first glance, because theoretically speaking the transitional object should only appear in infancy, as indicated by Winnicott:

'I suggest that the pattern of transitional phenomena begins to show at about 4-6-8-12 months... an infant's transitional object ordinarily becomes gradually decathected, especially as cultural interests develop.'

However, it is also important to note that Winnicott also suggested in the same paper that there is a possibility for the re-appearance of the infantile transitional object in adulthood when the person is threated by deprivation:

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 97)

the internal world.

'Purposely I leave room for wide variations. Patterns set in infancy may persist into childhood, so that the original soft object continues to be absolutely necessary at bedtime or at time of loneliness or when a depressed mood threatens. In health, however, there is a gradual extension of range of interest, and eventually the extended range is maintained, even when depressive anxiety is near. A need for a specific object or a behaviour pattern that started at a very early date may reappear at a later age when deprivation threatens.'

(Winnicott, 1953, p. 91)

Therefore, according to Winnicott, there is a possibility for the reappearance of the need for the transitional object even in adulthood when one is threatened by deprivation, or loneliness, or at bedtime when one moves from the external world to

At the end of the same 1953 paper, Winnicott gave three examples in relation to the pathological development and re-appearance of the transitional object in adulthood (1953, p. 97):

'In psychopathology:

Addiction can be stated in terms of regression to the early stage at which the transitional phenomena are unchallenged;

Fetish can be described in terms of a persistence of a specific object or type of object dating from infantile experience in the transitional field, linked with the delusion of a maternal phallus;

Pseudologia and thieving can be described in terms of an individual's unconscious urge to bridge a gap in continuity of experience in respect of a transitional object.'

Smoking addiction can be classified under the 'addiction' category of psychopathology: instead of following a healthy development path in which the transitional space is expanded over the entire cultural field and the transitional object is no longer needed, when threatened by deprivation, the smoker resorts to his cigarettes that can transport him to an intermediate area and a resting place where he can re-experience the blissful infantile reunion and merging with his mother. All these happen as soon as he lights up the cigarette and draws in the first puff of smoke, just like magic. To the smoker, a cigarette functions as a regressed form of infantile transitional object that can help initiate this regressive experience. This thesis provides evidence to support Winnicott's idea of the re-appearance of transitional object in adulthood when a person is threatened by deprivation, an idea that Winnicott himself did not further elaborate on after mentioning it in his 1953 paper.

# 7.2 Significance and implications of the current study to the smokers, the public health policy and the tobacco industry

Despite the known effect of nicotine on increasing our level of dopamine, the neurotransmitter that produces feelings of pleasure and reward, a smoking addiction involves a lot more than just the pharmacological side of the equation, otherwise nicotine replacement therapy would have been a successful tool to help people stop smoking. The results of the current thesis further suggest that conscious and rational factors alone are unable to account for the irrational behaviours displayed by the educated and intelligent people who continue to smoke despite knowing the risks of smoking. The unique physical characteristics and the consumption process of a cigarette make it able to evoke highly primitive associations and memories of the smokers. Even Sigmund Freud, the father of psychoanalysis, was unable to stop smoking despite multiple attempts in the span of forty-five years. At one time, after stopping smoking for fourteen months due to health reasons, Freud decided to resume smoking again, stating that he was unable to stop smoking cigars, and 'the torture being beyond human power to bear' (Jones, 1961, see paragraph 61 of '13 – the Fliess period (1887-1902)'). Freud continued to smoke an average of twenty cigars a day until he died.

What is the kind of 'torture' that is 'beyond human power to bear'? If we go back to our childhood, the origin of our lives, one can say that no torture is more severe than the torture of separation from one's mother, our first love object, someone who was equivalent to our entire world. Worst of all, from an infant's perspective, the separation is perceived as the death of the mother, no matter how short the duration is.

Using Winnicott's concept of the transitional object, in view of the primitive behaviours involved in the smoking process, a cigarette can be regarded as a regressed form of an infantile transitional object that re-appears in adulthood. The resemblance of the relationship between the smoker and their cigarette, and the infant and its transitional object, renders cigarettes a regressed form of transitional object par excellence. To the infant, the transitional object is its first possession, it is a part of itself like a mouth or a breast, and it is also a substitute for its mother and a representation of its omnipotence as the infant begins to bridge the subjective and objective experience and separate the 'me' from the 'not me'. Therefore, it is simply unimaginable for the infant to lose or discontinue its relationship with the transitional object at this stage of its development. By the same token, from a smoker's perspective, stopping smoking is similar to weaning, or getting an infant to cut off its relationship with the transitional object and letting go of the blissful reunion with one's mother, when one can rest and feel safe again, hence an infantile violent attack and objection are inevitable. Therefore, the primitive experience evoked in the entire smoking process is comparable to the kind of 'intense experiencing that belongs to the arts and to religion and to imaginative living, and to creative scientific work' (Winnicott, 1953, p. 97).

Taking the above insight into consideration, from the smokers' perspective, it is important for them to be aware of the primitive nature of their smoking behaviour, and how it resembles a regressed form of transitional object that re-appears in adulthood. Once the smokers are made aware of the fact that the 'prize' that they repeatedly look for in smoking their cigarettes is not the taste of the cigarette nor the addictive nicotine content, but the 'intense experiencing' or the intermediate space resembling the blissful

reunion with their infantile experience of omnipotence, then they can be introduced to other ways to achieve a similar 'intense experiencing', such as arts, religion, imaginative living and creative scientific work as suggested by Winnicott (1953). This insight will lead to a very different approach in helping smokers reduce their dependence on cigarettes.

Given the highly primitive nature of experience involved in the smoking process, and the unbearable torture that is 'beyond human power to bear' (Jones, 1961, see paragraph 61 of '13 – the Fliess period (1887-1902)'), cigarettes as a product are here to stay because there will always be demand for them. From a government's perspective, instead of trying to reduce smoking incidence with tactics such as increased excise, flavour and an ingredient ban, plain cigarette packaging, or cigarette pack display ban, a more effective strategy is to encourage the development of reduced harm products that resemble the physical characteristics of cigarettes, and at the same time retain the majority of the smoking rituals. The recent development of Tobacco Heating Products such as iQoS and iGlo from the global tobacco companies is on the right track in getting smokers to move away from the traditional cigarette to a significantly less harmful substitute, as these devices heat the tobacco to 250 to 350 degrees Celsius, which is below the combustion temperature and hence can stop the production of tar, a substance that is the main harmful by-product of tobacco smoke generated by the combustion of the cigarettes.

### 7.3 Limitations of the current study

#### 7.3.1 Improving objectivity through cross examination of transcripts

In order to reach a deeper level of knowing, it is important for the researcher to effectively make use of his subjectivity as an instrument of knowing, and being able to digest and decipher the emotional impact of the interview encounter would add another layer of depth to the gathered insight. However, we also need to be cautious that these interpretations and analyses are biased towards one researcher's own belief system, and hence some important nuances of the data may have been overlooked.

To go beyond the limitations of singular (and potentially biased) perspective, there is the possibility for another independent researcher to dive into the interview recordings and transcripts so that the support of another mind can be achieved, and triangulation of the collected data becomes possible. This will help improve the accuracy of the analysis and results.

#### 7.3.2 Improving interview setup to further improve openness of respondents

The FANI method advocates home interviews with the use of paired researchers. The objective is to ensure that respondents can stay in a place that they are familiar with during the interviews without feeling unnecessary anxiety in a strange environment. Another benefit of a home visit is that it enables the researchers to observe the family dynamics of the respondents, which can in turn help with retaining and understanding the gestalt of the respondents. The use of paired interviewers can facilitate future triangulation of interview data, and at the same time ensure the safety of both interviewers during home visits.

However, for this thesis, all of the interviews were conducted in a research agency meeting room to ease the management of the logistics of interviewing, so it was not entirely FANI compliant. Besides, there was only one female researcher conducting all the interviews, and since four of the eight respondents are male, their level of openness towards a female researcher might be different from that of a male researcher when it comes to certain private and sensitive topics. This may affect the level of rapport and disclosure during the interviews with the male respondents, so there is merit in having a pair of male and female researchers to conduct the interviews.

Future researchers are encouraged to follow the FANI recommended approach of having two interviewers conducting home visits to the respondents to further improve the depth of information gathered from the interviews.

# 7.3.3 Improving generalisability and reliability of the results in a larger scale research study

Due to resource limitation, only eight respondents were recruited for the interviews in this thesis. So, the results of this thesis are closer to the results of a pilot study that is applicable only to students aged between eighteen to twenty-four studying in the tertiary institutions in Hong Kong.

A replication of the research is needed with a wider respondent base across different nationalities and geographies. This will help improve the generalisability and reliability of the results.

One additional point to note is that there is a possibility that addiction to cigarettes is a specific kind of addiction due to the primitive needs evoked in the process of smoking the cigarette. Since FANI respondents are already addicted to cigarettes, they are

responding to the questions from a position of addiction to cigarettes instead of from their more unconscious process. Because of the above reason, further studies are required before the results on smoking addiction can be generalised to other forms of addiction, such as alcohol or eating disorders.

#### 7.4 Proposed directions for future research

## 7.4.1 A longitudinal study to understand the impact of the parents' child rearing practices on smoking addiction in adulthood

Winnicott put a lot of emphasis on the role of the mother in this theory. According to Winnicott, transitional phenomena and the transitional object are the basis of initiation of experience and object relations of the infant, hence signs of a healthy development that is made possible by the presence of a 'good enough mother', who, in a state of 'primary maternal preoccupation', continuously adapts to the needs of the infant by gradually introducing appropriate doses of external reality to it. This is done by creating a 'holding environment' and an illusion that reinforces the infant's feelings of omnipotence, an illusion that the infant is capable of creating an outer reality that could relieve instinctual tension, and that the breast is part of the infant's creation and is therefore under its magical control. If this illusion can be successfully established, a good internal object is created and the 'good enough mother' can start to gradually disillusion the infant by bringing small doses of the world to it, as its capacity to tolerate frustration increases over time.

On the contrary, there is a group of 'not-good-enough mothers' who constantly fail to adapt to the needs of the infant, and they can be further divided into three types:

'The psychotic mother may well be able to cope with the small infant's demands in the beginning, but she is not able to be separated from the infant as it needs to grow away from her preoccupation. The mother who does not naturally find herself in a state of primary maternal preoccupation — perhaps because she is too depressed or preoccupied with something else — may later on have to be a therapist for her child, who is likely to be seeking compensation for the earlier loss. The tantalising mother has, for Winnicott, the worst effect on her infant's mental health, as the erratic nature of the environment violates the very core sense of self.'

(Abram 2007, p. 243-244)

These 'not-good-enough mothers' seduce the infant into developing a pathological false compliant self to cope with their own maternal failure, resulting in an ego distortion of the infant, which is the basis of schizoid characteristics in adulthood; or it can result in the development of a self-holding defence mechanism in which a caretaker false self is formed (Winnicott, 1956). Winnicott's view is consistent with Milner (1952), who suggests that maternal failure is a precursor to premature ego-development and a disturbed illusionary period. Because of this disturbance, the ego is forced into precocious differentiation between the bad and the good object, and the individual can go on in their life searching for the valuable 'resting place' of illusion that they missed in their early childhood.

If smoking addiction falls into the realm of regression to the infantile transitional phenomena, using Winnicott's (1953) concepts of the 'psychotic mother' who never weans the infant, an interesting question would be to what extent the 'psychotogenic mother', i.e. the mother who causes psychosis in her baby, contributes to the prolonged

use of cigarettes by the smoker as a regressed transitional object to deal with separation anxiety and sustain their omnipotent delusion when confronted with deprivation?

Based on Winnicott's idea of the connection between addiction and regression to the infantile transitional phenomena in adulthood, as well as the 'psychotic mother' idea, we were at first also interested in exploring the relationship between a 'not-good-enough mother' and her child's smoking addiction in adulthood. However, in the absence of an available psychoanalytic research methodology to backtrack the child rearing practices of the smokers' mothers more than twenty years ago, and therefore provide an understanding of the quality of mothering delivered at that time without resorting to the current memory of the mothers which is prone to distortions and therefore can no longer be assumed to be the same twenty years ago, it has proved to be almost impossible to investigate this part of our research question in this thesis.

Future researchers are encouraged to conduct a longitudinal study involving both the respondents and their parents using direct observations over a period of at least eighteen years, in order to understand the impact of the environment (the mother and the father) on the propensity of smoking addiction of the respondents.

# 7.4.2 Researching the entire smoking process including the breathing stage of smoking

The smoking process involves three different stages and dimensions: the cigarette is used as an instrument (transitional object) to help smokers enter the transitional space when they draw in and blow out the cigarette smoke. Therefore, there is the instrument (transitional object), the smoking moment (transitional phenomena), and the breathing

related to the inhalation and exhalation of cigarette smoke. The current study only focuses on the first two stages, i.e. the transitional object and the transitional phenomena related to smoking addiction. More understanding is needed on the breathing stage in terms of how it relates to and impacts the smoking experience and smoking addiction.

# 7.4.3 Validating the effectiveness of the new approach to reduce dependency on cigarettes

If cigarettes can be regarded as a regressed form of transitional object that re-appear in adulthood, then the 'prize' that the smokers repeatedly look for in smoking their cigarettes is the 'intense experiencing' or the intermediate space resembling the blissful reunion with their infantile experience of omnipotence. If this is true, then it would be worthwhile to validate the effectiveness of providing a method or instrument for the smokers to enter this transitional space with 'intense experiencing' through culture living such as arts, religion, imaginative living and creative scientific work, as suggested by Winnicott (1953).

### REFERENCES

Abram, J., 2007. *The language of Winnicott: a dictionary of Winnicott's use of words.* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Karnac Books.

Agar, M., & Reisinger, H.S., 2002. A heroin epidemic at the intersection of histories: the 1960s epidemic among African Americans in Baltimore. *Medical Anthropology*, [Online]. 21 (2), pp. 115-156.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 4 March 2011].

Audrain-McGovern, J., Rodriguez, D., Tercyak, K.P., Epstein, L.H., Goldman, P. & Wileyto, E.P., 2004. Applying a behavioural economic framework to understanding adolescent smoking. *Psychology of Addictive Behaviour*, [Online]. 18 (1), pp. 64-73. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Azorlosa, J.L., 1994. The effect of chronic naltrexone pretreatment on associative vs. non-associative morphine tolerance. *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, [e-journal] 36 (1). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 12 March 2011].

Balfour, D.K.J., 2004. The neurobiology of tobacco dependence: a preclinical perspective on the role of the dopamine projections to the nucleus accumbens. *Nicotine and Tobacco Research*, [Online]. 6 (6), pp. 899-912.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Bandura, A., Adams, N.E. & Beyer, J., 1977. Cognitive process mediating behavioural change. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, [Online]. 35 (3), pp. 125-139. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 4 March 2011].

Bartos, 1977. Ernest Dichter: motive interpreter. *Journal of Advertising Research*, [Online]. 17(3), pp. 3-8.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 18 June 2011].

Bauer, M., 1996. *The narrative interview: comments on a technique for qualitative data collection.* [online]. London School of Economics and Political Science Methodology Institute Papers, qualitative series no 1.

Available at: <a href="http://www2.lse.ac.uk/methodology/pdf/QualPapers/Bauer-NARRAT1SS.pdf">http://www2.lse.ac.uk/methodology/pdf/QualPapers/Bauer-NARRAT1SS.pdf</a>

[Accessed 10<sup>th</sup> February 2013].

Baumeister, R.F. & Heatherton, T.F., 1996. Self regulation failure: an overview. *Psychological Inquiry*, [Online]. 7 (1), pp. 1-15.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

Becker, G.S. & Murphy, K.M., 1988. A theory of rational addiction. *The Journal of Political Economy*, [Online]. 96 (4), pp. 675-700.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Beenstock, M. & Rahav, G., 2002. Testing gateway theory: do cigarette prices affect illicit drug use? *Journal of Health Economics*, [Online]. 21 (4), pp. 679-698.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Bernays, E.L., 1928. *Propaganda*. New York: Ig Publishing.

Bickel, W.K., DeGrandpre, R.J. & Higgins, S.T., 1995. The behavioural economics of concurrent drug reinforcers: a review and reanalysis of drug self-administration research. *Psychopharmacology*, [e-journal] 118 (3). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Bickel, W.K., Madden, G.J. & DeGrandpre, R.J., 1997. Modelling the effects of combined behavioural and pharmacological treatment on cigarette smoking: behavioural-economic analyses. *Experimental and Clinical Psychopharmacology*, [e-journal] 5 (4). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a>

[Accessed 6 March 2011].

Bickel, W.K. & Marsch, L.A., 2001. Toward a behavioural economic understanding of drug dependence: delay discounting processes. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96(1), pp. 73-86. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Bion, W.R., 1977. The seven servants. New York: Jason Aronson.

Blaszczynski, A. & Nower, L., 2002. A pathways model of problem and pathological gambling. *Addiction*, [Online]. 97 (5), pp. 487-499.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 4 March 2011].

Bradley, B., Field, M., Mogg, K. & De Houwer, J., 2004. Attentional and evaluative biases for smoking cues in nicotine dependence: component processes of biases in visual orienting. *Behavioural Pharmacology*, [e-journal] 15 (1). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

British Psychological Society, 2009. Code of ethics and conduct: guidance published by the Ethics Committee of the British Psychological Society, [online] Leicester: British Psychological Society.

Available at: <a href="http://www.bps.org.uk/what-we-do/ethics-standards/e

Brody, S., 1980. Transitional object: idealization of a phenomenon. *Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, 49, pp.561-605.

Brody, S. & Axelrad, S., 1970. *Anxiety and ego formation in infancy*. New York: International Universities Press, Inc.

Brody, S. & Axelrad, S., 1978. *Mothers, fathers, and children. Explorations in the formation of character in the first seven years.* New York: International universities Press, Inc.

Busch, F., 1974. Dimensions of the first transitional object. In: *The Psychoanalytic Study of Child*, 24, pp.215-299.

Busch, F. & McKinight, J., 1973. Parental attitudes and the development of the primary transitional object. *Child psychiatry and human development*, 4, pp.12-20.

Busch, F. & McKinight, J., 1977. Theme and variation in the development of the fist transitional object. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 58, pp.479-486.

Busch, F. Nagera, H. McKnight, J. & Pezzarossi, G., 1973. Primary transitional objects. *Journal of the American academy of child psychiatry*, 12, pp.183-214.

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2017. *Tobacco use among adults with mental illness and substance use disorder*. [Online] (Updated 10 March 10 2017) Available at: <a href="https://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/disparities/mental-illness-substance-use/index.htm">https://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/disparities/mental-illness-substance-use/index.htm</a>

[Accessed 16 July 2017]

Chatterji, A., 2009. "Psychoanalysis and the unconscious" and D.W. Winnicott's transitional and related phenomena. *Psychoanalytic Review*, 96(5), pp.785-800.

Chen, X.G., Unger, J.B., Palmer, P., Weiner, M.D., Johnson, C.A., Wong, M.M. & Austin, G., 2002. Prior cigarette smoking initiation predicting current alcohol use: evidence for a gateway drug effect among California adolescents from eleven ethnic groups. *Addictive Behaviour*, [Online]. 27 (5), pp. 799-817.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Childress, A.R., Ehrman, R., McLellan, A.T. & O'Brien, C., 1988. Conditioned craving and arousal in cocaine addiction: a preliminary report. *National Institute of Drug Abuse Research Monograph*, [Online]. 81, pp. 74-80.

Available at: <a href="http://archives.drugabuse.gov/pdf/Monographs/">http://archives.drugabuse.gov/pdf/Monographs/</a> [Accessed 12 March 2011].

Christiansen, B.A. & Goldman, M.S., 1983. Alcohol-related expectancies versus demographic / background variables in the prediction of adolescent drinking. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, [Online]. 51 (2), pp. 249-257.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Clancier, A. & Kalmanovitch, J., 1987. Winnicott and paradox: from birth to creation. London: Tavistock Publications.

Cloninger, C.R., 1987. A systematic method for clinical description and classification of personality variants. A proposal. *Archives of General Psychiatry*, [e-journal] 44 (6). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 2 March 2011].

Conway, K.P., Swendsen, J.D., Rounsaville, B.J. & Merikangas, K.R., 2003. Personality, drug of choice, and comorbid psychopathology among substance abusers. *Drug and Alcohol Dependence*, [Online]. 65 (2002), pp. 225-234.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

Corbin, J. & Strauss, S., 2008. *Basics of qualitative research: techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Coppolillo, H.P., 1967. Maturational aspects of the transitional phenomena. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 48, pp.237-246.

Coultard, M. et al.., 2002. *Tobacco, alcohol, and drug use and mental health*. London: Office for National Statistics.

Available at: <a href="https://www.ons.gov.uk">https://www.ons.gov.uk</a>

[Accessed 10 September 2017]

Davis, M. & Wallbridge, D., 1981. *Boundary and space: an introduction to the work of D.W. Winnicott.* London: Karnac Books.

Dichter, E., 1946. Psychology in market research. *Harvard Business Review*, [Online]. 25(4), pp. 432-443.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 27 September 2011].

Dichter, E., 1947. The psychology of everyday living. New York: Barnes and Noble.

Dinnage, R., 1978. A bit of light. In: Grolnick, S., Barkin, L. & Muensterberger, W. Between fantasy and reality: transitional objects and phenomena. New York: Jason Aronson, Inc., pp.363-378.

Dixon, M.R., Marley, J. & Jacobs, E.A., 2003. Delayed discounting by pathological gamblers. *Journal of Applied Behaviour Analysis*, [Online]. 36 (4), pp. 449-458. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 6 March 2011].

Downey, T.W., 1978. Transitional phenomena in the analysis of early adolescent males. *The Psychoanalytic Study of Child*, 33, pp.19-46.

Drummond, D.C., 2001. Theories of drug craving, ancient and modern. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96 (1), pp. 33-46.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Drummond, D.C., Cooper, T. & Glautier, S.P., 1990. Conditioned learning in alcohol dependence: implications for cue exposure treatment. *British Journal of Addiction*, [Online]. 85 (6), pp. 725-743.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Edwards, G. & Gross, M.M., 1976. Alcohol dependence: provisional description of a clinical syndrome. *British Medical Journal*, [Online]. 1 (6017), pp. 1058-1061.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

Eigen, M., 1981. The area of faith in Winnicott, Lacan and Bion. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 62, pp.413-33.

Einstein, S. & Epstein, A., 1980. Cigarette smoking contagion. *International Journal of the Addictions*, [e-journal] 15 (1). Abstract only.

Available at: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/

[Accessed 4 March 2011].

Etter, J.F. & Perneger, T.V., 1999. A comparison of two measures of stage of change for smoking cessation. *Addiction*, [Online]. 94 (12), pp. 1881-1889.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Etter, J.F. & Sutton, S., 2002. Assessing 'stage of change' in current and former smokers. *Addiction*, [Online]. 97 (9), pp. 1171-1182.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Farkas, A.J., Pierce, J.P., Zhu, S.H., Rosbrook, B., Gilpin, E.A., Berry, C. & Kaplan, R.M., 1996. Addiction versus stages of change models in predicting smoking cessation. *Addiction*, [Online]. 91 (9), pp. 1271-1280.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Farrel, M., Howes, S., Bebbington, P., Brugha, T., Jenkings, R., Lewis, G., Marsden, J., Taylor, C. & Metzer, H., 2001. Nicontine, alcohol and drug dependence and psychiatric comorbidity: results of a national household survey. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*, [Online]. 179, pp. 432-437.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Ferrence, R., 2001. Diffusion theory and drug use. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96 (1), pp. 165-173.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 4 March 2011].

Finzy, R.T., 1971. Vicissitudes of the transitional object in a borderline child. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 52, pp.107-114.

Freud, S., 1910. 'Wild' psycho-analysis. *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume XI (1910): Five Lectures on Psycho-Analysis, Leonardo da Vinci and Other Works*, [Online]. pp. 219-228. Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a> [Accessed 10 Oct 2011].

Freud, S., 1914. Remembering, repeating and working through (further recommendations on the technique of psychoanalysis II). In: Strachey, J., 1958. *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume XII (1911-1913):* London: Hogarth Press, pp.147-156.

Freud, S., 1927. The Future of an Illusion, Civilization and its Discontents, and Other Works. The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume XXI (1927-1931). London: Hogarth Press. First published in 1964.

Fullerton, R.A., 2011. The birth of consumer behaviour: motivation research in the 1950s. In: *Proceedings of the 15th Biennial Conference on Historical Analysis and Research in Marketing (CHARM)*. New York Helmsley Hotel, New York City, USA19 – 22 May, 2011. CHARM: USA, [Online]. pp. 61-68.

Available at: <a href="http://faculty.quinnipiac.edu/charm/cumulative\_proceedings.htm">http://faculty.quinnipiac.edu/charm/cumulative\_proceedings.htm</a> [Accessed 27 September 2011].

Gaddini, R. & Gaddini, E., 1970. Transitional objects and the process of individuation: a study in three different social groups. *Journal of the American academy of child psychiatry*, 9, pp.347-365.

Gay, E. L. & Hyson, M.C., 1976. Blankets, bears, and bunnies: studies of children's contacts with treasured objects. In: *Psychoanalysis and contemporary science, Volume V.* Edited by Shapiro, T. New York: International Universities Press, Inc., pp.271-316.

Gelkopf, M., Levitt, A. & Bleich, A., 2002. An integration of three approaches to addiction and methadone maintenance treatment: the self-medication hypothesis, the disease model and social criticism. *Israel Journal of Psychiatry and Related Sciences*, [e-journal] 39 (2). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 5 March 2011].

Goldman, M.S. & Darkes, J., 2004. Alcohol expectancy multiaxial assessment: a memory network-based approach. *Psychological Assessment*, [Online]. 16 (1), pp. 4-15.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Grolnick, S. & Lengyel, A., 1978. Etruscan burial symbols and the transitional process. In: Grolnick, S., Barkin, L. & Muensterberger, W. *Between fantasy and reality: transitional objects and phenomena*. New York: Jason Aronson, Inc., pp.379-410.

Gwaltney, C.J., Shiffman, S., Norman, G.J., Paty, J.A., Kassel, J.D., Gnys, M., Hickcox, M., Waters, A. & Balabanis, M., 2001. Does smoking abstinence self-efficacy vary across situations? Identifying context-specificity within the Relapse Situation Efficacy Questionnaire. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, [Online]. 69 (3), pp. 516-527.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 2 March 2011].

Haire, M., 1950. Projective techniques in marketing research. *Journal of Marketing*, [Online]. 14(5), pp. 649-656.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 18 June 2011].

Herzog, T.A., Abrams, D.B., Emmons, K.M., Linnan, L.A. & Shadel, W.G., 1999. Do processes of change predict smoking stage movements? A prospective analysis of the transtheoretical model. *Health Psychology*, 18 (4), pp. 369-375.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Hinshelwood, R. D., 1991. *A dictionary of Kleinian thought*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Free Association Books.

Hinshelwood, R.D., 2013. Research on the couch: single case studies, subjectivity, and psychoanalytic knowledge. Hove: Routledge.

Hollway, W. & Jefferson, T., 2013. *Doing qualitative research differently: a psychosocial approach.* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Hong, K. M., 1978. The transitional phenomena. A theoretical integration. *The psychoanalytic study of the child*, 33, pp.47-79.

Hong, K. M. & Townes, B.D., 1976. Infants' attachment to inanimate objects: a cross-cultural study. *Journal of the American academy of child psychiatry*, 15, pp.49-61.

Horowitz, D., 1986. The birth of a salesman: Ernest Dichter and the objects of desire. [Online] (Updated 7 June 2011).

Available at:

http://www.hagley.org/library/collections/historicalref/articles/HOROWITZ\_DICHT ER.pdf

[Accessed 7 June 2011].

Horton, P. C., 1977. Personality disorder and hard-to –diagnose schizophrenia. *Journal of operational psychiatry*, 8, pp.70-81.

Horton, P. C., Louy, J.W. & Coppolillo, H.P., 1974. Personality disorder and transitional relatedness. *Archives of general psychiatry*, 30, pp.618-622.

Jacobs, M., 2008. D.W. Winnicott. London: Sage Publications. First published in 1995.

Jones, A.M., 1989. A systems approach to the demand for alcohol and tobacco. *Bulletin of Economic Research*, [Online]. 41 (2), pp. 85-105.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Jones, B.T., Corbin, W. & Fromme, K., 2001. Conceptualising addiction: a review of expectancy theory and alcohol consumption. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96, pp. 57-72.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Jones, E., 1961. *The life and work of Sigmund Freud [Kindle Edition]*. New York: Basic Books. Retrieved from Amazon.com

Jovchelovitch, S., Bauer, M.W., 2000. *Narrative interviewing*, [online]. London: LSE Research Online.

Available at: <a href="http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/2633">http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/2633</a>

[Accessed 10<sup>th</sup> February 2013].

Kafka, J.S., 1969. The body as transitional object: a psychoanalytic study of a self-mutilating patient. *British Journal of Medical Psychology*, 42, pp.207-212.

Kandel, D.B., Yamaguchi, K. & Chen, K., 1992. Stages of progression in drug involvement from adolescence to adulthood: further evidence for the gateway theory. *Journal of Studies in Alcohol*, [e-journal] 53 (5). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a>

[Accessed 8 March 2011].

Kearney, M.H. & O'Sullivan, J., 2003. Identity shifts as turning points in health behaviour change. *Western Journal of Nursing Research*, [Online]. 25 (2), pp. 134-152.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Keiser, S., 1948. The psychology of everyday living. *Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, [Online]. 17, p. 284.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 29 September 2011].

Kenkel, D., Mathios, A.D. & Pacula, R.L., 2001. Economics of youth drug use, addiction and gateway effects. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96 (1), pp. 151-164.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Khantzian, E.J., 1997. The self-medication hypothesis of substance use disorders: a reconsideration and recent applications. *Harvard Review of Psychiatry*, [e-journal] 4 (5). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Klein, M., 1935. A contribution to the psychogenesis of manic-depressive states. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis, [Online]*. 16:145-174

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a>

[Accessed 20 June 2010].

Klein, M., 1940. Mourning and its relation to manic-depressive states. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis, [Online]*. 21:125-153

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a>

[Accessed 20 June 2010].

Klein, M., 1946. Notes on Some Schizoid Mechanisms. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 27, pp.99-110.

Klein, M., 1975. *Envy and gratitude and other works 1946–1963*. New York: The Free Press.

Kuhn, T.S., 1962. The structure of scientific revolutions (excerpt). [Online] (Updated 2011).

Available at: <a href="http://philosophyfaculty.ucsd.edu/faculty/rarneson/courses/kuhn1.pdf">http://philosophyfaculty.ucsd.edu/faculty/rarneson/courses/kuhn1.pdf</a> [Accessed 26 March 2011].

Kvale, S., 1999. The psychoanalytic interview as qualitative research. *Qualitative inquiry*, [online] 5(1), pp.87-113.

Lazarsfeld, P.F., 1934. The psychological aspect of market research. *Harvard Business Review*, [Online]. 13(1), pp. 54-71.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 27 September 2011].

Lazarsfeld, P.F., 1937. The use of detailed interviews in market research. *Journal of Marketing*, [Online]. 2(1), pp. 3-8.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 26 September 2011].

Lewis, M.J., 1990. Alcohol: mechanisms of addiction and reinforcement. *Advances in Alcohol and Substance Abuse*, [e-journal] 9 (1-2). Abstract only.

Available at: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Lewit, E.M., 1989. U.S. tobacco taxes: behavioural effects and policy implications. *British Journal of Addiction*, [Online]. 84 (10), pp. 1217-1234.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Lindsay, G.B. & Rainey, J., 1997. Psychosocial and pharmacologic explanations of nicotine's 'gateway drug' function. *Journal of School Health*, [Online]. 67 (4), pp. 123-126.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Lindzey, G., 1952. Thematic appreciation test: interpretive assumptions and related empirical evidence. *Psychological Bulletin*, [Online]. 49(1), pp. 1-25.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 26 September 2011].

Littell, J.H. & Girvin, H., 2002. Stages of change. A critique. *Behaviour modification*, [e-journal] 26 (2). Abstract only.

Available at: http://online.sagepub.com/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Lorenz, E.N., 1972. Predictability: *Does the Flap of a Butterfly's Wings in Brazil Set Off a Tornado in Texas?* [Online] Washington: American Association for the Advancement of Science.

Available at: <a href="http://eapsweb.mit.edu/research/Lorenz/Butterfly\_1972.pdf">http://eapsweb.mit.edu/research/Lorenz/Butterfly\_1972.pdf</a>
[Accessed 14 March 2011]

Lubman, D.I., Yücel, M. & Pantelis, C., 2004. Addiction, a condition of compulsive behaviour? Neuroimaging and neuropsychological evidence of inhibitory dysregulation. *Addiction*, [Online]. 99 (12), pp. 1491-1502.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

Madden, G.J., Bickel, W.K. & Jacobs, E.A., 1999. Discounting of delayed rewards in opioid-dependent outpatients: exponential or hyperbolic discounting functions? *Experimental and Clinical Psychopharmacology*, [e-journal] 7 (3). Abstract only. Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 6 March 2011].

Madden, G.J., Petry, N.M., Badger, G.J. & Bickel, W.K., 1997. Impulsive and self-control choices in opioid-dependent patients and non-drug-using control participants: drug and monetary rewards. *Experimental and Clinical Psychopharmacology*, [e-journal] 5 (3). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 6 March 2011].

Marlatt, G.A., 1979. A cognitive-behavioural model of the relapse process. *National Institute on Drug Abuse Research Monograph*, [Online]. 25, pp. 191-200. Available at: <a href="http://archives.drugabuse.gov/pdf/monographs/download25.html">http://archives.drugabuse.gov/pdf/monographs/download25.html</a> [Accessed 9 March 2011].

Marlatt, G.A., 1996. Taxonomy of high-risk situations for alcohol relapse: evolution and development of a cognitive-behavioural model. *Addiction*, [Online]. 91 (Supplement), pp. S37-S49.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

McDonald, M., 1970. Transitional tunes and musical development. *The Psychoanalytic Study of Child*, 25, pp.215-299.

Melchior, C.L. & Tabakoff, B., 1984. A conditioning model of alcohol tolerance. *Recent Development in Alcoholism*, [e-journal] 2. Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 12 March 2011].

Meltzer, H. et al.., 1996. Economic activity and social functioning of residents with psychiatric disorders. OPCS Surveys of Psychiatric Morbidity in Great Britain. London: HMSO.

Available at: <a href="https://www.ons.gov.uk">https://www.ons.gov.uk</a>

[Accessed 10 September 2017]

Menzies Lyth, I., 1989. *The dynamics of the social: selected essays volume II.* London: Free Association Books.

Miller, P. & Rose, N., 1997. Mobilising the consumer: assembling the subject of consumption. *Theory, Culture and Society,* [Online]. 14(1), pp.1-36. Available at: <a href="http://www2.lse.ac.uk/sociology/pdf/MillerandRose-MobilisingtheConsumer-1997.pdf">http://www2.lse.ac.uk/sociology/pdf/MillerandRose-MobilisingtheConsumer-1997.pdf</a>
[Accessed 9 January 2012].

Milner, M., 1952. Aspects of symbolism in comprehension of the not-self. *International Review of Psychoanalysis*, [Online]. 33:181-194.

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a> [Accessed 9 January 2012].

Nestler, 2004. Molecular mechanisms of drug addiction. *Neuropharmacology*, [Online]. 44 (Supplement 1), pp. 24-32.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Niaura, R., 2000. Cognitive social learning and related perspectives on drug craving. *Addiction,* [Online]. 95( Supplement 2), pp. S155-S163.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 2 March 2011].

O'Brien, C.P., Childress, A.R., McLellan, A.T. & Ehrman, R., 1992. A learning model of addiction. *Research Publications - Association for Research in Nervous and Mental Disease*, [e-journal] 70. Abstract only.

Available at: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Office for National Statistics, 2002. Adults with a psychotic disorder living in private households London: TSO.

Available at: <a href="https://bulger.co.uk">https://bulger.co.uk</a>
[Accessed 10 September 2017]

Ogden, T.H., 1985. On Potential Space. *International Review of Psychoanalysis*, [Online]. 66:129-141.

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a>

[Accessed 3 June 2017].

Orford, J., 2001. Addiction as an excessive appetite. *Addiction,* [Online]. 96 (1), pp. 15-31.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 4 March 2011].

Oxford University Press, 1955. Public Opinion Research Conference: motivation research II. The impact of motivational research on market research. *The Public Opinion Quarterly*, [Online]. 19(4), pp. 433-435.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 8 June 2011].

Packard, V., 1957. The hidden persuaders. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: Ig Publishing.

Parker, C., 1979. Mother-infant interactions and infants' use of transitional objects dissertation. Columbia University.

Parrish, D., 1978. Transitional objects and phenomena in a case of twinship. In: Grolnick, S., Barkin, L. & Muensterberger, W. *Between fantasy and reality: transitional objects and phenomena*. New York: Jason Aronson, Inc., pp.271-287.

Paskauskas, R. A. ed., 1993. The complete correspondence of Sigmund Freud and Ernest Jones 1909-1939. Cambridge, M.A.: Belknap Press.

Phillips, A., 1988. Winnicott. London: Fontana.

Politz, A., 1956. 'Motivation research' from a research viewpoint. *The Public Opinion Quarterly*, [Online]. 20(4), pp. 663-673.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 18 June 2011].

Pritchard, W.S., Robinson, J.H., Guy, T.D., Davis, R.A. & Stiles, M.F., 1996. Assessing the sensory role of nicotine in cigarette smoking. *Psychopharmacology*, [e-journal] 127 (1). Abstract only.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Prochaska, J.O., DrClemente, C.C., Velicer, W.F., Ginpil, S. & Norcross, J.C., 1985. Predicting change in smoking status for self-changers. *Addictive Behaviours*, [Online]. 10 (4), pp.395-406.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Prochaska, J.O. & Goldstein, M.G., 1991. Process of smoking cessation. Implications for clinicians. *Clinics in Chest Medicine*, [e-journal] 12 (4). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Prochaska, J.O. & Velicer, W.F., 1997. The transtheoretical model of health behaviour change. *American Journal of Health Promotion*, [e-journal] 12 (1). Abstract only. Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a>

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Provence, S. & Lipton, R. C., 1962. *Infants in institutions. A comparison of their development with family-reared infants during the first year of life.* New York: International Universities Press, Inc.

Rather, B.C., Goldman, M.S., Roehrich, L. & Brannick, M., 1992. Empirical modelling of an alcohol expectancy memory network using multidimensional scaling. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, [Online]. 101 (1), pp. 174-183.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

Redmondmar, H., 2014. Why mentally ill people should have access to e-cigarettes. *Pacific Standard*, [internet] 29 March, 2014.

Available at: <a href="https://psmag.com/social-justice/mentally-ill-people-shouldnt-get-e-cigarettes-77497">https://psmag.com/social-justice/mentally-ill-people-shouldnt-get-e-cigarettes-77497</a>

[Accessed 16 July 2017]

Richards, B., 1995. Disciplines of delight: the psychoanalysis of popular culture. London: Free Association Books.

Richards, B., MacRury, I. & Botterill, J., 2000. *The dynamics of advertising*. Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers.

Robinson, T.E. & Berridge, K.C., 1993. The neural basis of drug craving: an incentive-sensitization theory of addiction. *Brain Research Reviews*, [Online] 18 (3), pp. 247-291.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 4 March 2011].

Robinson, T.E. & Berridge, K.C., 2003. Addiction. *Annual Review of Psychology*, [Online]. 54 (1), pp. 25-53.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Rodman, F.R., 1987. *The spontaneous gesture: selected letters of D.W. Winnicott.* London: Harvard University Press.

Rosenfeld, H.A., 1960. On drug addiction. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, [Online]. 41:467-475.

Available at: http://pep-web.org/

[Accessed 22 June 2010].

Rosenthal, G., 1993. Reconstruction of life stories: principles of selection in generating stories for narrative biographical interviews. *The narrative study of lives,* [online] 1(1), pp. 59-91.

Available at: <a href="http://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/bitstream/handle/document/5929/ssoar-tnsl-1993-1-rosenthal-reconstruction\_of\_life\_stories.pdf?sequence=1">http://www.ssoar.info/ssoar/bitstream/handle/document/5929/ssoar-tnsl-1993-1-rosenthal-reconstruction\_of\_life\_stories.pdf?sequence=1</a> [Accessed 10<sup>th</sup> February 2013].

Rothwell, N.D., 1955. Motivational research revisited. *Journal of Marketing*, [Online]. 20(2), pp. 150-154.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 18 June 2011].

Rycoft, C., 1968. Psychoanalysis and beyond. London: Chatto and Windus.

Samuel, L.R., 2010. Freud on Madison Avenue: motivation research and subliminal advertising in America. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Samuels, A., 1993. The political psyche. London: Routledge.

Schulteis, G. & Koob, G.F., 1996. Reinforcement process in opiate addiction: a homeostatic model. *Neurochemical Research*, [e-journal] 21 (11). Abstract only. Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 3 March 2011].

Schutze, F., 1992. Pressure and guilt: the experience of a young German soldier in World War Two and its biographical implications. *International sociology*, [online] 7(2) & 7(3). Abstract only.

Available at: <a href="http://iss.sagepub.com/">http://iss.sagepub.com/</a> [Accessed 10<sup>th</sup> February 2013].

Scott, A., 2018. *The centrality of research: A BPC policy document,* [online] British Psychoanalytic Council.

Available at: <a href="https://www.bpc.org.uk/about-psychotherapy/evidence">https://www.bpc.org.uk/about-psychotherapy/evidence</a> [Accessed 23 September 2018].

Segal, J., 1992. *Key figures in counselling and psychotherapy: Melanie Klein.* London: Sage Publications.

Siegel, S. & Ramos, B.M., 2002. Applying laboratory research: drug anticipation and the treatment of drug addiction. *Experimental and Clinical Psychopharmacology*, [Online]. 10 (3), pp. 162-183.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

Skog, O.J., 2000. Addicts' choice. *Addiction*, [Online]. 95 (9), pp. 1309-1314. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Slater, M., 2010. *Torches of Freedom*....[Online] (Updated 3 Jul 2010). Available at: <a href="http://looking-for-mabel.webs.com/torchesoffreedom.htm">http://looking-for-mabel.webs.com/torchesoffreedom.htm</a> [Accessed 3 July 2010].

Slovic, P.M., Finucane, M., Peters, E. & MacGregor, D.G., 2006. The affect heuristic. *European Journal of Operational Research*, [Online]. 177 (3), pp. 1333-1352. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 6 March 2011].

Smith, J.A., 2008. *Qualitative psychology: a practical guide to research methods.* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Smith, J.A., Flowers, P. & Larkin, M., 2009. *Interpretative phenomenological analysis: theory, method and research.* London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Soloman, R.L., 1980. The opponent-process theory of acquired motivation: the costs of pleasure and the benefits of pain. *American Psychology*, [Online]. 35 (8), pp. 691-712.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 6 March 2011].

Soloman, R.L. & Corbit, J.D., 1973. An opponent-process theory of motivation: II. Cigarette addiction. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, [Online]. 81 (2), pp. 158-171. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Sonnenfeld, J.A., 1985. Shedding light on the Hawthorne studies. *Journal of Occupational Behaviour*, [Online]. 6(2), pp. 111-130. Available at: <a href="http://o-www.jstor.org.serlib0.essex.ac.uk/">http://o-www.jstor.org.serlib0.essex.ac.uk/</a> [Accessed 16 Jan 2012].

Stauber, J.C., 2010. Smoke and Mirrors: How Tobacco and PR Grew Up Together. *PR Watch, Third Quarter, 1994*,[Online]. 1(3). Available at: <a href="http://www.prwatch.org/prwissues/1994Q3/smoke.html">http://www.prwatch.org/prwissues/1994Q3/smoke.html</a>

[Accessed 3 July 2010].

Stern, B., 2004. The importance of being Ernest: commemorating Ditcher's contribution to advertising research. *Journal of Advertising Research*, [Online]. 44(2), pp. 165-169.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 8 June 2011].

Stern, D.N., 1985. The interpersonal world of the infant: a view from psychoanalysis and developmental psychology. New York: Basic Books.

Stevenson, O., 1954. The first treasured possession. A study of the part played by specially loved objects and toys in the lives of certain children. In: *The psychoanalytic study of the Child*, 9, pp.199-217.

Sutton, S., 2001. Back to the drawing board? A review of applications of the transtheoretical model to substance use. *Addiction*, [Online]. 96 (1), pp. 175-186. Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 1 March 2011].

Tate, J.C., Stanton, A.L., Green, S.B., Schmitz, J.M., Le, T. & Marshall, B., 1994. Experimental analysis of the role of expectancy in nicotine withdrawal. *Psychology of Addictive Behaviours*, [Online]. 8 (3), pp. 169-178.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 28 February 2011].

The Tavistock and Portman NHS Foundation Trust, 2018. *Tavistock Adult Depression Study (TADS)*. [Online] (Updated 29 September 2018).

Available at: <a href="https://tavistockandportman.nhs.uk/research-and-innovation/our-research/research-projects/tavistock-adult-depression-study-tads/">https://tavistockandportman.nhs.uk/research-and-innovation/our-research/research-projects/tavistock-adult-depression-study-tads/</a> [Accessed 29 September 2018].

Tiffany, S.T., 1990. A cognitive model of drug urges and drug-use behaviour: role of automatic and non-automatic processes. *Psychological Review*, [Online]. 97 (2), pp. 147-168.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 2 March 2011].

Tiffany, S.T., 1999. Cognitive concepts of craving. *Alcohol Research and Health*, [Online]. 23 (3), pp. 51-62.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 2 March 2011].

[11cccssca 2 March 2011].

Tiffany, S.T. & Conklin, C.A., 2000. A cognitive processing model of alcohol craving and compulsive alcohol use. *Addiction*, [Online]. 95 (Supplement 2), pp. S145-S153. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 2 March 2011].

Tizard, J.P.M., 1971. Obituary: Donald Winnicott. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 52, pp.3.

Tullis, L.M., Dupont, R., Frost-Pineda, K. & Gold, M.S., 2003. Marijuana and tobacco: a major connection? *Journal of Addictive Disease*, [e-journal] 22 (3). Abstract only. Available at: <a href="http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/">http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</a> [Accessed 1 March 2011].

Usuelli, A.K., 1972. The significance of illusion in the work of Freud and Winnicott: a controversial issue. *International Review of Psychoanalysis*, 19, pp.179-87.

Volkan, V.D. & Kavanaugh, J.G., 1978. The cat people. In: Grolnick, S., Barkin, L. & Muensterberger, W. *Between fantasy and reality: transitional objects and phenomena*. New York: Jason Aronson, Inc., pp.289-303.

Vygotsky, L., 1966. Play and its role in the mental development of the child. *Voprosy psikhologii*, [Online] 6.

Available at: <a href="https://www.marxists.org/archive/vygotsky/works/1933/play.htm">https://www.marxists.org/archive/vygotsky/works/1933/play.htm</a> [Accessed 30 May 2017].

Waters, A.J. & Feyerabend, C., 2000. Determinants and effects of attentional bias in smokers. *Psychology of Addictive Behaviours*, [Online]. 14 (2), pp. 111-120. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Waters, A.J., Shiffman, S., Bradley, B.P. & Mogg, K., 2003. Attentional shifts to smoking cues in smokers. *Addiction*, [Online]. 98 (10), pp. 1409-1417. Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a> [Accessed 28 February 2011].

Weir, K., 2013. Smoking and mental illness. *Science Watch*, [Online]. Jun 2013, 44(6), p.36.

Available at: <a href="http://www.apa.org/monitor/2013/06/smoking.aspx">http://www.apa.org/monitor/2013/06/smoking.aspx</a> [Accessed 16 July 2017]

Weiss, F. & Koob, G.F., 2001. Drug addiction: functional neurotoxicity of the brain rewards systems. *Neurotoxicity Research*, [Online]. 3 (1), pp. 145-156.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 3 March 2011].

West, R., 2006. Theory of addiction. Oxford: Blackwell publishing Ltd.

West, R., 2011. The PRIME theory of motivation and its application to health behaviour. [Online] (Updated 2011).

Available at: http://www.rjwest.co.uk/slides.php

[Accessed 13 March 2011].

White, N.M., 1996. Addictive drugs as reinforcers: multiple partial actions on memory systems. *Addiction*, [Online]. 91 (7), pp. 921-949.

Available at: <a href="http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/">http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/</a>

[Accessed 4 March 2011].

Whitelaw, S., Baldwin, S., Bunton, R. & Flynn, D., 2000. The status of evidence and outcomes in stages of change research. *Health Education Research*, [Online]. 15 (6), pp. 707-718.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 1 March 2011].

Wieder, H., Kaplan, E.H., 1969. Drug use in adolescents -psychodynamic meaning and pharmacogenic effect. *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child*, [Online]. 24:399-431.

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a>

[Accessed 10 August 2010].

Williams, R.J., 1957. Is it true what they say about motivation research? *Journal of Marketing*, [Online]. 22(2), pp. 125-133.

Available at: http://researchpro.essex.ac.uk:8245/

[Accessed 24 September 2011].

Winnicott, C., Shephard, R., & Davis, M. (Eds.), 1984. Comments on the report of the committee on punishment in prisons and borstals. In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott.* Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 6.

Winnicott, D.W., 1949. Hate in the Counter-Transference. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 30, pp.69-74.

Winnicott, D.W., 1953. Transitional objects and transitional phenomena – a study of the first not-me possession. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, [Online]. 34:89-97

Available at: <a href="http://pep-web.org/">http://pep-web.org/</a>

Winnicott, D.W., 1945. Towards and objective study of human nature. In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott.* Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 2.

Winnicott, D.W., 1950. 'Yes, but how do we know it's true?' In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott.* Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 3.

Winnicott, D.W., 1951. Transitional objects and transitional phenomena. In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 3.

Winnicott, D.W., 1955. Group influences and the maladjusted child: the school aspect. In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott.* Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 5.

Winnicott, D.W., 1956. The antisocial tendency. In: Caldwell, L, & Robinson, H. T., 2016. *The collected works of D. W. Winnicott*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Volume 5.

Winnicott, D.W., 1956. Primary maternal preoccupation. In: Winnicott, D.W. ed. 1975. *Through paediatrics to psychoanalysis collected papers*. London: Hogarth Press. Ch.XXIV.

Winnicott, D.W., 1957. The child and the outside world: studies in developing relationships. London: Tavistock Publications.

Winnicott, D.W., 1960. The Theory of the Parent-Infant Relationship. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 41, pp.585-595.

Winnicott, D.W., 1964. *The child, the family and the outside world*. London: Penguin Group.

Winnicott, D.W., 1965a. *The family and individual development*. London: Tavistock Publications.

Winnicott, D.W., 1965b. *The maturational process and the facilitating environment: studies in the theory of emotional development.* London: Hogarth Press.

Winnicott, D.W., 1971a. Playing and reality. London: Routledge.

Winnicott, D.W., 1971b. *Therapeutic consultations in child psychiatry*. New York: Basic Books.

Winnicott, D.W., 1975. *Collected papers: through paediatrics to psychoanalysis*. London: Tavistock Publications. First published in 1958.

Winnicott, D.W., 1980. *The piggle: an account of the psychoanalytic treatment of a little girl.* London: Tavistock Publications. First published 1958.

Winnicott, D.W., 1986. Home is where we start from: essays by a psychoanalyst. London: Penguin Books.

Winnicott, D.H., 1987. *Babies and their mothers*. Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc.

Winnicott, D.W., 1988a. Babies and their mothers. London: Free Association Books.

Winnicott, D.W., 1988b. Human nature. London: Free Association Books.

Winnicott, D.H., 1993. Talking to parents. Massachusetts: Perseus Publishing.

Young, R.M., 1989. *Transitional phenomena: production and consumption*. [Online]. London: Human Nature Review.

Available at: <a href="http://human-nature.com/rmyoung/papers/paper27h.html">http://human-nature.com/rmyoung/papers/paper27h.html</a> [Accessed 20 January 2012]