

Lost to Desire. Stories That Refuse to be Dreamt. The Investigative Burden of the
Psychosomatic School of Paris

Wolfgang Lassmann

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Psychosocial and Psychoanalytic Studies

University of Essex

October 2018

This work is under the author's copyright and licensed under a Creative Commons:
Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivatives 4.0 Licence
(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>)

Abstract

As psychoanalysis spread in post WWII France, it came across a novel form of resistance: patients beset by somatic problems with little manifest fantasy life. Analysts from the Paris Society took the innovative step to turn their attention to what seemed without meaning. The term they gave to the barren working facade they met with was '*opératoire*', a pluriform mental exhaustion without a workable narrative. This approach set off a wave of interconnecting ripples as the problems of dealing with this became clearer. My thesis shows that collateral benefits of a conceptual innovation may outgrow its initial use, finding new ways to travel into practice, in this instance by turning towards the conditions needed for fantasy to take form.

Informed by Ian Hacking's suggestion that classifications shape relationships, my thesis looks at what the new concept has elicited in a community of practitioners - close to the *École Psychosomatique de Paris* - over a period of some sixty years. As a "skin for thought" it facilitated change while preserving coherence, gradually beginning to attract further considerations. Important themes have included: the early groundwork necessary for the configuration of fantasy, the importance of a shared imaginary, the role of denial and obliterated memories as a bond between people, emergency measures of a Me cut off from revitalisation, the effects of the rhythms and atmosphere at the workplace on family life, and the consequences of a crisis suppressed for lack of a holding frame.

As psychoanalytic discourse adapted to the challenges, the original perspective changed aspect, moving from a systematic evaluation of what the patients did not produce to what the analyst had to fill in to make sense of the situation. Clashing with the terrain, French psychoanalysts raised important problems about psychic anaemia that are stimulating and deserve cross-cultural discussion.

To the memory of Jean-François Bion (born Dijon, 24th June 1668)

absconded from his job
betrayed his king
gained a world

and to the memory of Joseph Priestley (1733-1804)

native son of Yorkshire
student of French, German and Aramaic
caused a riot
was persuaded to turn migrant

Table of Contents:

Ch. 1: Introduction	1
Ch. 2: Literature Review	14
Ch. 3: Background	30
Ch. 4: Foundations 1: Pierre Marty	42
Ch. 5: Foundations 2: Michel Fain, with Denise Braunschweig	66
Ch. 6: Basic Mechanisms 1: Nicos Nicolaïdis	88
Ch. 7: Basic Mechanisms 2: Gerard Szwec	103
Ch. 8: Configurations 1: Anna Potamianou	124
Ch. 9: Configurations 2: Jean Benjamin Stora	142
Ch. 10: Inquiries: César and Sára Botella	155
Ch. 11: Second Thoughts: Claude Smadja	178
Ch. 12: Entanglements: The forgotten pre-history of the <i>opérateur</i>	200
Ch. 13: Indispensable Extensions: Christophe Dejours	216
Ch. 14: Bridges: Jacques Press	243
Ch. 15: Conclusion	266
Endnotes	286
References	370

Chapter One: Introduction

*In every voice in every ban
The mind forgd manacles I hear
William Blake, London¹*

In the 1960s news began to emerge from France that psychoanalysts in place were encountering patients presenting features of mental life quite contrary to expectations. The unfolding debate on how to come to terms with this gained a wider audience at the 23rd ‘*Congrès des Psychanalystes des langues romanes*’ (Barcelona, June 8-11, 1962). It was there that Pierre Marty and Michel de M’Uzan read a paper on ‘*pensee opératoire*’, a mode of thinking geared towards keeping the subject on its feet while being strikingly devoid of discernible fantasy.

The bland term given to it, frequently found in work related contexts, suggests worlds in which the task to be performed is perpetually in focus and fantasy finds no soil to thrive.² Lines written around the time still reflect the shock of the encounter:

It was impossible that a human being might really be as two dimensional (*‘plat’*) and lacking in resources (*‘démuni’*) as [this patient] ... tended to make us believe.³

For the most part the patients concerned did not express any wish to enter psychoanalysis. It was others in the health services who had had the sense that their somatic complaint must have been related to something going on in their psyche.

This posed new challenges to French psychoanalysis, which had recovered from post-war difficulties, had weathered a major split and was on the verge of seeing two more against a backdrop of a hitherto unseen spectacular expansion.⁴

If psychoanalysis was to be regarded as a clinical force to be reckoned with, this new phenomenon called for a response.⁵ It was being articulated in a climate of intense competition between rival organisational formations.⁶ As Alain de Mijolla has pointed out, the French splits were the first in the history of psychoanalysis to which doctrine was not central.⁷ What constituted good practice was more germane to them than what constituted sound theory, what was rightful transmission of teaching, and in which framework, more a bone of contention than quarrels on succinct codification.⁸

This means that a senior practitioner of the Paris Society, the organisation from which the first split took place, during its years of consolidation and expansion might strive to show how existing ways of thinking could be rendered more supple by integrating further perspectives that added new dimensions to previous understanding.⁹ Clinical vignettes might be presented to make theory work in a more finely honed way and used to extend new threads and nodal points to a net in constant development rather than to present a completely new container.¹⁰

As becomes apparent in the major discussions of the time, reasoned divergence that dug into the ramifications of concepts was highly valued and played an important role in a contest that had already splintered psychoanalytic unity beyond repair. A shared psychoanalytic zone could only be achieved in applying what Sergey Dolgopolski in his study of the Talmud's discursive structures termed 'The art of disagreement', which, as he argued, differed significantly from consensus oriented models.¹¹ In engaging in such a debate, psychoanalysis in France beset as it was by bitter rifts, paradoxically flourished as never before, establishing a cultural pattern that went beyond allegiance to a particular school.¹² Lacan had laid claim to a return to Freud.¹³ Freud, a dead authority superior to Lacan's, was agreeably open source and full of fruitful contradictions to boot.¹⁴ It turned out that many young psychoanalysts were eager to accept the

challenge and put their mind to tinkering around a shared kernel of practice, happy to dispense with the office of Chief Interpreter altogether.¹⁵ Engaging in debate among themselves, the new generation, with the back to various parochialisms, encouraged by their progressive discovery of a multi-layered Freud, in its complexity good to think with, established a space within which disagreement worked as a fertiliser.¹⁶

Contributions to the debate, for all their inherent differences, share traits with Barry Scott Wimpfheimer's portrayal of the problematics of narrative within traditional Jewish law:

Because the Talmud regularly juxtaposes sources in a manner [...] that forces direct normative contradictions and resolutions, legal narratives are often perceived as problematic.

Among those scholars of Jewish law who critiqued codification in the wake of the proliferation of various codes in the sixteenth century, Rabbi Hayyim ben Besalel articulated the most radical antisystem understanding of Jewish law.... Rabbi Hayyim objects to the attempt at codification because Jewish law is supposed to be radically open-ended.... Only a completely flexible mode of writing permits the kind of open-endedness that allows a rabbi to decide the law one way today and the opposite way tomorrow.¹⁷

Rabbinic law, and psychoanalytic theory, must treat each case in the light of differences that may yet emerge and which, if and when they do, will have to matter.¹⁸ This is even more important in the case of patients who are low on energy, short on fantasy and at a loss to tell their story in any deeper sense.¹⁹ As an umbrella term used to pinpoint a certain type of recurrent clinical experience at the farther reaches of psychoanalysis' remit, '*opératoire*' has been useful to spark a number of debates that morphed the question 'what is wrong with that patient?' into something closer to 'what is it we do not fully get in this case?'²⁰

To follow the changes in usage a static dictionary definition would not be of much help because it would miss something vital which Sandler, Dare and Holder address on a more general level:

We find a situation within psychoanalysis in which the meaning of a concept is only fully discernible from an examination of the context in which it is used. The situation is complicated further by the fact that different schools of psychodynamic thought have inherited, and then modified for their own use, much of the same basic terminology...²¹

As David N. Livingstone puts it,

[thoughts in] different venues ... mean, and are made to mean, different things. This is because the circulation of ideas is not simply about transference; it's about transformation. It's not just about dissemination; it's about appropriation.²²

While Livingstone studies the impact of Darwin's theory of evolution in different venues, my thesis looks at the the impact of the introduction of *opératoire* as a concept on a network of practitioners in France over some sixty years. In this respect, Ian Hacking's concept of 'dynamic nominalism'²³ adds an important dimension. Ian Hacking noted that a new classification produces changes in the people to whom it is being applied, informs the relationship between them and experts, and feeds back into perceptions about the relation in a loop.²⁴ While I can see the point to this observation, I am in my present work more concerned with the effects the new conceptual node has on its clinical practitioners: What does it do them as they work with it? What do they do with it as they appropriate it and connect it with other tools at their disposal within a given ecology of ways and means?²⁵ If we follow Michel Neyraut's thinking,²⁶ this is part of ongoing work on the general countertransference psychoanalysis as a theory inevitably brings to any clinical encounter. As such it is also part of the work on the range, variety and flexibility of thought styles, a perspective originally proposed by Ludvik Fleck, and more recently given an appreciative nod in the discussion of psychoanalytic concepts by Werner Bohleber and his co-

authors.²⁷ Those who participated in it were part of a segment of French psychoanalysis facing outwards towards the new, but at the same time heirs to the older European practice of the ambitious general practitioner as an enlightened investigator.²⁸ In taking their conceptual stance they also anchored their discipline in the public and the professional mind.²⁹

In the case of the baffling patients mentioned earlier, the psychoanalysts whom I shall be studying took a radical step that changed all further debate: it was not what was in their psyche that made some patients sick, they contended, but on the contrary, the absence of processes there that constrained their inner leeway and exposed them to somatic illness.

My thesis follows the unfolding strands of the discussion by focusing on a number of psychoanalysts who contributed mutually complementary elements to the debate in a shared ecology of concepts. In presenting their thought I heed as much as possible Freud's reflection that stones like the onyx guide and restrain by the nature of their substance any skilful use to which they may be put.³⁰ Things get complicated by the fact that each psychoanalyst presented has been taking part in a living exchange embedded in the context of previous debates which is implicitly present but not necessarily spelled out.³¹ Though space is restricted, I try to hear practitioners out: concerns expressed by one analyst may reappear with another one because needed to give an idea of how they function in different contexts.

Glaring by omission in my discussion of thinkers are Michel de M'Uzan and Christian David, two members of the initial circle who cooperated in the presentation of key key papers in Barcelona, but later did not form part of the core group of *IPSO*, the institutional groundwork for the *EPP*, the *École Psychosomatique de Paris*, and followed paths of their own. Their work would merit studies of their own.

Secondary literature on the phenomenon I present is scattered and not abundant. I am providing a survey of what exists beyond primary literature in my **Literature Review (Chapter Two)**.

Marion M. Oliner's book is still useful, but was written some time ago and with a different focus, which means I largely have to go my own ways in an attempt to let a larger picture emerge.

To make the debate more comprehensible it is important to set it in some of its original context.

Chapter Three (Background) will therefore look briefly at main lines of development within French psychoanalysis from the 1940s to the 1980s to provide the reader with a feeling for the terrain, the main protagonists and some of the major conflicts fought out on it.

If not for Pierre Marty, the group would not have come into existence. **Chapter Four (Foundations 1)** traces the development of the main lines of his early inquiries and follows Marty's attempt to arrive at a systematic presentation of his thought. His explanation of mental structure is rooted in a vitalist appreciation of the articulations of life that encompass body and mind. He assigns a pivotal role to the preconscious in keeping the psyche adequately hydrated, as it were. Although he has not been followed in the theoretical underpinnings of his later systematisation by most of his colleagues, his acute sensibility to the silent crumbling behind well maintained facades and the importance of ledges to cling to above the threatening abyss has remained of lasting interest.

At the time when Pierre Marty was trying to lay the groundwork for a new comprehensive approach to deal with the disappearance of form and function, his close colleague and brother-in-law Michel Fain, both alone and in collaboration with Denise Braunschweig, was showing a

marked interest in the rhythms of presence and absence in early childhood, initiated by the mutual erotic re-investments of the mother and her lover. **Chapter Five (Foundations 2)** is taking a closer look at some of their main contributions, among them Fain's idea of a social link built on a shared, distorted perception of reality which, though seriously incapacitating, at the same time also offers a mainstay to identity. Inasmuch as Fain makes use of the *pulsion/instinct de mort*, he considers it as something that emanates from the mother reducing the boisterous life of her child to obedient calm.³²

Chapter Six: Basic Mechanisms 1: Nicos Nicolaïdis takes a look at getting glued to perception as an alternative to entering into symbolisation. Nicolaïdis makes the point that it does matter into what the individual can regress and what mental infrastructure is available to process his/her inner stirrings. Is it something comparable to LinearA/B, a syllabic script, where larger blocks have to be manipulated to configure the world, or is it rather something like the alphabet, where infinite variations can be produced from more flexibly combinable elements? Transmitted by the mother's culture these elements are important in weaning the child off the earlier dyad.

Chapter Seven: Basic Mechanisms 2: A prime focus on perception may or may not connect to self-throttling measures, in which calm is artificially induced and self-exhaustion is made to replace regression. **Gérard Swecz** dedicated a monograph to patients hell bent on transforming themselves into voluntary galley slaves to deal with the otherwise unmanageable burden of self-regulation. He links this to early disturbance of balances between the mother and the child sometimes leading to alimentary problems that burden further development.

Chapter Eight: Configurations 1: Anna Potamianou has, on various occasions, studied the preservative/obliterative impact of repetition, the effects of identification with a powerful

caregiver of unsound mind and the mixed blessings of hope enkysted in a bubble of timelessness. In the inner worlds of which she serves as a cartographer, the Me, possibly by bonding into a community of forgetfulness, has sacrificed inner space. Restricted in the territory it can access, the Me has turned into a rather securitarian establishment that must defend its borders nail, tooth and claw.

Chapter Nine: Configurations 2: turns to **Jean Benjamin Stora**, who pays attention to shocks that upset the balances necessary for the individual to thrive and has a particular sensibility to the necessity of a shared familiarity with the patient's imaginary worlds of reference for psychoanalytic treatment to succeed. His contributions show a marked awareness of material culture from an ethno-psychoanalytic perspective, for which he acknowledges the pioneer work done by Tobie Nathan. Illusion, we may gather from Stora, can be conducive to the inception of form. The situation of the psychosomatician at the hospital, at times an outsider on the inside, we understand from him, deserves particular attention.

Chapter Ten: Inquiries: César and Sára Botella, though not part of the core group, have been in sustained dialogue with *IPSO/EPP* over the years. Their work includes reflections on the plight of a person who finds him/herself left without any adequate mental image for his inner states. There is an omnipresent primal trace of very ancient lack that has left a dent but not a properly constituted memory and remains in quest of form. Sense that is '*en souffrance*' - capable of gaining shape but not as yet present even in a repressed state - needs the contribution of the psychoanalyst, who, the Botellas suggest, works as a double for the patient, to emerge from the sessions.

Chapter Eleven: Second Thoughts: Claude Smadja, looking back and tracing the development of the *EPP*, integrates an appreciation of Freud's Second Topography into Marty's thought. As a measure of the Me against narcissistic depletion, the *opératoire* is context sensitive. There are instances when the patient's environment is drenched in a culture inimical to personal thriving. Low levels of aversion to being thrown into the unwholesome can lead to 'low subjective density' with remaining narcissism invested in codes of behaviour mandated by a group. In times of increased difficulty, this may turn the individual into a collective unto him/herself, not well and on the point of breaking. In dealing with this, the analyst is faced with the autonomous logic of both the body and the environment.

Chapter Twelve: Entanglements: will look at developments in **French psychiatry of the work place** up to the early 1960s, when it was being sidelined by 'sectorisation', the growing psychoanalytic movement and changes in the cultural climate. The ground it covered in its experience with the challenges and rhythms of the workplace, as well as alienating identification, had to be rediscovered, when French psychoanalysts, dreaming different dreams but walking in the same footsteps,³³ returned to the matter at a later stage, left unattended for some time because too much smacking of the 'real'.

Chapter Thirteen: Indispensable Extensions: Straddling the fields of psychosomatics and the psychodynamics at the work place, **Christophe Dejours**, has studied and documented cases in which self-deafening becomes a mandatory procedure to fit in at the job. If desire is not initiated by sufficiently tantalising enigma encountered in the parents' world, the dead weight of things will increasingly wear down the individual. Dejours, like few other psychoanalysts, has given thought to the central role of work in the life of the subject and included an interest in inter-

generational effects of self-numbing, the vicissitudes of aggression if interdicted from pathways of expression and the storage of split-off zones of personality in an a-mental sector.

Chapter Fourteen: Bridges: Jacques Press, using as one of his references Jan Assmann's work on Echnaton's monotheistic revolution and its suppression, has given thought to what happens when a holding framework shatters, memory is obliterated, and a crisis cannot find external and inner space to be processed. In such a case, traumatic nuclei of (early) experience will leave a negative trace in form of *lacunae*, rather than a positive, if repressed, trace. Weaving into his reflections contributions of Ethnology, he suggests in doing so that the encounter between psychoanalyst and patient may not only entail a confusion of tongues, as Ferenczi pointed out, but also a clash of cultures.

In the **Conclusion (Chapter Fifteen)** I try as much as I can to pull threads together and argue that the discussions portrayed have a wider relevance beyond France.

Concepts regulate cognitive traffic in a given habitat. What they share with all attempts to safeguard a better flow of transport is that they always create stress somewhere down the mental lanes of commerce, which then has to be attended to. Once coined as a term, *opératoire* has proved surprisingly resilient to address concerns that had not been present when it was thrown into the discussion. What it bundles into one morpheme might well be tackled under a variety of headings in nosologies which owe nothing to the French debates. Naturally, cultural preferences will inform choices: there are zones of the *opératoire* which are very close to 'keeping calm and carrying on' in the face of exhaustion when the thread of life frays and all feeling becomes threadbare.

But the big courage is the cold-blooded kind, the kind that never lets go even when you're feeling empty inside, and your blood's thin and there's no kind of fun or profit to be had, and the trouble's not over in an hour or two but lasts for months and years I reckon fortitude's the biggest thing a man can have - just to go on enduring when there's no guts or heart left in you.³⁴

There is certainly something to be gained from such fortitude, but there will also be inevitable loss: transformation and an expansive zest for life has to be put on hold for the sake of preservation in an environment, present or past, that does not permit thriving for the moment and does not provide space for reflections why this might be so. In other, more severe cases whole ranges of vital experience will have been violently rendered *desaparecido*, in possibly unwitting complicity of the person concerned, who is left with oppressive results he/she then has to defend against.³⁵ Unconcern at what no longer connects to one's mental habitat becomes part of who one is and one has to, as the saying goes, 'deal with it'.

As a Central European I am interested in disappearances that have left too scant memories behind, but can by no stretch of the imagination be said to have been self-inflicted by those turned victims of collective selective memory. As I write and think about this in English I cannot help but notice that I am an uninvited guest to a debate that has in many ways yet to materialise. Oddly, a strong surge of psychoanalysis across the Channel, leading to increased French interest in the work of Winnicott and Bion,³⁶ has so far not produced major scholarly work in England on what happened next door. Following a lead by Michel Fain, I understand the relationship between British and French psychoanalysis as comprising elements of the *opératoire*, in which business as usual remains undisturbed by discommodating passion, which, if it once existed, has fallen beyond recollection. When William Hazlitt learned of Napoleon's defeat at Waterloo, we hear, he fell into listlessness and drunken stupor, against an abyss of disappointment that is likely to leave the contemporary reader nonplussed. Things might be different if his Irish and Unitarian

background, in which his sensibilities had an intellectual and emotional underpinning, had not also in shared cultural memory long sunken into oblivion.³⁷ Once passion and memory have gone, only indifference remains.³⁸

For this is what the French concept of the *opérateur* also speaks about: interfaces to a transformative potential gone missing unaccountably, leaving white noise behind. Seen like this, it interrogates Bion's words that the disturbances in the radio can be more important than the message that will, no doubt, often be more than willing to overlay the static.³⁹

Reading French psychoanalytic literature has been with me for some time and I have - contrary to what I have heard from colleagues who feel otherwise - found that it is quite a rewarding experience, especially if one goes to the original that often vibrates with echoes a translation cannot do justice do.⁴⁰ If I tend towards using words like '*pulsion*' in the original it is owed to the impression that its meaning in the French debates is obscured if translated as 'drive'. Like many words it is best understood in the context in which it occurs.⁴¹ In giving an account of the discussion on the *opérateur* I have to condense things and for this purpose use whatever expedient means I can find, including means of presentation that are not being used in the original texts. In general, the translation of texts is mine, unless indicated otherwise.

Over the years, I hugely profited from a long exchange of ideas with Dr Harald Leupold-Löwenthal, Dr Johannes Ranefeld and Dr. Sylvia Zwettler-Otte, who in their various ways have kept my interest in stimulating debate alive. My association, the *Wiener Arbeitskreis für Psychoanalyse* [Vienna Psychoanalytic Association], has over the years rendered me sensitive to the observation that concepts in use serve multiple functions that keep evolving. If I had not had

the privilege to follow and participate in the *WAP*'s development since the 1980s, I might have considered French matters unduly complicated.

I am grateful for the Department of Psychosocial and Psychoanalytic Studies to have provided a stable framework, including the supervisory board structure, to look at matters more closely and to Karl Figlio, willing to supervise my thesis, which was clearly going to take a road less travelled by. His unflinching willingness to enter discussion has accompanied me for the duration of the thesis. He has been reliably there, raising yet another angle, when it mattered. It confirms my suspicion that things gain shape in constant oscillation between form and formlessness, in a process in which what meets the eye of others plays an important part.

An eminent Chinese emperor of the Liang dynasty, 6th century CE, is said to have asked a visiting Indian teacher what benefit might be derived from following his way: the legendary reply is famous for cutting both ways: nothingness and spaciousness.⁴² What we see depends on how the positions we have taken upon ourselves make us move. Even a limited endeavour like a PhD may not amount to nothing if it helps to contribute to a framework in which space can be had to go beyond 'business as usual'.

Chapter Two: Literature Review

My review of the secondary literature informing my research has to come to terms with significant absences: studies which, given the importance of the topic, should - but apparently have not - been written. The sparse, extant literature is dispersed and often fragmentary or summary in nature. In other instances, books were published decades ago but have not been brought up to date and are thus in no position to take into consideration important new developments that have occurred since. After surveying what is available, I will venture reasoned conjectures why this is so.

Granted the general dearth of secondary literature, it is all the more remarkable that there do exist very encouraging examples of what could be done in studying French psychoanalysis, although they do not address directly the zones of my investigation. Luca Di Donna and E.P. Bradford 2008, for instance, adopt an approach the potential of which outside their own area of specialisation has largely been left untapped. In the *NCSP*'s (Northern California Society for Psychoanalytic Psychology) paper '*Fort Da*', they demonstrate what can be achieved even within a narrow compass of around 30 pages, if one focuses on a limited span of time and a particular thinker. Surveying a period fundamental to his later output, they show the inner connections in André Green's early work (up to 1973), set them into some of their original context, give an account of both the clinical concerns driving this thought and the wider philosophical framework underpinning its articulation, and explain in passing terminological differences to current American usage. By considering his work in the chronological order of the French, as opposed to the English translations' publication dates – including the period when Green's work as yet had to be published nominally enlisting as co-authors his medical superiors at the clinic he then worked at – they demonstrate that it gains accessibility and coherence if studied in its original context.

From this vantage point, notoriously difficult papers of his can be accorded their proper place in the unfolding of Green's thought. Both interviews with Green (including personal communications to the authors) and previously available secondary literature about him are drawn upon to reflect upon the significance of positions arrived at. Donna and Bradford also take into consideration biographical material, whenever helpful, to facilitate our understanding of Green's positions. Sometimes overlooked echoes within Green's work of international contributions, like Edith Jacobson's and Otto Kernberg's, are duly noticed. Since important reference points of Green's are elucidated, it is easier to understand the theoretical choices he operates, and in doing so come to terms with his clinical problems. To illustrate this, case material from Green's earlier work is included in the discussion. As this is a short piece of work, one is left at one's thirst to find out more about connections briefly alluded to throughout the paper. The authors only follow the inherent logic of their approach when they state towards the end of their contribution,

As we began exploring the work of André Green for this paper, we turned first to his later work. However, Green himself made such frequent reference to these earlier works that we soon understood this must be our starting place. Even in reading these papers, we found we were obliged to understand a great deal that the constraints of space have prevented our presenting here about the social, political, philosophical and cultural background from which French psychoanalysis entered the rich period of thinking following WW II. We plan to follow this paper with two others. In one, we will explore this history and see how it influenced not only Green's ideas, but those of his predecessors and contemporaries. In the second, we will look at Green's later thinking on the psychical functioning of borderline patients.....What we have explored here was written 35 to 40 years ago, but it still resonates and, more to the point, provides an important foundation for understanding Green's later work. We hope we have unraveled some of Green's

tightly knit arguments — not only to help the reader understand Green academically but also, more importantly, to help the reader understand the experience of more difficult patients.⁴³

To me the approach of Donna and Bradford is in many ways exemplary of what I would like to achieve in an area of French psychoanalysis contiguous to their paper. In accordance with these authors, I believe we have to consider arguments as much as possible in their concrete cultural and historical context so as to unravel them in patient cross-cultural translation work and in order to draw out their broader significance for clinical practice.

To understand this broader context, in absence of Donna and Bradford's as yet unpublished sequels to their paper, we have to make do with literature somewhat limited in respect to its nature, range and the period it covers.

An obvious starting point is Sherry Turkle's *Psychoanalytic Politics. Jacques Lacan and Freud's French Revolution* (first published in 1978, revised and updated edition in 1992). Based on a wide sample of personal interviews, it considers the Lacanian movement in France from a sociological perspective. Though useful, its main emphasis is on events up to the mid-1970s, with a brief survey of ulterior developments appended to the previous chapters in its updated 1992 edition. There is little attention accorded to the non-Lacanian groups beyond the description of the position they took vis-a-vis Lacan. A similar emphasis on Lacan, from a sociological perspective, is shown by Eli Zaretsky 2004, a study whose main point of focus is outside France.⁴⁴ If one wants to know more about the quite significant number of non-Lacanian, or lapsed Lacanian, Alain de Mijolla's work, predominantly published after Turkle's second edition, is indispensable and has to be consulted in conjunction with Élisabeth Roudinesco's monumental work, which traces the history of French psychoanalysis from a

Lacanian viewpoint. De Mijolla, who in his three volumes on psychoanalysis in France (comprising altogether over 2.100 pages) documents events by the year, presents a gigantic mosaic of information highly relevant to the historic developments within French psychoanalysis. He deliberately refrains from weaving emerging threads into a more synthetic explanatory narrative (in the manner of a medieval chronicler, as was observed by his interviewer on Radio France Culture on 8th March 2010) but instead leaves the interpretative work as much as possible to the reader. In one of his prefaces he points to remaining vast *lacunae*.⁴⁵ Faced with a disappointing amount of indifference on the part of his colleagues to their own history, he demissioned from his own association (the *SPP*) after the cool reception the publication of the first volume of his trilogy had met there.⁴⁶ An earlier essay of his retraces the work of the *Association Internationale d'Histoire de la Psychanalyse*, founded in 1985, over the past decades.⁴⁷ One derives the overall impression that the historiography of French psychoanalysis, compared to its primary output⁴⁸ constitutes something of a minority concern.

Beyond de Mijolla's and Roudinesco's work, some useful detail can be gleaned from Chemouni 1991, Fages 1996, Diener 2002 a and b. This, albeit very sketchily, is set into its larger thematic context (with sub-sections, for instance, on Anzieu, Green and Laplanche) by Bourdin 2007. There is also a useful older layer of comment in Barande 1975 with a number of pages on Bouvet. A view from outside France is provided by Heenen-Wolff 2007, who is exemplary in the careful attention she pays to historical background and divergent nuance in her condensed well-informed treatment of French non-Lacanian positions, and by Gallop 1985, whose contributions show that it was mainly the work of Laplanche, besides Lacanian positions, that, by that time, had made its way across the cultural divide. More specialist contributions exist in Torrente 2004 concerning the history of the French psychiatry of work and labour relations (with a chapter on Dejours), and Geissmann *et al.* 2004 about the history of child psychoanalysis, which contains

important sections about France. Ohayon 2006 sheds light on the difficult history of the relationship between psychology and psychoanalysis (as does Jalley 2006), additionally complicated by internecine conflict within the psychoanalytic movement. Widlöcher 2004 gives a brief overview of the links between psychoanalysis and French psychiatry. Jalley 2008 introduces us to some of the battlegrounds of the professional interest in psychoanalysis in France. Fansten 2006 shows that the formation of psychoanalysts looked at with a sociologist's eye can yield interesting results.⁴⁹ Lézé 2010, finally, attempts to take an ethnological look at the position of psychoanalysis in French society today.

A reflection on the amount of linguistic rumination brought to bear on the new translations of Freud in French (cf. Musalek 2006) shows that nuances of this kind should not be thought of lightly but rather connect to cultural ways the French make old texts render new meaning if interrogated in new contexts. Behind the new terminology suggested by the *EPP* we are thus likely to find a network of connections worked out so as to elastically fit new clinical dilemmata.

Given the relative lack of comprehensive accounts about the intellectual life within French psychoanalysis beyond Lacanianism, it has mainly fallen to anthologies to attempt to offset and remedy as best they can the resulting vacuum: among which, in particular, as older examples, Lebovici and Widlöcher 1980a and Chiland *et al.* 1981. More recently, the hefty volume by Birksted-Breen, Gibeault and Flanders 2010 - with some articles by authors from the *EPP*, a good introduction and a useful glossary - has been impressive evidence of renewed British interest in French psychoanalysis. This has recently been followed up by Sara Flanders in her very useful and concise contribution on non-Lacanian strands of psychoanalysis to a work on the evolution of theory and practice over the decades within the Lacan tradition.⁵⁰

The history of psychosomatics is served competently by the all too slim booklet by Kamieniecki 1994 (which has a precursor in Kamieniecki 1992), only a chapter of which – with more attention than usual accorded to Michel Fain and a useful extension on Christophe Dejours - focuses on the *EPP*. There is a short view from Quebec on the *EPP* provided by Fortier 1988, who within the scope of fifteen pages of text presents a succinct thumbnail sketch of relevant developments, and a view from America in an article by Dodds 2008, who extends the portrayal of positions of the founding generation to a consideration of the second generation, cross-links with neuro-psychoanalysis and an assessment of the divergent positions held by Joyce McDougall. On a slightly more minor scale in length is the manual entry by Chabert 1994, who dedicates five densely printed and argued pages to the *EPP*.⁵¹ In the English language, a choice of papers has been made available in Aisenstein and de Aisemberg 2010.⁵²

If one wants to find out more about the inner cohesion of thought proposed by the founding generation of the *EPP*, the slender volumes within the series *Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui* dedicated to Pierre Marty, Michel Fain, Denise Braunschweig, Michel de M'Uzan and Christian David provide a first starting point. With some variation in structure depending on the choices of the individual authors, they provide some basic biographical information, a concise survey of the *oeuvre*, a basic bibliography and, to conclude with, an anthology of representative extracts from the work of the author discussed - all within the compass of under 130 pages of close to Duodecimo format.⁵³ Marilia Aisenstein has recently presented a very valuable introduction to Michel Fain's thought in English, in which she also includes useful biographical information previously not easily accessible.⁵⁴ There is an older, slightly longer, study on Sacha Nacht.⁵⁵ Regrettably, I have not been able to find any comparable study on Maurice Bouvet. Escaping the categories so far discussed, Chagnon 2012 has published a series of concise commentaries on classical psychoanalytic texts about psychopathology, among which Pierre Marty and Michel

Fain are represented.⁵⁶ Parisa Dashtipour, from Middlesex University, in cooperation with Bénédicte Vidaillet, from the Université Paris Est, have shown that there is a lot to be discovered in Christophe Dejours that deserves our attention.⁵⁷

It is not easy to find longer work on the development of French psychoanalytic thought (as opposed to the history of French psychoanalytic politics) outside the Lacanian tradition. The little there is often comes from non-French authors who have noticed a wealth of relevant ideas and are stimulated rather than being repelled by what from the outside appears an opaque world operating on an unwonted level of intensity.⁵⁸ Although by now inevitably dated, Marion M. Oliner's *Cultivating Freud's garden in France* 1988 remains an outstanding example of this garnering sortee beyond the confines of one's own psychoanalytic culture. Oliner, who states she was drawn to the French by their engagingly multi-faceted approach to psycho-sexual development,⁵⁹ draws a broad picture of different non-Lacanian strands of French psychoanalytic life, including several sections useful for an appreciation of Marty's, Braunschweig's and Fain's thoughts.⁶⁰ Occasionally, interspersed observations of hers offer rich potential connections, underexplored in the discussion she reports. Thus, for instance, she remarks that the description of the *pensée opératoire* and *depression essentielle* reminds her of a similar functioning in concentration camp survivors.⁶¹

This, clearly, has considerable implications: if this mode of functioning can be acquired under duress, it would be reasonable to consider it a last ditch defence in well-nigh hopeless circumstances rather than inevitably presenting a developmental flaw in the constitution of a character. Robert M. Young stated that 'Juliet Mitchell once said of Grosskurth that her biography of Melanie Klein read as if its author didn't like anyone'.⁶² If this is so – and Young has his doubts about the justice of the sentiment he quotes – Oliner would be an example of the

converse approach: the attractions of writing about something one finds rewarding. Apart from the publication date, the problem about her very valuable book, if consulted for my topic, is one of its chosen focus: since she aims to give a broad picture, there is only so much available space which she can devote to any given topic. Published one year after Oliner's study, Edith Kurzweil's *The Freudians. A comparative perspective*, includes intriguing glimpses on French Freudianism, and the qualities that set it apart from both Anna Freudians and Kleinians.⁶³ Oliner has continued taking close interest in the French discussions, showing that a well informed view from outside at times may be vital to draw out latent connections. I will be able to make use of some of her contributions in Chapter 15.

In pursuing this investigation, I would like to take up a long-standing *caveat* of Andre Green's that the mental functioning observed in patients diagnosed with *pensee operateire* may not be limited to the sole group of psychosomatic patients.⁶⁴ While this would not absolve from respecting the original context in which the concepts were proposed, it would also open the possibility to study them as a defensive manoeuvre performed under the conditions of shrunk mental leeway.

With Green's admonition in mind, it is possible to make judicious use of Pirlot 2010, who aims to present the theoretical corpus, comprising different *doxa*, as he says, and clinical hypotheses in the area of psychoanalytic psychosomatic thought (and does so in a work of around 230 pages). As a psychiatrist, psychoanalyst and professor of clinical psychology he is concerned with the delineation of consolidated positions in this field so as to facilitate transmission to students, and in acknowledgement of this purpose the editor indicates on the cover that the book could be of particular relevance to master and doctoral students at French universities. Among other strands of thoughts it presents, it places Marty's work not only within psychoanalytic

thinking but also in continuation of psychiatric interrogations voiced by Henri Ey, the great mentor of French psychoanalysts in psychiatry. Useful as the book is, it has to serve, by its very purpose, the function of a reference work for students and has thus limited possibilities to delve more amply into the genesis and development of a strand of thinking of which it provides a thoughtful and sympathetic sketch. By far much further down the road of digestible and memorisable brevity, Pirlot 2013 – which supplements the study aid offered by Pirlot and Cupa 2012a – summarises in six pages what can be said about some of Pierre Marty's firmly articulated positions.⁶⁵ (A similarly condensed survey is presented in Doucet 2000).⁶⁶ Broad in compass and interest, Gérard Pirlot indicates to what extent elements of the *EPP*'s concerns have become part of accepted standard curricula – a far cry, understandably, from Braunschweig and Fain's provocative statement, 'it would displease us if anyone thought we were striving to explain things clearly and simply'.⁶⁷

There is, compared to Pirlot 2010, a nuanced shift of focus in Dumet 2002, who, since she covers less, has time to do more in the areas to which she directs her attention. Pirlot has already remarked on the position of the *pensée opératoire* at the very opposite pole of hysteria.⁶⁸ Nathalie Dumet reflects that while hysteria was originally discussed in close connection with bodily conversion symptoms it then often gave rise to, it is today thought to exist independently from these symptoms, which, on the other hand, can be found within the framework of different personality structures.⁶⁹ If one applied a similar de-coupling operation to the *pensée opératoire*, one has to conclude, it would not necessarily have to occur in conjunction with somatising tendencies and could be studied separately from the domain of psychosomatics, to which, however, it would conserve meaningful potential links. Dumet, more than other authors, traces the development of different positions (including Dejours') over time – from the conjecture of a specific 'psychosomatic' personality structure to mechanisms which can be deployed by any

personality type in certain moments of their lives – and recognises the anti-traumatic strategy operated in the frantic grip on the merely factual.⁷⁰ There seems to be more meaningful agency in the outwardly meaningless stance of robotic thinking and a history, albeit buried in oblivion, therein to be discovered that goes much beyond the mere constation of a deficiency, presenting a lamentable chink in the armour of '*mentalisation*' having fallen short of its evolutionary target.

This is not always apparent in the most dominant strata of the alexithymia debate, which in some but not all of its ramifications, coincides with concerns raised by the *EPP*.⁷¹ Alexithymia, as a concept, was developed on separate lines from Marty's and his colleagues' positions, put on different methodological foundations, which placed more emphasis on neuro-physiology⁷² and with different clinical recommendations that would, in many cases, favour cognitive behavioural therapy, as pointed out, among others, by Taylor 1990.⁷³ The latter author also stresses that the hypothesis of a specific link between alexithymia and psychosomatic diseases should be considered premature.⁷⁴ In Britain it is less the alexithymia discussion than the 'mentalization' concept, as proposed by Peter Fonagy and his colleagues, which one has to consult for a rough equivalent to the *opérateur* construct.⁷⁵ Holmes 1995 surveys the development and discusses possible objections. On French ground, Corcos and Pirlot 2011 trace essential French psychoanalytic elements towards a contribution to the alexithymia debate in their book, which raises the question not only of the nature of the mechanism but also the inner space (or lack thereof) from which it emerges as a remedial measure within a given inner and outer context. This would resonate with Jacquy Chemouni's reflection that we should think less of a given disease or patient structure when we study psychosomatics than, rather, of a particular *situation psychosomatique* – a psychosomatic situation, or more loosely translated, an (inner and outer) field.⁷⁶ There is a very useful contribution by Claude de Tychey, in which he juxtaposes the alexithymia to the *opérateur* and highlights the difficulties involved in this.⁷⁷

Bronstein 2011 subsumes both Marty and Fonagy under a deficit model perspective,⁷⁸ while Fischbein 2011 mentions Marty, whom he briefly summarises before moving on to McDougall.⁷⁹ There is an apparently widespread tendency to treat Marty as if he stood for the whole of the *EPP*'s past and present thinking on the matter and which may, to some extent, explain the almost exclusive attention accorded to him over his colleagues and successors in two contributions in Spanish.⁸⁰ As often, this lack of more detailed critical study, is somewhat mitigated by the existence of a carefully compiled anthology with a wider compass in de Calatroni 1998.

Cultural tendencies and social factors are paid attention to in Pirlot 2009. In this connection, with regard to a wider cultural canvas, however, it is vital to bear in mind the early warning of Zepf and Gattig 1981 – themselves highly critical of the *EPP* - against what they see as a oversimplifying tendency in Cremerius 1977, who against Marty and colleagues pointed out that the *mode opératoire* could be a marker of socio-cultural (and class) difference in emotional register rather than a specific personality structure as suggested by the *EPP* at that time. Granted that socio-cultural difference cannot explain everything, we yet have to take care to understand intercultural factors which may impinge on the analytic encounter and shape the particular situation the patient finds him/herself in.⁸¹

There are a number of German contributions to the discussion on the *EPP*'s tenets but the majority of them were published in the 70s and 80s and were not able to take into account later developments.⁸² Karola Brede's anthology of position papers in psychoanalytic medicine includes contributions of Marty's.⁸³ In spite of the rather summary dismissal the French colleagues receive in Thomä and Kächele 2006, based on the discussion of the 1980s, there are also signs of a somewhat more open attitude.⁸⁴ Scheidt 2006 sums up the previous reception,

emphasises the renewed interest in the alexithymia concept from the 1990s and stresses the wide range and heterogeneity of affect pathologies among psychosomatic patients. A more recent passage in a German psychiatric manual shows continuing interest but also some reservations as to the supposed tendency towards mono-factorial presuppositions within the psychodynamic French approach.⁸⁵

On the whole, the French debate seems to have travelled much less well than the American alexithymia and the British mentalisation concepts, hampered, no doubt, by language barriers but also by the tendency of French psychoanalysts to produce new work at full throttle without showing a commensurate amount of inclination to more detached delineations of the meanderings of the previous debate (although Green and Laplanche, in their different ways have shown the rich harvest this can bear when applied to Freud and Klein). It has been pointed out that one has to decide whether to interpret *in* the transference or *upon* the transference. It stands to reason that one can, operating a comparable choice, write *in* a tradition without ever finding the time for writing *on* a tradition. So far French psychoanalysis has overwhelmingly opted for the first approach, to mixed quantities of admiration and consternation among foreign observers.

Given this situation, it is upon favourably disposed but inevitably somewhat baffled foreign observers that has most often fallen the task to make sense of what French psychoanalysts have been debating among themselves. One of those who have consistently shown interest has been Otto Kernberg, who has repeatedly pointed out the importance of French contributions, among which – in contradistinction to those who only focus on Marty – he has also included Braunschweig and Fain.⁸⁶ It was Otto Kernberg who encouraged Oliner to proceed with her important work.⁸⁷ Curiously, it is nowadays from America, consistently slighted by Lacan, that some very pertinent and intriguing reflection on the French school of psychosomatics has

emerged.⁸⁸ A continuing interest can be traced in the reports by Emmett Wilson in *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* on the output of the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* on an annual basis⁸⁹ and in Howard B. Levine's lucid book review essays.⁹⁰ In a perspicacious commentary on an article of Pierre Marty's, Richard M. Gottlieb 2010a points out something that might be regarded as obvious, but too often has escaped attention:

the *psychosomaticien* school has by now been continuously around for more than 50 years and is well into its 'second generation' of theorists and clinicians ... This in turn has resulted in a significant accumulation of clinical experience with their ideas and therapeutic practices. Such an accumulation under one theoretical roof is unusual if not unique in psychoanalytic psychosomatics today and surely deserves out attention.⁹¹

Even if this thinking were to contain grievous errors – which would remain to be proven in spite of the condemnation Siegfried Zepf regarded as conclusive in the early 1980s - no serious consideration of it can take place as long as the examination of it is hampered by an almost total lack of understanding for the internal evolution and adaptation of a thought faced with the continuous challenges of clinical practice in the course of almost six decades (the reverse problem: French neglect of developments in the English speaking world, even in cases where there was an arguable similarity in perspective and interest, has recently been argued by Waintrater 2012).

This more expansive view is the more imperative as any reflection on the '*pensée opératoire*' is a clinically imposed rumination on what appears to be woefully lacking in an analytic encounter – a lack that might well be either secondary on the part of the patient (the result of a 'negative hallucination', as suggested by Pirlot and Corcos 2012),⁹² or, on the other hand, be partly due to limits of imagination and sensibility on the part of the psychoanalyst. Again it is R. M. Gottlieb, who points out that in a conference, in which analysts from different schools shared case

material, the analytic potential a situation was deemed to hold varied widely among those present: 'the contrast begs an explanation: How could it be that Stern found “almost nothing” where Dunn and Samberg found a rich vein to mine?'.⁹³ If 'The Other is an object for the patient's use', as Rina Lazar 2001 maintains, would this be true regardless of how this analytic Other inwardly constructs the situation of the encounter?⁹⁴

If we follow Michel Neyraut's reasoning,⁹⁵ psychoanalysis always involves an individual (and collective) counter-transference on the patient before the latter even enters the consulting room: a theoretically informed expectation of where to look and what to find before the encounter even takes place. Melanie Klein's original objections notwithstanding, neo-Kleinian thinking, on the whole, has regarded counter-transference as a source of minable information to be worked through and sifted, not to be set aside or ignored.

This would concord, from another perspective, with the propositions of Ludwik Fleck, medical doctor and original thinker in cognitive sociology, who regarded thought styles as the precondition of any cognition.⁹⁶ It is, in Fleck's view, in the interaction between case material and thought styles (anchored in thought collectives) that clinical reflection sometimes, and possibly for quite the “wrong” reasons, chances on the really useful.⁹⁷

The object of medical thinking, the disease, is no persistent state, but a continually changing process which has its own temporal genesis, its course and its decline.⁹⁸

What we can take from this is that every proposition has a context and a socially constituted remit. Its implementation is likely to change as it is more widely appropriated and put to use. Not only the individual, but also the professional group requires '*a skin for thought*' (Anzieu 1990)

which forms a permeable membrane between what is outside and what is inside. This is likely to be even more important in cases that confound professionally honed expectations.

There appears to be consensus that the subject thought to be making use of '*pensée opératoire*' is in a severe impasse but conserves residual resources. As psychoanalysis looks at the patient, it is this glance itself that has to be interrogated, especially when confronted with cases in which '*no memory and no desire*'⁹⁹ has changed sides and is upheld by patients who seem to be taking a leaf out of Pierre Janet's books instead of Freud's, covertly joining ranks with some of Bion's more disturbed patients.

As Dejours points out:

Authors, in fact, evolve, sometimes quite brusquely with the experience they acquire while working as analysts, with age and maturity, no doubt, after intellectual encounters, certainly.... But rare are those who strive clearly to lay account of the turning points and diverse stages of their thought. They present it as if this was to be taken for granted, or they forget to speak about it, by tact, calculation or lack of comprehension of the epistemological ruptures they are committing.¹⁰⁰

This requires some patient tracing of thought which at the moment – as far as the focus of my investigation is concerned - is not likely to come from within France. A quick glance at the institutional situation of psychoanalysis at university,¹⁰¹ at a list of doctoral theses in French¹⁰² and a catalogue of a publisher specialised in publishing doctoral theses,¹⁰³ shows a certain preference for approaches not burdened by the kind of retrospective work Dejours enjoins – unless other disciplines like ethnology (George Devereux) and philosophy (Cornelius Castoriadis) are co-involved in the *vita* of the respective psychoanalyst. There are signs that there

may be more to come with regard to André Green, whose work is receiving increasing attention in the UK.¹⁰⁴

Chasing up on possibly useful secondary literature I was struck by the diminishing tangible return on investigative effort, for what in the last resort, may well be quite a simple reason: within French psychoanalysis the highest compliment is to have accomplished an *oeuvre*,¹⁰⁵ rather than to have reflected on one: That is probably the reason why there is a *Prix Bouvet*, for those who have in innovative ways excelled in psychoanalysis, but no critical evaluation of the work of Bouvet himself (which on the other hand does exist for Castoriadis, who was also a philosopher, a discipline that does routinely engage in critical retrospective evaluation: Tassis 2008).

We will see in the next chapter that the background explains something of the density of the discussions that even participants might have found difficult to catch up with in all their ramifications.

Chapter Three: Background

Both in America and in France psychoanalysts, as their discipline was asserting its presence in medical institutions, increasingly met with patients who of their own accord would not have set foot in their private practices. When Freud was on his historic journey to America he - according to what Lacan during his stay in Vienna in November 1955 claimed he had heard from Jung - is thought to have joked, 'Little do they know that we are bringing them the pest'.¹⁰⁶ If pest indeed it was, its spread was meeting new pockets of resistance. A particularly baffling one of these consisted of opposing to the psychoanalyst's probing touch a life drained of fantasy and dreams. Since people who detest being out of marching order only talk to a doctor if they have to, a psychoanalyst would only come to see these kinds of patients if they were suffering from grievous bodily ailments other doctors could not make sense of. Some of the resulting encounters apparently came as a cultural shock to both sides, with an emotional profile of the meeting so flat it seemed impossibly unreal. 'It was so boring' Bion remarked of an apparently similar case, 'that it made me wonder how he did it'.¹⁰⁷ In France the wondering, when it came, had, as we have seen, a particular background, which we should briefly take a look at so as to understand the debate that was to unfold there.

When the *SPP* (*Société Psychanalytique de Paris*) reemerged at Liberation the challenges facing it were formidable. After the devastations of the years under the swastika, and important bearers of transmission for French psychoanalysis gone to America (Rudolph Loewenstein and Heinz Hartmann) or dead (Eugénie Sokolnicka and Sophie Morgenstern), it had to start from scratch.¹⁰⁸ There was, in spite of all the difficulties, a sense of a pioneer spirit.¹⁰⁹ Outlawed under Nazi rule, it had lost the premisses of its former institute. Not only had it to look for new lodgings, it also

had to provide itself with an adequate framework to administer it.¹¹⁰ A court case in which a lay member of the *SPP* was accused of the illegal exercise of psychotherapy showed that careful consideration had to be given to the question of how best to provide legal status and professional legitimacy.¹¹¹ Serious tensions began to emerge about who would direct the institute - for which American subsidies were being sought - and on which agenda of professional training. There were five people considered key players in the unfolding events. Sacha Nacht, who wanted to insert psychoanalysis in the medical establishment;¹¹² Daniel Lagache, professor at the Sorbonne, who wanted to establish it at university and to provide training for the new emerging discipline of psychologists;¹¹³ Jacques Lacan, who was keenly interested in the most recent philosophy and art debate about town;¹¹⁴ Maurice Bouvet, who was a recognised and gifted clinician interested in object relations theory;¹¹⁵ and Marie Bonaparte, 'the princess', who had a network of international contacts and who favoured 'lay' analysis.¹¹⁶ Bonaparte was inclined towards Lagache as long as his camp would not include Lacan, whom she loathed.¹¹⁷ When, after intense debate and infighting, a group of rebels, rallying around Lagache and his friends, failed to win adequate support against Nacht inside the *SPP*, they left on June 16th, 1953 to set up an organisation of their own, the *SFP* (*Société Française de Psychanalyse*).¹¹⁸ Lacan, who had been under attack for irregularities in his training analyses (with regard to frequency and duration of the sessions) went with them.¹¹⁹ Bouvet, who could have moved either way, stayed, later becoming the training analyst of a number of young analysts that were to shape the future of the *SPP*, among them André Green. The *SFP* had not fully anticipated an international dimension in what to them was a local dispute and had counted on the princess' aid to mend any eventual frays with the *IPA*, the *International Psychoanalytic Association*, a support which disappointingly was not forthcoming once it was clear that Lacan was with them.¹²⁰ A brief attempt of Lacan to build bridges to Melanie Klein (in his eyes a fellow rebel against the Bonaparte-Anna Freud camp) came to nothing because of a basic incompatibility of personalities and styles.¹²¹ In spite of what was

sometimes claimed afterwards, ideology formed no adequate support for the rupture, the first split in the history of psychoanalysis, as de Mijolla has pointed out, that was in fact not based on a major dissent on doctrine but in which matters of organisation, training and power were the core issue involved.¹²²

In August 1953 the *SPP* was down to thirteen full members.¹²³ The new *SFP*, at that stage by no account a Lacanian organisation, drew into its ranks many followers of René Laforgue, a charismatic and ambitious training analyst of the old *SPP* (as the first president of which he served in 1926).¹²⁴ Born in Alsace, when it formed part of the German Empire before 1918, he was not without good reason suspected by his colleagues, many of whom had ties to the Resistance, of foul play during the Occupation. Although nothing could be proved at the time (relevant evidence was to emerge from a Berlin archive only in the 1980s long after his death), Laforgue was being cold-shouldered and sidelined, a situation which was much resented by his training analysands, some of them prominent in cultural life, who took the split as an opportunity to settle accounts with the *SPP*.¹²⁵ Even before Lacan's rise to public stardom, pressures were forming within French psychoanalytic culture pushing people to take a stand and to articulate their respective positions clearly. It is difficult to understand the thriving of psychoanalysis in the 60s if one does not take into account the climate of combat that goes back to the 50s:¹²⁶ the fight to gain a hearing and to conquer a public led to a flowering of creative output unprecedented in the history of French psychoanalysis.¹²⁷

When the opposition left, Nacht, to whom control of the institute reverted, was free to pursue his project to train a future generation of doctors.¹²⁸ The institute gained a good reputation for clinical solidity and proceeded to demonstrate the considerable range of the topics it covered in a showcase publication of 1956.¹²⁹ Among those who took up the offer which the *SPP* was

extending to them were aspiring young graduates, who in the course of their psychiatric training in their most formative years found themselves congregating at Sainte-Anne's in Paris, as a hospital a rather special place, somewhat outside the regular system, with a setup that encouraged independent reasoning and debate, beyond what was then usual at the medical faculty. One of the factors which made the place special were the doctor-scholars who taught there, among them Henry Ey, who though not a psychoanalyst himself, encouraged the young interns to measure themselves against the best minds of their generation.¹³⁰

As a given, the place existed outside the strife of the rival psychoanalytic organisation, almost as the proverbial structural third, setting a high standard of discussion with natural openings towards philosophy and the human sciences. If Nacht's project was to thrive, its participants had to be able to give good account of themselves at Saint-Anne's, a challenge which in general seems to have been taken up by the younger generation of psychiatrists. Ey also convened what could be regarded as the closest approximative equivalent to the London Controversial Discussions (1941-46) in France: the famous 6th Colloquium of Bonneval on the Unconscious in 1960. Several important differences immediately spring to mind: it came seven years after the split had occurred and so could not possibly avert it; it encompassed philosophers of renown, who had gladly accepted the invitation; and it granted public argumentative space to the 'young lions' of the rival organisations eager to leave their mark. Among those present were the philosophers Paul Ricoeur, Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Henri Lefebvre and Jean Hyppolite; Serge Lebovici, René Diatkine, André Green and Conrad Stein, from the *SPP*; and Serge Leclaire, François Perrier, Jean Laplanche and J.-B. Pontalis from the *SFP*. Interestingly, psychologists were not invited, nor any masters of the second French psychoanalytic generation (e.g. Nacht and Lagache).¹³¹ Lacan was denied an exposé but was admitted as a mere participant. In the course of the meetings, there was heated controversy and ferocious, impassioned debate. Green,

for one, derived from it the impression of the intellectual weakness of his own camp and decided to attend Lacan's seminar.¹³² Green's participation in Lacan's seminar was based on what in retrospect can be recognised as a mutual illusion, the erroneous idea that Green's interrogations in Lacanian thinking space could somehow lead to interesting convergences.¹³³ He followed his teaching until 1967, when Lacan's attempts to bring him to heel failed.¹³⁴ Three years after this, Green presented a comprehensive account of the core issue of affect in psychoanalytic theory at the Congress of Psychoanalysts of Romanic Languages in Paris, taking into account both the work of Freud and the post-Freudians. In 1973 it was published, further augmented, under the title *Le discours vivant*, a discourse that clearly had broken down with Lacan, but which continued to influence further developments.¹³⁵ In it, Green again asserts that there is a plurality of regimes that govern signifiers, which do not all obey the same modalities of concatenation.¹³⁶ Affect on the level of the id is not linked to representation, but is rather in quest of representation.¹³⁷ Lived experience constantly chases after representation without reaching it contemporaneously.¹³⁸ What Green did was to provide a conceptual apparatus for thoughts that had so far largely lacked a thinker in France. Green states that his works could be read as a kind of autobiography.¹³⁹ If this is so, it is also representative of the itinerary of a generation, which, in an exciting climate of debate, was faced with an updated version of Paris' choice between putting a prime on clinical probity (Nacht/Bouvet), academic possibility (Lagache), or cultural and intellectual prowess (Lacan).

For two young analysts from the *SFP*, Jean Laplanche and J.-B. Pontalis, the aftermath of the Colloquium led to a number of difficulties with Lacan, who was dissatisfied with the increasingly independent formulations they were proposing.¹⁴⁰ Laplanche, looking back, pointedly remarked that it was the characteristics of lively thought that it took on board emerging problems and did not confine itself to prolonging the thought of a master¹⁴¹ - a liberty of manoeuvre that, once

won, would have to be defended. He was not alone in his difficulties: The *SFP* found it increasingly difficult to accommodate Lacan, who continued to take up an ever increasing number of analysands for ever shorter sessions and with decreased frequency.¹⁴² In 1963/1964 the *SFP* split into the *APF* (*Association Psychanalytique de France*), which joined the *IPA*, and the *EFP* (the *École Freudienne de Paris*),¹⁴³ which Lacan proclaimed with the following words: 'I [hereby] found – alone as I have always been in my relation to the psychoanalytic cause the *École Française de Psychanalyse*'¹⁴⁴ With Lacan on his own path to new peaks of renown, the *APF* in its further course, while staying conscious of Lacanian ideas as an important element in its heritage, in practice showed considerable closeness to Lagache's original project of setting psychoanalysis on a firm ground in institutionalised academia.¹⁴⁵

At Louis Althusser's invitation, Lacan held his seminar at the *Ecole Normale Supérieure*, which extended his audience to a non-medical public.¹⁴⁶ The publication of his *Écrits* in 1966 exploded public interest.¹⁴⁷ When, starting from 1968, Lacan published his own journal '*Scilicet*', only his own articles were signed, contributions by others had to remain anonymous.¹⁴⁸ As a consequence of conceptual difficulties with Lacan – as Pierre Marty observed, Lacan was given to making fun of everything in human exchange that did not belong to the order of language¹⁴⁹ – a number of French psychoanalysts not organised with Lacan were becoming increasingly interested in British psychoanalysis, which was free from Lacanian presuppositions. When Pontalis founded the '*Nouvelle Revue de Psychanalyse*' – the first volume was published in Spring 1970 - the editorial board comprised (among others) not only Didier Anzieu (from the *APF*) but also André Green (from the *SPP*), Masud Khan, who provided a link to London, and Jean Starobinski, a renowned scholar from outside the world of the psychoanalytic associations.¹⁵⁰ Turning to Winnicott it was easier to make conceptual space for a 'prequel' to the chains of representation and desire that have to be there for the latter to kick off.¹⁵¹ Arguing their new insights against

Lacan and the Lacanian storm, and as their thought developed, in many cases against each other, lent their publications an incredible density and wealth of thought.¹⁵²

When Pierre Marty together with Michel Fain, Michel De M'Uzan and Christian David founded the '*École Psychosomatique de Paris*' in 1962, this initiative fit in well with the general outline of the developments portrayed above. Based on the contributions of members of the *SPP* it can be seen as a logical diversification of Sacha Nacht's project to insert psychoanalysis in contemporary medicine,¹⁵³ which took up, further developed, and reworked pre-existing threads of thinking on the pre-verbal and relationships between the body and mind Sacha Nacht had already been interested in. It made a meaningful statement on what could be seen as the extralinguistic prerequisites of affect, at the times difficult to formulate in Lacanian terms, and it paid attention to the dynamics of the fantasmatic, to which Laplanche and Pontalis about the same time were devoting a seminal article originally published in *Le Temps Moderne* in 1964, later in reworked form to be released in form of a booklet under the title *Fantasme originaire. Fantasme des origines. Origines du fantasme*.¹⁵⁴ While it did not deny the importance of language, it tended to pay more attention to the particular quality and the concrete frames of early interactions.

The *EPP*, the '*École Psychosomatique de Paris*', on its part, tried to provide tangible answers to questions addressed to psychoanalysts working in hospitals by their non-psychoanalytic medical colleagues and followed up issues previously raised by respected figures like Henri Ey and Julian de Ajuriaguerra.¹⁵⁵ It thus offered, albeit in idiosyncratic form, a performative platform, which crystallised a number of concerns important to contemporary French psychoanalysis in its non-Lacanian strands. It went about its set task by looking at personal turmoil sunk into the body without traces of symbolic ripples or even affective storms to emerge from the surface. In this way it also claimed territory that Lacan had arguably left unoccupied because it did not partake

of the orders of the symbolic but had fallen under the verdict of 'foreclusion'.¹⁵⁶ It would tally nicely with reflections about to be developed by Didier Anzieu (*APF*) that mental activity required '*A Skin for Thought*', a mental epidermis which enabled thought to breathe as it were.¹⁵⁷

There was some discernible convergence with concerns pursued by Piera Aulagnier, who together with others, in protest about training regulations passed by the *EFP* according to Lacan's wishes, left it to set up their own group, *Le Quatrième Groupe*, to safeguard what they regarded as the essentials in the transmission of psychoanalytic competence.¹⁵⁸

As matters were developing, psychoanalysis in the 1960s and 1970s went through a crisis of growth.¹⁵⁹ By the 1970s psychoanalysis in France reached an ever widening public. Its apparent success led Didier Anzieu to warn that psychoanalysis was falling sick of its own success,¹⁶⁰ something that would have been called 'victory disease' by the Japanese in World War II.¹⁶¹ If we follow his lines, it is easy to see that some psychoanalysts might have experienced the *opérateur* as a resistance to a resistance movement they themselves were quite successfully running¹⁶²:

I would also like to say how much psychoanalysis in its very practice constitutes a silent critique and an active resistance to certain aberrations of the industrial civilisation. To set apart three quarters of an hour several times a week for someone attentively listen to him/her speak about himself/herself in complete freedom is an oasis that it is more and more impossible to find in our century infatuated with speed, output, and the proliferation of material objects.¹⁶³

Anzieu talks about budding interdisciplinary discussions between historians and psychologists on the phenomenon of crisis viewed on both a social and a personal level.¹⁶⁴ For a crisis not to be wasted, a stable framework was required that permitted all the various *pulsions* (in individual life) and political movements (in public life) to come into play.¹⁶⁵

Psychoanalysts working full time had contact with those developments primarily mediated by their patients: 'For years I have been frequenting only psychoanalysts, how should I know what a normal being is?' asked Joyce McDougall somewhat provocatively.¹⁶⁶ If society was changing, it was patients who would most effectively be the message bearers to their analysts. Not all the meetings went according to expectations, or, indeed, made any sense at all.

In '*L'Investigation psychosomatique*' (1963), one of the founding documents of the group I am studying, analysts described the sort of meeting any psychoanalyst secretly dreaded: a patient, who had been referred to by a non-psychoanalytic colleague because something beyond the bodily ailments in evidence seemed to be seriously out of kilter, but whose emotional profile, for all his/her troubles, seemed to be as arid as the desert. In a by now classic description, which merits being quoted in at least an extract, they describe the encounter:

The investigator cannot but be struck by how little relational interest – in the usual sense of the term – he seems to arouse in the patient and by the little amount of nuance and differentiation involved in the way in which he is being apprehended by him. Their relation does not give rise to any real elaboration, nor does it seem to be susceptible to being transformed into a dynamic whole which would assure its advancement. It is static and fragmented to a large measure. In its most pure forms the patient tends to respond mechanically, without waiting for anything, it seems, but an automatic play of stimulus and response. Unconsciously he seems to be animated by a need to bring down the interlocutor to the level of his own somaticity. In general, the psychosomatic patient gives the impression that his deepest interest is absorbed in what one might term an '*inner somatic object*' but this object, in contradistinction to the inner object of the neurotic, is opaque to sense, resists interpretation and lends itself badly or not at all to being taken up in conscious mental, fantasmatic or intellectual activity. Further, even if such an activity seems to develop to some degree, one is able to verify that it only carries a minimal functional value and that its role is energetically weak.¹⁶⁷

It seems as if Charlie Chaplin as of '*Modern Times*', freshly spewn out of the conveyor belt factory, had entered the consulting room, not this time, however, reduced in his occupation to humble repetitive manual labour and his condition not limited to particularly unpleasant moments in his/her life. French psychoanalysis was discovering the world of the 'normopathy' (or as Bollas termed it 'the normotic')¹⁶⁸ as if the dire visions of Adorno and Horkheimer ('with many people it is already an act of impertinence when they say 'I')¹⁶⁹ had newly struck their clinical territory with full force.¹⁷⁰

Incidentally, Marty and his colleagues published their *Investigation* one year before Herbert Marcuse, in a book that at the times enjoyed considerable success, put forward his views on 'one-dimensional man', an individual that lacked critical distance to what existed and seemed to be unaware of the dimension of the potential.¹⁷¹ Although Marcuse approaches things from a very different angle, there is some overlapping territory. How is it possible that a subject is not deeply stirred by what is befalling him/her? It is the many different facets they discern in this encounter that makes the work of *EPP* analysts so remarkable, as that of cartographers of lost inner worlds at the very opposite of hysteria, dramatic in its resounding absences, confounding as Green, for one, was to describe later, in its blank negativity.

In their goal to map these so far uncharted inner spaces they developed new conceptual categories, which described strangely un-neurotic morphologies: depression without inner objects traceable only through a haemorrhage of energy ('*depression essentielle*'); mechanical thinking ('*pensée opératoire*') which exhausted itself in compiling, as it were, endless inner shopping lists; and waves of inner destabilisation which overwhelmed all possible defensive points of fixation ('*désorganisations progressives*'). All of them seemed to be connected to deficiencies in the work of the preconscious and, as a consequence, a striking lack of what they

termed '*mentalisation*', a concept which should be read in the context of their work and not considered identical with the term as employed by Fonagy.¹⁷²

In the medium turn, this perspective fitted in well with an increasing concern for inter- and transgenerational phenomena within French psychoanalysis which made itself felt from the 1970s.¹⁷³ Clearly, not all of the problems patients were caught up in started with themselves. François Vigoroux, for one, has provided insight into how a family may be locked into repetitions of a destructive pattern for generations, until one day, changed circumstances permit significant change. It is only then that it becomes possible for an outsider to hear the testimony of the past transmuted.¹⁷⁴

Over the years, the Paris Society developed a network of institutions geared towards providing psychoanalytic consultations and/or treatments, among them the *Centre de consultations et de traitements psychanalytiques Jean Favreau* in Paris (*le CCTP*),¹⁷⁵ the *Centre de psychanalyse et de psychothérapie E. et J. Kestemberg*, with a special focus on patients presenting with psychoses or grave personality disorders,¹⁷⁶ and the *Centre Alfred Binet*, with a focus on children and adolescents.¹⁷⁷ The latter two belong to the network of services offered by *ASM 13*, the *Association de santé mentale du 13e arrondissement de Paris*. It is not rare to see the children once treated with success, return, in case of difficulties, as adults.¹⁷⁸ Steven Wainrib speaks of a *psychanalyse diversifiée*, which has taken up psychoanalytic work not only with individuals but also with families.¹⁷⁹

Perhaps all of this left its accumulated effect on the nature of the inquiries Marty's group had launched. Although the main emphasis was that some inner interface - the preconscious - was not serving the patient well, there increasingly crept in questions that added another angle:

granted an interface *within* the patient was doing strange things, what about the interface *to* the patient? Marty, de M'Uzan and David had thought that matters were sufficiently complicated as they saw them, yet, given some time, they were due to become much more complicated.

Chapter Four: Foundations 1: Pierre Marty

In one of his articles Gerard Szvec recalls having heard Pierre Marty talk about an intervention with a particular patient:

There was a situation in which I found myself saying to a patient who was telling me how he had refrained from replying to an aggression directed against him, 'You know, I, myself, act in another way; if someone steps on my foot on the underground, I feel like [*'j'ai envie de'*] killing him. Sure, I do not kill him! But I am furious, I draw a face, sulk, and after a while, I get angry with myself and find excuses for him. He did not do it on purpose. But no matter what, he did hurt me and I recognise that at this moment I felt like killing him. But that is me, and I am not you.¹⁸⁰

Very carefully, Marty refrains from suggesting that this is what the patient was really feeling, or would have liked to feel, or should better have felt. As Marty sees it, he/she may in fact be quite unable to feel anything of the sort and instead be confounded and embarrassed in his/her inability to comply with the required response.¹⁸¹ Telling the patient about himself, he extends the range of possible actions people might envisage without being necessarily proud about them. Szvec would most likely have heard this vignette in the Eighties or early Nineties, when Marty had had decades of experience and ample time to reflect on the approach he would take with patients hiding fragilities behind a bland surface. His clinical angle, as Szvec stresses, enjoined the prudence of the mine-clearer on the practitioner.¹⁸²

In this chapter I shall trace how Marty evolved his positions and the way this laid the foundation for the rise and further development of the group that formed around it, which was to become known as the *École Psychosomatique de Paris (EPP)*.

Beginnings and cursus vitae: from neurosurgery to psychoanalysis

As a child, Marty recalls, the illnesses afflicting members of his family had caused him a lot of anxiety.¹⁸³ A philosophy professor at school encouraged him to study medicine and then to specialise in psychiatry.¹⁸⁴ He practised neurosurgery with the First Army at the end of the war.¹⁸⁵ As a psychiatrist he started out with an organicist perspective.¹⁸⁶ It was Julián de Ajuriaguerra who one day took him aside, giving him a piece of very straightforward advice: 'Old chap, I say, you will never understand anything without psychoanalysis'.¹⁸⁷ In 1947 Marty entered psychoanalysis with Marc Schlumberger, joined the Paris Society, the *SPP*, first as an associate member in 1950, and then as a full member in 1952.¹⁸⁸ Marty married Simone Fain, sister of his friend and colleague Michel Fain, whom he had known from their days at the *lycee*, when they had been schoolmates.¹⁸⁹

In early 1953 Lacan, president of the *SPP* at the time, chose him as his secretary, a function he held during the historic split.¹⁹⁰ Remaining within the *SPP* and on Sacha Nacht's side, whom he held in great esteem, and in spite of this, until the split, in place as Lacan's secretary on the board, he experienced the most spectacular colitis of his life.¹⁹¹ A long time sufferer from allergies, and with close relatives from different branches of the family suffering from asthma, he was always fascinated by what seemed to him their shared characteristics beyond all noticeable differences.¹⁹² Freshly operated from double cataracts, he had to wear dark glasses, when Lacan, on one occasion some time after the split, wished to see him. Lacan took his changed appearance as a portent in their relationship, while Marty, without much success

providing background information, argued its personal importance on a separate level, an anecdote perhaps emblematic of deeper differences beneath their divergent lines of interpretation.¹⁹³ As he was working on '*L'investigation psychosomatique*', his wife, with whom in December 1962 he had prepared a radio feature on '*L'art tauromachique et la psychanalyse*', was dying of cancer.¹⁹⁴ Marty did not remarry.

From 1961 he served as vice president of the *SPP*, whose president he became in 1969 (a position he held until 1970).¹⁹⁵ Having assembled a core of collaborators, Marty from 1967 ran a centre of psychosomatic consultations in a location in Rue Falguière that had served as a treatment centre for venereal diseases. Its tiled floors were still a reminder of its former function in its battle for hygiene.¹⁹⁶ Now it became a place for teaching, supervision and for seeing psychosomatic patients.¹⁹⁷ Work was organised around the consultations Marty held there twice a week.¹⁹⁸ Once a week the team met with Pierre Marty to discuss current patient interviews.¹⁹⁹ This day clinic operated until 1978.²⁰⁰ One of the inconveniences of the situation was that the previous administration was still in place and a source of irritating interference.²⁰¹ On the advice of the Directorate for Health and the Paris Prefecture, Marty prepared to set up a non-profit association that would provide a legal framework for further activities.²⁰² Philippe Paumelle, who, with Serge Lebovici and René Diatkine, had put on the rails the *ASM 13* in 1958 - a pilot project for what later became implemented as the sectorisation policy in psychiatry - assisted in the planning.²⁰³ On 26 December 1972 *l'Institut de Psychosomatique (IPSO)* was created.²⁰⁴ Michel Alliot, former chief of staff of Edgar Faure in the ministry of education, was asked to become president of *IPSO* and accepted after he had had time to vet the project with the doyens of the faculty of medicine, clearing various administrative hurdles that had existed before.²⁰⁵ In 1978 the *Hôpital de la Poterne des Peupliers* was opened (later named the *Hôpital Pierre Marty*) and Marty was invited to open a care unit for psychosomatic patients.²⁰⁶ In 2004 their structures were integrated into the *ASM 13*.²⁰⁷

Early work: muscular armour and posture control as tools in distance management

At the time of Marty's internship in psychiatry, the only disease that seemed to affect the 'alienated' to a significant degree was pulmonary tuberculosis.²⁰⁸ Together with Michel Fain, in one of their earliest papers together, he looked into what could be gleaned of the psychodynamics and personality structure of more than one hundred post-cure tuberculosis patients from a professional background in teaching.²⁰⁹ They found that patients who moved within their personal 'zone of security' healed more rapidly and did not relapse.²¹⁰ Topographical and geographical distance to the mother was used to supplement more neurotic measures of distance maintenance avoiding a rupture.²¹¹ To maintain a personal equilibrium, they found, was of supreme importance to the individual and maintaining this equilibrium might be sought even in death.²¹² Marty and Fain's tentative attempts to connect the development of pulmonary tuberculosis to mental structures were met with little sympathy by at least one important member of the *SPP*: Marie Bonaparte. Her daughter had had pulmonary tuberculosis and she seemed to be disinclined to countenance any possible connections of such a disease to the mental sphere.²¹³

Looking at the modulation of external distances because inner distances to the object were difficult to manage was one way to probe the feeble points of an individual's mental management of conflict.²¹⁴ Soon other phenomena that posed related questions drew the attention of the authors. In studying patients with chronic headaches, Marty and Fain noticed the frequent presence of a painful interdiction of thought.²¹⁵ Reading Thomas M. French's 1941 paper, they were struck by the observation that even in their dreams some patients suffering from frontal headaches were loathe to envisage the free movement of figures inhabiting their dreams, whom they had to freeze into motionless states.²¹⁶ In an extended congress paper in 1954 they presented, from an object relations perspective, their reflections on the complicated relationship

between the exercise of motor skills (*motricité*) and the rise of fantasy.²¹⁷ The maturation of motor skills, they reflected, ensures contact, while at the same time permitting the infant progressively to regulate distance.²¹⁸ The register of movement is fine tuned in close identification with the moves and glances of the mother.²¹⁹ Once internal objects have been established, things complexify further.²²⁰ Social reality usually works towards a heightened amount of interiorisation and social links are maintained by a shared reference to a common '*idéal du Moi*.'²²¹ Tackling external objects, Marty and Fain suggested, can take pressure off the need to deal with internal objects.²²² Underneath the incorporated images of the satisfying, good object there is likely to be some residual toxic core of frustration.²²³ It is vital that early integration under the eye of an external object enable the infant to keep the need for immediate discharge (by way of the muscular apparatus) in abeyance.²²⁴ This build up of a capacity to defer action provides space for the elaboration of thought and fantasy.²²⁵ With early motricity contiguous to the crystallisation of a vector of *pulsion* but not identical with it, sense impressions and the excitements that go with them may lack representation.²²⁶

As Marty and Fain put it, the primal scene may reverberate through the body, although the cinema of fantasy may still be closed.²²⁷ If things go well for the infant, primary narcissistic identification, also working towards an inner corporal image, will achieve an amount of integration that will make the later elaboration of fantasy more feasible, even though fantasy may at times be hard put to serve as a buffer mechanism (*mécanisme tampon*) sufficiently capable to absorb the excitement generated by object relations.²²⁸ At the most archaic level of defence the subject lives a fantasy by channelling a response directly into motor action.²²⁹ With not enough mental holding structure, nascent fantasy may well be felt to be a useless excrement.²³⁰ This, then, presents a quandary: since impressions cannot be elaborated sufficiently by taking action on them, their continued inflow becomes persecutory.²³¹ If motor action is the means of choice to

process external reality, muscles in an impasse have to be restrained in painful contracture and in stiffening.²³² Marty and Fain notice with interest Wilhelm Reich's work on the muscular armour and importance of the form of expression over its particular contents, but diverge in the ways they put this to use in clinical thinking.²³³ Ideally, the authors suggest, their work could be a step towards a '*physiologie objectale*', which would place the development of expressive forms in a field in which maturation and object relations interact.²³⁴ In clinical work it may be the identification with the psychoanalyst and his/her interest in the patient's bodily motions that opens them up to increased understanding.²³⁵

Elements of interactional expression beyond language

In the discussion on the authors' contribution Sacha Nacht stressed that the dialogue analyst-patient, though overtly language bound, was in reality taking place on a level beyond language, notably including emotions, something also noted by Ajuriaguerra, who underlines that the authors permit a glimpse of the first lineaments of tonus and emotion – a 'dialogue body to body' - in the management of distance, an essential precondition for possible identifications that cannot thrive in its absence.²³⁶ René Diatkine regarded it as the task of the psychoanalysts of his generation to integrate their discipline into a larger perspective of neuro-biological development and welcomed the authors' contribution as a very interesting step in such an integration.²³⁷ Not surprisingly, in a parting shot after his dissociation from the *SPP*, Lacan singled out Marty and Fain's contribution as an example of what in his view was amiss with his former colleagues' understanding of psychoanalysis: too much attention to the 'real' elements in the relationship that deterred from imaginary constructions pursued by the patient, a line of attack which, despite their personal and ideological antagonism, shared elements with Marie Bonaparte's barbed comments on the paper: to her the interpretation of gestures and postures smacked of 'hyper-

interpretation'.²³⁸ In their concluding response to the discussion Marty and Fain explained that they were thinking of clinical examples in which it was not a certain way of thinking that caused a symptom but rather an incapacity to think.²³⁹ It was a Belgian analyst, Fernand Lechat, who in his intervention contrasted patients that refused contact with those who were pathologically incapable of it:

these types of individuals offer only colourless and monotonous verbal associations, which are nothing but the evocation of memories that seem to belong to another person's history and are only provided to obey the rules of the game.²⁴⁰

a problem, to which in due course, Marty and Fain would return with contributions of their own.

Object capture

If tackling reality in muscular response is a move that pre-emptly the ready emergence of fantasies while the effort lasts (Marie Bonaparte recalls Henri Bergson's reflection that action clogs representation), striving for near complete fusion with an object is another kind of recourse which enables the subject not to dwell on any shortcomings the moment might otherwise reveal.²⁴¹ In his 1958 paper Marty turns to a particular mode of negotiating distance he has frequently found with patients suffering from allergies: the attempt to merge completely with an object that, once within mental reach, has to be captured and successfully managed as a quasi annexed compound of the self.²⁴² Distinction between good and bad object does not matter much in this, what is important is the availability of an object that can be assimilated to the personal ideal of oneself.²⁴³ Marty reports the statement of a patient with eczema: 'I cannot live in myself, I cannot live unless united with another person'.²⁴⁴ There is a crisis if the host object evinces a quality that does not fit the task assigned to it: this is experienced like a loss of oneself.²⁴⁵

Although the Me may theoretically be weak, it does not appear to be so in practice, as long as

there is an object to fuse with.²⁴⁶ Objects, to some extent, are interchangeable.²⁴⁷ Often an object is kept in reserve to fall back upon in case of need.²⁴⁸ Analysis that purely addresses the neurotic screen will not get into contact with the non-neurotic core structure.²⁴⁹ This requires careful consideration on the part of the psychoanalyst.²⁵⁰

A new manifesto of psychosomatic investigation in the face of under-investigated lifestyles

In 1963 Pierre Marty, Michel de M'Uzan and Christian David published what soon was recognised as the manifesto of a new approach in psychoanalytic thinking about psychosomatic patients: '*L'investigation psychosomatique*'.²⁵¹ It had a considerable impact and became one of the founding documents of a new clinical outlook: the '*École de Paris de Psychosomatique*' (EPP).²⁵² In its centre the study put the transcripts of interviews with seven patients in a hospital setting in front of an audience of assistants comprising on average six to eight participants.²⁵³ Considerable thought had been invested in the particular setting: no table was placed between doctor and patient, the assistants were seated in clear view of the patient, as was a secretary who took down what was being said in shorthand.²⁵⁴ The examination was prolonged, taking always longer than one hour.²⁵⁵ Patients had been referred to this consultation either by other hospital services or by a local practitioner: seeing a psychoanalyst was not a home grown wish of theirs but was done on doctor's orders.²⁵⁶ Sometimes, but not always, the patient had been given some preparatory information on the nature and purpose of the consultation.²⁵⁷ The transcripts of the interviews were provided with copious footnotes to explain what the investigator was doing at each moment. On occasions the investigator addressed the assisting audience directly to point out, in presence of the patient, what had so far been learned of his/her mental structure.²⁵⁸ In addition to this, each patient interview was put into further perspective by a commentary at the end of the respective section. An introduction acquainted the reader with the theoretical perspective

adopted in the investigations and a conclusion proposed a preliminary take on the yields of the procedure.²⁵⁹ Early on the authors argued that the material they collected placed types of personality which had hitherto received too little attention into the centre of scrutiny,

or, more exactly, forms of life, which, as widespread as they may be, as trivial as they may appear, nevertheless, we believe, remain little known and little explored in spite of the human interest they arouse.²⁶⁰

To come to terms with this, the investigators probed the subject's defensive style, adaptive means, and capacity for object relations, as evidenced in the unusual situation encountered in the interview.²⁶¹ Resorting to established behavioural routines to shield against what could not be mentally digested was understood as but a brittle line of defence that, in case of breach, had to be bolstered by somatic symptoms.²⁶² One of the apparent worries of the investigators was that the possible disappearance of a symptom might wreak havoc on the total stability of the subject.²⁶³ To take this into consideration they proposed an economic viewpoint that strove to assess functional equivalents within the energy budget of a person.²⁶⁴ If well directed energy was a measure of mobilisation by the outer and inner object world,²⁶⁵ loss of this level of integration would lead to a deterioration in the quality of its articulation.²⁶⁶ What we might encounter then, in more diffuse form, was a tendency towards muscular contraction or a vacuous scanning for sensory stimuli as an external attractor to latch onto.²⁶⁷ In this view, somatic problems were part of a larger picture: the focus was on the person's habitual ways of handling him/herself and his/her relationships rather than on the disease as a separate entity.²⁶⁸ Within a given economy of mental means even hypochondria might be too organised a state of mind to be within easy reach of the patient.²⁶⁹ Building on earlier papers of Marty's, there was a noticeable interest in headaches routing aggressive tension that had not otherwise found expression,²⁷⁰ and a sensitivity towards fusional tendencies in object relations.²⁷¹ Maurice Bouvet, whom we have encountered

earlier, had taken an interest in the parameters of 'object distance' a given patient was most comfortable with: Marty, a lifelong devotee of the *corrida*, the Spanish bullfight, was keenly interested in the way patients made use of the arena they found themselves thrust into, after previous, prolonged exposure to the more familiar mores of the institutionalised medical care system.²⁷²

Everyone tries to understand what the bull does: what he loves and what he seeks, what he flees from, his going quiet, his silences, his brutal discharges, the evolution of his rhythm, his sense of attack and of defence, his means of expression, his reserve or his final fight²⁷³

Towards understanding fragile personality structure: business as usual as a front

What could be observed there and then, in public hearing, was treated as an X-ray picture of the subject's potential to handle him/herself in inner and outer worlds and as an indispensable preselector for therapeutic choices to be made after the session.²⁷⁴ In these interviews not only the layers and modes of the patients' subjective engagement drew the investigator's attention but also the rather camouflaged bypaths that were taken if more neurotic developments remained blocked. What at times appeared a solid character front, put in place to exercise rigid border control on any truly inter-subjective, fantasy fed commerce with the 'other', might not gradually show cracks and fissures if put under stress - and yet collapse without warning in one fell swoop.²⁷⁵

With little evidence for a sufficiently sustained ability to introject what is different, alterity is a threat that has to be managed by reduplication. In projective reduplication, Marty, de M'Uzan and David suggested, the other becomes a replica of one's own persona.²⁷⁶ The dimension of the factual in all its pressing urgency and the need to manage this takes precedence over everything

else.²⁷⁷ It is the preferential dimension of reference to be shared with the interlocutor, with the (dynamic) unconscious largely put out of circuit and the *magma fantasque* of early childhood buried.²⁷⁸ Understandably, the psychoanalyst confronted with a patient who offered little in the way of a subjective history or a personal future was put under considerable strain.²⁷⁹ There were, it seemed, obscure regions and powerful forces in the patient's life which did not have a configured mental interface.²⁸⁰ Inasmuch as the most profound interest of the ailing person was absorbed by an inner somatic object,²⁸¹ what thought he/she presented was starved of inner resources and battling against exhaustion.²⁸²

This said, not all of the cases presented showed *opératoire* functioning: the overarching purpose was to demonstrate the wide range of psychosomatic structures.²⁸³ Sometimes an early loss of a father had left a determining influence, and, on occasion, a repetition of intergenerational patterns could be spotted.²⁸⁴ In general, the investigators believed patients played the defensive possibilities at their disposal like a functional keyboard to rise to the challenges their everyday situations faced them with.²⁸⁵

When '*L'investigation psychosomatique*' was published, many of the authors' colleagues had already had the opportunity to acquaint themselves with its basic concepts: At the 23rd Congress of psychoanalysts of the Latin languages (*Congrès des psychanalystes de langues romanes*) in Barcelona in 1962 Pierre Marty and Michel de M'Uzan had given a report on *opératoire* thought. It arrived in print a few months after the *Investigation*.²⁸⁶ Its publication provided additional reflective depth with a slightly different emphasis.²⁸⁷ The authors set out by brushing, as it were, Michel Fain and Christian David's keynote congress paper (Fain and David 1963 [1962]) against the grain: if fantasy and dream life worked to protect and to further the subject's integration on levels encompassing the somatic, how would a marked lack in this function leave its imprint on

the individual's waking thoughts?²⁸⁸ Fantasy life in minus, they suggested, was to be found in *opératoire* thought – a new bland term for a bland state - that kept up a front of 'business as usual' but lacked any connection to an inner object really alive.²⁸⁹ It shadowed and accompanied action, reduced the investigator to his medical function and offered only a 'blank' relationship in return.²⁹⁰

The investigators surmised that this was what the patient was doing all his life, bogged down in actuality.²⁹¹ In contradistinction to the obsessional type he/she did not suffer from an abundance of significant connections that kept him/her from acting.²⁹² Under his vigilant grasp everything transformed into morsels of the present.²⁹³ Bereft of inner directions the person was groping for the safe parameters provided by convention.²⁹⁴ Contact with the unconscious seemed to be established on a most rudimentary, least elaborated level, beneath the threshold of '*la vie pulsionnelle*'.²⁹⁵ The capacity to refrain from routing disquiet into motor discharge was diminished, and dream life was impaired, with a particular propensity to insomnia.²⁹⁶ If fantasies did develop, they should be appreciated by the therapist in their functional value, given enough slack and not pounced upon in interpretation of their content.²⁹⁷ The authors emphasised the importance of prophylactic action with children so as to develop their full capacity for fantasy in their lives.²⁹⁸

'Essential depression': a fall in tonus without a narrative

Clearly, the role of the object in the development of early fantasy life was decisive.²⁹⁹ How could Marty and his colleagues come to terms with the apparent disappearance of a vital object in *opératoire* life? In 1968 Marty published a paper in the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* in which he focused on a particular form of adult depression: *la dépression essentielle*.³⁰⁰ In it, all

ability to sustain a libidinal investment of object world and self seemed to have vanished and with it the usual gamut of mechanisms the unconscious uses to keep up links.³⁰¹ Libidinal tonus was much diminished, and only obeisance to duty seemed to subsist.³⁰² The patient was treating himself as just another file on the way to just another doctor.³⁰³ It was not so much that the psychoanalyst was kept at a distance by attacks on his/her position, but rather that the potential to maintain links had slipped and vanished.³⁰⁴ In this dwindling away Marty saw a similarity to the bleeding away of vitality at the end of life without functional recompensation.³⁰⁵ If calm was more important than anything else and function was silently disintegrating, Marty pointed out, we were in the territory of the '*instinct de mort*'.³⁰⁶ Careful assessment of the situation was needed:

In doing so, we arrive at a functional evaluation, in which weight is given to [a] mental investments, both pathological and normal, [b] the tendency to employ action and behaviour in a response and [c] the wealth and the mode of object relations. The appearance of a somatic disturbance, in general, follows upon an alteration more or less comprehensive, in the aftermath of a conflict.³⁰⁷

Counselling divergence from the more customary tenet in French psychoanalysis of the importance of frustrating by maintaining one's distance, Marty stresses it was necessary to keep close to such patients, opening up the possibility for him/her to identify with a person not too different from him/her.³⁰⁸

A launchpad for a new comprehensive system

In 1967 already, Marty had observed that progressive disorganisation produced different results from regression in that it did not necessarily gravitate towards a fixation.³⁰⁹ Faced with the need for differentiation, Marty was looking for systematisation on a larger scale.³¹⁰ In '*Les*

mouvements individuels de vie et de mort' (Marty 1976) and in '*L'ordre psychosomatique*' (Marty 1980)³¹¹ he attempted to map out his findings in an evolutionary perspective which shared conceptual preoccupations with the neo-Jacksonian perspective proposed by Henri Ey but moved into a different direction.³¹² Marty strove to understand how a person in crisis could bodily suffer from a lack of being adequately disturbed in the mind.³¹³

With Ey, Marty believed that speaking of disintegration necessitated concepts of hierarchy and evolution.³¹⁴ For him, lack of integration was the initial starting point of the newly born: the '*mosaïque première*'.³¹⁵ To the extent cohesion is still lacking, it has to be provided by the functioning of the mother.³¹⁶ Gradually, individual rhythms are established, moving from basic *automation* (repetitive patterns) to more sophisticated *programmation* (a differentiation opening up the way to new functional links).³¹⁷ As the maturational potential of the child develops, the mother has to scale down her subsidiary help.³¹⁸ Depending on the early history of a person his/her evolutionary trajectory will show a variety of fixations to which he/she can return in case of crisis.³¹⁹ There will be parallel or lateral branches of structured response capabilities, split off in their dynamics from mainline development.³²⁰ Among them Marty ranges possibilities such as the processing of stressful situations in certain types of asthma, or manifestations of perverse sexual behaviour, mechanisms that, as varied as they are, take off pressure without being easily amenable to mental perlaboration.³²¹ Once we are familiar with the individual's fallback positions and available lines of defence against being put to rout (*les paliers de réorganisation*) we can better appreciate his/her defensive depth (*l'épaisseur régressive*).³²²

Central linchpin (*plaque tournante*) to the revitalisation of the subject is the preconscious.³²³ Its depth, internal fluidity and retentive capacities keeps the subject in exchange with inner and outer worlds.³²⁴ Significantly, Marty believed that an inner life working reasonably well

according to Freud's First Topography was not a universal given but came as an acquisition.³²⁵ Only on this basis could those inner structures take shape that were described in Freud's Second Topography.³²⁶

Hierarchical structures exposed to traumatic events

When a traumatic event strikes, full mental functioning is threatened. Depending on the previous development of layered, hierarchical structures, the response will come in the form of regression (partial or global) or of progressive disorganisation (temporary or progressive), in which mental response capacity is obliterated.³²⁷ In rising to such threat, different mental economies command quite different resources, depending on the means they routinely deploy to process tension.³²⁸ Marty distinguishes 'neuroses of behaviour'³²⁹ (*névroses de comportement*) – people whose stability strongly depends on their investment in what they are doing - and 'neuroses of character'³³⁰ - which Marty believed to be the most widespread contemporary form of neurosis - from more well mentalised neuroses capable of a full range of regressive possibilities.³³¹ In this way of thinking, the *opératoire* constitutes a fragile, precarious response to crisis on a minimal level of resilience,³³² in mental conditions that often do not correspond to the psychoanalyst's expectations.³³³

It is indeed among the neuroses of behaviour and some neuroses of character that *opératoire* states, according to Marty, find their most conducive structural hinterland:³³⁴ with little reserve to draw upon, essential depression more easily sets in, leading to the residual states of the *opératoire*, if the de-structuring process does not proceed further to severe and increasingly progressive somatic illness.³³⁵ It is a precarious state of affairs, in which there is some stabilisation while cohesion is no longer safeguarded.³³⁶ The individual appears reduced to the agglomeration of machinelike apparatuses and a mosaic of elements of conduct.³³⁷ Survival, not

having a life worth living, is the order of the day: to the interviewer in Marty's experience the patient frequently appears like a dead man walking, a shell of loosely connected templates of conduct, from which any or most of the significance they may have had, has evaporated in the new state of affairs.³³⁸ The phenomenon, though, is Janus faced: as long as automation proceeds, there remains hope of an ultimate restoration of a functional larger whole: it is a ledge the person can cling on to, for now.³³⁹

The importance of careful dosage in therapeutic response and the mothering function

In interviewing the patient, Marty argues, one should not be misled by a momentary flush of mental functioning that cannot be sustained in the long run and proves to be but a flash in the pan.³⁴⁰ In an ensuing therapy it is important that the analyst maintain an active presence. Despite being a relational object of importance, he/she may not receive full investment as an object.³⁴¹ It may be destabilising for the patient to be confronted with a freedom of mental movement in the person of the interviewer that much surpasses his/her own.³⁴² Dosage, Marty emphasises, is important and the therapist will have to adjust the relationship so that it supports the maximum level of organisation accessible to the patient while encouraging unconscious articulation.³⁴³ Before antibiotics were available, Marty points out, the institution of the sanatorium attempted to offer a carefully calibrated environment – at a distance to normal daily life - to stimulate and support self-healing processes.³⁴⁴ In a similar vein Marty enjoins on the therapist a mothering function that builds on the available grasp (*automation*) to stimulate the right amount of farther reach (*programmation*).³⁴⁵ Again, the psychoanalyst has to be careful so as not unwittingly to bolster a *Moi idéal* pushing towards enablement of the Me to such a degree that it stifles regression.³⁴⁶

What is important is to introduce, when needed, an element of reanimation. Once again, the relational form discernible (both to self and others) should be studied carefully and assessed in its functional value before focusing on conflictual content.³⁴⁷ At the end of the interview a possible sense of being abandoned by the interviewer has to be guarded against.³⁴⁸

Marty, on one of his journeys, treated psychosomatic patients in Africa and relates that, in his experience, *opératoire* phenomena can frequently be found in families that moved abruptly to a Western way of life. Without a traditional world providing cushions to regression in case of need, and mothers unable to accompany a transition from one culture to the other in early childhood, individuals have to resort to the emergency measures of the *opératoire*.³⁴⁹

Layered mentalisation

Behind the loss of structure or apparent in-organisation³⁵⁰ covered by a bland surface, there may hide considerable complexities: Marty stresses that the sensibility is still working but that the patient's propulsive and expressive capacities are impaired.³⁵¹ Marty's often quoted formula for this phenomenon is: 'In terms of the First Topography, the unconscious receives but does not emit'³⁵², resulting, according to Fain, in a *malaise*, without concomitant drama.³⁵³

From the early 1970s Marty increasingly used the term 'mentalisation' as a shorthand for a state of affairs in which a fully functional 'preconscious' was at work.³⁵⁴ It is the permanent wealth of available representations that makes classical repression of unconscious significance necessary. Despite its inconveniences it bolsters mental structure, thereby relieving the body of taking the brunt.³⁵⁵ He uses the example of the doll to show how layer upon layer of meaning creates additional depths to the mental registration of sensory perception: First it is an object to touch

and to sight, then an image of a tiny infant and in the end becomes sexually charged as a girl to dally with. When the object is thought of in adult life, there will be an echo chamber of resonances beyond its mere thingness. If this network of connections cannot be built over time, or collapses under the shock of mental sideration at a later stage, only thingness remains, as such rather refractory to perlaboration.³⁵⁶ Thus there are events that seen from the outside should be unsettling but, in fact, barely register.³⁵⁷

What seems to reduce mental registration, on the other hand, increases the likelihood of a bodily response to a reality to which a cushion of mental processes is lacking.³⁵⁸ For all its possible mental obtuseness, the individual remains exposed to 'individual movements of life and death'.³⁵⁹

'Instinct' as a vector of vitality and the reverses in progressive disorganisation

It has been observed that Marty's use of the word instinct in his later writings does not quite correspond to what is usually understood by it, nor correspond to the usual meaning of the French '*pulsion*'.³⁶⁰

The Instincts of Life do not reside in a force simply measurable, but in a quality, a virtuality, a potentiality attached to all the functions, which makes life feel better than [just] living matter, the latter being only partially capable of producing an account for this.³⁶¹

The 'Instinct of Life', as Marty employs the term, is manifested by structure working at peak capacity of its evolutionary potential.³⁶² The 'Instincts of Death', on the other hand, show themselves in the failure and disappearance of function, in particular in a counter-evolutionary sense, which reduces vital complexity, rolls back integration and results in disorganisation.³⁶³ This, with Marty, is not, as Freud's *Todestrieb*, an autonomous, albeit negative force, it is rather the undoing of the evolutionary vector producing and sustaining life in a particular individual.³⁶⁴

Whereas André Green's work on negativity finds its pivotal point in thinking about a mother who, though being physically present, has inexplicably become distant and dead in her feelings for the child, Pierre Marty's starting point seems to be elsewhere: in the progressive wasting away of a person, with little overt drama, in a process medicine can describe but is at a loss fully to comprehend:

A patient consults a doctor for hyperthyroidism. The doctor is able to heal it. Then diabetes appears, which one puts into equilibrium again with doses of insulin. A pulmonary tuberculosis arises. The cure of the tuberculosis with the help of drugs triggers digestive troubles. One changes therapy and tries other drugs. They bring about a retrobulbar optic neuritis [an inflammation of the optic nerve]. The doctor finds himself truly taken aback, having the impression that all the action on his part produces an unforeseen [somatic] response by the patient.

One strives in vain to find an anatomic-pathological link between the different affections presented by a 37 year old man³⁶⁵

Any representation of what is wrong seems to have gone missing in action without even the possibility of meaningful closure.³⁶⁶ The practitioner is left in a position woefully analogous to Bartleby's boss foiled and defeated in his every move.³⁶⁷ If the person suffering mentally may be attacked by terrifying shapes, Marty's patient of reference seems to be hounded noiselessly, but to great effect, by no-shape – brought down by a sudden loss of previously reasonably reliable structure.³⁶⁸

Compared to this silent progressive disorganisation even mental pathologies seemed to hold the body together.³⁶⁹ Marty believed it was difficult for the psychoanalyst used to the working of the mental apparatus in which the unconscious and the preconscious were working according to Freud's First Topography to accept the irregularities offered by the patients of which Marty and

his colleagues were striving to take the measure and truly to perceive what they were seeing.³⁷⁰ It was difficult to come to terms with what supposed to be there but was not.³⁷¹

Psychosomatic psychosomatics as the heir to Sacha Nacht's project

At the same time, and on another level, Marty's project, which came to fruition in the Eighties, was in many ways the continuation of Sacha Nacht's agenda: the insertion of psychoanalysis in medicine as a recognised and legitimate part of it. Working towards that goal, the phenomenon of affects offered itself as a particularly propitious zone of investigation, an area, where interests might converge, as efforts by Franz Alexander and his colleagues in America gave reason to hope.³⁷² This was not, nor could it be, the path of those who had split from the *SPP* in 1953: for different reasons neither Lagache nor Lacan were willing to move into the direction Nacht was favouring, and, in a deeper sense, the split had been just about that divergence. When Pierre Marty, Head of Clinic at Sainte-Anne,³⁷³ was won over to psychoanalysis by no other than Ajuriaguerra, post war psychoanalysis showed that it was a conceptual force to be reckoned with. Marty's further moves undertaken to establish psychosomatics in France as a legitimate angle of investigation, although running into opposition, repeatedly received vital support from the pillars of medical and political institutions, without which it could not have been as successful as it was.³⁷⁴ Conceptually this project came at a price: to Marty the psychosomatic viewpoint *included* the psychoanalytic one,³⁷⁵ a proposition liable to raise doubts about the exact position of psychoanalysis within the suggested unified perspective. André Green, who with regret observed that an envisaged controversial debate with Marty never materialised, once remarked that Marty's system was less geared towards meta-psychology than to meta-somatics, arriving at an imaginative biologisation of psychoanalytic thought.³⁷⁶

From the late Fifties fresh efforts were being made in France's public health system to reach new strata of the population in better ways. Part of this outreach activity were pilot projects like *ASM 13*, the ethno-psychoanalytic service established by Tobie Nathan and Pierre Marty's psychosomatic clinic.³⁷⁷ By participating in these efforts, psychoanalysis got into contact with patients that might never have crossed the threshold of a private practice. In Marty's case, this meant close contact with patients who had been through all available medical screening but whose complaints had never been resolved.³⁷⁸ Marty and Fain noticed that the imputation of repressed meaning as a root cause of these complaints was neither plausible nor helpful.³⁷⁹ What they also noticed was that these patients were deeply exhausted in their ability to process what had befallen them. In various ways, behind a bland surface, they were at the end of their tether, more on the verge of disintegration than on eruption.³⁸⁰ The *EPP*'s core assumptions, in a way, took a path similar to Freud's observations on the disappearance of higher capacities in a man beset by acute toothache:

‘Concentrated is his soul’, says Wilhelm Busch of the poet suffering from toothache, ‘in his molar's narrow hole.’³⁸¹

Very boldly, they took this one notch further: What if the man's tooth was in rebellion because his bearer had had no sufficient mental space to process his love-sickness?³⁸²

A social dimension at the margins of perception

There are problems with this approach, something that naturally became clearer as others began to take it up, develop it and work through its implications, at times in a different context than the one originally proposed. This, in hindsight, makes it easy to see that any findings must necessarily be highly context sensitive. A person presenting an irritatingly bland version of him/herself may harbour hidden preferences on where and when best to be bland: just as

sergeants in crisis situations are thought to be skilful in handling lieutenants by non-disclosure of their own hearts' counsel,³⁸³ social encounters regularly offer a varying degree of 'depth'. Pierre Marty, in his conversations with Nicolaïdis, recalls that Flanders Dunbar, when he met her in the Fifties, struck him as a person one could only relate to on a superficial level.³⁸⁴ His approach, for all its holistic aspirations, shows little noticeable interest in the previous experience of patients with institutions, unless indicative of personal fissure lines. Despite an interest in social conditions, social style as a distinctive element of affiliation is not given much consideration in its own right.³⁸⁵ Thus, for instance, the frequent use of direct speech rather than indirect speech is primarily understood as a personal trait pointing towards possible difficulties in interiorisation.³⁸⁶ Yet, when patients met the interviewer, the frame they suddenly found themselves in will have carried a weight of its own in the encounter.³⁸⁷

This stands in contrast to one of the other interviews, with a nurse quite comfortable with a hospital setting,³⁸⁸ who presented with little sign of '*opératoire*' thinking. Patients, on the whole, seemed to have experienced these interviews and the presentation that was required of them in different ways - and not all of this was likely to have been a straightforward emanation of their personal pathology. Continuing an institutional tradition of seeing patients assisted by a train of junior trainee doctors, it was a marked improvement upon it, in that it accorded the individual sufferer a hearing luxuriously long under hospital conditions.³⁸⁹

A new terminology

While this was developing medical practice into a direction heavily informed by experience within the psychoanalytic frame, the way Marty chose to present the sum of his findings (Marty 1976, Marty 1980) broke with the conventions of contemporary psychoanalytic language. In its

style it seems to have hearkened back to his much earlier discussions with Ajuriaguerra, set in the years of Henri Ey's considerable ascendancy in the psychiatric debate.³⁹⁰ Somewhat reminiscent of Bion's Grid, Marty developed his own system of classification that tried comprehensively to list factors pertinent to the clinical assessment of psychosomatic patients.³⁹¹ Though it might have been a personal preference, it also formed part of a strategic choice: only by developing a classificatory system could statistical material systematically be gathered.³⁹²

Some doubt, even by those who approved the new classificatory grid, remained: Were patients classified under the heading of 'character neurosis, mentalisation uncertain', seen by the psychiatrist actually the same as those seen by the doctor of internal medicine?³⁹³ No answer was given to the question and it is easy to see why: if both psychiatrist and doctor of internal medicine were making use of the same grid but interpreting it differently in the context of their separate patient encounters, how would one discern those differences that were not registered and subsequently taken into account by the shared classification?

Marty's legacy

On the whole, Marty's thinking, beyond its reception in France, fell on fertile ground in the Spanish speaking world, to which Marty felt close ties, mastering the language himself.³⁹⁴ Marty himself noticed that his thinking fared better where discourse had developed from Latin structures and travelled less well in English.³⁹⁵ One of his last journeys took him to Algeria, where interest in his work had sprung up.³⁹⁶

One of his lasting contributions to the debate was a sense of the depths of mental exhaustion hiding behind relentlessly functioning facades, an exhaustion that was not due to the working of classic repression, but something much closer to life slowly ebbing away that could easily escape

attention behind the bland, undramatic surface.³⁹⁷ While he was very influential in raising the problem, the ensuing discussion went beyond the theoretical system he personally suggested.³⁹⁸

We shall see that Michel Fain, Marty's friend, brother-in-law and long time collaborator, who outlived him by almost fifteen years, remaining productive for quite some time, was thinking in inner scenes produced by social interactions where Marty was building carefully arched conceptual cathedrals dedicated to the understanding for the rise and fall of an evolutionary *élan vital* expressed in individual structure.³⁹⁹ While Marty's perspective does integrate presuppositions on early interactions in an appraisal of structure, Fain has much more an eye for the hidden drama of which a given structure may be the ossified mute memorial, a difference of style, emphasis and nuance that had further consequences down the ramifications of their clinical thinking.⁴⁰⁰

If Marty's take on the complexities of the doll was quite multi-layered as it stood in its focus on the child, Fain was prepared to ask questions that distinctly added further dimensions in questioning the imaginings of the mother: What if the mother's inner eye could not take in the ruddy infant before her, but could only see its potential to be transformed into an inanimate doll to be handled at will?⁴⁰¹ It is to Michel Fain's contributions we have to turn now to understand another long term effect of Pierre Marty's legacy.

Chapter Five: Foundations 2: Michel Fain with Denise Braunschweig

In April 1998, not long after Michel Fain had turned 80 (he was born on 29 November 1917)⁴⁰², when colleagues came together in Annecy, Savoy, to honour the import of his life's work by debating it with verve, there was a moment when the celebree was notably struck by an exposé of one of the participants. In it François Duparc, based on remarks of Fain's,⁴⁰³ identifies four major lines of development in early mother-child interaction. Listening to the exposition, the reminder struck Fain as if out of the blue and caused him, he avowed, something akin to an attack of anxiety: He had forgotten all about this particular germ of thought and had failed to develop it any further.⁴⁰⁴ As painful as this realisation was to Fain, it is a fitful illustration of a tenet pivotal in Michel Fain's thinking: every event, according to him, unfolds its personal significance in three stages: (a) original incidence within a given relational field – (b) latency – (c) configuration of its ultimate personal meaning and impact.⁴⁰⁵ This, he holds, is not only true of the symptom, but also of the effects of an interpretation given in a session,⁴⁰⁶ or, more generally, the vicissitudes of scientific discovery and psychoanalytic discourse.⁴⁰⁷ In this chapter we shall see how much Michel Fain's thought added to the original propositions by Pierre Marty.⁴⁰⁸

Marty's original hunch in a different frame: the mother and the lover

Taking its cues from Freud, his line of thinking not only gives a new guise to Marty's thought, but also takes it to new directions.⁴⁰⁹ Discontinuing Marty's attempts at a meta-biology, Fain places the focus much more squarely on the interactions of a concrete child with a concrete mother.⁴¹⁰ In contradistinction to any approach privileging the outwardly observable, Fain takes a

keen interest in the fantasies affecting the mother as she is handling her child.⁴¹¹ Important parts of his work were developed together with Denise Braunschweig between 1970 and 1981, at a time when they formed a couple.⁴¹²

In its ideal-typical form, the early foundations of a rich fantasy life, according to Braunschweig and Fain, might be laid as follows: After a period during which the mother's attention is intensely centred on the newborn child, there comes a time when she wants to resume her larger interests and in particular her love life.⁴¹³ To turn '*femme*' (woman or/and wife) again she has to take periodic leave from her functions as a mother. As she is holding the child her mind strays elsewhere: how can she put her child to undisturbed sleep so that she can turn into the arms of her lover? In a series of exchanges with her infant, investment is withdrawn within a safe enough framework, which permits the child to glide into sleep and into more auto-erotic modes. In such an early affective ambiance in the gravitational pull of a triadic field, the hysteric potential of the child and its capacity for bi-sexual identification is gradually developed to the rhythm of continuously repeated discontinuities of investment.⁴¹⁴ It is such an environment in which the hallucination of desire can find its place.⁴¹⁵

In its early form published in Fain 1971a,⁴¹⁶ Braunschweig and Fain's concept of the '*censure de l'amante*' – their term for the vital, structuring role of the mother turned lover – predates André Green's concept of the 'Dead Mother', to which it yet forms the flip side of a coin, the negative of a negative.⁴¹⁷ In Green's version the mother, who had previously taken delight in her child, has become absorbed by an unspeakable loss, which, inexplicably to the child, has transformed her presence into a permanent mental absence. In vain the child tries to reinsert him/herself into a story that would make sense of this brutal eclipse of the sun, in a world which had just a short while before been full of colour and warmth and light.⁴¹⁸

As in Green's template, yet separated from it as if by an abyss, the much more fortunate child in Braunschweig and Fain's situation of reference senses that something important has happened to his/her mother.

When the desire for her male partner reappears with a mother, a message gets transmitted to her child by way of a modification of her bodily contact, a message that points to an object of desire in another location. The body of the mother, as it extricates itself “mentally” from the one of the child, confers autonomy to the latter. In this regard we have used the image that the mother takes back her narcissistic investment from the child “to put it on as make up” (*pour s'en farder*).⁴¹⁹

... the *femme* takes back, for her own dispositions, all the investment, in which it had enveloped her child, and in doing so becomes fascinating. This fascination gets displaced on this *femme*'s object of desire.⁴²⁰

The early bath of affects and the role of stimulating discontinuities

This, if circumstances are sufficiently good, is embedded in a kind of lullaby, drenched in affects addressed to the child and attaching itself to the animistic worlds of the child.⁴²¹ The mood music, deeply sunk into the unsaid⁴²² that underlies the quality of the gently rocking movements with which the mother lulls the baby cradled in her arms into sleep (*le bercement*) is crucial for future developments.⁴²³ Maternal tenderness nurtures a link between a wholesome, indispensable narcissism it confers (*narcissisme de vie*) and the quality of the infant's sleep: 'my sleep loves me just as my mother does'.⁴²⁴

Handling her baby in this way, enrobing it in the projection of her own narcissism, the mother enthrones it as “his majesty the baby”.⁴²⁵ Yet, the wish to put her child to sleep is not a purely altruistic act – she has to take leave of her child to resume those parts of her life that exclude it.⁴²⁶ In a partnership this means putting functioning as a parent on hold and leaving family concerns aside so as to turn to each other as lovers.⁴²⁷ It is the '*censure de l'amante*' mentioned above, a contact barrier between their moments as lovers and their function in the family, that permits the parents for the time of their lovemaking to forget that they are parents.⁴²⁸ For the child it is important that the sexual relationship between the parents is working out well enough.⁴²⁹ On it depends the way the infant's id transforms in its contact with reality, the way primal fantasies are organised and the functional quality of the preconscious.⁴³⁰

When the mother puts her child to bed, withdrawing the protective cover of her full libidinal investment in it, she rarely leaves it with a sufficiently functioning defensive shield.⁴³¹ This exposes the child to stimuli from the realms of raw, non-symbolised reality, which impact on its sensibility.⁴³² Fain likens the resulting fragile situation to the paranoid-schizoid position.⁴³³ Counter-availing to these forces of fragmentation there is the pull to what the child vaguely senses as the mother's desire directed to an absent third that reinforces its auto-erotism.⁴³⁴ It identifies both with the desiring mother and with the desired third, and within this framework the perception of lack serves as an architect for future dreams.⁴³⁵ Contact with the reality of the parents' reciprocal sexual desire sets off differentiations within the child's id and stimulates an elaboration of animistic thought.⁴³⁶ Since it springs from the loss of the mother's palpable physical presence, nascent desire contains strong masochistic elements.⁴³⁷ The loss of the position as the centre of the mother's universe combines with emerging fantasies about the privileged beneficiary of the mother's changed focus to create a sense of riches lost and to be rediscovered:

As a matter of fact, we have already tackled the matter that is implicit in the principle that rules unconscious mental life: each time when the pressures of the external world entail the repression of the exercise of a function, even if this function in the end does not bring about great pleasure in its exercise, from the moment repression leads to its loss it undergoes a change and symbolically turns into the most marvellous thing the subject has ever possessed. Just as the end of the state of primary narcissism transforms it into a lost paradise for the subject but not for the parents who take delight in it together, the lost function is acquired by the father, all the work consisting from now on to rediscover it.⁴³⁸

The infant's fantasy life against the background of the parents' relationship

This is a very important experience but itself part of a larger gamut of mutual relations in which the unconscious fantasies of the parents play an important part: the fantasies awakened in the mother when she touches the child;⁴³⁹ the way the father responds to the spectacle of the unfolding relationship between mother and child;⁴⁴⁰ the jealousy with which the mother responds to the unconscious identification with the mother, which shapes the counter-oedipal aspects of the father's position;⁴⁴¹ the ways the parents talk or behave when they believe the child cannot comprehend them;⁴⁴² the degree to which the father himself experienced an investment of good quality by his own mother;⁴⁴³ the narcissistic cover of a texture, different from the mother, which the father 'of good quality' early on provides for his daughter;⁴⁴⁴ or the paths on which the boy arrives at a possible positive identification with his father;⁴⁴⁵ all contribute to infinitely complex individual variations.⁴⁴⁶ Particular circumstances are liable to complicate pre-existing structure.⁴⁴⁷ Braunschweig and Fain argue that '*pulsion*' comes into being on the basis of successive inscriptions of memory traces constituted by various registers of language intimately and erotically linked to the body⁴⁴⁸ – a perspective, they contend in the same context, which, by

situating outside the infant the erogenous excitement, is able to provide an explicative hypothesis to the mysterious concept of '*pulsion*'.⁴⁴⁹

Early on the mother transmits an unconscious message of inquietude to her child with regard to its continued well-being, when she is faced with auto-erotic behaviour and her responses to it. This unspoken exchange, understood by Braunschweig and Fain as the first stage of the structuring of the castration complex, receives its interpretation only in retrospect, creating the myth, almost akin to a primal fantasy, that the mother had in fact issued a verbal warning.⁴⁵⁰ It is deeply steeped in the mother's own unconscious fantasies, a manifestation of her own oedipal conflicts.⁴⁵¹ A contribution by Braunschweig sheds light on some of the intricacies involved in this approach:

[When we treat a child] We give shape to what it experiences vaguely, we structure his Oedipus, we separate him from his object of desire, and doing so, we bandage up his narcissism (but not solely by virtue of our words). We do not tell him, 'You are too little to have sexual relations with your parents', but whatever the mode of libidinal satisfaction envisaged might be, 'You think that papa or mummy would then rob you of your genital organs, or his love, or your ability to experience pleasure' and when we say this in effect – or do not say so in words – the child experiences with us a prohibition to act reiterated, a prohibition he finds reassuring, because, in any case, he cannot act.⁴⁵²

Abandoned to its own devices, the subject exhausts itself in vain attempts to discover workable means to discharge excitement. Experiences are needed that give form to dream symbolism, making use of the mediating force of primal fantasies. These experiences are provided by the alternation of periods of retention interspersed with periods of satisfaction.⁴⁵³ In Freud's understanding of the First Topography, the unconscious, Fain points out, maintains a constant pressure towards the preconscious, aided and directed in this push by preconscious content

previously put into latency.⁴⁵⁴ If this is so, the time of latency required has to be of a particular quality, a quality that will to some extent be shaped by cultural factors.⁴⁵⁵

Thus, despite Marty's reticence to envisage this, his concept of evolution necessarily contains a cultural perspective, which as Fain argues, is patently included, in particular, in the phenomenology of the *opérateur*.⁴⁵⁶ Fain conceptually differentiates the non-symbolised 'real' from a subjectively accessible reality that may be grasped, passed on in codified form and which supplies incentives to action models.⁴⁵⁷ Since reality, in this perspective, is an 'interim notion [*une notion temporaire*] as defined by a given group',⁴⁵⁸ it is of particular importance to which extent a family and their ways of dealing with the spoken and the unspoken provides a framework for the emergence of animistic thought in a child.⁴⁵⁹ Will there be sufficient space for an oscillation between the 'baby of the night', the baby of fantasies, and the 'baby of the day', the infant in its material existence and its social significance?⁴⁶⁰

In this context, the mother's membership of a wider social group affects the messages she transmits to her child.⁴⁶¹ If the way the parents live their sexuality does not provide building blocks for the child to organise his/her fantasy of the primal scene,⁴⁶² the image of an erotic father will find itself excluded, with damaging effect for the future development of the child.⁴⁶³ A good deal depends upon fine balances in the dealings between the mother and the child. Early trauma does not necessarily point towards objective flaws in a mother but might as well spring from a mismatch between the subject and the ambient framework into which various factors, some of them conceivably of hereditary nature, may enter,⁴⁶⁴ putting at risk the emergence of a field of integration complexified enough within a developed mental economy.⁴⁶⁵ Reflecting on the experience of the child's encounter with his/her own mirror image, which entered psychoanalytic discourse with Lacan, Braunschweig and Fain characteristically contextualise it:

the image results from a complex history, which is particular to each and everyone, and in which the individual appropriates a series of figurations emerging from the latent thoughts of others.⁴⁶⁶

A question of fine balances easily to be disturbed

Serge Lebovici, one of the pioneers of the psychoanalytic study of the child in France, in 1965 encouraged Michel Soulé, a paedopsychiatrist, and Michel Fain, known for his psychosomatic research, to undertake a study of the somatic disorganisations of early childhood, a work group which was then also joined by Léon Kreisler, a paediatrician and clinical director of the department of child and adolescent psychiatry at the hospital Saint-Vincent-de-Paul.⁴⁶⁷ Organised in the form of a series of discussions between its three contributors on a number of functional disturbances in early childhood, the contributions appeared in its first form in instalments in the journal *La psychiatrie de l'enfant* between 1966 and 1974.⁴⁶⁸ The discussions seem to have deepened Fain's interest in the plight of the very young child suffering from insomnia.⁴⁶⁹ For this baby the fine balances necessary for drifting safely into sleep have been severely disturbed and the mother, emitting discordant messages, has not been able to protect it against an excess of excitement in her arms, of which she herself is the source – this early quandary becomes a crucial point of reference in Fain's thinking.⁴⁷⁰

Continuous rocking, pitting itself against any emergent discontinuity, is employed to force the child into sleep, a sleep which, when it does eventually come, is not conducive to the development of a wholesome dream life.⁴⁷¹ The place a satisfying mother might have occupied has been lost to a mother hyperactively intent on instilling calm, reducing to nought any auto-erotic tendencies:⁴⁷² sometimes this leads to violent spasms of sobbing in presence of the mother in which unconsciousness is sought by induced anoxia.⁴⁷³ Fighting agitation by persistent mechanical rocking, the mother tries to fight fire with fire in an attempt not only to run down

excitement but also to dull sensibility.⁴⁷⁴ There are instances in which what gets transmitted seems to be '*une pure culture d'instinct de mort*' pushing towards the extinction rather than the transformation of excitement.⁴⁷⁵ One might say, Fain muses, taking his cue from Bion, that the holding frame (*le cadre*) has lost its capacity to dream the subject.⁴⁷⁶ It is as if a bad fairy had been sitting at the infant's bedside.⁴⁷⁷

Premature maturity as a heavy burden

To come to terms with the chronically unsafe environment, in which passivity does not procure any pleasure, the infant prematurely strives for a maximum of attainable mastery:⁴⁷⁸ to make up for what he/she does not receive, the child does everything to construct his/her own bunker.⁴⁷⁹

In fact, under the impact of an excitement receiving an insufficient holding structure within a balanced family organisation, there may from the outset develop a primal disequilibrium between the processes of mastery and that excitement,⁴⁸⁰

Sensory perceptions cannot easily be put to rest⁴⁸¹ or mutated into '*pulsion*'.⁴⁸² Animistic thinking finds no favourable conditions to blossom.⁴⁸³ There is little resonance for double layers of meaning in language.⁴⁸⁴ Early suffering does not give rise to an abundance of representations.⁴⁸⁵ To develop quickly becomes the supreme imperative, with less space accorded to complexification and mental sophistication.⁴⁸⁶ As a result, the development of the Me suffers a distortion, a condition, which may, but need not be, an antecedent of a future obsessional neurosis.⁴⁸⁷ One cannot, Fain points out, endlessly put oneself to bed all alone, as it were, especially if one has no illusions.⁴⁸⁸

Although one or the other line of development is more pronounced with each individual, traces of the imperative of prematurity and the imperative of complexification co-exist in everyone.⁴⁸⁹

What will vary is the degree to which a child is exposed to distorting influences in his/her early childhood.⁴⁹⁰ Braunschweig and Fain, in one of their quirky musings, give a twist to Lacan's formula of the 'foreclosed' by connecting it to a meaning it has in legal transactions: a right forfeited because not laid claim to within a stipulated period. Coming too late to exercise it, the claimant finds the service desk closed and the clerk asleep protecting himself against the disturbance by producing dreams.⁴⁹¹

Transitionality provided or impeded by the parents

When parents leave their children so as to spend time as lovers, they do not quite close the service desk abruptly: the transitional objects described by Winnicott are provided by the parents to be deployed in a space from which they are going to become absent.⁴⁹² The ability to put playful distance to the world is embedded in the ability of the parents to disengage from their social obligations and their duty to larger groups.⁴⁹³ On this disengagement depends their time as lovers and, if they are able to experience this, their sleep in each other's arms, an echo of the sleep of the baby whom its mother has helped to let go of daytime object investments.⁴⁹⁴

In this way, the Sandman, bringing about the child's slumbers, closes its eyes on the things it should not know, while at the same time protecting the parents from a return of the repressed that would confer to their vigorous lovemaking a forbidden character. He thus condenses the barrier of censorship and the protective shield systematically deployed by each family.⁴⁹⁵

In his multi-layered reading of the dream of the burning child there are echoes of Lacan's emphasis on the intrusion of 'the real' into the dream:⁴⁹⁶ Fain imagines a prequel to the child's death: exhausted by the long watches at the son's sickbed, the father at a certain point had repressed indications of his son's worsening fever so as to be able to sleep. The son's death not only caused the re-emergence of the perception in a traumatic dream, it shed doubt on the quality

of the compromise – and its wisdom – effected to enable sleep.⁴⁹⁷ Though periodically turning one's back on reality is important, we may conclude, the environment has to be free of serious threat to make an act of distancing safe enough.

In constant tension to the mandates of vigilance, being able to take a step back from the flood of perceptions⁴⁹⁸ so as to negate the clamours of reality is an important prerequisite for adaptation. It permits regression in treatment,⁴⁹⁹ it prevents complete exhaustion for the person who has fallen sick,⁵⁰⁰ and it is a feature which is woven into humour.⁵⁰¹ Put to use like this, negation opens space for the imaginary by keeping reality at a distance from which it does not have to be annihilated.⁵⁰² This, Fain holds, should be differentiated from a form of denial that has no fantasmatic use for reality but tries to root it out as a persistently traumatic source of excitement. It is as if someone, unable to shield oneself from the sunlight by wearing sunglasses has to go one-eyed.⁵⁰³ What is thus rejected will no longer provide representations or give fantasies.⁵⁰⁴ It attempts to weed out disturbances at their source by dulling perceptions.⁵⁰⁵ Since repeatedly processing small quantities of trauma is an important condition to stay alive,⁵⁰⁶ denial of this kind operates in the same direction as *l'instinct de mort*.⁵⁰⁷

Denial as a shared bond

Turning one's back on becoming too curious about reality is most efficiently done in a group, in the exercise of shared identifications and reduced sensibilities.⁵⁰⁸ In its most radical form it is much more than wearing socially agreeable blinkers: it is a process that very early denies mental space to the child in a way that pre-emptly any defensive action against it.⁵⁰⁹ In its implicit maternal message it locks the child into an idealised image that does not correspond to anything which it has a chance to develop on its own and uses the infant as a prop to provide figuration to

the mother's latent thoughts in a denial of oedipal loss and refusal of mourning.⁵¹⁰ It pushes the child into what Fain terms an 'identification in a community of shared denial' (*identification dans une communauté de déni*): it is something that is present in the parents' unspoken attitudes (often contradictory to their manifest verbal declarations) and finds itself articulated in mundane everyday activities.⁵¹¹ As a consequence of something that did not happen – contact with a mother whose desires go beyond the child and can be satisfied – there is a segment of the Me that has been exposed to the impact of a lack, a lack that has to be denied⁵¹² in unconscious identification with a member of the family.⁵¹³ What ideally, according to Freud's First Topography, would be about the irresistible push of a dynamic unconscious becomes a phenomenon more fitfully discussed in the light of reflections on the influence of collective psychology on the subject.⁵¹⁴

Muscular masculinity as a group ideal

Fain discusses possible ramifications of this in an article. There he gives a thumbnail sketch of groups in which lads come together to venerate the shared ideal of irrepressible toughness: '*les rouleurs de mécaniques*'.⁵¹⁵ Being part of such a group means it is not enough to be tough today: one has to be seen to get better at this, every single day.⁵¹⁶ It is as if an erection had to be maintained in permanence, without any implied reference to an eventual orgasm that might provide release.⁵¹⁷ In Fain's perspective, these are individuals locked into a mother's glance that turns the child into an imaginary, timeless adult which is there to remedy her narcissistic and erotic deficiencies.⁵¹⁸ Their early relationship is determined by being handled like a small girl's doll straight out of the mother's dreams and her unconscious aspirations. It forms a transitional object for a person who does not transit anywhere.⁵¹⁹ Their persona has been dreamt up by another's unconscious.⁵²⁰ This is covered up by the mother's defensive measures that conceal

what the child really means to her.⁵²¹ They are bound into a community of denial with the mother, instrumentalised in effacing the traces of the mother's exclusion of the father as a sexual object.⁵²² Once they have become members of the group united by a shared code of conduct, there surfaces the need permanently to safeguard against turning into a woman.⁵²³ Though at first contact presenting with a classically neurotic personality, placed in psychotherapy they are deprived of the protective cover which their usual behaviour provides and they succumb to what Marty terms *dépression essentielle*.⁵²⁴ Moving in an environment in which they are constantly perceived and acknowledged is indispensable to them for the continued working of mental processing⁵²⁵, evidence of a relatively shallow subjectivity, despite all activities, asleep on its feet without dreams.⁵²⁶ Interpreting as closely as possible to the Me can be quite a tall order for the analyst when the Me in question risks to hear only a recognition of failure, while the analyst would like the person to see a glimpse of hope.⁵²⁷

Artificially engendered needs that prop up the Me's economy

Fain pays close attention to the transformation of the libidinal economy that takes place when new needs pre-fabricated by the cultural environment take hold of the subject. Building on an illustration he and Braunschweig provide, and integrating further reflections of theirs in their highly complex chapter on the '*néo-besoins*':⁵²⁸ it is as if a group of teenagers congregating at a tram stop were to use the wait to light their cigarettes while facing a huge billboard – a scene we might for reasons of public order want to set in the last century – enticingly linking the flavour of adventures in the wild, true non-chalance and boundless erotic opportunities with the consumption of the right brand of cigarettes.⁵²⁹ What they are doing is not about fantasies where the tram might take them but about soaking up the tension of living through empty time. They resort to a social practice that bolsters group life in an affirmation of shared style.⁵³⁰ It holds out

promises of transit but its true transitional value has to be seriously put into doubt.⁵³¹ The space it arrogates is one that has been lost to the latency of a desire that would have taken time to develop in due course: Braunschweig and Fain argue that a mother who abusively keeps her child at her breast causes harm to the development of his/her auto-erotism.⁵³² Artificially closing gaps of discontinuity, the *néo-besoin* has to be constantly renewed to remain effective.⁵³³ The authors stress that this is a mechanism everyone is familiar with to some extent.⁵³⁴ What is important is what kind of wider economy of functioning it is embedded in.⁵³⁵

Fain points to the work of Paul Federn on the shrinking of the borders of the Me under the impact of trauma, a reduction of territory which leaves outside zones that used to belong to it but are no longer invested as Me.⁵³⁶ Braunschweig and Fain, in keeping with this line of thinking, argue that important splits do, not as Kleinian authors assume, originate from a mechanism within the subject, but from a reality it is exposed to.⁵³⁷

Going militant with nothing else to cling to

In 1982 Fain organises one chapter of his '*Le désir de l'interprète*' around the case of a young girl, who is wedged into a story that leaves her limited space to manoeuvre.⁵³⁸ In the interview with the mother the following emerges: Weary of having to accompany the eldest sister to school on top of a multiplicity of professional and domestic tasks, the mother agreed to the wish of the girl to have a bicycle. On her first trip the girl was killed by a car.⁵³⁹ Following the tragic accident, the parents dedicated all their time to saving children from an unhappy childhood, as if by virtue of their efforts, somehow, their eldest child could still be saved.⁵⁴⁰ By doing so, they left their remaining two children in such a state of neglect that they might easily have fallen victims to accidents.⁵⁴¹ It is not that these efforts were not crowned by social success, the

problem was that their charity work was part of a dogged work of denial, indicative of the fact that they could not absorb the shock by falling back on more classically neurotic means like for instance, obsessional neurosis.⁵⁴² If the parents had not become militants of a good cause, another possible route for them might have been going *opératoire*, reduced to perfunctory mental routines on the verge of falling bodily sick.⁵⁴³

The effects of this turn of events on the surviving daughter, whom Fain saw in consultation, were, as might be expected, withering. She showed identity confusion, finding it difficult to maintain a sense of being separate from her elder sibling, whom she idealised and kept alive in her fantasy. She suffered from camouflaged depression and from agoraphobia, did badly at school, and had the impression of being followed.⁵⁴⁴ Fain argues that within her personality there existed a contradiction with two aspects pitted against one another in mutual denial. On the one hand, there was an identification with the family unit built on shared denial of what had happened – a position which made it impossible for her to take over the place of the sister kept artificially alive by the parents. This produced a stalemate, denied her something to make sense of and led her into depression.⁵⁴⁵ At the same time, on the other hand, there were traces of a hysterical elaboration of the event, which turned the crushing to death of her sister into a substitute for the primal scene.⁵⁴⁶ Producing the symptoms that led to the consultation and the confusion about her identity constituted a defensive reaction which was constructive because it pointed towards the parents' madness and by this permitted the girl to recover her own identity.⁵⁴⁷

As for the parents, they found, as we have seen, recourse in permanent, morally muscular action, applying themselves with an amount of exertion they had shrunk back from when they granted the eldest daughter her wish of a bicycle.⁵⁴⁸ Fain has an acute sense of how a certain turn of events may wreak havoc on balances that had previously worked well enough but, in retrospect,

throw into relief the limited defensive depth of individuals and families within an overall economy of ways and means.⁵⁴⁹ If a child falls sick, the family environment may lack sufficient supporting qualities.⁵⁵⁰ When a family is confronted with a child's problems, it does matter what their social resources are, because this will determine which links they are able to establish and who they will turn to when they are in trouble.⁵⁵¹ If a mother is enveloped in a traumatic neurosis with her child, there is a need for a level of symbolisation provided from outside that helps to break the loop.⁵⁵²

Sinking into Chronos

There are occasions when it is the proverbial straw that breaks the camel's back.⁵⁵³ If a juncture of external and internal factors eventually leads to a crisis, the *opérateur* person acts *as if* he had the defensive potential he is sorely lacking. To carry on, he falls back on whatever mental cover his membership of a group provides.⁵⁵⁴ This remedy is a two edged sword: while it grants some mental stay, it swallows up the subjective dimensions of time traversed:

Chronos, who gave his name to time in its social dimension [*temps social*], to what devours the life of humankind, counter-investment to the timelessness of desire, is he not also the god who devours his children?⁵⁵⁵

For the interlocutor talking to a person disappearing into the social background it is a mystery why he/she does not feel as depersonalised as the listener does.⁵⁵⁶ Again, almost in passing, Fain gives an interpersonal twist to Marty's formula that the *opérateur's* unconscious receives but does not emit: the psychoanalyst's unconscious, in session, has emitted but no response has come back.⁵⁵⁷ The psychoanalyst finds his existence as a dreamer rejected and his own professional reality negated.⁵⁵⁸

Fain, as we have seen, traces this (non-) response back to antecedents in the person's personal history: there is a fundamental difference between everything transmitted by contact with the real body of the mother and things which in their unmediated suchness envelop the subject in indifference.⁵⁵⁹ What is held in check in its raw form by being put to calm is vulnerable to coming forcefully to the fore if external reality breaks the truce that, while it lasts, sustains the efficacy of the tension reducing measures employed as a stand-in.⁵⁶⁰

Being swaddled in indifference

Though Fain does not directly make this argument, there is some evidence that child raising in the past engaged in practices that provide rich illustrations for what he addresses as the workings of the *instinct de mort* by proxy. Edward Shorter relates that peasant nurses in the region of Auvergne in France would tightly swaddle their children to 'suspend them from a nail when they want to go about their work'.⁵⁶¹ In the early 19th century there are numerous complaints from Central Europe that children are knocked into the sleep of insensibility.⁵⁶² In Fain's use the *instinct de mort* or *pulsion de mort* is like a cold, dank shroud of insignificance the child gets swaddled in at a time when all resistance is futile. In contrast to the reverberations of the hysteric nucleus, which unfold in two phases, separated by latency, the sequels of having been 'suspended from a nail' in indifference or turned into an inanimate doll tend to be refractory to elaboration, chronic and thus mono-phasic.⁵⁶³ Liable to be subject to denial, they foment sectors that are split off⁵⁶⁴ and not even open to a masochistic elaboration.⁵⁶⁵ This creates very complex relations not only between denial and non-perception, which are difficult to keep apart, but also between loss and non-acquisition.⁵⁶⁶

Fain contrasts an understanding of the death instinct that follows Freud in emphasising the noiseless waning and bleeding away of mental life with the more noisy manifestations of the death instinct in the tradition of Melanie Klein.⁵⁶⁷ The contrast, however, he points out, may be more stark in theory than in practice.⁵⁶⁸ A child having been exposed to the *instinct de mort* of the early environment is forced into premature development. It will have to come to terms with impulses of a kind of hatred that will do nothing for the proper construction of his/her Me because it has to combat what is lacking, which cannot be named and has to be covered up.⁵⁶⁹ Destruction is the reverse side (the negative) of the imperative of supreme calm.⁵⁷⁰

Fain as a reader of puzzles left by Freud

To come to terms with the challenging clinical landscape, Fain does not move towards synthesis - as Pierre Marty did – but rather traces some of the puzzles left by Freud in the different strata of his thinking without ever coming to a comprehensive solution.⁵⁷¹ In doing so, Fain creates puzzles of his own. Can one maintain, he asks, that Freud's meta-psychology as presented in 1915, and in which the unconscious constantly pushes towards the preconscious, has within its horizon not perceived the repetition compulsion as described in 1920?⁵⁷² Does one not perceive what one has not thought yet? As Bion has Alice, one of his characters in '*A Memoir of the Future*', say: 'My headache is no dream I can tell you'.⁵⁷³ It is difficult to 'not perceive', we may conclude, what one has not dreamt yet.

Not surprisingly, Fain pays particular attention to the *Massenpsychologie und Ich-Analyse*, which appeared between *Jenseits des Lustprinzips* and *Das Ich und das Es*.⁵⁷⁴ The Me analysed on the basis of collective psychology depends above all on an exterior organisation pivoting on what Freud terms the object of the Me.⁵⁷⁵ The complexity of the Me, Fain concludes, depends on

the complexity of the object, in as much as it takes shape not in contact with reality but with reality as codified by the object.⁵⁷⁶ With the metapsychological purity of 1915, as he says, among the fallen in the Great War, the work of an individual is no longer decisively shaped by dreams but takes its historical configuration in an ultimate re-emergence contingent on an adequate conjuncture.⁵⁷⁷ This is a juncture, we have to surmise, based on what Braunschweig and Fain write elsewhere, at which the permanently *opérateur* person possibly misses an important turn and gets locked out of his /her subjective future.⁵⁷⁸ It is easier, Fain points out, to explain the *fort-da* game than the return of Moses: when he returns it is a return beyond the pleasure principle.⁵⁷⁹ After 1920, reality is a traumatic source of excitement, with the death instinct trying radically to run down the sensibility that at the same time offers the chance to turn reality into experience lived through.⁵⁸⁰ Gradually, the seduction of unfortunate children by adults, as discussed around 1900, is contrasted by the incapacity of the same adults to construct a symbolic holding frame around the child, or in other words, to construct the primal fantasy around the seduced child.⁵⁸¹ It is unfortunate both for the patient and the child constantly to compensate for the supposed or real unreliability of a holding frame,⁵⁸² as if it had to bootstrap his/her environment in the manner of Baron Münchhausen's famously bogus exploit of having successfully pulled himself out of the swamp by his own hair.

For the early psychoanalytic movement, including Freud, the introduction of the new economy of mental functioning with all the questions it raised was experienced as nothing short of traumatic.⁵⁸³ Freud's work, which in itself seemed to be taking shape as a discontinuous process, was subjected to reinterpretations that worked like catastrophes hitting the individual.⁵⁸⁴ To get back a sense of control, simple formulas were subsequently developed that were facilitating the teaching process.⁵⁸⁵ Yet, getting things into too much of a delimiting frame could have its drawbacks: If Melanie Klein had been part of a task group working within a pre-established

methodological framework, Fain argues, she might still have been a talented child psychotherapist but would have been unable to do anything out of the ordinary.⁵⁸⁶

The psychoanalyst as a refugee from worlds drenched in 'banality'

In one of his many asides, Fain reflects that a recoil from banality may originally have led many to choose psychoanalysis as their profession.⁵⁸⁷ If he included himself in their number, as seems plausible, it must have come as a shock to him to discover that psychoanalysis might be capable of developing *opératoire* versions of itself. One glaring instance of this, in his view, was one brand of American psychoanalysis, very successful at the time, that gave pride of place to the ego as an autonomous agency. As with *opératoire* patients, one would look in vain for the work of the preconscious.⁵⁸⁸ Fain concedes that he arrives on different paths at a number of conclusions that are similar to Melanie Klein's.⁵⁸⁹ What she catches well in Fain's view is the dynamics of the primal process.⁵⁹⁰ Everyone, Fain believes, is likely to have developed elements of a premature Me.⁵⁹¹ This means that believing it is an innate trait, which he does not but Klein does, produces no divergence on a practical level.⁵⁹² If only theoretical considerations were to matter, it would be difficult to explain why he worked well with Marty, who was a firm believer in the evolutionary process, something quite alien to Fain's perspective.⁵⁹³

One of the marks of *opératoire* language is that it lacks depth to the listener, is rather dry and does not cause reverberations. This is a complaint that occurs with noticeable frequency once language borders are crossed by the reader, especially if the translation used is reasonably accurate. Fain seems to make a corresponding experience with English as used in psychoanalytic texts, which he finds devoid of subtleties and indicative of a pragmatic, 'hands-on' approach, intent on distancing itself from mere 'literature'.⁵⁹⁴ Taking a leaf out of Fain's own book one

might argue that whenever ideas cannot be put into abeyance, after having been rendered amenable to negation, a shared imaginary becomes very difficult.⁵⁹⁵

Unfinished shape, unmourned by the mother

Translating Bion for himself, Fain notices that he does not remember well what he has read, and has difficulties to absorb it, until it comes back years later.⁵⁹⁶ One of the ideas that attract his interest is Bion's thinking about pre-conceptions.⁵⁹⁷ Although there is no evidence he ever came across it, we can safely assume he would have approved of the temporal onion layers in Bion family crest's motto '*Nisi dominus frustra*' in allusion to Psalm 127:1: *Nisi dominus aedificaverit domum in vanum laborant qui aedificant eum*.⁵⁹⁸

In typically stenographic fashion, Fain in one passage refers to a patient who arrives like an '*ours mal léché*'.⁵⁹⁹ The expression, in popular usage designating an uncouth person, stems from a passage in Isidor of Sevilla's *Etymologies*:

The bear (*ursus*) is said to be so called because it shapes its offspring in its 'own mouth' (*ore suo*), as if the word were orsus, for people say that it produces unshaped offspring, and gives birth to some kind of flesh that the mother forms into limbs by licking it. Whence this is said [...] Thus with her tongue the bear shapes her offspring when she has borne it. But prematurity is what causes this kind of offspring; the bear gives birth after at most thirty days, whence it happens that its hurried gestation creates unshaped offspring.⁶⁰⁰

Fain adds that for bears to have been properly treated, it is necessary that the mother disinvests them in just the right way so that dreams can take shape.⁶⁰¹ What to do with those patients who have not experienced this? The psychoanalyst, like the mother, transmits a culture that injects elements of symbolism and provides another chance for discontinuity to give rise to dreams.⁶⁰²

For this it is important that the consulting room of the psychoanalyst is clearly demarcated from a medical setting, and perceived to be so, in discontinuity to what else is going on in the life of the patient.⁶⁰³

In a footnote he stresses the importance of the secondarily original narcissism imparted to the child: something not born with but born into that should come as a self-evident right: an inalienable claim made to an environment that should be able to fulfil a promise.⁶⁰⁴ Once turned adolescent, the group the individual belongs to may be a decisive element in how the subject handles him/herself.

If we look at what Fain brings to Marty's original observations it is the role of the other in the individual's mental economy that becomes much more conspicuous. How the parents were navigating their own unconscious, what the mother's inner eye was occupied with as she looked at her child, is central to the development of the child's desires.

We now turn to Nicolaidis and his suggestion of a basic toolkit transmitted to the child by the mother's culture and the quality of the necessary cushion of regression offered by myths available at the times.

Chapter Six: Basic Mechanisms 1: Nicos Nicolaïdis

In his inquiry, Nicos Nicolaïdis picks up threads from Pierre Marty, Michel Fain and Denise Braunschweig about the prerequisites for infantile desire. Fitfully for French psychoanalysis, the resulting work is relentlessly dense,⁶⁰⁵ rich in thought and material, and weaves multicoloured thematic threads into a mesh of interlocking segments of filament. For the purpose of my investigation I shall explore a number of potential access points that open up reasonably negotiable paths through his conceptual terrain, inasmuch they enrich out understanding how a person may or may not go *opératoire*.

Let us consider the following situation: While courting Elizabeth Barrett in her father's house, Robert Browning showed her lines that gave poetic voice to his strong sense of what the English landscape, gradually awakening to Spring, must be looking like at a time when the persona of the poem, a sojourner wandering the continent, cannot actually witness this. In '*Home-Thoughts, from Abroad*' (published in 1845 in '*Dramatic Romance and Lyrics*') memory steps in and provides impressions garnered in the past to be arranged into a vivid mental picture of what is currently beyond his grasp. Every minute little detail, quite possibly lost to a casual rambler traversing a landscape familiar to him/her, bespeaks the magnitude of loss inflicted by its physical absence. It is the poignancy of feeling, coming to him like an unsolicited visitor at an untoward moment, and for which the poetic persona in Browning's lines may have been ill prepared upon leaving England, that reveals to him who he is to himself in his solitude and whereto a sense of unbidden belonging now beckons him from afar. Not long after this, Robert Browning eloped with Elizabeth, taking her from England, the country *for* which his poetic alter ego had felt such acute pangs of nostalgia, to Tuscany, the place he had experienced this *from*, in

this translocation famously curing his newly wedded wife - after her marriage without further ado disinherited by her father - from the illness that had beset her and had rendered her a fragile invalid whilst at home.⁶⁰⁶

It is some of these complexities Nicos Nicolaïdis - without reference to either Robert or Elizabeth Browning, it must be said, but straddling Greek and French culture in his own way while working in Switzerland⁶⁰⁷ - addresses in his studies on perception, representation and the blocking force of mentally indigestible presence, studies to which we now turn.

On the tracks of disorganisation

In one passage, Nicolaïdis reminds us that Henry Ey, the influential mentoring spirit of a generation of young French psychiatrists and psychoanalysts, held it against psychoanalysis that it, in his opinion, inadequately accounted for mental disorganisation⁶⁰⁸. He argued that any attempt to draw on the forces of 'libido and destrudo' was incapable of explaining the phenomenon of disorganisation, thus making the important point that a lack of mental organisation might neither be indicative of a hidden wish nor constitute a covert attack.⁶⁰⁹ This chimed in with earlier positions, not referred to by Nicolaïdis in this passage, by Pierre Janet, who stressed deficiencies in organisation over the dynamics of the unconscious (with echoes in Fairbairn and Jung), positions with which Ey's own thought reverberated in critical tension⁶¹⁰. Although we shall see that disorganisation does play some part in Nicolaïdis' thought, it is to the disastrous consequences of insufficient differentiation⁶¹¹ that he turns when he presents his psychoanalytic reading of the Gaia – Ouranos myth.⁶¹²

The drama of Gaia and Ouranos

From the primal Abyss Gaia (Earth) emerges. In parthenogenesis she gives birth to Ouranos (the Sky), who covers her entirely and has incessant intercourse with her, reflecting himself in her image. In this constant mating, in which the generational difference is swept aside, respite from mirroring is none: rare will be perceptually unsaturated moments, little can give rise to the mental anticipation of pleasures yet to come. Gaia and Ouranos are caught in a sensory-perceptual forcefield entrapping them in a degree of homeostasis that is detrimental to the further development of the Kosmos.⁶¹³ To countermand this, Gaia sets an end to this relationship, which is exhausting itself in driven repetitive action and is lacking in representation. She orders her son Kronos to cut off the testicles of his father-brother Ouranos, bringing an end to boundless agitated non-separation.⁶¹⁴ It is in Nicolaïdis' view the 'No' of a mother renouncing completion by her child, the son-lover to be pruned off her in this act of castration, that opens up the necessary space for differentiation and the establishing of a new timeline and a new rhythm.⁶¹⁵ This permits her to reposition herself as Mother in the undoing of a tight dyadic fit marinated in stale satiety beyond measure.⁶¹⁶ From the cut off testicles fallen to Earth the Erinyes, the Furies, spring into existence establishing a first law of talion.⁶¹⁷ The *originnaire* has to pass and wane before even the primary can set in.⁶¹⁸

Escape from oppressive presence

In this rejection of ceaseless gratification, in Nicolaïdis' reading, room is made for the notion of a Father as a new universal point of reference beyond the early dyad: Greek theogony presents the world of humans as a realm owed to the rise of displeasure. Nicolaïdis sees strong inner connections between the mythemes of Hesiod and the psycho-sexual development of the child,

as described by Freud.⁶¹⁹ Is there, Nicolaïdis asks, an early perceptive-sensorial force field that provides a primitive voltage supply for the organisation of an as yet fragmentary self – a '*mosaïque première*' as hypothesised by Pierre Marty⁶²⁰ – a force field which, if unduly strong and protracted,⁶²¹ impedes hallucination and the kicking in of the imaginary⁶²²? Instead of coming to terms with absence, distance and delay, Nicolaïdis suggests, images of a surfeit of the same will exert their unbridled magnetic attraction. Perception of raw sensory reality will freeze numb what could otherwise have served as later contact points to the symbolic.⁶²³ This early hoar frost descending on the nascent subject will paralyse affect, while at the same time conserving it in shrivelled form and shunted off from representation.⁶²⁴ Meaningless perception will go on offering a nucleus of anti-fantasmatic potential set beneath the threshold of fantasy.⁶²⁵ If crises later in life throw the subject back to its early defences, and they were to prove unstable, it is the sheer force of perception that will offer a rallying point by drawing the subject magnetically towards the unthinkable image of the early object, in which residual excitement remains symbolically undigested and pre-symbolic perception frames the subject.⁶²⁶

The sway of early reality unprovided with a representational handle

As Nicolaïdis relates, it was Winnicott's work on breakdown, and in particular his words about 'breakdown' to describe the unthinkable state of affairs that underlies the defence organisation' that provided the germ for his initial reflections on the *objet référent*, an (early) object, the vital place of which in the subject's foundational groundwork can neither be thought nor properly experienced, rendering it a source of both support and menace to the mental edifices erected upon it.⁶²⁷ The *référent*, in Nicolaïdis' approach, is the form under which the object imposes itself when set in the space of what later emerges as the prodromes of breakdown, in this manifestation

elusively escaping the grasp by a subject who was not really there when it all happened, '*en deça de l'appareil psychique*'.⁶²⁸

Nicolaïdis derives the term *référent* from Ferdinand de Saussure's structural hierarchy of linguistic classification, a means to denote a concrete, nameless quiddity without linguistic significance.⁶²⁹ In an article in the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse*, which is based on a course he gave at the Psychological Faculty of the University of Geneva in the 1978/79 winter term, Nicolaïdis sets out to connect this to psychoanalytic theory and practice. Like Saussure's *référent*, the object which Nicolaïdis hypothesises is comparable only to itself and does not point to anything else.⁶³⁰ Although there is a Gestalt (or rather Pre-Gestalt⁶³¹) to it, it is situated on a pre-objectal level, before even the appearance of partial objects.⁶³² It cannot be hallucinated, does not lend itself to either figurability or metaphor and does not produce dream images, although it may give rise to something akin to a *trompe l'oeil*, a two-dimensional near approximation to hallucination.⁶³³ Echoing Piera Castoriadis-Aulagnier, Nicolaïdis sees in this *référent* an early form of pictogramme that expresses the lasting sensory attraction of the irreplaceable original, for which no representational substitute is acceptable, a reality that cannot be told and against which one has to fling oneself relentlessly.⁶³⁴ It belongs to the realms of Ananké, at this stage unvisited by desire.⁶³⁵

Since separation has not occurred, lack is not experienced as something caused by the doings of the object, an object, to which at this stage the baby, make or break, is totally fused in a symbiosis that may yet come to haunt it in future shapeless blanks.⁶³⁶ Perception that cannot be invested in subverts the psychic apparatus, sweeping the mindscape with a cold wind.⁶³⁷ Granted the individual is born with a certain constitution, a considerable weight lies on the development

of the newborn's relational interactions – something Nicolaïdis terms synaptic in the original Greek sense of the word: a function of elements touching in liaison.⁶³⁸

The advent of language into a world shaped by interaction

Much as the good breast in Kleinian psychoanalysis provides a comprehensive metaphor for what is wholesome, the Lacanian term *signifiant phallique* - 'phallic signifier' - is used by Nicolaïdis as short hand for an indispensable ingredient in mental development: a signal of separation, a harbinger of asymmetries to be dealt with, a portent of differentiation to come, transforming by its vigorous insistence the early dyad.⁶³⁹ As this is happening, and the earlier scaffolding is left behind, a world beyond is opening up: language, as a movement towards the world, significantly extends the scope of reference and sentiment beyond immediate lack and survival.⁶⁴⁰ more fully fledged representation under the impact of separation spells out the early hieroglyphic presence of the mother in more freely mobile elements analogous to the transit from Linear A/B script to the alphabet.⁶⁴¹ If it is in place, there is the increased possibility a rich multiplicity of meanings and representations can be processed more easily, crucially enriching the preconscious.⁶⁴² Whereas the early 'hieroglyphs' conserve a link with bodily movement, condensation, displacement and figuration now take advantage of the new possibilities provided by language to furnish the world of dreams, and in doing so finds new means to evade censorship.⁶⁴³ Language, an organising bridge, joins into a community of speakers and, to boot, gives access to a galore of stories drenched in fantasies.⁶⁴⁴ It is the capacity of illusion passed on by the parents that determines how long the desert of meaninglessness will have to last.⁶⁴⁵

The power of historically contingent myth

In contrast to Lacan, as Nicolaïdis says, he does not believe that we are faced with supposedly invariant, universally valid structures, but rather deal with historically grown myths shaped by the experiences and desires of a particular society, group or family and in considerable flux.⁶⁴⁶ With the preconscious in development, mythologies into which the mother and her world are embedded come more forcefully into play, offering to the infant culturally engendered dream equivalents, of which he/she will make selective use according to the shape and the needs of his/her particular infantile neurosis.⁶⁴⁷ Myth selects from the historical experience of a people to present an imaginary continuity grounded in desire, whereas regular history accounts present a line-up of facts and events, which corresponds to the imperatives of desire only in discontinuous bouts.⁶⁴⁸ In illustration, Nicolaïdis reminds us that London has its *Waterloo Station* but Paris its *Gare d'Austerlitz*, commemorating history very selectively.⁶⁴⁹ Myth gives form to desire by offering a screen, thus unifying experience and offering affective pregnancy.⁶⁵⁰ Beyond the structuring of content, it structures the very container for what escapes the conceptual framework of the times.⁶⁵¹

A potential crisis of transition

Into this pre-existing space the child enters, finding in it, as Nicolaïdis suggests in allusion to words ascribed to Aristotle, in nascent subjectivity a position to learn, to suffer, as well as getting involved in a process of being made ready for a disposition.⁶⁵² Transitions have to be negotiated and for this the infant needs to meet with the right conditions accorded by both the mother and her world,⁶⁵³ a world in which important choices as to which symbolic screens are to be

privileged have already been made.⁶⁵⁴ Although individual myth and collective myth have to be differentiated, there is a permanent interaction between the two.⁶⁵⁵

Leaving behind early sensory worlds of pictogrammes is fraught with hazards: early idiom has to find a translation into the new worlds of meaning, mediated by language, delimiting the role of the mother and giving an inkling of her desires pointing beyond the dyad.⁶⁵⁶ If the mother is not able to connect to a preconscious sufficiently structured by triangulation, provided with freely mobile elements,⁶⁵⁷ with a good regressive potential grounded in her personal and her group's myths,⁶⁵⁸ the effects on the infant will likely be deleterious: whatever tinder there is in the child will find it uncommonly difficult under these conditions, to meet with the indispensable spark.⁶⁵⁹

Although there is territory that will never be bindable into networks of meaning, Nicolaïdis, in contrast to Lacan, does not believe that foreclosure, once it has occurred, has to be deemed an irreversible structure: things beyond language and thought may find a propitious moment to re-connect to the sayable, thinkable and feelable and re-insert the excluded into the realms of the symbolic.⁶⁶⁰

In critique of supposedly supra-historic structures

Considering Nicolaïdis' strong interest in the mutability of specifics and their evolution, it is not surprising that he takes exception to Melanie Klein's view of phantasy, which in his view tends to assign a supra-historic statute to it, and which, he says, erects a wall around the dyad.⁶⁶¹ He accuses her of confusing, and conceptually merging, a potential for symbolisation with its actual manifest functioning.⁶⁶² Nicolaïdis regards culture – like the psychosexual development of the child - as work in progress, linked to civic space, social developments and cultural processes.⁶⁶³

The *roman culturel* of a specific time and setting opens up or hinders, as the case may be,

specific forms of mental elaboration.⁶⁶⁴ In this his view he is closer to Winnicott, to whose understanding of the importance of culture and the environment he repeatedly refers,⁶⁶⁵ than to the structuralism of Lacan, as a theory less accommodating to refractory specifics and the tides of change.⁶⁶⁶ Within a French context there seems to be, in this point, some unstated proximity to his fellow Greek-French psychoanalyst Cornelius Castoriadis' understanding of the social imaginary as *magma*, not a structure but something in movement, which can take different shapes.⁶⁶⁷

If the concept of affect does indeed include, as Nicolaïdis acknowledges with André Green, who in his seminal work on this matter takes to task Lacan's structuralism, aspects of perception, it is important that it finds mental representation early enough.⁶⁶⁸ Both perception and affect are solicited by fantasy linked to the mythological potential of the times.⁶⁶⁹ Cuts in the cohesion of affective tissue will form scars that spur the individual to responding perceptively and not by way of representation.⁶⁷⁰

The importance for flexible building blocks for fantasy

Borrowing from Lacan, Nicolaïdis refers to the processes of transformation from crude to elaborate, which meaning and language distil from early asymbolic experience, under the term algorithm.⁶⁷¹ For a workable result the distance between the element to be transformed and the element into which it is translated should neither be tantalisingly great nor stultifyingly small, lest the voltage flow of desire be impaired.⁶⁷² To bolster this productive tension, there have to be freely mobile elements of form (an alphabet of combinable elements),⁶⁷³ accessible to the subject to express nuances of sentiment and to bind them into a gamut of meaning. To return to our initial vignette, Robert Browning himself would not have been able to produce his poems in

hieroglyphic script (or have them, anachronistically, replaced by photographs)⁶⁷⁴ to the same effect and, thus restricted, would not have been able to woo Elizabeth Browning in the way he did, playing on the tension between what is, what is not and what might be. For lack to be able to register as loss with the individual, absence from the object of desire has to work on the mind and be provided with elements of a configuration breathed upon and quickened by language.⁶⁷⁵ In such manner, Jeanette Winterson, adopted into an oppressively religious family in Lancashire, for all the mental shackles her mother attempted to put on her, found yet the language of the King James Bible, echoed in local vernacular use, a source of rich cadences and a treasure trove of verbal space. In her experience, it was capable of empowering the hearer and reader to enter a world beyond the confines of the family, in a wealth of connectivity which the more facile, lexically refurbished new versions, cutting links to four hundred years of poetry, could not offer.⁶⁷⁶ With all acceptable form put beyond the pale, on the other hand, things to be said may have to be kept *en souffrance* (waiting for realisation), in at best, a twilight of stasis unable to carry investment.⁶⁷⁷

Potential dis-differentiation: sensitivity reduced, complexity on hold

Insertion into and investment of the symbolic, desirable as it is, remains liable to be put at risk by the archaic *réfèrent*, threatening not just the fruit of translation but the very process itself.⁶⁷⁸ a disruption instead of a productive discontinuity within a continuum, 'affect without a skin'.⁶⁷⁹ To all intents and purposes, the realms of Nicolaïdis' *réfèrent* bear close relationship to E.M. Forster's fictitious Marabar caves, used to great effect in *A Passage to India*, in which meaning falls prey to much more archaic forces and composure succumbs to the inchoate.⁶⁸⁰

Not surprisingly, he shows little faith in the workings of the *pulsion de mort* posited to be striking the psyche of the individual as a force of nature unconnected to his/her concrete moorings, in this joining André Green's doubts on the justification of assuming an auto-destructive function that were to articulate itself primitively, spontaneously or automatically from innate sources.⁶⁸¹ This does not keep Nicolaïdis from finding himself in agreement with Michel Fain's non-metaphysical use of the *pulsion de mort* in describing forces leading to disorganisation.⁶⁸² These processes, he believes, typically work in silence, much less spectacularly than the majority of phenomena described by Kleinians under this heading, and act as a shield against an overflow of excitement, striving to reduce it to nothing.⁶⁸³ Michel Fain, as Nicolaïdis points out, imperceptibly rehabilitates the death instinct as a force opposing death, when he reminds his readers that Freud considered living matter as typically clothed in a defensive coating provided by a deadened – more obtuse - layer which protected the narcissistic capital of the subject from exposure to the world in raw, as if skinned alive.⁶⁸⁴

If we connect this with the potentially disruptive effect of the *référent*, a complex picture emerges, in which the *caveat* lodged by Henri Ey (and Pierre Janet)⁶⁸⁵ can be given its due. Integration may have been jeopardised because differentiation was arrested in too prolonged an *avant coup*.⁶⁸⁶ For all the resulting deficiencies, dead insensitive layers of the individual may find secondary use in defensive and life sustaining purposes. Attempts to 'mentalise' this could have potentially destructive consequences.⁶⁸⁷

Référent: a state of affairs that cannot be resolved in a crisis

In the effects of prolonged exposure to the *référent* – perhaps loosely to be translated as a state of affairs in which things are as they are and only as they are, without anything pointing to a

beyond – Bion's 'unsaturated element' seems to find a dark cousin: whereas with Bion ζ seems to be a factor impelling onwards, urging new solutions to previous arrangements, the *réfèrent* has a more sinister side to it, potentially putting at risk all translation into meaning.⁶⁸⁸ It is as if in Bion's parable⁶⁸⁹ of an egg hatching out, faced with a crack but not knowing of the chicken it will turn to, the natural causeway leading from egg to chicken were to be put into doubt. Just as with Bion, we find crises of transition with Nicolaïdis, but in some of them form cannot adequately be invested in, constrained by the limited horizons of an environment that does not take kindly to the kindling of desire and in which little, if anything, points beyond the mandates of sheer necessity.

The réfèrent as a retardant of sublimation

This is, of course, in many ways the reverse of what has traditionally been discussed under the heading of sublimation, a term much less frequently used outside the Francophone zone within the psychoanalytic world today.⁶⁹⁰ Yet it seems that 'reparation', which has to some extent replaced it, only partially covers the territory vacated by its disappearance in psychoanalytic discourse, with Winnicott's 'potential space' admittedly recovering important stretches of it.⁶⁹¹ With an author like Hans W. Loewald we find sublimation as a means to overcome alienating differentiation on a higher level,⁶⁹² which would not have been sought for if no sharp loss had been felt. In an interesting comment by Antonio Di Benedetto sublimation is seen as a move from the causal order of things to the realms of the aesthetic.⁶⁹³

Psychoanalytic aesthetics as a domain receptive to the restraints of the material

It is in the department of psychoanalytic aesthetics, indeed, that the questions raised by Nicolaïdis seem to have received closest attention within British psychoanalysis, which in its

Kleinian articulation has been more inclined to see the subject as naturally equipped – and preyed upon – by an abundance of formative, if problematic, forces and thus has had no good reason to doubt their continued operation. Although Melanie Klein in her paper *On Identification* (1955), offering her comments on Julian Green's novella *Si J'étais vous*, accepts that the shape of the host character taken over by the protagonist severely limits the sensibilities of the transmigrating 'soul', the further development initiated by Bion's concept of the container does not seem to have led to an extensive literature on the social morphology and texture of form, beyond what can be asserted about the naturally somatoform. This, perforce, cannot apply to aesthetics, which by its very nature has to ask questions about the interplay between dark urge and available material form.⁶⁹⁴

Available remedies contingent on the times

What Nicolaïdis' thinking throws into relief is that form needed to process inner life may or may not be available. What happened to John Stuart Mill in the Nineteenth Century may well serve as an example for this. As we know from his autobiography, when John Stuart Mill went through a deep crisis in the latter half of the 1820s, he felt as if stranded, 'with a well-equipped ship and a rudder, but no sail; without any real desire...'.⁶⁹⁵ He was saved from his wretched state by reading, for the first time in his life, in the autumn of 1828, as he recalls, the poems of William Wordsworth, which turned out to be 'medicine for my state of mind'.⁶⁹⁶ In his work *On Liberty* years later Mill contends that

Human nature is not a machine to be built after a model, and set to do exactly the work prescribed for it, but a tree, which requires to grow and develope [sic] itself on all sides, according to the tendency of the inward forces which make it a living thing.⁶⁹⁷

Mill's crisis had been taking place in an environment in which antidotes to the idolatry of the factual were both available and accessible to him. What objects can be put to service to increase mental space seems to vary considerably. What is self-appropriated has often been present in waiting, as it were, to be found and put to use by the subject. Yet, the means to do so have to be present in the mental environment and will change with the times.⁶⁹⁸

The sensation of lack mediated by the inner worlds of the mother

Nicolaïdis, in tackling the imagination (conceptualised as representation), concedes almost Wordsworthian status to the power of the preconscious regressing to memory traces 'in tranquillity' as it were, yet roots this not in universal capability and natural endowment but in the stimulus offered by access to the phantasms of others, embedded in and often mediated by a halo of words.⁶⁹⁹ Although there is an acknowledgement of the libidinal kick and push (only inadequately rendered by the British 'drive'), there is an interpersonal, object related element, which finds its inter-generational pivotal kingpin in the preconscious of the mother.

Not lack as such creates desire but lack to which a trajectory of desire is opened by the mother's own desires, taking the child from a reverie within the dyad to a reverie beyond the dyad,⁷⁰⁰ and bridging the dry sands of what is continually at hand to intimations of what might possibly be. Demand for form has to be complemented by a supply of building blocks of form - the more freely mobile the better - if the preconscious is to develop and thrive.⁷⁰¹ Infantile object seeking should be given the chance of meeting an object that is given to the seeking of pleasure, whatever the duty it has officially signed up for. Images saturated with presence could dampen the representative imagination, which, on the other hand, if permitted to amble into, and lose

itself in, family myth, will work its way towards pictures sponsored by both language and absence, as happening in dream life.⁷⁰²

As myth shows, there are times when it is useful to lose oneself in non-differentiation so as to better survive the crisis: Thus, Odysseus, confronted with Polphemus determined to devour him and his comrades, retreats into a 'I am nobody', a wily move employed to best the Cyclops.⁷⁰³

Attention to concrete interactions as a step beyond Lacan

In the positions of Nicolaïdis, sketched above, he deviates from Lacan - whose thoughts he does not reject, but whose group he does not belong to⁷⁰⁴ - along remarkably similar lines as Winnicott does from Melanie Klein.⁷⁰⁵ Both were willing to take into account the going-ons in the concrete mother to an extent thought unwarranted by those with whom they were parting company. In Stephen A. Mitchell's view on the differences between Fairbairn and Klein,⁷⁰⁶ Nicolaïdis would show important divergences from Klein that would position him closer to Fairbairn, simply by working on French assumptions, at some measured distance from Lacan.

We shall see with César and Sara Botella, who do not belong to Nicolaïdis' more immediate group, that his questionings on the difficulties and hazards of figurability were addressed afresh from a somewhat different angle. His interest in motricity as a substitute for representation (used as a blueprint by Ouranos in the Gaia myth) finds more detailed treatment in the work of Gérard Szewc on the contemporary epidemic of 'voluntary galley slaves', rowing towards release from tension, a matter to which we turn in the next chapter.

Chapter Seven: Basic Mechanisms 2: Gérard Szvec

Being able to draw on flexible building blocks for representation may, as we have seen in the previous section on Nicos Nicolaïdis, be of great importance to the subject: it determines what can be processed. At the same time, having at one's disposal a protective layer capable of reducing the amount of incoming stimuli - Nicolaïdis reminded his readers of Freud's image of the outer peel of the vesicle - can keep the individual up and running in the face of adversity. This, apparently, can work both ways: There are those who have to keep on running until they drop so as to generate the only means known to them to process tension. It is to these devotees of a Sisyphos agenda unbeknownst to them that Gérard Szvec turns his attention in his study '*Les galériens volontaires*', which has received attention and acclaim within a wider public beyond a strictly professional readership.⁷⁰⁷

Some people appear like convicts chain-ganged to repetition beyond the pleasure principle. They are fascinated by their own functional [*opératoire*] robotisation. Sometimes it is this what they count upon to pull them out of the shipwrecks of their distress to which, however, they return compulsively and which they re-edit unto exhaustion. They row, run, and swim, to the limit of their forces; and then they recommence. Adventure repeated *ad nauseam* does not make them dream any more. For a long time it [this way of dealing with things] has been nothing but constraint to them, constraint automatically to repeat behaviour exactly identical, without repose, without respite. They have turned themselves into voluntary galley slaves.⁷⁰⁸

Self imposed drudgery in quest for inner calm

Gérard Szvec points out that his focus is not on individuals who love adventure or who develop a taste for risk but specifically on those who use fright and terror as a paradoxical means to

soothe themselves and to bring about radical inner calm.⁷⁰⁹ He refers to interviews with solitary [long distance] rowers published in the journal *Libération* on 22 November 1991, already in the public domain.⁷¹⁰ One of the interviewees, Gérard d'Aboville, sustained on average seven thousand oar strokes per day over a distance of ten thousand kilometres, at a rate of seventeen strokes per minute. To keep up this amount of programmed regularity he inwardly had to go on automatic pilot. Szwec quotes d'Aboville:

Always the same tune, always the same metronome rhythm (...) the body works like a machine and the spirit functions like a calculator, it keeps accounts. [...] Minutes are hours, hours are days, days are months. [...] It is another world that resembles hell.⁷¹¹

Szwec provides other examples of extreme sportsmanship in which the athletes deliberately take their psyche off-line by resorting to regular counting and making an effort of focusing on pre-programmed automatic bodily movement.⁷¹² In the world of work this is not a matter of choice; with rowers like d'Aboville it is. Why do they eagerly enter a hell of their own making?⁷¹³ One rower interviewed by *Libération* stated that rowing had quickly become a terrible drug to him, impossible to renounce.⁷¹⁴ Once the behaviour has been established, tension is not routed into the psyche but soaked up by the activity and laid to rest in pre-established patterns.⁷¹⁵ There seems to be little pleasure and satisfaction involved.⁷¹⁶ A new need has been created,⁷¹⁷ the realms of *ananke* been ingeniously extended. Mastership, not desire, is the order of the day, as new states of helplessness are ushered in to be repeatedly overcome in a desperate struggle for survival engineered on purpose.⁷¹⁸ To hold fast to the helm, the muscular apparatus is solicited to the full.⁷¹⁹ Perception of pain becomes a substitute for the object.⁷²⁰ Emptiness offers its folds into which to sink as fickle relief, if the body is not ready to succumb to illness as yet,⁷²¹ and if psychosis is beyond reach.⁷²²

Some may be pushed to extreme feats by a group ideal that seeks excellence in the quest to provide incontrovertible evidence for a bullet proof masculine identity. No one will be able to mistake those clad in it for a weakling, a woman or a person terminally at the end of their tether.⁷²³ Szwec refers to Fain's words on the '*rouleurs de mécaniques*', the swaggering lads, who need to show off their muscular virility.⁷²⁴ Living this ideal, though, is something that, once attained, has to be put to the test repeatedly to be topped again and again in ever new ordeals.⁷²⁵ Touching rock bottom raises the animal that will respond, d'Aboville explains in his book, a response that, we must assume, has been coveted all along:⁷²⁶ 'I am a resistance fighter in a war I have invented for myself'.⁷²⁷ Anguish and despair welling up on the razor edges of the abyss' brink perform a function nothing else will.⁷²⁸ Only perception confronted with concrete, stark reality can provide what the imagination cannot stand in for, offering to bind together in action what cannot liaison in fantasy.⁷²⁹ Focused pain is better than irrepresentable formlessness, fright better than distress without an object.⁷³⁰

For others, the environment they seek uncannily replicates important features of the dungeons of their daily drudgery, this time however, self-inflicted as a pastime. One of Szwec' patients, approaching his fifties, runs a commerce, in which he works without a break upwards of thirteen hours a day, with no time to lean back. He dumbs himself down into a brutish existence (*s'abrutit*), as he says, by thinking of concrete tasks only. Among his customers there are violent petty criminals who think nothing of getting out the knife. He accepts a fight when he has to and sees it as a chore that goes with the job. To occasionally break out of the routine, he goes on solitary full marathons for which he is not in near enough acceptable bodily shape.⁷³¹ Chronological lists of sometimes serious accidents, which he has survived, attempt to glue together morsels of his life, which do not feel like he has really lived them, into a semblance of a pretended whole.⁷³²

A lack of being unconscious

Understandably, against the background of his case material, Szewc shows interest in Jean Cournut's studies in the inhabitants of psychic deserts and the smashed up (*les désertiques et défoncés*),⁷³³ but he does not believe that an unconscious identification with a mother who has not been able to grieve her losses – and which the patient would subsequently feel tied to in a secret crypt according to the famous suggestions by Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok – goes very far in explaining the problems of his Rowing Dutchmen, inwardly chained to their oars. Patients like these, he believes, present with problems that turn on a lack of the very ability of being unconscious.⁷³⁴

They do not strive to lodge a forceful, if painful, message in the other.⁷³⁵ Instead, they want to lay to rest any excitement emerging from the object and have substituted a vigorous activity for an object relationship. If anything has been lodged outside the subject, it has been deposited in the activity. Under these circumstances it becomes impossible for the individual to establish links of sufficient quality; psychic activity is not usually tinged with distinctively erotic hues (*la coexcitation sexuelle est insuffisante*⁷³⁶), and leaning back into passivity is extremely difficult.⁷³⁷ Indefinite repetition, sought for the sake of the exhaustion it will eventually bring, does not produce symbolic content.⁷³⁸ Given more leeway to develop into links with the object world, the states forestalled by the seeking of supreme calm - in itself a substitute for erogenous masochism⁷³⁹ - could further develop into inhibition or phobia.⁷⁴⁰

While the psychosomatic sufferer in a quandary will respond with a somatic crisis so as to take off unbearable pressure,⁷⁴¹ the individuals whom Szewc discusses have to resort to a particular

type of extreme behaviour to reduce tension, a stop gap measure that does not produce pleasurable rest and which has to be employed repeatedly to achieve, again and again, the required effect,⁷⁴² as if scooping out water from a leaking boat.⁷⁴³ As long as you keep up action you have a chance not to be traumatically overwhelmed and sink.⁷⁴⁴

Early interactions out of kilter

Szwec comes to his deliberations from his own background as a psychoanalyst working with children both within the framework of *IPSO*, where in 1993 he was heading their unit for children at Paris, and within the *Centre médico-psycho-pédagogique* at Trappes, a child guidance institution which he directed as a paedopsychiatrist and which was offering consultations to families challenged by behaviourally disruptive children.⁷⁴⁵ From 1990-2016 he served as the medical director of the *Centre de psychosomatique de l'enfant Léon Kreisler (Institut de Psychosomatique, IPSO/ASM 13)* and is currently president of *IPSO*.⁷⁴⁶ In the light of his experience he establishes links between the traumatophilia among the athletes he read about, hell-bent to put themselves in harm's way, and the situation of the baby that is not cuddly and that does not affectionately invite caresses ('*non câlin*').⁷⁴⁷

Those babies that are unstable refuse to be cuddled by their mother and seemingly prefer living in the solitude of a nightmare rather than in the traumatising anxiety against which they do not find appeasement on the part of the woman that is the very source of it.⁷⁴⁸

Something in the early interactions is seriously out of kilter with how the child ticks and, consequently, does not lead to the development of an ample enough regressive potential in the infant, a letting go without quite losing the libidinal object world.⁷⁴⁹ In the face of unsatisfactory early balances, the future 'slaves of quantity' (those tied to the *quantum* of excitement, not its *qualia*, according to an expression coined by Michel de M'Uzan)⁷⁵⁰ do not turn to hallucination

but to behavioural devices that prematurely provide self-help without taking recourse to an object (*'le développement de conduites prématurément auto-aidantes à visée désobjectalisante'*).⁷⁵¹ They have, in a sense, become guerilla fighters of the nursery, already gearing up towards a future indefatigable survivalism.⁷⁵² In many cases, Szwec was able to observe that children whose mother experienced difficulties to touch them, in response, tried to keep her at a distance early on by becoming hyperactive, falling into uncontrollable fits of rage, taking refuge in noise and avoiding her lap.⁷⁵³ Whatever physical skills they had acquired was put to service in a determined attempt to steer clear of unwanted contact with and resulting perception of her.⁷⁵⁴ Not just the physical contact skin to skin but vital elements in the transmission of unconscious messages from mother to baby have been seriously compromised: the libidinal sensibilities of the child are not furthered by the qualities of a mother's fond touch, nor does the skin, in this instance, fully develop its essential role at the crossroads of self love and object love.⁷⁵⁵

Often the ability of the mother to disinvest the imaginary ideal child of her dreams is impaired, which has detrimental effects on the necessary oscillations between periodic investment and disinvestment of her real child.⁷⁵⁶ Fantasmatic interaction between mother and infant becomes a secluded locked room (*huis-clos*), and the future fault lines of the child's defensive organisation take shape under this sombering star.⁷⁵⁷ Early development may for different reasons come to harm if the mother's dream worlds cannot protect the baby against disruptive hospitalisation and/or prolonged pain.⁷⁵⁸ In this case maternal care is not enough to permit the child to acquire enough of an illusion of narcissistic invulnerability.⁷⁵⁹ Szwec relates that mothers who talk about their babies in a consultation may abruptly become matter-of-factual and *opératoire* in a limited sequence of the conversation when their words touch a traumatic event that has never ceased to be stalking them.⁷⁶⁰

Excitement which a mother cannot shake off may goad her to an effort to shake, rather than lull, the baby to sleep. Another one may habitually throttle any nascent desire of the infant by offering her breast pre-emptively.⁷⁶¹ In a contribution to a panel discussion, Szwec mentioned that he had found that a number of mothers coming for consultation with babies presenting alimentary difficulties had previously been active sportswomen.⁷⁶² During pregnancy they had been deprived of their habitual ways of channelling tension into exercise: being forced to be more passive had led to important imbalances in the way they handled themselves, an imbalance that apparently made it difficult for them to regress with their babies. In some cases this led them to excessively stimulating their children into early motricity.⁷⁶³

Szwec, following Michel Fain, believes that important things happen when a baby is put to sleep. In letting her baby glide into sleep, the mother's unconscious, if things go rather well, will be conveying a dual message: the moment has come when it is right for the child to go to sleep, unalarmed and with no need for heightened vigilance, so as to, in slumbering, be taken on a safe path into pleasurable and wholesome becoming; it is equally time for the mother to see to other investments of hers now, be it pleasure or work.⁷⁶⁴ For the child the way it finds sleep is vital for the quality of its dreams.⁷⁶⁵ It is indeed the 'imaginary appetite' of the mother⁷⁶⁶ that colours, beyond the sensations offered by her presence, the quality of her absence and which establishes early possibilities for identification both with herself and the object of her desire, thus laying early foundations for psycho-sexual affectation.⁷⁶⁷ Thus the constitution of the first kernel of the unconscious and the work of primary repression heavily depend on the role of the mother in the early dyad.⁷⁶⁸ Children who are locked into an immutable position assigned to them in their parents' prefabricated fairy tales lack necessary stimulating discontinuity and find it difficult to find satisfactory balances between primary and secondary processes.⁷⁶⁹

Striving for premature independence as an escape route

In a number of papers Szwec grapples with different emergency arrangements that prematurely try to make do without the mother, who is either unavailable or far too much present in a highly disturbing way.⁷⁷⁰ Depending on inner and outer factors and their interplay this may result in different clinical arrays, the composite parts of which may, to some extent, intermingle.⁷⁷¹ Encounters with small children often show a co-existence of different modes and a recourse to the *opératoire* if and when a function insufficiently libidinalised fails to provide support.⁷⁷²

Focusing on possible de-structuring effects of early depression veering into the traumatic, he reminds us that René Spitz insisted anaclitic depression was contingent on a reasonably good relationship with the mother predating disruptive separation.⁷⁷³ If the nascent Me and its object links are still too precariously developed, hallucination and auto-eroticism cannot carry the weight of the mother's too prolonged absence.⁷⁷⁴ The emergent state, Szwec argues, will sensibly go beyond depression.⁷⁷⁵ Not only has the object gone missing, but its inner representation, not yet safely established, will slip and be rejected once re-established.⁷⁷⁶ If this happens, the developing subject's capacity for investment in the object world (including inner objects, be it good or bad) will receive a dire blow, with consequences for vital tonus and representative function.⁷⁷⁷ Mourning will be impeded because sideration struck mental life at a structurally fragile moment when something failed to happen, leaving a gap rather than a memory.⁷⁷⁸ A de-structuring push against the grain of progressive development impairs further processing.⁷⁷⁹ Loss cannot be represented and distress does not turn into anxiety,⁷⁸⁰ there is no phobia of strangers because everyone, in a sense, is a stranger and projections falter.⁷⁸¹ Pain may be solicited to defend against what cannot be processed mentally.⁷⁸² There is a comprehensive 'failure to

thrive'.⁷⁸³ To come to terms with what is not there, the child turns to an early form of *opératoire* functioning, in place of hallucination. In doing so it is trying to defend itself against the consequences of an earlier even more basic defence, when object links slipped/were cut,⁷⁸⁴ a process which one must assume, remains ambiguous because the subject is not fully differentiated from the object and the environment, having just about reached the threshold of this process.⁷⁸⁵

Alimentary disorder as an attempt of demarcation

There are babies that practically from the first days after birth find it difficult to establish a workable balance between hunger and satisfaction. Szwec relates the case of Nina, who presented with a severe case of alimentary disorder. Despite all medical intervention she seemed determined to let herself die of hunger.⁷⁸⁶ The case was addressed to Szwec by a paediatric unit when Nina was eleven months old.⁷⁸⁷ What emerged from the very challenging treatment of Nina - and her family - was that her oldest brother in his early infancy had to receive hospital treatment for anorexia.⁷⁸⁸ The mother had lost her father when she was an adolescent and her own mother, whose first name she had given to her daughter, had died after a long, painful fight against her disease three years before the first interview with Szwec took place.⁷⁸⁹ Nina was beset by an incredible amount of consecutive illnesses: influenzas, rhinopharyngites, anginas, fatigues of various origin, and most of all, gastroenterites.⁷⁹⁰ The mother's every concern was centred on her daughter's weight, with all conceivable means pressed into service to make her eat.⁷⁹¹ Her ability to play with Nina was restricted, especially with regard to playing hide and seek.⁷⁹² She had great difficulty to accept that her daughter had nightmares and pressurised doctors vigorously, but in vain, to prescribe night-time sedation.⁷⁹³ Even when Nina grew and was putting on weight, her mother kept fretting she was still worryingly slim.⁷⁹⁴ Hankering after

measurable weight increase, the mother had become indentured as a 'slave of quantity': every gram Nina did not put on threatened her narcissism.⁷⁹⁵ Things began to take a turn when the mother's worries changed and began focusing on her growing conviction she herself was developing cancer: becoming a hypochondriac in her own right – and thus reaching a personal holding point of sorts - she released her grip on her daughter.⁷⁹⁶

Calling in medical support, to some extent, had worsened the problem because it further tampered with the establishment of autonomous cycles of hunger and satisfaction. The hospital, in fact, was at risk of being made complicit in a Munchausen syndrome by proxy.⁷⁹⁷ The combination of mother and machine (Nina was put on feeding tubes) left Nina with very little in the way of Melanie Klein's oral sadism, splitting into good and bad objects, introjection of the object and re-introjection of her projections.⁷⁹⁸ In all of this, worrying for the integrity of the corporeal envelope of the child, the only acceptable evidence for which was corpulence, constituted a protective shield (*pare-excitation, Reizschutz*) for the mother, who was not able to provide this protection for herself in replacing her own mother.⁷⁹⁹ What could not turn hypochondriac anxiety on her own behalf, was excorporated onto the daughter, with *opératoire* measures to stand watch over both her and the traumatic wounds the mother herself had received.

Absence of Stranger Anxiety as a warning signal

Under the circumstances it is not surprising that Nina, deadlocked into her mother's investment of her, was not able to find relief in another arrangement, studied by Szwec, to deal with early environments: fusion with an archaic object, especially in children suffering from early asthma.⁸⁰⁰ Much depends on how the infant negotiates the crucible of Stranger Anxiety,

originally described by René Spitz as a normal phenomenon appearing with infants suddenly around eight months after birth. As Szwec points out, the presence of fright at this age, while indicating that a hallucinatory solution has failed, also bears witness to a certain degree of successful mental organisation: it provides evidence of a Me sufficiently differentiated from an object to be struck by the thought of the possible loss of a libidinal object clearly constituted. Absence of anxiety at this stage, far from being an encouraging sign of self-confidence, points to a development that has not run its regular course, with apparently problem-free serenity deceptively masking a structural deficiency.⁸⁰¹ Szwec takes up Claude Le Guen's reflections on the impact of the non-mother as a precursor of triangulation in a very early form: infant – mother – non-mother, a basic form later fantasies can successively build upon.⁸⁰² Before this important watershed of differentiation, extreme situations are lived as unmitigated distress (Freud's *Hilflosigkeit*, which Jean Laplanche translated by creating a new word: *désaide*) but not, properly speaking, as anxiety envisaging the threatening spectre of loss.⁸⁰³

In children whose environment does not suffer separation lightly, this necessary development, however, is impeded by a mother whose continued hovering presence gradually becomes a disorganising burden for the infant, and who may smother in the very plenitude of her loving, gratifying care the appearance of necessary auto-erotic behaviours in the infant.⁸⁰⁴ Absence is nullified.⁸⁰⁵ In many children troubled by early asthma, on the other hand, objects seem to have remained interchangeable. Defence mechanisms more archaic than repression and projection are resorted to, with expulsion, reversal into the opposite (*renversement dans le contraire*) and turning round upon the subject's own self (*retournement sur la personne propre*) carrying the brunt in the process.⁸⁰⁶ Conflict is thinned out and a choice between different objects shunned.⁸⁰⁷ Szwec reminds us that Pierre Marty thought it possible the avoidance of conflict seen in these children was not primary but the consequence of even earlier prenatal conflictual imbalances and

frictions between the fetus and the mother on a hormonal level.⁸⁰⁸ In these infants an attack of asthma is likely to appear when a surcharge of tension cannot be processed.⁸⁰⁹ Phobia is circumnavigated but at a high price: identification remains bound to the mimetic, whereas the hysterical position and auto-erotism are difficult to reach.⁸¹⁰ The occurrence of fusional ('allergic', according to Marty and his colleagues)⁸¹¹ relationships, however, does not mean a given patient cannot show several different registers of mental functioning, one, for instance, at the moment of crisis, and another one in the interstices between crises.⁸¹² In some cases, moments of regression comprising asthma (and the negating of object distance), can alternate with bouts of insomnia, raging fury and hypermotricity.⁸¹³ Until the end of adolescence things will remain in flux, so that in spite of early fixations, any assessment of the best inner arrangement to be arrived at has to remain provisional.⁸¹⁴

Camouflaged early fault lines

What many of the asthmatic children whom Szwec has studied seem to share⁸¹⁵ with some of his extremist sportsmen is that they have difficulties in reaching a stage in which they are able to experience object anxiety.⁸¹⁶ In at least one way, however, they form extreme opposites: if the analyst strays into limiting him/herself to a superficial treatment, patients given to allergic relationships can appear to be the patients their analysts have always dreamt of, adroitly morphing towards any expectation unconsciously directed at them, open to a generously free flow of associations.⁸¹⁷ This sets them, in appearance, miles apart from the *opérateur* patient who quickly becomes his/her analyst's counter-transferential nightmare. While the 'allergic' patient will shape shift into fusion with the threat, turning the object into a host of him/herself, the behaviourally hyperactive person will act as if affected by invisible *Epidermolysis bullosa*, a state, in which he/she, the 'Butterfly Child', has to avoid energetically and unthinkingly all

contact with a mother that does not hold and soothe but excite and irritate.⁸¹⁸ If there is compromise, it will have to be reached by establishing a balance between the traumatophilic and the traumatophobic tendencies.⁸¹⁹

No easy access opens for them towards a recognisable variety of W.R.Bion's self-holding experience in World War I under extreme duress.⁸²⁰ The children who show what in Szwec' view is the prototype of the experience do not cradle themselves soothingly but, sometimes, have to head bang themselves into oblivion against the cradle's wooden frame.⁸²¹ For them the mother's investment in them is a vessel of death, an offshoot of the maternal *pulsion de mort* ('*un message d'investissement mortifère issu de la pulsion de mort maternelle*'), which, according to Denise Braunschweig, is emanating from the mother's superego.⁸²² In this context, laying a baby to rest is a crucial moment, in which the mother's reduction of the intensity of her child-directed awareness (including manifestations of her *pulsion de mort*, reducing cathexis)⁸²³ has to be offset by the safe - and well-enough satisfied - regression of the child into a fantasy space not too frantically imposed upon it.⁸²⁴

Substitutes for impossible 'No's

If the early environment with its tug-of-war between balances and imbalances - played out on a turf fully soliciting the mother's fantasmatic object relations⁸²⁵ - happens to jar with the infant's nascent subjectivity, his/her possibilities effectively to say no to what is on offer will, at an early stage, be limited. What can be raised in place of 'no' will have to be predicated on the body.⁸²⁶ We have seen that eating disorders may develop as a consequence. They often set in during the first six months, when the early object relation has been constituted.⁸²⁷ In its eating behaviour, the anorexic infant displaces a first conflict that it cannot successfully transfer from the mother to

the face of a stranger.⁸²⁸ Dramatic sobbing spasms often appear between six and eighteen months and typically eclipse consciousness for the duration of the crisis.⁸²⁹ Children who early on show difficulties are likely to provoke negative responses from their parents that give rise to further crises.⁸³⁰ It is within this field of early interactions that the responses of babies '*non câlins*' find their particular place. By their hyperactive behaviour they try to escape from a form of relationship that does not provide them with an adequate protective shield but an ever-present source of trauma, giving rise to an internalised image of insecurity.⁸³¹ If disconnecting from it by ordinary means is not possible, ramping up the volume of sensations that can be actively procured acts as a barrier against the source of unacceptable sensations – the mother – that cannot be dealt with and cannot be fused with.⁸³² Putting up screens of mobility and/or noise carves out a habitat that will not be meddled with. It attempts to self-cradle in a hostile environment, in which play has failed, on a precarious ledge.⁸³³ Though resistance may well be futile, surrender is not an option: succumbing passively to the given environment on offer would be inconceivable.⁸³⁴ By these devices, which shun any passive position, the path to the constructive build up of a protective masochism is impaired.⁸³⁵ The only form of relaxation available is that produced by exhaustion. If the child has directly or indirectly been exposed to adult violence, a sense of self may coalesce around pain,⁸³⁶ which may in cautious therapy be re-linked to its lost masochistic potential.⁸³⁷

If the hyperactive child tries to flee the intolerable, sometimes by producing barrages of noise, the prematurely 'wise' child has found a different way to disappear from the locus of pain by merging into the more impersonal background of social noises regurgitating received wisdom. Turned adult, his position is aphoristically characterised by Szwec as 'My father has died, my wife has left me, what is it now people do in such a case'.⁸³⁸ In spite of their obvious, impressive surface differences, the restless warrior infant and the quiescent child Stoic, Szwec seems to suggest, present different faces of an *opérateur* use of the world of physical and social data to

constantly re-edit the traumatic.⁸³⁹ While the hyperactive child turns to strenuous exercise, the prematurely 'wise' child uses suppression to obliterate any potentially dangerous connection between affect and mental representation by the vigorous exercise of premature ego function.⁸⁴⁰ What the 'wise child' certainly has learned is to avoid unwelcome attention (accorded to 'difficult children', sometimes even by state agencies on a national level in France)⁸⁴¹ by nipping, one might say, subjectivity in the bud.

Putting a stop to the capacity to form saturated links

Szwec' use of the term suppression builds on previous discussion. In the very first issue of the *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* (1991) Catharine Parat in a very much noted article pertinently pointed out that a close reading of Freud suggests that there is a difference between *Verdrängung* (English: repression, French: *refoulement*) and *Unterdrückung* (English: suppression, French: *répression*) and that this was of clinical relevance.⁸⁴² According to Parat, suppression obliterates affect while keeping the representation intact but separate and neutralised at the level of the preconscious, pre-empting the need for perlaboration in an act in which volition plays an important role.⁸⁴³ Parat, following previous work by Sami Ali, envisages a suppression of the capacity to have a working imaginary (*la fonction imaginaire*) that enters into character formation.⁸⁴⁴ She concedes that an important part of reality is constituted by acts of *répression* brought to bear upon the child by its immediate family environment.⁸⁴⁵ A loss of a privileged channel of discharge for tension can in further life lead to a critical disbalance which can make the person more vulnerable.⁸⁴⁶ Szwec, as we have seen, shows that alimentary arrangements that do not work on an elementary level are a heavy burden for a subject's future development. What if the 'mental diet' fed to a child produces a recoil from sinking back into levels of the unconscious provisioned by the way the parents handle the child? We have seen that

Pierre Marty believed that too quick a transition in West Africa from tribal cultures to the modern life in cities left children exposed to modes of the *opérateur* as a fall back coping mechanism.

Disappearance into conformity

Szwec notes that the particular link the fully fledged *opérateur* person is likely to entertain to the social dimension differs from what Freud described as a tendency of behaviour in crowds: It is not the identification with or attachment to a leader that is moving the *opérateur*, but a quest for functional conformity, an identification with no one in particular but with the 'on dit' (what people say) and with the realm of approved time-hallowed recipes.⁸⁴⁷ To behave as if motivated by the selfsame forces that drive others enables them to gloss over the sorry state of their inner worlds.⁸⁴⁸ If the allergic child can be a gifted imitator of prominent politicians,⁸⁴⁹ the *opérateur* has a knack of assimilating the broad, critically unscrutinised consensus. This acts as a kind of prosthesis for what would otherwise be kept malleable by the various strata of the preconscious.⁸⁵⁰ With shallow identificatory processes and attempts to deal with their problems by way of projective reduplication,⁸⁵¹ they are, we have to conclude, moles without a spymaster to liaison to, in a brittle way vulnerable to being exposed in the difficulties they face to produce the same evidence for 'depth' of psychic functioning as others,⁸⁵² a problem reminiscent of the dangers replicants in the film 'Blade Runner' routinely face in probing interviews.⁸⁵³

In at least one of his contributions, Szwec seems to echo approvingly a comparison between Hannah Arendt's description of the totalitarian domain and the mind exposed to infantile distress.⁸⁵⁴ Although the connection may not be stringent, one can see that fault lines in the individual could easily be re-enforced by larger forces in the socio-cultural domain. At any rate,

the individual formerly exposed to childhood trauma will try to find and maintain a social location, in accordance with his/her needs for a protective shield against the onslaught of tension difficult to process, buttressing an ideal Me comforted by the existence of overwhelming might, and be it that of facts, outside its psyche.⁸⁵⁵

Cultural toolkits for quick steps into mindlessness

When Szwec' 1998 book '*Les galériens volontaires*' was released in a new edition in 2013,⁸⁵⁶ it had in the meantime inspired further studies on the implementation of self-calming procedures as described by Szwec, among them a study of the *clochards* of Paris.⁸⁵⁷ In a new preface Szwec introduces what at first seems to be a further clinical vignette. It focuses on a runner of ultra-marathons in pursuit of his goal to run 100 kilometres and who describes his ordeal based on notes shortly after completion of his course. The world, as described by him, shrinks and is reduced to the ground three meters ahead of him.⁸⁵⁸ 'I run to attain emptiness' the runner confesses.⁸⁵⁹ Szwec finds ample echoes of the patients he described in the previous edition, who try to install vigorously anobjectal regimes and who reduce tension by exhausting themselves while concentrating on their exertion. Then he reveals the identity of the runner: it is Haruki Murakami, the celebrated Japanese writer, who runs every morning to empty his mind and who has written an essay about his experiences as a runner.⁸⁶⁰ Can one be able to function on a high level of symbolisation and be capable of being *opérateur* at the same time, Szwec asks. Can one be a part-time *opérateur*?⁸⁶¹ Can there be a cyclical division of labour between the *opérateur* and the fully mentalised, an occasional binging on the *opérateur*, as it were?

Apparently, Szwec concedes, there are people who can function in more than one register.⁸⁶²

Szwec is willing to envisage the possibility of a highly performative split in the way Murakami

functions.⁸⁶³ Everyone, in the course of his individual psychopathology of daily life, can pass through transitory *opératoire* moments, by, for instance, mechanically doing crossword puzzles, or by counting sheep so as to fall asleep more easily.⁸⁶⁴ In passing, he notes that Murakami mentions the 'mantras' he recites and without which he believes he would not be able to be up to his task.⁸⁶⁵ Szwec suspects there are elements of ancient non-integrated distress that move him to his runs.⁸⁶⁶ Although Szwec does not explicitly address the matter, this raises the question whether some of these transitory *opératoire* moments may be grounded in a locally accessible range of cultural practices: it would not be too difficult to find cultural equivalents in attaining nothingness by the persistent reciting of a mantra in Japan.⁸⁶⁷ In other places, local culture seems to have developed special techniques to put the flavour of fancy into the dullness of repetitive labour, depriving routine behaviour of some of its *opératoire* potential.⁸⁶⁸

It is indicative of a certain distance between psychoanalysis and cultural studies that Szwec does not seem to be aware of the work of Ian Hacking on people who, in France, in the latter part of the 19th century felt driven to take to their feet to escape the constrictions of their immediate environment and became part of a widely commented upon cultural phenomenon of the times.⁸⁶⁹ Hacking pays close attention to the consequences of medical attention and classification on the people set on going on a *fugue*, but tries to stay close to the feeling of events:

One reader of my story wanted more history - of the politics of psychiatry, for example, and how it fitted into nineteenth-century French politics. Instead I added more about buildings, more about the sense of being in provincial, closed-in Bordeaux, where Albert went mad. I am no novelist, but I hope to have invited the reader into the mean dark streets of a town that suffocates under its own pride or into the spacious cloister of the hospital where my compulsive walker found a safe place.⁸⁷⁰

A mother certainly can be inept to deal with infantile trauma. But what about cultural environments? Does it make any difference how they are marked by trauma or whether they have set apart ways of dealing with it?

Concluding his preface fifteen years after the first publication of *'Les galériens volontaires'*, Szwec reveals that in writing the book he realised he had spent his childhood immersed in an environment in which *galériens du travail* (galley slaves chained to their work) were very much in evidence. In the Ashkenazi surroundings in which he was growing up after World War II, hard work from morning to evening was the rule. What people advanced as arguments when asked was related to economic reasons, but what he personally knew of these men and women makes him believe, looking backwards, that they were in a state of trauma. Writing about one of his patients made him remember one person in particular, of whom he had vivid childhood memories. Bent over all day over his clattering sewing machine, bathed in an ambience of furious sound, with a radio he did not listen to booming away in the background, this was the way he passed the day, all of his days. He had had to leave his family and to work at the machine when he was ten years old, before finding himself tumbled into the cauldron of war and revolution. He had first survived famine and then wartime persecution. He justified his constant work by arguing that in life it was either 'march or die'. One can easily understand that Szwec believes it is clinically useful to keep the registers of trauma and masochism separate because they follow different developmental lines.⁸⁷¹ To this galley slave, to whom memory took him back, and to some others he has known, Szwec dedicates the new edition of his book, a book deeply engaged with the reverberations of trauma in seemingly erratic behaviour.⁸⁷²

Object distance in an environment inculcating self-impingement

Szwec, in the footsteps of Marty, Fain, Braunschweig and Léon Kreisler,⁸⁷³ continues Maurice Bouvet's interest in object distance,⁸⁷⁴ the spatial position the subject tries to occupy in relation to the object.⁸⁷⁵ The infantile positions described so far try to make do without having to acknowledge the presence of a concrete, distinct object into whose fantasy life the subject entered even before birth.⁸⁷⁶ True to Fain and Braunschweig's suggestions, Szwec considers the *pulsion de mort*⁸⁷⁷ to originate from outside the infant, with the mother.⁸⁷⁸ Granted some of this may always be present, what will vary is the mixture, the fusion and the patterns of periodic oscillation between calming down and stimulation.⁸⁷⁹ If calming down is the standard fare, there will be little in the way of a fantasmatic catalyst present to stimulate the imagination of the child.⁸⁸⁰ In Jean Laplanche's 'General Theory of Seduction' the focus is on libidinal subversion. In Szwec' reflections there is a dark cousin to this, in the possible undermining of the nascent fantasmatic potential of the child in the family he grows up in: it is not the dark sinful desire of the vampire that threatens the child here, so to speak, but the dementor's horrid kiss.⁸⁸¹ Mothers who reduce the infant in their care to a functioning thing⁸⁸² spur the baby to set in motion a range of emergency measures.⁸⁸³ The attempt to run down tension, using too forcefully the *pulsion de mort*'s reductive tendencies to defend and shield oneself at all costs, is a means born of distress rather than of object anxiety.⁸⁸⁴ In a number of very difficult cases there is not enough object link to envelop this early distress in a mesh of masochism in which object relations are at least implied.⁸⁸⁵

The mechanisms which Szwec discusses address what Winnicott would have considered negative impingement,⁸⁸⁶ a reduction of the available expanse of mental space in which the child is free to move. Using a desperate stratagem, the child combats archaic distress by deploying an

emptiness of its own,⁸⁸⁷ with the *opératoire* as a mode to disengage when no other disconnect is ready to do the job, measures that will likely, at later stages, be embedded in cultural practices and the world of work. Not everyone can go insane like King Lear: for those not sufficiently predisposed to disengage psychotically, going *opératoire* can be something seemingly within their conscious grip.⁸⁸⁸ Lebovici speaks about the early 'bath of affects' that turns proto-representations into fantasies:⁸⁸⁹ Szwec shows that that the fantasmatic worlds of the mother determine not only the temperature of this bath but the dimensions and the positioning of the tub the baby encounters it in. His approach, open to meaningful nuance, takes an interest in early fantasmatic interactions⁸⁹⁰ so as to better understand such resulting arrangements that leave the subject libidinally and narcissistically ill prepared to face the moment of crisis when it arrives.⁸⁹¹ We shall see with Anna Potamianou in our next chapter how the Me is likely to respond in the face of such emergencies.

Chapter Eight: Configurations 1: Anna Potamianou

In the last chapter we followed Gérard Szvec study the desperate lengths the subject might go to in order to find a modicum of transient calm and rest. In this chapter I shall present Anna Potamianou's approach, who views this situation from yet another angle. For many of the patients Potamianou reflects upon, transition to a land of meaningful hopes has stalled. What is left of one's personal future has been deposited and locked into action. The territory remaining to the Me is defended nail, tooth and claw.

This is indicative of an overall situation that gravely leaves to be desired.

The subject marooned in fallow lands sustained by routines

The individual in the centre of Potamianou's interrogation has been cut off from vital resources in what otherwise might have constituted his/her self, following a process the history of which has fallen beyond reach.⁸⁹² Within the remaining impaired repertoire of defensive possibilities, much is loaded on a mechanism that once helped the nascent Me to feel reasonably secure within established perimeters: repetition. As Freud suggested, repetition compulsion opens a window to a world beyond the pleasure principle. Since this is territory the *mode opératoire* clearly transverse, the detailed look Anna Potamianou takes at processes of repetition helps to understand more fully an important ingredient of robotic functioning as portrayed by Marty and his colleagues.⁸⁹³

This follows its own logic patiently traced by Potamianou: of old repetition served to produce building blocks of the familiar, giving rise to remembrance of the already been and underscoring testable lines of demarcation between Me and non-Me.⁸⁹⁴ While granting apprenticeship in manageable skills, it also has entrenched borders that, for all their being to some extent artificial, can be put to use in warding off the turmoil of exposure to the as yet unknown.⁸⁹⁵ Although repetition often appears to be a pliant servant to a conservative status quo, Potamianou believes there is also a mesh of possibly quite discrete potential that links it to former theatres of the libido.⁸⁹⁶ What the individual who makes extensive use of repetition does is to deposit as much of his/her core history for safekeeping directly in the enactment of the actual without passing the realms of fantasy.⁸⁹⁷ With no other elaboration accessible, motricity provides a shell for the individual, thereby protecting mental life from the threat of extinction, faintly echoing times the link to which has slipped and enkysting remaining supplies of libido.⁸⁹⁸

Repetition as a deposit of relationship – forgetfulness as a ritual offering

Concomitantly, as Potamianou points out, objects fade in vitality and lose their own proper texture.⁸⁹⁹ It seems the subject has become impervious to any urge to realise his/her fuller potential.⁹⁰⁰ Myth constructs stories around this: banished by the gods, the only sustainable relationship Sisyphos can enter into is to his stone.⁹⁰¹ In this shrinking of the world the Me has ceded territory in what Potamianou discusses as an often unconscious act of quasi-sacrificial offering, re-enforcing his/her links to a social environment to which this *kenosis* - self-emptying - is offered as a gift and as a binding contract.⁹⁰² To illustrate this, Potamianou draws our attention to the ancient rites at the temple of Trophonios, in ancient Boiotia, Greece, in which the pilgrims to the sanctuary were administered special potions by the officiating priests so as to make them forget their previous lives and to remember more poignantly what happened in the

ceremony.⁹⁰³ In the patients whom Potamianou considers, this transaction - effected to gain access to the lived values of a rite in exchange for the seal of oblivion on antecedent history - has not worked in their favour and has given rise to mental habitats not easy to live in, in which the urge not to wish for more than what circumstances seem to permit shores up the status quo in but a threadbare fashion: repetition churns on dust. Administering to death a refusal to expand into the world, it attempts to keep a lid on any surge of excitement the understanding of which, deprived of a context in retrievable memory as it is, has become exceedingly difficult.⁹⁰⁴

Attractors embedded in force fields detrimental to thriving

In the downsized mental economy envisaged by Potamianou, external reality has gained ground as an organiser for the impaired inner dynamics: the weakened psychic apparatus seems to be drawn to what, following the work of Georges and Sylvie Pragier, Potamianou terms attractors, positioned outside the subject,⁹⁰⁵ powerful force fields that distract and disperse rather than equip with nuclei of nascent cohesion.⁹⁰⁶ Unless the individual finds within himself/herself the inner vertebrae to stand up to the vortex, alloplastic vicissitudes, not autopoiesis, occupy the foreground largely vacated by the subject, with the regulatory system of the subject struggling to deal with the effraction of its defensive shields by what he/she experiences as barrages of the aleatory.⁹⁰⁷ Especially if early tendencies towards non-differentiation remain strong, the subject is drawn into the fissures opened up by the primal object's deficiencies.⁹⁰⁸ Wishes for fusion and a turning against the self may provide protection against the painful realisation that the maternal object is, in effect, failing the subject.⁹⁰⁹ This is significantly different from the attraction exercised by objects invested in by desire (which, Potamianou suggests, may well work like the *pregnance* postulated in the theories of René Thom).⁹¹⁰ Potamianou posits a continuing, almost gravitational pull of the original lack of representation – a forcefield of representative nullity,

omnipotent in absence of something conceptually tangible – to which the individual is exposed in crisis.⁹¹¹ In the effort to maintain a threatened balance at all costs, Potamianou suggests, the attraction of an inner pre-conceptual abyss makes itself felt, an inner chasm that alluringly calls out to the subject bidding it to bury all painful conceptual differentiations in it.⁹¹² The subject becomes susceptible to being magnetically drawn towards the dark gulf of early experience never really given up,⁹¹³ beckoning with intimations of a fusional potential and a possible potency beyond common measure, a constellation that does not favour figurative work.⁹¹⁴ Precariously perched on a brink, beset by a painful silence of memory, the implicit continuities of the non-dynamic parts of the id provide solace against a background in which the more elaborated strata of mental life thin out and fray, with the id drawing on a pool of restive, non-qualified, indifferent energy that has never entered into formation of the *pulsion* [*'montage pulsionnel'*] and which makes liaisons to mental work difficult:⁹¹⁵ the individual's capacities for binding tension into representational and symbolic thinking is put at risk.⁹¹⁶ Interested in the work of César and Sára Botella on the catastrophic dangers of non-representation, Potamianou emphasises the possibility that the gap between perception and representation could also originate in an early renouncement of a Me not previously exposed to the right, optimal, degree of seduction⁹¹⁷ of entire zones of its territory, leaving it, as a consequence, fallow.⁹¹⁸

Repetition as part of a residual shock absorption system

For all the difficulties this creates for analytic work, repetition compulsion should not, Potamianou argues, be seen as an unalloyed articulation of the *pulsion de mort*: neither the slipping of links nor the withdrawal of erotic interest will ever be total.⁹¹⁹ It offers to the subject a Janus faced means of last resort to fix boundaries when nothing else holds, although this emergency measure further tears and frays the mental web it was meant to conserve.⁹²⁰ It is, the

reader understands, a desperate measure like calling in the Goths to save Rome.⁹²¹ In spite of the considerable collateral damage its use causes, it may in its frantic drive to establish a grip on things (*prise sur*), nevertheless, enshrine hope for a future new take on things (*re-prise*),⁹²² if the analyst manages to work with it and can discover in dreary repetition the potential for promoting an amount of change that has so far been put beyond the pale.⁹²³ In some cases, the new amount of mobility made available by the treatment becomes unbearably terrifying to the patient because it smacks of a loss of control and poses an unacceptable threat to how things have been run so far.⁹²⁴

As Kaswin-Bonnefond once remarked, Potamianou tends to understand the sequels of the traumatic as a dynamic process rather than as a more static structural deficit.⁹²⁵ Potamianou refers to Jean-Claude Ameisen's exploration of *apoptosis* - programmed cell death - that is sculpting recognisable form in a constant interplay of construction and destruction, which keeps and conserves only what is bound into vital exchange.⁹²⁶ For new forms in inner life to arise, tendencies to break up and to detach oneself play an important part. Potamianou stresses that Freud's *pulsion de mort* disaggregates larger units and sees libidinal disentanglement and disinvestment as consequences of this direction within the mental apparatus.⁹²⁷

In a 2001 monograph of hers the author comes to develop her topic further and to ground it more deeply in her reflections on trauma.⁹²⁸ The traumatic, she argues, is inevitably present at the beginning of our existence: it is a vein that runs through all psychic territory.⁹²⁹ Yet, this territory does not always have the same extensions:

More than once Freud alluded to the capacity of the mental apparatus to open or to tighten up, to restrict or, on the contrary, to widen its processual aptitude and its mobility.⁹³⁰

With the subject under duress, the traumatic forms a link of last resort when the subject finds itself plunged into disarray.⁹³¹ It is then that an emergency boot up of agency, marshalling rather residual self-states, steps in to connect to an otherwise no longer tangible object world: 'The frozen [in the original: *fixé*] time of traumatism shatters and upholds at the same time'.⁹³² Dissatisfaction, lack and loss weave a string of frustrations which does not attach to symbolising nodes.⁹³³ Repetitions usually address knots of tension, in quest of a link escaping the mental apparatus.⁹³⁴ When disobjectalisation threatens, holding fast to the traces of the traumatic constitutes is all there can be held to.⁹³⁵ It conserves what can be salvaged by employing behavioural rather than mental means.⁹³⁶ In some instances, traditionally connected to severe cases of the *mode opératoire*, the unconscious seems to have fallen mute altogether: it still receives but has ceased all discernible emission, according to Marty's classical formula ('*L'inconscient reçoit mais n'émet plus*').⁹³⁷ The propulsive and directional guidance provided by the working of the *pulsions* disintegrates.⁹³⁸ Fantasy falls silent and mental activity tumbles head down, drowning, into the shallows of stagnant waters.⁹³⁹ Response to stimuli becomes an overweening concern, dragging the subject through cycles from tension to exhaustion.⁹⁴⁰ What has been ceded/foreclosed, Potamianou concedes, may well return from the outside.⁹⁴¹ If no cushion of the imaginary dampens the effects of exterior reality, its impact may be violent.⁹⁴² Perceptions cannot sink into a mental cushion where they can become latent thoughts but are clung to so as to provide subsidiary anchorage.⁹⁴³ For figurative work to take place and comprehensible desires to emerge there would have to be a dialectic between the Me that represents itself and the Me that lets itself go, something that evidently does not happen in the case of the *opératoire*.⁹⁴⁴ There are also indications, Potamianou points out, that the subject's psycho-sexuality has not solidly – or solidly enough – been established along hysterical lines.⁹⁴⁵

With Neyraut 1997, Potamianou understands repetition compulsion as a pivotal element of an anti-traumatic protective shock absorption system.⁹⁴⁶ In broad accord with him, she remains attentive to the amount of sexual co-excitation occasioned by trauma and the position in which the defensive measures adopted place the Me vis-a-vis the id.⁹⁴⁷ In more amenable cases masochism will attempt to liaison with the unsupportable. Potamianou refers to Benno Rosenberg's work on the two versions of masochism: life saving as opposed to death procuring.⁹⁴⁸ If masochism as a guardian of life comes into play, it will meaningfully connect the woes the subject finds itself in to the worlds of infantile sexual fantasy, assigning suffering a legitimate place in the experience of the individual.

Pain as an envelope to contain a breach

In another solution, further removed from the object world, the puncturing of the protective shield, signalled by pain, will be ring-fenced by narcissism, as an emblem of the hope that the affliction can be contained locally: pain becomes a sign that there is still something alive to respond to it beyond the devastated zone.⁹⁴⁹ It compacts the Me, as it were, in routines in which repetition compulsion is an important factor.⁹⁵⁰ To be able to survive may become a triumph as such, witnessed by the ability to co-exist with pain, nurturing ideals of narcissistic empowerment.⁹⁵¹ Embracing pain and an envelope of suffering will become a way of life and support for one's sense of self.⁹⁵² Potamianou takes as an example Philoctetes, a Greek soldier in the Trojan war marooned on an island by his erstwhile comrades for the unbearable stench of his festering wound incurred whilst in service.⁹⁵³ Following Michel Fain, Potamianou considers the possibility that the narcissistic investment hemming in the wound and hurt may constitute a protective, quasi erogenic, zone in its own right designed to form a second protective shield against traumatic neurosis.⁹⁵⁴

The fewer of these links of last resort can be entertained the more repetition will emptily churn on, conserving residual links that increasingly reach out into empty space.⁹⁵⁵ If nothing else serves as a remedy, somatic episodes could constitute attempts to take off pressure from having to come to terms with the unsupportable.⁹⁵⁶

Identification sickness

In all these processes the role of identifications should not be neglected.⁹⁵⁷ In 1984 Potamianou devoted a book to the subject⁹⁵⁸, to which she has come back in her later studies.⁹⁵⁹ Although it is not directly focused on the *mode opératoire*, it has clear repercussions on it. Potamianou reminds us that identification at the oedipal stage serves as an antidote to desire in the face of overwhelming obstacles – in the form of an interdicting powerful third – to its realisation.⁹⁶⁰ More generally, it also appropriates and attempts to assimilate the fascinatingly and disturbingly powerful which cannot be dealt with in other ways.⁹⁶¹ As it disposes of - and to some degree neutralises - desire to which an immediate outlet is blocked, it also dispenses considerable violence in the process of laying hold on the object to be hauled in for identification.⁹⁶² In case of a mentally disturbed relative on whose frighteningly unbridled power a part of the subject's Me may unconsciously model itself, there may open an insufferable gap between conscious and unconscious self-representations.⁹⁶³ Attracted by the gaping void at the origin of our existence bare of representation, the subject is drawn to representations of violence that others exercise on us or on themselves.⁹⁶⁴ Following Alain de Mijolla's work on 'visitors in the Me', including the presentation of the disquieting case of Arthur Rimbaud - part of a very vivid discussion on alienating unconscious identification in France from the late 1970s - Potamianou highlights the possibility of 'identification sickness'.⁹⁶⁵ In a passage particularly relevant to an understanding of

possible pre-histories to the *opérateur*, she suggests that the way the preconscious of a subject gains shape and structure, takes its cues from [*se façonne d'après*] the interiorised shape it is formed with persons of particular significance to the subject.⁹⁶⁶ Often enough, things develop sufficiently well and identification can open up meaningful futures and zones of desire. In other cases however, identificatory moves close mental space and obliterate desire, with no language at hand to offer solace and sustenance, a situation in which compulsive repetition has to stand in for the inexpressible.⁹⁶⁷

Hope gone rancid

Even if the subject still feels entitled to hope, there are cases in which this hope is little more than a fetish, tenaciously clung to, opening up a semblance of future that on closer inspection proves to be a dead end.⁹⁶⁸ In *'Un bouclier dans l'économie des états-limites'* the author describes a shield of stagnant hope, sometimes used by borderline patients, which nurtures a gratifyingly soothing confidence in the ultimate arrival of transformative change, which – in contrast to what is overtly proclaimed – is continuously adjourned *'ad calendas graecas'*.⁹⁶⁹ One of its important functions is to put the present into stasis, isolating it against mutative change⁹⁷⁰ and the necessity of choice at a crossroads⁹⁷¹, in this its working reminiscent of Winnicott's concept of “fantasying”, an activity 'absorbing energy but not contributing either to dreaming or to living'.⁹⁷² Potamianou evokes the myth of Pandora, recounted by Hesiod, and reminds us that hope is not always a good thing for the person who entertains it.⁹⁷³ Keeping hope detached from all possible realistic attempts at realisation, the patients Potamianou has studied spare themselves the mental mobilisation necessary to invest libidinally in objects and self, which would require, they say, an amount of energy which they simply do not possess.⁹⁷⁴ Potamianou refers to Andre Green's use of, as he terms it, 'the object's other' (the one the object's inner gaze is directed to if it does not

purely dwell on the subject): what if the space on offer by the primary care giver were to deny any potential to thriving and force the subject in the straits of enforced self-sameness?⁹⁷⁵ Others are necessarily closely involved in what the subject comes to experience as hope: functionally hope shares traits with the ego ideal, whose receptability for influences from the grandparents' ego ideal has been discussed by de Mijolla.⁹⁷⁶ Potamianou approvingly sums up Janine Chasseguet-Smirgel's position on the importance of a sense of promise in the ego ideal.⁹⁷⁷ In case of threatening helplessness, various sub-projects undertaken in search of a Graal, as it were, may serve as an anti-phobic screen that protects against a loss of all hope.⁹⁷⁸ Even if everything is blocked and resources are limited, hope, deeply enkysted, standing in for pleasurable satisfaction or even for desire itself may keep some inner flame flickering lest the glacial night of non-desire covers everything.⁹⁷⁹

In Pandora's case it was her curiosity that caused her to open the lid to the box.⁹⁸⁰ Neither curiosity nor hope, be it in the particularly stagnant form Potamianou portrays, have been regarded as hallmarks of the *opérateur*. Nor are oscillations between desire and lack of desire, which Potamianou finds with borderline cases⁹⁸¹ something the *opérateur* seems inclined to. Flights of hopeful fancy and any extravagant flourish, on the whole, appears to be alien to his/her mode of being and functioning. Creative illusions⁹⁸² are not his/her genre. Whatever buckle he/she has is heavily invested in facticity and activity.

Resilience at a rock bottom level: The opérateur as a process in a field of shifting forces

When Anna Potamianou addresses problems of the *opérateur*, she strongly emphasises, as has been pointed out, the processual as an important complement to any structural considerations.⁹⁸³ If a person has at his disposal a network of mental representations of sufficient depth and

flexibility, his/her psyche will have the ability to oscillate.⁹⁸⁴ These oscillations⁹⁸⁵ will be set in a field of shifting (inner and outer) equilibria in an economy of forces⁹⁸⁶, an 'entanglement', as Potamianou writes 'of defensive arrangements exposed to the ripples of incessant vibrations'⁹⁸⁷ whilst integrating experiences of the past.⁹⁸⁸ Such a person will be able to apply regulatory brakes without grinding to a halt: excitement and exhaustion will not easily wreak havoc on his/her mental economy.⁹⁸⁹ In contrast to this the *opératoire's* situation is characterised by an inordinate amount of violence, not only exercised against the psychic apparatus (by early or later traumatisms and by narcissistic hurts) but also within the psychic apparatus.⁹⁹⁰ The platform of *opératoire* functioning actively takes things in hand, operating an intra-systemic strategy which brutally knocks about the functionality of the Me.⁹⁹¹ The Me is shrunk violently so as to offer as little as possible vulnerable surface to be pierced in its protective tissue.⁹⁹² Mounted from a reduced basis, defence consumes a lot of energy.⁹⁹³ In this perspective, the Me is not so much exhausted as such, but working at the limits of its defensive capacity.⁹⁹⁴ Without quoting him, Potamianou shows how Michel Fain's caustic remark to the effect that the *opératoire* patient is a person demonstrating too successfully that the Me can go autonomous could work out in a situation in which bearing up is all there is left to the subject.

In Potamianou's delineation, the *opératoire* person's situation is, indeed, to all intents and purposes reminiscent of a wartime economy. As in every war, questions of the exact make up of core territories and remaining resources at a given moment are crucial to any assessment of future viability. In line with her general approach that privileges nuanced differences, she contends there may be quite a range - '*une palette*' - of varieties of the *opératoire*, not all of them covered in the original identikit provided by Pierre Marty and his colleagues.⁹⁹⁵ Some of the patients Potamianou has in mind do not show the heightened degree of disorganisation postulated by Marty but rather a massive tightening of mental life around a hard narcissistic core,

in a situation in which boundaries waver and the defensive organisation of the Me falters.⁹⁹⁶ Under these circumstances *opératoire* functioning, which operates with reduced tonus over a shrunken mental surface, in Potamianou's view, takes on the character of a substantial, defensive counter-investment.⁹⁹⁷

As a defence against afflictions in dire straits is it only directed against an external lack or is there a fifth column of the negative, striking from within when the mental apparatus is weakened by crisis?⁹⁹⁸ In the problematic response the subject musters in the face of adversity we may well find a dysfunctionality on the level of the unconscious, but what emerges on the surface, under the conditions, is an iron curfew the weakened Me clamps down on what arrives from within and without.⁹⁹⁹ Transformation is put on hold in a sclerosis of free mental movement and relational zest.¹⁰⁰⁰ It is a pathology of the Me we are confronted with, which may or may not be linked with psychosomatic illness and *dépression essentielle*.¹⁰⁰¹ There are, probably, different paths, involving an interplay of inner and outer factors that drive people into a corner, to which the *opératoire* is an emergency response.¹⁰⁰² In the varieties described by Potamianou there is resilience but at a rather basic level and at appalling costs.¹⁰⁰³ The Me that is in place emerges as a rather securitarian establishment, relentlessly patrolling the perimeter with all the manpower available, an action quite possibly in tacit obeisance to a cult of supposedly archaic power.¹⁰⁰⁴ There will be bread, more frequently stale than not, but no amenities and, in particular, very little in the way of games. If they are held at all, they are a serious affair in which neither man nor beast will be spared.

Personal myth as a force of irrigation

Piera Aulagnier - whom we have met earlier in Chapter Three as a founding member of the *Quatrième Groupe* - quoted by Potamianou on various occasions, held that it was not really the unconscious that was constructed like a language, as Lacan taught. Rather this was something that might be said about the (unconscious) Me, for the constitution of which identification plays an important role.¹⁰⁰⁵ Potamianou moves into related territory when she speaks of cases in which inscriptions fail to take place because morphemes needed to give shape to psychic events are not available to the individual.¹⁰⁰⁶ To some extent, at least, myth, she argues, steps in to fill the gap:

... repression leaves gaps in perception and memory which allow for omissions in the historical continuity of the subject's life. The gaps are filled by the mythical morphemes that shape the self-image and influence the perception and understanding of the surrounding world.¹⁰⁰⁷

Personal myth, Potamianou believes, aids the differentiation between inner and outer world and constitutes an individual's 'most personal mode of shaping his or her own reality'.¹⁰⁰⁸ It 'irrigates analysis with the flow of desires' and contributes 'to the structuring and maintenance of the individual's unique inner world',¹⁰⁰⁹ a territory which, as we have seen, finds itself under intense pressure in the varieties of the *opérateur*.¹⁰¹⁰ In her treatment of the figure of Helena in various strands of old lore she draws an implicit comparison between mythical morphemes and dream work, which supports the mental economy of the subject.¹⁰¹¹ As with the appearance of dreams, the emergence of personal myth in analysis should not be used single-mindedly to ferret out the 'real' history of the patient: it is the only way he/she has to deal with the derivatives of the unconscious.¹⁰¹² What is important is to help the patient to live with the fact that his/her ego 'can never acquire complete control over the primary processes'.¹⁰¹³

It is interesting to note the importance she accords the myth of Prometheus: Would Oedipus have found himself at the triple crossroad, she asks, if in some part in him a Prometheus had not made himself heard?¹⁰¹⁴ Although Potamianou emphasises the invariant necessity of psychic conflict,¹⁰¹⁵ she is very sensitive to the social and cultural conditions that shape the work of the great Greek tragedians: conditions push the poet who uses myth to develop in his work the stuff dreams are made of [*la fantasmatique*].¹⁰¹⁶ What she writes of Prometheus seems to be applicable as much to the great playwright as to the average citizen:

deliverance will come when Prometheus will be able to imagine the effort, the ordeal, and acknowledges the conflict to step up to it [*assumer le conflit*].¹⁰¹⁷

Ambition is nothing less than setting one's sights at changing the way things are ordered in this world.¹⁰¹⁸ It is this both libidinal and aggressive fire that Prometheus brings to mankind, which, if held and kept within a furnace, can be used by artisans and craftsmen, a fraternity of which Prometheus becomes, in acknowledgement of this gift, the protective deity in the city of Athens.¹⁰¹⁹

What if a story like Prometheus' had never come to the fore and, in addition to this, tragedy as an art form would never have developed in Greece?¹⁰²⁰ Would there have been a difference if a person had tried to work out his personal matters not in Athens but in Sparta, a society finding an important backbone of its collective identity in the ritually repeated choreography of the oppression of helots?¹⁰²¹

Civic space under consideration

If one's access to participation in an arena of shared projects is very much at risk, how much can the individual process what is befalling him/her?¹⁰²² In a written response of his own to the article in which Potamianou uses Philoctetes' story to reflect on what it means to hold fast to one's pain, Jacques Press points out

... the wound and the pain of Philoctetes contain, un-thought, both un-formulated and incapable of formulation [*non formulables*], all the elements which appear, in contrast, with great abundance in the tale of Neoptolemus.¹⁰²³

It is incapable of decryption as such, were it not through the putting into representative form undertaken by his *vis-à-vis*, with the supplementary paradox that this is at first of no use whatsoever to Philoctetes.....¹⁰²⁴

It takes more than one person, Press suggests, to give voice to, and be able to process, pain and grief,¹⁰²⁵ just as Greek myth considered Prometheus instrumental in bringing fire to the furnace. Though Potamianou has an emphasis different from Press, she acknowledges the importance institutions and the framework they provide play in aiding or discouraging people to accommodate the unfamiliar.¹⁰²⁶ As a psychoanalyst in touch with the work of Serge Lebovici and René Diatkine at *ASM 13* in Paris,¹⁰²⁷ she shows sensitivity to the concrete cultural and social conditions in existence at a given time,¹⁰²⁸ an awareness perhaps also sharpened by her work with children and the difficulties to find proper space for this work in Greece.¹⁰²⁹ Her contributions to the *Yearbook of the International Association for Child and Adolescent Psychiatry and Allied Professions* (Potamianou 1992e[1988]; Potamianou 1984b[1980]; Potamianou 1983a[1978]; Potamianou 1983b[1978], Potamianou 1983c[1978]) show her thematically connected to a wide ranging international network of research on child therapy,

within which her work for the *Centre of Mental Health and Research*, founded by her in 1956 in Athens must have been of considerable relevance.¹⁰³⁰

The voice of Anna Freudians as background chorus

Perhaps mediated by these connections and concerns, she shows more echoes than can usually be found in other French language publications of topics of importance to Joseph Sandler¹⁰³¹ and to Anna Freud¹⁰³²: as happened on a more public stage in Spartan society and culture, a subject about which Potamianou wrote an article in 1998, an individual tempted to the thrust of *opératoire* measures, will feel his/her sense of security threatened from without and from within. Potamianou points out that it is not just ego restrictions that hamper the subject in his/her dealings with the outside world, there is also the possibility of fissures within, 'cavities bored into the flesh of the ego', a situation that admits a number of variants which might include the 'crypt' – containing a dead embalmed object tenaciously clung to - described by Abraham and Torok.¹⁰³³ In the constellation envisaged by Potamianou there is an 'incrustation in the ego of an object', which becomes 'a source of encapsulated excitation'.¹⁰³⁴ The resulting impairment, however, may well be partial, depending on the overall organisation.¹⁰³⁵

Though events in the past may have long lasting effects, they have to be considered within an overarching inner economy of ways and means. A radio interview with Stephen Grady in 2013, who as a boy was active in the French Resistance, illustrates some of the variants Potamianou repeatedly explores in her work.¹⁰³⁶ Deeply traumatised by his earlier experiences, he spent his later years in a remote spot in the Greek islands in a house which he surrounded with trip wire so as to feel more safe.¹⁰³⁷ At a later stage, he took down the tripwire, because, as he said in the radio interview, he got prone to tripping himself up with increased age.¹⁰³⁸ In doing so he

showed, for whatever reason, an amount of flexibility that was apparently not available to him earlier on.

Can fire be admitted to the house without a furnace?

The turn security measures take in this illustration throws into relief Potamianou's approach to them. In her writings there is a dialectic between the frighteningly unrepresentable and the frame charged to deal with it that is constantly put to the test within an overall economy of ways and means. Potaminaou emphasises that we should bear in mind the differences between an available frame defensively not being made use of and a frame that cannot be used because it is in ruins.¹⁰³⁹ While some patients engage in attacks on figuration, there are others who have not been able at their own good time safely to reject what was foisted on them as an impingement.¹⁰⁴⁰ This necessary work of differentiation leads to another consideration: was there at any point in the subject's early development a crisis that had gone wasted because there was no proper space for it? Potamianou shows interest in Piera Aulagnier's reflections on pre-forms of the symbolic that have not been able to develop more fully.¹⁰⁴¹ In a recent contribution Potamianou points to Levine *et al.* 2013 for the gaps that open between what can be taken in by the senses and what can be provided with a mental handle (the perceptible and the representable).¹⁰⁴² Some of these sensory footprints of the past may in treatment, given the opportunity, serve as pre-forms of fantasy.¹⁰⁴³

Theory as an aid to gauge the potential of situations

If this is to happen, words have to be highly time sensitive: there are, as Potamianou says, ports that are not navigable at all times.¹⁰⁴⁴ In this enterprise to find the right moment for the right

move, theory does not only protect against being submerged by the chaotic, it also suggests where to look. The elements of clinical theory which Potamianou assembles into a whole attempt to accompany the analyst, as Potamianou's compatriot Athanasios Alexandridis has observed, like a watchful mother [*mère veilleuse*] sensitive to every half felt stir.¹⁰⁴⁵ Potamianou, in the corpus of her work, introduces possibilities to fine tune the concept of the *opérateur* by offering points of contact with existing stretches of theory on ego restriction and, to some extent, the clinic of trauma. Anna Potamianou's contributions on repetition compulsion, mental pain, identification as a straight jacket and the bunker of false hopes occupy an important position in understanding the *mode opératoire*. Although her thinking is firmly grounded in the work of the *EPP*,¹⁰⁴⁶ she has shown, as we have seen, a noticeable interest in perspectives on ego pathologies informed by Anna Freud's work, while at the same time integrating this with strands of French thinking on the *opérateur*.¹⁰⁴⁷

With Potamianou we have seen a beleaguered Me threatened in its territory employ all regulatory means at its disposal. In the next chapter we shall see Jean Benjamin Stora, while being very much interested in the aspect of regulation, introduce further concerns: a sense that for a person to keep a lifeline open to the world a shared imaginary may be required and, flowing from this, an interest in and respect for ethno-psychoanalysis.

Chapter Nine: Configurations 2: Jean Benjamin Stora

Jean Benjamin Stora, who worked with Pierre Marty, and from 1989 to 1992 was president of *IPSO*, introduces further dimensions to the reflection on the *opérateur*.¹⁰⁴⁸ Born, like André Green, in an Arab country into a Jewish family, he brings to his work an acute awareness of the importance of affect and the enormous difficulties that accrue if this finds no adequate support in the shared imaginary of the environment.¹⁰⁴⁹

Among the cases Jean Benjamin Stora presents in his 1999 study - published in English in 2007 under the title *When the Body Displaces the Mind: Stress, Trauma and Somatic Disease* - there are at least two in which the subject's capacity to sustain a working defensive shield against adversity, without warning, takes a devastating hit in a nodal point. Turning the immediate environment into helpless bystanders, the event shows all reparatory efforts *post hoc* to be dramatically futile.

Shocks that kill

The first of these stories is one that Stora witnessed as a small child. It set him on a lifelong course of inquiry leading him to his work in psychology, psychoanalysis and psychosomatics. It happened to his grandfather, at a time when the family was still living in the province of Constantine (present day Algeria).¹⁰⁵⁰ Stora's grandfather, a veteran of the Great War, in which he had lost his left arm, had been hit by Vichy's pernicious antisemitic legislation. His possessions had been expropriated and handed over to a "trustee" appointed by the state. A sister, whom he had loved very much, had died about the same time.¹⁰⁵¹ Then came another shock: an army truck ran over and killed a cousin of J-B. Stora's in the streets of the quarter in

which the family lived. His grandfather's health deteriorated steadily. He sought solace in the Tehillim, the Book of Psalms, the traditional sustenance of those fallen on hard times, in which he immersed himself night and day.¹⁰⁵² The child, who observed all this, had the impression that this practice did indeed provide a modicum of help to his grandfather, but then, to his surprise, became aware of a change in quality and daily rhythm, when local magical healers, whose charms to him seemed to be little in consonance with the spirit of Judaism, began to be admitted to the house. Their efforts, too, proved to be in vain. Stora's grandfather died of a cancer, of which he had not been told, but of which he somehow knew.¹⁰⁵³

A second case, related in one important point, comes to Stora's attention, mediated by a source somewhat unusual for a French psychoanalyst¹⁰⁵⁴. He finds it quoted by Jon Kabat-Zinn (the American pioneer of the mindfulness based stress reduction programme offered originally at the University of Massachusetts Medical Center to somatic patients) in his book *Full Catastrophe Living*.¹⁰⁵⁵ It derives from the recollections of a renowned American cardiologist, Bernard Lown, who as a young doctor witnessed an incident that even at a distance of some thirty years still causes him to shudder. Lown had a post-doctorate fellowship with S.A. Levine, professor of cardiology at Harvard Medical School, whose bedside manners were considered to be very reassuring by his patients. In one of his first clinics Bernard Lown had Mrs. S. as a patient, a middle-aged librarian who had low grade congestive heart failure. What follows merits to be quoted *in extenso* because it reflects the incredulity of the increasingly shocked observer looking back at the course of events:

Dr. Levine, who had followed her in the clinic for more than a decade, greeted Mrs. S. warmly and then turned to the large entourage of visiting physicians and said, "This women [sic] has TS," and abruptly left.

No sooner was Dr. Levine out of the door than Mrs. S.'s demeanor abruptly changed. She appeared anxious and frightened and was now breathing rapidly, clearly hyperventilating. Her skin was drenched with perspiration, and her pulse had accelerated to more than 150 a minute. In reexamining her, I found it astonishing that the lungs, which a few minutes earlier had been quite clear, now had moist crackles at the bases.[...]

I questioned Mrs. S. as to the reasons for her sudden upset. Her response was that Dr. Levine had said that she had TS, which she knew meant "terminal situation" [what the doctor really had done was to use the medical acronym for "tricuspid stenosis"] [...]. I tried to reach Dr. Levine, but he was nowhere to be located. Later that same day she died from intractable heart failure.¹⁰⁵⁶

In both cases, as Stora observes, there is an onslaught of excitement, well beyond the capacity of the subject to process.¹⁰⁵⁷ With the arrival of an unforeseen piece of information, the imagination takes fright and balks at the fuller implications of the new scenario, before it can be herded back into the safer confines of previously established networks of meaning. On impact (but evidently not before, which might have denied expanse to the shock wave), the mental apparatus goes into a state of disconnect.¹⁰⁵⁸ It is as if the subject were to 'bleed to death in his own tissues'¹⁰⁵⁹ – tissues, we have to remember, a person considered to be *opérateur* is deemed not to have.

Shared symbolic universes as a precondition for communication in depth

Stora takes care to point out the relevance of the imagery developed by the patients embedded in the universe of symbolic meaning they have been moving in.¹⁰⁶⁰ He goes as far as saying that psychoanalysis is counter-indicated for first generation immigrants and possibly has to be adjusted for second generation immigrants.¹⁰⁶¹ If this extra caution is neglected, there is the danger that the patient's and the psychoanalyst's inner worlds will irremediably run on separate rails.¹⁰⁶² In such a case, a large, if not major, part of the patient's imaginary life risks escaping treatment. It is therefore requisite for the psychoanalyst to be conversant with the patient's

cultural universe of reference. The wealth of the patient's imaginary life can only be appreciated if there is sufficient knowledge of the myths implied in it.¹⁰⁶³ Repeatedly, Stora refers to Tobie Nathan's work in ethno-psychoanalysis,¹⁰⁶⁴ pointing out that there are cultures in which the individual does not strive for a degree of separation from the group, but in which the individual Me forms part of a group Me to an extent unusual in Western society.¹⁰⁶⁵ Images of what forces the patient believes to be at work in his/her inner life – and be it of supposedly demoniacal nature - have to be taken into consideration.¹⁰⁶⁶ If this is not heeded, the patient may erroneously be classified as *opérateur* not because he/she is constitutionally unable to connect to others on an emotional level, but because he/she cannot do so under present circumstances.¹⁰⁶⁷

Stora relates the case of Nina, a young woman from the Maghreb, a patient who was referred to him by a GP, who found her lacking in the rudiments of the imagination.¹⁰⁶⁸ Stora gradually discovered that, by inferring from his personal familiarity with the patient's cultural background links that were not being made explicit, he was gradually able to gain access to a rich inner universe. In it a belief in evil spirits at odds with Western thinking was central to the patient's assumptions, which she had been keeping secret.¹⁰⁶⁹ Reading the case description, one understands that Nina, in turning a bland surface towards the world around her, was attempting to adapt as best as possible to the particular social place she found herself in.

Entering hospital, Stora considers, the patient leaves behind a world of previous arrangements and has to come to terms with a situation in which clinical success may depend on his/her capacity to stay passive in the face of extended waiting.¹⁰⁷⁰ Being enveloped by an all-encompassing institution may further regression, draw on a masochistic core, and offer a certain protective shield (*pare-excitation*, *Reizschutz*) to the patient.¹⁰⁷¹ At the same time, he/she will also be confronted with a medical system that comprises numerous complex examinations, in

which he/she may feel as is he/she were a loose confederacy of facts and functions,¹⁰⁷² part of an elusive whole, in which importance is expressed in numbers and conversations with doctors can take a turn that is experienced as Kafkaesque.¹⁰⁷³ Stora warmly recommends Marie-Christine Pouchelle's anthropological studies on hospital culture.¹⁰⁷⁴ In them she observes styles of interaction strangely reminiscent of what psychoanalysts have described as *opérateur*:

From the first moments of my investigation in this centre, I was surprised by the "surgical" style of interpersonal relations, widespread among the medical caregivers [*les soignants*]: whatever the sympathy and the warmth connecting two people speaking with each other, one of them is capable of abruptly breaking up contact and turning away without employing any of the forms of disengagement usual in daily life. .. As if the "soft tissue" ... of interpersonal relations had been sacrificed to the benefit of a a hard core of a communication reduced to the essential, in the same way that surgical and scientific publications today want, on the American model, be exempt of any literature so as to privilege technical information considered as the only thing untainted, useful and true.¹⁰⁷⁵

Adaptive measures put to the test

If outside hospital an excessive investment in work might serve as an anti-traumatic measure,¹⁰⁷⁶ turning oneself into a highly invested collection of facts, a medical file on two legs as it were, must offer benefits to certain fragile patients, some of whom may be able to protect their own subjective belief systems in this way.¹⁰⁷⁷ Inability to translate inner worlds into language accepted as valid currency in hospital culture is at its most conspicuous in cases in which patients who are considered inveterate hypochondriacs are eventually, on insistence, given the benefit of doubt, re-examined and, to the doctors' surprise, diagnosed with cancer.¹⁰⁷⁸ Clearly, the atmosphere of the hospital and the interactions taking place there colour the responses to anything that touches the patient's mental life and should be taken into account when we assess a

person's psychological functions.¹⁰⁷⁹ Also, it is important to gauge the response of the family to what is happening to the patient.¹⁰⁸⁰

As we have seen with Stora's grandfather, a fully functional symbolic universe may not be enough to restore patients at the end of their tether to a working equilibrium (not even *après coup*). Both Stora's grandfather and Mrs. S. were not without resources when we find them struck by disaster: Stora's grandfather was intimately familiar with the tradition of a discourse of the soul with itself;¹⁰⁸¹ the librarian diagnosed with TS had a background of long familiarity with the treatment supervised by a trusted professor. Yet, under the impact of a sudden shock the network of inner and outer objects was no longer providing adequate support. The patients fell through the mesh of the network of links that had hitherto sustained them. Emergency measures attempted both by the hospital and by the traditional magical healers came to nothing.

Apparently, even a sufficiently rich inner world is of no avail if it cannot sustain its buffer function at crisis point in a given environment. Stora, in his study on stress, in line with Pierre Marty's and Michel Fain's thought, emphasises the importance of a preconscious of sufficient depth, fluidity and of spontaneous availability to absorb shock in case of need.¹⁰⁸²

Buffer zones invigorated by the imaginary

Stora refers to Didier Anzieu's concept of a psychic envelope structured like a multilayered skin, comprised of different strata separated from each other, which protects from the outside and relays signification inside.¹⁰⁸³ If there is a sufficiently demarcated distance between the surface of excitability and the surface of communication and signification, there is a transitional intermediary zone that transforms stimuli into meaning.¹⁰⁸⁴ If the distance between the two collapses, layers get glued to one another and mental function is lost, another description,

according to Anzieu, of the *mode opératoire*.¹⁰⁸⁵ Work, under the circumstances, can serve an anti-traumatic function.¹⁰⁸⁶

From other information Stora provides, we have to gather that the inner leeway a person possesses can, to some extent, depend on the social imaginary he/she is able to tap into. Stora draws on studies that found that individuals who thought to be in control at the workplace felt less stress and more of a sense of well-being than those who did not.¹⁰⁸⁷ Countries which favoured an individualist culture produced a greater number of people who felt on top of the situation than those in which collective culture was emphasised to a greater extent.¹⁰⁸⁸ Since this perception is culturally mediated and does not correspond to an increased level of measurable social security¹⁰⁸⁹ we have to assume that the magma of socially available imaginary performs buffer functions in any judgement upon circumveiling reality: illusionary though it might be, the culturally mediated but personally claimed imputation of self-efficacy and liberal agency will show tangible results nonetheless if there is a cultural frame for it and conditions do not deteriorate.

Aridity of mental links as a fire-door shut on fright

What seems to be so destructive to the equilibrium of some patients we have to conclude – and the librarian aforementioned is a case in point - is the eruption of inflammatory meaning of an event which incontrovertibly presents itself to the psyche as a portent of ill, a meaning for which an *opératoire* person might not be susceptible because he/she does not spend much time in the realms of the imagination. Although the shock waves of an event will reach the *opératoire* eventually, if on a bodily level, we cannot see the *opératoire* as a person who takes fright easily. There is a measure of stolidity to be derived from an overwhelming preoccupation with stark

unadorned reality and this, although Stora does not specifically mention it, has been an ideal held out by a number of cultures.¹⁰⁹⁰ Stoic thinking, in particular, has traditionally suggested we should adjust our imagination so that bursts of bad fortune will not unsettle it and should make judicious use of the world as it is without giving too much slack to the vagaries of what is seen as vain desire.¹⁰⁹¹

Rehearsals of trivia of material culture as a re-affirmation of shared bonds

There is gain to be derived from an intense investment in fact, which offers ties to a shared community of practice and remembrance inaccessible to the uninitiated observer.¹⁰⁹² Stora shows interest in the work Marcel Mauss, whose seminal *Essai sur le don* examined the various dimensions of the gift.¹⁰⁹³ If what appears as perfunctory – and at times quasi-metallic¹⁰⁹⁴ – mental functioning in some patients were to tie into a communality of material culture, social bonds and transgenerational transmissions,¹⁰⁹⁵ what would its implicit exchange value as a gift be both to the subject and to others?¹⁰⁹⁶ Granted it might in some particular cases be a quest for the non-desire of the other, as Stora quotes André Green, its meaning, as Stora's work amply shows, will have to be considered on various levels and in different contexts: it remains polyvalent in its opaqueness.¹⁰⁹⁷ Stora himself points towards Antonio Damasio's work on potential representations.¹⁰⁹⁸

Repression of emotion as a corollary of a body having to establish new equilibria

Stora reflects on the possibility of specific physiological and neurological impediments to the expression of their emotions encountered by heart transplant patients for some time after the operation;¹⁰⁹⁹ points out that the repression of emotions and their re-routing into the body is not

necessarily the equivalent of alexithymia;¹¹⁰⁰ and notes the alleviation of emotional repression inculcated in a severe education after a heart transplant has re-established bodily integrity.¹¹⁰¹

In the patients whom he sees both progressive adaptation and a drifting into residual robotic functioning remain possible outcomes.¹¹⁰² After having earlier on worked with Pierre Marty, Stora was able to examine more than 3.000 patients as a psychosomatic consultant attached to the hospital Pitié-Salpêtrière's department of endocrinology, whose help was made accessible to patients from all departments of the hospital. Drawing on his experience, he was able to establish a university diploma course in '*Psychosomatique intégrative*'.¹¹⁰³

The work of the psychosomaticien in the institution as an enfranchised outsider

In his interviews with patients he seems to enjoy a unique intermediary - and paradox - position of an esteemed and well connected outsider inside the institution who is able to engage patients from an angle that both breaks their hospital routine and draws their attention.¹¹⁰⁴ He wears a white blouse and the badge of doctors with additional reference to his psychosomatic competence but is not part of any *grande visite* and takes along on his visits one of his students at most, in a conscious break with the large academic audiences present at the interlocutions with patients in the tradition from Charcot to Marty.¹¹⁰⁵ A discernible number of the patients he writes about have a linguistic or childhood background outside France.¹¹⁰⁶

Both with his cross-cultural patients and certain of his neurological patients, he has to inject quantities of the imaginary and to propose chains of association, with which patients are made aware they are at liberty to disagree, in an effort to re-animate mental processes.¹¹⁰⁷ With some patients who lack adequate gratification in sublimatory activities, lateral transferts in new fields

of self-assertion and exploration are actively encouraged.¹¹⁰⁸ At times the release of previously inhibited aggression, even if directed against hospital staff has to be understood as a sign of improvement, an assessment that puts the psychosomatician into a somewhat delicate position vis-a-vis his medical colleagues.¹¹⁰⁹

Working with the submerged potential of patients

Stora habitually inquires about his patients' spiritual beliefs and practices so as better to assess the recourse available to them in case of distress to face up to adversity and also shows interest in belief based cultural constructions feeding into research.¹¹¹⁰ The symbolic potential of a person in part depends on the way his/her culture provides him/her with accessible meaningful structure in his/her preconscious.¹¹¹¹ Apparently, there has to be a shared dimension of the imaginary for the analyst to become tangible to the patient - the mental space of the encounter cannot simply be taken for granted.¹¹¹²

On one occasion Stora meets a former patient of Marty's, whose long road to treatment is probably representative of more than just her own personal experience. At one point she consults a psychologist at a big Paris hospital because she wants to receive help better to observe her diet. This psychologist interrogates her, does not communicate his findings to her, but recommends to her a psychotherapy. He also, and this becomes very important, writes a letter of reference to the medical head of *IPSO* for her:

She keeps this letter in her bag for a year, and after some reflection, she goes to make the visit to the Institute of Psychosomatics, where she is received warmly [*de façon chaleureuse*] by Pierre Marty in his office; of which encounter she still keeps a vivid, warm memory [*un souvenir ému*].¹¹¹³

The way she was received by Marty made it possible for her to begin therapy with him. There was a bridge between her world and the idea that therapy might be something important for her.

Stora avows having been influenced by the thought of Thure von Uexküll, from which he retains a vivid interest in the patient's ways to inhabit his/her world - his/her personal *Umwelt* - and their transformation of input into autopoiesis.¹¹¹⁴ Yet, as the case of Stora's grandfather shows, there are times when autopoiesis fails, when existent form can no longer be invested in to keep up a good enough defensive screen and the threads of libido fray.¹¹¹⁵

Regulatory economies of dealing with tension

Stora privileges the economic point of view that takes a deep interest in the vicissitudes of mental energy, although he concedes that energy in this context is a metaphor to deal with states of the mental apparatus in its dealing with stimuli of excitement and potential tension.¹¹¹⁶ How much this apparatus has been developed may vary considerably between different individuals.¹¹¹⁷ If pain sets in and life trickles out of life, behaviour and character try to hold the line as elements of composure.¹¹¹⁸ Stora postulates a series of auto-regulatory oscillations, island-like zones of stability in a whole in which instability predominates.¹¹¹⁹ They work within certain limits like catchment basins, at times competing to attract currents.¹¹²⁰ If the mental apparatus is overwhelmed, Stora believes, there is a latency of at least 24 to 48 hours before elaborative work can be resumed.¹¹²¹ If this does not happen within a reasonable delay, stimuli are passed on to other neuronal subsystems which attempt adaptation to what by then has become a threat to the organism.¹¹²² Stora quotes David Ruelle's image of the faucet that regulates the flow of water: if opened too wide there will be turbulence.¹¹²³ If shut tightly – as we have to take the *opératoire* to be against any surprising outbursts of the imagination – can we assume the pipes, once pressure

builds up, will have a tendency to burst at default lines of greatest fragility? Stora does not expatiate upon this in his lines on Ruelle, but, with Jaak Pansepp, distinguishes four sub-systems that control emotion at a neuronal level – another base line of integration to assist at processing stimuli: seeking, rage, fear and panic.¹¹²⁴ Stora discusses the circuit of seeking from the point of view of its exploratory and auto-conservatory functions: under-stimulation of this sub-system results in loss of interest in the world, consummation of its basic goals extinguishes its activity - libido, as a concept, is here replaced with appetite.¹¹²⁵ Both a lack of *pregnance* of form, as René Thom would have put it, and a lack of lack (a satiety) - to which we can safely add lack of basic security - will impede exploratory behaviour.¹¹²⁶ What integrates all the different mental and physiological sub-systems is the overarching necessity to process whatever stress is impacting on the subject: 'Complete freedom from stress is death', Stora quotes Hans Selye.¹¹²⁷

Illusion conducive to the inception of form?

Stora places his approach, derived from Pierre Marty, within a larger theoretical framework of, as he terms it, a bio-psycho-social approach.¹¹²⁸ Stora believes that it is impossible to develop a science of the interrelations of the different levels of life by only referring to psychoanalysis,¹¹²⁹ which probably reflects Pierre Marty's own emphasis.¹¹³⁰

His main concern is the psychoanalytically informed psychosomatic treatment of the severely ill, or post-operational, patient. Although his main focus is not on the *mode opératoire*, his observations, as we have seen, contain important reflections pertinent to it. He shows sustained sensitivity to the states of the patient's imaginary as an access point to his/her condition. This personally appropriated imaginary rooted in culture forms a barrier against disintegration but also makes the person vulnerable to imaginary ills a person with reduced phantasmorphic potential and more restricted imagination might not be exposed to in the same way. Among other

concerns, Stora also raises the question how much of the imaginary specific to the patient has to be shared for effective treatment to be able to start.

His approach to the situation of the patient's economy of mental energy presupposes a concept of cathexis – mental investment – which seems to imply that a given patient may be out of budget to entertain a fantasy. This fantasy out of reach would then have to be considered as something akin to a faint, pale, distant beckoning of a form without a self-supporting force field to go with it. If this - the absence of fantasy - were the possible plight of a patient, we would then have to see in it the reverse of what Ferenczi proposes as a habitual mode of enrichment of the Me: the constant introjection of elements of non-Me to extend the subject's mental realms.¹¹³¹ The question is whether for this to happen this process has to be sustained by what Winnicott termed illusion (in this diverging from Freud's use of the word) as a feeling for the yet unproven potential the future might hold in store. Seen in this way, the French use of *investissement* (cathexis) and *intrication* (libidinal entanglement), on the one hand, and Winnicott's use of illusion, on the other hand, may be approaching the same problem - how enchantment with the world is produced and what it is contingent upon - from different access points.¹¹³²

It may not be enough for a person to have a cultural imaginary to tap into if this does nothing or little to sustain the person at the end of his/her tether. In the case of Mrs. S., Dr. Levine's patient, a basis of trust in her doctor was not enough when his presence would have been required.

In our next chapter we will see how César and Sára Botella put a particular emphasis on the work of figurability stalled if not for a double, in whose inner presence it can take place.

Chapter Ten: Inquiries: The work of César and Sára Botella

As we saw in the last chapter, Jean Benjamin Stora offers material that shows that, for treatment to work, a shared imaginary between patient and doctor/therapist can be indispensable. Yet, this may not be easy to come by. There are encounters that give rise to the suspicion that people plodding through the wastelands of the absorbingly functional are unlikely to be beset with unexpected visitations from beyond their horizon: no mirage lights up for them taunting them with delights tantalisingly out of reach. Like the colour blind who are not easily taken in by camouflage,¹¹³³ it seems, no trick of the light or lay of the ground will distract them into vain hopes. It appears as if their crushing lack has been barred from tapping into sources of hallucination open to others.

Given this particular configuration, it comes as no surprise that member of the *EPP/IPSO* have on a number of occasions entered into discussion with César and Sára Botella, from outside their more immediate circle and who, inspired by Michel Fain among others,¹¹³⁴ have produced a cohesive body of work¹¹³⁵ on the inner connections between traumatic potential, psychic configuration and hallucinatory capacities.

The vital difference between figurability and presentability

Pivotal to their work is a concept that appears prominently in the *Interpretation of Dreams*, where it is accorded the dignity of a section title and is being treated as a baseline concept: German *Darstellbarkeit*, which is reduced to 'presentability' in Strachey's translation and to which the Botellas have striven to reconstitute some of its original texture by turning to French

figurabilité.¹¹³⁶ This they take to designate the manner and extent to which what exercises the mind lends itself to being given shape, in ways to be found and created in conformity with the material.¹¹³⁷ César and Sára Botella, with good reason, contend that the word employed by Freud does not exhaust itself in mere goal-oriented presentability - an act of rendering to the purview of social recognition a reasonably functional exhibit. Instead it connects to the inherent messiness of a terrain from which cohesive form must eventually arise, somewhat akin to the working field of a potter modelling from clay.¹¹³⁸ Not surprisingly, they deplore the choice of the editorial collective in charge of publishing the *Œuvre Complètes de Freud* (the OCF) to diverge in their new edition from previous French usage so as to now uniformly employ '*presentabilité*', sacrificing in this step a considerable amount of cultural context, both French and German, to the rigorously closed lexis mandated by their editorial policy.¹¹³⁹

Figurability, they suggest, is most properly conceived against a backdrop of absence, just as Isaac Luria thought, when he tried to come to grips with an emptiness from which plenitude had first to be withdrawn graciously in an act of *tsimtsum* (contraction, withdrawal) in order to make room for the act of creation.¹¹⁴⁰ The Botellas, without reaching back quite that far into history, provide a glimpse into mutual Franco-British bafflements when they reproduce ironical reflections of Voltaire's on the difference between Paris and London:

A Frenchman who arrives in London, will find matters in philosophy, like everything else, very much changed there. He has left the world a plenum, he now finds it a vacuum....in Paris...according to your Cartesians, everything is performed by an impulsion of which we have very little notion; according to Mr. Newton, things work by attraction, of which one does not any better understand the cause.....What a ferocious contradiction. At last, the better to resolve, if possible, every difficulty... [Newton] proves or at least makes it probable... that it is impossible there should be a plenum; and brings back the vacuum, which Aristotle and Descartes had banished from the world.¹¹⁴¹

For Voltaire, the Botellas go on to say, leaving Paris is like turning one's back on an established repertory of pattern recognition, which makes one see only what is bound into it.¹¹⁴² Instead, one moves to a place in which the mind, bereft of one's bearings, its inner lantern of calibrated insight extinguished, finds itself disturbingly exposed to what is uncertain, doubtful and strange against the backdrop of an infinite void.¹¹⁴³ Thinking, the Botellas suggest, is always something of a ceaseless to and fro between Paris and London, as it were,¹¹⁴⁴ a movement again and again repelled by emptiness and in itself a substitute for hallucinatory desire.¹¹⁴⁵

The dynamic potential of the void held in a dialectical relationship

In this perspective the developments of Freud's position in his later years are of particular importance. What has earlier been established as a central nexus: *drive – repression – fantasm*, closely connected to the First Topography, takes a new turn with the discovery of traumatic neurosis, which escapes dream perlaboration and grants a new status to external events.¹¹⁴⁶ In his theoretical revision of 1920 Freud introduces the death drive as a means to tackle negativity,¹¹⁴⁷ and the introduction of the id emphasises a primitive foundation rooted in motion, act and raw discharge.¹¹⁴⁸ These developments de-centre previously established theory towards a new axis *object-reality-denial*, complementing the previous one.¹¹⁴⁹

To show how momentous this new direction is, the Botellas recur to Hegel, who at a time when, as they say, Newton's notions of the void had fallen by the wayside,¹¹⁵⁰ was rethinking the prodigious power of the negative to kick things into motion and to confer vitality to whatever puts itself into opposition.¹¹⁵¹ It has pertinently been pointed out that there are considerable differences in the ways Hegelian negativity has been interpreted and put to use in France over the last century. What springs to mind from the Botellas' treatment, who clearly follow the general lines of Alexandre Kojève's interpretation,¹¹⁵² is that the dynamic potential of the

negative is developed in sustained opposition to something set against it, to which tension is run up in a contained field. Much as in a water pump, which uses vacuum to counteract gravity, water will only be displaced as long as the integrity of the duct holds. Thus even severe lack may not inevitably produce desire. It will only do so, if it forms part of a dynamic relatedness within which Hegelian *Aufhebung* - a new combination of elements on higher levels of integration, entailing the destruction of previous form¹¹⁵³ - becomes conceivable. In order to enable negativity to become productive, enveloping form and dynamic force have to come together, a precondition that should not too lightly be taken for granted. While Freud's first model of psychic functioning would follow the trace of what has been repressed, his later reflections show much more interest in what has left no memory trace and yet keeps lurking in the absence of such inscription. There are evidently zones beyond the pale of liaisoning, unbound into even related antagonism. They remain mutely averse to taking part in the libidinally infused Queen Mab like dance vividly described by Hegel:

The true is such a bacchantic dizzying waltz (or: frenzy: *Taumel*), in which no member is not intoxicated and since each [member], in differentiating itself, thereby also dissolves [into the whole], it is equally fully transparent and simple tranquility.¹¹⁵⁴

What strikes us as trauma, however, is a negative that puts into question any possible *Aufhebung* capable of creating productive fusion on a higher level, a void that on encounter declines to be harnessed into anything obligingly dialectical.

While the Botellas do not in the least deny the range of clinical challenges posed by the unconnected negative, their work shows an acute interest in the negative as a potential engine of dialectic movement¹¹⁵⁵ and as an incentive to shaking the mind from the confines of too narrowly conceived certainty and too settled habit. With Alexandre Koyré they admire in Newton his ability to oppose, and at the same time bring together into one, the discontinuity of matter and

the continuity of the void, a mode to think attraction in empty space.¹¹⁵⁶ With Sami Ali, following the well known lead in Freud's 1910 work *The Antithetical Meaning of Primal Words*¹¹⁵⁷ on similar expressions, they also show curiosity for the *addâd*, Arab words that hold several mutually exclusive meanings in abeyance, like *dûn* (below and above as well as in front and behind),¹¹⁵⁸ words that, as they say, are apt to throw down a gauntlet to quick and easy understanding. Koan-like these words kick away the scaffolding of secondarised thought and may even push the mind to quasi-hallucinatory realisation.¹¹⁵⁹ If transferred to the psychoanalytic turf with whatever degree of necessary creative misunderstanding, Hegel's *unité supérieure négative* plays in the same league as Bion's unsaturated element, albeit emerging from a different philosophical pedigree: from one angle it banks on the future dynamic potential of the provisionally contained contradiction, from another one it opens frontier space to the emergence of the unexpected, in rupture with zones of previously settled thought.¹¹⁶⁰

Coherence one level up

In the Botellas' view, the *unité supérieure négative*, uniting while separating, finds its early laboratory in the mother-infant relation, in which object representation and self representation are intimately and inextricably entangled.¹¹⁶¹ Any new superior level is also a condensation, which simplifies both structure and function in a new array of coherence.¹¹⁶² The Botellas build on Francis Pasche's work to consider that the seemingly unitary concept of object representation is a composite traversed, of old, by two contradictory movements: an anti-narcissistic one setting into motion the centrifugal thrust of desire (*élan du désir*) in its inexhaustible quest for the object, and an auto-erotic one, leading to a return to the self (*retour sur soi*).¹¹⁶³ Reflections of the erogenous body self and perceptions of the external object both leave their mark on the representation of the object. Dark undercurrents to this development are constituted by the

traumatising and disorganising forces fed by non-represented chaos and non-perception returned by the sense-organs.¹¹⁶⁴

If the object is gone, this will not have a traumatic impact as such, as long as its inner representation is kept alive by the pleasure self. According to the Botellas the supreme threat for the nascent subject is not the absence of the object, but the loss of its representation.¹¹⁶⁵ Against this unspeakable menace, raising the threat of a possibly implosive emptiness, the subject will defend itself at all cost, even if this means enlisting the sensory plenitude of a nightmare to protect itself against an empty regard. To be scared out of one's wits might well be preferable to losing oneself in the infinite aridities of indifference, in which the subject has to contend with the non-represented, and to defend itself against the spectre of psychic death itself.¹¹⁶⁶

What strikes the authors in the bobbin reel game of *Fort/Da* that Freud's grandson invented for himself (the game of the wooden reel, in French famous as *jeu de la bobine*)¹¹⁶⁷ is that the baby, who at the moment of the play, is outside the cot, is throwing the bobbin inside. Although the bobbin certainly represents the mother, it evidently also stands in for the baby itself, who is exerting himself to master his own possible disarray in the game of the absent mother.¹¹⁶⁸ Playing the game it seeks to keep at bay the threat of exhausting his inner capacities of holding fast to an object representation on which hinges the possibility of keeping alive his own self-representation.¹¹⁶⁹ Engaging in this activity the infant also enacts the burial of the early mother (the *mère primitive*), coming to terms with the body memory her holding left on the body, to create the image of another one in the present, a process to which Freud's grandfatherly presence provides the necessary framework.¹¹⁷⁰ One angle of looking at infantile sexual theories is to appreciate that they maintain a link to absent parents and keep up the child's investment in them.¹¹⁷¹ Fairy tales, even if peopled with monsters, are preferable to figurative destitution.¹¹⁷²

With René Thom, the Botellas believe that early salience for the baby is linked to the perception of a qualitative discontinuity.¹¹⁷³ Representation, in tension to perception, comes into being as a projection on the void left behind by the object:

..it is in the encounter between the imprint [*l'empreinte*] and the work imposed by the negative experience that the human psyche constitutes itself.¹¹⁷⁴

Only when the hallucinatory solution fails, does the distinction between outside and inside turn hallucinatory continuity into sensorial discontinuity and absence becomes real.¹¹⁷⁵ Words emerge to signify what is not there and which cannot otherwise be pointed to in place of former hallucinatory continuity.¹¹⁷⁶ This loss produces a *pulsion*, carries a charge and ultimately establishes a link, where else there would have been none.¹¹⁷⁷ Is a search not really a sign something looked for has previously been found, they ask with Blaise Pascal.¹¹⁷⁸

For the baby, hallucinatory stages mark the transition from mere states of tension to a new order of psychic functioning, slowing down the onrush of raw urge.¹¹⁷⁹ Consciousness thus unfolds against a backdrop of a hallucinatory response to lack and cannot be understood as being solely based on what arrives via the sense organs.¹¹⁸⁰ In the magical moments at which mental life ignites, the matrix of all reflexivity is configured by the triad perceiver – perceived – lost object, in which the perceiver is not yet a subject but close to a corporeal Me.¹¹⁸¹

A primal trace of lack

The Botellas feel compelled to postulate the existence of a primal trace of lack in the interstices between the loss of the object and hallucinatory satisfaction.¹¹⁸² This primal trace leaves a mark on further developments, reorganising the whole of investments and offering an explanatory

point of reference for every emergent lack. Infantile trauma and non-representation are closely tethered to the primal trace and its vicissitudes.¹¹⁸³ What has never been represented is not, they stress, necessarily a result of the work of denial or foreclosure.¹¹⁸⁴ Every night, as we sink into sleep, the psyche has to navigate its self-preservation between a wish for narcissistic regression without bounds and the dangers of non-representation.¹¹⁸⁵ Exposed to non-representation we are closer to the primal trace of absolute distress and prone to taking fright at a possible loss of representation and object investment.¹¹⁸⁶

So, the primal trace has to be tamed by a return to one's self under the auspices of the object: if we look at ourselves auto-erotically this glance will always bear the marks of being looked at by the object.¹¹⁸⁷ Two productive negatives combine paradoxically, the Botellas suggest, to keep the psyche at work: represented, the object is considered to be physically absent; perceived, its hallucinatory presence is kept in abeyance.¹¹⁸⁸ Just as a piece of magnet, if divided, will produce both a north and a south pole in its individual fragments, the psyche is maintained by a comparable field, which, by virtue of its dual, symmetrically constituted negativity, grants coherence to the whole.¹¹⁸⁹ As long as this field holds, perception is constantly re-linked to infantile sources of fantasy.¹¹⁹⁰ It is non-representation that is apt to rend asunder the dynamic symmetry, producing sterile perception and devitalised representation, cut off from their archaic animistic sources.¹¹⁹¹ Our complexes, on the other hand, bound to sexual infantile theories, promote an investment of objectal representations, suggest explanations for absence and difference and obscure the negative face of infantile trauma, which receives its force from the infant's incapacity to transform early states of tension that are unlinked and unbound.¹¹⁹²

Perception as an anchor to fall back to

Beyond questions of psychic structure,¹¹⁹³ the problems of transformation, put on the agenda by Bion, have become a concern to psychoanalysts.¹¹⁹⁴ The conceptual terms of Freud's First Topography, in the Botellas' view, do not suffice to think about this.¹¹⁹⁵ What Freud in 'On Narcissism: an Introduction' terms *das aktuelle Wahrnehmungsmaterial*¹¹⁹⁶ resists integration and witnesses to the flaws in the narcissistic cohesion of the subject.¹¹⁹⁷ If sensations perceived cannot become part of a dream working towards a realisation of desire they become hyper-invested and transformation is impeded.¹¹⁹⁸ The Botellas advance the hypothesis that there exist precursors of liaison to be found in movements of perception that carry their own track record of a quest for satisfaction with them.¹¹⁹⁹ When representational links are suddenly ruptured, there is a turning to perceptive form and a regression to a condensed, overdetermined, basic representation deeply clinging to the sensation.¹²⁰⁰ On the trace of the hallucinatory, the old bulwark against primordial distress, we find ourselves beyond the established pathways of infantile neurosis in territory on which the webbing and weaving of psychic causality is still in *statu nascendi*.¹²⁰¹

The Botellas use Arthur Koestler's experience of a quasi mystic bliss, which he strayed into unawares, when imprisoned by the Fascists during the Spanish Civil War and under threat of imminent death. He had extracted a piece of iron spring from the wire mattress and found himself lost in contemplation of a mathematical problem he had scratched with it on the prison walls, drifting into a wordless trance.¹²⁰²

I was floating on my back in a river of peace, under bridges of silence....There was no river and no I....I refer to a concrete experience that is verbally as incommunicable as the feeling aroused by a piano concerto yet just as real – only much more real...¹²⁰³

This mirrors, to some extent, the experience of Zoran Music, referred to by the Botellas. Music, when imprisoned at Dachau concentration camp, felt a state of exaltation while drawing on scraps of paper, which he had furtively managed to lay his hands upon, the horror of corpses piled up in the camp.¹²⁰⁴ In this disappearance of limits, the Me fuses with something larger.¹²⁰⁵

When the hallucinatory erupts into the realm of perception it is in retrospect seen as a happy state of union with an immaterial object that is being idealised in place of an investment of object and self.¹²⁰⁶ On an even more basic level, abandoned babies turn towards whatever, in place of a more permanent object, provokes sensations in them - movement, light, contrasts, smells, sound, contact - to find some sort of coherence and sustenance.¹²⁰⁷

Imageless states of terror

In contrast, the Botellas report the case of a patient, who wakes up at night in the grips of a raw panic in complete absence of any image, unable to link this brutal shock to any event.¹²⁰⁸ Even a terrifying image, arising from the depths of a nightmare gives the subject something to latch onto, as it wards off even deeper levels of distress beyond any representation.¹²⁰⁹ Although a dream springing from traumatic neurosis confronts us with a memory of sorts, it is not amenable to dream perlaboration. Rather, it is heir to a sensorial trace of a perception that has not found inscription in memory.¹²¹⁰ If it becomes conscious at all it does so in a hallucinatory fashion bypassing both the preconscious and the established nexus of infantile neurosis.¹²¹¹ For some patients – including the one mentioned above - investment in the object increases the threat of a loss of all representation because it activates a primal trace of distress.¹²¹² If early tendencies to immediate discharge, emanating from an inchoate id, are not modified in the organisation of an unconscious capable of condensation and displacement, offering a chance to complexification

and growth, there will be no psychoanalytic version of the Hegelian *unité supérieure négative*, something that coalesces on a higher level.¹²¹³ Running counter to the psyche's tendency to work towards coherence and convergence,¹²¹⁴ traumatic potentiality is not limited in its presence to individuals with particularly fragile structures, but exists also in those Marty would have regarded as 'well-mentalised'.¹²¹⁵ In case of emergency, a regression to perception traces will attempt to mend the tissue of ruptured psychic links in hallucinatory fashion and work towards coherence.¹²¹⁶ To take into account both structure and the as yet unstructured, the Botellas have found it useful to focus on what is in process.¹²¹⁷

The work of the double

If the environment is in a shape propitious to the thriving of the subject, this 'formal' regression (to the sensorial trace) will not occur in a relational void: alterity and sameness will be kept in productive tension in what the Botellas term the work of the double.¹²¹⁸ In the beginning, the body of the mother is the first mirror of the child: investing in it the infant assembles its own disparate parts into a whole and by doing so imitates the model of the mother in which it seeks its reflection, basking in her libidinal and narcissistic satisfaction.¹²¹⁹ The Botellas understand this early function of the mother as a primitive, composite double of the child, a stage at which being looked at, erogenous body and perception of the double are closely linked, establishing the basis for a future auto-erotic regard on one's own self. This experience provides the foundations for a continuous sense of one's own existence.¹²²⁰

To explore this role of the double the Botellas turn to Freud, looking at both his investment of Fliess as a supposedly ideal addressee, functioning as a catalyst in the gradual unfolding of his thought and at his later reflections on the disturbingly familiar stranger.¹²²¹ In Freud's 'The

Uncanny', the double, understood as a creation that harks back to mentally archaic times, is at the outset regarded as benevolent.¹²²² It belongs to an animistic world, in which everything around seemed to be a reflection of one's own psyche.¹²²³ Representation and perception are not markedly separate and inner and outer have not definitely parted ways as yet.¹²²⁴ In the Botellas' hypothesis, the need to create a double can be understood as a means to deal with the shocking perception of absence and to cope with an encounter with the empty regard of indifference by a psyche avid in its search for complementarities: it surges to rise up against the fear of mental death.¹²²⁵

the negative foundation of every infantile trauma resides, in short, in the impossibility for the child to imagine himself non-invested by the object of desire; to imagine the irrepresentable character of his own absence in the object's eyes.¹²²⁶

At a first stage, the baby uses thumb-sucking to self-appropriate the motherly object as a pre-representational substitute for the relationship to the mother in a basic, minimal organisation of the libido.¹²²⁷ As the development of auto-eroticism proceeds, the animistic double is enriched, as an interplay between being passively observed and taking on the role of an active observer permits the infant's self image to deepen.¹²²⁸ At this stage the auto-erotic double, the Botellas hold, constitutes an inner mirror, which, like the shield of Perseus in the face of the Gorgon, bounces off the fatal threat of non-representation.¹²²⁹ In times of crisis this internal mirror can turn dark and leave the subject destitute, casting around for a material external replacement, a narcissistic double that will come to the rescue.¹²³⁰

Giving shape to nightmares in the psychoanalytic session

In the psychoanalytic session, when free association, figurability and use of words prove to be insufficient to discharge tension, a situation close to actual neurosis emerges.¹²³¹ An uncomfortable strangeness creeps in, and the patient, to avoid a breakdown of all accessible representation, needs to make use of the analyst as a double, a step in which the figurability solicited in the analyst is both reflection and complement to the psychic functioning of the patient.¹²³²

What conveys to this its specificity is the quasi hallucinatory character of the disturbing, seemingly unconnected images that surge in the analyst and against which he/she at first will try to defend himself/herself.¹²³³ It is from the rifts and flaws within the densely knitted tissue of links and investments that a work on what has never been representable emerges if the chance is being seized upon.¹²³⁴ César Botella reports a session with Florian, in which the patient referred to a previous dream. There he had been together with his analyst but not followed him into the shower, a dream that did not give rise to any associations. The analyst somewhat reluctantly refrained from an interpretation on the homosexual elements in the scene and after further listening found himself saying 'The shower is the gas chamber'. While the first interpretation might have been quite plausible it was the latter that proved pivotal to further work with the patient by giving shape to a nightmare that had been beyond any conceivable representation before.¹²³⁵

the quality of the analyst's psychic functioning [*la calidad del psiquismo del analista*] consists of reaching the capacity to hallucinate, which is a process whereby unconscious representation acquires a quasi-perceptive quality, as an act of psychic survival of the analyst faced with the patient's disruptive and destructive unrepresented.¹²³⁶

Under the circumstances,

the new task of the analyst is not so much to discover, but to confer meaning to what had forever been lost, buried and 'without memory', and of which a suffering, deprived of represented content, can often be the sign.¹²³⁷

A ghostly potential of form and the role of conviction

Taking inspiration from Winnicott, the Botellas propose the possibility of trauma in a negative key: the lasting effect not of what took place in the past but of what did not when it should have. Of this the subject has neither perception nor representation. No trace left in memory can be object of repression or rejection.¹²³⁸ If we know that the traumatic impact of an event confronts the subject with a rupture in psychic coherence,¹²³⁹ the traumatic impact of a non-event must likewise be understood to produce much the same effect on the subject's mental territory. Refractory to a reparatory grasp by the Me, primordial narcissistic wounds are yet liable to produce an inveterately figurative punch that will seek hallucinatory realisation in a quest for transformation.¹²⁴⁰

The Botellas point out that with Freud, from 1937, remembrance finds itself dethroned in his work not just, as is widely know, to admit subsidiary construction in absence of memory. There is another turn as well: conviction becomes a factor worthy of meta-psychological consideration. It is now accorded attention as a state of mind emerging from the psychoanalytic process in quasi-hallucinatory fashion and in prolongation of a past that had psychically been non-existent.¹²⁴¹ It is, the Botellas write, using a surrealist image of André Breton's, as if, before

biting the hook offered by the analyst in his work at figurability, the *négatif* had been a 'trauma-fish' in diluted, shapeless manifestation at large in the vast seas of the id, existing in some places in more dense concentration than in others,¹²⁴² a ghostly potential of form, so to speak.¹²⁴³

In its confrontation both with memory and doubt,¹²⁴⁴ conviction (which permits form to solidify) has roots in animistic thought.¹²⁴⁵ It carries qualities of affect and representation without being either the one or the other.¹²⁴⁶ The Botellas advance the hypothesis that reality testing needs to pass through the contradictory position of doing away with outside reality and denying it vigorously by insisting that the object exists only inside. If this is so, space for representation and thought may open up, and the object can be held internally.¹²⁴⁷ Because it exists, as if by magic, inside, it can be found outside¹²⁴⁸ - 'only inside, also outside' is the paradoxical formula that by virtue of its dynamics grants a sense that what is being perceived is indeed real. Perception alone cannot carry conviction: we cannot deeply hold as real something in the creation of which we have not ourselves participated: perception of the world remains intimately linked to the hallucinatory.¹²⁴⁹ It is to this primitive level, to which the perceptive elements of hallucination provide access, that psychoanalysis has to accede, if memory alone cannot be relied upon to provide the necessary clues.

Regredience to untamed memory

For this to work, a community of regression needs to be available, as the Botellas show in a case vignette. Jasmine, a girl from Vietnam, now in latency, was adopted by non-Vietnamese French parents. Her own parents had been killed in a massacre together with all the other villagers during the wars and the small child, who may have been two years old at the time, had been found close to the corpse of her mother, at the side of whom she had been lying for a

indeterminate period of time. She knows her past but cannot believe in it, and is condemned to live in a present confined to the immediate. When she sees her own image in a mirror she is struck as if having encountered a ghost. Only when she is able to persuade herself that her analyst, like her, was born in Vietnam (which is patently untrue) does the quasi-hallucinatory image of her village resurge in a shared link of regression to a sense impression that had previously not properly been part of memory.¹²⁵⁰

The Botellas remind us that Freud is aware of 'untamed memory'¹²⁵¹: a *Niederschlag* of the past leaving a lasting dent on the present, but not a properly constituted memory trace.¹²⁵²

Construction in a psychoanalytic session is always related to a regression in thought shared by the two partners in the psychoanalytic enterprise. In this way, access to a hallucinatory actualisation of pre-symbolic traces of the perceptive may become possible, leading to a sentiment of psychic reality (*Wirklichkeitsgefühl*) based on shared experience.¹²⁵³ The figurability contributed by the analyst - attentive to what is going on beyond the levels of memory and symbolisation in the session - represents both the reflection and the complement of the psychic functioning of the patient.¹²⁵⁴ This means the analyst will have to be prepared to follow the absence of thought in the patient rather than the contents in evidence,¹²⁵⁵ in a movement of regredience that permits itself to be disturbed in its freely floating state and attracted by non-represented zones of disturbance.¹²⁵⁶

The impact of child psychoanalysis

As Sára Botella points out, a sense of the non-separability between mother and child has been kept alive in the United Kingdom, where adult and child psychoanalysis have not been running on separate rails, as they did elsewhere, including France.¹²⁵⁷ This has meant that the

accumulated experience of psychoanalytic work with children, in which attention to the perceptions of the moment is very important – just as it is with psychosomatic patients – has perhaps been unduly slow in being taken up by the main stream.¹²⁵⁸ Only because a bridge between British psychoanalysis and French psychoanalysis was facilitated by André Green was it possible for some of the old sterile dichotomies to be overcome in a move in which Winnicott's and Bion's ideas were brought into contact with both structuralist and economo-dynamical tendencies in French psychoanalytic thought.¹²⁵⁹

The work of the double between 'projective identification' and 'partners in thought'

César Botella himself, who had left Francoist Spain to go to France, had a grounding in Bion before he began a thorough reading of Freud, as he explains in an interview in Brazil.¹²⁶⁰ His and his wife's interest in figurability started when a child, in therapy with Sára, would not respond to any intervention until she confronted him with the image of a wolf that had risen up in her mind.¹²⁶¹ César Botella believes that there are cases when projective identification is not an ideal guide to the process of figurability because the structuring image does not really originate with the putative 'sender'.¹²⁶² Donnel B. Stern, who had dedicated his earlier book *'Partners in thought'* to 'unformulated experience',¹²⁶³ not without good reason groups the Botellas' work with Bionian field theory - together with Antonino Ferro - and points out there is some common ground with interpersonal/relational psychoanalysis (*IRP*) in the apparently shared assumption that the symbolic experience emerging in the session does not predate it.¹²⁶⁴ Ferro and Civitarese, on their part,¹²⁶⁵ see an important divergence to *IRP* analysts in the amount of active investigation resorted to in the session. This is exactly the reservation Botella and Botella have voiced in demarcation to inter-subjectivist practice: in their view regression is given too little scope, compared to Winnicott's practice in this matter, which has remained the reference of choice for

them.¹²⁶⁶ For their part, they are happy with André Green's suggestion that psychic work is sometimes incomplete without the work of two psyches involved.¹²⁶⁷

The non-communicating central self

Although the Botellas' endeavour, if successful, will ultimately give rise to new symbolic meaning in session,¹²⁶⁸ their more immediate call might be best caught by those lines of Milton's to which Bion was fond of returning:

.....[Light] Shine inward, and the mind through all her powers irradiate, there plant eyes, all mist from thence Purge and disperse....¹²⁶⁹

This, the Botellas believe, will only happen in the darkroom of regredience (a conceptual relative of Bion's 'negative capability'). James Rose, in a recent reflection on 'figurability', establishes a connection to a passage by Winnicott¹²⁷⁰:

I have tried to state the need that we have to recognize this aspect of health: the non-communicating central self, for ever immune from the reality principle, and for ever silent. Here communication is not non-verbal; it is like the music of the spheres, absolutely personal. It belongs to being alive. And in health, it is out of this that communication naturally arises.¹²⁷¹

If this non-communicating central self is there as a tacit retro-scene of psychic life, something very important has already been achieved. What, if this sustaining quality is missing or has been badly damaged?

Building transitional space for survivors

Given this conundrum, it comes as no surprise that some of the echoes of the Botellas' concept of a necessary 'work of the double' come from practitioners familiar with survivors of the Shoah.¹²⁷² It may well be, as Devoto has put forward in a different context,¹²⁷³ that 'representational enrichment', in a transitional space that was previously not available, is much needed in some therapies. Yet, it has also to be considered that, for this to happen, intermediary steps towards the symbolic have to be facilitated, which will require the analyst to be willing to stay in the unrepresented.¹²⁷⁴ External reality may well have wrought considerable havoc, which has to find means of transformation in a work of the double before it can turn into words.¹²⁷⁵

Negativity thus has to be contained by the quality of presence of the psychoanalyst, who as an animistic double favours regression and with it elicits a hallucinatory response to the track of traumatic lack that has not left a memory but rather an indelible dent in the psychic cohesion of the subject.¹²⁷⁶ What then are we to make of the fact that *L'investigation psychosomatique*, the study presented by Pierre Marty, Michel de M'Uzan and Christian David in 1963 regards projective reduplication as one of the hallmarks of the *opérateur*?¹²⁷⁷ Would not this be close to the ability of the patient to seize the analyst as a double, postulated by the Botellas?¹²⁷⁸ It seems that, like the traumatic dream that tries to work its way towards linking, this mechanism seeks from the other something which it has great difficulties to find.¹²⁷⁹ César Botella finds with Marty great attention to what can be perceived in the manner the patient handles him/herself¹²⁸⁰ and, in the tradition of Bouvet, of the way the patient positions him/herself in relational space.¹²⁸¹ Taking into consideration the mental economy of the patient, the analyst may have to bear in mind what is beyond representation (and has to remain there) at a given moment.¹²⁸² In the case study of Jasmine the Botellas, following Marty, reflect on the narcissistic difficulties of the

analyst to regress and identify with a certain patient beyond his/her reach,¹²⁸³ which, in a way, renders the analyst *opérateur*:

...one might think that, at the end of the day, the analyst has a deficient mental apparatus (*un psychisme carencé*), unendowed (*dépourvu*) [of his or her own] in that it does not possess the mental plasticity necessary to accompany his/her patient. And, one would conclude, that it is as difficult for the analyst to be the mirror of his/her patient as it is difficult for the patient to recognise him/herself in his/her analyst. It might well be that taking into consideration this mutual strangeness is the first step of a move that would join our experience in the therapy of Jasmine.¹²⁸⁴

Poverty in theory and the non-inevitability of Hegelian 'Aufhebung'

If theoretical work in recent years has received new impetus it is because it has become clear that the aridity of some patients finds an equivalent in the psychoanalyst's own theoretical and technical poverty faced with the opacity of the cure of the *opérateur*, in the light of his lack of tools to seize such a functioning.¹²⁸⁵ This, one would assume, is another instance of negativity, leading to a further push for a new, more satisfactory solution, hopefully in a contained field of theory.¹²⁸⁶

While this is a desirable development, can it be said to be inevitable? Recently, Claire Pagès has pointed out the inconveniences of the fact that Hegelian negativity is always in league with an *Aufhebung* (a surpassing on a higher level), a perspective which creates difficulties for its use in psychoanalysis.¹²⁸⁷ Hegelian negativity is an element in a contradiction, which starts as difference to become opposition¹²⁸⁸, as part of a whole. With Hegel, negativity does not lead to nothingness but to mediation.¹²⁸⁹ Is it not, Pagès, asks, possible to conceive of a psychic

negativity which does not lead to any secondary benefits for the psyche, a derivative of the *pulsion de mort* without any positive structuring effect?¹²⁹⁰

It seems that André Green, a pronounced proponent of a hardy implementation of the concept of negativity in psychoanalytic thought¹²⁹¹ was aware of unresolved problems. In 2011, after his summer vacation, he said he had spent time reflecting on *le négatif du négatif*.¹²⁹² He wanted to develop his reflections in a seminar but his deteriorating state of health prevented this.¹²⁹³

Nietzsche, who had criticized Hegel, figured prominently among his reading that summer but we do not know at which results he might have arrived if he had had more time and been able to transmit them.¹²⁹⁴ Whatever he might have emerged with, he would not, given his clinical and intellectual trajectory, have chosen Goethian Mephistopheles as his guide (who as part of his self-advertisement claims to be part of the forces that always plotting evil always manage to contrive good).¹²⁹⁵ Neither have the Botellas: coming to terms with infantile trauma with them is contingent on the availability of the work of a double that permits vacuum to produce results.

Possible sense that is not latent

If we follow this line of thought, an important part of the mental development depends on the accessibility of an encounter of substantial quality. *Avant-coup*, the subject may not have an idea of what to expect because, as Sára Botella reflects, it does not express a *latent* but a *possible* sense.¹²⁹⁶ Thus, it may not even be denied, rejected or repressed, although lack may well give rise to a system of defence. Denial and non-representation may look similar, and yet they will have arrived on different paths.¹²⁹⁷

These paths will inevitably be linked to developments in surrounding society and culture.¹²⁹⁸ In Erik Erikson's observations of Sioux children it is produced by cultural responses: the rage of the frustrated child is linked by observers to his future strength as a hunter and as a warrior within the tribe,¹²⁹⁹ a narrative that may work to contain some, but possibly not all, of the early distress. With Nicolaïdis (see *supra*) we may well take interest in cushions of possible regression facilitated or denied by a given culture.

A cultural frame to hold potential space

Most difficult of all, there remains the assessment of processes that have fatally failed to happen. If the English Romantic movement had never taken place, this would have been a grievous cultural loss on many different levels. Yet we would not have been able to mourn its non-arrival because we would not have had an inkling of the magnitude of what we would have missed. If ideas in order to arrive need a juncture where potential space meets grief,¹³⁰⁰ conditions for this may sometimes not be met. This would then make psychic structures vulnerable to the impact of non-events beyond the given mental horizon, a vulnerability in which the secondary benefits of 'negativity' would depend heavily on the qualities of an enveloping field. Just as the psychoanalytic debate of trauma has always had to take into consideration what the subject's psyche cannot generate by itself,¹³⁰¹ any therapeutic action will try to add something crucial previously not available in the environment, in an encounter which can be had or missed. In this sense it is an event, which, though aleatory in the context of the person's previous history, is felt indispensable in retrospect, rather than emerging as a natural result predictably from a given structure.¹³⁰²

The Botellas' counsel in the face of this difficulty, certainly relevant to our understanding of the *opératoire*, apparently is to crank up disciplined creativity within psychoanalysis, while opening gates of exchange between different strands of thinking.¹³⁰³ In his 2007 interview with the *Revista Brasileira de Psicanálise* César Botella quotes with some relish the statement by an unnamed colleague of his that something Darwinian must be done in psychoanalysis to make it stronger.¹³⁰⁴ A response from Brazil pointed out that the function of an author always exceeded his own contribution because it permitted its readers to give to work on their own understanding in permanent confrontation with the creative ideas of others.¹³⁰⁵ Perhaps, if things turn out well, interregional exchange in psychoanalysis can perform what Barros points out will be the result of successful work on dreams: a perlaboration of the symbolic foundations helps the mind to enhance its ability to think.¹³⁰⁶

In recent work, César Botella writes,

... Freud never conceived of psychoanalysis as a sum of ideas that aspire to becoming, one day, a theory that is complete and closed. On the contrary, and this is my basic hypothesis, the continuous development of the work [of psychoanalysis] cannot be grasped if not in a permanent movement of opening up, a movement in which the present state is there to support what follows upon it. This is the image of a person walking, every step of whom is only possible in a constant [change from] dis-equilibrium to re-equilibrium owed to the next step just initiated.¹³⁰⁷

For this to happen, a certain distance has to be taken from the immersion in a feeling of self-evidence. Our next chapter will show Claude Smadja's look back at the beginnings of the *EPP* in a break with available interpretation and his attempts to integrate this in a perspective not available at the time.

Chapter Eleven: Second Thoughts: Claude Smadja

As pointed out by Denise Bouchet-Kervella in her review of articles by the *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, the second generation of members of *IPSO* has shown a marked tendency to move away from Pierre Marty's conceptual hierarchies towards a stronger appropriation of Freud's Second Topography, often in dialogue with André Green's contributions.¹³⁰⁸ Though in contradiction to Marty's own theoretical edifice in its final form, this has often been in continuation of reflections by Marty's colleagues Denise Braunschweig and Michel Fain.¹³⁰⁹

Among those most visibly engaged in integrating these new directions in systematic fashion has been Claude Smadja, long-time president of the *Association Internationale de Psychosomatique Pierre-Marty (AIPPM)*, medical director of the *Institut de psychosomatique de Paris* (which since 2004 has been part of *ASM 13*) and founding editor, together with Gérard Szwec, of the *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, an important publishing platform of *IPSO*.¹³¹⁰

Marty's divergence from previous models reconsidered 40 years later

In his key paper on *opératoire* functioning as encountered in psychosomatic practice at the 58th *Congrès des Psychanalystes de Langue Française* held in Lausanne in 1998, he adopts an approach in agreement with a maxim once employed by André Green: *Reculer pour mieux sauter* – if in the midst of an intractable problem, get some distance to gather force in dealing with it.¹³¹¹ Altogether, he traces the major lines of psychoanalytic engagement with somatic illness to show how disenchantment with the available approaches led a group of young French psychoanalysts to a new approach which had long-term consequences that become clearer in

hindsight.¹³¹² In their meeting with a new group of difficult patients they started to take a closer look at what they did *not* find in these encounters.¹³¹³

Previously, various attempts had been made to assign covert meaning to bodily disease. With Georg Groddeck psychic and somatic affections are, on par, considered manifestations of a powerful id.¹³¹⁴ To him everything is a symbol, generated by an id exuding signification like a plant producing oxygen in photosynthesis.¹³¹⁵ Because the subject is inevitably lived by the id, the creation of symbol does not necessitate a psychic structure of particular quality involved in its creation.¹³¹⁶ Bodily complaints are accessible to interpretation in much the same way as typical dreams are and do not require the patient's associations so as to be intelligible to the analyst.¹³¹⁷ The symbols these complaints employ are rooted in collective experience and the prehistory of mankind.¹³¹⁸

Smadja groups this approach together with that of others, like Ángel Garma or Jean-Paul Valabrega, who, he contends, would be hard-pressed to differentiate the meaning of an illness in one case from its non-meaning in another case.¹³¹⁹ While their approach finds coherence by understanding the body as a front end of the soul's quest for expressivity,¹³²⁰ another school of thought, quite influential in post-war France,¹³²¹ moves into the opposite direction. Franz Alexander and his colleagues in the Chicago Psychoanalytic Institute, building on the work of Walter B. Cannon and, later, of Hans Selye, considered the preservation of homeostatic equilibria and adaptation in the pursuit of this goal as the organising principle that permitted a unified perspective on mind-body disorders.¹³²² In a meeting of minds between hospital medicine and a psychoanalytically inspired psychiatry, physiological processes were regarded as crucial for the development of somatic disease in a conflicted individual, with emotions as the subjective face of the process.¹³²³ The key terms they employed, like adaptation and emotion, but also

energy, were used somewhat ambiguously, slanted towards the biological but appearing to be loaded with psychological meaning. Seemingly with frictionless borders, Smadja argues, psychoanalytic interpretation was patched on as an extra to a stock of received medical perspectives.¹³²⁴ In the last resort, a difference between conversion neurosis and a vegetative neurosis - a concept which Alexander developed from Ferenczi's organ neurosis - depended on neurophysiological criteria and not on any specific psychological process of transformation.¹³²⁵ In addition to this, Alexander's Theory of Specificity introduced constant conjunctions between a certain type of unresolved emotional conflict and a specific organ liable to bear the brunt of this aggravation, irrespective of the particular psycho-history of the individual.¹³²⁶ Flanders Dunbar attempted to identify personality types that were most likely to be at risk from certain diseases.¹³²⁷ Although this approach had its limitations, it contributed important elements developed further by French analysts that were to form the core of the later *EPP/IPSO*. Reflecting on the detrimental effects of certain physiological states, Alexander pointed out that in these cases the individual was suffering from an excess of defence, an observation Michel Fain found of great interest for understanding impoverished mental states.¹³²⁸ There is something else: with Alexander's vegetative neurosis the possibility that an illness rooted in a subject's personality might altogether lack a hidden symbolic agenda was squarely on the agenda again.¹³²⁹

It is this aspect that seemed to engage Pierre Marty from early on. He had met Franz Alexander in 1950 and exchanged views with him on the subject of gastric ulcers.¹³³⁰ One year later he presented the case of Marie, a patient suffering from headaches, to the Paris Psychoanalytic Society, which caused him to reflect on the inhibition of thought and the failure of dream work.¹³³¹ This, followed up in a 1952 paper, led him to question both the concept of generalised symbolisation and the idea of a close correlation between illness and personality profile and to focus, instead, on the narcissistic difficulties of the psychoanalyst in his encounter with the

patient.¹³³² In analogy to libidinal regression, the idea of somatic regression arose during those years.¹³³³

Increasingly, a new generation of French psychoanalysts saw the somatic as a field to which Freudian metapsychology could fruitfully be applied if the patient was regarded as a whole and the relationship to him/her was shifted to centre stage.¹³³⁴ Moving the main emphasis from wishing to investigate a given disease to understanding what happened in the encounter with a sufferer,¹³³⁵ among whose problems evidently ranged a serious disease, they had to propose a new angle to this meeting, in a change of focus that in a typically French way was fed and buttressed by theory.¹³³⁶ In this sense, the publication of *L'investigation psychosomatique* was the founding document, and rallying cry, of a new school.¹³³⁷ From this new perspective, perhaps for the first time in the institutional context that formed its starting point,¹³³⁸ it was possible to sense the strangeness of meetings with hospital patients who presented themselves as nothing more than the incarnation of their medical files, a kind of behaviour that might have seemed perfectly rational to another generation of doctors but which seemed very peculiar to psychoanalysts at this time.¹³³⁹ Against the new conceptual background, set in an object relations perspective inspired by Maurice Bouvet's work,¹³⁴⁰ what was not happening in the meeting was regarded as an important part of the way the patient was handling him/herself and integral to how he/she dealt with any emerging blankness resulting from non-meaning.¹³⁴¹ This, they thought, gave important indications as to the libidinal economy of the subject in which the somatic disease and his/her response to it was set.

A need to address simplifications

While Claude Smadja builds on Pierre Marty's work, he gives it, as mentioned, a new turn by more fully taking into account, following both Fain's and Green's leads on this, Freud's Second Topography.¹³⁴² He suggests the *opératoire* could suitably be understood as a pathology of the Me within Freud's Second Topography and sets out to make the case for this.¹³⁴³ In taking another look at the various layers of *EPP/IPSO* conceptualisation in the course of this venture, he also points out that the public image of *opératoire* life has been shaped by collective assumptions that need to be opened to critical re-examination.¹³⁴⁴

The first simplification of this type is the idea that *opératoire* life emphasises its chronicity.¹³⁴⁵ To say someone is *opératoire* tends to be a judgement on the likely irreversibility of this state based on an interpretation of the patient's structure and constitution. Pierre Marty himself was of two minds on this and clinical experience shows that the *opératoire* can be found in different forms, some of which seem to be better understood in terms of process rather than in terms of structure.¹³⁴⁶ Though it can appear as a permanent condition, it can also come up as a transitory phenomenon in daily life, moments at which, Smadja suggests, the subject takes a nap from his/her subjectivity, retiring into a convalescence of being.¹³⁴⁷ Since the Me has need to put down its burdens in periodic withdrawal of investment, these states ultimately serve to bolster the person's narcissistic resources. An overall understanding of the *opératoire* has to take the whole gamut of variants into account, from the most enkysted to the most transitory.¹³⁴⁸

A second popular over-generalisation posits the well-nigh complete lack of the imagination as central to *opératoire* life. If this were the case, as radically and pervasive as suggested, the person, Smadja points out, would have to be dead on arrival to qualify. Treatment often finds

that a potential was present at one time but not developed and thus without reach of the individual.¹³⁴⁹

A third collective idea regularly associates the *opérateur* with a severe somatic affection that puts the patient's life at risk. As with the other two assumptions there is some truth to this stereotype but it covers only one part of clinical experience.¹³⁵⁰ Over the years the number of *opérateur* patients with whom no somatic disorder is found seems to have increased. It is possible to see these patients as close to tipping towards somatisation, a point which, however, in their case has not been reached. It is moreover likely that no single patient vignette will show the whole range of qualities with which the discussion of the phenomenon has associated the 'ideal type'.¹³⁵¹

The Me turned pauper

To find suitable angles of attack we have to look at the practical concerns that have been raised in dealing with *opérateur* patients. *L'Investigation psychosomatique* emphasised the difficulties of the psychoanalyst to identify with the patient as well as the latter's great narcissistic fragility. It used the image of a wall that is more likely to crumble than to show cracks.¹³⁵² Once the connection between a liability to somatic disintegration and a lack of fantasy had been made, the investigation moved to an increased interest in the ground on which facades turned to a busy street were built with little living space behind. Smadja finds early hints in an aside of Freud's, in which he envisages states in which melancholy is not directly object related.¹³⁵³

Smadja traces the various attempts by Marty and his colleagues to understand this 'inexpressive depression' or 'essential depression'.¹³⁵⁴ He links the mute complaint, without a proper inner

addressee, to further layers of thought which situate the narcissistic depletion and lack of vital tonus in evidence in an early relational field not accessible to the patient: because of problems of her own, the mother did not elect her baby to be enthroned in majesty.¹³⁵⁵ Smadja sees considerable convergence with Green's reflections on negativity.¹³⁵⁶ As Green's work on the 'Dead Mother' shows, transgenerational influences may have to be reckoned with, in particular in what is not there.¹³⁵⁷ If things were out of kilter at a time when mother and child were not experienced as separate yet,¹³⁵⁸ the Me is not a place that is continuously replenished with investments flowing from the id.¹³⁵⁹ The Me itself has been turned pauper and has gone missing as a valid object of predilection.¹³⁶⁰

Low 'subjective density' and low levels of aversion

Considering that Freud saw early hatred emerge from the infant's narcissism averse to the world's demands, Smadja finds it striking how many *opératoire* patients do not show a propensity towards hatred, lacking in the requisite 'subjective density'.¹³⁶¹ If thwarted, they show diffuse signs of excitement instead, as they fall prey to something Smadja likens to an inflammatory process.¹³⁶² Whenever circumstances permit, there seems to be an attempt to harvest perception for all it can deliver in place of hallucinatory wish fulfilment and to self-cradle as much as possible in stark reality.¹³⁶³ Since this process is essential to their stability, it is not surprising that there can be a surplus of vigilance found with them, amounting to a veritable 'hypochondria of the real'.¹³⁶⁴ If mad they are from the psychoanalyst's view, they are 'mad' in having gone hyper-real to an uncommon degree, having seemingly consented to having their lives cut down to size as teleguided front ends of a reality they unflinchingly affirm and which they are determined to inhabit without divergence from others.¹³⁶⁵

The opératoire subject as a crowd unto him/herself

Smadja believes that too little attention has been paid to the relationship between the *opératoire* and collective psychology.¹³⁶⁶ For the *opératoire* patient the world runs on well discernible rails, which precludes doubt, hesitation and having to feel one's way into the future.¹³⁶⁷ He/she is a crowd unto him/herself, losing his/her individuality in it, and yet cannot derive the profit from this act of immersion which Freud envisages in his study on crowd psychology.¹³⁶⁸ Affectivity is not heightened, intellectual activity is not diminished, and libidinal investments are not in evidence.¹³⁶⁹ If Freud suggests that the ego ideal opens up a significant path to the understanding of the psychology of crowds, Smadja proposes to look at what crowds can teach us about the Me.¹³⁷⁰ In the state of affairs Freud discusses, crowds put the subject into a state of relative narcissistic abundance: it is when he reflects on those extraordinary moments in which a mass disintegrates, wreaking havoc on the libidinal economy of its members, that we get closer to the narcissistic subsistence economy the *opératoire* must make do with.¹³⁷¹ If there is an identification with the ways of the world on the part of the patient, it is the image of a social ecosystem under extreme pressure that is being conjured up by Smadja's descriptions: whatever function the social collective has for others, his/her own standing in it may be closer to the voyage of a third class passenger on the Titanic who spent all his/her meagre means to make in on board.

A narcissism invested in codes of behaviour

Following Michel Fain, Smadja speaks of a *narcissisme de comportement* and, with Green, of a *narcissisme d'emprunt*, something borrowed and propped up by a certain type of external behaviour designed to ward off passivity at any cost.¹³⁷² While identifications usually serve to

appropriate mental territory, and are, indeed, of considerable importance to the *opérateur* patient, they seem to be particularly unhelpful to nourish, sustain and enrich his/her inner life.¹³⁷³ One way of looking at this is to posit deficiencies in the quality of primary identification in a patient whose mother may not have been able to invest her child in a way that permitted enough of a hysterical potential to be developed.¹³⁷⁴ Another way to tackle this is to probe into the patient's apparent need not to be found out of step with the social group of reference: would an offence against the norms of the group make the patient feel guilty or rather ashamed?¹³⁷⁵ This is quite a different form of inner organisation from the the patient suffering from a powerful superego in melancholia.¹³⁷⁶ Apparently the relationship of the *opérateur* to his/her superego is of a different nature: somehow the superego has lost its object, the Me.¹³⁷⁷ The ideal, the faceless norm takes the place of the superego.¹³⁷⁸ Breaking the ranks would matter, being a subject does not, or at least not that much. In this sense the *opérateur* is also a *maladie du Surmoi*.¹³⁷⁹ Carrying oneself well is of paramount importance.¹³⁸⁰ Tensions between one own's norms and those of the collective are experienced as very painful and receive a lot of attention.¹³⁸¹ Perhaps, then, it should come as no surprise that some patients feel a sense of relief at falling sick:¹³⁸² now, at least, something that concerns them personally, in a certifiable way, does matter.¹³⁸³ Being cared for in a medical institution may permit an amount of regression that might have been regarded as improper before.¹³⁸⁴

Actual neuroses revisited

Although Freud at one time explicitly stated that the study of actual neuroses offered no angle of attack to psychoanalysis, the situation looks different today.¹³⁸⁵ Smadja, building on discernible developments in Freud's thought, argues for their close connection to narcissistic and traumatic neuroses and the importance of this for an understanding of somatosis.¹³⁸⁶ After Freud's

theoretical innovations of 1920 actual neurosis has to be seen in a new framework: any traumatic event is liable to interrupt the dynamics of psycho-sexuality and to engender an actual neurosis.¹³⁸⁷ Recent hurt joins ancient trauma to drain the subject of the possibility to liaison libidinally with either object or self.¹³⁸⁸ Mental organisation, when and if it exists, acts as a protective shield for the body.¹³⁸⁹ With this shield failing, aggressive forces that can no longer be tethered to a subject's vital projects,¹³⁹⁰ unleashed, unbound, become destructive and turn inward as the capacity of the subject to keep working links intact is put to risk.¹³⁹¹

When the erotic investments placed in objects fall away, the narcissism of the subject becomes the ultimate barrier before the body is affected. When the narcissistic investments fall away as well, auto-destruction spreads within the organic domain.¹³⁹²

Regression impeded by an ambient 'pure culture d'instinct de mort'

Ambient reality against which the individual defends itself seems to be reeking of a '*pure culture d'instinct de mort*', reducing to nothing all strivings of the individual in undifferentiated, impersonal, administrative procedure.¹³⁹³ Against the background of increasing exhaustion, the *opératoire* mode is being used to brace and shore up the floundering subject.¹³⁹⁴ What has not fallen silent by itself, as yet, is put under the strict curfew of a self-calming agenda that has to serve, under the terms of the command economy imposed, as *Ersatz* for more luxurious means of regression currently unavailable.¹³⁹⁵ Staying active is a way of keeping things together.¹³⁹⁶ This is not limited to patients seen within a psychosomatic consultation: when the psychic survival of an individual brought to the brink of death is at stake, as Smadja points out - be it towards the end of life weighed down by progressive illness or under the extreme conditions of a Nazi extermination camp - the *opératoire* is one last line of defence.¹³⁹⁷

Self inflicted compliance with an imperative of calm

When Michel Fain was reflecting on the ideal type of the toxic mother the image he came up with, as we have seen, was in the likeness of a fairy tale, stepmotherly, Ice Queen, who does everything within her means to reduce her child to a mere object, a thing, to be handled efficiently.¹³⁹⁸ Working from the outside - but with much the same effect as Freud thought the death instinct might achieve from the inside - she would clamp down on her child, sending cascades of 'terminate all' signals, both covert and overt, to its boisterousness so as to induce compliant and swift enough calm.¹³⁹⁹ Thrown upon him/herself, in dire straits, the *opérateur* patient, according to Smadja, comes up with similar recipes when handling him/herself.¹⁴⁰⁰ What cannot be transformed within mental space has to be brought to a definitive stop: there must be, there will be, silence.¹⁴⁰¹ If this is not successful, or insufficiently successful, the diffuse anxieties well up without a distinct image.¹⁴⁰² Together with Szwec (both authors in 1996 received the *Prix Maurice Bouvet* for this),¹⁴⁰³ Smadja early on focused on the particular self-calming processes used in absence of tangible modes of inner processing, as a last resort, if the projection of destructivity outwards is no feasible option.¹⁴⁰⁴

The problem, under the conditions, is what to do with an excitement that has no history, no project and no memory, in contradistinction to a *Trieb* (*une pulsion*; a drive) that has both a history and a project.¹⁴⁰⁵ If tension cannot be absorbed, it has to be reduced by any means at hand, applying emergency measures which are bound to draw heavily on perception, physical movement and codes of behaviour.¹⁴⁰⁶ Running dry on both hope and desire leaves quantities of destructive energy unbound, only precariously taken care of by self-calming measures.¹⁴⁰⁷ Paradoxically, excitement can also be fought by further excitement which is marshalled to

procure a plenitude of sensation in absence of other anti-traumatic resources.¹⁴⁰⁸ If this is the case masochism has failed to act as a sufficient binding mechanism of excitement/tension.¹⁴⁰⁹

Smadja speculates that exposure of a baby to the will of an adult who does not act in accordance with the child's needs can place the infant in a zone not only beyond contradiction and conflict, but also beyond the pleasure principle and thus beyond masochism.¹⁴¹⁰ Some patients indeed give the impression of having been, under total maternal domination, locked out from their own subjectivity and denied access to territory much needed for affects to take shape.¹⁴¹¹ Smadja refers to René Roussillon's contribution to point out that for an affect to acquire its particular quality three requirements have to be met: it has to be capable of being shared at a primitive stage with the primary object to gain its ultimate form; it has to be regulated by the meeting with the object; and it has to become individualised by becoming distinct and separate from the mother's own response.¹⁴¹² If the nascent subject is denied this process, his/her affective future will bear the marks of this missed opportunity.¹⁴¹³ There will still be the raw material for affect but it will not have been bound into processed form yet.¹⁴¹⁴ Using *opératoire* procedures may be an attempt at self-healing in a situation in which the Me has been fragmented and disappearing in the crowd a means to avoid surveillance by an oppressive inner mother.¹⁴¹⁵

Links to revitalisation disrupted in conjunctures of hurt

In more recent work Smadja reconfirms his view on what he believes to be the most likely road to somatisation: a conjuncture of circumstances reawakens the traces of ancient hurt and re-activates previously established lines in radical defence against it, among which splitting of the Me and denial take pride of place.¹⁴¹⁶ The already stretched narcissistic capital of the individual is further depleted, with what is left flowing from the libidinal to the auto-conservative pole of the inner economy.¹⁴¹⁷ De-liaison, a cutting off from libidinal ties, not conflict, is the order of the

day.¹⁴¹⁸ With this turn away from the world of objects, destructivity is set free and directed towards the subject. Together with Marilia Aisenstein, Smadja recalls the work of the renowned French biologist Jean-Claude Ameisen on the mechanisms of cell death.¹⁴¹⁹ If a neuron drops out of vital exchange with other neurons, its programme of auto-destruction gets activated.¹⁴²⁰

Their survival permanently depends on the nature of the interactions upon which they enter with the community that surrounds them, interactions that are indispensable to the repression of their auto-destruction. A new, more dynamic perspective of our body begins to emerge: our continued existence depends on a permanent balance between the processes of deconstruction and reconstruction, of auto-destruction and renewal.¹⁴²¹

In his reflections on fatigue, Smadja - without reference to Ameisen - produces his own parallel to the above lines. He invites his readers to imagine an evening when they return home from work with the only wish in mind to go to rest. But an evening invitation at friends is on the programme. So, despite the fatigue, it is time to go out again. A few hours later, on return, one notices that far from adding to one's fatigue, the evening with friends has spirited it away.¹⁴²² If this ability to liaison pleurably is lost, not only is the likelihood of fatigue increased, but a lack of flexibility and immobility creep in, affecting the way the flow of time is experienced.¹⁴²³ All lightness of touch is gone, the future does not beckon with new possibilities.¹⁴²⁴ If perception does no longer evoke hope and desire, the relentless repetition of the same sets in.¹⁴²⁵ Fatigue is spreading.¹⁴²⁶ What Ameisen's passage shows, but Smadja does not particularly emphasise, is that the ability to liaison is a two way traffic. Smadja in the above example he gives certainly has to be willing to leave his house, but for this to happen there needs to be an invitation.¹⁴²⁷

Somatic diseases: cause or effect of narcissistic depletion

Absence of this possibility for interaction, if not compensated by other means,¹⁴²⁸ will, one has to suppose, wear down the body in the long run.¹⁴²⁹ Smadja, following this line of thought, posits the depletion of narcissistic resources of the Me as the most likely root cause of somatisation.¹⁴³⁰ Szwec, with whom he had introduced the investigation of self-calming measures in 1993, is not convinced.¹⁴³¹ In his contribution to the 1998 congress, he points out that Freud was comparing the redistribution of libido found in hypochondria to the *consequences* of somatic disease. What metapsychology may help us to understand are the consequences of somatic disease not its causes.¹⁴³²

Somatic illness as the only point of contact with psychoanalysis

As Roussillon observes, Smadja's *maladie du Moi* confronts us with 'a failure and inability to be' rather than an act of repression, an extra-territoriality to the subject's Me rather than an unconscious that dwells in him/her.¹⁴³³ Jean Guillaumin emphasises that the group of people showing *opératoire* traits seems to extend much beyond the psychosomatic patients in whom Pierre Marty and his colleagues showed such interest.¹⁴³⁴ In fact there seems to be a fair number of them in present day society, Guillaumin reflects, but they do not seek psychoanalysis. The only professional point of contact psychoanalysts are likely to have with them is established if they fall sick and are referred to them in the course of their medical treatment.¹⁴³⁵ People in long term medical treatment for severe illnesses will, as observation has shown, lean towards *opératoire* behaviour the more vigorously they are subjected to medical treatment and the more chronic their state becomes. In these cases hyper adaptation to 'reality' is the consequence of a mortal threat against which the subject tries to find a valid line of defence.¹⁴³⁶ Inner and outer

reality, of which the therapist is deemed to form part, is no longer safe, and the subject tries to gain some distance by objectifying itself.¹⁴³⁷ If there is disinvestment, it is partial and functional: preconscious dimensions lose importance because all the energy is needed to man the Me's defence perimeters.¹⁴³⁸ What we observe as *opératoire* behaviour is a last ditch defence against a catastrophic loss of inner organisation.¹⁴³⁹ In agreement with Smadja, Guillaumin regards Freud's Second Topography as well suited to describe the position of a Me vis-à-vis superego, ego ideal and id, who must subjectively experience this within his/her own intimacy as an encounter with extraterritorial forces.¹⁴⁴⁰

In a recent contribution Smadja returns to the precarious situation of a subject exposed to the 'actuel', the raw forces of mentally undigested inner reality in a situation where he/she finds himself on a precarious ledge between inner, yet extraneous, forces and a social reality into which he/she is bound.¹⁴⁴¹ He takes up the question posed by Jacques Mauger:

What are we to make of that excess of heat and noise that assails from outside psychoanalytic working space supposedly at shelter, by its silence and its rhythm, and without an oculus.¹⁴⁴²

How are we to deal with lives in which what impacts on them can find only little subjective narrative, does not reverberate in figurative shapes and does not easily admit transformation?

Smadja refers to a passage by Maurizio Balsamo:

The problem appears when we are confronted with mental functioning [*fonctionnements psychiques*] where chance and noise are excluded from the field of the possible or are present in excess, with structures and lifestyles [*formes de vie*] which we could define as lacking the poetic ear, characterised by what presents itself as a weak factor of transformability, by the lack of subjective observation and point of view, by histories at a low narrative and figurative level.¹⁴⁴³

Smadja sees mental representation as a complex structure organised like an edifice integrating both past and present realities.¹⁴⁴⁴ What Marty termed *l'épaisseur du préconscient* - the depth of preconscious layers - are the dimensions of subjectivity that resonate in psychoanalysis.¹⁴⁴⁵ This, Smadja points out, is a relative wealth that can find itself retrograded to levels of impoverishment and destitution, in conjuncture with important developments in a patient's life. Under threat from inner disintegration, the life of affects faces strong currents of obliteration.¹⁴⁴⁶ If this is so, it will be the task of the psychoanalytic encounter to enable a re-liaisoning with desire, a process in which the psychoanalysts's own ability to form associations will have to act as a catalyst and introduce, once a foundation has been laid, elements that address the patient's situation but come to him/her as a surprise.¹⁴⁴⁷

One difficulty that will come up is that for the psychoanalyst the functioning of the patient is deeply anti-analytic.¹⁴⁴⁸ The silence of the unconscious in the encounter constitutes a traumatic shock for the analyst that can only be overcome if the analyst takes an interest in the way the patient mentally functions.¹⁴⁴⁹ Smadja sees a reversal of roles at work in the encounter: it is the analyst in whom the situation of the helpless baby the patient once was is repeated, and it is the patient that has taken over the role of the smothering, death bringing object.¹⁴⁵⁰

It may be necessary to develop explorations of possible new mental space on separate rails from the patient's experience of the world of the *actuel* in a zone provisionally split off from this world of noise in a helpful way.¹⁴⁵¹ In difference to the classical psychoanalytic attitude, the analyst, in exercise of a motherly function, will also make use of facial expression and bodily posture to accompany and re-animate a patient who behind his/her brittle *opératoire* facade has to make do with an extremely precarious and unstable mental economy.¹⁴⁵² This 'economic' understanding of the patient's situation has to take into account three different territories: mental

space, outside reality and the body, all of which impact the individual in his/her capacity for mental transformation.¹⁴⁵³

The psychoanalyst faced with the autonomous logic of the body

Although the disorganisation of a patient's psyche will have consequences on the body, these processes, beyond a certain point, will follow their own autonomous logic in the physiopathology that has by then set in.¹⁴⁵⁴ In many cases the psychoanalyst will feel a deep disquiet and worry, difficult to pin down, about the somatic well-being of a patient who does not seem to be particularly discomfited.¹⁴⁵⁵ Sometimes the mental functioning of the patient will vary, depending on the stimuli provided by the tangible presence of the psychoanalyst.¹⁴⁵⁶ Smadja recommends making use of the nascent dramatic potential of the psychoanalytic encounter, suggesting in an accessible way implications of what is happening as the meeting unfolds.¹⁴⁵⁷ This can contribute to weaning the preconscious off its saturation with the yields of perception.¹⁴⁵⁸ The external frame of the sessions should be given careful consideration: it should be in a separate location, clearly demarcated from where the patient normally receives medical care.¹⁴⁵⁹ An arrangement in sitting may be preferable.¹⁴⁶⁰ If a psychoanalysis were to be undertaken with a somatic patient, the unconscious of the patient (in the sense of Freud's First Topography) would have to have found a solid enough basis. On the basis of preliminary work it will depend whether this will be a psychoanalysis with or without a beginning.¹⁴⁶¹

The structuring role of intergenerational processes

As we have seen, the space in which early fantasies are developed (or pre-empted, as the case may be), receive particular attention in Denise Braunschweig and Michel Fain's thinking. In

their contribution to a manual on Child and Youth Psychiatry, Michel Ody and Claude Smadja put the position of the mother into perspective, by including the role of the father in the development of mental functioning.¹⁴⁶² The authors acknowledge the contributions of Lacan in underlining the huge symbolic importance of the father, but concede that his overwhelming structural importance in Lacanian theory pushes the real person of the father and the role his own desires play, into the background.¹⁴⁶³ They take a somewhat different path by including in their survey investigations into how fantasies among the parents interact with the child and his/her own image of the father:¹⁴⁶⁴

From before his/her birth, the child expected (or non expected) mobilises the fantasies of the parents in the way they mentally represent it (or refuse to represent it). The real, gendered child, at his/her birth is going to change these representation with limits that vary for each of the parents.

In this triangular situation that is established, the quality of the well-being (or ill-being) of each of the partners depends as much on the investment towards the two others as on that between them.¹⁴⁶⁵

The mother, the authors point out, not only carries within herself representations of the father of her child, but also of her own father reverberating in her own history as a child.¹⁴⁶⁶ Children suffer the effects of conflicts previous generations were not able to resolve.¹⁴⁶⁷ The role a father can play for a child can sensibly be changed if there is no place for him in the mental world of the mother and the equilibria between her femininity and her maternal role are out of balance.¹⁴⁶⁸ Social processes, present from the beginning, also play a role in the way adolescents are able to achieve increased distance from their parents in a process of de-idealisation.¹⁴⁶⁹ Though constellations have been identified that arguably do not bode well for the future of the child, it also has to be admitted that a plurality of factors of considerable variety enter into the eventual outcome.¹⁴⁷⁰

The psychoanalyst faced with the autonomous logic of the environment

Since any ideal type has to be confronted with multiple realities on the ground, it is only proper that the question has been raised whether the *opératoire* exists in only one major key or can be observed in a minor key in different configurations. Claire Rueff-Escoubes has pointed to the inter-relationship between the requisites of contemporary social life and modes of mental functioning and envisaged a situation in which the organisation of personal space in an increasingly *opératoire* society might marginalise those whom psychoanalysts have hitherto regarded as well mentalised subjects with individualised, subjective inner space:¹⁴⁷¹ anti-psychoanalytic functioning on the part of individuals might be well-adapted to their particular environment.

Denys Ribas, more recently, has conceded that metapsychology sometimes seems to be ill equipped to lay account of environments that bring about psychic death by inducing the subject to withdraw investment in his/her own self:¹⁴⁷² organised indifference deprives the subject of the opportunity of vital exchange, which it needs in order to thrive.¹⁴⁷³ If the world we move in is radically different from our patient's, Gottlieb's observation 'that which we can know is bounded by the circumstances of our own psychological development'¹⁴⁷⁴ must of needs receive a particular, unconscious, cultural slant.

One day, Marilia Aisenstein recounts, around 1979 or 1980, Pierre Marty, when she arrived at his office, took her out into the pouring rain to show her something, or rather someone:

a carcass of a car, four sheets spread on the ground, an engine completely taken apart with the pieces thrown on the sheets, so that they would not be in direct contact with the mud. An Asian man crouched there, occupied, very calmly, with very meticulously putting together his car again,

which he had completely taken apart the day before. Pierre Marty asked me, “So, what do you see there?” I answer him, “I see a Chinese who is completely mad”. He tells me that this is not at all the case, that I had not got it at all, had nothing understood, although I had been at the hospital for more than a year! “This is a moment of *opératoire* life *in vivo*.” I was not very convinced and I told him that I found that very, very mad. He tells me, “No, madam, for if this Asian were deranged by any fantasy life, he could not take apart a car screw by screw and calmly put it together again like that. And anyone among us, deranged as we are by our unconscious, could not do this kind of work”.¹⁴⁷⁵

As Marty pointed out, looking at the foreigner confronted them with their own mode of mental functioning. In retrospect, Aisenstein thinks there is something akin to a cold form of psychosis at work in such starkly *opératoire* behaviour.¹⁴⁷⁶ Since the man, for reasons of his own, was clearly more interested in his car than in the diagnosis conferred on him by a group of uninvited bystanders to his persistent, determined work, this is a point that has to remain moot. What it also shows is that any psychoanalytic perspective that does not include the world view of the person glanced at from outside must remain severely handicapped.

The psychoanalyst faced with cultures alien to him/herself

In a contribution from the Eighties, Smadja observes the particular difficulties faced by a psychoanalyst in his work with a family with whose cultural moorings he is not familiar.¹⁴⁷⁷

The *psychosomaticiens* are wont to say that the analyst must often lend his/her preconscious to his/her patient. Can we do this, ourselves, to these families? For it is here that the rub really lies: we lack the representations, with cultural facts in our view working like latent thoughts, [insight into which] we fall short. ... We progressively feel that our capacity to associate diminishes. In

the worst case, we can no longer function in front of these patients: boredom, irritation, aggressivity and depression are the reflections of this mental dysfunctioning of the analyst....¹⁴⁷⁸

It only requires a clash of cultures, it seems, for the analyst to come close to *opérateur* functioning himself. It is a strong reminder that any clinical assessment will have to be highly sensitive to the particular circumstances in a given person's life.

A situationalist dimension of the opératoire

With Smadja's remarks that the *opérateur* might at times be a transitory element, and his willingness to take cultural factors into account, it is easier to arrive at a reading that makes sense of a person's remedial measures at a certain moment of time. In this light we can also understand better the seemingly mad actions of people who are not necessarily mad but entangled in something that takes their all, which sometimes bypasses their minds.¹⁴⁷⁹

As was raised in response to Smadja's presentation at the 1998 congress, we should take into consideration different levels of the *opérateur*, employed in different contexts and charged to get certain things done within an economy of inner ways and means,¹⁴⁸⁰ in which elements of the proto-imaginary are at times difficult to discern.

The interlocutor pushed against his/her ignorance

Marty in 1952, as we have seen, made the narcissistic difficulties of the observer confronted with functions invisible to him/her the linchpin of his inquiry.¹⁴⁸¹ It is instructive to link this to Bion's words

In short, there is an inexhaustible fund of ignorance to draw upon: it is about all we have to draw upon.¹⁴⁸²

Balsamo and Mauger - taken up by Smadja as we have seen above - refer to the *oculus* that is not available to the psychoanalyst, creating a special condition which constitutes both a boon and a bane. The problem is aggravated if we deal with suffering at the workplace, which affects the subject in ways which he/she may find difficult to understand, feel or put into words. Our ignorance of this, it seems, is both structural and situational. Part of it might as well be due to a resistance to knowledge available, but not absorbed, because it has been cut out of the loop. In the following two chapters we will probe into how French psychiatry discovered the rhythms of the workplace, forgot most about them, and rediscovered them from a new psychoanalytic perspective.

Chapter Twelve: Entanglements: The forgotten pre-history of the *opérateur*

The antecedents: patients' work in psychiatry - a means to energise or to subdue?

Thinking about *opérateur* behaviour in France existed before the term was coined. It focused on what work did - or failed to do - to people who were in a difficult situation to start with. Before we look at Christophe Dejours' contribution in the following chapter, we need to take a brief look back to see what had been too optimistically discarded in the intervening period. To understand this, the effects of the end of World War II on France have to be considered.

At a time when French psychoanalysis had to reconstruct under changed circumstances the underpinnings of its renewed existence from scratch, institutionalised psychiatry in the land was confronted by formidable challenges on its part. With neuroleptics not yet available, every effort had to be made to use prudently, under constrained conditions, what was at hand.¹⁴⁸³ One way to make professional manpower go a long way was to put a premium on any action that strove to mobilise a collective, as Bion and Rickman had done in their own way in the Northfield Experiment.¹⁴⁸⁴ In France, psychodrama, soon to be given a psychoanalytic penchant, was adopted to suit the needs of the times.¹⁴⁸⁵

Another possibility, in continuation of a long tradition, established in France at least since Philippe Pinel (1745-1826), was to put patients to work.¹⁴⁸⁶ This, in the past, had had a number of less desirable collateral effects. In the 19th century, mental asylums, charged by the law of 1838 to open their gates to the mentally disturbed regardless of their pecuniary situation, increasingly became financially dependent on the labour of their patients, who were made to work up to ten

hours a day to sustain the required output.¹⁴⁸⁷ In the famous legal provisions of 1857, work continued to be regarded as both a means of treatment and a source of distraction well suited to its inmates.¹⁴⁸⁸ It was, at any rate, seen as the method of choice to keep the ward calm by producing through its strict application submission, self-denial and self-forgetfulness in a workforce rendered both docile and listless¹⁴⁸⁹ - something that would well fit later descriptions of the *opératoire*. Not until 1938 did the *asiles d'aliénés* shed their former designation to become psychiatric hospitals at least in name, places in which one psychiatrist was responsible for up to six hundred patients and the 'guardians' involved in day-to-day handling of the patient population had received no regular training.¹⁴⁹⁰

Whatever precarious balances may have been reached by this system, they were shaken up dramatically during the war years, in which an estimated one fourth to one third of their patient population died in desolate conditions, from malnutrition and lack of heating, even in regions where more actively murderous German methods did not apply.¹⁴⁹¹ On occasion, however, the breakdown of the system of traditional care showed unexpected effects as well. In June 1940, La Charité-sur-Loire, under imminent danger of bombardment, released some of its patients to their families, while others simply fled. After some time it was found that the ex-patients had adapted rather well and were contributing to the communities that had accepted them.¹⁴⁹² In 1943, Paul Sivadon, previously responsible for a place lodging patients in family settlements, and now charged to run the former asylum Ville-Évrard at Neuilly-sur-Marne, decided to open up the place to the surrounding rural environment and was able to see some spectacular transformations in his patients.¹⁴⁹³

Lessons drawn: increased attention to rhythm, suitability and context

The post-war years found Paul Sivadon centre stage in many of the reform debates within French psychiatry and as medical adviser for the national health insurance (introduced by the 'ordonnances de 1945'¹⁴⁹⁴), with a wide-ranging network of professional contacts both within and outside the medical profession, in a position to influence the shape of necessary reforms.¹⁴⁹⁵

From his observations of patients at work he seemed to have developed a lively interest in ways to understand what sort of job would best stimulate a given patient: various parameters like rhythm, space, material and social context had to be considered to find the right kind of fit.¹⁴⁹⁶

Engagement with a task, he concluded, could only be sustained if it offered a manageable challenge to the subject performing it, kept alive the dimension of the as yet unknown and offered a tension that invited to be resolved.¹⁴⁹⁷ If this *écart*, and the tension created by it, disappeared, there would be either a drifting into mechanical behaviour under the sway of all enveloping boredom or an onset of more pronounced aggression leading to a turning away from the job at hand, both of which moves would again bring pathological behaviour to the fore.¹⁴⁹⁸

Just as too much homogeneity in the surroundings would result in indifferentiation and fusion, too much heterogeneity would produce listless co-existence or outright rejection.¹⁴⁹⁹ In a theoretical move apparently both inspired by philosophical vitalism and the psychology of Piaget,¹⁵⁰⁰ Sivadon posited it would be best for the individual, if the personal environment were not only to sustain and to enable, but by some admixture of aversive qualities also manage to propel and incite the subject to transcend its constraints:

Personality is nourished by its surrounding field [*milieu*] and structures itself by putting itself in opposition to it. Its development is only possible if the nutritive factor and the resistance by the environment correspond to the capacities of assimilation and independence the subject has.¹⁵⁰¹

Hospitals would be wrong to impose conditions that might cripple their patients' sociability and drive them into sterile exasperation of their aggressivity.¹⁵⁰² Regression towards secure modes and progression towards accepting risks had to be able to alternate and should be brought into balance to assure personal equilibrium,¹⁵⁰³ a goal which would more readily be achieved if there was enough intermediary space provided.¹⁵⁰⁴ Not only should there be a certain range of tasks requiring different amounts of efforts: to grow, the individual should be exposed to different environments to stimulate its capacity of development.¹⁵⁰⁵

From the observation of patients at work to the investigation of the world of work extra muros

From observing what work did to the patient to taking interest in his work place integration after release from hospital seemed but a small step to be taken in stride.¹⁵⁰⁶ In order to be successful, the rehabilitation process had to accomplish the re-insertion of the ex-patient in a work place, something Sivadon tried to achieve by every means at his disposal. In 1948, together with Suzanne Baumé, he founded the association *l'Élan Retrouvé* ('Zest Regained'), the programme of which was announced in its very name. It offered to former patients a place of sociability and welcome in form of a club, where they would also receive help by social workers to cope with administrative, professional and material problems.¹⁵⁰⁷ After an agreement with the national health insurance, this was extended into a '*foyer de post-cure*' [a post-treatment centre] in 1956, offering further help to ex-patients to come to terms with renewed social independence and to find appropriate work after release from hospital. In spite of all his efforts, at the beginning of the 1950s structured offers with a similar goal were relatively scarce and provisions as yet fragile.¹⁵⁰⁸ It was against this background that Sivadon first introduced the term *psychopathologie du travail* [psychopathology of work] to a wider professional public.¹⁵⁰⁹ Sivadon, in his presentation, approached his topic from three angles of investigation: the

adaptation of the mental sufferer to his work; pathogenic work; therapeutic work, three areas of study that have since moved apart but which he tied together by focusing on the position of the mental patient in need of rehabilitation.¹⁵¹⁰

Casualties of the work place

It did not escape his and his co-workers' attention that the world of work in France at the time was undergoing massive transformations, putting new demands on the workforce, which was increasingly confronted with new modes of organisation and accelerated rhythms. All this put meaningful social integration of ex-patients at risk by creating a gap between the new demands and their individual possibilities that could no longer be bridged.¹⁵¹¹ What if the resources of renewable psychic energy within the immediate environment were found to be lacking?¹⁵¹² Even if they managed to adapt, the adaptation demanded of them might well be alienating and malign, unawares sidetracking young, vulnerable people into a shriveled life.¹⁵¹³ Once caught up in the impasse, they would be at a loss to know how to transform situations by dreaming of them and enveloping them with an imaginary halo.¹⁵¹⁴ They would lack sufficient resources provided by what he called interiorisation: reality, Sivadon believed, only jumped at one's throat if one did not dispose of an intermediary cushion formed by a network of symbolic connections which also provided the means to conceive possible futures.¹⁵¹⁵ A future disenchanted, its back turned to desire, would turn the flow of time into something void and bloodless: for individuals with extinguished lives (*'individus eteints'*) time neither pulled nor beckoned.¹⁵¹⁶ To them, and many others, help should have arrived earlier.¹⁵¹⁷

According to international studies at the time, there existed an elevated percentage of mental pathological disorders impacting on 'ordinary work'.¹⁵¹⁸ In his 1952 article he referred to studies

that put the percentage of those affected amounted to around 30 to 40 percent.¹⁵¹⁹ It would, hence, he suggested, be important to ask oneself a number of questions:

To what extent does the professional activity reverberate on the psyche and favour one psychopathological manifestation over another? To which measure, on the contrary, does a given mental structure steer the subject towards a certain mode of activity, while at the same time constituting favourable territory for the emergence of a given category of mental troubles?¹⁵²⁰

Work might impact the individual in quite different ways, then: what was highly unlikely, however, was that it would not leave any mental impact on – or resonance with - the subject and his/her life.¹⁵²¹ Though work may put florid pathological manifestations to some rest, Sivadon suggested it should not be used to put the whole person into a permanently reduced state.¹⁵²² Compensation, even if it occurred, certainly did not equal healing and should not be confused with it.¹⁵²³

Towards rallying the public: the work of the Mental Health Ligue

If the thin red line of French reform psychiatry was to rise to the challenges posed by the transformations of post-war society, they had to educate the professional public.¹⁵²⁴ Only if awareness was sufficiently raised and training offered, the importance of preventive measures to promote mental health at the work place could be more properly understood and the sensibility towards precursors of mental troubles be more widely spread.¹⁵²⁵ This was even more important under the conditions prevalent in France, where the exercise of the medical specialisations of psychiatry and work medicine was at the time stipulated to be mutually exclusive and doctors of work received no formal training as yet.¹⁵²⁶ One of the focal points of the endeavours in 'extended psychiatry' and inter-professional dialogue - apart from encounters gravitating around the *Élan Retrouvé* - became the *Ligue d'hygiène mentale*.¹⁵²⁷ Under the guiding influence of Paul

Sivadon, it became in the 1950s and early 1960s a centrepiece of national strategies for the prevention of mental disease with connections on an international scale.¹⁵²⁸ By dint of considerable effort, France was moving into somewhat closer affinity with American developments, which had seen concerns of national health move to the centre stage in public awareness, unprecedented elsewhere.¹⁵²⁹

In 1952, together with Claude Veil, Paul Sivadon founded a section within the *Ligue* specially dedicated to mental hygiene at work.¹⁵³⁰ In this field of specialisation there was an approach shared with contemporary British and Dutch studies, in a view which tended to lodge the source of disturbances in the personality structure of the worker, reflecting only on second thought on the type of work suitable for an already fragilised individual.¹⁵³¹ This perspective at times entailed a call for tutelary care with strong paternalistic features: those who could not cope with the contemporary rhythms of daily life had to be provided with guidance and direction how to adapt, if necessary by strongly pushing them to take the necessary steps or organising their environment.¹⁵³² Seen from the workers' perspective, attempts by work medicine to encourage mental hygiene could seem like another attempt by state and employers to meddle with whatever compartments of precarious autonomy were left to them.¹⁵³³ From a professionally strategic perspective, on the other hand, psychiatry, at a time when clinical psychology was positioning itself as a possible competitor, was moving into territory left largely unoccupied as yet.¹⁵³⁴

Dissenting voices: Louis Le Guillant

While Paul Sivadon in his understanding of the development of society showed strong echoes of the sociologist Georges Friedmann, founder of a modern sociology of work in France,¹⁵³⁵ one of his fellow psychiatrists, Louis Le Guillant, equally engaged in studying the psychopathology of

work, was moving into more markedly Marxist directions of a pro-Soviet flavour.¹⁵³⁶ He actively fought for an extended psychiatry engaging in preventive measures beyond the existing hospital structures.¹⁵³⁷ In 1948 he founded within the hospital in Villejuif, Paris, the association *Entr'Aide et Amitié*, which tried to involve local enterprises with the work of patients in protected workshops.¹⁵³⁸ The campaign of the *PCF* against 'reactionary psychoanalysis' in 1949 created internal rifts within the reform camp, to which Le Guillant responded by creating with Henri Wallon, who for a long time in tension to Piaget had emphasised cultural and social factors in the development of the infant, *La Raison*, a magazine which provided a platform of argument in favour of dialectical materialism.¹⁵³⁹

His trade union contacts raised his interest in conditions of work in various professions and their consequences on mental dispositions. He notably pioneered, with Jean Begoin, work on the neurosis of telephonists and typists and initiated investigations in the conditions of house maids.¹⁵⁴⁰ In his studies he insisted on the social habitat as a place that created tensions to which people adapted to the best of their abilities: it is the constant nervousness of telephonists acquired at the workplace that rendered them apt to execute their task.¹⁵⁴¹ When the noxiousness of a situation leant on individual histories a pathogenic effect was very likely to take shape.¹⁵⁴² At the *Centre de Traitement et de Réadaptation Sociale* of the Villejuif psychiatric hospital, Le Guillant was intrigued by the considerable number of Breton women taken care of in this service. Frequently working as domestic servants, uprooted from their provincial background, and living in comparative isolation, they had to face comparable problems.¹⁵⁴³ His reasoning is well presented in the following lines about Madame L., a patient working as a maid, in which he tries to assemble elements of a drama that escapes the patient:¹⁵⁴⁴

To a certain extent she has lost contact with the social reality that is hers....she has alienated herself profoundly from the surroundings where she should live in ... Her lived experience, which is of such eloquent tragedy, speaks a language which she does not understand.¹⁵⁴⁵

Depending on the situation, your job might cut you off from a sense of belonging, imprison you in identifications contracted in your family of origin and effectively stall all meaningful desire, rendering you 'dispossessed of yourself'.¹⁵⁴⁶ Although different individuals might respond differently to finding themselves in an impasse, this condition is always the source of a considerable amount of mental tribulation.¹⁵⁴⁷ Le Guillant, in contrast to Paul Sivadon, as we can see, introduced something his colleagues were not developing in the same way: a clinic of subjective situations under the impact of social conditions.¹⁵⁴⁸

A different emphasis: François Tosquelles

If work is to have a chance to be recuperative it has to involve the individual in all his/her subjectivity. Among his generation it was perhaps François Tosquelles, with his Spanish Civil War experience in the Catalan non-Stalinist Left,¹⁵⁴⁹ who argued most insistently the necessity to understand what kind of social world and social relationships an activity opened up to.¹⁵⁵⁰ Transitional and, in particular, transactional objects were needed to enable exchanges with others that allied aggressive impulses to libidinal ones and were apt to enrich secondary narcissism.¹⁵⁵¹ There was an evocative material dimension involved in the dynamics of exchange.¹⁵⁵² How people were, handled themselves and presented themselves ('*se portent*')¹⁵⁵³ was connected to the exchanges they were embedded in. Even before people began to reflect upon things, there had to be an implicit groundwork of rules - functioning as external attractors - that enabled the exchange.¹⁵⁵⁴ What was needed was an activity deeply rooted in the subjectivity of the individual that was participating in the construction of a social world:¹⁵⁵⁵ the very opposite of a dead end

assignment that, though known to be meaningless, had to be tackled ceaselessly with at least a show of dogged persistence.¹⁵⁵⁶ Ergotherapy at an institution, if it was to have success, he argued, should not be a new organ added to the body of the hospital but work like the hormonal system, furthering the growth and metabolism of the body and synchronising the whole.¹⁵⁵⁷

If jobs did not perform this re-connecting and re-vitalising function, one of the consequences that seemed to resist the effects of short time rest was pervasive fatigue, a mental and bodily state that had risen in prominence in contemporary discourse but irritatingly bedevilled theoretical understanding.¹⁵⁵⁸ For the psychophysiology of work it was difficult to pin down because it defied objective measurement in its development and impact on the individual.¹⁵⁵⁹ With many subjective, non-quantifiable factors evidently involved, the manifold manifestations of fatigue lacked a framework for proper analysis.¹⁵⁶⁰ What made matters worse was that attrition (*usure*) at work was regarded as external to their own fields of investigation by quite a number of disciplines, thus falling into a cranny beyond what each of them regarded as their methodologically properly constituted remit.¹⁵⁶¹

It might have helped if the lessons of Ignace Meyerson, founder of a historically grounded psychology, mindful of the socio-cultural context of human activity, had still widely been heeded, but he himself had been straddling the established boundaries of disciplines to an extent that made it impossible for him institutionally to establish his own school of thought.¹⁵⁶² Beyond the epistemological difficulties resulting in an effective scotomisation of the subjective dimensions of fatigue within the academically constituted disciplines, there was also the problem that the sciences that dealt with labour problems did so on widely held utilitarian assumptions slanted towards solving the problems of the big players in the market and not ideally suited to an understanding of the problems of the individual worker.¹⁵⁶³ For psychiatrists sudden fatigue

remained a possible precursor of further trouble to come.¹⁵⁶⁴ but how exactly did this come about? Integration in a group and status at work seemed to protect against fatigue.¹⁵⁶⁵ Yet, Le Guillant's approach, which had yielded tangible results when focusing on house maids, ran into considerable difficulties when he investigated the complaints of French train drivers: he conceded that something was clearly amiss at their workplace but could not pin down and conceptually isolate the harmful factors involved.¹⁵⁶⁶

Claude Veil's third way

Claude Veil, a generation younger than Sivadon and Le Guillant, and more markedly grounded in psychoanalysis and phenomenology than either of them, introduced new nuances in what amounted to the articulation of a third way.¹⁵⁶⁷ what rendered a situation pathological was the mounting saturation of a person's defences caused by work norms, the imperfections of which psychiatry throws some light upon.¹⁵⁶⁸ Understanding personal thresholds of tolerance is as important as extensive epidemiological research work.¹⁵⁶⁹ Disadaptation to the work he/she has been doing can happen to an individual for very tangled reasons at any given moment in time.¹⁵⁷⁰ Unless an exhaustion is correctly diagnosed and situated, the treatment of the resulting anxiety may reach an unsatisfactory stalemate.¹⁵⁷¹ People can reach a point where they are so drenched in tiredness that, submerged in it, they have fallen prey to a measure of intoxication.¹⁵⁷² If, as is common, the propensity to chronicity is thought to be lodged in the individual and not in his/her links to the environment, people who are considered as invalids will be pushed into social exclusion.¹⁵⁷³ We must therefore understand and take into account processes of *de-liaison* to which the subject may find himself/herself exposed, as well as any available hinterland of counter-balancing measures.¹⁵⁷⁴ As Guillaume Le Blanc, reflecting as a philosopher on the work of Sivadon, Le Guillant and Veil, points out, there is always an inherent fragility in the creativity

that an individual is able to muster when confronted with a situation which seriously throws into doubt the possibility to make one's activities fit into one's projects of identity.¹⁵⁷⁵ In continuation of previous leads by Sivadon, Veil keeps an eye on the economic balance of psychic investments of the subject while his phenomenological interests at the same time render him acutely aware of ways of being and feeling oneself in the world¹⁵⁷⁶ - something that draws him close to the ethnopsychanalytic stance of Georges Devereux and, in particular, the interdependent entanglement between the inner and the outer proposed by the latter.¹⁵⁷⁷

The waning of the movement

Although the movement in favour of the recognition of a psychopathology of work had consolidated its positions and had attained considerable sophistication - to which Claude Veil's interdisciplinary research activities and positions within the *École Pratique des Hautes Études* and later the *École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales* greatly contributed - it petered out towards the end of the 1960s.¹⁵⁷⁸ Claude Veil himself speaks of the following years as a trek through the wilderness (*la traversée du désert*).¹⁵⁷⁹ The reasons for this seem to be complex. On the basis of two government decrees (in 1960 and in 1970), French psychiatry was organised in a way that de-emphasised the importance of the psychiatric hospital. The territory of the nation was divided into sectors of around 70.000 inhabitants, which were served by smaller structures and inter-disciplinary teams of mental health care. One of the examples of this new approach, much vaunted as a sign of progress in health policies in the Fifth Republic under de Gaulle, was the *ASM 13*, at which Serge Lebovici and René Diatkine, psychoanalysts from among the ranks of the *SPP*, were taking the lead.¹⁵⁸⁰ Seen from the perspective of 'the sector', the work place was extra-territorial to it and not the focus of their efforts.¹⁵⁸¹ As Veil points out:

For the activist fervently in favour of the sectorisation of psychiatric services, who had opted for the distribution of responsibility within mental health care according to the principle of residence, any move to take into account the workplace only threatened to upset things: anyone bold enough to suggest such a thing would qualify as an objective enemy.¹⁵⁸²

Concomitantly, the growth of the psychoanalytic movement in France was introducing a new emphasis: for many psychoanalysts, Veil observed, the worries of the psychiatrists of work were reeking of a futile interest in mere 'actual neurosis'.¹⁵⁸³ Within the Left, positions like that of Le Guillant were relegated to the margins by the new structuralist interpretation of Marxism offered by Louis Althusser.¹⁵⁸⁴ As Lacanism took off on its meteoric rise, interests in the activity of the subject at work, who might well be at a loss for words, were put on the back burner at the time.¹⁵⁸⁵ Within French psychoanalysis concepts like psychic investment, affects and Freud's 'economic' angle on mental life, became the concern of a rather cornered minority, and were by many regarded as less important than the key role of signifiers proposed by Jaques Lacan.¹⁵⁸⁶ Georges Friedmann, who had pioneered the sociology of work and had influenced Sivadon, gradually turned from his former focus and took more of an interest in the media, communication and mass phenomena.¹⁵⁸⁷ When the students were on the march in May 1968, graffiti proclaiming *sous les pavés la plage* (beneath the pavement lies the beach)¹⁵⁸⁸ appeared all over Paris, a slogan as anti-*opératoire* as could conceivably be proposed. Its original seed thought had been the rather rambling and less catchy: 'the old who only justify their sacrifices do not want to be understood by the sacrificed'¹⁵⁸⁹ - to do away with fatigue and suffering at work, not to study it, was for many the goal envisaged.¹⁵⁹⁰

It was a decade which was to push work psychiatry - in the eyes of rebellious students peopled at best by geezers who had adjusted their sights for far too long to the pavement - into well-nigh oblivion. Seemingly the representatives of a dated approach, challenged in their

conceptualisation by the new dominant ideologies, their previous chains of inner- and intra-institutionalised transmission unsettled, they faded into the background.¹⁵⁹¹ What was left joined forces with ergonomics or constituted research nuclei within higher studies.¹⁵⁹² More recent digests of work accomplished in France show the abiding relevance of the problem but sometimes little awareness of earlier efforts to tackle it.¹⁵⁹³

Towards new foundations

It took more than ten years for a new, second foundation of a psychopathology of work to take place.¹⁵⁹⁴ As Yves Clot points out about a different but related context: once the storm has blown over the social and institutional landscape is no longer the same.¹⁵⁹⁵ The first, post-war, generation had encountered considerable difficulties in trying to theorise the fruits of their experience.¹⁵⁹⁶ What had proved elusive for any psychiatric approach was the relationship of the subject to his/her own activity and the links this activity established to others.¹⁵⁹⁷ There was also some recognition that there was a considerable cultural distance between the psychiatrist and the worker.¹⁵⁹⁸

By the late 1970s, the structuralist ascendancy in social studies was waning and the concepts of subject, experience and agency were again becoming legitimate concerns in French academia.¹⁵⁹⁹ In 1980 Christophe Dejours presented his study *Travail: usure mentale* and initiated a new stage of inquiry by putting the focus on the inter-subjective processes mobilised by situations of work, a field of investigation he termed psychodynamics of work to encompass zones of experience that go beyond suffering.¹⁶⁰⁰ His psychoanalytic approach, centred on the clinic of the subject and its defence strategies, has since been challenged in critical dialogue by Yves Clot, who has been proposing a 'clinic of activity' and a psychology of work environments.¹⁶⁰¹

For our investigation, it is essential to note that it was between 1960 and 1970 that psychoanalysts rediscovered a patient that had very much been in the focus of the school described, now virtually on the verge of demise. The name they gave to this way of functioning was *opératoire*, a word strangely reminiscent of the world of work and its operating procedures that had been pushed to the margins.¹⁶⁰² Half forgotten, the difficulties it had described in detail did not disappear. This is how Isabelle Billiard explains why the work psychiatrists of the 50s had a very difficult time understanding their patients:

Work is the object of 'doing' of 'giving a hand', of tacit consent among workers: the employed do their work more than they talk of it, and the turns of phrase used to denote certain modalities of activity or certain constraints inherent in given domains of activity are generally considered to be purely technical by outside observers. ... the workers themselves shy back from talking about what they personally experience at their work, if for no other reason, because their expression is put to defeat by the opacity and the 'inavowable character' of suffering.¹⁶⁰³

On numerous occasions we encounter metaphors of energy and economy employed to discuss people whose dreams and daily lives are no longer on speaking terms but whose persistent malaise nonetheless defies any psychiatric understanding groping for factors of revitalisation.¹⁶⁰⁴ If the similarity is one in surface detail, it is yet close enough for it to be shrugged off as mere co-incidence. Edward Shorter, from his own perspective as a historian, has discussed the spread of fatigue as a mass phenomenon in the second half of the twentieth century and offered observations, presumably understood to be non-exhaustive, on particular medical subcultures centered on it.¹⁶⁰⁵ In the midst of these developments apparently pervasive in Western society we find something that seems to be more specific to France: in international comparisons the French accord a very high importance to the nobility of work, expect much more possibility of self-realisation from it than other European citizens, show themselves most disappointed by social

and political constraints imposed on it, and are, as a consequence, likely to withdraw into dysphoric affective disinvestment.¹⁶⁰⁶ If work turns out to be an impasse, it is an impasse of considerable significance; if, on the other hand, a core team finds means to exercise creative agency in the midst of apparent disorganisation, it becomes a source of vital flux and steady revitalisation against all odds.¹⁶⁰⁷

Not surprisingly against this background, it is the baffling multitude of social and personal contexts in which fatigue turns into incapacitating suffering that defined the field at which the new Psychopathology of Work in France cut its teeth.¹⁶⁰⁸ My conjecture is that psychoanalysis in its advance through medical institutions was beginning to see patients that had previously been the headache of another branch of specialists. Psychoanalysts had inherited a phenomenon - at its most disquieting both chronic and endemic - that was not part of the core of their own clinical legacy.¹⁶⁰⁹ In trying to rise to the challenge they were, *grosso modo*, about to countenance, in the arena of their own clinical tradition, some of the theoretical moves the generation before them had been forced through in the course of their prolonged encounters with the terrain.¹⁶¹⁰ We shall see in the next chapter on Christophe Dejours what psychoanalysts were beginning to make of this.

Chapter Thirteen: Indispensable Extensions: Christophe Dejours

Early descriptions of *opérateur* patients see them as adrift in the unstructured actual. This was at first believed to go with certain predominant personality traits. From the early Eighties, one line of reflection began to show a more pronounced interest in the arrangements a person entered in, both at the work place and at home.¹⁶¹¹

Obviously, nefarious adaptations to the dynamic resulting from this would impact psychic functioning. In this chapter I shall focus on the thought of Christophe Dejours in whose work this approach has been developed most extensively. Member of the *Institut de Psychosomatique de Paris (IPSO)*; since 1983), member of the *Association Psychanalytique de France*, and professor for Psychoanalysis, Health and Work at the *Conservatoire National des Arts et Métiers (CNAM)*.¹⁶¹² He is president of the scientific council of the *Fondation Jean Laplanche*.¹⁶¹³ For many years, Dejours has in creative ways been moving back and forth from the '*mode opératoire*' to the '*usure mentale*', the brutal mental attrition often encountered at work. At some distance from Pierre Marty's systematisation, it shows that the consideration of *opérateur* modes of functioning went well with a move of psychoanalysis into new fields of application to which it had previously been extraneous.¹⁶¹⁴

While still a medical student, Dejours' interest was drawn to the abominable living conditions among immigrant workers.¹⁶¹⁵ He has since conducted investigations in different professional environments, including the automobile industry, the building industry, cement works, the chemical industry, the nuclear industry and the police.¹⁶¹⁶ At first he encountered some animosity not only on the part of the management, but also from the unions, who did not want to hear of

any psychological explorations into the lives of their membership.¹⁶¹⁷ When a wave of suicides struck the automobile industry and, more recently, *France Télécom*, he was very much in demand as a professional authority to elucidate the backgrounds of the shocking events.¹⁶¹⁸ The increased public attention also resulted in an investigation published by *CDFT France Télécom-Orange* on suffering at the work place, in which the professional help of Dejours was enlisted.¹⁶¹⁹ A study of the relationship between psychiatry and the labourer credits his work with the revival of public interest in the psychopathology of work, which as a discipline had seemed in terminal decline by the end of the 1960s.¹⁶²⁰ To emphasise new considerations within a larger perspective, Dejours proposed to call the new discipline *psychodynamique du travail* rather than *psychopathologie du travail* from the early 1990s.¹⁶²¹ He received the *Prix Maurice Bouvet* in 2001 for the sum of his contributions.¹⁶²²

Dejours' work bears the signs of a long discussion process, in which arguments and counter-arguments have repeatedly been sifted to absorb new experiences and data, to revise positions and to present them in coherent form and clear language.¹⁶²³ It seems that his readership comprises two different groups, whose interests may touch but do not converge: his psychosomatic contributions are of clear interest to a psychoanalytic audience, while his ideas about the psychodynamics of work are more frequently discussed by a professional public focusing on social realities.¹⁶²⁴ Since I believe the two branches of his work form a whole,¹⁶²⁵ and as such are relevant to psychoanalysis, I will draw on both of them to describe his theoretical approach, which is in some continuation of Michel Fain's work but at the same time in important ways influenced by Jean Laplanche.¹⁶²⁶

Two threads of development: attachment versus libidinal subversion

In Dejours' approach it is not secure attachment that puts to ease the body at ease but early contact with the fantasies of the environment.¹⁶²⁷ Desire has to be given the opportunity to work its wiles on the body if the subject is to keep in reasonably good shape. Dejours believes there exist two kinds of corporeal destinies intertwined in intricate ways.¹⁶²⁸ He focuses his investigations on what he terms the 'second body', which emerges in childhood in a process unlikely to be ever successfully completed from a first body of genetic endowment, physiological function and instinctual appetite.¹⁶²⁹ For all the usefulness of studies on this field of expertise, he believes, there is a hiatus with the prime preoccupations of psychoanalysis focusing on dream, fantasy and desire,¹⁶³⁰ subjective experiences that convey new subjective meaning and give direction to corporeal existence.

This surplus dimension, in Dejours' view, is contingent on a process he terms 'libidinal subversion', a development in which forbidden fantasies induced by the parents' sexuality inject covert layers of meaning into the adult-child relationship which then 'denaturalise' the body, turning it away from its instinctual moorings and the dull weight of physiological factors.¹⁶³¹ The emerging 'erotic body' responds in novel ways, not hardwired into it at birth, to the stimuli of the world.¹⁶³² As the child constructs his/her own sexuality by deciphering and subjectively translating the enigmatic messages directed to him/her contaminated by adult sexuality in unconscious ways, he/she moves away from the sphere of biologically grounded instinct into the sphere of psychoanalytic *pulsion*.¹⁶³³ Dejours stresses that Laplanche's work implies a theory of creative thinking: children have to strain to 'translate' the flood of enigmatic messages addressed to them into something coherent and comprehensible, which is never a predictable reproduction.¹⁶³⁴

The carrier wave for adult messages, directed towards the child but inevitably affected and compromised by their own sexuality, is formed by the innate behavioural patterns that produce attachment.¹⁶³⁵ Caught in this tension, childcare induces a flowering world of infantile sexuality in response to unavowed meaning hidden in the behaviour and speech of adults.¹⁶³⁶ The personal unconscious of the child is formed by residues of the infantile interpretation process that cannot further be broken down into a conscious translation of the messages.¹⁶³⁷ Liberties taken or restrictions imposed in body-to-body interaction leave their imprint on the nascent map of the 'erotic body' in a series of sedimentations and, as a further consequence, define the extent and limits of unconscious fantasy.¹⁶³⁸

Since the sensibility of the body is used to probe tentatively into the world,¹⁶³⁹ not surprisingly, much of this affects the sensorium of the body's surface.¹⁶⁴⁰ Dejours sees natural conjunctions in his thesis about the genesis of an 'erotic body' with Didier Anzieu's theory of a 'skin-ego'.¹⁶⁴¹ It is this 'erotic body' and the demands it poses on the subject which characterise the emerging mental life and conveys to it qualities that go beyond the merely intellectual:¹⁶⁴² all communication, whether in words or in silence, will be accentuated by (inward and outward) movements of the body.¹⁶⁴³

The mill by the waters: irrigation won from the torrents of the wilds

For any of this to happen, however, energy provided by the urges of nature has to be side-tracked off its course to gain shape in infantile sexuality so that the register of desire will be able to gain the upper hand on the register of need.¹⁶⁴⁴ Dejours uses the metaphor of the mill making use of water diverted from its natural riverbed to produce effects which potentially transform a whole

landscape: *étayage* would correspond to the turning wheel which levies energy off the forces of instinct, sidetracking some of it, that is then put to use as libidinal *pulsion*. Not only will the riverbed be relieved of the potential overflow of turbulent excitement, it will also adapt to the new economy of forces as it turns into something that is no longer raw nature.¹⁶⁴⁵

In Dejours' picture, the turns of the wheel produce a new rhythm of movement, regulating the respective plenitude and scarcity of water in canals downmill in new ways not pre-patterned in the given extraneous currents of the river:¹⁶⁴⁶ side channelling the brute forces of energy will also relieve the riverbed of pressure.¹⁶⁴⁷ If, and only if, this scheme of things is operating, it will be possible to apply Freud's dynamic viewpoint to drives, instead of the economic viewpoint more adapted to the understanding of comparatively inchoate unchannelled forces.¹⁶⁴⁸ *Pulsion*, in order to come into its own, needs the other.¹⁶⁴⁹ Like Marty, Dejours is inclined to see Freud's Topography (First and Second) not as mere stages in Freud's thinking but as successive stages in any successful developmental process.¹⁶⁵⁰ Once the basic structures, contingent on successful *étayage*, are in place, energy is syphoned off auto-conservation to generate desire directed towards erotic goals that put self-conservation at risk.¹⁶⁵¹

Dejours underlines the paradoxical continuity between Freud's earlier theory of drives and his last theory of drives, which, in effect, means that the forces of auto-conservation seeking homeostasis finish up on the side of the death drive.¹⁶⁵² Although attachment, as we have seen, serves as the carrier medium of 'libidinal subversion', it also produces residual zones untouched by libido as bastions of future psychic muteness, potential inroads to de-compensation under the sway of the *pulsion de mort*.¹⁶⁵³ Erotic passion, like a biphasic wave, regularly introduces shocking, unsettling disturbance to pre-existent stabilities in its systole, which then in its diastole have to be reworked and integrated in dreamlife.¹⁶⁵⁴ In other words: Eros as a binding force and

the sexual in its quest for excitement contradictorily work both with and against each other.¹⁶⁵⁵

Failure to achieve an equilibrium in this throws the subject back on the dis-hinging potential of ancient mutenesses to undo what has been developed so far.¹⁶⁵⁶

Towards a situated history of selective numbness: Zones gone cold

As we have seen, in Dejours' view, the spark kindled in the child's mental life originates from contact with worlds of adult fantasy. While the encounter between the adult and the child stimulates desire, it also produces zones practically impervious to it. When the adult takes care of the child, his/her unconscious is solicited in the close contact between bodies and nascent infantile sexuality reactivates conflicts in the carer stemming from his/her own childhood.¹⁶⁵⁷

Bodily registers that are excluded from play with the child are bound to leave their negative imprints on the emerging geography of the erogenous body of the child.¹⁶⁵⁸ Reasons for these parentally imposed dull blanks may vary: with the parents themselves these zones may have been left cold and unresponsive or, on the contrary, too frighteningly excitable. Certain affects may appear to be altogether inaccessible to the parents.¹⁶⁵⁹

These areas will be excluded from the registers of interpersonal expression and, given the somatic disponibility, will be the zones of choice for future disease to strike if the subject is exposed to a crisis which his/her mental system cannot perlaborate.¹⁶⁶⁰ Not the symptom as such is *bête* (dumb) – as de M'Uzan famously postulated for psychosomatic disease¹⁶⁶¹ – but the zone at which it strikes has been numbed out on the inner maps resulting from the bodily exchanges between adult and infant.¹⁶⁶² Bodily zones that fell prey to proscription, have been radically banished from emerging mental maps.¹⁶⁶³ This is particularly pronounced if the adult feels acutely threatened by scenarios initiated by the child he/she cannot handle and which have to be

excluded by all possible means. If the child invites to play on this territory, there will be a violent backlash on the part of the parents.¹⁶⁶⁴ In these regions the protective shield of the libidinal body will not assume its full function, leaving the dead weight of physiology, mentally not adequately integrated, in its wake.¹⁶⁶⁵ Complex disablement results from early interactions that by their very nature are difficult to bring into narrative form.

Some families, at a very basic level, have fundamental problems with being made up of three and not just two,¹⁶⁶⁶ making it difficult for the mother to oscillate between being a mother and being a mistress to the father of the child.¹⁶⁶⁷ Personal structure builds on intersubjective processes as they unfold in their different temporal layers¹⁶⁶⁸: the body of a person bears the mark of the erotic history of his/her parents and of what they loathed.¹⁶⁶⁹ The infant learns early on that it has to play its part in reassuring the parents to prevent a surge of excitement, which, were it to occur, would establish a connection to a traumatic primal scene unassimilable by thinking.¹⁶⁷⁰ Patients who turn to somatic malady as a remedy in crisis often come from a family background in which a violent parental attack directed against the child's capacity for reverie and fantasy is a distinct possibility.¹⁶⁷¹ As a result the child becomes an early expert in laying hold of perceptions which calm down his/her parents, distracting them from possible fantasmatic entanglements, stressing elements of control and having a grip on things.¹⁶⁷² When the infant encounters a reality which the mother herself is not able to symbolise, it identifies, as Fain and Braunschweig have suggested, with the mother and shows his/her loyalty by joining her attitude of denial - *l'identification à la mère dans la communauté du déni* - to protect her from threatening break down.¹⁶⁷³

Another solution to the dilemma is to provoke the parent so that the unbearable tension is channelled into a violent beating of the child, and, as a consequence, evacuated so that calm is

re-established.¹⁶⁷⁴ In contrast to the psychotic person, with whom thinking is warped, a limitation of mental territory and a restriction on the libidinal use of the body is more often the dominant problem for people with marked psychosomatic vulnerabilities.¹⁶⁷⁵ Deficiencies in the make-up of the 'second body' will lead to a lack of intuition and inventive ingenuity.¹⁶⁷⁶ For Dejours, it is the body, or rather 'the second body' that pre-shapes thinking as it follows affect.¹⁶⁷⁷ If, as André Green has suggested, affect is the '*regard sur le corps ému*'¹⁶⁷⁸, there are children for whom neither the regard nor the unrestricted movement of the body can feel safe. Since this has been prevented from forming any link to thought, it cannot be repressed in the classical sense.¹⁶⁷⁹

Persons suffering from these restrictions, in order to keep stable, try to neutralise within themselves any proprioceptive sensation that might lead down a slippery slope of overboarding excitement.¹⁶⁸⁰ The problem what to do with 'impossible' excitement is exacerbated if socio-cognitive resources are scarce because early learning processes were hampered; lack of education, as such, however, does not preclude a rich life of fantasy.¹⁶⁸¹

The subject pushed against its own unresponsiveness

If in adult life a person is in a situation calling for the activation of functions laid waste to from childhood, he/she is helplessly pushed against an inexplicable, selective impotence.¹⁶⁸² Coming up against it feels like staring death into the face.¹⁶⁸³ The subject finds no way to give psychic form to the tension he/she is under¹⁶⁸⁴ and, primarily, tries to safeguard him/herself against the emptiness in him/herself where the unavailable function should have sprung into being. The first impulse would be to annihilate the source of trouble:¹⁶⁸⁵ the object necessitating a response not forthcoming from within.

There is a dangerous crisis if the subject finds himself/herself totally incapable of putting the inner drama into scenes but at the same time finds no means of projecting it on an inter-subjective stage.¹⁶⁸⁶ If there were traces of expressive behaviour, this could, in advance of understanding, prepare the way for it. Since there are not, this means that there will be no possibility to observe the response of others. *Pulsion* – always addressed to the other – has been eclipsed and the subject is at the mercy of his/her rather confused residual instincts.¹⁶⁸⁷ While some patients try to find recognition at the job, as an attempt at sublimation, this will only work if there are exchanges with a sufficiently supple preconscious.¹⁶⁸⁸ A violent first response inhibited, a somatic affection in the body part interdicted to 'speak' could be the means of last resort.¹⁶⁸⁹ Dejours uses the concept of '*l'agir expressif*' - a use of the body in symbolic interaction - that is crucial to further development.¹⁶⁹⁰ If barred, a pathogenic development can easily set in.¹⁶⁹¹

Dejours, in his vignette of Madame B., describes the case of a sixty year old lady working as a high ranking civil servant in the public administration of museums.¹⁶⁹² Of Jewish origins, she had fled to France towards the end of World War II, where she learned the language, and despite a difficult start, made her way to enjoy a brilliant career. Her overarching goal, taking precedence over relationships, is to be able to lay the foundations of a museum which she has been planning. Whenever her husband is slighted or experiences a setback at work, this reverberates sharply with her. She feels incapable of expressing hostile sentiments in situations that hurt her, if only in defence.¹⁶⁹³ The lung cancer with which she has been diagnosed with could well be a consequence of her strong habit of smoking. But there is also a fracture in her life she herself is aware of and which occurred two years before the tumour was discovered: Her daughter, Jewish without knowing it, married a handsome man from an aristocratic family, whose father is an active, militant member of a right wing extremist party, leading members of which are frequently

present at family gatherings of the in-laws. Antisemitism has invaded her family space and ways to address this seem barred because there is no possible register of expression available to her.

This is a problem she is familiar with: both her parents were quite incapable of showing anger. The unbearable situation charges her with a tension that cannot be laid to rest because it is kept from social exchanges. Since no dramaturgy of wrath is conceivable, the depths of pain are driven underground and become invisible. Whenever tension mounts she effaces it by lightening another cigarette, a habit which exposes her to considerable risk since there is a high incidence of cancer running through her family.¹⁶⁹⁴ If the subject disposes of no mental resources to grant a stage to what hits him/her, one of his/her last resources is to meddle with the sensorium that receives unbearable stimuli in a way that excludes them from sinking into the preconscious and forming links there. They are being put down before they can saturate themselves with meaning capable of repression, resulting in a much more radical suppression.¹⁶⁹⁵ In this it is related to inhibition, but works at a more basic level, closer to the body.¹⁶⁹⁶ As one of the last resorts against reality for the psychotically untalented, suppression provides an alternative to suicidal acts by re-routing tension in ways that in the end present the bill to the body.¹⁶⁹⁷

Putting fantasy at bay for the job

Dejours provides an example of how this suppression works from an area of experience in which it has been studied more fully as a regular feature of social life: highly mechanised industrial piece-work means that the worker has to regiment his mental life in order to stay in step with the necessities of the stereotyped, repetitive, machine-gearred processes, in which a paralysis of all fantasy is actively sought for, so as to be able to accomplish the work at hand.¹⁶⁹⁸ Dejours concedes that the amount of fantasmatic elaboration of being swallowed up by this kind of

heteronomous work seems to vary. He refers to Miklós Haraszti's *Le salaire aux pieces*¹⁶⁹⁹ and Charly Boyadjian's *Le nuit de machines*¹⁷⁰⁰ as witnesses in written form of lives on the short leash of piece work. For some people at least, as Haraszti shows, keeping functional cannot be conciliated with even momentary flights of fantasy.¹⁷⁰¹ One instructive way for workers to handle this is to throw themselves head over heels (*a corps perdu*, one might be tempted to say) into the work rhythm to suppress any mental activity to become nothing but the act. They turn insensitive by means of senso-motoric hyperactivity, a mode of auto-acceleration that deliberately steps up the pace so as to channel into motricity what cannot be disposed of in any other way.¹⁷⁰²

For, if one were to take too much pleasure in thinking freely and in meeting up with oneself again, one had to, after returning to the conveyor belt line, to start afresh the whole infernal cycle of auto-acceleration necessary to reach the stage of adaptive mindless brutishness. Much better to keep up the defences outside work and to avoid letting go the reins on the harnessing collar put on free imagination. Leisure time, if there is, is used to engage in exhausting activities so as to leave place, if one finds calm eventually, to nothing else but the wish for sleep.¹⁷⁰³

To sync into the rush of sense impressions so as to stay adapted, especially if subjective leeway is restricted and attention has to remain relentlessly transfixed, may actually be experienced as helpful by the person. At one factory, workers protested against noise reduction measures taken at their workplace because the continuous background din helped them to keep up their vigilance directed towards a screen.¹⁷⁰⁴ The vanishing of customary ambient noise levels was experienced not as an improvement but as an additional source of stress. In fact, the way in which the economy of sense perception and motricity is being managed may be an important tool in constructively acquitting oneself of the job at hand. To keep at bay a possible invasion of thinking and to stay insensitive is for some people one step towards staying on top of things.¹⁷⁰⁵ Perception is invoked to sideline representation that could leave its traces on inner maps in ways

too painful to be countenanced. Aggression, sometimes artificially induced by the company's management to enhance output, has to be marshalled and channelled into speed and motricity.¹⁷⁰⁶ Interruptions, if they occur, call to mind the precarious nature of established equilibria. This is one reason why times of rest prescribed by a doctor are often seen as a threat to the status quo and the ability to bear the depersonalisation required at work.¹⁷⁰⁷ Far from being a phenomenon restricted to a relatively small number of pathological cases, Dejours believes that what psychosomatics calls *pensée opératoire* concerns potentially most of the workers he encounters.¹⁷⁰⁸ The difference to the cases studied by Szewec, Dejours argues, is that in Szewec's view a disposition is needed that turns people into 'voluntary galley slaves'.¹⁷⁰⁹ In those investigated and documented by Dejours, '*pensée opératoire*' is something that is related to the workplace and which disappears once the situation there changes.¹⁷¹⁰

The costs of maintaining defensive shields

The functional shield kept up at work will also have to be negotiated when a parent returns to a home with small children.¹⁷¹¹ On such occasions, a potential zone of play, desire and curiosity is brought into contact with zones of self-effacement and inhibited aggression. The way this is being handled will have long term consequences. Sometimes, traditional ways of doing things are called into question and have to be abandoned. Dejours recounts the case of Mr. A., an Algerian man, aged over 40, who had been working in the building industry for about 15 years. He was earning about 1.000 Euro per month, left home at 5:45 and came back at 20:15. When he came to France he had to leave his wife, with whom he had six children, behind. The marriage was one of mutual choice, not arranged in traditional manner by the parents. He talks of his wife and children with great tenderness. For many years he had been saving to make it possible for his

wife and children to move to France. When he finally managed to accomplish the transfer of his family, they had another child. Then he fell sick.

Various possibilities of inter-psychic and interpersonal conflicts were explored but did not yield promising material. What finally emerged was that the amount of feeling he had for his newly arrived family had caused an inadaptation to the asperities of his workplace and the type of person he needed to be there. He found that he could no longer keep up his defensive shield and at the same time permit himself to be tender at home. Mr. A. managed to change his place of work from the building site to a place of small commerce. He regained his health and evidently thrived. The balances in his life had become manageable again,¹⁷¹² the reverse outcome of the alternate possibility in which the job is kept but the affective register at home severely curtailed. In such a case, children may learn quickly to give the parent the wide berth he/she so patently requires - defensive strategies thus have a pernicious tendency to be exported.¹⁷¹³

Although not every patient has a work related symptomatology, it is instructive to understand these manoeuvres of self-effacement radiating from the job. They appear to be the defensive measure of choice in other cases as well, when analysts see patients seemingly incapable of grasping the transformational potential of the encounter. At times the patient only shows a vivid response to something that interferes with the frame of the encounters, an incident often involuntary on the part of the analyst.¹⁷¹⁴ In such a situation the analyst can adapt as best as he/she can, modify the *cadre* or confront the violence contained in the mineralising attempt directed towards him.¹⁷¹⁵ For this he needs an approximative assessment of the forces at work in the patient.

Dejours, in a recent contribution, points out that it took many years before a public debate between perspectives focusing on the clinic of work and those focusing on psychoanalytic psychosomatics was able to take place, on the topic of fatigue, in 2004.¹⁷¹⁶ There, one of the points of divergence was a contrast in the assessment where to locate the root of the trouble: would one rather see hyper-activism as something of a personal problem or rather as something closely related to the structure of the workplace people need to adapt to?¹⁷¹⁷ Based on his clinical experience with a patient whose illness was the result of improper treatment to which he was enticed by a criminal medical network and whose mental situation was much improved by treatment,¹⁷¹⁸ Dejours raises the question whether reduced mental functioning might not be the consequence, rather than the cause of somatic illness.¹⁷¹⁹

Splitting as core of a third topic

Dejours observes that there are neurotic patients who regularly make use of non-neurotic defence mechanisms.¹⁷²⁰ If suppression were to be regularly pointing towards a non-neurotic character structure, this phenomenon should not occur. Discerning in a patient excitement not tied to meaning, one might be tempted mainly to give interventions that provide a protective shield against it.¹⁷²¹ The goal then would be to avoid a crisis that might draw the rug under a patient suspected of dangerously lacking in structural robustness.¹⁷²² This, Dejours points out, is not the only way to view things. Dejours believes that Freud's concept of a split in the ego - according to which a patient might function in two different modes mutually out of touch with each other has not received attention enough in psychosomatic theory.¹⁷²³ Yet, it is a challenge to bring splits in the subject into relation with the topographical maps sketched out by Freud. How can one conceive of two different modes of mental functioning within the same subject?

The amental unconscious

In his third topic, Dejours works with the assumption that there are two different sectors of the unconscious.¹⁷²⁴ In one sector neurotic repression has worked and material of a sexual nature keeps pressing into the preconscious. The other sector is the product of violence on the part of the parent(s) exercised against the thinking capacity of the infant.¹⁷²⁵ It corresponds to mute zones of the body excluded from the infantile erogenous body.¹⁷²⁶ Since its development took place outside thinking, Dejours terms it *l'inconscient amental*.¹⁷²⁷ It does not produce mental activity. When activated by events, it spawns disintegration of the Me and goes to compulsive behaviour. Whether this activation takes place depends on the quality of compensating arrangements taken by patients in their lives. Quite possibly, for prolonged periods of their lives, their amental unconscious will rest mute.¹⁷²⁸

What is bolstering the dyke put up to provide a barrier against the amental unconscious is an implementation of *opératoire* thought.¹⁷²⁹ In a “normally” functioning individual the dyke put up against the amental holds and the subject appears to be reasonably well adapted. The question of the relative size of these 'territories' situated on either side of the split is of considerable consequence. Although there are zones of the amental in everyone, the question is how extended they are in comparison to the remaining part of the personality, in which ordinary repression keeps up a reasonably functioning dynamic.¹⁷³⁰ Is there enough of an erotic body left to hold out against the mute traces of violence if life takes a difficult turn?¹⁷³¹

There is a zone of heightened sensibility of the unconscious (*zone de sensibilité de l'inconscient*, as suggested by Michel Fain)¹⁷³², which is a psychic territory in which the two compartments of the unconscious converge in contact with outside reality.¹⁷³³ It is not possible to experience the

territory beyond the dyke directly, but it may become accessible so in an encounter with reality.¹⁷³⁴ Potentially traumatic stimuli arriving there impact on layers of the preconscious doing its best to ring-fence the amental: its only strong bulwark is denial.¹⁷³⁵ If this line of defence does not hold, decompensation threatens. The psychotic will hallucinate, while those for whom their character forms a rigid fortress, will channel it, bypassing the mental apparatus, into a corporeal reaction.¹⁷³⁶ In cases where the breach is not too massive but containable, the perception of it may be processed after the event.

In a way, one could say that reality has provided an 'interpretation' from outside of a particular state of excitement in the body after the lifting of denial in the encounter with reality. This 'interpretation', which works directly on a perceptive level and involves the sense organs, is different from the analytic interpretation, which (in principle) passes by words only...¹⁷³⁷

At the end of this process the repressed unconscious has absorbed new material. Further encounters with reality will be able to draw on already established memory traces.¹⁷³⁸ Finding yourself doing something you would not have done in your dreams will provide food for thoughts. Little by little territory may be won from the amental by displacing the dyke so as to increase the zone of the neurotic unconscious.¹⁷³⁹

If this encounter is too unsettling but can neither be repressed nor rejected, the response will have to be forged in the register of violence.¹⁷⁴⁰ This may range from strategic aggression against unbearable parts of reality to violent, uncontrollable fits. In other cases in which all resistance to reality is deemed to be futile, a vehement suppression of all motions of violence takes place, leading sometimes to moments of stupor or more long-term channels of somatisation.¹⁷⁴¹ If excitation remains unbridled it will trigger mental confusion detrimental to the psychic

apparatus. There may also be sexual co-excitation, with the erotic element a passenger on a ride offered by violence: interpreting only the erotic element will not effect much.¹⁷⁴²

Dejours avails himself of the explanatory potential of his 'third topic' to differentiate between phenomena that bear a certain resemblance to each other but present with important elements of divergence. Thus, the discourse of a socially well embedded paranoid person may bear a surface similarity to the *opératoire* one. What distinguishes them is the amount of passion involved in paranoid reasoning, reaching peaks of exasperation it does not have in the *opératoire*, for whom the ultimate defence is in his character.¹⁷⁴³ Paranoiacs make use of hypertonic operational thinking, while the classical mode of *pensee opératoire* is rather hypotonic.¹⁷⁴⁴ In the latter, there is less agitated pressure from the amental. In case of crisis, pressure is directed towards the body so that the split can be maintained: the pathological character at the height of the crisis can appear not only quite normal but calm, gentle and settled.¹⁷⁴⁵ Behind this camouflage, the violence at the root of the decompensation stays hidden.¹⁷⁴⁶ Once it is routed into corporeal responses, it will shape the future handling of crises.¹⁷⁴⁷ What was originally a breach has turned a safety-valve.¹⁷⁴⁸ There is the likelihood it will be used again.

We should however bear in mind that defensive strategies always form a whole: although one particular mode may predominate, others can be used as accessories in a complementary fashion.¹⁷⁴⁹ Dejours very much doubts that defences can be classified according to personality types,¹⁷⁵⁰ and *contra* Marty, maintains that marked neurotic and psychotic structures do not necessarily protect from somatisation and from resorting to acts that bypass the preconscious - which constitute a defence open to all.¹⁷⁵¹ Defensive strategies will be embedded in the social and built on what was acquired in early childhood.¹⁷⁵² This will play out differently depending on job choices: fighter pilots have better chances than labourers in the construction industry to tap into childhood fantasies.¹⁷⁵³ The social stage at which inner resonances can be sought and found takes

different shapes depending on the structure of the work field,¹⁷⁵⁴ or constraints of gender roles in a particular environment.¹⁷⁵⁵ Sublimation or suppression of desires are 'choices' intimately linked to the nature of the job and the space for self-realisation it permits.

The amental - a reservation of the pulsion de mort?

There are close connections between the amental and the *pulsion de mort*: the amental forms a reservoir of lethal potential: it is closely associated with the compulsion to repetition;¹⁷⁵⁶ violent in nature, it attacks all binding capacity. This push towards deadly dissolution bypasses the elaborative channels of the preconscious along lines untouched by desire.¹⁷⁵⁷ External violence is resorted to so as to counteract the looming disorganisation of thought.¹⁷⁵⁸

Alternatively, relief may be sought by resorting to the exercise of sense perception in compulsive ways, a recourse unpropitious to sublimation.¹⁷⁵⁹ Since the amental cannot be fed into thought, the subject is driven to find in the outside world a situation that somehow offers a form - unattainable inwardly - to the motion he/she is currently experiencing. This does not create anything new, a result which is hardly noticed because there is little lasting memory of these acts.¹⁷⁶⁰ Satisfaction by perception does not destabilise the splits under the shadow of which it blossoms, and usually receives the benedictions of society, which does not feel threatened by it: it is also an innocuous activity for children whose parents would respond aversely to unbridled fantasy.¹⁷⁶¹

There are other ways in which society lends support to the inner balances of the person who cannot respond more personally to the challenges posed by the moment: it provides thoughts ready-to-use, loaned from the social imaginary of the times (*'pensée d'emprunt'*), which fit in

well enough to patch up the gaping absence of a response that would mobilise the subject more fully.¹⁷⁶² Once the link between the amental and the trappings of the social imaginary has been formed, the relative gain has to be propped up by an arrangement continuously bypassing thought.¹⁷⁶³ The subjective is put into abeyance, in a move that, for Dejours, does not partake of passion but owes everything to compulsion.¹⁷⁶⁴ If the split holds, a certain measure of normality can be maintained.¹⁷⁶⁵

Dejours takes care to differentiate this from Laplanche's '*pulsion sexuelle de mort*'.¹⁷⁶⁶ He defines *sexuel* as any activity actively engaged in or submitted that aims to increase within the body sensual effects of excitement.¹⁷⁶⁷ To this he contrasts cases where death is not the possible outcome of lust, but of a compulsion that lashes out against a body deserted of the power to experience the sensation of itself: a reaction *in extremis* against the terror to watch on as subjectivity slips away and what is left is hurled into an abyssmal fall down into a body '*sans pulsion*'.¹⁷⁶⁸ There is a third possibility: somewhere along this tumble into nothingness, sexual co-excitation may kick in, which will turn the free fall into something capable of ascension.¹⁷⁶⁹ In spite of this possible liaison, Dejours insists on the fundamental difference between *pulsion* and *compulsion*, maintaining that the latter always takes its force from the cold, the empty, the de-vitalised, which nestles in flawed erotic maps of the body.¹⁷⁷⁰

The gendered distribution of suffering

Domestic life, as we have seen, plays an important part in a person's overall balances. The way erotic love tends to more permanent arrangements has important consequences for identity, narcissism and sexuality and will entail a distribution of roles in looking after shared affairs.¹⁷⁷¹ Since these roles will not be identical for the two partners, the relationship will take place within

a force field of inequalities aggravated by corresponding problems in socially established gender roles.¹⁷⁷² Love hearkens back to childhood, in which care, attention and attachment in asymmetrical relationships of authority were closely linked.¹⁷⁷³ This will bring into play questions of domination versus submission.¹⁷⁷⁴ The one who submits will accept a lion's share of the domestic workload and this, in a heterosexual couple, will normally be the woman.¹⁷⁷⁵

Paradoxically, the sensuously erotic also activates zones of alienation that are difficult to seize for sociological theory. They are recalcitrant to the work of thought even in psychoanalysis.¹⁷⁷⁶ Increased self-love founded on the ability of the body to experience pleasure (and give pleasure) with a concomitant heightened sense of autonomy in the erotic register perplexingly reawakens questions of dependence on the other and his/her gaze.¹⁷⁷⁷ With the *pulsion* to get a grip on things/the other entering into play,¹⁷⁷⁸ some actively seek out a partner whom they can manipulate or make the object of their cruelty, giving rise to a tyrannical relationship.¹⁷⁷⁹ To make the other subservient to one's need is also a means to keep the upper hand vis a vis one's own amental.¹⁷⁸⁰ The split they keep in place prevents them from feeling any culpability about this: the stability of the arrangement depends on the capacity not to think conveyed by it without even having to repress (in the sense of *Verdrängung*).¹⁷⁸¹ Alliances may be formed which grant both partners the feasibility to bolster up their splits, resulting in uneasy equilibria between need and desire.¹⁷⁸²

Although, in principle, the positions may be reversed between the partners, this is not likely to happen: relationships tend to stabilise into inequality.¹⁷⁸³ Being exploited at the work place for a woman thus may be exacerbated by being subjected to the domination of her spouse in a relationship which, though it may have originated in an erotic encounter, has settled down into the dreary humdrum of self-demeaning dependency.¹⁷⁸⁴ This state of affairs is more often denied

by the man, whilst acknowledged by the woman. Since denial is frequently integral part of the collective defensive strategies of men at work, this is complemented by a similar denial of any dependence vis-a-vis the spouse.¹⁷⁸⁵ This denial protects the husband from a potential, painful loss of composure.¹⁷⁸⁶ Suffering is always sexed both in the family and at work.

Dejours builds on the difference between sex and gender acknowledged in the work of Laplanche.¹⁷⁸⁷ If gender is a social construction, it yet becomes part of the '*vie d'âme*'¹⁷⁸⁸ in a process of creative self-appropriation.¹⁷⁸⁹ Assignation, as widely discussed in feminist literature, in Dejours' view, is the sum total of all messages transmitted to the infant on the matter of gender identity.¹⁷⁹⁰ An essential conduit to the child is formed by mothering, something into which a considerable amount of work is invested by the mother, understood as maternal work by Jane Messer.¹⁷⁹¹ Jane Messer, taken up by Dejours, emphasises the discrepancies between what a mother would like to feel, what she ought to feel and what she tries to feel, and the burdens this places on her.¹⁷⁹² Dejours thinks that the psychoanalytic take on the sexual is considerably enriched by the concept of assignation, which provides an angle that might turn out to be more Freudian than Freud's own social theory.¹⁷⁹³

As Dejours observes, at the workplace the social should not and cannot be reduced to the sexual.¹⁷⁹⁴ If a young woman, as in a case he presents, wishes to have a differentiated relationship to men in her personal life but does not want to be dominated by men in her social life, it would be a mistake for the psychoanalyst to interpret this as simply a phallic demand.¹⁷⁹⁵ Not yet 20, Mlle Mulvir refuses to give up her passion for electronics but, in order to do so, has to adopt strategies to blend in at her workplace dominated by men.¹⁷⁹⁶ Certainly, the psychosexual conflict needs to be addressed. But the analyst also has to learn to understand when developments in sexual identity are threatened by the psychodynamics of the workplace.¹⁷⁹⁷

Work as the second arena central to self-fulfilment

Since identity has two mainstays of self-fulfilment in love and in work, inquiries into one cannot be separated from those into the other.¹⁷⁹⁸ Dejours traces Freud's thinking on work: If one defines work as an activity of production/ in services there is little to go on.¹⁷⁹⁹ Yet, work can never be a factor neutral to a person's self esteem and mental balances.¹⁸⁰⁰ It puts a person into contact with a reality independent of his/her wishes that resists attempts at mastery.¹⁸⁰¹ It is from the clash confronting a subject with concrete material at hand with that new shape arises.¹⁸⁰² This is an intermediary stage Freud leaves out of consideration.¹⁸⁰³ There are two stages: one of experiencing a setback in the struggle with the task, one of rising up to the challenge in finding new ways of dealing with it in making use of one's body.¹⁸⁰⁴ Interposed between the two is dream life in which the relationship of the body to the world is being reworked.¹⁸⁰⁵

In most cases, work will require a cooperation with others, the results of which cannot easily be predicted.¹⁸⁰⁶ Work, Dejours suggests, provides people who look back on a chequered history of erotic encounters with a second chance to find out what they are, can become and can reach out for.¹⁸⁰⁷ Failure to be recognised on this important social field, one's mettle tested,¹⁸⁰⁸ is bound to be a source of destabilisation and will put an additional strain on the domestic arrangements of the individual. There is the continuing paradox of a double centrality of work and love in the unfolding of a person's life.¹⁸⁰⁹

If things go wrong, both the legacies of childhood and the hazards of life at work contribute to the *mêlée*. It stands to reason that the individual will go to any lengths not to be pushed against his/her own limitations. A split in the personality, as we have seen, is maintained for

protection.¹⁸¹⁰ To choose a socially recognised occupation grants social legitimacy to partitioned off impulses.¹⁸¹¹

Mental erosion as a cumulative factor in nefarious arrangements

Dejours emphasises that the real world is a permanent challenge to the individual: it consistently resists comprehensive description and is recalcitrant to being mentally provided with a handle.¹⁸¹² Tradition provides various resources that bring perception and symbolisation to bear on the task.¹⁸¹³ From this repository of techniques, various defensive strategies to deal with the exigencies of work place are collectively cultivated.¹⁸¹⁴ To be socially accepted at the job, one has to be seen to be a co-player in the performance of their implementation.¹⁸¹⁵ They might range from enforced superficial conviviality to pouring manly derision on the physical risks at the work site.¹⁸¹⁶ While these are ploys to maintain a cheerful front, they also perpetualise situations that produce the very tensions they are charged with ritually to keep in check.¹⁸¹⁷ Tributes to a mandatory can-do mentality, they work like an anaesthetic that permits the subject to keep obscure to him/herself the causes for his/her suffering and to reject out-of-hand any need for change.¹⁸¹⁸

To make things worse, social zones of relatively relaxed informal exchange between employees are increasingly regulated away and pushed off the premises.¹⁸¹⁹ It is the resulting compartmentalisation of suffering, shut off from finding ways into expression, that is apparently among the causes for an increasing number of work-related suicides in France. This includes suicide by highly motivated and qualified members of staff driven to despair by the cynical power play at work, acts of desperation that do not fit easily into socially acceptable narratives.¹⁸²⁰ The subject that does away with himself/herself may well want to preserve

subjectivity in one final expression, while the person who delivers what is required, in order to do accomplish this, may have to do away with his/her own affectivity in a prescribed *mode opératoire* that leaves little emotional resonance with one's own sources of pleasure.¹⁸²¹ suffering, without resonance, becomes inaudible and invisible, even to oneself if deprived of any conceivable audience as a court of appeal.¹⁸²² In this perspective normality becomes an enigma: how do people at work manage to resist its constraints and ward off decompensation and lunacy?¹⁸²³

Dejours is able to show that superficial epithets like 'professional hyperactivity' may hide more than they reveal if not backed up by careful investigation of the particular circumstances encountered by the patient concerned.¹⁸²⁴ In quite a similar manner, one must suppose, the *mode opératoire* has to be carefully placed in the total life situation of the person numbed by it. This may be of particular importance because there are indications that work places select people whose foibles and weaknesses pre-dispose them for the defensive strategies required there.¹⁸²⁵ The biographically grounded personal *opératoire* and the socially functional *opératoire*, one has to conclude, must liaison to maximise the effect of defensive mindlessness. On the whole, Dejours seems to be interested in forms of suffering which, at first glance, do not strike as conspicuous ('*dans le registre du bas bruit*')¹⁸²⁶ but constantly trickle into increasingly strained containers, wearing down long-accustomed resistance, incrementally reaching ever higher levels of the as yet just but hardly bearable.¹⁸²⁷

Akrasia facilitated by a split

For all of this, the maintenance of a fundamental split in the subject is indispensable:

This split which traverses the whole of the psyche [*l'appareil psychique*], including the unconscious, installs in the functioning of the soul [*dans le fonctionnement psychique (ou "animique")*] the fundamental possibility of a duplicity which is perhaps the fundamental problem left behind by this trajectory between sexuality and work. The human being is double. In the name of work, of productivity and of rentability, people can be led to provide support to acts which they morally disapprove of. And they do not always enter into crisis, in spite of the flagrant contradictions ... [with] their intellectual and moral commitments in the private sphere.¹⁸²⁸

The weakness of will - *akrasia*, according to the ancients - incapable to do anything about this is accompanied by intellectual sloth making use of slogans to hide behind, which again serve as a collective screen of defence: 'Things are like that', 'It has always been like this', 'there is no choice', 'we must be realistic'.¹⁸²⁹ This simple device permits to maintain the split without too much effort and to live both as a moral being as an opportunist, and - thanks to this - in 'good health'.¹⁸³⁰ Apparently, for the subject thus stabilised, it would not do at all to get unduly curious about things: what exactly would be the use of that?¹⁸³¹ In Dejours' assessment, the *opérateur* becomes a superb tool of staying on course without being too much bothered about how one manages to achieve this and warding off any need for change.¹⁸³²

Métis: applied social intelligence as an act of covert infiltration

While various exertions like hyper-virility,¹⁸³³ submission,¹⁸³⁴ and even feminine competence as such,¹⁸³⁵ or self-irony,¹⁸³⁶ grant only limited protection in the long run, there is a manoeuvre, which, given minimal opportunity, manages to infiltrate social intelligence into sometimes oppressive external conditions: Dejours, reminds his readers of the ancient Greek word *métis*: the cunning which dares to trust one's implicit experience to deal with emergent situations for which

official regulations provide no guidance at best, asking for the total suffocation of common sense, at worst.¹⁸³⁷ It is an intelligence

constantly in breach with norms and reglementations, it is an intelligence fundamentally transgressive. It is at the heart of what one calls *métier*: this is *métis* or "cunning intelligence" ["*intelligence rusée*"] of which Detienent and Vernant propose an analysis based on sources in everyday life of Ancient Greece.¹⁸³⁸ ' it subverts [official reglementation] for the purpose of work and in order to attain objectives by using more efficient procedures than the strict implementation of prescribed modes *opératoires*.¹⁸³⁹

This very much seems to bear a family resemblance to a '*subversion libidinal*' adapted under the conditions of the work-place.¹⁸⁴⁰ Engaging in it is a way not to go *opératoire* in a psychoanalytic sense.¹⁸⁴¹ Ambiguous signals of the hierarchy about what really counts are creatively decoded so as to unlock new territories of movement which enable experience that can *post festum* be re-introjected to increase subjectivity.¹⁸⁴² This requires spaces that can be opened up, if needs be covertly, and made 're-permeatable' for subjective agency to introject - one might say with Ferenczi - and not just to incorporate.¹⁸⁴³ If this can be fed into social communication, work, though linked to suffering, will be instrumental to the expanding of subjectivity.¹⁸⁴⁴ Where this is not possible, suffering is increased.¹⁸⁴⁵ The psychodynamics of work, as a discipline attempts to throw light on actions that help to transform suffering by reintroducing creativity into social space.¹⁸⁴⁶

As we have seen, Dejours puts what has been discussed as *opératoire* into a larger context. There is a story to be heard about mental erosion, though the subject may be at pain to find ways telling it. In the next chapter we shall see Jacques Press focusing on the destruction of frameworks

needed for the individual to make sense of his/her own experience and how psychoanalysis may help or hinder this process.

Chapter Fourteen: Bridges: Jacques Press

Jacques Press, in different ways from Christophe Dejours, takes up the consolidated discussion to expand into new territory. Both the psychoanalytic encounter and the frame are central to his perspective, which, in its own way, sheds new light on the *opérateur*. We shall follow the various strands of his contribution by starting with an important event.

When presenting one of the two key reports at the 68th *Congrès des Psychanalystes de Langue Française* in Geneva in 2008, Jacques Press,¹⁸⁴⁷ gave to his paper the title *Constructions with and Constructions without End*,¹⁸⁴⁸ a contribution that ultimately was to form the nucleus of his 2010 study.¹⁸⁴⁹ One of the vignettes he used by way of illustration sketches the case of a young woman, who, towards the beginning of her analysis, reported a dream. She was in a holiday home together with her lover. He announced to her that there was another woman in his life. She took revenge by grabbing a hose to douse him with water.

At a first glance, the motif of oedipal rivalry and a phallic element imposed themselves. Following up on the patient's associations, however, Press noticed that things took a different turn. After the vacation the young woman was planning to change her professional orientation. She had been to her new place of work, which had reminded her of a Third World hospital, sending a ripple of echoes through her mind. She herself came from a family of Maghrebinian immigrants, was born in the Third World, and had had to be taken to hospital when her parents had confided her to the care of her grandmother. The memory of the distress she had experienced then was still very much with her. Every time she was reminded of it she was close to tears. Interpreting the sexual content of the dream, Press reflected, would have obscured the memory

of being abandoned, which had made use of hallucinatory wish fulfilment to mask the underlying traumatic trace.¹⁸⁵⁰

Marty revisited

This way of looking at things, while it does not flatly contradict, yet diverges from the way of clinical assessment systematically laid out by Pierre Marty in the Seventies and Eighties. Taking our cues from that blueprint, we would have expected to see some careful probing into the patient's degrees of mentalisation so as to understand whether the patient could safely be treated in psychoanalysis. In more than twenty years of practice, Jaques Press, however, not without struggle, has arrived at a different path of interpreting his theoretical heritage, by paying close heed to the variation introduced by Michel Fain and Denise Braunschweig, digging into the lasting legacy of the Freud-Ferenczi debate and articulating his findings in a sensibility honed by his reflections on Winnicott - just to mention three main lines of the trajectory documented in the considerable creative wealth of his written output.

Ferenczi: the Me assailed by early trauma

For the sake of presentation these threads have to be somewhat artificially disentangled. With the above vignette in mind, it is easy to see that Ferenczi might be stimulating. Press points out that Ferenczi leads us to think that every inscription in the psyche could have two faces: one turned towards figurability, the other turned towards trauma and immediate discharge.¹⁸⁵¹ For adaption to reality to take place, territory of the Me has to be ceded and parts of a hostile, alien world have to be introjected.¹⁸⁵² This leaves memory traces that bear the scars of these early processes, but which the forces of Eros strive to employ for their own ends:¹⁸⁵³ partial self-destruction gives rise

to a more robust mode of being.¹⁸⁵⁴ Press draws our attention to the fact that in delineating the infant's interactions with his early objects in this way Ferenczi provides a more generalised form of what, a few years later, he was to isolate as pathological identification with the aggressor.¹⁸⁵⁵

Ferenczi, as Press reminds us, recognises three factors that dramatically overburden the early capacities of the child: in addition to abusive sexual seduction he mentions passionate, punitive sanctions, often meted out by an adult foaming with rage [*die leidenschaftlichen, oft wutschnaubenden Strafsanktionen*] and the terrorism of suffering, in which the child is engulfed in the drama of a close relative.¹⁸⁵⁶ To protect itself against conditions to which it cannot as yet respond alloplastically, by changing its surroundings, the main line of defense has to be autoplasmic action.¹⁸⁵⁷ Rather than giving up all links to the object, the personality relinquishes its cohesion and splits into a “wise baby”, shielded in early maturity against adult passion, and another, traumatised part, which keeps its proximity to it in raw form.¹⁸⁵⁸

In Press' view, it is in this rift created that an identification with the aggressor installs itself, stitching together disparate parts of the personality, and permitting anaesthesia of affects.¹⁸⁵⁹ Reinforced by the reign of silence imposed by adults, the child unconsciously takes upon itself the unavowed guilt of the aggressor.¹⁸⁶⁰ Without the sustained inner relationship to the mad object, Press concludes, the patient fears to lose all his/her bearings and to sink into an abyss of unspeakable distress.¹⁸⁶¹ The traumatic becomes the measure of all real passion, sometimes leading to a veritable addiction to it.¹⁸⁶² A harsh superego is set up against this, which, on closer inspection, seems to be borrowed from the aggressor. Steps taken that threaten its severity are not experienced as welcome relief but rather perceived as a collapse threatening the Me.¹⁸⁶³ In the rift between *the wise baby* and the traumatised part, repressive mechanisms borrowed from the environment take hold.¹⁸⁶⁴ Membership to the social group is maintained by a shared

identification in denial that ensures the unspoken rule of silence.¹⁸⁶⁵ In this situation, the analyst has to be particularly attentive to who is doing the talking: is it the patient himself/herself or is it an implant, which functions like a core of the actual (in the Freudian sense) around which the personality has constructed itself, a grain of sand both traumatic and indispensable.¹⁸⁶⁶

As is well known, Freud strongly took exception to Ferenczi's 1932 paper.¹⁸⁶⁷ Jacques Press traces the subterranean effects of Ferenczi's thinking on Freud's later work. He follows Ilse Grubrich-Simitis in regarding Freud's *Moses and Monotheism* as the central piece of Freud's continuing auto-analysis in his later life, at a time at which the spread of vitriolic anti-semitic hatred in German speaking culture, his illness and his aging, pushed him to revisit inner places of early trauma.¹⁸⁶⁸ As Press points out, Freud hardly published anything between May 1933, the death of Ferenczi, and January 1936, although his letters to Arnold Zweig, in this respect almost a second Fliess, reflect the intense inner interrogations of Freud at the time.¹⁸⁶⁹ Beginning with his work on *Moses and Monotheism*, to which his letters to Zweig contain early references – indicative of both the turmoils and the deep personal significance of its production¹⁸⁷⁰ – there is a new version of Freud's approach to trauma. Running like a strong thread through Freud's later thought, it shows several points of engagement with Ferenczi's work, as if Freud was continuing the discussion with his deceased friend and pupil.¹⁸⁷¹

The obliteration of shared memory as a point of reference

In trying to come to terms with the lasting legacy of Moses, Freud also grapples with how to arrive at a sufficiently truthful construction of what has left an impact but has to remain beyond the grasp of individual memory.¹⁸⁷² Press finds the approach of the German Egyptologist Jan Assmann highly conducive to a contemporary understanding of the problem: What are the

traumatic events that have led to the cultural memory focused on Moses?¹⁸⁷³ With Assmann, Press finds them in the suppression of polytheism by Akhenaten, whose memory in turn was obliterated after his death. What remains of these traumatic upheavals has crystallised around the figure of Moses. Whereas Moses is a figure of cultural memory but not of tangible history, Akhenaten is a figure of tangible history, but not of cultural memory.¹⁸⁷⁴ In understanding Moses as an Egyptian, Freud shows that a price had to be paid for establishing a culturally formative distinction. Press writes,

To link the Egyptian origin of Moses to the sources of antisemitism, as Freud does, constitutes therefore a terrible affirmation: not only is there the Other (the Egyptian) in the Me (the Jew), but that which founds the Jewish identity and which conveys to it its unique and specific character is the very quiddity of the stranger.¹⁸⁷⁵

Assmann's thesis on the "Mosaic distinction", separating the true God from the idols, and his followers from the gentiles, has raised an animated controversy.¹⁸⁷⁶ Though constituting echoes from intellectual battle grounds somewhat removed from the psychoanalytic session, these debates furnish an apt reminder that we are often dealing with nuances: 'division' and 'separation' are expressions a thesaurus of synonyms might yield - together with 'damage' - under the entry 'split'. Consulting, in a slight change of emphasis, on the other hand, the entry 'distinction' might direct the reader to 'difference', 'judgment', 'perception', 'separation', 'discernment' and 'discretion', concepts not intrinsically alien to 'individuation'.¹⁸⁷⁷ Ferenczi, in a fragment, indeed postulates that intellect only emerges from suffering of a traumatic nature, linked, he seems to suggest, to a memory that springs from psychic scar tissue.¹⁸⁷⁸

Assmann, Press contends, throws an important light on a psychoanalytic understanding of trauma when he underlines that an event only becomes 'experienceable, communicable, and

memorable' by frames of experience based on everyday culture and in a dialectical relationship with the social imagination and the practice of memory enshrined in it.¹⁸⁷⁹ When Akhenaten did away with traditional religion, the symbolic universe in which the average Egyptian found his/her moorings was shattered.¹⁸⁸⁰ Since Akhenaten's successors proscribed his memory, paths towards a reconstructive imagination were obstructed:¹⁸⁸¹ 'only the imprint of the shock remained'.¹⁸⁸² Press is particularly intrigued by a passage in the French edition, which is missing from the English edition,

Hence, traumatic experiences are characterised by the incapacity of the framework of pre-established cultural meaning to grasp them.¹⁸⁸³

Understanding the traumatic legacy of the Amarna period, Assmann, while taking a fresh turn, integrates, as he points out, contributions by Benedict Anderson on 'imagined communities', by Maurice Halbwachs on 'collective memory' and 'affective communities', by Ernst Cassirer on 'symbolic forms', and by Aby Warburg on culture as a phenomenon of memory.¹⁸⁸⁴ Press, receptive to Aby Warburg's thought,¹⁸⁸⁵ is most concerned with the effect on the individual.¹⁸⁸⁶ If, as in Egypt, a plague strikes at a time when the cultural frames of reference have just been shattered, the conjuncture will be traumatic.¹⁸⁸⁷ The traumatic character of the event is reinforced by the systematic suppression of all visible traces until, in the end, there is not even a reminder of its suppression: only the shockwave, bereft of a frame, subsists, witness to the 'economic' dimension of trauma.¹⁸⁸⁸ A veritable attack on linking, in Bion's sense of the term, has occurred.¹⁸⁸⁹ As for the child, it is easy to see that trauma touches it preverbally at a narcissistic and bodily level, before the sexual comes into play.¹⁸⁹⁰ Press, as we have seen, takes particular interest in cases in which a non-event did not leave an 'inscription' in the psyche.¹⁸⁹¹ In its wake there remains a gap, a trace of a non-trace, which leads Press to think of Winnicott's reflections on the non-integration of an experience of break-down.¹⁸⁹²

Vicissitudes of defence and self-preservation in a deficient environment: waste-disposal at risk

Both Ferenczi's and Winnicott's work, Press points out, provide elaborations of what Freud had recognised as worthy of investigation in *The Introductory Lectures* but did not pursue in any systematic fashion either then or after the major turn of 1920, when in *Beyond the Pleasure Principle* he introduced the *Todestrieb* (in French: *le pulsion de mort*): the destiny of the *Selbsterhaltungstrieb* (in French: *pulsions du Moi*, in Strachey's translation: self-preservative instinct).¹⁸⁹³ These proved to be both more fragile than Freud had initially envisaged and, to an important extent, dependent in their development on the qualities of the environment.¹⁸⁹⁴ Is it safe enough for the child so that it will not strive for early autarchy at all costs?¹⁸⁹⁵

While Freud in 1913 assumed that in normal development libidinal impulses were in advance of the impulses of the Me, his take on things in 1924 postulated a prior sway of the *Todestrieb*, which in many respects had taken over conceptual territory once held by ego impulses.¹⁸⁹⁶

Implicitly, the ego impulses now appear in two guises: on the one side we find the *Todestrieb* expressing a tendency of the Me to refuse radically everything that is 'not-Me', on the other side we find ego impulses tied to the workings of the libido engaged in sustaining life.¹⁸⁹⁷ Winnicott, as is known, had slight regard for the concept of the death drive.¹⁸⁹⁸ This dissent in principle notwithstanding, we can observe that he arrives at an analogous result by a different path: it is the incapacity of the environment that produces the kiss of death to the potential of the individual.¹⁸⁹⁹ As with Ferenczi, the deficient object for Winnicott is not necessarily absent.¹⁹⁰⁰

What fails to happen in the early relationships may be as important as any actual event.¹⁹⁰¹ Press evokes Winnicott's suggestion of a difference between unintegration and disintegration.¹⁹⁰²

Haunted by what did not arrive at its own good time, leaving in its wake unintegration, the

subject tries to protect itself against distress by actively pursuing the path of disintegration.¹⁹⁰³ Since the way to regression under the circumstances is fraught with dangers, withdrawal, in place of regression, becomes the default fall back position.¹⁹⁰⁴ If a meaningful passivity is to be reached it has to be painstakingly built in treatment first.¹⁹⁰⁵

Coming to Winnicott from a long-standing engagement with the thought of *IPSO/EPP* analysts,¹⁹⁰⁶ Press is struck how much the work of Michel Fain and Winnicott on the dawn of the psyche is mutually enriching for the reader and in resonance with the other's lines.¹⁹⁰⁷ While Fain focuses on indispensable experience in absence of the object, Winnicott's emphasis is on indispensable experience in presence of the object, both perspectives arguably complementing each other.¹⁹⁰⁸ It was when re-reading Fain's '*Prélude à la vie fantasmatique*' that he more fully began to realise, as he says, the importance of Winnicott's 'Fear of breakdown'.¹⁹⁰⁹ What Fain conceives of as a distortion in the Me appears with Winnicott as a false self, built in defense against a deficient environment, congealed in a response pattern likely to reappear in treatment.¹⁹¹⁰ If as, Fain once remarked in one of his seminars, the *opérateur* patient is the equivalent of the zero level of countertransference,¹⁹¹¹ Press finds clues in Winnicott to understand more fully how this could be seen as a re-enactment of an early environment in urgent demand of a better solution.¹⁹¹²

With Winnicott, Press believes that the subject has to develop the capacity to make use of an object. For this to happen the subject has to experience that it is safe to expose the object to an attempt of destruction.¹⁹¹³ Press turns to reflections of Winnicott's, published posthumously, to understand possible obstacles: when is the non-use of an object an act of hatred and when is it an automatic attempt to protect the object? There are cases when an imputation of hatred would not only be far off the mark but could be seen as an act of retaliation on the part of an object feeling

threatened.¹⁹¹⁴ In one of his last papers, *The use of an object in the context of Moses and Monotheism*, Winnicott situates the rise of offensive impulse at a primordial stage, earlier than frustration, the reality and the pleasure principle.¹⁹¹⁵ Permitting this to develop into a workable liaison, Press points out, requires of the analyst not to take this move as destructivity.¹⁹¹⁶ 'Let me learn how to say no so that I can say yes', may well be a spark of hope buried in the cinders of negativity¹⁹¹⁷: aversion has to be discovered as a possibility before desire can be given a chance. Following Winnicott, Press suggests repetition compulsion should be seen in conjunction with a failure in the proper constitution of external reality in the aftermath of the survival of the object.¹⁹¹⁸ In this case 'waste-disposal' - as Winnicott terms it - is obstructed,¹⁹¹⁹ something Press links with Freud's reflections on the protozoa that can rid themselves only insufficiently of the products of their own metabolism and in the end die from the mounting accumulation of them.¹⁹²⁰

The analyst put on the spot: the need to discern what is missing and to hear what cannot be said

Press had established himself as a doctor of internal medicine, before, in his forties, he effected a complete turn of professional orientation, trained as a psychoanalyst and set out on a second career.¹⁹²¹ It comes as no surprise, therefore, that he takes special interest in Ferenczi as a somatising patient.¹⁹²² Looking at what we know about Ferenczi's life, the correspondence between Freud and Ferenczi and that between Ferenczi and Groddeck, Press sees evidence of a somatisation process of increasing severity under the weight of Ferenczi's own trauma and of the perturbations of his relationship to Freud.¹⁹²³ Where Freud emphasised rivalry, discounting love, Ferenczi emphasised love, discounting rivalry.¹⁹²⁴ In absence of the possibility to work this through with Freud, the unattainability of love and mutual understanding remained like an open wound.¹⁹²⁵ In this crisis, Ferenczi's latent homosexual position, which had served as a protection

against the traumatic early object, no longer worked as a protective shield, a development that was unsettling his inner economic equilibria and exposing him to grave somatic dangers, which in the end, Press is inclined to think, cost him his life.¹⁹²⁶ It was an impossible choice: He could follow Freud and thereby give up things he could not afford to lose, or follow the rebellious and unanalysed, yet creative part in himself and thereby forego all anti-traumatic protection provided by Freud. Faced with this stark a dilemma Ferenczi may quite possibly have lost hold on the wish to exist altogether in his desire to preserve what seemed essential to him.¹⁹²⁷ Perhaps, Press argues, Marty's take on what happens when vital structure disintegrates, should be complemented: there are instances when a subject gives up on life in order to conserve something essential, something dyed into the very fibres of his/her individuality. At times 'one can die from a desperate effort to stay oneself'.¹⁹²⁸

What is to be done in difficult cases like this? Press picks up Fain's remarks about the importance of *femmelité*, a life-preserving quality, which, according to Fain, precedes even the mythical rule of the tyrant of the horde.¹⁹²⁹ An interpretation given from this position works, Fain argues, not because it transmits knowledge, but because the patient comes under the spell of the illusion of which it is but a token. In this promise a secret message, emanating from the patient, has been received and translated – a sign that the analyst has succeeded where the builders of the Tower of Babel have failed.¹⁹³⁰ If such an interpretation followed the lost language only a mother would comprehend, could this not go some way towards repairing what was missing in early interactions, exchanges that forced a brittle maturity on an infantile self for which it was as yet woefully ill prepared?¹⁹³¹

Press follows cues of Fain's: What is the echo in psychoanalysis of an event that did not take place?¹⁹³² Press argues that to be receptive for this requires modifications in the way the analyst

is listening: free-floating attention may not be enough.¹⁹³³ Since the analyst is used to working with fantasies, he/she will be looking for what is latent. It is more difficult to be receptive for what is manifest without meaning, a nucleus of the actual.¹⁹³⁴ Offering silence as a response does not work well, because it can too easily be taken for indifference.¹⁹³⁵ What is required is a quality of presence tangible to the patient – a 'body to body' of the psyche into which enter not only the tonality of the language but also every physical particularity of the analyst's presence in the session.¹⁹³⁶ It is not just the preconscious of the patient that might be said to have a certain depth, but the echo zone in treatment that grants access to sensations as yet undigested by thought.¹⁹³⁷ To the extent that this develops, the cure of words can gain a foothold.¹⁹³⁸ If, as Michel Fain once said, there are patients to whom it is important to show how little things self-evident to them should really be taken for granted but, rather, 'are making one wonder' (*ça donne à penser*), there are moments, Press suggests, at which cures have to proceed per *via di porre*, adding to what has already taken shape in the patient.¹⁹³⁹

Sometimes things have to happen in external reality first so that the patient can make important steps in coming to terms with the traumatic.¹⁹⁴⁰ By not insisting to differentiate himself/herself from the patient, but becoming the medium against which an image can gradually gain shape, the analyst underwrites a bill of rights for the patient to exist.¹⁹⁴¹ It is of particular importance to be highly attentive at moments when the patient inwardly takes leave of the analyst and waxes numb or dumb and which interventions, on the other hand, bring him/her back to life.¹⁹⁴² Presence and absence of the analyst need to be brought into a dialectical relationship, just as the enabling ground of receptive passivity needs to be complemented with an *élan* reaching out towards the patient but secure in its own framework.¹⁹⁴³ Press is attentive to how discontinuities within the flux of stimuli are necessary for the good functioning of the psyche.¹⁹⁴⁴ It is such

discontinuity that protects, together with the tough skin provided by deadened outward layers of the psyche, the mental apparatus.¹⁹⁴⁵ Periodically the unconscious

stretches out feelers, through the medium of the system Pcpt.-Cs., towards the external world and hastily withdraws them as soon as they have sampled the excitations coming from it.¹⁹⁴⁶

For some patients an analyst insisting too narrowly on the rules of the trade seems to offer a blank relationship in *opératoire* functioning which does not address the patient's basic needs in treatment.¹⁹⁴⁷ Fain believed there was the danger a person whose mental structure had not evolved might feel mortified by the encounter with the analyst. Press turns this around: should it not rather be the analyst who feels this mortification in being insufficiently equipped to help?¹⁹⁴⁸

Psychoanalytic psychosomatics: towards finding a frame for the encounter

In keeping with his general thrust, Press is skeptical of Marty's push to establish psychoanalytic psychosomatics as a medical discipline geared towards an objectifying approach and intent on garnering a sufficiently robust mass of hard data.¹⁹⁴⁹ Although Marty's clinical practice centred on the importance to find the patient wherever he/she was to be found,¹⁹⁵⁰ the classification he promoted as his scientific legacy carries the considerable risk of lodging the deficit too one-sidedly in the patient, reifying his supposed structure and thus keeping him/her at a supposedly safe distance.¹⁹⁵¹ There is the constant danger of finding too much comfort in classificatory elements or time-hallowed conceptual formulas, '*prêt-à-penser*'.¹⁹⁵² 'Have you ever', Press repeats de M'Uzan's metaphor, 'tried to put a cat [alive] into a [stationary] shoebox?'¹⁹⁵³

Not only is the diagnostic attribution of structural deficit fraught with danger, the imputation of defensive behaviour on the part of the patient is no less likely to miss its target if the experience against which the patient is supposed to be defending against has had no previous chance to

constitute itself properly.¹⁹⁵⁴ In the worst possible case the analyst's classificatory push becomes the instrument by which '*une pure culture d'instinct de mort*' is installed in the sessions: as with a mother ill-adjusted to the potential of the child, everything still on its way towards becoming significant is being put on mental tranquiliser in non-receipt.¹⁹⁵⁵

Working with theory: a paradigm or a model?

Press is intrigued by Michael Parsons' reflections on re-finding psychoanalytic theory in day-to-day work with patients in a process of discovery for which the cognitive grasp on a certain set of propositions is only the starting point.¹⁹⁵⁶ Work on theories implies work on the difficulties in everyday practice, a process that requires coming to terms with the countertransference when our expectations are being confounded.¹⁹⁵⁷ What he commends in a case presentation by Marta Calatroni is evidently the triple objective he is used to setting himself: establishing contact with the patient, gauging his/her psychosomatic status and at the same time engaging in the first opening moves of an approach that keeps close to the actual needs of the patient in his/her state of disorganisation.¹⁹⁵⁸

In his own personal take on theory, Press differentiates a paradigm from a model. While a paradigm gives voice to a new intuition, a hunch of how things could be connected, it organises thought but does not turn it into a fully fledged system.¹⁹⁵⁹ A model tries to go further, striving to dot the i's and to cross the t's, so as to offer comprehensive cohesion.¹⁹⁶⁰ Marty's new paradigm established a correlation between the effacement of mental functioning in a *vie opératoire* and the onset of somatisation: not anxiety as such would lead to somatisation, reduced mental space, however, would. Therefore the better one mentalised, the less one would be liable to somatise.¹⁹⁶¹ To spell this out, Marty proposed a model that was hierarchical, suffused with vitalism and

monism, and which in its linear take on evolutionary processes, its third conceptual pillar, looks, Press points out, dated today.¹⁹⁶² Lines of development that look clearcut in a model may not be so at all in clinical reality.¹⁹⁶³ We may, indeed, at times encounter cases in which the model proves deficient but the paradigm continues to be useful.¹⁹⁶⁴ To prove its central thesis in the world of hard data, Press argues, double blind research would have to be conducted on large, representative samples constituted without any bias of selection, observed on a long-term scale, while at the same time taking appropriate measures to exclude the distorting work of factors not under investigation – a gargantuan task, certainly beyond the reach of present day psychoanalytic psychosomatics.¹⁹⁶⁵

Press learned from Marty that trauma might lead to the effacement of a given psychic function rather than to traumatic neurosis¹⁹⁶⁶ resulting in a psychic economy that does not follow the blueprint of neurosis but does not fit easily into the register of borderline disturbances either.¹⁹⁶⁷ In dealing with this, it is important what kind of regard is accorded to what appears not to be there. We have to be particularly attentive to factors we would expect to be in evidence, but which are not, without losing sight of our possible relationship to this condition.¹⁹⁶⁸ This may determine whether any openings to future developments can be found.¹⁹⁶⁹ What resists treatment the most, Press suggests, is also a potential source of creativity¹⁹⁷⁰: where there is a grain of sand there may, ultimately, be a pearl that will surround it. Press draws on the work of the British social anthropologist Jack Goody to point out that our bewildered consternation may be a useful beginning: it shows that a difference has not found a frame useful enough to give rise to a productive potential.¹⁹⁷¹

Influenced by his own patients, his understanding of the *opératoire* has changed over the years.¹⁹⁷² In 1995, when he discussed the concept of suppression, he started with Marty's finding

of 'secondary gaps in the preconscious' and in his case vignette in the same year considered this a precursor of a *vie opératoire*.¹⁹⁷³ In later work he was much more cautious and discernibly shied from making too sweeping statements: in using the term *vie opératoire*, he conceded, there was a risk that it could be used to lift from the analyst the burden of difficulties he was encountering in his/her counter-transference.¹⁹⁷⁴ With Winnicott it was not too difficult to see another dimension to this: in his take on 'fear of breakdown' this state is bereft of any psychic representation and is not analysable as such.¹⁹⁷⁵ As long as this flight continues, precocious splits in the self are perpetuated.¹⁹⁷⁶ Ancient internal borders, set up to hem in breaches of containment, may have provided temporary fixes, but also reduce the space within which the Me can move freely. It is in better understanding the economic plight of a split Me that Press would now expect to see clues emerge on the impasse of *opératoire* functioning.¹⁹⁷⁷ That is why zones of potential mental collapse specific to each analysand have to be carefully investigated.¹⁹⁷⁸

Reflecting on Henry James' *The Beast in the Jungle* Press points out that a subject exposed to mental destructivity from outside may respond with effacement.¹⁹⁷⁹

The incapacity of the partner to respond to this [their] demand does not lead to a reaction of active destructivity in them, but rather to a silent extinction, a physical destruction, which constitutes the exact counterpart of the psychic destructivity at work with their vis-à-vis. There occurs a phenomenon of resonance between an enclave of non-psychisation in the subject to which corresponds in the interlocutor an enclave characterised by unbound destructivity.¹⁹⁸⁰

In the work with patients who learned not to trust their early environment it is important to be mindful of their need to keep an inner place of refuge that is, however, constantly exposed to the vicissitudes of the person's life.¹⁹⁸¹ To constitute an inner zone of withdrawal can be vital.¹⁹⁸² Treatment may easily be experienced as a threat to their core of identity. This puts them under

pressure to act out, or if this way is blocked, tension will be channelled into the body.¹⁹⁸³ Often the analytic process has to put together a holding frame true to the pleasure principle so that then experiences located in any case outside of it can be addressed.¹⁹⁸⁴

Only by way of patient work on the constitution of a frame, ancient distress can be faced and find a chance to turn into something to which traits of the enigmatic can be restituted.¹⁹⁸⁵ Press believes this way of looking at things is better suited to an understanding of what he had hitherto treated under the term suppression (*répression*).¹⁹⁸⁶ In recent work he deals with the resulting problem under the term *impasse*, which beyond a merely structural diagnosis, opens the perspective for the subjective trajectory of a person finding him/herself in dire straits with scant means at disposal and limited space for manoeuvre, in a situation in which words only seem to add insult.¹⁹⁸⁷ If words there can be none, the body is likely to bear the brunt.¹⁹⁸⁸

In one of his contributions, Press focuses on a group of patients whose strong inner investment in their jobs masks an underlying frailty of their narcissistic economies.¹⁹⁸⁹ The elation they experience if and only if things go their way works for them like the ingestion of anti-depressants.¹⁹⁹⁰ The equilibrium thus achieved, is however utterly contingent on external factors, continued accommodation to which consumes all their strength.¹⁹⁹¹ Yet, there is a knowledge that this state of relative success will not last – outspending their resources they are running on borrowed time, trying to put off a major crisis that sooner rather than later is bound to happen, but which so far has not found a framework to be safely addressed.¹⁹⁹²

Social anthropology, again, provides useful insights to Press: Marshall Sahlins' concept of the 'structure of the conjuncture'¹⁹⁹³ leads him to reflect on the situational attributes of an encounter in which mutual expectations are being frustrated, but from which a new structure might well

emerge in a violent clash of perspectives, given the chance.¹⁹⁹⁴ The meeting between analyst and patient, to some extent, resembles that between cultures alien to each other.¹⁹⁹⁵ Its meaning, which emerges in the conjuncture, can create surprising effects.¹⁹⁹⁶ This encounter will reverberate in the countertransference of the analyst, shaking his sense of identity.¹⁹⁹⁷ Diffuse tension, where it occurs, first has to receive a frame suitable to transform it into pain with borders circumscribed enough to provide more discernible contours to what is narcissistic and what is object related, separating the two in the experience.¹⁹⁹⁸

A complement to the First Topography: elements of a General Theory of Trauma

In accordance with strands of thought within the *EPP/IPSO*, the Second Topography is not regarded as simply having superseded the first but both topographies are seen as complementary.¹⁹⁹⁹ Press points out that the atemporality of the unconscious seems to be an achievement rather than a given.²⁰⁰⁰ If the mental apparatus is not differentiated enough, the traces of trauma are apt to disturb profoundly the perception of temporality and libidinal rhythms articulated in the outstretched antennae of the unconscious tentatively venturing into degustation.²⁰⁰¹

While Jean Laplanche, drawing on Freud and Ferenczi, proposes a Theory of General Seduction to account for the vicissitudes of *pulsion* and desire in the individual,²⁰⁰² Press leans towards the late Freud.²⁰⁰³ As he emphasises, we can assume that there exist inscriptions in the body that do not belong to the psyche but exert an influence on it.²⁰⁰⁴ There is always a traumatic background against which early psychic development takes place.²⁰⁰⁵ It needs an irritating grain of sand, Press points out, around which the pearl of conscience can grow.²⁰⁰⁶ What if this grain of sand has not constituted itself?²⁰⁰⁷ What is left in its place is a black hole that acts like an internal foreign

body, which for all the constant irritation it inflicts, evades mental grasp and pushes the subject towards perception rather than representation.²⁰⁰⁸

If we follow Freud's line of thought on Moses in the light of Assmann's recent work, Press argues, there is an alien element, a stranger and quintessential other, both present and buried within the constitutive separation from the pots (and gods) the country of slavery: an Egyptian to whom, paradoxically, the distinction from the world of Egyptians is owed.²⁰⁰⁹ This finds some correspondence in psychoanalysis: only if the patient is able to face up to the stranger in him/herself, the implanted grain of sand, around which the personality went into construction to safeguard survival, can change take place.²⁰¹⁰

The emergence of the intimate between the traumatic and the formless

In his preface to the Hebrew edition of *Totem und Tabu* Freud writes,

If the question were put to him [the author]: 'Since you have abandoned all these common characteristics of your countrymen, what is there left to you that is Jewish?' he would reply: 'A very great deal, and probably its very essence.' He could not now express that essence clearly in words; but some day, no doubt, it will become accessible to the scientific mind.²⁰¹¹

There is something just beyond the grasp that is, however, closely related to a person's deepest sense of self. Press evidently believes that Freud returns to this very essence in question for his construction work on the role of Moses both in his own life and the life of his people.²⁰¹² It may be a 'historical novel', 'a great image on feet of clay' and yet contain a core of historical truth necessary to throw light on current experience.²⁰¹³ Not only can the archaic only be revisited in

retrospect, it may well be that it never existed in archaic purity.²⁰¹⁴ If successful, construction has a counter-traumatic effect remedying to some extent what could not take place earlier.²⁰¹⁵

Winnicott, Press observes, managed to express deep ideas in simple, everyday language.²⁰¹⁶ Press, recently, has followed the example, leaving behind the customary density of French argumentative and expository prose to render account of his thinking in somewhat different terms, couched in language much closer to Christopher Bollas²⁰¹⁷ than to either Michel Fain or André Green. Although this may not be in contradiction to earlier work, it offers an appreciable amount of rephrasing, providing new echo zones to previous thought. A significant part of psychoanalytic work, he now says, is to bring the unknown, the intimate and the formless into play and mutual interaction.²⁰¹⁸ The intimate - the way a person has constructed his/her own identity and history - has two faces, he argues: one turned towards the traumatic, the other opening to formlessness.²⁰¹⁹ Formlessness, in his view, can be seen as another name for 'drive', a drive as yet in quest of a transformational object and of potential expression: chaos results from the failure of or defeats in transformation, in the absence of transitional form within reach.²⁰²⁰

Perhaps coincidental to this change of register, Press has in recent years used Walter Benjamin's reflections on the task of the interpreter to express his understanding of what is happening in psychoanalysis.²⁰²¹ The translator always works with what remains refractory, Press points out.²⁰²² In continuing to exist in the new form of the translation the original is being changed.²⁰²³ This is why a translation of great works can never be definitive but has to be taken up afresh generation after generation, because it contains, as Press says in reference to Bion's thought, unsaturated elements.²⁰²⁴

Transmission is easier if a theory does not appear too saturated, a danger that has been a recurrent risk in Marty's classificatory scheme.²⁰²⁵ It would be a great achievement, he says, if our theories indeed managed to be sufficiently incomplete.²⁰²⁶ If they are not, institutions can be relied upon to inject a dose of entropy into any wish to break out of the mould, just as the bad Fainian mother would plant the kiss of mental death on her child by surreptitiously smothering it in forceful calm.²⁰²⁷ He believes it is absolutely necessary to arrive at an inter-fertilisation [*métissage*] of theories²⁰²⁸ but also to permit the encounter with the patient from the patient outside our own culture of reference shake the foundations on which we enter into it.²⁰²⁹

Press is aware how much countertransference goes into making theories – he happily confesses himself the problem patient of the theories he is holding²⁰³⁰ – but also has a sense how much a particular theory gives voice to the intellectual 'background noise' of a period, in which it is rooted as if it were the navel of its dream.²⁰³¹

Trauma: general or specific, visible or invisible?

It has been pointed out that Press joins Winnicott to build a general aetiology on the universal occurrence of primitive agony suffered in precocious trauma.²⁰³² And, indeed, there is that: in his thinking the inchoate seems to be ever present waiting to disturb what has been considered successfully shored up.²⁰³³ Yet, Press also reminds us that Freud believed cases involving a traumatic core had better chances of treatment.²⁰³⁴ This would show the continuing importance to have a specific theory of trauma for a more limited number of cases alongside a general theory of trauma, a question which Press, however, does not pursue. To some extent, Press approaches early trauma in the way desire is handled under the auspices of the First Topography, its

existence assumed unless proven otherwise. Seen this way, the hypothesis of early trauma would be a paradoxical generator of hope where else there might be little or none.²⁰³⁵

There seems to be a catch, though: as Press himself concedes, there is no guarantee, early processes detrimental to the subject have left a residual awareness of what has been done to it.²⁰³⁶

the psyche may have been undermined by something that touches it and alters it while it is not able to preserve the traces of this [intervention], not even in negative form. ... These modifications are not inscribed in the *psychisme*, but will modify the way in which this will treat further experiences to which it will find itself exposed, to the extent it has undergone a deformation, not only in complete ignorance, but also any possibility of knowing.²⁰³⁷

Apparently there are some poisons that escape notice.²⁰³⁸ What would the analyst find, if he/she, as Press suggests, were to take upon himself/herself to be in the present the object in charge of accumulated deficiencies?²⁰³⁹ To some extent the situation bears a resemblance to the dilemma facing political firebrands past and present: if agony is rife among the populace, and an ardent desire is spreading to break the yoke, then a decisive turn of events may still be possible. But what if things are grinding on in their own miserable way, unpromisingly but stably?²⁰⁴⁰ When Fain metaphorically spoke of the dark fairy sitting at the head of the newborn child's cradle he did not necessarily imply that this would register as agony with the child.²⁰⁴¹ As fairy tales are apt to teach us, the complications following from such an untoward early presence will make themselves felt, though the visit as such may not. They are likely to entangle the subject in a string of strangely inexplicable repetitions of misfortune weaving a web of misery.²⁰⁴² People drawn into this will have difficulties to transform what is happening to them into stories that make sense, clinging to limited damage control in an attempt to pre-empt any need for more substantial transformation.²⁰⁴³

On the traces of Georges Canguilhem, the eminent French philosopher-physician, Michel de M'Uzan reminds us of an old medical treatise on illnesses that are dangerous to cure²⁰⁴⁴ because a cure would fatally destabilise the patient. Press, when he takes a patient in treatment, is confident that old woes left unwrapped in thought, can be brought to a salutary crisis within the framework of the sessions.²⁰⁴⁵ While one of the goals of Marty's classification was to provide orientation on whom *not* to take into psychoanalytic treatment, lest this endanger the patient, Press' implicit general theory of trauma provides not a guide on counter-indications to psychoanalytic treatment, but daringly turns things on their head: it is not so much the structure of the patient that, for all the traps it offers, puts treatment at risk, but the mental and emotional unreadiness of the analyst exposed to it.²⁰⁴⁶ There are certainly patients for whom analysis is counterindicated: in most cases they are those who do not ask for it.²⁰⁴⁷ The problem is complex, emerging from the lay of the land, as it were, as we try to gauge it. Press, *via* Winnicott, arriving in territory more usually held by relational psychoanalysis, has to hold what happened in the past for all its severity as less decisive than what may yet happen in the psychoanalytic encounter.²⁰⁴⁸ Since it is only by breaking that the hyacinth bulb sets free its fragrance, as he says,²⁰⁴⁹ how can we, before the event, with any certainty 'smell' the outcome?²⁰⁵⁰ If we cannot be completely sure what the result will be, it is certainly worth trying.²⁰⁵¹

Press seems to be well aware of the magnitude of the challenge. In fact, he is one of the few practitioners who has gone on record with a pertinent question too often left unasked: Discussing the problems of false positives and false negatives in the classification, he raises the possibility that *opératoire* patients seen in private practice, might present with different modes of mental functioning from those seen in an institutional context.²⁰⁵² This points to something essential:

what exactly is the frame of an encounter that has given rise to the impression that the patient in question has but a shallow fantasy life?

Practically all the non-clinical literature which Press draws upon highlights the importance of social processes within a given cultural framework.²⁰⁵³ If, as Press affirms, maternal care (with its discontinuities) ensures the subject can both create and express what already exists in him/her,²⁰⁵⁴ it seems that social conditions very much shape the arena in which the child will find the expressive syntax for these ventures. It is likely that both push and pull factors will have to interact to make this happen. Desire and *ananke* (in Old English *wyrd*, etymologically related to 'becoming') do not enjoy a level play field: subjective anticipation of what has to count as *ananke*, in relation to assumptions shared with others, will determine the space left for desire. The way a patient can make use of his/her own culture to process the as yet formless, may deserve our interest as much as the more established attention to object usage - in particular, if the frames of reference have been mauled beyond recognition.

In this context, the case study Assmann presents is clearly of significance.²⁰⁵⁵ As Press shows, a psychoanalytic session is a new encounter, for both parties, embedded in a reality insufficiently understood by both.²⁰⁵⁶ Yet its presence offers an arena in which past impingement can be revisited in the light of a future that has to be seen with the eyes of the patient before it can be rebuilt. For this, the practitioner has to keep both mentally agile and emotionally present. In private practice, as Press implicitly shows, this may well mean shanghaiing every useful concept within reach into psychoanalytic service while permanently reworking the implications of the psychoanalytic tradition in its different manifestations.

Chapter Fifteen: Conclusion

As Edith Kurzweil pointed out, Pierre Marty's and Michel Fain's work was grounded in early object relations in a manner that made Anna Freudians feel uncomfortable about it.²⁰⁵⁷ Their emphasis on elements outside language was nothing, as we have seen, Lacan at that stage was inclined to look with sympathy upon.²⁰⁵⁸ The way they made the emergence of fantasy contingent on early interactions was unlikely to gain traction with Kleinians of the times.²⁰⁵⁹

Although this did not ease the reception of the group's work abroad, it was a significant contribution to psychoanalysis: it opened a way to suggest new ways of looking at baffling facts, turning them from a vexing obstacle into an enigma worthy of resolution.

Constituting an impediment to a psychoanalytic approach, the *opérateur*, as it turned out, was a fertile concept, but similarly difficult to pin down in one, and only one, location as the psychoanalytic process by its very nature: As Michael Parsons pointed out, in agreement with Samuel Abrams, there has been some variability in the understanding what the term

should be taken to refer to: was it something primarily happening within the patient; within the analyst; in both of them; between the patient and the analyst; or a combination of processes.²⁰⁶⁰

In *Das Unbehagen in der Kultur* (1930) Freud suggests that the person dissatisfied by reality tries to escape from it by fleeing into neurosis, or this failing, psychosis.²⁰⁶¹ The development of neurosis, in this passage, is predicated upon a wish to escape from reality. This high road, French psychoanalysts belonging to the *EPP* thought, may not be the one taken by everyone. In the 1999 film fantasy *The Matrix* the protagonist was given a choice between two pills: take the blue pill

and things continue more or less as they are, take the red pill and another reality will reveal itself.²⁰⁶²

Psychoanalytic reflections on the *opératoire* started with the clinical hunch that some patients had, as it were, taken a different pill from the neurotic, the psychotic or the perverse. They did not want to distance themselves from reality - they fled into the opposite direction, directly into it.²⁰⁶³ Initially, it was thought that this was something enshrined in personality structure, which meant that once this path had been taken, it was difficult to opt out of.²⁰⁶⁴ Taking it would predispose the subject to respond to strain by channelling it into activity and through the body.

Significantly, the emergence of the concept of the *opératoire* attached itself to two areas of life Freud himself did not think were propitious to psychoanalytic thinking, but with which French psychoanalysis, in its march through the institutions, was increasingly confronted with: affections of the body and conditions of work.²⁰⁶⁵ In one of the early responses to the theses of the *EPP*, a Swiss psychiatrist reminded his readers of a passage in Marcel Proust:

It is in moments of illness that we are compelled to recognise that we live not alone but chained to a creature of a different kingdom, whole worlds apart, who has no knowledge of us and by whom it is impossible to make ourself understood: our body. Say that we met a brigand by the way we might yet convince him by an appeal to his personal interest, if not to our own plight. But to ask pity of our body is like discoursing before an octopus, for which our words can have no more meaning than the sound of the tides, and with which we should be appalled to find ourself condemned to live.²⁰⁶⁶

Patients seen by Marty for his investigations were at a low point. It remains uncertain to what extent the encounter with psychoanalysis on hospital grounds, in the presence of a group of

assistants, shaped the manner of their self-presentation. At this stage there is little indication that their previous experience with medical institutions, the structure of interactions they had come to expect there, and the adaptation to this according to their own cultural codes was sufficiently taken into account.²⁰⁶⁷

Yet, there was an element in the psychoanalysts' toolbox which permitted them to make allowances for the particular situation these patients found themselves in: considerations of the inner libidinal economy of a person. To put it bluntly: a person may have been born poor and remained impoverished or he/she may find him/herself momentarily out of pocket at a particular conjuncture. What we encounter in a person showing signs of limited leeway are draining effects, of whatever origin, on a given budget of ways and means.²⁰⁶⁸

This led the debate to be pursued on a number of different work sites,²⁰⁶⁹ separate, yet inter-related by a common reference to the concept of the *opérateur*. Let us, for ease of reference, go again over some major lines of development.

One path tried to re-imagine the world of the early infant: in the version proffered by Fain and Braunschweig, a good early environment was not so much predicated on the mother's abounding love as it was on the oscillation between this and a world full of passion hidden, yet easily intuited, beyond the mother's discontinuities in loving attention.²⁰⁷⁰ Those times the mother's focus was on the infant, it was important what her inner eye saw and how much space this inner perspective left to the real living being on her knees. In a bold theoretical step, the *pulsion de mort* was thought to emanate from the mother, in the manner a cold wet blanket might be applied to bring down heat, so as to reduce the boisterousness of the child when intolerable to the mother.

The time a child was weaned off the more continuous presence of the mother called for counterweights to be in place, making the transition feasible. Among them, speculated Nicos Nicolaïdis, were elements combinable in the manner of the letters of an alphabet, which would furnish building blocks for the child's imagination. While Marty was interested in the fluidity and depth of the preconscious, this approach, in addition, was looking for the range of permutations supported by the mother's culture, a potential that could only be accessed once a certain distance to the dyad could be established. Structure, in this view, does not self-replicate: what is handed down is the variability of expressive means that has to be made available to the subject as a kind of starter kit to deal with inner and outer worlds.

If the starter kit is of a more rudimentary kind, a more 'muscular' approach to meet the challenges of life will be required, studied in many varieties by Gérard Szvec: in case of tension arising, the subject may wish to fight fire with fire and gear up for action in order to calm down, a preference that will not easily make him/her a likely patient on the couch.²⁰⁷¹ This may have deep roots in a person's experience: sometimes alimentary disturbances in an infant point to very early incompatibilities with the mother's inner worlds, in other cases it is very difficult for a child to develop solid enough aversion against the incongruities it is exposed to.²⁰⁷²

Though this does not work in its favour, the child may be drawn into bonds of identification based on a shared denial of what is happening.²⁰⁷³ Anna Potamianou conceives of ways of forgetfulness that bolster community life.²⁰⁷⁴ In other parts of her work, she takes a deep look at how even hope can go rancid if it has been shorn of all transformative potential. Tenaciously clung to, enkysted hope has become a dead end and may have turned into a retreat offering a holdout against the need for change.

In Potamianou's interest for communal practice there is some point of contact with Jean Benjamin Stora's focus, pervasive in his work, on a cultural dimension in the shared imaginary that determines what a person can or cannot express within its terms.²⁰⁷⁵ There are self regulatory systems embedded in a social and cultural environment, which, if thrown off-kilter, send shock waves into the body.

So far, the picture emerging points towards the *opératoire* as a defensive mode against restricted options, a baseline of standard operating procedure resorted to when other, more fluid means are found to be beyond reach and the Me's territory is under threat. From the outside, it may seem as if the zones of the psyche amenable to fantasy based interaction and dream life have contracted and shrunk so that the inner echo room resonating with events has been diminished.²⁰⁷⁶

This can only constitute a major conceptual challenge if fantasy is regarded as a composite phenomenon and not considered to be rising organically and inevitably from the natural order of things, just like teething. In a major contribution, César and Sára Botella forcefully argue that the ability to give shape to mental life - figurability - is not a given. There is an important proviso: it is the integrity of the holding field that permits inevitable experiences of absence and negativity to perform a creative function.²⁰⁷⁷ To be able to get to this will require the accessibility of the image of a 'double' in early life,²⁰⁷⁸ a development, which if it was impeded early on, especially requires the 'work of the double' in psychoanalytic treatment. Nothing, they reflect, will be as terrifying as having an intense experience which one cannot find any means to give form to.

In this, context does matter: Smadja's emphasis on the economic aspect goes hand in hand with a recognition of the situational context of the *opératoire*, in which in some instances, the subject takes a nap from his/her subjectivity, retiring into a convalescence of being.²⁰⁷⁹

If this is so, earlier work by French psychiatrists after the war exploring the effects of work and the work place on the psyche goes towards showing that convalescence is not always a process supported by the environment in its own demands on the functioning of the subject. Work is a place, Dejours points out, where the individual grapples with a reality that resists, though the subject will look for wily ways of adaptation that leave room for creative practice. It is also a part of life that, if radically split from other compartments of a person's life, is likely to fortify zones of the a-mental, the unthought, armoured in temporal layers. While there are sources of vitalisation to be had at the job, there are apparently also sources of devitalisation, a 'dementor's kiss' for those willing or frail enough to accept it.²⁰⁸⁰ 'Dead on arrival' as a phenomenon may appear in the consulting room, there will be a story to it, which the subject may not have been able to wrap his/her brain around.

Having taken stock of some major lines of developments of the *opératoire*, it is time to face difficulties that have been lurking in the margins.

A similarity between the opératoire and responses to survivors' trauma

The way the person in *opératoire* mode is described he/she might well be a deeply traumatised soldier escaped from a war we know nothing about but which we suspect, from where we stand, is deeply weird. Jonathan Shay describes the strange way Vietnam veterans he encountered conducted some of their conversations:

Civilian friends and family members may be by turns bewildered, amazed, bored, and then annoyed by veterans' ability to talk with each other for hours on end about details of weapons that they used, of the contents and texture of different C rations..... The speech rhythms, the jargon, the technical minutiae are the only doorway a veteran finds into the rooms that they carry: Farmer, the veteran of the brown water Navy we met above, once spoke at length in group therapy about the 20mm cannon in the turret of his boat....The language of weapons, of the military setting, was his doorway into the traumatic material of his friend's maiming.....²⁰⁸¹

One might say that in the example above endless repetition of trivia of material culture, shared in a community of remembrance, held deposits of raw experience, which, against all hope, were in quest of a possible transformation. Jonathan Shay found access to this by reading Homer on the inner injuries left by war, a source that was not in the mind of his patients but which worked like a bridge to connect to what previously had seemed beyond comprehension.²⁰⁸² Alain Fine once pointedly asked whether the psychosomaticians were the facilitators of legends for the patient population,²⁰⁸³ and perhaps there are cases in which it is imperative the psychoanalyst connect to a story line that can keep a balance between accessibility and required distance.²⁰⁸⁴

Marion Michel Oliner has pointed out a striking similarity between *opératoire* thinking and responses to trauma:²⁰⁸⁵ the intermediary zone where external reality and unconscious fantasies are integrated has been impaired in its functioning.²⁰⁸⁶ In contradistinction to Shay's Vietnam veterans, who talk about something that can be localised in history, we may be at odds to discern concrete traumatic events that have led to this state.

As with clinical work on the aftermath of trauma, it emerged that numbness, to some extent, was partial.²⁰⁸⁷ Fain, followed most systematically by Christophe Dejours in this, has pointed out that

there is a split inside the patient between the person who knows and the person who does not know. In a parallel development, Claude Barrois, having extensively worked with soldiers, has described three possible responses to mortal danger: severe depressive breakdown; alternating episodes of depression and the narcissistic illusion of control; and, finally, a split in the subject in combination with partial denial. The last solution shows some similarity to what the *EPP* has described as *opératoire* coping mode:

The subject accepts to have already died and becomes a dead man walking, reduced to bare automatisms of self-conservation, alimentation and [routine] everyday actions. In war, this is the combatant competent to a fault, [highly] professionalised, but whose every desire, every feeling have been expelled. This leads to a split [...] the future development of which is problematic: once the danger has passed, will the subject be able to retrieve his live double capable of desire? This split is in fact very different from psychotic and perverse splits.²⁰⁸⁸

Significantly, Barrois reserves prognosis: were it to be pronounced, it would be tied to a vector into highly unknown futures. What he does not have to be uncertain about, apparently, is the person's past. This is an advantage we do not always have. Smadja sees the *opératoire* as a possible second stage after traumatic devastations, put into place for its analgesic function, so as to permit the individual to conserve his/her forces.²⁰⁸⁹ If so, and it is indeed part of a combat mode, the narrative of the war in which it is being employed has often been effaced.²⁰⁹⁰

If this comparison is valid, and it very much seems it is, it underscores the view emerging from various strata of the discussion that *opératoire* modes do not need a particular personality structure to be put into effect.²⁰⁹¹ Press, among others, makes use of the word *impasse*, which is not necessarily tied to a particular way a person got into his/her present straits, but emphasises the limited options subjectively available in a given situation.

The opératoire as a response affected by a sense of place and available sustenance

If *opératoire* behaviour is a stand on inauspicious territory meant to limit damage, its results are a reminder of the poignant warning 'containers will not fix your broken culture'.²⁰⁹² Something about the place *opératoire* patients live in, for all we know, does not lend itself easily to revitalisation and comfortable enough containment. Christopher Bollas has argued that

People who dislike the area where they live are in a sad state of disrepair, for they are denied the vital need for personal reverie. Each person needs to feed on evocative objects, so called 'food for thought', which stimulate the self's psychic interests and elaborate the self's desire through engagement with the world of objects.²⁰⁹³

Those affected do not appear to have anything to lean back into, once their personal resources are about to get exhausted.²⁰⁹⁴ They seem intent on bootstrapping a sense of agency in ambient conditions that are failing them. In more extreme cases this verges on the attempt to pull oneself out of the mire by one's own hair for want of a better solution. As a defence it is a stop gap measure against an untoward turn of events. Yet, it may have built up over the years as an attempt at appeasement of a world that was not friendly to start with. Just as people sometimes find it difficult to sell stocks they have been massively losing money with, the subject may be loath to leave behind the past - to destroy the past as Bollas puts it²⁰⁹⁵ - *especially* if it was suffused with memories of pain.²⁰⁹⁶

In a sense, the world in which *opératoire* behaviour is felt to be the only possible move has not been made safe enough for Winnicott's ideas, nor does it abound in accessible evocative objects, important to Christopher Bollas.²⁰⁹⁷ In it, proto-psychoanalytic concepts that emerged in the

Romantic movement and which, as Matt Ffytche has argued, have continued to shape the implicit assumptions of major psychoanalytic thinkers on individuality, have to all intents and purposes failed to leave a major imprint.²⁰⁹⁸ Perception is not linked to deep personal meaning steeped in culture, as it is in the contemplation of the cherry blossom in Japanese culture.²⁰⁹⁹ There is a lack of psychic generativity²¹⁰⁰ with the subject largely unaware of what it is missing. It is, Alain Fine believes, the plight of the *opérateur* person that he/she suffers from a lack of the unreal which surrounds the perceived world as a halo of what is not there but enters as a play of the possible.²¹⁰¹ In the mental ecology in evidence, there is some echo of the alimentary disturbances vividly described by Szwec: the 'food for thought' available to the psyche is not sufficient to provide adequate sustenance. It yet has to become clear what might and would.²¹⁰²

For the individual not to reduce his/her impulses to naught, he/she requires living links to others that reverberate in fantasy, stimulated by a sustainable position that is centred and de-centred by others at the same time.²¹⁰³ It seems that to the *opérateur* patient social life does not provide a ground fertile enough to develop expressive form capable of being integrated into viable projects. There is a mismatch between potential space needed and space on offer.²¹⁰⁴ Jean-Claude Ameisen, a biologist, provides a useful image of the complex exchanges needed to thrive.²¹⁰⁵ Cells that are bound into a living exchange with other cells are inhibited in their self-termination programme by virtue of the signals they receive in this exchange.²¹⁰⁶ The ongoing work of the negative, chipping away at the living being, paradoxically sustains form by keeping balances in motion: If not for the self-termination of cells, the human body could not gain or, having gained, retain functional shape.²¹⁰⁷ Cells that refuse to die off if no longer needed, give rise to tumorous growth that brings death to the whole.²¹⁰⁸

In the *opératoire*, balances have become skewed to the detriment of the individual, in ways that may be opaque to the person concerned.²¹⁰⁹ Following Fain, we might conjecture that the baby sent on its trajectory as a future person permanently gifted for *opératoire* options could in its mother's mind represent a recalcitrant cell that refuses to shut down, thus threatening her mental life with tumorous growth.

It might, on the other hand, that in turning poisonous to the psyche, it is the present that retroactively declares the past to be a ground insufficient for a sustainable future to be built on.²¹¹⁰ Jean-Luc Donnet has written about the effects of a changing social landscape on the work of the *Centre Jean Favreau* in Paris, at which the Paris Psychoanalytic Society is offering free consultations and psychoanalytic treatment to patients who otherwise would not be able to afford the cost. New forms of precarisation, he points out, had brought forth 'a form of *névrose de guerre économique*',²¹¹¹ which psychoanalysts have to come to terms with in their offer of a treatment.²¹¹² Apparently, there are deserts of daily life that do not lend themselves easily to narration²¹¹³ and Dejours shows that work, and the way it is organised, plays an important part in this.

It has been pointed out that the present and the past continuously interact with each other.²¹¹⁴ There is also the further crucial influence of the future, as imagined by the subject, on the individual perception of both the past and the present.²¹¹⁵

Cut away the future, and the present collapses, emptied of its proper content. Immediate existence requires the insertion of the future in the crannies of the present.²¹¹⁶

Gregorio Kohon, in recent work, points to Agamben's reflections on the idea of a poverty of experience that appears in Walter Benjamin's work.²¹¹⁷ There are connections in this to Louise

Berlant's analyses of 'impossible' subjective futures, hemmed in by forms of "cruel optimism", in which the subject is in

a relation of attachment to compromised conditions of possibility whose realization is discovered either to be impossible, sheer fantasy, or *too* possible, and toxic.²¹¹⁸

Some of them, she reflects

move towards a normative form to get numb with the consensual promise, and to misrecognize that promise as an achievement..... In the middle of all that, we discover in the impasse a rhythm that people can enter into while they're dithering, tottering, bargaining, testing, or otherwise being worn out by the promises that they have attached to in this world.²¹¹⁹

This addresses the various, sometimes ambiguous, forms illusion may take, an inner perspective which inevitably gives hostages to fortune. While Freud uses 'illusion' as a term indicative of an erroneous assessment of reality, Winnicott's use of the word includes a mother's confidence in her child's future that goes beyond what can safely be ascertained at the moment.²¹²⁰ Not for every baby a mother's fond hopes are enough of a protective shield to make the child world's safe for the experience of aggression and desire.²¹²¹ At a crossroads, one approach will gain the upper hand, shaping the horizons of the future.²¹²² Public representations of pathways open to be chosen colour the perception of future generations.²¹²³ French psychoanalysis has shown a long-standing interest in inter- and transgenerational phenomena and there are some echoes of this in the reflections of the authors discussed.²¹²⁴ In cultures suffused with pain²¹²⁵ transitionality is endangered, benign forms of illusion are nipped in the bud, and there appears to be no meaningful crisis within reach, which, once weathered, might present the world in a new light.²¹²⁶ If this is so, the *opérateur* mode of behaviour is expressive of what Nineteenth Century German scholarship termed the *Sitz im Leben* [literally 'seat in life'], the concrete multidimensional

context from which form (or lack thereof) arises, and in which the life of the *pulsions* must find its setting.

Non psychic reality impacting on the patient

Since the *opératoire* reflects the impact on the psyche of a dynamic reality that is not adequately represented, the lay of the ground creates difficulties for the psychoanalyst who has to discern what is not there, in which way and to what effect.²¹²⁷ This, it turns out, is tricky: what is the difference between links repressed, links effaced and links inexistent? What the difference between denial and complex impairment of the psyche? How would the psychoanalyst know without having an accurate enough picture of the raw forces impacting on the patient?²¹²⁸ Oliner has deplored a tendency towards too exclusive an emphasis on 'psychic reality' in many strands of contemporary psychoanalysis.²¹²⁹ Focusing mainly on what can be mentally digested and put into language would naturally tend to move from the analyst's remit much of what happens in the body and at the workplace.²¹³⁰ Fernando Urribarri in lines written in 1999 regretted that psychoanalysis showed a 'systematic disregard for and exclusion of issues connected with the social-historical field'.²¹³¹ If this is so, there will have to be extra care taken that the analyst does not fall prey to splits between hermetically sealed spheres, a state of affairs, which as Dejours shows, offers a fertile ground for the *opératoire* to flourish.

Fluidity, depth and reliable availability, three attributes Pierre Marty thought were vital to the preconscious, are also important for the quality of intermediary space between psychoanalyst and patient.²¹³² It is, as we have seen, not sensible to talk of an *opératoire* mode without giving heed to the context the patient is enmeshed in. Considered in this way, the *opératoire* addresses a further problem: it is not just within the patient that intermediary space might be lacking, it might

as well be lacking between the patient and his/her analyst. What the *opératoire* person therefore requires is the reconsideration of the analyst's procedures in the face of unaccountably subdued mental life. As Bion once wrote,

I suggest that somebody here should, instead of writing a book called "The Interpretation of Dreams", write a book called "The Interpretation of Facts", translating them into dream language - not just a perverse exercise, but in order to get a two-way traffic.²¹³³

Giving heed to what has been left unserved by frames past and present

Related considerations have led Jacques Press to a radical shift in perspective: the standard operating procedure which robs the patient of a fuller potential is also a dangerous lure to the analyst who has to come to terms with the clash of realities between him/herself and the patient. The early Seventies, as we have seen, brought French psychoanalysts into contact with Winnicott's and Bion's thinking. Building on what has previously established as a link, Press welds French thinking about the necessity of having a frame within which to think, feel and imagine to Winnicott's reflections on the fear of a breakdown. In the resulting picture, it is the crisis that cannot take place for lack of a properly framed interpersonal space that has damaging future effects. Experience has gone missing because a crisis cannot be risked. Negativity under such conditions lacks a containing field. Approaching matters this way introduces a qualifier to the assumption that fantasy life is a given: rather than being omnipresent, it is contingent on a frame. Having to deal with the shattering of frames, French reflections on the effects of absence meet Winnicott's thinking on the qualities of presence.

This fits in with a strong influence of Ferenczi in various strands of French psychoanalysis, another latent point of contact with British Independent thinking²¹³⁴: what has been done to a

person in an asymmetric relationship is very important to the development of his/her inner life. There is traumatic potential submerged in the ordinary, and in adaptation to its requirements, that leads to levels of exhaustion not owed to the repression of latent meaning.

If we follow Press (and the Botellas) on the necessity of a frame, this also means that the contrast to other schools of thought becomes more nuanced: fantasy and representation draw on proto-forms that, given the right frame, can eventually take shape more fully.²¹³⁵ Although interactions precede language in the infant, these are interactions with parents embedded in worlds of language and emotion preceding the child's birth.

With no wish or need to emulate Lacan,²¹³⁶ the French psychoanalysts studied in my thesis, found it easier than Lacanians of the times to focus on the reverberations of action based scenes on inner echo rooms. With undercurrents evasive of language, the individual may or may not be able to navigate this in sufficiently adequate ways.²¹³⁷ The idea of the economical aspect, harking back to Freud, introduced an element that cast doubt on the supremacy of language and symbolic structure, but put the question of transformations firmly on the agenda.

An *opératoire* state, seen in this light, speaks of a crisis of a transformation much needed but stalled for lack of inner and outer means to weather it: As Antonio Gramsci once observed,

The crisis consists precisely in the fact that the old is dying and the new cannot be born; in this interregnum a great variety of morbid symptoms appear.²¹³⁸

Understanding the concrete conditions under which this strange 'interregnum' operates will go some way towards getting beyond the desperate stalemate.²¹³⁹ If this is so, the concept of the *opératoire* also interrogates what the psychoanalyst understands about the different faces of the reality the patient has to live in.²¹⁴⁰ For all we know, Marty's quite un-Hegelian working

assumption of a negative totally unmitigated, of destruction without any recompense, with vital forces draining away, might well be part of the person's reality, as walls are closing in.²¹⁴¹

Finding new interfaces and space of reception

As Dejours' investigations into the world of work has amply shown, stronger connections to research on the social field might quite possibly yield interesting results.²¹⁴² Special care would have to be taken to differentiate situations in which a patient unfamiliar with psychoanalysis is seen in a hospital setting from those in which he/she has already made his/her way to a private practice.²¹⁴³ Surprisingly, there has not as yet been any major systematic reflection in print on a potential 'elephant in the room': presentational differences between patients encountered in dissimilar social frameworks.²¹⁴⁴ Szvec, in a recent contribution, has remarked upon a slow process of separation between the *EPP* and psychosomatic medicine.²¹⁴⁵ If this is so, repercussions on the prevalent use of concepts are to be expected and may already have contributed to the shift of tone, noticeable, for instance, in the work of Jacques Press. Controversies into which framework psychoanalysis is to be inserted lie at the very roots of the splits in French psychoanalysis. Emerging from this, Marty tried to provide one possible answer. The new overall situation, very much changed since the Fifties and Sixties, has quite possibly shifted the discussion markedly towards those patients that are currently seen in private practice.

As previous moorings keep changing, new challenges are developing: Thinking about encounters that inexplicably fall flat is acquiring new dimensions of relevance in Western societies that increasingly have to deal with the aftermath of forced migrations, leading to encounters in which 'mutual dis-articulation' remains a destructive possibility.²¹⁴⁶ When the need to get things done in the face of averse reality is threatening to swallow up mental space, there is the need for a third

who in spite of difficulties may yet be capable to accommodate what is mentally alien to him/her as a host.²¹⁴⁷ Marie R. Moro speaks of the ongoing need to de-centre oneself by working with what one is not familiar with.²¹⁴⁸ The way we do this will connect to our own histories and how we interpret them.²¹⁴⁹ While Marty took interest in West African children uprooted by their mothers' sudden migration from the traditions of a village to a big conurbation, the past decades have made it unnecessary for us to travel far to encounter a similar phenomenon.²¹⁵⁰ People travel to us, many die in the attempt, and survivors carry with them the memories of those who did not make it. As Virginia de Micco has recently (De Micco 2018) graphically written

In this "extreme" situation where the human being struggles to defend his or her own humanity, to maintain, or suspend, his or her own status as "human", we find ourselves confronted with one of the first founding antinomies of the idea of survival: what survives is on the one hand that which does not die but also, on the other, that which does not live. What does not die completely, but also what does not live fully: something that "remains" and resists, but is present in a paradoxical form as the "disappeared", as a lacuna. Survival is therefore, above all, a form of incompleteness which acquaints us with a logic that is not that of loss and mourning and the psychic operations connected to these, but that of disappearance and reappearance, deletion and re-emergence: a paradoxical dimension in which nothing stays dead forever and nothing ever really comes back to life.²¹⁵¹

Lacunae, which we might have preferred not to engage with, begin to claim our attention.²¹⁵² Psychoanalysis, if it wants to stay relevant, is forced to work on a reality in which hope, at times, is a refugee without papers, hiding behind a false wall. To have a professional preconscious well nourished enough to deal with situations seemingly closed in upon themselves, might be worth the occasional step out of theoretical certainties.²¹⁵³

Reading the opératoire as a probe into the permanently difficult dented by the terrain it is employed on

As Fitzgerald and Ryan put it, in talking about attempts to work out solutions for Afghanistan, the 'landscape' always finds a way to speak back.²¹⁵⁴ French psychoanalysts congregating around the *EPP*, in many ways were forced to revisit territory previously held by by French reform psychiatrists striving for a better understanding of the work place after World War II. In doing so they also traversed old battlegrounds of the Freud - Janet controversy on repressed meaning versus traumatic lack²¹⁵⁵ and reached terrain in more recent time held by debates on how to understand 'resilience' and its limits.²¹⁵⁶

What I have shown in my study in some detail is that the concept of the *opératoire*, as it was appropriated by practitioners over decades has, in the process, gained elasticity to work in new contexts, with new angles protective of nuance.²¹⁵⁷ It has proven highly performative in throwing light on the various ways in which mental life is quietly put to death in adaptation to the dynamics of the early and the actual environment. In this development it also bears the marks of the idea of 'the other' - a concept which widely gained traction with Lacan - as it meets the non-Lacanian *pulsion de mort*, understood not as sound and fury but as a silent wasting away.²¹⁵⁸ Shedding some of its initial focus on the patient's structural deficits, it has more recently been extended to address an analyst's difficulties to find shape in what has never been represented in patients who fail to thrive. In this new functionality it has gained potential to link to areas of experience in which social, cultural and work related fields help little to absorb the shock of events.²¹⁵⁹ In its present form it offers a network of linked considerations that we may, with Dejours, understand as a form of professional *métis* [professionally sly moves] developed by a

given group of psychoanalysts so as to tackle situations for which more traditional classifications have been of limited helpfulness.²¹⁶⁰

Delineating what range of concerns a concept comes to address, I have found, helps to find paths through dense argumentative undergrowth of fine differences. In this perspective, although this is beyond the scope of my present work, it would also be easier to compare the *opératoire* with stratagems other strands of psychoanalytic traditions have developed to address analogous situations of conceptual kernel shock.²¹⁶¹ This would shift the emphasis from the unique brilliance a concept may deploy to the amount of stress it can take while accommodating a wide scale of differential factors in practice.²¹⁶² As the French example shows, international psychoanalysis would deprive itself of important resources, if it were to insist on being conducted in linguistically demarcated parallel worlds.

To develop a sense of possible futures on which the past is mute

When a person makes use of things apparently devoid of significance as a prosthesis to keep going, we will be groping for clues what this does to him/her in the inner economy of things. Like the poet's imaginary ear in William Blake's lines⁶

The caterpillar on the leaf/Repeats to thee thy Mothers grief²¹⁶³

we will not only attempt to listen to what we cannot hear, we will strive to listen to what could never have been turned into words because it was not available as an experience at a time when it could have made worlds of difference. It will share its lack of forceful push with the phenomenon ignorance, which, as Bion well saw, is not necessarily a dynamic force working towards change.²¹⁶⁴ If the mother was not able to grieve what the world leaves to be desired, the caterpillar will fall silent, stopped cold in its possible transformation into a butterfly: another

mute fact in a world filled with facts to the brim. Yet, its silence will conserve a past unable to unveil a future, in what the caterpillar does not say about a grief that did not take place to an ear that is not there. What can be made of this? If the patient does not know, there might be the need for an encounter with someone in whom a hunch is developing for what did not happen, where and why not.

- 1 London', Blake 1977[1794], p. 128.
- 2 Dejours 2013b, p. 12 is fairly typical of the usage made of the term in work related contexts: 'The work one is set consists of the objectives that have to be attained and the way by which to reach them, which is named *'mode opératoire prescrit'* or simply task.' The Grand Robert lists the following definitions: 1. *relatif aux opérations chirurgicales*. 2. *Qui concerne une opération (2) [acte ou série d'actes (matériels ou intellectuels) supposant réflexion et combinaison de moyens en vue d'obtenir un résultat déterminé], une série organisée d'actes*. 3. *relatif aux opérations (mathématiques, logiques)*. It is, in its most widespread usage, understood to refer to goal oriented behaviour suited to the job at hand. Dejours shows that there are creative dimensions to it, which is not something Marty, de M'Uzan and David would have wanted to emphasise in their use of the word.
- 3 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 262; on the challenge contained in this observation: de M'Uzan 2009, p. 14.
- 4 de Mijolla 2012b, which covers the period 1954-1964 has as subtitle: 'from one split to the other'. For a comparable stage in American psychoanalysis in the Fifties see: Hale 1995, pp. 257ff.; Hale points (p. 257) to Stone 1954 for a snapshot of the situation: 'in the last decade or two, at least in the United States, any illness or problem which has a significant emotional component in its etiology has become at least a possible indication for psychoanalysis. In its extreme development, this indication includes not only conditions where this etiology is quite well established, but not infrequently, as in the psychosomatic disorders, only reasonably probable.' [he erroneously references this as to be located on p. 593, it can, instead, be found on p. 568]. For the case of Argentina: Plotkin 2010, pp. 121ff. Also see: Zaretsky 2004, pp. 288ff. 339f. A brief sketch of the organisational development of psychoanalysis in France is provided in Fages 1996, pp. 201-203.
- 5 de M'Uzan 2008b, p. 27: '*L'interrogation des internistes portaient sur d'éventuelles causes "psy" dans de cas des céphalgies, de rachialgies, etc....*'
- 6 See de Mijolla 2012b, p. 383.
- 7 See de Mijolla 2012b, p. 36f.; de Mijolla 1995, p. 273.
- 8 See de Mijolla 2012b, p. 38; Fansten 2006, p. 85; Barande and Barande 1975, pp. 143ff.; Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 369; Chiland 1990, p. 185f.
- 9 Cf. Fages 1996, pp. 207ff. Chiland 1990, p. 195 says that diversity in French psychoanalysis is regarded as a '*source d'enrichissement*', something enriching in a non-pecuniary sort of way.
- 10 Annual congress reports focusing on one particular topic debated controversially in its relation to current practice typically run into several hundred pages, a useful look at the output of just one year of the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* can be found in Perelberg 2013. As she points out, 'There is an implicit, at times explicit, dialogue amongst the authors who contribute to each of the volumes', Perelberg 2013, p. 589.
- 11 Dolgopolski 2009, p. ix. Practising an art to disagree is an antidote to another possibility: scotomising each other in perfect tranquillity. Green 1974, p. 119 with evident regret [reflecting on non-communication] writes, 'This would perhaps also permit to look into the problems of communication among analysts. People outside are often surprised that those whose profession it is to listen to patients know little how to listen to each other.' This would also indicate that the art of disagreement, in as much it is practised in psychoanalysis, is something much more precariously placed in its setting than anything Dolgopolski has in mind. Although there is a community of practice, there is not a point of reference transcending it that mandates the practice.
- 12 Cf. de Mijolla 1995, p. 279. As Chiland 1990, p. 188 points out that although there were five psychoanalytic societies in 1980 that did not mean that there were five different psychoanalytic 'schools'. Within there were sub-groups in close cooperation. Affinities between individual members of different societies were often stronger than between them and members of their own society. André Green, for instance, discovered "negative hallucination" in a small study and translation group together with Laplanche, Duparc 1995, p. 148; Urribarri 2008, p. 56fn.1. As Oliner 1988, p. 7 observes, 'Although the French analysts seem to be united in trying to make psychoanalytic theory yield more explanations, they often come up with very different answers. When they disagree, they analyze the problem down to its very foundations; in the course of doing so, however, they draw attention to issues that might otherwise not be considered.'; also see p. 14f: 'French analysts have demonstrated the fertility and malleability of the old by conceptualizing some of the newer concerns in terms of the language of Freud's original theories'. From the mid 1960s Fansten 2013, p. 7 found a solidifying of Freudians and Lacanians into 'parallel worlds', which on the whole, did not engage each other in controversial debate any longer.
- 13 Fain 1998g, at minute 31, states that he believes Lacan had been an opportunity for psychoanalysis in France because of the extremely animated discussions [*discussions violents*] that his work raised. Dana Birksted-Breen and Sara Flanders write, 'French psychoanalysis is unique because the dialectic of its growth and development is specific to the entry of Lacan onto the scene', Birksted-Breen and Flanders 2010, p. 7. Widlöcher 2010, p. 85: 'the movement of the Freudian discovery seems to me to be very directly linked to Lacan. Not because he advocated the 'return to Freud', but, for many, because this return has made it possible to free oneself from Lacanian solutions to questions which, after all, are not absent from Freudian thought'.

- 14 'Faire travailler Freud', as Jean Laplanche famously suggested (Laplanche 1997/1992, p. 395), was possible at a time when 'faire travailler Lacan' was bound to run into serious difficulties if not met with approval by Lacan himself. Christophe Dejours speaks about the importance of having 'access to a culture which permits an intimacy and a veritable dialogue with the *œuvres* which are needed to be able to think alone [*pour penser seul*].', Dejours 2001b, p. 32; also see p. 31. Flanders 2018, p. 56 succinctly states that the master Lacan was pitted against the grand master Freud; Fain 1998g, at 17:50ff speaks of a veritable 'bulimia of reading'.
- 15 Conrad Stein, one of the representatives of the *SPP* present at Bonneval, frankly acknowledges that his relationship to Freud was greatly facilitated by the fact that he was already dead when he, Stein, came across him, Stein 1971, p. 350; cf. Roudinesco 1986, p. 318. Also see Diatkine 2006, p. 247. André Green, looking back, says, 'I had followed Lacan in the name of freedom of thought, and now he was upbraiding me for thinking for myself', Green 1986, p. 9. For the *SPP* its emphasis on being the guarantor of orthopraxis permitted a considerable leeway in matters of theory. Fansten 2006, p. 112, writing about later decades says: 'Generally accused of being a bureaucratic institution, rigid and hierarchical by the other societies, it likes to remind [people] that its rigorism as far as practice is concerned is the precondition for its theoretical pluralism. This theoretical heterodoxy is, according to numerous members of the *SPP*, its trademark, although it admittedly demands to balance this, a certain orthopraxis, which no doubt feeds its [the organisation's] reputation for rigidity and being closed.'
- 16 See Urribarri 2008, p. 55f.; Sechaud 2008, p. 1011; Green 1995b, p. 7f.; cf. Widlöcher 2010, p. 80; Press 2004c, pp. 53ff; Kernberg 1996, p. 160; de Mijolla 1982, p. 85. This, one should add, only worked as long as all participants implicitly held the same assumptions about the discourse to be engaged in. As Sherry Turkle points out: 'During the international conferences at which psychoanalysts meet, American and British analysts describe even the more "medical" French analysts as "intellectual terrorists"', Turkle 1978/1992, p. 217. One can see that what the French were familiar with at the time must have seemed to others like heartless grilling. Chiland 2015, p. 203 in her recollections of the meetings with René Diatkine and Serge Lebovici, who were very important for her, states that the only way not to be steamrolled into silence was to contradict and to find her own way. The gusto with which the new generation of psychoanalysts proceeded was grounded in historical precedent: Henri Ey, who as we shall see in Chapter Three, played a considerable role in the training of the new generation of psychiatrists after the war, was, as Green says, nostalgic of the great, fervent debates in 19th century French psychiatry, Green 1993a, p. 12fn.7. And indeed, what well informed non French observers, like Udo Hock, in writing for an audience abroad, even nowadays find striking is the intensity of the debate, resulting in an output of commensurate dimensions, Hock 2013, p. 942.
- 17 Wimpfheimer 2011, p. 11f. Wimpfheimer adds, p. 12: 'Where Rabbi Hayyim advocates open-endedness in the practice of law, this study posits an open-endedness as the foundation of meaning within law - a foundation, that is, that precedes its practice'. Goldenberg 1984, p. 166 with regard to the procedures of the Talmud in general, speaks of 'a relish for complicated but careful argument' that is 'entirely available to the modern reader'. Samely 2007, p. 62 voices a warning against too facile summaries: 'Anybody who wishes to draw on the explicit authority of whole rabbinic texts cannot quote uncontentious 'basic principles' or 'core' messages. Whole rabbinic books do not make unequivocal unified statements, and explicit general principles often provide no summary of their topic (...). All reductions of a major rabbinic theme to a universal principle or an 'essence' are therefore the reader's own creation'.
- 18 Wimpfheimer 2011, p. 19: 'A narrative becomes a narrative, in other words, because it describes events and actions that violate expectations, especially legal ones. A legal narrative often rises to the level of narrative because the expectation it violates is the one clearly articulated in legal statutes.'
- 19 Cf. Chiland 1990, p. 281.
- 20 Gálvez 2002, p. 176 reflecting appreciatively on a book by Nicolaïdis, for instance, writes that the complaint of a patient may confront us with 'the coming into each other's presence [*la mise en présence*] of two alphabets, that of the patient and that of the therapist. Categorising [*qualifier*] the symptom as stupidly meaningless [*bête*] reminds me of those who consider foreign languages as "barbarous" (which is to say stammering) because their language is not comprehensible.'
- 21 Sandler, Dare and Holder 1992/1973, p. 2. Inasmuch as the different schools mentioned do not necessarily practice an 'art of disagreement' among themselves, frictionless co-existence is no doubt made easier by non-engagement.
- 22 Livingstone 2014, p. 1.
- 23 Hacking 2004, p. 279f.
- 24 Hacking 2007, p. 293fn.21. George Devereux and Edwin M. Loeb might have considered this as tributary to their wider concept of 'antagonistic acculturation', which, among other things, attempts to shed light on how new labels direct attention and shape interactions drawing on both auto and alloplastic behaviour: 'Acculturation of all types, and in particular antagonistic acculturation, is the outcome of a bilateral challenge resulting from socio-cultural contact.' (Devereux and Loeb 1943, p. 146). One graphic example of the complexities potentially involved is provided by Devereux 1975a, p. 399: 'In the ninth and tenth centuries, the

- pagan Hungarians routinely drank fermented mare's milk, for it was their only alcoholic beverage. But they also drank with pleasure the beer and wine they found in sacked Western cities. However, beginning with Hungary's Christianization and Westernization, the Western priests decided to treat kumys-drinking as a pagan practice... As a result, certain Hungarians who wished to resist both Christianization and Westernization, defiantly began to drink kumys in a new and different spirit'.
- 25 This has been an emphasis strongly advocated by Jacques Press (see *infra*).
- 26 Neyraut 1974. Any experience will be processed in a framework of understanding that predates it. This statement should only be contentious, if we were to equate the 'Here and Now' with the imperative of absolute immediacy. It might then create tensions similar to the one described by Faure 1991, p. 63f., in his critique of Chan Buddhism, between *upaya* [skillful means] required to set things into motion and the demand for unmediated access to reality on the spot. Glover 2009, p. xxiv in a rather sweeping statement, believes there is an anti-humanistic tendency at work in France, which she finds in Lacan, but apparently also sees as 'the main distinction between French psychoanalysts and their British and American counterparts'. It is difficult to see how this statement, in a less mono-lingual environment, would have survived extended contact with the sources.
- 27 Bohleber et al. 2015, p. 726. Fleck 1935, p. 54f. speaks of the '*Denkkollektiv*' [thought collective] as a community the members of which are mutually exchanging ideas or are in mental interaction' [*Gemeinschaft der Menschen, die im Gedankenaustausch oder in gedanklicher Wechselwirkung stehen*]. 'Thought collective' can, if taken out of context, easily be misunderstood as a hive mind, which it is not. Perhaps we can think of it as a thought habitat, within which people think and feel with more or less ease, and which suggests places where to go and where not to go (sometimes in a literal sense, see Bridge 2013, p. 483 on responses within her environment to her plan to move out of London as an analyst). There may be tendencies towards preferences for certain mental dietary arrangements, i.e. what to use as food for thought and what not, see Kohon 2018, p. 6: 'When the 1986 edition [of his book] was published, two unexpected comments were made to me by colleagues from the Independent Group: first, that it had taken a foreigner to come up with this idea, and, second, that my writing was not really representative of their group. The text of my Introduction and my Dora paper were both 'too *French*' - most definitely, some of them argued, *not* 'Independent'. [emphasis in the text].
- 28 A role Lydgate, for instance, takes upon himself in George Eliot's *Middlemarch*, Eliot 1965 [1871-72], p. 175: '... it seemed to Lydgate that a change in the units was the most direct mode of changing the numbers. He meant to be a unit who would make a certain amount of difference towards that spreading change which would one day tell appreciably upon the averages, and in the meantime have the pleasure of making an advantageous difference to the viscera of his own patients.'
- 29 Forrester 1997, p. 201 remarks upon the shared traits of doctors in the dramas of Ibsen, Chekhov and Schnitzler, Freud's contemporaries as new general practitioners, and goes on saying: 'psychoanalysis would not appear as a wing of the newly professionalizing medical subspecialties such as psychiatry or neurology so much as a reaction to the more widespread problems faced by general practitioners when confronted with a shift toward public and scientific legitimations for their ancient art.' Jervis 1988, p. 75 emphasises that there are echoes present to this day: 'This type of attitude and research is in its tradition and substance that of a craftsman [*è artigianale nella tradizione e nell'essenza*]: in fact, it is learned from the living example of the masters, and refined in everyday individual practice, and remains, in any case, rather experiential than codifiable.' On an institutional level the situation, as far as psychiatry was concerned, was checked: what Colette Chiland says about her experiences in the 1960s might well be representative beyond her immediate circle. In comparison to fifteen years earlier she found an atmosphere changed by psychoanalysis and new medicines. The medical head of the clinic was not a psychoanalyst but had to take cognizance of what it could contribute. The assistant and the junior medical doctors were practically all in analysis. Analysis mattered 'not because one would 'analyse' the patients there, but because one takes an interest in their history, their person and the relationship one can enter into with them', Chiland 1990, p. 209.
- 30 Freud 1900, p. 243.
- 31 As Simpson 2018, p. 487 observes on a paper by Michel Fain, 'There is a sense that this paper is part of long conversations and debates within French psychoanalysis whose context is difficult for the current reader to understand'. Jacques Press refers to the 'background noise' of a period in which theory is rooted as if it were the navel of a dream. cf. Press 2010a, p. 145; Press 2009a, p. 146; Press 2004a, p. 155ff.; Press 2001b, p. 48f.; Press 1998a, p. 123. Wimpfheimer 2011, p. 10 notices: 'the Mishnah does not include all extant opinions within its reports of scholarly debate'. This, for different reasons, applies to the proceedings of French psychoanalytic congresses: what is within the shared memory of their participants is apparently assumed to be present as a connotative halo to the debate but not referenced as such.
- 32 Comparable, though this example is not used in Fain's writings, to the shutting down of an unresponsive application in a Unix environment: by sending an 'xkill' command that imperatively terminates any runaway process.

- 33 I am borrowing from the widely quoted statement by Bernard Fall on Vietnam: Americans were 'dreaming different dreams than the French but walking in the same footsteps', for which I could not track the exact reference, probably in a newspaper article in the 1960s. See Logevall 2012, p. 714 and p. 795fn.24. The source Logevall uses does not give the exact reference. It already appears in unattributed form almost thirty years earlier in Cohen 1984, p. 161.
- 34 Buchan 1919, p. 139.
- 35 Vargas 2017, p. 215fn. 26 says [during the Argentine military dictatorship the] then-commander of the army Roberto Viola put it this way: 'A *desaparecido* was someone who was 'absent forever', whose 'destiny' was to 'vanish'. Officially, a *desaparecido* was neither living nor dead, neither here nor there.' See Julia Alvarez' impressive short story 'Disappeared does not take a helping verb in English', Alvarez 1994. I owe the reference to Alvarez to Vargas 2017, p. 215fn.27.
- 36 Green 1986, p. 9, for instance, declared himself a fervent defender of the *entente cordiale* in psychoanalysis.
- 37 Grayling 2000, pp. 4ff. 190ff. 193f.; Wu 2008, p. 179f. For William Hazlitt's father also see: Whelan 2010, pp. 128ff. Much of the ease in which a Presbyterian in one place might be referred to as a Unitarian in another place would be incomprehensible if not understood against larger changes in English Dissent, to which Short 1968 provides a brief survey.
- 38 There is no really good English word that comes to my mind which might stand in for German '*Befremdung*', a close companion of indifference. At times it is the feeling of being otherised in an encounter that does not make sense and, in the absence of true contact, renders those affected by it momentarily strangers to themselves on their own home turf.
- 39 See Bion 1994, p. 304; Bion 1990, pp. 100f. 105f.
- 40 Reading French psychoanalytic texts in their English translation goes a long way towards creating a mild version of an *opérateur* experience under laboratory conditions. Oliner 1988, p. 7 quotes Mavis Gallant (Gallant 1985) 'A French sentence, transcribed exactly as it stands means an English sentence with five words too many'. What you cannot transcribe is an engagement with a world in which you need these five words. If these sentences are taken away from their natural habitat, they often become what they are not. Shorn of echo rooms clinging to the original language and culture, a text appears alien, almost as if it were set to attack the reader's mental wellbeing - just as some patients are thought to be doing who appear to be deprived of any vital dimension. If generativity is to be recovered, a shared zone would have to be found, in which reverberations of whatever is being said might become possible, in an act of creative apperception, see Parsons 2014, p. 10; Peter Fonagy once remarked on the differences between French and British psychoanalytic culture which amount to a cultural shock, Fonagy 2000, pp. 83f. 94; Braconnier, Musiol and Advenier 2008, p. 166.
- 41 I also tend to use Me, reflecting the French *Moi*, rather than the more usual ego, unless it occurs in a text that having already been translated from the French makes use of the usual English terminology. In the same way, when I quote a French article that has been published in English I use the word drive as it is found in the translation. Birksted-Breen and Flanders 2010, p. 26ff. offer succinct remarks on the French use of '*pulsions*'.
42 Suzuki 1949, p. 188f. In fn. 1 Suzuki makes the point that what the story would be concerned with is an experience, which, we have to assume, although he does not explicitly say so at this point, turns 'vastness' into 'spaceousness'. McRae 2014, p. 128 puts the tradition into some of its context.
- 43 Di Donna and Bradford 2008, p. 62f.
- 44 Zaretsky 2004, pp. 320-325.
- 45 de Mijolla 2012b, p.vi.
- 46 de Mijolla 2010a; for a review see Surprenant 2013.
- 47 de Mijolla 2007.
- 48 Cf. Lebovici and Widlöcher 1980, p. vii; de Mijolla 2003, p. 141: 'the veritable graphomania which took hold of most of the psychoanalysts from the 1950s onwards'.
- 49 Also see Fansten 2013.
- 50 Flanders 2018.
- 51 Chabert 1994, pp. 139-143.
- 52 See the review Levine 2012a.
- 53 Aisenstein 2000, Danon-Boileau 1998, Debray 1998, Ody 2000.
- 54 Aisenstein 2018. There is also an introduction to one of his papers in Aisenstein and Papageorgiou 2018, which also explains some of the background.
- 55 Saada 1972.
- 56 Chagnon 2012, pp. 85-94; pp. 243-251.
- 57 Dashtipour and Vidaillet 2017.
- 58 Cf. Turkle 1978/1992, p. 217, as quoted previously in endnote 16.
- 59 Oliner 2010, p. 224f.
- 60 For reviews see: Bass 1992, Jacobs 1992 and Zimmer 1992.

- 61 Oliner 1988, p. 234.
- 62 Young 1993.
- 63 Kurzweil 1989. Writing about French psychoanalysis in English one can easily get the impression that one is imprudently entering areas wiser minds have learned to let well alone. It is, in this context, to be noted that Marion Michel Oliner felt encouraged by the attention France was receiving in Kurzweil's study and by conversations with Dr. Edith Schwarz. '[Dr Schwartz]... reinforced my belief that the French approach is sufficiently different and valid to merit the attention I was giving it. Dr. Edith Kurzweil, whose sociological study of psychoanalysis in four countries parallels mine with regard to France, acted as a welcome sounding board. We were able to compare our observations informally, and I felt less of the pain of the writer's isolation because of my contact with her.'
- 64 Green 2010a, p. 21; a reflection, which with regard to alexithymia was also voiced in Weinryb 1995, pp. 178ff.
- 65 Pirlot 2013, pp. 144-149.
- 66 Doucet 2000, pp. 54ff.
- 67 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 115.
- 68 Pirlot 2010, p. 11.
- 69 Dumet 2002, p. 28.
- 70 Dumet 2002, pp. 54. 60.
- 71 Carton 2011, p. 15 points out that Nemiah and Sifneos in introducing the concept of alexithymia made explicit reference to the *EPP*.
- 72 Carton, Chabert and Corcos 2011, p. 3.
- 73 Corcos 2011, p. 152f.; Corcos and Pirlot 2011, p. 105f.; Taylor 1990, p. 779.
- 74 Taylor 1990, p. 773; for a survey of empirical research see Taylor 1995.
- 75 Peter Fonagy emphasises the differences between his understanding of mentalisation and the way the word is used in France: Braconnier, Musiol and Advenier 2008, p. 167; Fonagy 2000, p. 92 without entering into much detail.
- 76 Chemouni 2010, p. 34.
- 77 de Tychey 2010, p. 182: there is some controversy within the groups that use the respective concept on how best to understand it. Smadja's suggestion, in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 7, is 'When one talks about the close connection [*parenté*] between two clinical entities, we must place both the one and the other in the context of the specific models [to which they belong]. We cannot [just] add them on top of each other [*on ne peut pas les superposer*].' This seems to be sound advice.
- 78 Bronstein 2011, pp. 180-182.
- 79 Fischbein 2011, pp. 208-209.
- 80 Ulnik 2000; Fernández 2002. Both authors, it must be said, pay some attention to Dejours' positions.
- 81 Pirlot 2011.
- 82 In addition to the aforementioned Cremerius 1977 and Zepf and Gattig 1981 – revisited without substantial revision in Zepf 2000, pp. 601-612 - there are the synthetic efforts by Kapfhammer 1985 and Stephanos and Auhagen 1979.
- 83 Brede 1974, pp. 420-455. She emphasises that the topic she covers should not be thought of as something fixed and settled that can be taught in a curriculum, but as an area in which the reader is bound to find unsolved methodological and theoretical problems at every step, Brede 1974, p. 33.
- 84 Thomä and Kächele 2006, p. 432.
- 85 Kapfhammer 2010, p. 1283.
- 86 Cf. Kernberg 1995 *passim*.
- 87 Oliner 1988, p. xvi.
- 88 For an older sign of bemused interest see Gedo 1999.
- 89 See, for instance, Wilson 2012.
- 90 See, for instance, Levine 2011, Levine 2008.
- 91 Gottlieb 2010a, p. 365.
- 92 Pirlot and Corcos 2012, p. 1418, following Green.
- 93 Gottlieb 2010b.
- 94 Lazar 2001, p. 284.
- 95 Neyraut 1975, p. 16f. and *passim*; for a more recent reflection on a collective counter-transference with regard to the *pensée opératoire* see Marin 2009.
- 96 Cf. Douglas 1986, p. 13; for further perspectives in cognitive sociology see Zerubavel 1997.
- 97 Cf. Fleck 1935, pp. 57. 70.
- 98 Fleck 1927-1960 [1927], p. 43; cf. Schäfer and Schnelle 1983, p. 14.
- 99 Bion 1967.
- 100 Dejours 2009, p. 18f.; Gottlieb 2003; Bion 1965, p. 19f.

- 101 Florence *et al.* 2002.
 102 www.theses.fr.
 103 <https://www.editions-ue.com/catalog>.
 104 See, for instance, recently, Perelberg and Kohon 2017, which might serve as the starting point for further debates, see: Levine 2018, p. 538. Earlier work on Green encompasses Jackson 1991 and Pirlot and Cupa 2012b.
 105 As may be seen and felt in Green's appreciative words on the Botellas, Green 2001, p. 1303.
 106 Augmented paper as printed in Lacan 1966, p. 403.
 107 Bion 1994, p. 25f.
 108 See Birksted-Breen and Flanders 2010, p. 11; cf. table p. xx. de Mijolla 2012a gives to his work on the period between 1946 and 1953 the subtitle: 'a painful renaissance'.
 109 de Mijolla 2012a, pp. 4. On the importance of the younger generation, just into their thirties: de Mijolla 2012a, p. 37f.; de Mijolla 1995, p. 274. Also see de Mijolla 1982, p. 41: 'Sacha Nacht put away the uniform under which he had joined the Resistance, and put himself to work, ushering in, to respond to a demand as abundant as short on financial resources, a bold technical innovation: the reduction of the length of sessions from one hour to forty-five minutes, and of their frequency from five sessions per week to four.' As Widlöcher 2004, p. 10 relates, 'The requests [for analysis] are so frequent that the time of waiting [for a place in analysis] is increasing. It is soon almost half of the junior hospital doctors that have taken up [psychoanalytic] training and who, forming the fourth [psychoanalytic] generation [in France], will become training analysts at the end of the Sixties. This demographic explosion, [together with] the young age of the candidates, their enthusiasm and proselytism, is profoundly going to affect the psychiatric *milieu*.'
 110 Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 369.
 111 Roudinesco 1986, p. 222f.; Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 297ff.; de Mijolla 1996, p. 16f.
 112 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 218ff.; Diener 2002a, fiche 5.1; Barande and Barande 1975, pp. 63-66; Fages 1996, pp. 215-219. Nacht was afraid psychoanalysis might be absorbed by university and wanted to strengthen its autonomy by anchoring it in medicine, Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 293. On Nacht's active role in the Resistance, with a direct link to London: Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 249f. On the success of the Institute, under Nacht, to come to an agreement with Social Security, Saada 1972, p. 22. As de Mijolla 1982, p. 49 sums things up, Nacht was known for his authoritarianism, was nicknamed the '*satrape*', appreciated for his efficiency, feared but little loved, except perhaps by Lacan, a very close friend of his (until the split): 'to Lacan the kingdom of words. To Nacht that of 'presence', which he asked from psychoanalysts more than '*bonté*'...'
 113 Lagache, in 1951 emphasised that the medical faculty had so far refused to set up a chair in psychoanalysis, Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 303. Roudinesco 1986, p. 228f.; Diener 2002a, fiche 5.4; Ohayon 2015, p. 321 and Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 203ff.; 277ff. provide an indispensable counterbalance to Roudinesco's perspective, which she qualifies as a '*portrait caricatural*', p. 204; also see Chiland 1990, p. 208f. It is a measure of Lagache's long-term success that Jalley 2006, p. 10 can write, '... if there exists an original French psychology, consideration should be given to the fact that its nucleus was in its essence constituted by French psychoanalysis.' The title of this section reads '*La psychanalyse est la seule "psychologie" qui ait réellement compté en France depuis 1950*', Jalley 2006, p. 9.
 114 See, for instance, Widlöcher 1997, p. 19.
 115 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 280ff. Diener 2002a, fiche 5.3. Roudinesco 1986, p. 281 puts it like this: 'He has no project for psychoanalysis except to practice it in the best way possible, rigorously, not to say ritually.' She follows Lacan in underestimating Bouvet and his long term influence. Talking about Lacan's strategy to condemn him by not mentioning him by name she says: 'The strategy is all the more clever, because Bouvet is an obscure clinician who will never have his own school', which is in some contrast to Barande and Barande 1975, pp. 78-84. As Forrester 1997, p. 197 puts it: 'the living hero of Roudinesco's second volume is ... Jacques Lacan, magician and charlatan, grand theorist and transgressor of all psychoanalytic etiquette', a protagonist clearly very different from Bouvet. André Green in Fine and Smadja 2000, p. 170 says: 'One will realise, when one will write the history of psychoanalysis of the 50s and 60s [in France] that it was Lacan, Bouvet, and Marty.' Green's statement, reasonable as it is, carries layers of personal meaning: Lacan rejected Green's wish to open a debate, Bouvet died while Green was in analysis with him, and Marty skilfully evaded any debate with Green until it was too late.
 116 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 221f. 250. 262f. It should be said that it apparently was not always clear who would eventually side with whom and split from whom. On December 20th, 1952 Marie Bonaparte wrote a long letter to Rudolf Loewenstein in which she wrote, 'The serious fact is that our society is currently split into two. On the one hand the group of Nacht, comprising Bénassy, Lebovici, Marty, Mâle, Diatkine, Schlumberger and Pasche. / The other part are no doubt all the others. That means it is 8 against 12. We have certainly the majority, but the minority is not negligible and we must at all costs avoid a split of the society. If Nacht and the others were to split off, they would no doubt set up a strictly medical syndicate, which would attract quite a number of young doctors and students as well as eventual patronage from the authorities. But it

- is us who would guard the Institute, in possession of the society, [because we are] the majority. / We must therefore come again together in January in some sort of assembly. In my opinion it is possible, and Lacan, our future president, desires this as well.' Also see Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 368ff.
- 117 de Mijolla 1995, p. 277; Roudinesco 1986, p. 249; Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 371. On a personal level the situation at the time of the split is quite complicated: Nacht and Lacan used to be good friends, de Mijolla 1995, p. 284; Roudinesco 1986, p. 226f.; Bouvet has Lagache in analysis, Roudinesco 1986, p. 280; there is a limited amount of either identity of purpose or trust between Lagache and Lacan, Roudinesco 1986, p. 260; Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 373; Denis 1971, p. 190. With the new *SFP*, for a number of its followers, the provinces of France seem to gain their voice vis-à-vis Paris and with some there is the impression that Catholic identities find more of a place within the new organisation, Roudinesco 1986, p. 274f. Relatively early, in 1955, as de Mijolla 2012b, p. 48 relates, the *SFP* adopted a policy of expansion with the founding of regional groups. Yet, Jalley 2008, p. 79 affirms that even at the time of his writing, about fifty years later, it was still difficult to find a reliable psychoanalyst in regions like the Jura.
- 118 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 260ff; Diener 2002b, fiche 7.1.
- 119 A brief sketch is provided by Diatkine 1997, p. 16f. De Mijolla 1982, p. 58 reports that the enemies of Lacan had made their own calculations: if Lacan was to keep up all his training analyses according to regulations he needed working days of more than 24 hours.
- 120 For the unexpected international complications: Roudinesco 1986, p. 262f.; Diener 2002b, fiches 7.1 and 7.2.
- 121 See Roudinesco 1993, p. 265f.; Kristeva 2000, p. 367f. René Diaktine, in analysis with Lacan, translates Melanie Klein's 'The Psychoanalysis of Children' from the German and transmits the manuscript to Lacan, who lets Melanie Klein know that he, himself, has done the translation. Klein learns that it was Diaktine who did the real work and Lacan loses the manuscript of which Diatkine did not conserve a copy. Lacan, as a consequence, loses all credibility with Klein.
- 122 See de Mijolla 2012b, p. 38; de Mijolla 1996, p. 19; de Mijolla 1995, p. 273; Fansten 2006, p. 85; Barande and Barande 1975, pp. 143ff.; Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 369; Chiland 1990, p. 185f.
- 123 Denis 1971, p. 191.
- 124 See Roudinesco 1982, pp. 289-297. 347ff. 418f. A short sketch of his role can be found in Denis 1971, pp. 187ff.
- 125 de Mijolla 2010a, p. 811; de Mijolla 2003, pp. 142ff.; de Mijolla 1995, 284; de Mijolla 1989. Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 244ff.; Roudinesco 1986, pp. 170ff.
- 126 See Green in Kohon 1999, p. 44.
- 127 de Mijolla 1996, p. 20. Also, as Jalley 2008, p. 21 observes that the *SPP* in response to Lacan moved into areas Lacanians left unoccupied and produced a well developed network of child and youth psychotherapy.
- 128 Turkle 1978/1992, p. 108; cf. Roudinesco 1986, p. 221. Kurzweil 1989, p. 222 sums up the situation: 'Still, many of the classical Freudians had medical degrees and connections to psychiatry, and they could quietly trade on their medical prestige. Some of them advised a number of ministerial commissions on mental health and child psychiatry, and they expanded on whatever footholds in hospitals and clinics they had had before the Lacanians "captured" Vincennes.' de Mijolla 2012b, p. 35 reports a divergence of aim between different attempts to ground psychoanalysis in medical practice and quotes from an article in *Les Temps modernes* by J.-B. Pontalis in January 1954: '... for Professor Heuyer, the main thing is to recognise psychoanalysis - which means in this context: to foreclose its autonomous development and to preserve the [rights of the] title of doctor of medicine in its entirety; for Dr. Nacht it is to put it on an official footing - that is to get it accepted as a reasonable form of therapy and to obtain for his institute a status comparable to that of the *École de Stomatologie* [offering a specialisation in oral medicine]. Being rightly concerned for the respective groups they represent they would [in pursuit of these interests] consequently rejoin forces in the way they would define the understanding of psychoanalysis, if not its extension. (For Heuyer it remains a branch of psychiatry, for Nacht it goes beyond the scope of psychiatry by inspiring psycho-somatic medicine...)'.
- 129 Nacht 1956, see de Mijolla 2012b, p. 95f.
- 130 Cf. Green 1994, pp. 40ff.; Green in Kohon 1999, p. 17f.; Green 2006, p. 17; Widlöcher 2004, p. 11.
- 131 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 317ff.
- 132 Green 1994, p. 63.
- 133 I studied parts of this relationship in an earlier, unpublished, module paper: Lassmann 2009. Chapter Three, by necessity, shares some common ground with the 2009 paper (both Green and Marty were influenced by Bouvet), with which it is not in contradiction. It does, however, serve a different purpose and follows a different thrust: explaining the concrete conditions for Marty's rather than Green's conceptual venture.
- 134 Green 1986, p. 9; Green 2006, p. 309. For the parting of ways with Lacan also see: Benvenuto and Green 1994.
- 135 On Lacan's furious response see Green in Kohon 1999, p. 23; Richard and Urribarri 2005, pp. 392.394.
- 136 Green 1973, pp. 330. 285; cf. Duparc 1996, p. 31.
- 137 Green 1973, p. 253.

- 138 Green 1973, p. 279.
- 139 Duparc 1995, p. 148.
- 140 Roudinesco 1986, pp. 323ff.
- 141 Roudinesco 1986, p. 324.
- 142 Anzieu 1990, p. 28 referring to his own experience, earlier on in the early Fifties, remembers it like this, 'The waiting room filled with people anxious to know whether they would be seen - Lacan would open the door and point to the chosen one, who would cross the room again ten or fifteen minutes later to leave. I would read. Lacan would tap my shoulder, and it was my turn to pass in front of everyone or to find myself postponed to another day.' Green 1994, p. 163 remembers, 'I sometimes accompanied friends of mine to their sessions of analysis [with Lacan] [They] told me, "Wait for me at the bistro at the corner". I did not have time to finish half of my mineral water before they had again taken their place at my side'. Green believes that it was practically impossible for Lacan to pass up on any opportunity to accept a candidate into didactic analysis so as to strengthen the chain of his transmission. Also see Heenen-Wolff 2007, p. 366; de Mijolla 1995, p. 273. For the development of the problem over a number of years: Langlitz 2005, pp. 107-124.
- 143 Cf. Diener 2002b, 2: fiche 8.1; Diatkine 1997, pp. 97ff.; de Mijolla 1995, p. 271 quotes Pierre Turquet's report on a visit to the *SFP*, Paris, June 21st, 1960: 'No claim is made for completeness. The picture is confused: the truth is not easy to find.'
- 144 de Mijolla 1982, p. 101f.; Marini 1992, pp. 129. 131.
- 145 Fansten 2006, p. 108f.
- 146 Turkle 1978/1992, p. 67.
- 147 Chemouni 1991, p. 31; de Mijolla 1982, p. 107f.
- 148 Chemouni 1991, p. 104.
- 149 Marty and Nicolaïdis 1996, p. 57.
- 150 Roudinesco 1986, p. 626f.; Pontalis 1986, pp. 187ff.; Green 1994, p. 125f.; Green 1986, p. 10; Jackson 1991, p. 132.
- 151 As Winnicott famously argued, 'After being – doing and being done to. But first, being.', Winnicott 1971, p. 114; also see Flanders 2018, p. 64; Birksted-Breen and Flanders 2010, pp. 16ff. 45.
- 152 Urribarri 2008, pp. 53ff.
- 153 For some of the outreach activities of Nacht's Institute of Psychoanalysis towards hospital doctors see de Mijolla 2012b, pp. 158. 177.
- 154 Literally: 'Original fantasm. Fantasm of origins. Origins of fantasm', Laplanche and Pontalis 1985.
- 155 Botella, C. 2018b, p. 729 reminds his readers that Freud considered theories 'uninvited guests' that called while one was busy doing something else.
- 156 Cf. Pontalis' remarks that for Sartre words were a substitute for acts, while for Lacan language reigned supreme – Pontalis 1986, p. 193. Heenen-Wolff 2007, p. 372 believes that the strong emphasis on the economic aspect in the Paris Society also served as a demarcation to Lacan.
- 157 Title of his autobiographic reflections in an interview with Gilbert Tarrab, Anzieu 1990.
- 158 See Fansten 2006, pp. 94ff.; 99-106; Diatkine G. 2006, p. 249; Diener 2002b, fiche 10; fiche 10.1; fiche 14.3; de Mijolla-Mellor 1995, pp. 296ff; de Mijolla 1982, p. 102; Troisier 1998, pp. 5-12; Chiland 1981, pp. 195ff. for important parts of her trajectory also see Roudinesco 1994, pp. 347. 357. 410. 412. 457-460. 465ff. 477-482. André Green in conversation with Fernando Urribarri refers to her as a post-Lacanian, Urribarri 2013, p. 103; Green treats her work more fully in Green 2013, pp. 105-125. A useful diagram of the development of psychoanalytic societies in France can be found in Birksted-Breen, Gibeault and Flanders 2010, p. xxi.
- 159 Chiland 1990, p. 185.
- 160 Anzieu 1976, p. 134: '*Freud et les premiers psychanalystes ont été des conquérants. De nos jours, il en va tout autrement. La psychanalyse est tombée malade de son propre succès. ... Notre tâche, à nous, psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui, n'est pas de répéter ce qu'a découvert Freud sur la crise de l'homme occidental à la fin d'ère victorienne mais de trouver une réponse psychanalytique au malaise de l'homme dans la civilisation présente.*'
- 161 *Senshoby*, an expression coined by Chuko Ikezaki in the 1930s, Stephan 2002, p. 124. Anzieu does not use the word but seems to think of something rather close to it.
- 162 Lézé 2010, p. 79, from a social anthropologist perspective raises an interesting point: in his view [French] psychoanalysts are cherishing an image as outsiders, while being situated at the heart of the medical and intellectual mainstream. It would probably be possible to line up considerable evidence for both viewpoints, contradictory as they appear to be.
- 163 Anzieu 1976, p. 145.
- 164 Even before, Lagache and Anzieu had been hatching the project to put together research linking psychology, philosophy and sociology, Ohayon 2015, p. 325.
- 165 Anzieu 1976, p. 146f.

- 166 McDougall 1972, p. 345. Coltart 1993, p. 57 tackles this from a slightly different UK angle in her quirky, terse statement, 'Some of my best friends are normal'.
- 167 Marty, Michel de M'Uzan and David, 1963, p. 12.
- 168 Bollas 1987, pp. 135-156. A discovery quite in contrast to the choice of their profession: as Michel Fain put it, 'The very choice of our profession is it not an escape attempt [*une fuite*] from banality?', Fain 1965, p. 107; also see Fain 1966a, p. 455; Bollas 1995, p. 110 writes of the plane of reality: 'It enters the analysis not as an elaboration - although that may subsequently happen - but initially as a dumb thing: a fact. "Them's the facts." Dumb.'
- 169 Adorno 1951, p. 57 (No 29) '*Bei vielen Menschen ist es bereits eine Unverschämtheit, wenn sie Ich sagen.*'
- 170 The alternative, of course, might have been to declare psychoanalysis had no remit in these cases and leave them to psychiatrists and non-analytic therapists, see Botella, C. 2018a, p. 30.
- 171 Cf. Kellner xxvii; the tension between what is and what ought to be collapses, Marcuse 1964, p. 140.
- 172 Widlöcher 2008, p. 167.
- 173 See the remarks in Baranes 2002; for some of the background see Lassmann 2013.
- 174 Vigoroux 1993, pp. 81-92.
- 175 Baldacci 2006, p. 50f.; Sparer 2010, pp. 1186ff.
- 176 Gibeault 2006, pp. 57ff.
- 177 Angelergues 2006, pp. 63ff.
- 178 Diatkine G. 2006, p. 249f.
- 179 Wainrib 2006, p. 17.
- 180 Szewc 2008b, p. 25 ; Moreau 1998, p. 145f. records a statement of Marty's that throws light on the approach: 'the therapist, while at the same time bearing in mind and respecting the primary projections of the patient, may offer himself (incitation disguised) as an example of conduct parallel to, yet at the same time quite different from, the patient's.'
- 181 Also see Moreau 1998, p. 150.
- 182 Szewc 2008b, p. 25; also see Asséo 2009, p. 113.
- 183 Marty 1996[1991], p. 19; Debray 2002, p. 1020.
- 184 Marty 1996[1991], p. 19.
- 185 Marty 1996[1991], p. 38; Fain 1994a, p. 8.
- 186 Marty 1972, p. 812; Marty 1996[1991], p. 73.
- 187 Marty 1996[1991], pp. 19. 54; Nicolaidis 1996a, p. 9; see Marty 1976, p. 86f.; on de Ajuriaguerra, Dechaud-Ferbus 2011, pp. 25-27; Green 1994, pp. 39. 46-47; de Ajuriaguerra himself was from 1949 to 1952 in analysis with Sacha Nacht, Dechaud-Ferbus 2011, p. 26; Aguirre Oar and Guimon Ugartechea 1992, p. 25. As for Marty's decision to enter psychoanalysis we find the remarkable passage in de Mijolla 2012a, p. 224 that he also did so on the advice of Louis Le Guillant, who was opposed to both psychoanalysis and psychosomatics and, as we shall see in Chapter 12, a high profile voice of the Communist Party within the medical community.
- 188 Debray 1998, p. 9; Indepsi 2013; Marty 1996[1991], p 54; for a recollection of the atmosphere of these days see: Marty 1970, p. 751.
- 189 Debray 2002, 1020; Aisenstein 2000, p. 11; Fain 1994a, p. 7; Fain 1976, p. 741f.
- 190 Debray 2002, 1020.
- 191 Marty 1996[1991], p. 61; Marty and Fain 1955[1954]b, p. 319; Marty 1996[1991], p. 56.
- 192 Marty 1996[1991], pp. 38. 40.
- 193 For the anecdote: Marty 1996[1991], p. 60.
- 194 Marty 1996[1991], pp. 64. 71; Debray 1998, p. 11.
- 195 Debray 2002, p. 1021; http://www.spp.asso.fr/wp/?page_id=38.
- 196 Wiener 2011, p. 148; Debray 1998, p. 28.
- 197 de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 16; Wiener 2011, p. 148.
- 198 Wiener 2011, p. 148.
- 199 Wiener 2011, p. 149.
- 200 Wiener 2011, p. 148;
- 201 Wiener 2011, p. 148; Marty 1996[1991], p. 66.
- 202 Marty 1996[1991], p. 67.
- 203 Marty 1996[1991], p. 67.
- 204 Debray 2002, p. 1021; de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 14.
- 205 Marty 1996[1991], p. 68.
- 206 Debray 2002, p. 1021; Marty 1996[1991], pp. 66. 68f.; Indepsi 2013; de Calatroni 1998, p. 11f.
- 207 <http://www.asm13.org/Le-departement-Institut-de-psychosomatique>.
- 208 Marty 1996[1991], p. 20.

- 209 Marty and Fain 1954[1953], p. 244f.; for presentational reasons two of Marty's early papers, Marty 1951 and Marty 1952, are discussed elsewhere, in the chapter on Smadja.
- 210 Marty and Fain 1954[1953], p. 251; cf. p. 269.
- 211 Marty and Fain 1954[1953], pp. 256. 259. 264; cf. Marty 1996[1991], pp. 21. 34f.; Marty 1990a, p. 20; in the discussion Lebovici points out that the problems of the patients investigated seem to be remarkably akin to those portrayed in Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain*, Marty and Fain 1954[1953], p. 274.
- 212 Marty and Fain 1954[1953], p. 271.
- 213 Marty 1996[1991], p. 59. de Mijolla 2012a, p. 230 records the election of Marty to full membership of the SPP on May 13th, 1952: 10 yes votes, 1 no. Marie Bonaparte was present.
- 214 Cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 34f.; Marty 1991[1990], p. 11f.
- 215 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 206; cf. Marty 1972, pp. 812ff.
- 216 French 1941, p. 568f.; Fain 1994a, p. 9; Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 206f. See Fain 1998g, minute 1:06ff.
- 217 At the time Marty and Fain assisted Jean Gosset at the surgery department of the hospital Saint-Antoine, Paris, who asked their view on intense spinal pains not justified by the available medical assessment of their body status and linked to muscular contractions, which added to their interest in motor articulations bypassing mental representations, see Marty's retrospective account of the unfolding of events: Marty 1996[1991], p. 33f.
- 218 Cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 207; 245. 263.
- 219 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 258ff. 263f.: '*l'identification sensorio-motrice primaire*'. It encompasses within its range gesture, mimics and vocals, and forms an essential early core of personality (Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 209; cf. p. 238.
- 220 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 210f. 236. 280f.
- 221 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 280f.
- 222 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 210f. 225f.; cf. p. 272.
- 223 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 262, cf. p. 256f.
- 224 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 251. 264, 281; also see the remarks in Marty 1967/2003, p. 26.
- 225 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 264.
- 226 Cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 208. 225. 238; also see: Marty 2006[1987], p. 166.
- 227 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 220; cf. p. 246.
- 228 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 265f.; cf. Fain and Marty 1965[1964], p. 570; Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 276.
- 229 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 263. 272; cf. p. 280; not to be confused with the libidinal investments of sportsmen and sportswomen: Marty 1996[1991], p. 36f.; for variations see Donabédian 1994, p. 111.
- 230 Cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 264. 273f.
- 231 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 254, noting with approval Melanie Klein's views.
- 232 Cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 239.
- 233 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, pp. 222fn.1. 239. 281; see the comment by René Diatkine on this: Diatkine 1955[1954], p. 306f. on the form of expression as a natural concern in child psychoanalysis p. 281; also see Marty 1996[1991], p. 33f. on the greater degree of latitude permitted to child analysts.
- 234 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 279; cf. p. 205f.
- 235 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 271; cf. Marty 1955, p. 403; Fine 1995b, p. 1703 suggests that even an organic disorder can, in psychoanalytic work, eventually become a 'mental object'.
- 236 Nacht 1955[1954]a, p. 287; de Ajuriaguerra 1955[1954], p. 298f.; Ajuriaguerra, in his later work, spoke of 'a dialogue in [body] tonus [*dialogue tonique*]', considering two axes of essential importance for the development of the personality of the infant: identification and detachment [*distanciation*], Krzysztof 2009, p. 37f.
- 237 Diatkine 1955[1954], p. 305, taken up with approval by the authors: Marty and Fain 1955[1954]b, p. 321.
- 238 Diatkine 1994, p. 160; Lacan [1956], pp. 77-80; see p. 79f: 'This is how the analytic situation gets taken for a real situation, where a process of reduction from the imaginary to the real is accomplished,' perhaps part of a larger indirect battle of words and ideas he was having with Bouvet and those attracted to his perspectives: de Mijolla, 1982, p. 81; cf. de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 17 for Bouvet as a clearly recognisable influence in Marty and Fain's work; Bonaparte 1955[1954] p. 286; also see: Braconnier 2007, p. 42.
- 239 Marty and Fain 1955[1954]b, p. 319.
- 240 Lechat 1955[1954], p. 291; on Lechat: Coddens, p. 46.
- 241 Bonaparte 1955[1954] p. 285, probably in reference to Bergson 1907, p. 145: '*La représentation est bouchée par l'action. La preuve en est que, si l'accomplissement de l'acte est arrêté ou entravé par un obstacle, la conscience peut surgir.*' ['Representation is stopped up by action. The proof of this is, that if the accomplishment of the act is arrested or thwarted by an obstacle, consciousness may reappear', English translation p. 151]; Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 225; cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]b, p. 320.

- 242 Marty 1958[1957], p. 6f.; sponge-like: p. 10, Asséo 2002, p. 56, and previously Asséo 1994, p. 55fn.1, compares this to Woody Allen's *Zelig*.
- 243 Marty 1958[1957], p. 9; cf. p. 11; Marty 1958[1957], p. 10.
- 244 Marty 1958[1957], p. 8; p. 29: the passion is to be the other; p. 16: 'I am so much dependent on you that I am you'.
- 245 Marty 1958[1957], p. 7; Marty 1958[1957], p. 12; Marty 1958[1957], p. 13; cf. Marty 1962[1961], p. 295.
- 246 Marty 1958[1957], pp. 12. 26.
- 247 Also see: Marty 1984a, p. 111f.
- 248 Marty 1958[1957], p. 11.
- 249 Marty 1958[1957], p. 27.
- 250 1958[1957], pp. 17. 20. 28. Later clinical experience complexified the picture further: Marty 1969, p. 245. Although the 'allergic' patient may be a very 'good' patient, the psychoanalyst 'rapidly learns to discount his illusions as to the future of the interpretations he is giving', Marty 1980, p. 155, on 'good' and 'bad' patients: Marty 1976, p. 80. Patients eager to please the therapist: Marty 1958[1957], p. 27; Marty 1996[1991], 41f. for this personality structure among the helping professions, not excluding psychoanalysis.
- 251 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963; the group had worked on it from 1958 to 1962: de M'Uzan in Braconnier 2003, p. 28f.; de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 17.
- 252 See Diatkine 1994, p. 159: 'several medical doctors of my generation became psychoanalysts after reading *L'investigation psychosomatique* (1963) by Pierre Marty'; Smadja 2012f, p. 203f.
- 253 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 4; the interviews took place within the psychosomatic consultation of the neurosurgical department at Sainte-Anne, run by Professor Marcel David, father of one of the authors of the study, see Green 1994, p. 46f.; Marty 1996[1991], pp. 66. 70; cf. p. 20.
- 254 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 4; later, in Rue Falguière, Marty made sure the patient's seat was as comfortable as his own and that there was no barrier between himself and the patient. Marty would never sit between the patient and the door so that the way out was unimpeded, Wiener 2011, p. 148.
- 255 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 8. Botella, S. 2016, p. 26 emphasises that the term 'investigation' goes beyond traditional anamnesis: it attempts to take into account not just the mental processes of the patient but everything that could be observed of the patient's behaviour. As Sára Botella reminds us (p. 27), Marty strives to take into account a principle of equivalence in the use of energy: instead of doing *x* the patient does *y* and this can be of significance in the understanding of how he/she functions; also see Fortier 1988, p. 23.
- 256 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 257; Debray, 1998, p. 14; also see Marty 1968[1966], pp. 595. 598; Marty 1976, p. 75f.; Marty 1980, p. 47fn.66; p. 86. Green 1998, p. 46 raises the interesting question why Marty was sent specific patients, beyond what was apparent on the surface.
- 257 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 2; the authors add that this circumstance, in their view, did not have a noticeable influence on the interviews, if anything they were more 'pure' because of the comparative lack of information.
- 258 See Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 27ff. p. 33fn.17, p. 197; examples from Marty's later work: Marty 1980, pp. 168f.; 174f.; 182; 193f.; Marty considered the presence of his assistants a means to stimulate fantasies and their emergence on a given screen of projection: Wiener 2011, p. 148; cf. Moreau 1998, p. 147.
- 259 In a 2003 edition the original study was presented with a preface by Michel de M'Uzan and Christian David from September 1993, after the death of Marty, and extracts from de M'Uzan and David 1960.
- 260 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 3, cf. p. 257; Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962]), p. 345; Marty 1980, p. 60fn.87; on the sociological relevance, Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 259; David in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 21: if one were to engage in '*forcing symbolique*' [expression in the original] this would exclude a large group of patients, perhaps an important segment of the population from treatment. Botella, C. 2018b, p. 728 emphasises the change of focus in Marty's approach: from psychoneurosis to character and behaviour.
- 261 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 3. 5. 11. 12f. 15; cf. pp. 217f. 261; cf. Marty 1976, p. 157fn.1.
- 262 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 179f. 182; Marty 1967, pp. 1113. 1118; Marty 1976, pp. 182. 230; Fain 1994b, p. 154.
- 263 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 9; see de M'Uzan 1994, p. 115 in reference to Raymond 1816 [1757]; Marty 1958[1957], p. 18; Marty 1967, p. 1119; Marty 1976, pp. 70. 154; Marty 1980, pp. 118. 132f.; Marty 1996[1991], p. 20.
- 264 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 13. 161. There is an acknowledgement of Wilhelm Reich's work on character neurosis but the authors prefer to speak of behaviour rather than character: Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 260.
- 265 As seems to emerge from Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 144; cf. Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 264f.
- 266 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 14.

- 267 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 78fn.10; 104; 144f.; 146; cf. Marty 1980, p. 249fn.8; Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 110 mentions 'an adhesiveness to perceived reality, the inert weight of which crushes the capacity to evoke the imaginary'; Smadja 2001a, p. 161 points out that *opérateur* thought is presented as *une pensée motrice*, a form of thought intimately linked to moving around and going places.
- 268 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 260.
- 269 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 159fn.17; cf p. 15.
- 270 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 215; Marty 1990a, pp. 20ff.
- 271 Termed 'allergic' see Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 213fn.1; Marty 1990a, pp. 24ff.
- 272 Debray 1998, p. 10f.; Fain 1994a, p. 8; David in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 16; Parat 1994, pp. 25ff.; Angulo 1994, p. 169; Jorda 1994, pp. 174ff.) cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963 p. 3f.; Marty 1996[1991], pp. 47f.; 63-66; on Bouvet: Marty 1990a, p. 20; Marty 1960, p. 710 and Marty 1996[1991], p. 62 on attending the corrida with Maurice Bouvet, an interest shared with Henri Ey, see Clervoy 1997, p. 162f.; Henri Ey was president of a club of *aficionadas* of the bullfight in Paris: Marty 1996[1991], p. 64; on object distance Marty 1980, p. 33; Marty 1996[1991], p. 34f.; also see Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 229.
- 273 Marty and Marty 1962, p. 9.
- 274 Also see Marty 1976, p. 95fn.1; Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 45. 74. 110. 146. 186. 218. 252; Marty 1980, p. 25; Marty 2001[1981], p. 166f.; Wiener 2011, p. 148f.; also see the assessment arrived at in Marty 1967/2003, p. 30f.
- 275 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 180; cf. Marty 1976, p. 172; also: Fain and Marty 1965[1964], p. 569f.
- 276 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 110. 172fn.34. 180ff. 212. 255f.; Marty 1980, p. 65fn.92; also see Smadja 1994b, p. 33f.; on second thought Marty is somewhat unhappy with the term originally chosen, stressing that there is no real projection and Kleinian projective identification in this type of patient is conspicuous by its absence: Marty 1972, p. 807.
- 277 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 258; cf. the comment of Nicolaïdis 2003a, p. 51: there is permanent alarm in reference to Marty 1990a, p. 30; on the variations in the mechanisms of projection and introjection to be taken into account: Marty 1976, p. 140 and fn.1; as it is, desire has ceded its place to needs, with little to hold them together: Marty 1980, p. 101f.
- 278 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 256. 258.
- 279 Cf. Marty 1972, p. 809; Marty 1976; p. 234; Marty 1980, pp. 65f. 89fn.129. 90fn.130; Marty and Fain 1964, p. 616.
- 280 Cf. Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 262; also see Marty 1967, p. 1118; Marty 1972, p. 807f.; Ody 2008, p. 69 points to a passage by Green's he quotes but does not reference. It is from Green 2002, p. 223: with non-neurotic patients intermediary formations between the archaic and conscious communication are lacking.
- 281 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 12.
- 282 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 12; p. 13 speaks of a 'petrification of resources'; cf. Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962]), p. 353.
- 283 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 254; cf. Marty 1967, p. 1116f.: psychosomatic patients are those who respond by falling sick when they cannot process a crisis by mental means.
- 284 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, pp. 35. 93. 123ff. 184.
- 285 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 260; de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 21.
- 286 The *depot legale* of *L'investigation psychosomatique* was December 1962, the *depot legale* of the special number of the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 27 was March 1963.
- 287 Also see Smadja 2001a, p. 158f.
- 288 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], pp. 345. 354; also see Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 16f.; Marty and Fain 1964, p. 621; for the process that led to Fain and David's paper: David in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 19.
- 289 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 349: 'But even when it [the *pensée opératoire*] is complex and technically prolific, in the realms of pure abstraction, for example, it always lacks the reference to an inner object really alive', p. 353: 'it follows that the *pensée opératoire*, given its lack of functional value to intergrate the *pulsions*, cannot assume a place in the economy of the subject', also see Marty and Fain 1964, p. 622.
- 290 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 346; cf. p. 351; de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 20.
- 291 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], pp. 346. 348. More cautiously Marty 1980, p. 68; cf. Marty 1972, p. 805: '*opérateur* thought, witness to a life *opérateur*'.
- 292 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 352; see also Marty 1980, p. 120fn.175.
- 293 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 348; cf. p. 245; Marty 1976, p. 210f.fn.1.
- 294 'My father has died – what is it that people do in such a case' the authors quote a patient: Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 350, cf. Marty 1980, p. 23; for a similar vignette frequently used by Marty see Fain

- 1994b, p. 154.
- 295 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 352; p. 354 refers to 'an archaic sideration of the primary process'.
- 296 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], pp. 351. 354; cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 35.
- 297 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 354, cf. Marty 1976, pp. 70. 236f.; Marty 1980, pp. 45f. 89. 121. 261fn.22. 264fn.25. 279fn.50.
- 298 Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 354; cf Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 146.
- 299 Cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 46; Marty 1957[1956]a, p. 449f.
- 300 A 'depression without object' seemed implicitly to emerge from *L'investigation psychosomatique*: de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 20; see Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 71. Pirlot 2010, p. 110 connects this to Janet's *psychasthénie*.
- 301 Marty 1968[1966], p. 596; Marty 1976, pp. 176-179; cf. Marty 1972, p. 810.
- 302 Cf. Marty 1968[1966], pp. 595. 598; a depersonified superego', Marty 1972, p. 807.
- 303 Cf. Marty 1968[1966], p. 595; Marty 1980, p. 96 and fns.138 and 139; also see Marty 1956, p. 565f. See the proverb quoted in George Eliot's Middlemarch: 'Since we cannot get what we like, let us like what we can get.', Eliot 1965 [1871-72], p. 499.
- 304 Marty 1968[1966], p. 595; cf. Marty and de M'Uzan 1963 [1962], p. 350.
- 305 Marty 1968[1966], p. 597; cf. Marty 1967, p. 1123fn.1, p. 1124: 'The world was dead, just as the subject was already in process of becoming'; on the lack of tonus: Marty 1996[1991], p. 76; Marty 1980, p. 59; for broad similarities to a childhood anaclitic depression Marty 1980, p. 76f.; on the role of depressions in early childhood: Marty 2006[1987], p. 167.
- 306 Marty 1968[1966], p. 597; p. 596 silently [*'sans bruit'*]; cf. Marty 1980, p. 69f.; Marty's own take on the term stresses the absence of libidinal activities: Marty 1967, p. 1120; with a *dépression essentielle* installed the weight of reality becomes crushing Marty 1980, p. 79.
- 307 Marty and Fain 1964, p. 616; italic letters added for clarity.
- 308 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 186; Marty 1968[1966], p. 598; cf. Marty 1967, p. 1121; Marty 1980, p. 21fn.22; Marty 1990b, p. 620.
- 309 Marty 1967, pp. 1114. 1120. 1125f.; cf. Marty 1968[1966], p. 596; Marty 1968[1967], p. 246; Marty, Fain, de M'Uzan and David 1968[1967], p. 713; Marty 1976, p. 132. Christian David touched upon the Jacksonian echoes with which a discourse on destructuration might reverberate, David 1967, p. 1128.
- 310 In his own intervention on Marty 1967, Michel Fain took a different turn and focused on early mother-child interactions laying the ground for later regression as opposed to disorganisation, Fain 1967, p. 1131.
- 311 The title was suggested by the publisher, Marty himself has something like 'What is the mental disorder in psychosomatics' in mind, Marty 1996[1991], p. 46f. Nicolaïdis 1997b, pp. 329ff. interprets the use of order in the title as pointing to hierarchic structure as a bulwark and safeguard against mental anesthesia.
- 312 Cf. Ribas 1998, p. 1607; Garrabé 1997, p. 38f.; David in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 18. Ey, in cultivating his hierarchical model of 'organo-dynamism' sought to explain hallucination as a structural disruption and disorganisation, Clervoy 1997, p. 167. Pierre Marty, in many ways, expresses his Freudian inspirations weighed towards the First Topography, in terms shaped by Henri Ey, cf. Edwards 2013, p. 728; Trillat 2012, p. 360f.; Smadja 2008a, p. 199f.; Fain 2001b, p. 12. Ey had wanted to overcome the impasses of both spiritualist dualism and materialist monism by proposing, on the basis of John Hughling Jackson's thought, structured hierarchies, in which every plane was the necessary, but not sufficient condition for the next level of functioning that in turn obeyed its own logic. Thus the psyche would depend on the body but at the same time introduce its own causalities in an increasing complexification of the whole system. Psychogenesis - the proposition that psychic factors explained the functioning of an individual - could only be held to apply if the mental system functioned well. This kind of dynamic hierarchisation did not conceptually depend on just one interface between body and mind but offered multiple levels of integrations.
- 313 Marty 1996[1991], p. 20: 'With a certain experience in psychiatric hospitals, and being a young psychoanalyst, I had the impression that one had to 'choose' in life, between somatic disease (at least if severe) and mental disease. To a large extent, I obtained confirmation by making inquiries with my *maîtres*, Henri Ey [...] [and] Maurice Bouvet [...]. On the whole, no somatic diseases among the well-organised psychotics, nor among the obsessional neurotics'; also see Marty 1976, p. 97f.fn.1; Marty 1990b, p. 619.
- 314 For Ey: Garrabé 1997, p. 47.
- 315 Marty 1990a, pp. 36ff.; Marty 1976, p. 118f; Marty 1980, p. 139; Nicolaïdis 1996b, p. 150fn.15 records an oral contribution by Claude Smadja in a seminar by *IPSO* on 4 June 1993: life begins with a 'disorder in process of construction'.
- 316 Marty 1976, p. 119; Marty 1996[1991], p. 22f.; Kreisler 1984, p. 1246.
- 317 Marty 1990a, pp. 36. 38; Marty 1980, pp. 105f. 110f.fn.160. 132. 140; Kamieniecki 1994, p. 77; Fain 2001c, p. 48; Marty 1980, p. 106fn.151 states tersely: 'programmation builds on [*s'appuie sur*] automation just as desire builds on need'.

- 318 Cf. Marty 1980, pp. 38. 126fns. 186 and 187; p. 127; the need to respect the increasing autonomy of the child may create difficulties for the mother; also see Marty 1976, p. 165; Marty 1980, p. 31fn.38; p. 126f.
- 319 '*La chaîne évolutive centrale des fixations*', Marty 1976, p. 138f.
- 320 Cf. Marty 1976, pp. 127fn.2. 145. 152f. 155; Marty 1980, pp. 143. 150; Debray 1998, p. 41f.; for the difference between 'lateral' and 'parallel': Marty 1984a, p. 111: 'I have, in my work, spoken of "lateral lines" when the somatic lines of evolution do not participate fully in the mental evolution, and of "parallel lines" when they do not participate in it at all.'
- 321 Marty 1976, pp. 138f. 147f. 149. 153; for the considerable amount of nuances also see Marty 1980, pp. 146ff.; 158.
- 322 Marty 1976, pp. 14f. 16. 70 [*de niveaux privilégiés de résistance*]. 97. 104. 133f. 139fn.1; 141f. 157fn.1; Marty 1980, p. 9f.; Marty 1990a, p. 32; Marty 2001[1981], p. 164; Debray 1998, pp. 41. 58; Fine 1994, p. 120.
- 323 Marty 1976, p. 92; Marty 1981[1980], p. 293f.; Marty 1990a, pp. 38f. 45f.; Debray 1998, pp. 34. 57; Kamieniecki 1994, pp. 68-71; Ody 2008, pp. 60-64; Fine 1994, p. 41; de Calatroni 1998, p. 12. Ulnik 2000 points out that Marty turns the adjective 'preconscious' into a noun, much increasing its remit in the process. It is, however, less a turn towards reification, as he suspects, that is manifested here, than the need to find an interface between conscious and unconscious the working of which the revitalisation of the subject can be made contingent upon. Braunschweig 1984, p. 119 recognises that Marty's preconscious is rather different from Freud's preconscious. Later writers would see connections to Winnicott and/or Bion (for a recent view on convergences with Winnicott see Jaeger 2015). Nicolaïdis 1997b, p. 341 stresses that the preconscious is the place of *liaison* and *déliasion*, a zone in which mediation between order and disorder takes place. To some extent, this is a counter-concept to a focus on the ego. In Oliner 1988, p. 169 reflects on the ramifications of this: 'In my opinion, not enough has been said in this country about the possible sterility of a well-organized ego. I attribute this lack to cultural factors that have led to a tendency to overlook the deficiencies in a well-organized personality.'
- 324 Also see Marty 1976, p. 150fn.2.
- 325 Cf. Marty 1976, p. 221; see also Marty 1981[1980], p. 293; Marty 1980, pp. 103f. 244fn.3.
- 326 Marty 1976, pp. 91. 119fn.2; cf. Marty 2006[1987], p. 166f.; Nicolaïdis 2001a, p. 26; Rouart 1981, p. 426: '*Pour P. Marty leur succession n'est pas seulement celle qui apparaît historiquement dans l'oeuvre de Freud, mais surtout celle qui se produit dans le cours du développement individuel, la seconde ne s'établissant qu'à partir d'un certain degré d'évolution*'. Ody 2008, p. 61 comments, '*...conduisit Pierre Marty, à mon avis, à renverser ce qu'il nomma "une position classique en psychanalyse", c'est-à-dire celle de considérer la première topique comme un aspect du fonctionnement de la seconde, et donc de dire cette fois qu'un "fonctionnement convenable de la première topique est nécessaire au fonctionnement de la seconde"*'. Kreisler 1984, p. 1246 remembers Fain's position on this: the First Topography safeguards the functioning of the apparatus, the Second enlivens the drama. Ulnik 2000 makes the valid point that Marty puts into an evolutionary perspective what for Freud were evolutions of his thinking: '*Contrariamente a lo que sostiene Marty, desde mi perspectiva, las dos tópicos no son mas que dos modelos, dos formas de explicar el funcionamiento del aparato psíquico y no dos sistemas que se deben asociar evolutivamente. Lo único evolutivo que tienen es el pensamiento de Freud, que por distintas razones evolucionó haciéndole modificar su modelo*'. A similar observation is made by Oliner 1988, p. 226, and, earlier on, by Braunschweig 1984, p. 118. Birksted-Breen and Flanders 2010, p. 10fn.14 provide an overview of the situation.
- 327 Marty 1976, p. 95; Debray 1998, p. 47; Fine 1994, p. 48f.; Marty 1976, pp. 14. 101. 154. 161fn.1. 240; Marty 1996[1991], p. 30.
- 328 Cf. Marty 1976, p. 89. 95f. p. 139fn.1.; Marty 1996[1991], pp. 33. 35; Fain 1994b, p. 154.
- 329 Marty 1976, pp. 175ff.; Marty 1990a, p. 41f.; relationships seem to be rather shallow: Marty 1976, pp. 177fn.1: 'The investment of objects, which do not result in the profound interiorisation of objects, is barely in evidence. It is primarily the immediate relation to objects, in its behavioural aspect [*dans les activités qu'elle comporte*], which is invested'; also see Marty 1980, pp. 220. 259fn.20. Fernández 2002, p. 122 observes that the behaviour in question is one of hyperadaptation.
- 330 Marty 1976, pp. 107ff.; Marty 1980, pp. 11ff.; Marty 1984b, p. 1145; with slightly different emphasis Marty 1972, p. 805.
- 331 Marty 1976, pp. 105. 152. 166.
- 332 Cf. Marty 1980, p. 108.
- 333 'One has to know that numerous individuals, no doubt more than a quarter of our Western population, do not have a satisfactory [*convenable*] organisation of their first topical system: unconscious – preconscious – conscious. As a consequence they do not have a satisfactory organisation of their Me'. Marty 1984a, p. 107; on the fragility of the *opérateur* Me: Fine 1995a, p. 173.
- 334 Cf. Marty 1976, p. 172f.fn.1; Marty 1972, p. 805f.; Marty 1980, p. 11; Rouart 1981, p. 418; for the fragilities of 'normal' people: Marty 1984a, p. 108; Marty 1968[1967], p. 246.

- 335 Cf. Marty 1976, pp. 176-182; Marty 1976, p. 172f.fn.1: the *opérateur* is a sign of a relative loss of structure.
- 336 Marty 1980, p. 94; Marty 1980, pp. 100. 104. 108; cf. Marty 1972, p. 810.
- 337 Marty 1980, pp. 99. 102.
- 338 Marty 1980, p. 95; Marty 1980, p. 91. Mechanical behaviour may repeat under present conditions what had meaning once but is a stranded leftover from better days in a previous economy, cf. Marty 1980, pp. 99. 101. 108; Asséo 2009, p. 117: 'a residual investment in a mental landscape in ruins'; also see: Nicolaidis 2003a, p. 54.
- 339 Marty 1980, p. 109; cf. Marty 1984b, p. 1155; cf. Marty 1972, p. 810; Marty 1980, p. 93f.
- 340 Marty 1980, pp. 24. 26. 33. 45, 279fn.50: 'the emergence, artificial as it were, of an island alive amidst mental disorganisation. This island alive is nevertheless symptomatic of the possibility to at least arrest the disorganisation by putting into place a psychotherapy'; cf. Marty 1976, pp. 163. 187. and Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963 p. 15; also see Marty 1957[1956]a, p. 450.
- 341 Marty 1980, p. 91; cf. pp. 25. 46. 113; Marty 1976, p. 234; also see Marty and Fain 1955[1954]a, p. 225. André Green in Fine and Smadja 2000, p. 166, independently, expands on this: 'Yes, of course, because the analyst is there, there is always an object in practice. Only, [the thing is] we know, that we do not exist for certain patients. Sometimes, the transference is narcissistic to such a degree that we are an image totally fabricated for them, which is [then] called an object'.
- 342 Marty 1980, p. 21fn.22; und Marty 1980, p. 45; Marty 1976, p. 103fn.4; also see Szwec 2008b, p. 25.
- 343 Marty 1980, p. 91fn.133; pp. 131. 144; cf. p. 89fn.129; Marty and Parat 1974, p. 1072f.; Rouart 1981, p. 420f.; Parat 1994, p. 26; Fain 1994b, 156 points out what may happen, if the psychoanalyst gets this wrong: 'It is not rare that a positive dialogue gets installed that owns its completeness to the sentiment provided by the therapist. In fact, no interiorisation whatsoever occurs. At the same time and connected to this, no rejection appears which would show the beginnings of organisation. If, either after a [therapeutic] honeymoon, or, from the beginning, the therapist discerns the rise of the negative, it appears to him in the form of an invasion, more or less intense, of the *opérateur*.'
- 344 Marty 1976, p. 52.
- 345 Marty 1980, pp. 112. 120ff.
- 346 Marty 1980, p. 262. p. 264fn.23.24; cf. p. 26; on Marty's position on the *Moi idéal*: Fine 2004, p. 114; Asséo 1994, p. 59f. An autonomous ego, to the extent that it exists, is an aberration, rather than an achievement, see Fain and Marty 1965[1964], p. 570f.; Marty 1972, p. 808; Marty 1980, p. 23; Marty 1990a, pp. 46ff.; trying to escape from the unconscious as a false, but on occasion tempting, turn for anyone: Fain and Marty 1965[1964], p. 571: 'We concur once more, in our own way, with the opinion of Hartmann on the autonomous ego. A part of us has a tendency to separate from the unconscious and to seek out [*trouver*] an *opérateur* form of behaviour, while the disaffected part goes for somatic troubles [*entretient des perturbations somatiques*].'
- 347 Marty 1980, p. 46; on this approach Moreau 1998, p. 73.
- 348 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963 p. 176fn.43; Moreau 1998, p. 151.
- 349 Marty 1976, p. 98f.fn.2 with the pertinent passages, within the very long footnote, on p. 99; cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 80; Debray 1998, pp. 9. 12. A contemporary version of this, among families who migrated to Europe, is highlighted by de Micco 2014, p. 5f. cf. p. 10 (Manuscript transmitted as a Microsoft word document by the author).
- 350 On the latter Marty 1976, p. 171; for the difficulty to distinguish between the two, also see: Marty 1991/2013, p. 21.
- 351 Marty 1980, p. 104; cf. p. 110; Rouart 1981, p. 423f.; Marty 1972, p. 808.
- 352 '*Au niveau de la première topique, l'inconscient reçoit mais n'émet pas*', Marty 1980, p. 63; cf. pp. 62. 25. 207f.
- 353 Marty 1980, p. 61fn.88.
- 354 Cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 19f.; Marty 1984a, pp. 109. 106f.; Marty 1991[1990], p. 7; Marty 2001[1981], p. 165; Fine 1995a, p. 178f.
- 355 Cf. Marty 1980, p. 240; Moreau 1998, p. 143; for the inverse case see Marty 1980, p. 99.
- 356 Cf. Marty 1991/2013, p. 16f., also see Marty 1996[1991], p. 57; Nicolaidis 1998d, p. 1581, Moreau 1998, p. 143 a 'mental hemorrhage' unbeknownst to the patient.
- 357 The loss of someone close, Marty believes, may not be more traumatising for one adult, than, on a given day, for another one, the sentiment caused by the passage of a speck of dust through a sunray, Marty 1976, p. 102; cf. Marty 1984a, p. 103.
- 358 Cf. Marty 1980, p. 99.
- 359 Marty 1976.
- 360 Green 1998[1994], p. 26; also see Fine 1994, p. 42; Marty 1976, pp. 83. 123fn.1 and 2; Marty 1968[1967], p. 248f.
- 361 Marty 1976, p. 11f.

- 362 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1995d, p. 19. Braunschweig 1984, p. 122 draws a comparison to Freud's forces of Eros.
- 363 Marty 1967, p. 1126; Marty 1976, pp. 13ff.; cf. Pirlot 2010, p. 114.
- 364 Marty 1976, p. 125; cf. Fine 1994, pp. 44ff.; Parat 1994, p. 24f.; Asséo 1994, p. 59; Smadja 1991, p. 164; Smadja 1995b, p. 17; Smadja 1998c, p. 66; Marty 1996[1991], p. 72 holds that aggressive tendencies [*pulsions*] should not be ranged under the heading '*pulsion de mort*'.
- 365 Marty 1976, p. 69; cf. p. 80; and Marty 1980, p. 134; Marty 1991[1990], pp. 17ff.
- 366 Cf. Marty 1980, p. 119.
- 367 Melville 1853.
- 368 Cf. Marty 1972, p. 810; cf. p. 806: 'In my view, this is not a flight from the interior world but a lack of an interior world. It is not acting acting-out [the English term is used in the original], underpinned by preconscious fantasies but it is rather a life absorbed by action [*une vie agie*].'
- 369 Cf. Marty 1980, p. 14.
- 370 Cf. Marty 1996[1991], p. 31; cf. p. 26; Marty 1981[1980], p. 293.
- 371 See the remarks of de M'Uzan in Braconnier 2003, p. 29; Fine 2009, p. 44.
- 372 Cf. Brown 2000.
- 373 Cf. Fain 1994a, p. 7.
- 374 Marty 1996[1991], p. 67f.; de M'Uzan in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 20; Bernier 1994, p. 165, for Green's perspective: Green 1998[1994], p. 21.
- 375 Marty 1976, p. 117.
- 376 Green 1998[1994], pp. 17. 19. 24. 25. 27; Marty's perspective certainly extended beyond the workings of the psyche: in Marty 1980, p. 78fn.110 he discusses disorganisations in the vital tonus of animals. Nicolaïdis 1998e, p. 134 comes to Marty's defence, points out that Freud, on his part, had his own way of using biology in a metaphorical way, and argues (p. 135) that in the pre-mental the almost mental becomes visible. This should have made for animated discussions, but evidently at least one discussion, that between Green and Marty, faced inexplicable obstacles. André Green in Fine and Smadja 2000, p. 170f. remembers, with evident regret and irritation, the impossibility to draw Pierre Marty into a discussion. It seems he had, over the years, from a different angle come to a conclusion similar to the one Nicolaïdis 1995f, p. 216 drew: 'The thought of André Green and that of Pierre Marty often follow parallel paths. But we know that parallels only meet in infinity...'. Additional material on the startling complexities of this is provided by Marilia Aisenstein in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 6.
- 377 Cf. Lassmann 2013, pp. 78ff.; <http://www.ethnopsychiatrie.net/TobieNathan.html>.
- 378 Cf. Fain 1976, p. 742.
- 379 On this perspective also see David in David and de M'Uzan 1994, p. 21.
- 380 Cf. Marty 1972, p. 809; Fain 1976, p. 743; Chamcham 1998, p. 1659f. draws on recollections from 1918 colonial France on patients suffering from "*coulchitis*" - a term coined in Algiers for local patients who when asked what was wrong with them just said "*coulchi*", which was understood to mean "everything everywhere". The source seems to be Antoine Porot, whose view on Arab patients suffers from a strong, distorting supremacist bias and a lack of a workable cultural interface: Porot 1918; Piret 2011; Bennani 2008, pp. 84ff.; Chabane 1984, p. 19f. makes the valid point that what cannot be expressed should be understood in the context in which it cannot be expressed.
- 381 Freud 1914, p. 148f.
- 382 Cf. Marty and Fain 1964, p. 619f.; Fain 1976, p. 754; Marty 1980, p. 260fn.21; a consequence of very early difficulties of integration: 1957[1956]b, p. 480; Marty 2006[1987], p. 166f.
- 383 For anecdotal echoes of this put to use in fiction, Stephenson 2002/1999, pp. 140. 189.
- 384 Marty 1996[1991], p. 18; for some of the complexities, under the surface: Vande Kemp 2001.
- 385 Marty and Fain 1954[1953], pp. 245. 273; Marty 1976, pp. 49f. 52. 166; Marty 1980, p. 56; p. 31fn.38; on his lack of social bias: Parat 1994, p. 25.
- 386 Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 48fn.1; Marty 1980, p. 34; cf. p. 23; cf. Fine 2004, p. 126; also see Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 67f: 'Verbal expression, on the whole, can hardly make do without [*ne s'écarte guère de*] mimic expression and gestures, indication of a thought that tends towards the *opérateur*'.
- 387 See, for instance, reflections of René Roussillon's on the importance of a 'transference on the frame' on the part of non-neurotic patients: Roussillon 2008b, p. 105f.; cf. Roussillon 1991, pp. 584. 586. The institutional space provided must have given quite a particular flavour to the patients' understanding of what they were doing:
- Sit down, put yourself at ease – I am listening to you.
This is for what?.... because I have two.... is it for my ear?
Go ahead, yes
Is this here for my ear? Because I have two visits, one for my ear and the other to be questioned. (Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 23; cf. p. 99).

- This is a lunatic asylum [*une maison de fous*], I told my doctor it was a lunatic asylum and my doctor said, I am not sending you for that reason, it is to examine you. (Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 25).
- 388 As the authors themselves note, Marty, de M'Uzan and David 2003/1963, p. 211.
- 389 See the interview documented in Moreau 1998, p. 67f, cf. p. 151.
- 390 On Marty's eschewing the use of more familiar language: Fain 1976, p. 755.
- 391 Marty 1991[1990], pp. 19ff.; Marty 1984b, 1143f.; Pirlot 2013, pp. 145ff.; Debray 1998, pp. 59ff.; Zubiri 1994, pp. 181-183, also see Moreau 1998, pp. 70f.; p. 141f. There have been some reservations: proposing such a detailed framework might falsely give off the impression of a completeness, closed in upon itself, and as such not provide enough reminder of its necessary '*inachèvement*', Aisenstein 1994, p. 72, Debray 1994, p. 107; Debray 1996, p. 29f. ; Moreau 1998, p. 72 on the unease felt by many; also see Fain, M. (1965[1964], p. 72); *inachevée* could, with recourse to Bion, loosely be translated as 'containing a sufficient amount of unsaturated elements'.
- 392 Cf. Lê 1994, p. 102. Braunschweig 1984, p. 116 speaks of '*une théorisation quasi-exhaustive*': 'Marty', she writes, 'built an explanatory edifice starting with a pathology that seemed alien to me and which he knew perfectly well...'
- 393 Andréoli 1996, p. 131.
- 394 Debray 1994, p. 108; Debray 1998, p. 13; for Barcelona: Angulo 1994, pp. 168ff.; for Bilbao: Zubiri 1994, p. 179f.; on the impact in general: de Calatroni 1998, p. 13.
- 395 Debray 1994, p. 108; see the attempt to draw Joseph Sandler into a discussion which drew a polite non-response: Marty 1967[1965]; Sandler 1967[1965], p. 27f.
- 396 Debray 1994, p. 108; Diatkine 1994, p. 160f.
- 397 Reading Marty one gets the sense that with some patients he deals with there might be drama if only there were enough space and force both to envisage and to sustain it.
- 398 In a very French way, the discussion of the following decades also focused on what Marty had left unthought. Smadja and Szwec 1994, p. 6 showed a starting point: '*Avec son œuvre Pierre Marty nous a livré cet ensemble de contradictions qui lui sont inséperables*'.
- 399 On the '*pointe évolutive*' in a child: Marty 1984a, pp. 102-104 107fn.2; Marty 2001[1981], p. 162; Marty on Fain and Braunschweig's contribution Marty 1984a, p. 104; Marty 2001[1981], p. 164; on the vicissitudes of '*tonus vital*' in the course of the life cycle: Marty 1984a, p. 114; Marty 2001[1981], p. 169.
- 400 Also see Smadja 2012f, p. 204; for early interactions: Marty 1991/2013, p. 18; Marty 1991[1990], p. 8; Marty tends to list as fact what Fain develops as a scene see Marty 1984a, p. 105.
- 401 Fain 1990, pp. 1287. 1290, cf. Marty 1972, p. 809.
- 402 Aisenstein 2000, p. 10.
- 403 Kreisler, Fain and Soulé 1974, pp. 500-503.
- 404 Fain 1999b, p. 90 in reference to Duparc 1999c, pp. 74ff., an event also noted in Press 2010c, p. 41, who dates it in contradiction to Duparc 1999a, p. 11 as having taken place in 1997. I retain the date provided in Duparc 1999a, p. 11.
- 405 Cf. Fain 1999[1980], p. 196; Bergeret in Fain 1999d, p. 162; Nicolaïdis in Fain 1999d, p. 170, Fain 1981b, p. 985f.
- 406 Fain 1982, p. 18f.
- 407 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 115f.; cf. p. 119; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 10f.; also see pp. 88. 94. Because there are necessarily different layers of meaning, it would not be acceptable to reduce matters to deceptive simplicity: 'It was unpleasant to us that one might think we wanted to explain things clearly and simply. Every clear and simple explanation of mental phenomena [*phénomènes psychiques*] is an injury perpetrated to the human being', Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 115; also see: Fain 1970, p. 711; Fain 1984b, p. 8. Lear 2017, p. 205 concludes a chapter of his with an anecdote that seems to be a very close American approximation to what was important to Braunschweig and Fain: '[Hans] Loewald once prefaced a talk by saying that he hoped his remarks would shed a little darkness on the subject.'
- 408 Fain is notorious for the terseness of his style, striking for any first-time reader, see Riolo 2018, p. 485. Aisenstein and Papageorgiou 2018, p. 471, writing about Fain 2001a, say, 'Once again, we are dealing with an article written for an initiated public, where each sentence would deserve an exegesis and a commentary on its own account'. This, of course, would have been entirely reasonable and appropriate in the world of the Talmud, his father was imbued with, cf. Fain 1998g. On Fain's own family background, as the child of two foreigners in France, Aisenstein 2018, p. 495. Aisenstein 2018, p. 496, stresses Fain's qualities as a storyteller, and indeed, there are many stories waiting to be told embedded in his dense argumentative prose. Aisenstein 2018, p. 507 from personal memory says, 'his [spoken] discourse was among those that make listeners intelligent and creative'. Fain's way of writing has a background: in the climate of thought flourishing, earlier on, in the Sixties and Seventies, in which new frontiers of thought opened up for the avid new readers Freud had acquired in France, it was quite possible, for instance, for Conrad Stein to hold his audience in thrall by

- lecturing on Freud's seventh chapter of the 'Interpretation of Dreams' in his annual seminar but never making it beyond the detailed discussion of the opening three lines (Dreyfus 1999, p. 7) without distracting in the least from the suspense.
- 409 Cf. Duparc 1999c, p. 76f.; Fine 2011, p. 37f.; for Fain's own reminiscence Fain 1998f, pp. 145ff.; the *EPP* as a group of friends with different points of view: Donabédian 2010, p. 109, including a very different perspective on the *corrida*: de M'Uzan 2010, p. 17f.
- 410 Cf. Jaeger 2008, p. 48; Asseo 2005, p. 65f.
- 411 A position broadly similar to Serge Lebovici's attempts to find a stronger recognition for fantasmatic interactions within the findings of attachment theory, cf. Lebovici 1989.
- 412 Szvec 2013c, pp. 10f. 20; Green 2010b, p. 115; on the cooperation Fain 1999d, pp. 156. 158 and Fain 1999a, p. 51: 'As far as Denise is concerned, I should say I am not sure at all that I would have written anything good without her aid'. As Kamieniak 2017, p. 278 writes [about *Éros et Antéros*, Braunschweig and Fain 1971] 'Having emerged from a long correspondence with a daily exchange of letters, this dense and poetic, complex and colourful text reflects the pleasure of their dialogue and the impetus of the shared discoveries and innovations.' Aisenstein 2018, p. 498 recounts the importance of epistolary communications for Fain: '... if one of us had encountered a clinical problem, he was capable of responding with a very long letter full of personalized explanations, written at home on the pages of a notebook.'
- 413 Cf. Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 520fn.4; Fain 1982, p. 126; not just her love life: Fain 1999c, p. 139.
- 414 See Fain 1971a, pp. 321ff.; Fain 1981b, pp. 993ff.; Fain 1982, p. 37; Fain 1999[1980], pp. 209ff.; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 40; p. 263f.; Braunschweig and Fain 1976, p. 533; Braunschweig and Fain 1981a[1976], p. 208; an act of gradual weaning: Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 40; on the hysteric nucleus: Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 73; cf. p. 289f.; on the hysteric nucleus as a proto-form of double meaning: Cosnier 1978, p. 130; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 279.
- 415 Cf. Fain 1998c, p. 1494; Duparc 1999b, p. 19: the child constructs its mental apparatus around traces of an act that takes place behind the scenes, outside itself.
- 416 See Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 129. 184; Fain 1971a, p. 344 notes that as recently as 1968 he had not as yet developed the concept; for a short outline of the *censure de l'amante* see Ody and Danon-Boileau 2002; also see Maupas and Prudent-Bayle 2016, p. 497; for a recent review see: Kamieniak 2017.
- 417 Green himself makes a connection: Green 1983[1980], p. 253: 'Much has been talked about the *'censure de l'amante'* these last years, now it is my turn to lift the censorship that weighs on the dead mother'. In an interview Fain states that one germ of thought derives from reflections of Serge Leclaire's: 'A woman breastfeeding a child', Fain sums this up, 'is, at a given moment, associating on the erotic caressing she experienced with her lover in the past. This thought will be immediately repressed, but the infant will have perceived this disinvestment and repressed it at the same time', Fain 1999g, p. 189; also see Fain and Kreisler 1970, p. 293; The reference is apparently to Leclaire 1968, p. 71f. Leclaire was one of the outstanding analysts in Lacan's camp, recognised beyond partisan boundaries, but with a checkered history with Lacan, see Turkle 1978/1992, pp. 113f. 176. 255ff.; for a vivid vignette of Leclaire see Roudinesco 1986, pp. 292ff. Fain 1969a, p. 279 takes into account a mother physically present, but mentally absent, a situation developed by Green 1983[1980] and in their response to Green's presentation on the affect Braunschweig and Fain 1970, p. 1177 seem to imply an early version of the concept. As often in French psychoanalytic debates, mutual influences abound and Fain 1998c, p. 1493 acknowledges that the early stages of the debate on the negative stem from Green's thinking in the early 1960s. He also emphasises (p. 1494) that different studies should not be artificially separated from each other; Green's view on shared positions, especially with the negative expressed in mute disappearances: Green 2010b, p. 116.
- 418 Cf. Green 1983[1980], pp. 229f. 232f. 249; also see Pirlot and Cupa 2012b, pp. 47-54.
- 419 Fain 1999[1980], p. 209f.; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 39f. 263; Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 520; Fain 1986, p. 977.
- 420 Fain 1991b, p. 1132; cf. Fain 1986, p. 977.
- 421 Fain 1999[1987], p. 220: '*Le discours maternel à l'enfant (dans des conditions suffisamment bonnes) par l'affectivité qui s'y manifeste constitue un chant phonématique qui colle à la pensée animique du dit enfant*'; also see p. 225; Braunschweig and Fain 2010/1974, p. 160; cf. Fain 1989b, 2000; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 291f.
- 422 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 152; Fain 2000a, p. 423.
- 423 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 152 speak of the '*lien primitif mère-enfant, noyé dans le 'non-dit'*'. In my translation I follow the Italian interpretation by Giovanni Pavan: '*affondato nel "non detto"*': Braunschweig and Fain 1983[1975], p. 137.
- 424 Fain 1996a, p. 56; cf. Fain 1996b, p. 41; Fain 1999[1989], p. 242; Fain 2000a, p. 423; Fain 2001a, p. 33; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 120. 195; cf. Fain 1962, p. 205; Fain 1997d, p. 146.
- 425 Fain 1996a, p. 57; Fain 1999[1990], p. 258; Fain 1999h, p. 166f.; Fain 1993f, p. 1707: the boy sees his penis mirrored in the eyes of the mother.

- 426 *'S'en débarasser'*, Fain 1996a, p. 56; cf Fain 1971a, p. 322f.
- 427 Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 520: 'Domestic interchanges cease during the primal scene, which dis-couples itself from [existing] family structure', cf. Fain 1971a, pp. 293. 321; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 141. 194f.; Fain 1999f, p. 98.
- 428 Cf. Fain 1971a, p. 359; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 199.
- 429 Cf. Fain 1981b, pp. 989. 991; cf. Fain 1999[1980], p. 205f.
- 430 Fain 1986[1983], p. 99; Fain 1999[1980], p. 208; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 125. 179f.; also see the short vignette Fain 1997c, p. 1687.
- 431 Fain 1971a, p. 329.
- 432 Fain 1971a, pp. 291ff.; Fain 1982, p. 95; cf. Fine 2011, p. 42.
- 433 Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 520.
- 434 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 117. 120. 135. 184; Fain 1982[1980], p. 120. As Oliner 1988, p. 259 points out, 'It suggests that the absence of the object per se does not have to traumatize and that the presence is not necessarily beneficial. It remains for us to inquire into the quality of each, and the capacity of the erotic fantasies to transform each into a gratifying fantasy.'
- 435 Fain 1983, p. 326; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 266: 'What is customarily termed 'primal scene' is partly constituted by the perception on the part of the infant that the family nucleus is [now] no more than a formal unit, momentarily deprived of its libidinal cement by the sexual relations of the couple'; cf. p. 183.
- 436 Fain 1982[1980], p. 121; Fain 1981b, p. 994; Fain 1988, p. 113: 'At contact with its mother, the child perceives the mutation of her into *femme*. The *femme* places the child 'outside'. Via a precocious hysterical identification, the child invests, without seeing him, the sexual partner of the mother. If it thus [mentally] intrudes into the life of the [erotic] couple, it is in creating an internal inner space, broadly speaking the space of the dream'.
- 437 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 124; Ody 2000, p. 29.
- 438 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 133; cf. p. 49; p. 110fn.1; pp. 170. 179. 189. 229; cf. Fain 1999[1990], p. 257f.; Fain 1987[1986], p. 29.
- 439 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 245; cf. p. 295; also see Braunschweig and Fain 1976, p. 509; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 229; Fain 1982, p. 39; Fain 1999f, p. 103.
- 440 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 36. 45.
- 441 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 54.
- 442 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 145f. 246.
- 443 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 259.
- 444 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 208.
- 445 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 48.
- 446 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 48; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 239fn.1 refer to Lebovici and Soulé 1970 for research on the influence of the personality of the parents on the development of the child.
- 447 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 240, a matter which Braunschweig and Fain feel is not being taken sufficiently into account in English speaking post-Kleinian psychoanalysis: Braunschweig and Fain 2010/1974, p. 158; see however the more nuanced position in: Fain 1991d, p. 74. Pasche, to which the authors refer with regard to his understanding of the symbolic voices somewhat similar reservations with regard to Lacan, who has a certain disdain for concrete reality: 'That is why, contrary to Jacques Lacan, we do not think that it "would be illusory to look for reality beyond the wall of language" nor that "it is the world of words that creates the world of things"', Pasche 1960, p. 165.
- 448 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 157.
- 449 Cf. p. 168; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 185 expresses assent to Francis Pasche's position, who does not concede to language a '*valeur pulsionnelle*' as such outside a specific relationship to invested objects (see e.g. Pasche 1960, p. 168). They add that they agree to the extent language is understood as something that extends to communicable words. For further differentiation from Lacan: Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 220fn.2. The authors also take note of Green's work on affect, Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 166. In the light of this, a second look should be taken at Karen Gubb's statement 'By implication, the Paris School focuses more on individual constitutions than on early object relations, Gubb 2013, p. 135.
- 450 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 243f. 245. 256f.
- 451 Fain 1999[1992], pp. 265. 267. 269f.; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 292f.; Braunschweig and Fain 1976, p. 524; Braunschweig and Fain 1981b, p. 1240; Fain on p. 267 refers to a contribution by Denise Braunschweig which supposedly dates from 1973 and (p. 275) is referenced as "Braunschweig (Denise) (1973), *Angoisse et complexe de castration, sous la direction de A. Le Guen, A. Oppenheimer et R. Perron; Monographie de la Revue Française de Psychanalyse*, Paris, P.U.F, 1991". The book referred to does not list any contribution of Denise Braunschweig in the table of contents (Le Guen, Oppenheimer and Perron 1991, p. 6). The bibliography only mentions Braunschweig and Fain 1971 (Le Guen, Oppenheimer and Perron 1991, p. 155).

- 452 Braunschweig 1967, p. 856.
- 453 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 260.
- 454 Fain 1981a, p. 282; cf. Fain 1994b, p. 154; Fain 1999f, p. 103; also see Braunschweig and Fain 1981b, p. 1221; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 283 state that the archaic language discernible in dreams and the formations of the unconscious cannot be conceived 'without having received from the external world the complement necessary to acquire its symbolic value'; on this also see Fain 1977, p. 79f. The authors follow suggestions by Pasche, see Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 124. It seems that it is passages like Pasche 1960, pp. 159. 165. 168f. which they have in mind; cf. Fain 1974b, p. 316.
- 455 Fain 1981a, p. 282. Repeatedly Braunschweig and Fain point to the necessary balances that have to be struck: 'Desire, linked to the pleasant retention of a libidinal co-excitation born from need not immediately satisfied (the absence of the object) must therefore be closely backed up [*doublé*] by an organisation of primary narcissism', Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 216.
- 456 Fain 1981a, p. 282.
- 457 Fain 1982, p. 124; cf. p. 138; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 192f.; Braunschweig and Fain 1981b, p. 1237; also see Lucas 2010, p. 147.
- 458 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 76; cf. p. 185.
- 459 Fain 1999[1987], p. 220.
- 460 Braunschweig and Fain 1981b, p. 1241; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 291; Braunschweig and Fain 2010/1974, p. 159f.
- 461 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 83. 191.
- 462 Fain 1999[1980], p. 208; Fain 1991b, pp. 1131. 1133; Fain 1984a, p. 1223 on a child who has only been exposed to the fears of her mother about sexuality not embedded in recurrent sexual practice.
- 463 Fain 1986[1983], p. 100f.; also see Fain 1982[1980], pp. 115f. 118; Fain 1993a, p. 159.
- 464 Fain 1999[1987], p. 224.
- 465 Cf. Fain 1993b, p. 1091; Donabédian and Fain 1995/1993, p. 142; Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 276f.; the authors refer to concepts in French 1952 in development of work by Kurt Lewin.
- 466 Braunschweig and Fain 1981[1976], p. 208. Writing, in general, about Fain's perspective Flanders 2018, p. 63 observes, 'perhaps the shadow of Lacan falls more indirectly here than in the synthesis of Laplanche'.
- 467 Kreisler 1974, p. 15; Guédeney 2009, p. 5f.; Szwec 2009b, p. 7f.; Golse 2012, p. 358f.; on Lebovici: Geissmann and Geissmann 2004, pp. 576-582.
- 468 Kreisler 1974, p. 15; Aisenstein 2000, p. 31f.
- 469 For the discussions see Kreisler, Fain and Soulé 1974, pp. 72-104; also see: Fain 1966b, p. 725f.; Fain 1967, p. 1132; Braunschweig and Fain 1970, p. 1178; Aisenstein 1999, p. 27f.; Ody 1999, p. 67f.; on the impact: Jaeger 2008, p. 47.
- 470 Cf. Fain 1966b, p. 725; Braunschweig and Fain 1970, p. 1178; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 95. 120; Fain 1971a, p. 319f.; Fain 1993d, p. 59; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 228, in a somewhat different context, surmises that a mother who has herself experienced a 'good mother' transmits a balance between a certain amount of seduction and a certain amount of repression; Press 1999a, p. 39 stresses the fragility of the equilibrium; Fain 1971a, p. 291 reflects that a system highly ordered is one that has achieved a high degree of improbability.
- 471 Fain 1993b, p. 1091; Fain 1993d, pp. 59. 61; cf. Fain 1996a, p. 56; Fain 2000c, p. 74.
- 472 Braunschweig and Fain 1970, p. 1177f.; Fain 1969a, p. 280; also see the abusive giving of the breast mentioned in Braunschweig and Fain 1981b, p. 1230; Fain 1999f, p. 100 addresses difficulties with children that respond poorly to bodily contact with the mother and refuse to disengage from their play; Fain 1991d, p. 78: families have to provide the right sort of discontinuity for the child.
- 473 Braunschweig and Fain 1970, pp. 1177f. 1182: le *spasme du sanglot*, in English terminology 'breath holding spells'; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1974, p. 1042.
- 474 Cf. Fain 1999[1980], p. 193; Fain 1982, p. 101; Fain 1991d, p. 73; Fain 1993d, p. 61; Fain 1999d, p. 168 says 'As Freud was saying in *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, there exists a tendency in each and every one of us to become a vegetable: that is: to do nothing and budge no more', to continue p. 169: 'I believe it is to the extent that a mother is incapable, whatever she does, to turn her child into a vegetable, that erotism is going to appear'.
- 475 Braunschweig and Fain 1970, pp. 1178. 1180; Fain 1992d, p. 5; Fain 1993b, p. 1092; Fain 1993d, p. 62; Fain 1996a, p. 55; cf. Fain 1994d, p. 15; Press 1999a, p. 42.
- 476 Fain 1994d, p. 13.
- 477 Fain 1982, p. 132; Fain 1997d, p. 142.
- 478 Fain 1993e, p. 128; Fain 1995a, p. 740; Fain 1999[1990], p. 263; cf. Duparc 1999c, p. 85.
- 479 Fain 1999[1990], p. 257; the word in the French text is *blockhaus*; also p. 259.
- 480 Fain 1982, p. 19; cf. p. 20; cf. Donabédian and Fain 1995/1993, p. 146; also see Fain 1991d, p. 73.
- 481 In reversal of Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 95; cf. Fain 1982, p. 41.

- 482 Fain 1995a, p. 739; Fain 1995a, pp. 738. 742 expresses an affinity between his thinking on prematurity and Green's concept of primal anality. Green 1993b, p. 77 speaks of patients as if 'flayed alive', with their 'psychic envelopes' a mere crust; Fain 1991d, p. 73: projection in this does not disencumber the individual of what is too disturbing but rather evidence of what has been wrenched [*arraché*] from the subject.
- 483 Fain 1993e, p. 129; Fain 1995a, p. 739.
- 484 Fain 1982, p. 41; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 132.
- 485 Cf. Fain 1993e, pp. 135. 142; Press 1999a, p. 40.
- 486 '*L'impératif de prématurité*', Fain 1993b, p. 1091; Fain 1993d, pp. 60. 65; Donabédian and Fain 1995/1993, p. 151; Fain 1998g, at minute 1:15ff.
- 487 Fain 1995a, p. 738.
- 488 Fain 1969a, p. 282.
- 489 Donabédian and Fain 1995/1993, p. 146; cf. Fain 1993b, p. 1091; Fain 1995a, p. 743; Fain 1982, p. 41f.
- 490 Cf. Donabédian and Fain 1995/1993, p. 151.
- 491 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 37.
- 492 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 151fn.1; cf. p. 152; on squiggles and their benefits: Fain, 1995b, p. 1549.
- 493 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1971, pp. 199. 202. 265.
- 494 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 196f.
- 495 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 198; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 147.
- 496 Freud 1900, pp. 513ff.; Fain 1982, pp. 105ff.; Lacan 1973[1964], pp. 68ff.; on Lacan's reading of the dream see Chapman 2016.
- 497 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 107.
- 498 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 283f.
- 499 Cf. Fain 1999[1980], p. 192; cf. Fain 1982[1980], p. 104; Braunschweig and Fain 1983, pp. 579. 586
- 500 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 122.
- 501 Fain 1973, pp. 531. 538; commenting on the famous quip of the delinquent led to the gallows on a Monday, in Freud 1927, p. 383, Fain adds a further layer to the work of negation, by suggesting a situational context: the famous quip is a story concocted by the delinquent's accompanying assistants to shield them against any emergent feeling of pity: Fain 1973, p. 537.
- 502 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 47; Fain 1983, p. 327; Fain 1992d, p. 12; Fain 1999[1992], p. 272; Aisenstein 2000, p. 37; cf. Dufour 1999, p. 137; Dufour 2008, p. 30.
- 503 Fain 1982, p. 117.
- 504 Fain 1981b, p. 995; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1981a[1976], p. 225: 'let us give homage to Bion, who by his description, has shown that projective identification cannot in any case serve to elaborate a fantasy'; also see Fain 1982[1980], p. 122.
- 505 Fain 1981b, p. 995.
- 506 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 193; on p. 195 they state: 'In a nutshell, there emerges the notion of the necessity of the production of a certain tension of excitement, a tension born by the encounter of a living being (and therefore excitable) with circumstances (*une conjoncture*) the traumatic impact of which has to within a limited but sufficient dimension,....'. In the same year the authors take a similar approach to the shocks caused by Lacan in French psychoanalysis: Braunschweig and Fain 1975b, pp. 212. 222. 224.
- 507 Fain 1982, p. 117f.
- 508 Cf. Braunschweig 1982, p. 9f.
- 509 Cf. Fain 1990a, p. 1290; Fain 1997d, p. 141f.
- 510 Braunschweig and Fain 1981a, p. 207.
- 511 Fain 1982, p. 154f.
- 512 Fain 1982, p. 41f.; Fain 1971a, p. 329; see Gillibert 1983, p. 862.
- 513 Fain 1982, p. 44; Fain acknowledges Alain de Mijolla's work on intergenerational influences: de Mijolla 1981.
- 514 Fain 1982, pp. 43; 156; also see Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 267; lovers as a threat to group psychology: Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 279. Aisenstein 2018, p. 504fn.7 emphasises Fain's interests 'in collective psychology and the individual psychic movements linked to a mass or community, whether imaginary or real and social'; also see Aisenstein and Papageorgiou 2018, p. 471 on Fain's interests in 'the close but antagonistic relations between individual erotic desire and collective psychology'.
- 515 Fain 1990a; cf. Fain 1991c, p. 1722: 'it is true when one has few means at one's disposal, it is a benediction from heaven to find them splendid'.
- 516 See Fain 1990a, p. 1284; cf. Fain 1969c, p. 952.
- 517 Fain 1990a, p. 1285, cf. p. 1283.
- 518 Fain 1990a, p. 1286; Fain 1996a, p. 63.
- 519 Fain 1990a, p. 1287; on handling dolls also see: Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 225.

- 520 Fain 1990a, p. 1287: 'In this Winnicottian perspective the *rouleur de mécaniques* is an individual produced, created, by the unconscious of another (*d'un(e) autre*)'; also see Fain 1996a, p. 59.
- 521 Fain 1990a, p. 1290.
- 522 Cf. Fain 1990a, pp. 1285. 1290; Fain 1996a, p. 63.
- 523 Fain 1990a, p. 1287; cf. Fain 1969b, p. 602; in related cases Fain reflects that there may not be so much a refusal of passive situations rather than a deep incapacity to establish them: Fain 2001a, p. 34; virility as a character defence against the hysteric: Fain 1982, pp. 37. 59; also see Fain 1999h, p. 167.
- 524 Fain 1990a, p. 1289.
- 525 *Une activité représentative*; Fain 1990a, p. 1289; also see Fain 1996c, p. 136f.
- 526 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 183fn.1: '*Serait-ce un Moi qui "dormirait debout"? Sans le secours du rêve.*'
- 527 Fain 1993a, p. 160; cf. Fain 1982, p. 147f.
- 528 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 259-302; also see Donabédian 2012, pp. 45ff.
- 529 See Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, pp. 262ff. 270fn.1 specifically mentions advertising; Fain 1982, p. 17; Fain 1971a, p. 356 on the consumer society. I contract several statements for the purposes of presentation and compact them into one scene.
- 530 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 264: 'As we are in the midst of explaining, the *néo-besoin*, according to the desexualising intention of those who propose it (first from outside the subject, then from inside, mediated by secondary narcissistic identifications constitutive of his/her Me), aims at dissimulating its character as 'need' artificially acquired under the appearance of an erotic promise.
- 531 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 262.
- 532 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 266; also see Fain and Kreisler 1970, p. 300; Fain 1969c, p. 944f.
- 533 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 267.
- 534 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 267.
- 535 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 276f., in reference to French 1952, see, for instance, French 1952, pp. 216ff.
- 536 Fain 1991c, p. 1722; Fain 1982, pp. 121f. 155.
- 537 Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 277; see Fain 1996a, p. 57: 'This dispossession comprises *ipso facto* a factor of distortion in the organisation of the Me: not having been invested narcissistically, the subject finds itself in a situation that deprives it of its own elaboration...'; Fain 1990a, p. 1290: 'the prematurity of development may be the feat of someone else'.
- 538 Fain 1982, pp. 107-119.
- 539 Fain 1982, p. 109.
- 540 Fain 1982, p. 110.
- 541 Fain 1982, p. 110.
- 542 Fain 1982, pp. 111. 113f.
- 543 Fain 1982, p. 111f.; also see Fain 1998c, p. 1495; Fain 2001b, p. 16.
- 544 Fain 1982, p. 107f.
- 545 Cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 51fn.1: on the toxicity of the absence of meaning of a symptom; lost sense, however, does not equate nonsense: Fain 1993d, p. 63.
- 546 Fain 1982, p. 108f.; on the juxtaposition of two different versions of mental reality: Braunschweig and Fain 1983, p. 571, also see Fain 1982[1980], p. 122.
- 547 Fain 1982, p. 110.
- 548 Fain 1982, p. 110.
- 549 See his remarks about what he has taken away from a book by Pasche: 'One has to be F. Pasche to grasp that the *Comédie humaine* of Balzac constitutes a work that constantly shows the drama of disequilibria, measured against an implicit middle line', Fain 1970, p. 718.
- 550 Fain 1992d, p. 7.
- 551 Fain 1989a, p. 1272: 'Now, the hypotheses which I have been able to make always envisage an encounter. Thus it is – and there may be a polemic attitude against the genetic ideas – that I have described the newborn as an individual complete from the beginning, if one admits that all his possibilities are held in stewardship [*mises en gérance*] (a term introduced by P. Marty) in the social environment of the family. In stewardship means that the child is proprietor of his potentialities thus allocated and that he ought be reimbursed once the moment comes. ... In this perspective, still according to my hypothesis, the mother, inseparable from the frame of the family, plays a leading role of as an intermediary between the child and all the locations where the future potentials of the child are deposited; ... For example, a mother may know that there exist psychoanalysts able to help her, without necessarily understanding how. How different may be the destiny of a child, if difficulties in his/her development appear, depending on whether he/she will be taken to Professor Debray-Ritzen [known for his strident opposition to psychoanalysis] or to a competent psychoanalyst. Let us in passing note the privileged stewardship offered potentially by a well trained child psychoanalyst'; see Fain 1998a, p. 28: 'It is not a question of culture or erudition but of knowing that there exists, depending on the problem, the right door to knock at. Behind these right doors there exist means of the exterior world able to

- take important action on a child still ignorant of the exterior world. One may, as a child suffering from some psychological problems, have been taken either to S. Lebovici or to P. Debray-Ritzen'; Fain 1984a, p. 1209f: it does matter what kind of cultural toolbox the child's holding framework: '*l'importance que jouent dans la vie d'un sujet les capacités de communication de son encadrement avec les connaissances de son temps*', cf. p. 1227; along somewhat similar lines: Fain 1984b, p. 8: if factors that concern the frame in which our practice takes place 'our discussions, as serious and reflected they may be on the transmission of psychoanalysis, are at risk to resemble Byzantine propositions ignorant of the presence of the Turks'.
- 552 Cf. Fain 1992d, p. 9. This seems to be a slightly different nuance from the configuration envisaged in McDougall 1980 [1972], p. 352: 'The early break between the self and its important objects would seem to have destroyed not only the continuing capacity for libidinal investment, but also the desire to explore, to question, to know more. *This is the death of curiosity* [emphasis in the original]. ... The magic book of fantasies about all that links one human being to another has been firmly closed - and in its place come the rules of conduct and an operational relation to the external world.' because it seems to suggest that there was a time when it was accessible before it was closed.
- 553 Fain 1997b, p. 69, more literally: it is the drop that makes the vase overflow.
- 554 See Fain 1997b, p. 72f.
- 555 Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 100; cf. Fain 1997c, p. 1685; Braunschweig and Fain 1983, p. 587; Fain 1969a, p. 284: 'Laurence, who symbolises to the utmost social life today is also the symbol of the heathen hells'.
- 556 Fain 1997b, p. 72; cf. Fain 1999g, p. 191.
- 557 Fain 2001a, p. 30; If one does not have a fertile imagination that knows how to discern the richnesses of a desert, one remains disconcerted: Fain 1966a, p. 451.
- 558 Fain 1965, p. 106.
- 559 Fain 1968, p. 87; Fain 1983, p. 325, in assent to Francis Pasche's opinion.
- 560 Cf. Fain 1993d, p. 65; Fain 1992d, p. 19.
- 561 Shorter 1975, p. 197 in reference to a source from the 19th century.
- 562 Shorter 1975, p. 172.
- 563 Cf. Fain 1982[1980], 110; Fain 1993d, p. 61; cultural values play part in a possible apotheosis of calm: cf. Fain 1993b, p. 1092.
- 564 Cf. Fain 1982[1980], p. 110; Fain 1982, p. 41; Fain 1994c, p. 1046; on the co-existence of 'too little meaning' with 'too much meaning': Fain 1997a, p. 15; and in dialectic position to Green: Fain 1998f, p. 146.
- 565 Cf. Fain 2000b, p. 70f.
- 566 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 117f.; Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 516.
- 567 Fain 1971a, pp. 298. 301. Something also emphasised by Chagnon 2012, p. 246.
- 568 Cf. Fain 1971a, p. 298; Fain 1971a, p. 299f. states that one interpretation of Melanie Klein renders her view '*une véritable théorie janséniste*', [loosely translated, considering the context: a predestinarian theory]; yet Fain 1971a, p. 340 proposes a perspective that though it may not exactly be Jansenist, approaches the same result from a different angle: 'Popular wisdom, by the way, places a circle of fairies, good ones and bad ones around the cradle of royal infants - rarely born from love, in their birth justified by reasons of state - whose destiny, as a matter of principle, has been fixed in advance'; also see: Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 160; Fain 1971a, p. 314: with some patients a Kleinian system predominates in their mental economy.
- 569 Cf. Fain 1999e, p. 1739; Fain 1996a, p. 61f.; Fain 1993a, p. 158; Fain 1991a, p. 195.
- 570 Fain 1993b, p. 1093.
- 571 Cf. Fain 1982, pp. 26. 88; in a similar approach towards Melanie Klein: Fain 1971b, p. 1088.
- 572 Fain 1982, p. 118.
- 573 Bion 1991, p. 221. The passage is not mentioned by Fain.
- 574 Fain 1982, p. 156.
- 575 Fain 1982, p. 156; cf. p. 95f.; Fain 1987[1986], p. 26f; Braunschweig and Fain 1976, p. 485; Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 267; Fain 1970, p. 715f.
- 576 Fain 1982, p. 156.
- 577 Fain 1982, p. 115f.
- 578 see Braunschweig and Fain 1975a, p. 37; Fain 1989a, p. 1272
- 579 Fain 1982, pp. 89. 91.
- 580 Fain 1982, p. 96.
- 581 Fain 1982, p. 96.
- 582 Fain 1982, p. 133; Fain 1998c, p. 1496; cf. Fain 1995a, p. 739; Braunschweig and Fain 1981a[1976], p. 221: 'the most grave cases are those who were obliged to construct a self-holding environment [*un auto-encadrement*; cf. Fain 1969c, p. 962], which confers on them rigidity and fragility at the same time.
- 583 Fain 1982, p. 26f.; cf. p. 52; Fain 1993b, p. 1089; Fain 1987[1986], p. 25.
- 584 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 119.

- 585 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 16; Fain 1970, p. 718; for Freud's approach Fain 1987[1986], p. 38.
- 586 Fain 1966b, p. 722.
- 587 Fain 1965, p. 107.
- 588 Fain 1966b, p. 727f.; also see Fain 1999g, p. 191; Fain 1969c, p. 960.
- 589 Fain 1982[1980], p. 123; Fain 1992c, p. 1445f.; further down he declares himself to be a '*métapsychologist blanchi sous le harnais*' – a veteran metapsychologist turned grey under the harness over the many years of battle, Fain 1992c, p. 1447.
- 590 Fain 1966b, p. 722.
- 591 Fain 1992c, p. 1446.
- 592 Fain 1992c, p. 1446; also see: Fain 2001a, p. 34: the introjection of the bad breast is a consequence of the lacking sublimated investment of the child on part of the mother; precocious prematurity compared to Klein persecutory position: Fain 1966b, p. 726; mechanisms described by Klein are a response to early failures: Fain 1971a, p. 356f.; an expression of a certain conflictual scenario: Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 85; 'the theory of Melanie Klein lacks parents who are a father and a mother, a man and a woman, and not just mythical *procréateurs*': Braunschweig and Fain 1971, p. 14.
- 593 Fain 1999b, p. 93f. mentions presuppositions of Marty's, evidently not shared by Fain, and those by Klein, equally doubtful to him, within the same passage; cf. Fain 1998c, p. 1494; Klein did not explain how her concepts squared with the theory of narcissism and the hallucinatory realisation of desire: 'if an author is expected constantly to ensure this work [of comparison], there hardly remains any time for him/her to express him/herself' Fain 1971a, p. 306. The amount of divergent emphasis between Marty and Fain, might well have, under different circumstances, warranted the emergence of a new school in bitter feud with the original line: in this case it did not produce this result and Marty and Fain never fell out with each other.
- 594 Fain 1998b, p. 425f.; cf. Braunschweig and Fain 1976, p. 527. Lebovici and Widlöcher 1980, p. x state '...psychoanalytic books published in our country are not, or are not solely based on the usual scientific model, where one or more hypotheses are proposed and subjected to verification from observational data.'
- 595 Cf. Fain 1982, p. 133; Fain 1969a, p. 283; barriers to shared symbolisation - Fain 1989b, p. 2001 – may, but probably are not always, a problem lodged in the psyche of one of the participants, as another look at Press 2001a, p. 30 might suggest.
- 596 He was, in 1953, one of the translators of Otto Fenichel's *The Psychoanalytic Theory of Neurosis* into French: Fain 1974a, p. vii.
- 597 Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 520fn.3; Fain 1989a, p. 1271f.
- 598 Bion 1982, Bion 1985, frontispiece; Braunschweig and Fain 2010/1974, p. 159 – also see Fain 1971b, p. 1093 - noted with regret an insufficient recognition of the *après-coup* among Kleinian authors: discovering Bion's frequent considerations of an *avant-coup* would have been much to their liking.
- 599 A bear badly licked, Fain 1998d, p. 11.
- 600 Etymologies XII.2.22; Barney, Lewis, Beach and Berghof, p. 252f.
- 601 Fain 1998d, p. 11; cf. Fain 1992d, p. 17.
- 602 Fain 1998e, p. 108: the therapist introduces elements into the mental apparatus apt to be hallucinated; Fain 1992a, p. 331: the setting stimulates latent thought; Fain 1993c, p. 122: intervals of absence aid the process of identification; Fain 1999g, p. 192: the analyst, like the mother introduces elements of autoerotism to the patient; also see André 2000, p. 188f.; Fain 1982, p. 150f: the analyst is messenger of a culture a large part of which remains unknown to him/herself; Braunschweig and Fain 2010/1974, p. 171 about fantasies, in a certain clinical context, to be constructed rather than re-constructed; also see Braunschweig and Fain 1977, p. 998f. and Fain 1969c, pp. 948. 950.
- 603 Fain 1999g, p. 186.
- 604 Fain in Fain and Guignard 1984, p. 517fn.1; Fain 1989a, p. 1272; Fain 1991a, p. 193.
- 605 Even for a Francophone reader, cf. Roux 1985, p. 1594, for a view from Italy Masciangelo and Racialbuto 1987, p. 540.
- 606 See Chapman 2012, pp. 475ff.; Stone 2008/2004; Forster 1988, pp. 183ff.; Leighton 1986, p. 23f. Karlin 1985, p. 175f. observes 'The source of both love and writing is, for Browning, the same, an act of mind, an appropriation of imaginative space from which to speak...'
- 607 Petacchi 1978, p. 471; for his connections to *IPSO*, see Nicolaïdis 1998c and Nicolaïdis and Press 2004, p. 5f. the '*Tribune de Genève*' carried obituaries of Nicolaïdis in July 2016, and, earlier, in May 2012 of his wife Graziella, see 'Nicolas "Nicos" Nicolaidis' and 'Graziella Nicolaidis'.
- 608 Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 37.
- 609 Ey 1950, p. 448, quoted in Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 37.
- 610 Cf. Nicolaïdis 2003a, p. 18f. 24; Chazaud 2004.
- 611 An aspect duly noted by Masciangelo and Racialbuto 1987, p. 536; also see p. 533: 'while it seems that the importance of absence and negation has been amply recognised in its importance for the constitution of a way of thinking that has semiological characteristics, this has not happened to the same extent with difference.

- Nicolaïdis certainly fills this lacuna'.
- 612 Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 10-13; Nicolaïdis 1992, pp. 1640-42; Nicolaïdis 1988, pp. 82-85. 138-140; Nicolaïdis 1980a, p. 167f.; Nicolaïdis 1980b, pp. 203f. 207f.; Nicolaïdis 1973, p. 479; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, pp. 28-30. 41; also see the review of Nicolaïdis 1993 by Jacques Press: Press 1997d. Nicolaïdis thus tackles from another angle, what, according to Oliner 1988, p. 12, French analysts are not very much interested in: the aspect of separation-individuation, Oliner 1988, p. 12.
- 613 See Nicolaïdis and Andréoli 1986, p. 347 on the necessary *Urverdrängung*, which sets things into motion: '*le refoulement originaire est un acte de départage qui inaugure l'évolution de l'appareil psychique à travers une première déliaison du Moi de la source de l'excitation ...*'
- 614 Cf. Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 41f.
- 615 Nicolaïdis 1995b, p. 1192; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 37; Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 255.
- 616 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1064 fn.; Nicolaïdis points out that this is something the Greeks termed *hybris*, cf. Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 38f.; cf. Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 256. Also see Nicolaïdis 2009a, p. 154.
- 617 Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 46; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 29.
- 618 Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 28f.; for an analysis of the development of the Sphinx myth from incubus to an emitter of enigma see Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 81f., Nicolaïdis 1982a, pp. 860ff. Also see Nicolaïdis 1977, p. 1107f. about Apollo's prehistory and his differentiation from Mother Earth. After separation, auto-erotism can come into play: '*Autrement dit il faut être suffisamment auto-érotique pour pouvoir avoir des objets internes ou externes*', Nicolaïdis 1977, p. 1110.
- 619 Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, pp. 32. 35. 38; Nicolaïdis 1989c, p. 111.
- 620 Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 13f.; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 14; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 55.
- 621 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 17f.
- 622 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 16; cf. Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 85.
- 623 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 89. 99; and the implications of Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1063.
- 624 Nicolaïdis 1989a, p. 1874; cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 21: *anémique*. Press 1997d, p. 217 points out the centrality of affect in Nicolaïdis' thought.
- 625 Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 10. 16. 20.
- 626 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 17f.; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 10; Nicolaïdis 1989b, p. 1872.
- 627 Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 8; Winnicott 1974, p. 103, in French 'state of affairs' is rendered as '*l'état de chose*'; further see: Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 32f.; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 90; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 40.
- 628 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1989b, p. 1872; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1037, cf. p. 1053fn. 85.
- 629 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1044fn. 44; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 32f.;
- 630 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1044.
- 631 Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 13.
- 632 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1043; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1053, cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 104.
- 633 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1042, Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 38. 110; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1042fn.37; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 81; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1046; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1044fn.45; cf. Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1977, p. 283; Nicolaïdis and Papilloud 1988, p. 525.
- 634 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1999c, p. 174; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 81; Nicolaïdis 1980b, p. 205; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1053; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1061fn.120; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 28; Nicolaïdis and Papilloud 1988, p. 530; Nicolaïdis 1992, p. 1641.
- 635 Nicolaïdis 2004, p. 12; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1044; p. 1058.
- 636 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1058; cf. Nicolaïdis and Papilloud 1988, p. 530; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1044fn.43; p. 1046.
- 637 Nicolaïdis 1995a, p. 568; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 87.
- 638 Nicolaïdis 2003a, p. 125f.; Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 17; Nicolaïdis 1995e, pp. 263-265. 275; cf. Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 17.
- 639 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1045; p. 1047f.; p. 1052. On how this can go wrong: Nicolaïdis 2009a, p. 141.
- 640 Nicolaïdis 1981, p. 1030; Nicolaïdis 1995c, p. 1696; cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 145; Nicolaïdis 1981, p. 1029; Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 247f.; Nicolaïdis and Papilloud 1988, p. 524; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 90.
- 641 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1045; cf. Nicolaïdis 1998b, p. 73f.; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 153f.; Nicolaïdis 1980b, p. 207; Nicolaïdis 2009a, p. 158 makes a related point about the music of language: 'In generalising this suggestion, we can say that the necessary detachability for the freedom of movement within the mind [*l'appareil psychique*] must be accompanied by intonation, which at the beginning of life, establishes the first rhythms necessary for the survival of the baby. These rhythms have to become rapidly asymmetrical and polytropic in order to escape the domination of the compulsion of repetition.' Lenarduzzi 2005, p. 34f. considers family myth in its relation to the vulnerability of a person to psychosomatic illness. He argues that in 'psychosomatic families' disease has an immovable status. (p. 34). In broad antithesis to this, Nicolaïdis and Cornu 1976, p. 326 emphasise that words used in psychoanalysis should leave enough material for the imagination to work upon: '*Dans cette optique nous pensons que les mots, composant le discours psychanalytique doivent investir la chose imparfaitement pour laisser une marge de fantasmatisation et d'ambiguïté polysémique, créant ainsi*

- l'espace dans lequel se situe le Signifiant psychanalytique.*' For this to happen, the psychoanalytic frame is needed: '*Ce cadre a sa propre signifiante structurale et affective étant à la fois, dans sa vacillation et ambiguïté, le signifiant premier avant la lettre.*', Nicolaïdis and Cornu 1976, p. 329.
- 642 Nicolaïdis 2001a, p. 8; cf. p. 14. Nicolaïdis 2001a, p. 56: '*Préconscient qui devait être, au début de sa structuration, alphabétisable (par la relation enfant-mère, entourage) et ensuite alphabétisé.*'
- 643 Nicolaïdis 1995c, p. 1697f.; Nicolaïdis 1999b, p. 1903f.
- 644 Nicolaïdis 1982b, p. 200; cf. Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 28; cf. Nicolaïdis 1995e, p. 285; Nicolaïdis 1991, p. 1187; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 38.
- 645 Nicolaïdis 2004, p. 15f.; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 42, referring approvingly to the work of Winnicott and René Diatkine, cf. p. 53.
- 646 Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 410; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1045; Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 249; Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 56. 88; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1060, cf. 1052; Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 419fn. 33; Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 268. Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1989, p. 63 offer the following explanation for *mythhistorème*, a word which doesn't exist, but should: *oeuvre d'imagination en prose (roman)*, from whence one can see a rather close connection between 'imagination' and 'myth' in Nicolaïdis' thinking. A *mythoplaste*, p. 64, would be a '*créateur, inventeur de légendes, de mythes, de contes. Riche en imagination.*' Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1997, p. 24 write, 'It is always the case that the individual and a people construct a device [*un "appareil"*] which is mental [*psychique*] for the subject, ethnic and cultural for the people; and they do so by putting into a mythological scene, an "other scene" Lacan would say, or space which contains and signifies desire. In this sense, mythology encompasses a field larger than it is usually accorded.'
- 647 Nicolaïdis 1999b, p. 1901; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 7; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 105; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 56.
- 648 Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 411; Nicolaïdis 1985, p. 205.
- 649 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 56, cf. Nicolaïdis 1987, p. 779.
- 650 Nicolaïdis 1979a, pp. 409-411; Nicolaïdis 1980a, p. 180. In Nicolaïdis and Abraham 1989, p. 799 the authors point out that desire is always outside the order of biologically grounded necessities.
- 651 Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 417; p. 409f.; see p. 417fn.28 quoting with approval Rudhardt 1977, p. 316.
- 652 Nicolaïdis 1999a, p. 4; Nicolaïdis 1991, p. 1188; cf. Nicolaïdis 1998d, p. 1580f.; Nicolaïdis 1995e, p. 285; Nicolaïdis 1999b, p. 1891; cf. Gould 1990, p. 55; mirroring the three basic modes mentioned in Masciangelo and Racalbutto 1987, p. 537: active, passive and reflexive.
- 653 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1054fn.90; p. 1064fn.126; Nicolaïdis 1999a, p. 6ff.; Nicolaïdis 1998d, p. 1579f.; Nicolaïdis 1991, p. 1188. Nicolaïdis 1997b, p. 331 says the mother has to be sufficiently *esthésisante*. This is a word unknown to the Grand Robert in its 1992 edition. In the context it is being used as an antithesis to anesthesia, with the connotation of not transmitting too much or too little signification.
- 654 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1991, p. 1187; Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 410 with Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 4, reiterated in Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 22: 'every people [has] the mythology and the religion 'that it deserves'; see also Nicolaïdis 1985, p. 210; Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 413 and fn.17. In Nicolaïdis 1989c, p. 102 he reaffirms, 'The postulate of this article, expressing the reflections of a psychoanalyst and not a theologian, is that man created God (or the divinities) in his own image and not the other way round, which brings me to say that every people has the myths and the religion that it deserves.'
- 655 Nicolaïdis 1996c, p. 11.
- 656 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1995, p. 565; Nicolaïdis and Papilloud 1988, p. 523; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1977, p. 283; Nicolaïdis 1999a, p. 10; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 76.
- 657 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 153f.; Nicolaïdis 1980b, p. 213f.; p. 207
- 658 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1995e, p. 285; see also Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 50 and Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 75 on the link to mythological fantasies '*qui ravitaillent pulsionnellement*', providing libidinal nourishment.
- 659 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 89f.; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 135. This would be the reverse side of what Nicolaïdis 1996c, p. 11f. describes as follows: 'In this way, the *fantasme* of the subject (individual "myth") remains an open organisation to the extent that it is inspired and structured as much as possible by the uncertainty of meaning which collective myth offers in its *polytropie fantasmatique*. This polytropy of the mythical frame in which the subject is developing, helps him/her to follow a trajectory of open-ended auto-organisation and [thus] to escape the "monotrope" path of the individual destiny of the pulsion [*destin pulsionnel individuel*].' Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1989, p. 77 offer the following definitions of polytrophe: '*ingénieux, polyvalent, habile, adroit*'.
- 660 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 152; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 19.
- 661 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 416fn.26; Roux 1986, p. 1595; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 38; Nicolaïdis 1975, pp. 254. 256. 261. 267f. 269; Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 254. Nicolaïdis finds the lack of a preconscious in Kleinian theory rather worrying: '*Comment peut-on fonctionner comme psychanalyste en court-circuitant le préconscient, comme le font, par exemple, les Kleiniens dans leur théorie et leur pratique*', Nicolaïdis 1984b, p. 741.
- 662 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 26; Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1063.

- 663 Cf. Wilgowicz 1996, p. 1067; Nicolaïdis 1975, pp. 252f.; 254f.; 262; Nicolaïdis 1988, pp. 4. 8. 39. 41. 43f. 45f.; Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 413.
- 664 Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 43. 48; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 91; Nicolaïdis 1988, pp. 41. 47; Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1994, p. 43; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 93.
- 665 Eg. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 88.
- 666 Nicolaïdis 1975, p. 268; for a similar criticism see McNay 2008, p. 32.
- 667 Cf. Florence 2006, Fressard 2006, Tello 2003, pp. 71. 85.
- 668 Nicolaïdis 1979b, p. 1037 in implied contradistinction to 1975, p. 268; cf. Green 1973, p. 221: 'affect is a glance at the body moved'; Nicolaïdis 1999a, p. 6; cf. Nicolaïdis 2001b, p. 5f.
- 669 Cf. Green 1973, p. 192; Nicolaïdis 1988, p. 50; for the difference between *fantasme* and myth see Nicolaïdis 1980b, p. 199; on the role of fantasy as a connector between organism and environment: Nicolaïdis 1971, p. 1013.
- 670 Nicolaïdis 2000a, p. 7. As Press 1997d, p. 216 states: 'For, if P. Marty defined it [*mentalisation*] as the quantity and quality of representations at a given moment, he tells us very little about what conditions not so much the quantity as the quality and the constancy of said representations.'
- 671 Cf. Conté 1993/2003, p. 317; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 41; Nicolaïdis 1990, p. 1637; Nicolaïdis 1995e, p. 272.
- 672 On the algorithm cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 20; Nicolaïdis 1989b, p. 1873f.
- 673 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1977, p. 284; cf. Roux 1985, p. 1595f. In a different context, Nicolaïdis writes, 'How, or rather by whom, does a material take on a specific quality and becomes potentially transformable? (*Comment, ou plutôt par qui, un matériau devient spécifique et virtuellement transformable?*). By someone who has a special aptitude....', Nicolaïdis 2009b, p. 187. This aptitude, as other parts of Nicolaïdis' work show, are to some extent in a dialectic relationship with the basic toolkit that has been made available.
- 674 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 2.
- 675 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 136.
- 676 Start the Week 11th November 2013, at 12:33ff.; cf. Winterson 2011; a tradition, not a heredity, as Nicolaïdis would point out [1995e, p. 285], a counterforce against entropy [1993, p. 78], as well as against brutishness [1993, p. 145], synonymous with desire [1998a, p. 15].
- 677 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 85; cf. Nicolaïdis 1979a, p. 417 quoting with approval Rudhardt 1977, p. 316.
- 678 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1988, pp. 81ff; see the negative development sketched in Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 92f.
- 679 Nicolaïdis 1984a, pp. 49. 55; Roux 1985, p. 1595; cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 42; Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 112; cf. Nicolaïdis 2003a, p. 61f. In Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 49 the author writes, 'In other words, the referent apparently is an object "pre-hallucinatory" (not hallucinable) and, as a consequence, without any defensive value, because this "object", being not substitutable, cannot be replaced except by itself. We have already seen that the "relation" to the referent does not represent a link, but a break-up, a meaningless *a-signifiant* corresponding to a quantum of affect (of energy) without any partitioning wall, without skin, which cannot be linked into an object representation.....'. Thanopoulos 1997, p. 393 comments, 'Under these conditions the prospect of an evolution towards the symbolic (transitional) gets lost and in its place the relation to the concrete takes over.'
- 680 Forster 1924, p. 147: '.. but the echo began in some indescribable way to undermine her hold on life. Coming at a moment when she chanced to be fatigued, it had managed to murmur, 'Pathos, piety, courage - they exist, but are identical, and so is filth. Everything exists, nothing has value'. If one had spoken vileness in that place, or quoted lofty poetry, the comment would have been the same - 'ouboum' '; cf. Nicolaïdis 2003a, p. 134f.; Nicolaïdis 1997a, p. 147.
- 681 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 115; Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 118f., 127; Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 116. 120.
- 682 Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 116. 128; cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 134.
- 683 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 125; Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 129f. As Oliner 1988, p. 6 observes, 'Typically, many French analysts have remained with the original formulation of Thanatos and have not settled for its later, more generally accepted version: aggression.'; cf. p. 258.
- 684 Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 138; Nicolaïdis 1993, pp. 77f. 130; cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a p. 137; cf. p. 99; cf. Nicolaïdis 2005, p. 170; Nicolaïdis 1999a, p. 9. The passages referred to are in Freud 1920, pp. 25ff., where for the purpose of his argument he uses a mental experiment about the basic functioning of a primitive entity of living matter, an undifferentiated vesicle [*undifferenziertes Bläschen reizbarer Substanz*]. Fletcher 2013, p. 296f. offers the following perspicacious comment, 'Curiously, Freud's previous metaphor, of a crust that has been baked through by intense stimuli, applies more fittingly to the idea of dead skin that forms a protective carapace (compare the function of shells among the lower life-forms) than to a still-sensitive receptive surface that can function only beneath the crust. Paradoxically, both the protective layer, with its resistant filters, and the protected layer, without resistances, in Freud's metaphorical account, are the effect of the same high-intensity impact (being "baked through") of the surrounding powerful energies that assail them. A further paradox is that the dead crust, with its retained coefficient of resistance necessary for its filtering function - the crust of a crust - turns out to have some of the properties of a 'living' homeostatic system. The protective

- shield, we are told, has "its own store of energy", which it must preserve, along with "the special modes of transformation of energy operating in it" (ibid.), against the destructive effects of a leveling out should the surrounding forces overwhelm it. So we have a "dead" and "inorganic" outermost layer that protects a still-living inner layer; while the latter has lost the specific density of its resistances, the dead layer retains both its resistance, at least in part, and its own 'store of energy' (the same phrase Freud had used in the "Project" to describe what meets the exigencies of life) necessary to enable its own homeostatic functioning. This subordination of death to the survival of the vital principle (and a 'death' with some lifelike attributes) in an unpromising, hostile environment does not lead the reader to expect the celebration of the death instinct that is to come in sections V and VI. [typographical differences between different inverted commas in the original].
- 685 Cf. Bromberg 1998, p. 203.
 686 Cf. eg. Nicolaïdis 1993, p. 16.
 687 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1984a, p. 7.
 688 For Bion cf. Sandler 2005, p. 656f.
 689 Bion 1990, p. 75.
 690 As Valdre 2014, p. 2, cf. Conrotto 2014, p. xiii, reminds us.
 691 Valdre 2014, pp. 5. 31. 32f.
 692 Discussed Valdre 2014, p. 35, with reference to Loewald 1988, p. 24.
 693 Valdre 2014, p. 37; Di Benedetto 1993, p. 66f.
 694 For a recent important overview see Glover 2009; for the importance on the code as well as the message see p. 14f.; on stylistic change in the arts: p. 143.
 695 Mill 1873, pp. 133ff.; 139.
 696 Mill 1873, pp. 146. 148; cf. Warnock 1976, p. 205; Capaldi 2004, pp. 66ff.; Garcia Pazos 2001, pp. 22ff.
 697 Mill 1859, p. 107; for more about the context see Ffytche 2012, pp. 25. 201. 262.
 698 See Nicolaïdis 2003b, p. 167.
 699 Scholars concerned with education, for this reason, have often shown a keen interest in the pre-requisites for imagination to develop – a 'seeing-in-the-mind's eye – as expressed in literature and philosophy, cf. Warnock 1976, p. 9f.; p. 116.
 700 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1998a, p. 15.
 701 Cf. Nicolaïdis 1998b, p. 75.
 702 See also Nicolaïdis 2001b, p. 4f.
 703 The Odyssey, book 9, lines 366-367: 'My name is Nohbdy: mother, father, and friends, everyone calls me Nohbdy', Fitzgerald 1992, p. 156; Nicolaïdis 1972, p. 973: '*Polyphème ne peut pas l'appeler ou quand il l'appelle, le mot n'a plus de sens, il est inexistant. Ulysse-Personne existe mais décortiqué de sens, inattaquable, indévorable, polytrophe.*'
 704 See Nicolaïdis 2001a, pp. 97-101 for the account of the public supervision Nicolaïdis took with Lacan, on the occasion of the latter's visit to Geneva in 1975.
 705 Cf. Hughes 1989, p. 174. For Nicolaïdis link to Lacan see Press 1997d, p. 212f. Like Lacan, Press points out, Nicolaïdis privileges the First Topography.
 706 Presented in concise form by Clarke 2006, p. 74f. For Klein, he argues 'the internal world is a natural, inevitable and continual accompaniment of all experience... [Klein] stresses the a priori origins of object images as: part of the phylogenetic inheritance built into the experience of desire itself, ... Klein also stresses the importance of real people in the child's life; however, here it is the universal features of these real objects that are most important...'
 707 Szwec 1998a; cf. Szwec 1995a, p. 88; Radio France Info, *Modes de Vie*, 19th May 2014, see Serrat and Rédaction de France Info 2014; cf. Sitbon 2002, p. 289; for the sources of the approach in Michel Fain see Smadja 1999b, p. 211f.; Kamiński 2015, in her review of the new edition, p. 895 refers to the '*galériens volontaires*' as forming part of 'our contemporary psychoanalytic mythology' and then adds 'we know some of them who have become celebrities like Gérard d'Aboville, the solitary rowers, and others in our surroundings, but very few, on the face of it, enter our offices.'
 708 Szwec 1998a, p. 9; also see: Szwec 2015a, p. 95; repetition does not offer anything pleasurable playful in this instance: Szwec 2015a, p. 97.
 709 Szwec 1998a, p. 38fn.1; pp. 9. 20; Szwec 1994a, p. 744fn.1.
 710 Szwec 1998a, p. 11 fn.2; Szwec 1993c, p. 27fn.1.
 711 Szwec 1998a, p. 19; cf. Szwec 2004, p. 86; cf. D'Aboville 1992, pp. 92. 95; d'Aboville himself uses the term *galérien* – galley slave, p. 142.
 712 Szwec 1998a, p. 19; something which we will also encounter in the investigation, undertaken by Christophe Dejourné, of alienating, imposed rhythms at the workplace, see Szwec' reference to Dejourné in just this context Szwec 1994a, p. 760; cf. Szwec 1998a, p. 57; p. 88fn.1.
 713 Szwec 1998a, pp. 11/12; cf. Szwec 2004, p. 81; Szwec 1994a, p. 743f.
 714 Szwec 1998a, p. 22.

- 715 Szvec 1998a, p. 18.
- 716 Szvec 1998a, p. 23; at any rate not in the short term, d'Aboville 1992, p. 144.
- 717 'Un neo-besoin', Szvec 1995a, p. 84, in the sense discussed by Michel Fain and Denise Braunschweig, see Chapter Five.
- 718 Szvec 1998a, p. 32; Szvec 1998a, p. 25; Szvec 1995a, p. 76; also see: Szvec 1998a, p. 49; Szvec 1998b, p. 1513; cf. d'Aboville 1992, pp. 126. 144. 161.
- 719 Szvec 1998a, p. 32.
- 720 Szvec 1998a, pp. 130. 135; p. 114; cf. Szvec 1997a, p. 87.
- 721 Cf. Szvec 1996d, pp. 1138. 1141; Szvec 1998a, p. 60.
- 722 Smadja and Szvec 2005, p. 5f.; Jaeger and Szvec 2005, pp. 21ff.; under the conditions prevailing at the moment: Smadja and Szvec 2005a, p. 6; cf. Szvec 2005a, p. 12; see also: Smadja and Szvec 2001b, p. 8 and Szvec 2005a, p. 10: behavioural channelling of tension as an alternative to both mental processing and somatic illness, but with possible entanglements with both Szvec 1993a, p. 99; cf. p. 115, also see Szvec 2006b, p. 156: the replacement of a response in the psyche [*de réponses psychiques*] by responses in behaviour [*des réponses comportementales*]; traumatic neurosis as a possible alternative to somatic disorganisation Szvec 1995a, p. 69f., Szvec 1992, p. 65.
- 723 For a female version of this see Szvec 2004, p. 85f.
- 724 Fain 1990a; Szvec 1994a, p. 744f.
- 725 Cf. Szvec 1994a, p. 758. Hence the attraction of an audition to take part in exploits that comprise sweating through the lived nightmare of Borneo's 'liquid hell' (in France 20.000 registered as candidates) only to be, in the case of success, admitted to the next even more infernal round, Szvec 1994a, p. 744f. Szvec notes the role which the environment, hand-picked for its unforgiving hostility, plays in the scenario. It is against this that the lonely individual is thrown, against this that contestants have to fend to preserve the rudiments of their existence, Szvec 1994a, p. 757; cf. d'Aboville 1992, p. 125f.; also see Szvec 2015a, p. 98.
- 726 d'Aboville 1992, p. 116, quoted in Szvec 1994a, p. 759; cf. p. 745; also see d'Aboville 1992, p. 136.
- 727 d'Aboville 1992, p. 76.
- 728 Cf. Szvec 1994a, p. 752.
- 729 Cf. Szvec 1994a, pp. 753. 755; cf. Smadja and Szvec 2001b, p. 8; Szvec 1993c, p. 35; cf. Szvec 1995b, p. 1631f.
- 730 Szvec 2005a, p. 14; Szvec 1994a, p. 758.
- 731 Szvec 1994a, p. 750f.
- 732 Szvec 1994a, p. 751f.
- 733 Szvec 1998a, pp. 10. 66ff.; Szvec 1995a, pp. 76ff.
- 734 Szvec 1998a, p. 76; cf. Smadja and Szvec 2001c, p. 6.
- 735 Cf. Szvec 2010c, p. 1689; Szvec 2009a, p. 12.
- 736 Szvec 1998a, p. 134; cf. p. 125; cf. Szvec 2013b, p. xiii; Szvec 1996d, p. 1140; Szvec 1994a, p. 746; Smadja and Szvec 2001b, p. 9.
- 737 Smadja and Szvec 2001a, p. 6; Szvec 1998a, p. 132.
- 738 Szvec 1998a, p. 149.
- 739 Szvec 1998a, p. 150; Szvec 1998b, p. 1512; Szvec 1995a, p. 88; cf. Szvec 2008a, p. 79f.; also see Szvec 2016c, p. 414f.
- 740 Szvec 1998a, p. 155f. and the qualification of anti-traumatic behaviour as 'pre-phobic' in the chapter title on p. 149; Szvec 1998b, p. 1512fn.2; cf. also Szvec 2013b, p. xf.; Szvec 1994a, p. 749), or, as the case may be, slide into a depressive breakdown (Szvec 1998a, p. 145; cf. Szvec 2001, p. 8f.; Szvec 1994a, pp. 758f.
- 741 Cf. Szvec 2005a, p. 10; Szvec 1993a, pp. 16. 93. 96. 110.
- 742 Cf. Szvec 1994a, pp. 746f. 753. 756; Szvec 2013b, p. xiv; Szvec 1996c, p. 49; Szvec 1995a, p. 74; on the urgent need 'to be in psychoanalysis' all the time: Szvec 2015a, p. 111, a psychoanalysis that does not transform anything, p. 112.
- 743 Cf. Szvec 2013a, p. 76; Szvec 2004, pp. 81. 84; Szvec 1999a, p. 26; Szvec 1998b, p. 1513; Szvec 1995a, p. 83.
- 744 Cf. Szvec 1995a, p. 71f.
- 745 Cf. Geissmann and Geissmann 2004, pp. 609-614; Szvec 1993a, front cover flap and p. 3; Szvec 2006a, p. 36; Szvec 2006b, p. 153.
- 746 Szvec 2017c, p. 1445.
- 747 Cf. Szvec 1998a, p. 133; Szvec 2000c, p. 132f.
- 748 Szvec 1994a, p. 749; cf. Szvec 2003b, p. 40; Szvec 1997a, p. 74f.
- 749 Cf. Szvec 1996c, p. 49; Szvec 1994a, pp. 746. 752; Szvec 1995a, p. 86fn.1. This does not necessarily mean that there is one sudden and brutal act of disinvestment as described by Green in his description of the "Dead Mother", Szvec 1999b, p. 10.
- 750 Taken up by Szvec 1998a, p. 10.

- 751 Szvec 1998a, p. 133; cf Szvec 1996c, p. 51; Szvec 1994a, p. 747. This is a development which runs counter to what Christophe Dejours' describes as 'libidinal subversion', an enrichment of erotic potential, Szvec 1996c, p. 50.
- 752 Szvec 1994a, p. 749; cf. 751.
- 753 Szvec 2010c, p. 1689; Szvec 2006a, pp. 36ff.; Szvec 2004, pp. 84. 86; Szvec 1999a, p. 29; Szvec 1998a, p. 89; Szvec 1998b, p. 1512; Szvec 1994a, p. 746.
- 754 Szvec 2006a, p. 37; cf. Szvec 2010a, p. 90; Szvec 2010c, p. 1689.
- 755 Cf. Szvec 2008b, p. 29; Szvec 2006a, p. 34f.; Szvec 1999a, p. 29; Szvec 1998b, p. 1516; Szvec 2006a, p. 47. Szvec believes that early childhood is a time when trauma, in the sense of too strong stimuli, is normal, Szvec 1996c, p. 48.
- 756 Szvec 1998a, p. 133; cf. Szvec 2002a, p. 79; Szvec 1999a, p. 30; Szvec 1993a, p. 139; Szvec 1989a, p. 1985.
- 757 Szvec 1998a, p. 133; Szvec 1999a, p. 27; for a particularly difficult relationship Szvec 1993b, pp. 593. 601.
- 758 Szvec 1994a, p. 746 cf. p. 749; cf. Szvec 2012a, p. 38; Szvec 2008d, p. 1664; Szvec 1998a, p. 89; Szvec 1998b, p. 1512; Szvec 1997a, p. 72; cf. the traumatic effects of shattering poverty Szvec 1993b, p. 598.
- 759 Cf. Szvec 1998b, p. 1506.
- 760 Szvec 1994a, p. 755; cf. Szvec 2015a, p. 108; Szvec 2006b, p. 157.
- 761 Szvec 2006b, p. 158; Szvec 2003b, p. 39f.; Szvec 2002b, p. 1792f.; cf. Szvec 2013b, p. xvii.; Szvec 2003c, p. 241.
- 762 Szvec in Cramer, Denis, Henny, Nicolaïdis and Szvec 1999, p. 18; also see Szvec 2015a, p. 100f.; Szvec 2000c, pp. 125ff.
- 763 Cf. Szvec 2003b, p. 40f.; also see the difficult case Szvec 1995a, p. 80f.
- 764 Szvec 2010a, p. 86; Szvec 2006a, p. 38; Szvec 2002b, p. 1791; Szvec 1994a, p. 747.
- 765 Szvec 2004, pp. 82ff.; Szvec 1997b, p. 41.
- 766 Szvec 2001, p. 20 in verbal echo to Lacan [1956], p. 82 and conceptual debt to Braunschweig & Fain, see Chapter Four; see also Szvec 2013c, p. 15f.
- 767 Cf. Szvec 2010a, p. 87; Szvec 2006a, p. 38; Szvec 1993a, p. 41. Szvec relates the entry he found in a weblog. There one mother gave advice to another whose child was suffering from insomnia. When she had the need to have a nap, she wrote, or to make herself beautiful or to 'have a dissolute siesta with my man who works in the mornings', she put the little one into the creche to pick her up at 4 pm. Szvec concludes by saying the 'dissolute siesta with her man' provided a good prelude to the fantasmatic life of this baby', Szvec 2010a, p. 94.
- 768 Szvec 1998a, p. 86f.; Szvec 1998b, p. 1516; Szvec 1993a, p. 41; cf. p. 53.
- 769 Szvec 1997b, p. 59.
- 770 Sirjacq 2017, p. 147 points out that Szvec does not say the child is prematurely developed but that its behaviour strives to be in advance of what it can actually do.
- 771 Cf. Szvec 2001, p. 7; Szvec 1997a, p. 78.
- 772 Szvec 1998b, p. 1510.
- 773 Szvec 2001, p. 11; Szvec 1998a, p. 102; Szvec 1998b, p. 1511.
- 774 Szvec 2001, pp. 10. 13. 15. 17.
- 775 Szvec 2001, p. 16.
- 776 Cf. Szvec 2001, p. 18; Szvec 1998b, p. 1512; see also: Szvec 1989b, p. 1990 on the traumatic non-transformation of perception into representation.
- 777 Szvec 2001, p. 18; cf. Szvec 2010c, p. 1690; Szvec 2001, p. 25; cf. pp. 8f. 11. 17, and Szvec 2005a, p. 9, connecting Andre Green's *fonction objectalisante* and *fonction desobjectalisante* with Pierre Marty's *depression essentielle*, discussed in Chapter Four.
- 778 Szvec 2001, p. 18; Szvec 2001, p. 16 with reference to Winnicott 1974; cf. Szvec 2004, p. 84.
- 779 Szvec 2001, pp. 8. 9fn.1., 13. 24.
- 780 Szvec 2001, p. 14fn.1; Szvec 1989a, p. 1982; Szvec 2001, pp. 20. 23fn.1, Szvec 2016b, p. 52 remarks that the perception of lack is the perception of what one has understood, not the perception of what the eye sees.
- 781 Szvec 2001, p. 20; cf. Szvec 1997a, p. 78; Szvec 2001, p. 21.
- 782 Szvec 1997a, p. 80.
- 783 Szvec 1999b, p. 11; Szvec 1998a, p. 109 and Szvec 1997a, p. 78, with the English term in the French text. In Szvec 1999b, p. 12 the author regards the term as an acceptable equivalent for Marty's '*dépression essentielle*'.
- 784 Szvec 2001, p. 19 taking up a suggestion by Michel de M'Uzan; cf. Szvec 1989a, p. 1979.
- 785 Cf. Szvec 2001, p. 13; cf. Cramer, Denis, Henny, Nicolaïdis and Szvec 1999, pp. 14. 17; Szvec 2001, p. 20; for nuances see Szvec 2001, pp. 17.19; rejection at a later age: Szvec 1997a, pp. 73.77; see also Szvec 2010a, p. 88 on Michel Fain's view on '*la faiblesse économique de certaines représentations balayées au moindre conflit*'; for the importance of capabilities of retention and demarcation: Szvec 1993a, p. 28. Szvec

- 2016b, p. 47 explains that he has come to attribute less importance to the criterion 'before or after language acquisition' in comparison to the more important factor of the differentiation of the Me from the object.
- 786 Szwec 2002a, p. 65; cf. p. 77.
- 787 Szwec 2002a, p. 67.
- 788 Szwec 2002a, p. 66.
- 789 Szwec 2002a, p. 68.
- 790 Szwec 2002a, p. 69f.
- 791 Szwec 2002a, p. 76.
- 792 Szwec 2002a, p. 68f.; cf. p. 71; for another case in which separation by sleep is almost intolerable: Szwec 1995a, p. 85.
- 793 Szwec 2002a, p. 75.
- 794 Szwec 2002a, p. 76.
- 795 Szwec 2002a, p. 79.
- 796 Szwec 2002a, p. 66; cf. Szwec 1993a, p. 80. Szwec considers it likely that Nina's precocious anorexia developed as part of an early, as yet anobjectal depression (what Pierre Marty termed *depression essentielle*), which, in early interactions, took on the character of opposition to her mother's preoccupations, once the Me and its objects began to differentiate, Szwec 2002a, p. 77. The development of fantasy in the child was hampered, not facilitated by the grip the mother's fantasies firmly clamped on the child, cf. Szwec 1989a, p. 1982.
- 797 Szwec 2002a, p. 80.
- 798 Szwec 2002a, p. 78; cf. Szwec 2012b, p. 67.
- 799 Szwec 2002a, p. 79.
- 800 Szwec 1993a; cf. Fine 1995d; for another example of a child locked into his mother's projections and responding by a refusal to eat as a substitute for saying 'no': Szwec 2012b, p. 65ff. in an article that is a response to a paper by Nigolian 2012, in which she concludes that negation can be an intermediary stage on the way to mentalisation, Nigolian 2012, p. 54.
- 801 Szwec 2006a, p. 39; Szwec 1993a, pp. 33-35. 50.
- 802 Szwec 1993a, p. 49f., Szwec 1989a, p. 1982; cf. Le Guen 1974, p. 60 and *passim*; for a later approximation of introducing a third in a dual relationship: Szwec 2008c, p. 143. In an aside he connects the infant's fear of the stranger to the moment the mother turns into a stranger by becoming the lover of her partner again: Szwec 2010a, p. 91.
- 803 Szwec 1993a, p. 32.
- 804 Cf. Szwec 1995a, p. 85; Szwec 1993a, pp. 37-39; Szwec 1996c, p. 55; Szwec 1995b, p. 1630; cf. p. 66f.; cf. Szwec 1998b, p. 1512.
- 805 Szwec 1993a, p. 92; cf. Fine 1995d, p. 936. The situation, Szwec observes, is at the very opposite of the one found in the early pathology of merycism (Rumination Syndrome), in which the mother, though physically present, is experienced as absent, and frenzied attempts at auto-satisfaction have to replace the mother's provisions, Szwec 1993a, p. 39.
- 806 Szwec 1993a, p. 40.
- 807 Cf. Szwec 1993a, pp. 62. 69f.; cf. p. 38.
- 808 Szwec 2009a, p. 7fn.3; Szwec 2006a, p. 41.
- 809 Szwec 1993a, p. 110; cf. Fine 1995d, p. 937.
- 810 Cf. Fine 1995d, p. 937.
- 811 Szwec 1993a, p. 7; cf. Fine 1995d, p. 935f.
- 812 Szwec 1993a, p. 72.
- 813 Showing object aversal cf. Szwec 1989a, pp. 1978f.; 1983f. and *passim*.
- 814 Szwec 1993a, p. 77; cf. p. 25; see also Szwec 2010b, p. 220.
- 815 See, however, the proviso Szwec 1993a, p108fn.11
- 816 As opposed to distress; cf. Szwec 1993a, p. 101.
- 817 Cf. Szwec 1993a, pp. 23; 104 and fn.8; 127; 132.
- 818 Szwec 1993a, p. 109.
- 819 Szwec 1995a, p. 74.
- 820 'It is impossible to convey any idea of the strain this put on us all. We walked slowly in front of the tanks and waited for shells. The strain had a very curious effect; I felt that all anxiety had become too much; I felt just like a small child that has had rather a tearful day and wants to be put to bed by its mother; I felt curiously eased by lying down on the bank by the side of the road, just as if I was lying peacefully in someone's arms.' Bion 1997, p. 122.
- 821 Szwec 2004, p. 82; Szwec 2010a, p. 94; Szwec 2004, p. 84; Szwec 1994a, pp. 745. 747.
- 822 Szwec 1995b, p. 1631fn.1.
- 823 Szwec 2004, p. 83; cf. Szwec 2010a, pp. 86. 93

- 824 Cf. Szwec 1997b, 59f.; Szwec 1995a, p. 85.
- 825 Cf. Szwec 1994b, p. 68.
- 826 Szwec 2009a, pp. 3. 5. 13.
- 827 Szwec 2009a, p. 9.
- 828 Szwec 2009a, p. 10; cf. Szwec 1996c, p. 57.
- 829 Szwec 2009a, p. 6; cf. Szwec 1996b, p. 75f.
- 830 Szwec 2009a, pp. 4. 6.
- 831 Cf. Szwec 1998b, p. 1516; Szwec 2010c, p. 1689; cf. Szwec 1995a, p. 82; Szwec 2009a, p. 10; Szwec 1999a, p. 40; Szwec 1998a, pp. 146. 48.
- 832 Cf. Szwec 1997b, p. 60; Szwec 1998b, p. 1513; 1998a, p. 114;
- 833 Szwec 1996c, p. 55: the child prefers exhausting itself in cradling itself [*s'autoberçant*] repeatedly rather than being put to bed by its mother in an *opératoire* way.
- 834 Cf. Szwec 1996c, p. 51; Szwec 2009a, p. 11.
- 835 Szwec 2009a, p. 11; also see Szwec 2016a, p. 694; Szwec 2015a, p. 99; Szwec 2000a, p. 90f.
- 836 Cf. Szwec 1998a, p. 114; Szwec 1997a, pp. 87. 90 and *passim*;
- 837 Szwec 1999a, p. 33f.; on partially repressed motherly violence see Szwec 2012c, p. 104; Szwec 1995a, p. 85. Szwec 2016a, p. 698 on the appearance of sadistic material within a structure that is neurotic to only a fragile extent.
- 838 Szwec 2009a, p. 17.
- 839 See also Szwec 2009a, p. 15f. cf. p. 18.
- 840 Szwec 2010a, p. 94; Szwec 2009a, p. 14f.; cf. also Szwec 1992, p. 50.
- 841 Szwec 2009a, p. 18.
- 842 Parat 1991. For some of the vicissitudes of the concept: Palacio Espasa 2002. The distinction is also commented upon by Lebovici and Widlöcher 1980, p. viii: 'the French language sometimes makes possible useful differentiation of terms. In French, we can make the distinction between *Verdrängung* und *Unterdrückung* in using the words *refoulement* and *répression*, which seems to convey the original meaning better than repression and suppression.'
- 843 Parat 1991, p. 93.
- 844 Parat 1991, pp. 97. 104.
- 845 Parat 1991, pp. 104. 110.
- 846 Parat 1991, pp. 99. 108.
- 847 Szwec 2008b, p. 28; Szwec 1998b, p. 1507.
- 848 Szwec 1998b, p. 1506.
- 849 Szwec 1993a, p. 108; Szwec 1991, p. 124.
- 850 Cf. Szwec 2013a, p. 75; Szwec 1998b, p. 1506.
- 851 Cf. Smadja and Szwec 2001c, p. 6; Szwec 1998b, p. 1506; see also Chapter Four.
- 852 Cf. Szwec 2008b, p. 26; Szwec 1998b, p. 1506f.; for the vulnerability cf. Szwec 1999a, p. 30.
- 853 Cf. the circumspect way of Pierre Marty not suggesting hidden depth of meaning in an interview, while keeping possibilities to think in imitation open: Szwec 2008b, p. 25.
- 854 Szwec 1996d, p. 1140f.; cf. also the approach by Theodor W. Adorno and his colleagues Jay 1973, p. 246f.
- 855 Cf. Szwec 1994a, p. 758; cf. Szwec 1999a, p. 37.
- 856 For a review of this recent edition see Nayrou 2014 and Kamieniak 2015.
- 857 Declerck 2001; discussion see Szwec 2013b, pp. xiiff.
- 858 Szwec 2013b, p. ii.
- 859 Szwec 2013b, p. v.; cf. Szwec 2015a, p. 104ff.
- 860 Murakami 2009.
- 861 Szwec 2015a, p. 108.
- 862 Szwec 2015a, p. 108.
- 863 Szwec 2013b, p. vi; cf. Szwec 1999a, p. 27f.
- 864 Szwec 2013b, p. vi, cf. vii; for such transitory usage also see Smadja and Szwec 1993, p. 5; Szwec 1998b, p. 1517.
- 865 Szwec 2013b, p. vii.
- 866 Szwec 2013b, p. viii.
- 867 See, for instance, Sansom 1952, p. 330 for the *nembutsu* in Jōdo Buddhism, the most widely practiced form of Buddhism in Japan; also Conze 1951, pp. 205ff. on Amidism.
- 868 See Korczynski, Pickering and Robertson 2013, pp. 20ff. on the categories of work songs; for a concise overview of Scottish variants see the entry 'work songs' available under <http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk>.
- 869 Hacking 1998. Hacking was nominated to the *Collège de France*, Rheinberger 2014, p. 103. His work 'Mad Travelers' was released in French in 2002 by Les Empêcheurs de penser en rond, the same publishing house that had published Pierre Marty's *Mentalisation et psychosomatique* in 1991.

- 870 Hacking 1998, p. 5.
- 871 Cf. Sitbon 2002, pp. 286ff. Even though a given patient may be able to make use of both registers at different moments, cf. Szvec 1999a, pp. 21. 26. Whether PTSD is the right conceptual container to catch meaningful variation has to remain open to doubt. As Paulette Letarte, who before becoming a psychoanalyst, had worked with Hans Selye said in an interview with Szvec: '*Pour que s'instaure un stress post-traumatique, je pense qu'il faut que l'individu fournisse sa part, quelque chose qui lui est rigoureusement personnel*', in: Jaeger and Szvec (2005), p. 21; see also p. 15; cf. Szvec 2005b, pp. 6f.; 9; Szvec 1992, p. 64; for developments in the appreciation of trauma as opposed to *fantasm* Szvec 2005b, p. 8 and the ideological implications in the current use of 'stress' Szvec 2003a, p. 6; Smadja and Szvec 2003, p. 170f.
- 872 Szvec 2013b, p. xx.
- 873 Szvec 1994b, pp. 66.68 and *passim*; cf. Sitbon 2002, p. 283; Szvec 2009b, p. 7f.; Szvec 1996a;
- 874 Already in evidence with Pierre Marty and Michel Fain, cf. Szvec 1996a, p. 9;
- 875 Szvec 1993a, p. 20; cf. Szvec 2010a, p. 90. Via Léon Kreisler there is also a link to Serge Lebovici's research, in particular in bringing together '*l'enfant pédiatrique*', the child as seen by paediatricians and '*l'enfant psychanalytique*', the child as encountered in psychoanalytic practice, see Lebovici and Soulé 1970; cf. Szvec 1996a, pp. 7. 9, an arc of interest that encompasses both René Spitz and Winnicott, cf. Szvec 1996a, pp. 11. 12fn.2. Szvec 2017b, p. 41 points to the importance of Spitz' work for Pierre Marty at a time when Winnicott was not yet a point of reference; also see Nicolaïdis 1998e, p. 128.
- 876 Cf. Cramer in Cramer, Denis, Henny, Nicolaïdis and Szvec 1999, p. 14.
- 877 As we have seen in the section on Nicolaïdis this is not a metapsychological concept with Fain but seen as a tendency to disengage, disintricate and to reduce to zero; also cf. Szvec 1999a, p. 31.
- 878 Szvec 1995b, p. 1631fn.1; see, however, the qualifications about the element of speculation Szvec 1996c, p. 57. Szvec 1999b, p. 10 speaks of a disinvestment that saps the very foundations of narcissism.
- 879 cf Szvec 2004, p. 83.
- 880 Szvec 1995b, p. 1630f.; for Fain and Braunschweig's position see in particular, p. 1631fn.1.
- 881 For the 'dementor's kiss' see Schwabach 2006, 329ff.
- 882 Cf. Szvec 2012c, p. 104; Szvec 1995a, pp. 80f. 85f.
- 883 Since the integration of *pulsion* happens in and for the object, there will be serious consequences for the successful anchorage of the *pulsions* in the body Szvec 2010c, p. 1687fn.1; cf. pp. 1688. 1691; cf. Szvec 2013a, pp. 83. 82. 79.
- 884 Cf. Szvec 2010c, p. 1690; Szvec 1999a, p. 39; Szvec 1998b, p. 1515: '*un excès de déliaison*'.
- 885 Cf. Szvec 2010a, p. 94.
- 886 Abram 2007, p. 173f.
- 887 Cf. Szvec 2013b, p. 5; Szvec 1997a, p. 76fn.1 refers to Winnicott's suggestion that organised controlled emptiness can be a protection against the frightening character of emptiness; see Winnicott 1974, p. 105f.
- 888 Cf. Szvec 1999a, p. 39; Szvec 1995a, p. 75f.; Szvec 1995b, p. 1632f.
- 889 Lebovici and Castarède 1992, p. 114.
- 890 Cf. Szvec 1997a, p. 77; Szvec 1996b, p. 72f.; Szvec 1994b, p. 68.
- 891 Cf. Smadja and Szvec 1993, p. 5.
- 892 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 24.
- 893 Potamianou 1995, see the reviews Guignard 1998, Paul 1997; cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 30.
- 894 Potamianou 1995, p. 17. 20; p. 55.
- 895 Potamianou 1995, p. 55f.; Potamianou 1995, p. 108.
- 896 Potamianou 1995, p. 22; cf. p. 48; Potamianou 2000a, p. 131. In Potamianou 2017a, p. 66 she writes, 'It [the compulsion to repeat] indicates that a mode of psychic work keeps going on, even if low, as what cannot be bound in consciousness determines actions which are vehicles of the possibility of conscious remembering'.
- 897 Potamianou 1995, p. 57; cf. p. 82, p. 117, p. 145f.; Potamianou 1995, p. 31; Potamianou 2016, p. 214 envisages a '*mémoire de comportement*', a memory enshrined in behaviour.
- 898 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 106; Potamianou 1995, p. 32, p. 102; Potamianou 1995, p. 42, p. 48.
- 899 Potamianou 1995, p. 39.
- 900 Potamianou 1995, p. 137.
- 901 Potamianou 1995, p. 39; cf. Potamianou 2000b, p. 56f.
- 902 Potamianou 1995, p. 59; Potamianou 1995, p. 60, also remarked upon by Paul 1997, p. 1037; Potamianou 1995, p. 13. Potamianou takes up Jean Guillaumin's point that in addition to taking into consideration processes of negation and separation we should keep alert to the processes of renouncement leading to an abandonment of passion Guillaumin 1992, p. 20f.; Potamianou 1995, p. 61.
- 903 Potamianou 1995, p. 9.
- 904 Potamianou 1995, p. 63, p. 67; p. 58; Potamianou 1995, p. 58; Potamianou 1995, p. 54; also see Potamianou 2015, p. 949; Potamianou 2015, p. 945 points to Freud 1939 [1934-38], p. 181 where he discusses the

- negative effects of trauma. In her words: 'He states that, when nothing is repeated and nothing is remembered, the ego's organization is conditioned by avoidance processes that may develop into inhibitions and phobias.' As often - and this is something Potamianou, as we shall see, takes into consideration in her discussion of *opératoire* states - it seems that different root causes may contribute to comparable end states. See Damasio 1999, p. 104f. 'I have seen this disintegration occur in many Alzheimer's patients and never as painfully as in a dear friend who was also one of the notable philosophers of his generation and whose intellectual brilliance disguised his mental decline for all but those closest to him. Once I saw him move close to the single, nearly empty bookcase in the room, reach for a shelf at about the level of the chair's armrest, and pick up a folded paper. It was a worn-out glossy print, 8x10, folded in four. He set it on his lap, slowly; he unfolded it, slowly; and he stared for a long time at the beautiful face in it, that of his smiling wife, now split in four quadrants by the deep creases in the countlessly folded paper. He looked but did not see. There was no glimmer of reaction, at any moment, no connection made between the portrait and its living model who was sitting across from him, only a few feet away; no connection made to me, either, who had actually made the photograph ten years before, at a time of shared joy. The folding and unfolding of the photograph had happened regularly, from earlier in the progress of the disease, when he still knew that something was amiss, perhaps as a desperate attempt to cling to the certainty of what once was.' Another example, mentioned by Roussillon 2008a, p. 192f, unreferenced, may even be closer to Potamianou's theoretical preoccupations: It discusses the impact of behavioural therapy on some subjects who, in Roussillon's sketch, no longer feel fear but present its bodily symptoms when confronted with an anxiogenic object. In another possible development, secrets in the family may create a swell of underground excitement which cannot be addressed because they lack a shared reference point: Potamianou 1992f, p. 314.
- 905 Pragier and Faure-Pragier 1990, pp. 1443ff.; Potamianou 1995, p. 106f. 108; cf.p. 70.
- 906 Potamianou 1995, p. 107fn.38; Potamianou 2004a, p. 145; cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 133; Potamianou 1992a, p. 67f.
- 907 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 70; p. 108; Pragier and Faure-Pragier 1990, p. 1466.
- 908 Potamianou 2015, p. 948; cf. Potamianou 2004a, p. 147; Potamianou 1978, p. 114 sees the decision to undertake analysis in some patients as a step towards working on the problems of dependence and autonomy hitherto unresolved.
- 909 Potamianou 2015, p. 949; cf. p. 947; for variants of the situation: Potamianou 1977a, p. 212; Potamianou 1988a, p. 921.
- 910 Potamianou 1995, p. 16; Paul 1997, p. 1037; Mürsepp.
- 911 Cf. Potamianou 1992a, p. 69f.
- 912 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 33; p. 104; cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 132f.; Potamianou 2005, p. 174f.; also see: Potamianou 2010, p. 169f.
- 913 Potamianou 2001, p. 77; cf. p. 16f. and p. 132; cf. Potamianou 2008a, p. 70; Potamianou 2008b, p. 23f.; Potamianou 1992a, pp. 62. 70. 124. 140; see also Kaswin-Bonnefond 2004a, p. 273f. and p. 276; cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 66.
- 914 Cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 44f.; p. 94. 98. 104; Potamianou 1985a; Potamianou 1988a, p. 931; Potamianou 2001, p. 132f.
- 915 Potamianou 1995, p. 46; Potamianou 1995, p. 33; Potamianou 1995, p. 35f.; cf. also Potamianou 2001, p. 55; Potamianou 1994a, p. 103f.; Potamianou 2015, p. 958; Potamianou 2010, p. 170.
- 916 Potamianou 1990a, p. 274f.; cf. Potamianou 1988a, p. 931.
- 917 Cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 149f. and p. 149fn.; Potamianou 2015, p. 959f.; also see Potamianou 1975, p. 1062; Potamianou 2010, p. 172.
- 918 Potamianou 2001, p. 134f.; cf. Potamianou 2008b, p. 15.
- 919 Potamianou 1995, p. 42; Potamianou 1995, p. 54f. Potamianou 1990b, p. 174. Potamianou on the *pulsion de mort*: Potamianou 1988a, p. 928ff.; Potamianou 1985a.
- 920 Potamianou 1995, p. 31; Potamianou 1995, p. 59; as Anna Freud once put it, 'a wholly successful defence is always something dangerous', Sandler and Freud 1981, p. 240.
- 921 I am here indebted to the ironic lines by Antioni de Viti de Marco on the situation in Italy at the cusp of the 20th century: 'Now the bourgeoisie is willing to give its consent to everything: that the republic may succeed to monarchy; a federation of Italian states to the republic; that the pope may take over power from from the federation of states; or, as the case may be, the dominium of the Goths from the pope, under the [only] condition that apart from reforming the [outward] peels of government the economic system may remain unchanged...' [in the much more elegant original: '*Ora la borghesia ammette tutto, che alla monarchia subentri la repubblica, alla repubblica una federazione di stati italiani, a questa il papa e al papa il dominio dei Goti, a condizione che oltre la scorza della riforma di governo non si tocchi il sistema economico,*'] De Viti de Marco 1929, p. 243; for the situation in the 5th century when the Goths did in fact play an ambiguous role in Roman power play: Arnold 2014, p. 117.

- 922 Potamianou 1995, p. 57, cf. Potamianou 2002b, p. 163; Potamianou 2000b, p. 67; also see Potamianou 1998b, p. 955: '... keeping [the brilliance of desire] alive within a hot envelope of hope, even though this often turns out to be vain or empty'.
- 923 Potamianou 1995, p. 145; Potamianou 2001, pp. 127f., 149. 152; Potamianou 1995, p. 146; cf. Potamianou 2015, p. 954; Potamianou 1988a, pp. 926f. 932; Potamianou 1983d, p. 104. A similar reflection is presented in Nicolaïdis and Andréoli 1986, p. 358.
- 924 Cf. Potamianou 1988a, pp. 924. 928; Potamianou 2001, pp. 57ff.; Potamianou 2004a, pp. 147. 154. In Potamianou 2004a, p. 143, Potamianou doubts that the negative therapeutic reaction is one single clinical entity and contends it should be differentiated as to its form and dynamics. In Potamianou 1988a, p. 919 she points to Joseph Sandler's cautioning against too broad a definition of the term to include all 'negativistic' responses in treatment, in Sandler 1980. Situations in which the mobilisation available can no longer be supported by an inner holding structure may lead to a recourse to familiar and automatic patterns of behaviour: it is an ultimate barrier against inner silence: Potamianou 1990b, p. 174; in Potamianou 1984b[1980], p. 531 the author states: 'In my view, change is like love. It can crush you and destroy you or it can nourish you, encourage your creativity and make the world a place more friendly and accepting'; also see Potamianou 1983d, p. 101: 'analysis is corrosive for the defensive system so far employed by the patient'.
- 925 Kaswin-Bonnefond 2004a, p. 278. See Potamianou 2006b, p. 51: 'Contemporary geophysics has provided analysts with new metaphors. The theory of tectonic plates that break apart, creating fissures, or get closer together, or even interpenetrate one another thus creating mountain chains, evokes articulations and disarticulations, convergencies and divergencies that are familiar to psychoanalysts. Metaphorically, all these representations are perfectly usable with regard to the psychic land. Moreover, I think these movements allow us to see what Heraclitus added to Parmenides, i.e. that what is in a situation (structure, defence mechanisms, constraints etc.) changes constantly by virtue of the course taken.'
- 926 Potamianou 2008a, p. 67, cf. Potamianou 2007, p. 97f. 101f. and in particular p. 103; also see Potamianou 2016, p. 214fn.5.
- 927 Potamianou 2000b, p. 67. In the original: '*car comment pourraient se construire nos objets et s'organiser des formes nouvelles dans notre vie psychique, si des tendances à se séparer, à se diviser, à se dépendre et à se distancier ne venaient pas agir contre les condensations et les agglomérats?*' and '*La négation, dont l'appartenance à la pulsion de mort est affirmée sous ses formes primaires et secondaires, a une contribution majeure au travail élaboratif du psychisme*'; also see Fine 1995c, p. 922; cf. Potamianou 1992a, pp. 32-34. 81; in Potamianou 1992g, p. 29 she speaks of 'links forged and links undone, the building of structure and the loosening of structure'; about the polymorphism of disinvestment Potamianou 2008b, p. 17; Aulagnier 2001, p. 139.
- 928 Potamianou 2001, see the review by Clair 2003.
- 929 Potamianou 2001, p. 4; p. 37; cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 36; cf. Kaswin-Bonnefond 2004a, p. 273f.
- 930 Potamianou 2001, p. 87; cf. Potamianou 2000a, p. 124; Potamianou 2006a, p. 41.
- 931 Cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 143; Potamianou 1997c; cf. Kaswin-Bonnefond 2004a, p. 275.
- 932 Potamianou 2001, p. 40; cf. p. 31.
- 933 Cf. Potamianou 1992d, p. 1524.
- 934 Potamianou 1995, p. 145; cf. Potamianou 1992a, p. 84; Potamianou 2015, p. 954f.
- 935 Potamianou 2008a, p. 70.
- 936 Potamianou 2008a, p. 64.
- 937 Marty 1980, p. 63 taken up in Potamianou 2001, p. 30; also see Potamianou 2004b. Potamianou does not agree with André Green's view that the Second Topography superseded the First, but accords to both a place in clinical thinking, Potamianou 2013, p. 103.
- 938 Potamianou 2001, p. 28, cf. p. 55; cf. Potamianou 2008a, p. 70; Potamianou 2015, p. 958.
- 939 Potamianou 2001, p. 31; Potamianou 1995, p. 110; Potamianou 2001, p. 91.
- 940 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 36
- 941 Potamianou 2001, p. 7; on possible variations and nuances, as well as differences to Lacan's *forclusion*, see Potamianou 1992d, p. 1523 and p. 1520; for Lacan: Lacan [1955] p. 21: '*tout ce qui est refusé dans l'ordre symbolique, au sens de la Verwerfung, réparaît dans le réel*'; cf. Lacan 1966, p. 388: '*Et c'est pourquoi la castration ice retranché par le sujet des limites mêmes du possible, mais aussi bien par là soustraite aux possibilités de la parole, va apparaître dans le réel, erratiquement, c'est-à-dire dans des relations de résistance sans transfert, ...*'; also see Safouan 2001, p. 44f.; Evans 1996, pp. 64ff.; Diatkine 1997, pp. 38ff.
- 942 Potamianou 2001, p. 45.
- 943 Potamianou 2001, p. 101; Potamianou 2001, p. 44; also see Alexandridis 2010, p. 106.
- 944 Potamianou 2001, p. 131; cf. Potamianou 2004a, p. 146.
- 945 Potamianou 2001, p. 91; Potamianou 1988a, p. 925 reflects there may be two parallel chains: one rooted in fantasy, one assembling elements resulting from trauma.
- 946 see in particular 'The child and the soldier', Neyraut 1997, pp. 65-70; Potamianou 2001, p. 53.

- 947 Neyraut 1997, p. 79. Potamianou 2001, p. 5, cf. p. 97f.; Potamianou 2005, p. 177; cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 81ff.
- 948 Cf. Potamianou 1995, pp. 41. 49. 120; Potamianou 2001, p. 55; see also Potamianou 2008b, pp. 9. 13 and Potamianou 2005, p. 180; Rosenberg 1991, p. 83ff.
- 949 Cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 8; Potamianou 1992a, p. 124; also see Potamianou 2001, p. 80, where she quotes a patient 'Images do not take form in me [*ne se constituent pas*]... At least I have my crises'.
- 950 Cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 70; Potamianou 1995, p. 90: processes and self-states may have to stand in for the object; Potamianou 2001, p. 48; Potamianou 1992a, p. 130.
- 951 Potamianou 2001, p. 78. This may, depending on the times, entail qualities highly regarded, if grudgingly, by others as a source of strength: George Bernard Shaw is reported to have described General Bernard L. Montgomery as 'that intensely compacted hank of steel wire', Atkinson 2002, insert to one of the photos between pp. 398-399; cf. p. 418.
- 952 Potamianou 2001, pp. 65. 70. Potamianou 2001, p. 65 attributes 'envelope of suffering' to Roussillon 1999, p. 165. As can be seen there, it was, in fact, coined by Anzieu. Although Roussillon does not provide an exact reference, one instance of its use can be found in Anzieu 1985/1995, pp. 227ff. cf. Potamianou 1999a, pp. 53. 58 and p. 59: a kind of spinal column [*une espèce d'épine dorsale*], p. 51 'valued like a possession of which the patient does not want to divest himself [*se défaire*], because it constitutes for him a familiar experience [*vécu*] and a sign of identity'; also see Potamianou 1992a, p. 29.
- 953 Potamianou 2001, pp. 70-75; Potamianou 1999a. With regard to Philoctetes it bears pointing out that Wilson 1941, pp. 272 - 295 shows that the story of Philoctetes can be, and has in the course of history been, approached from a variety of angles. He sums up part of his own position on p. 294: 'I should interpret the fable as follows. The victim of a malodorous disease which renders him abhorrent to society and periodically degrades him and makes him helpless is also the master of a superhuman art which everybody has to respect and which the normal man finds he needs. A practical man like Odysseus, at the same time coarse-grained and clever, imagines that he can somehow get the bow without having Philoctetes on his hands or that he can kidnap Philoctetes the Bowman without regard for Philoctetes the invalid.' Green 1966, p. 183 uses the story of Philoctetes as an image of psychoanalysis in its essence: 'It is in fact for the reason that Freud works his way starting with what is dross, discarded waste and *faux pas* that he discovers the structure of the subject as a relationship to the truth. This is perhaps less close to the image of Prometheus chased for having stolen fire from the hands of the gods than to the image of Philoctetes abandoned by his people on a deserted island because of the stench of his wound.'
- 954 Fain 1994, p. 8; cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 81f.; Potamianou 1999a. p. 60.
- 955 Cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 67.
- 956 Potamianou 2011b, p. 82; Potamianou 2001, p. 3; cf. Potamianou 1995, p. 54. Also see the converse situation: body and soul have fallen silent and only fright can break the silence: Potamianou 1982b, p. 373; cf. Potamianou 1997d, pp. 49. 54; Potamianou 2001, p. 139.
- 957 Cf. Potamianou 2010b, p. 1364.
- 958 See the review: Lebovici 1988, Vaneck 1985.
- 959 See, for instance, Potamianou 2001, pp. 111-124; p. 56. There is a very useful contribution by Colette Chiland - Chiland 1992[1988] - in which she sums up some of the great lines of development of the concept of identification, an article immediately preceding Potamianou's (1992e[1988]).
- 960 Potamianou 1984a, p. 19; cf. Potamianou 1984a, p. 22f.
- 961 Potamianou 1984a, p. 110; cf. Potamianou 1984a, pp. 30. 33. 128; Potamianou 1988a, p. 931; Potamianou 1987, p. 60: there is a double danger: what is coming from a fascinating, terrifying object, but also what arises in oneself in response.
- 962 Potamianou 1984a, p. 124; Potamianou 1984a, pp. 20. 32. 163; Potamianou 1984a, p. 11.
- 963 Potamianou 1984a, pp. 112ff.; Potamianou 1984a, p. 47; cf. p. 31; Potamianou 1992e[1988], p. 76f.; Potamianou 1987, p. 49f.
- 964 Potamianou 1992a, p. 38f.; Potamianou 1984a, p. 110; Potamianou 1992e, p. 77f. Potamianou 1987, p. 56 reflects: 'the potential of having no representative links [*la non-liaison représentative*] is written into the very core of the human being, because the first stages of its existence in the mother's uterus and immediately after birth cannot in any case be taken in charge by the network of representations. It is therefore an open gap torn into representation [*une béance représentative*] from which we emerge'; cf. Potamianou 1991, p. 59f., where she connects this with Bion 'O'.
- 965 de Mijolla 1981, on Rimbaud: pp. 35-80; on some of the background see: cf. Baranes 2003; 'identification sickness': in the original '*maladies de l'identification*', Potamianou 1984a, p. 28f.
- 966 Potamianou 1984a, p. 28; also see Potamianou 2008c: 'although the subject is cut off from a part of himself, the buried ancestors, the ignored fathers and the unrecognised omnipotent mothers, all of whom are merged into the figuration of destiny, are not for all that excluded from the life of their descendants. It may be said that the sanctuaries of destiny contain between their walls the ghosts of vanished objects, whose effects are

- very costly for whom they harass.' and Carapanos and Potamianou 1980, p. 82.
- 967 Cf. Potamianou 1992a, p. 101; Potamianou 1992a, p. 87; Potamianou 1984a, p. 46.
- 968 Potamianou 1992a, p. 131. Also see McDougall 1980 [1972], p. 353: 'It has sometimes seemed to me that these analysts cling to the analysis like a drowning man to a life belt, even though he no longer believes he will ever reach the shore.'
- 969 Potamianou 1992a, cf. Fine 1995c; McDougall 1996; McDougall 1994; Patrick 1999; Steiner 1993.
- 970 Potamianou 1992a, pp. 115. 117. 127.
- 971 Potamianou 1992a, pp. 75. 108. 123; Potamianou 2011a, p. 512.
- 972 Winnicott 1971, p. 36.
- 973 Potamianou 1992a, pp. 13-18; 126; Potamianou 1992a, p. 17.
- 974 Potamianou 1992a, pp. 45. 59.
- 975 Potamianou 1992a, p. 55; cf. pp. 59. 62
- 976 Potamianou 1992a, p. 93; de Mijolla 1981 (see, for instance p. 130f. for Freud).
- 977 Potamianou 1992a, p. 94f., referring to Chasseguet-Smirgel 1973, and in particular, pp. 779-780 where she emphasises the sense of a project and takes up Fain and Marty's (1959) suggestion of a pressure, exerted by the object directing the subject into a progressive evolution; also see: Potamianou 1973, p. 1173.
- 978 Potamianou 1992a, p. 103.
- 979 Potamianou 1992a, p. 110; Potamianou 1992a, p. 106; cf. pp. 125. 132f.; on the necessary suspension of judgement: Potamianou 1992c, p. 1104. Even Freud's concept of the *pulsion de mort*, Potamianou suggests, may be an attempt to draw primordial destructivity into a link to life on a voyage in which even psychic death is taken on as a passenger: '*Car cette pulsion de mort, destructivité primordiale, retenue - même en agonie - dans le liens de la vie, ne fait-elle pas de la mort dans le psychique une aventure et un voyage? Mes ancêtres auraient dit: "un passage"*', Potamianou 2000b, p. 69.
- 980 Verdenius 1985, p. 65.
- 981 Potamianou 1992a, p. 107.
- 982 Cf. Potamianou 1992a, p. 110f. with reference to Winnicott's and Khan's contributions.
- 983 Potamianou 2006a, p. 46; cf. Potamianou 2003, p 56; also see Potamianou 1974, p. 1129. To each mental economy, one might venture to suggest, its own variety of the *opérateur*.
- 984 Potamianou 1993a, p. 91.
- 985 Potamianou 2008a, p. 64, cf. also Kaswin-Bonnefond, p. 274.
- 986 Potamianou 1995, p. 48.
- 987 Potamianou 1986, p. 524.
- 988 Potamianou 1986, p. 521.
- 989 Cf. Potamianou 1993a, p. 89; cf. Potamianou 2005, p. 172f.
- 990 Potamianou 2006a, p. 39.
- 991 Potamianou 2006a, p. 39; Potamianou 2006a, p. 41; Potamianou 2006a, p. 43.
- 992 Potamianou 2006a, p. 42;
- 993 Potamianou 2006a, p. 43.
- 994 Potamianou 2006a, pp. 42. 41; Potamianou 2004b; see Potamianou 1974, p. 1130: '*la cuirasse extérieure*' [the outside armour] and Potamianou 1992a, p. 39: armoured shell ['*carapace*']; Potamianou 1977b, p. 1119: her life's experience as if canned ['*son vécu "en conserve"*']. Potamianou 1980, p. 992 points out that defences used by an adult may differ considerably from those used in infantile neurosis; cf. Potamianou 1990a, p. 276; for the range and complexity of possible defensive manoeuvres see Potamianou 2001, p. 127.
- 995 Potamianou 2004b; Potamianou 2001, p. 93; Potamianou 1998a, pp. 51. 60. 61.
- 996 Potamianou 1998a, pp. 53. 55; Potamianou 2004b; Potamianou 2001, p. 93; cf. Potamianou 1992a, p. 39; Potamianou 1982a, p. 425 points to Lichtenberg and Slap 1971, for an understanding of the defensive organisation, who, on p. 456, sum up: 'The defensive organization is that part of the total ego organization which explores the possibilities for adaptation to the disequilibria of intrapsychic conflict and attempts to find the best solution in the given circumstance'. In Potamianou 1977b, p. 1123 the author points to Anne-Marie Sandler's article on the significance of Piaget's work for psychoanalysis, in which she emphasises Sandler 1975, p. 376, the importance of patients' 'organized unconscious theories of the world'.
- 997 Potamianou underlines the significance of René Diatkine's statement that it is essential the psychoanalyst is able to imagine the functioning of the Me of his/her patient: Potamianou 1974, p. 1129 in reference to Diatkine 1974, p. 790.
- 998 Potamianou 2008a, p. 66, cf. Potamianou 2007, p. 89f.; a fundamental wound: Potamianou 1999c, p. 1705.
- 999 Potamianou 2006a, p. 42; Potamianou 2007, p. 103; Potamianou 2006a, p. 42f. It would also be important to evaluate whether it is really the unconscious that emits badly or whether one would rather have to take into account an exhausted Me, weakened so much not only by object loss but also narcissistically, that the flux of internal and external perceptions can no longer be handled, Potamianou 2001, p. 141.

- 1000 Potamianou 1997d, p. 52; Potamianou 1998a, pp. 54, 57; Potamianou 2001, p. 95; cf. Potamianou 2004a, p. 144 on a kind of anorexia of having and being.
- 1001 Potamianou 2006a, p. 41; Potamianou 2006a, p. 39f.
- 1002 Potamianou 2006a, p. 37f.; Potamianou 2006a, p. 41: '*j'ai voulu mettre l'accent sur la possibilité de différents cheminements dessinant des configurations cliniques manifestement proches, mais dont le fond diffère*'; Potamianou 2006a, p. 44.
- 1003 Cf. Potamianou 1997d, p. 52.
- 1004 See Potamianou 2000a, p. 130f. and Potamianou 2001, p. 93 on primordial anality as a fantasy. In Potamianou 2002c, p. 612 she writes, 'The organisation of the defence is sustained by an omnipotent fantasy according to which the ego can exert absolute control over its objects, over the surrounding world and over its own functions. In the fantasy, a part of the ego, cloistered with a primary omnipotent object, imposes a constraint on psychic mobility and attracts cathexes.'; see Potamianou 2017b, p. 154: '*fantasmes de nidification narcissique*'.
- 1005 Aulagnier 1974, p. 278; a useful short sketch of Aulagnier's position: Birraux 1996, pp. 409-412; on the emergence of the '*Je*': Troisier 1998, p. 30f.
- 1006 Potamianou 2016, p. 215. Potamianou 2001, p. 8fn.1 on the word morpheme; Carapanos and Potamianou 1980, p. 75 emphasise that cultural patterns are made up of more than just language.
- 1007 Potamianou 1985b, p. 294. Personal myth is, in turn, influenced by personality structure: Potamianou 1985b, p. 289.
- 1008 Potamianou 1985b, p. 292f. On p. 288, Potamianou states: 'I would say that the personal myth is the thread that runs through these three fantasies [the primal scene, the scene of seduction, and the scene of castration], weaving a conscious representational morpheme that infiltrates the individual's self perception and understanding of events and which molds the screen memories. Its sources remain unconscious'. In the next paragraph she notes approvingly de Mijolla's position, articulated in de Mijolla 1981/2003, p. 221, which she sums up as: 'we keep telling us stories that correspond to our personal truth'; also see Potamianou 1997b, p. 37.
- 1009 Potamianou 1985b, p. 292.
- 1010 Potamianou 2000a, p. 122: the Me gives up '*les territoires non sécurisants*', territories about which it does not feel secure enough.
- 1011 Potamianou 1998b, p. 954, the penultimate paragraph of the article: 'But if the Helena of our dreams drifts away [*s'éloigne*], is it not the psychic desert which is looming on the horizon [*s'annonce*]?'; on dream work Potamianou 1974, p. 1131.
- 1012 Potamianou 1985b, p. 295; cf. p. 286; also see Potamianou 1997b, p. 36.
- 1013 Potamianou 1985b, p. 294.
- 1014 Potamianou 1979, p. 376.
- 1015 Potamianou 1992g, p. 35; cf. Potamianou 1998c, p. 60.
- 1016 Potamianou 1979, pp. 377, 378ff.; 381 Potamianou 1992g, pp. 33ff.
- 1017 Potamianou 1979, p. 384; cf. p. 385: the project of Prometheus is equally the project of Aeschylus. In Potamianou 1992g, p. 39 the author doubts that tragedy would be the most apt form to give voice to some of the inner tensions of the contemporary world, which certainly do not lack drama but a drama of a lack of communication and of solitude. As Devereux 1975b, p. 50 points out: 'art is the means by which a sane society manages to use in a constructive manner those impulses that seem to be least amenable to being socialised, and even to increase their intensity by providing them access to the vast resources of culture, which renders them both capable of expression and culturally productive.' An impressive contemporary example of the power of form, if available, to re-process content has recently been provided by Sears 2017, who has reassembled and reconfigured words of Donald Trump's in haiku form.
- 1018 Potamianou 1979, pp. 391.
- 1019 I am drawing on Potamianou 1979, pp. 386, 399.
- 1020 Potamianou 1974, p. 1131 makes a related point about the dream: it is not only important what conflicts it expresses but what it does for the mental economy by virtue of its very existence.
- 1021 Devereux 1998, p. 39; cf. p. 42f.; p. 51: the socio-cultural system in Sparta as a pathology. In Potamianou 1992g, p. 39 the author points out that it was identification with the actors that led to catharsis in Greek theatre. She does not comment on what kind of impact on subjective experience we might have to expect if such an occasion for a communal working through were to be lacking. There is, however, a conjecture of hers in 1998c, p. 61 that Spartan culture might not have been able to modify imaginary experience by using symbolic thought, a remark that in the wider context of her thought - she is not a Lacanian - could be interpreted as follows: Spartan culture confronted with the image of a threat (social upheaval and catastrophic change) was unable to process this menace by working it through in a manner analogous to what happened in Athenian theatre. Since this did not happen possibilities of social transformation did not open up that might have made the repeated enactment of ritual cruelty unnecessary. In a different context Potamianou tersely

- states: 'Our choices remain bound [*restent obligés*] to our identifications', Potamianou 1992b, p. 480. I have not found evidence that Potamianou has had recourse to the thinking of her one time countryman and fellow psychoanalyst Cornelius Castoriadis, whose thought would be of some pertinence in the matter, cf. Giust-Despaires 2009/2003, pp. 94ff. As Lois McNay (McNay 2000, p. 137) puts it: 'The imaginary [in Castoriadis' view] is not, therefore, a specular structure which seeks to conceal lack, but an originary capacity of figuration or presentification.' For a short sketch of Lacan's position see: de Mijolla-Mellor 1996a, pp. 124-126. About the use of the term 'imaginary' by French non-Lacanian: Diatkine 1997, p. 118f. Useful glimpses on Castoriadis are provided by Elliott 1992, pp. 4, 27-28, 140-141, 145.
- 1022 Devereux 1998, p. 44: 'it is precisely this type of disorientation, as regards reality as much as regards the lessons that can be derived from what has passed, that the Spartiates successfully imposed on the helots'.
- 1023 Press 1999c, p. 73.
- 1024 Press 1999c, p. 74.
- 1025 For Press the 'amputation of the representational' (Potamianou 1998a, p. 57) is embedded in a relationship. Following Press' line of thoughts it is also easy to see that Philoctetes represents something his former comrades would prefer not to remember. Shay 1994, p. 21, from his own perspective, makes a different point that is, however, related: Achilles' indignant rage (*ménis*) at Agamémnon has to be understood in the context of the wrong done to him and the betrayal of "what is right". '... moral injury is an essential part of any combat trauma that leads to lifelong psychological injury', Shay 1994, p. 20. Philoctetes can no longer entertain the illusion of belonging, aptly described by Maurice Halbwachs: 'memory donates to us the illusion to live among groups which do not imprison us, and which impose themselves upon us only as much and as long as we accept this', Halbwachs 1925/1994, p. 110.
- 1026 Potamianou 1992b, p. 476f.; also see p. 480f.; about the range of the deeply unsettling: Potamianou 2002b, p. 153.
- 1027 Some of which is reflected upon in Lebovici 1984[1980], pp. 363ff. Potamianou contributed Potamianou 1984b[1980] to the volume; cf. Vlachakis 2004, p. 107f.
- 1028 See Potamianou 1983b[1978], p. 183f. and 1983c[1978]; Potamianou 1998b, pp. 947f. 954; Carapanos and Potamianou 1980, p. 82; Potamianou's doctoral thesis in 1958 was on 'The causes of antisocial behavior', see 'Anna Potamianou. Publications', p. 1.
- 1029 Potamianou 1977a, p. 208: the way a mother takes external reality into account and the quality of her care progressively modify the quality and form of the child's projections; Potamianou 1973, p. 1171 (from a case vignette): the mother is able to integrate reality but uses mechanisms that show an extreme fragility of her Me and a deep rejection of her child; cf. Vlachakis 2004, p. 108f. The homonymous article by the Hellenic Psychoanalytic Society on its history bluntly states: 'Psychoanalysis' two aspects, as a movement and as an organization, are in conflict, and this is particularly true in Greece, a country with deficits in organization. These deficits are manifested in populism and corruption that replaced the repressive tendencies of the rural society Greece used to be', 'Hellenic Psychoanalytic Society', p. 8; also see Potamianou 1988b, p. 249.
- 1030 Potamianou 1983a[1978], p. 105; cf. Vlachakis 2004, p. 107f.; 'Hellenic Psychoanalytic Society', p. 2; for a Lacanian perspective, hostile to the steps undertaken by the Hellenic Society to become part of the *IPA* see: (2007), 'L'association: La psychanalyse en Grèce', *passim* and p. 52. A recent paper permits to set Potamianou's initiative against a background. The outline Talfanidis and Maniadakis 2014, p. 128 present deserves to be quoted in full, '... in the 1950s, the psychiatric landscape in Greece was particularly bleak; it was dominated by asylums while, according to several testimonies, clinical activity was less than basic. It is characteristic of the spirit prevalent in the psychiatric community and the country in general that a Colony for the Mentally Ill was founded on Leros, a war-ravaged island that had hosted political exiles. There were only two exceptions to this dual phenomenon that both the absence of psychoanalysis and the extremely lacking clinical activity in the Greek psychiatric community. The first was the founding, by the psychologist and psychoanalyst Anna Potamianou, of the Center for Mental Health and Research (*CMHR*), a network of community-based mental health units. The *CMHR* was open to the principles and clinical applications of psychoanalysis. It organized visits by foreign psychoanalysts to Greece for educational purposes and offered, among other services, psychoanalytically oriented therapy, often under the supervision of psychoanalysts from abroad. The operation of the *CMHR* was often disrupted by the intervention of administrators and, during the 1967–74 dictatorship, by the military. Anna Potamianou resigned; she returned to the *CMHR* only after the fall of the dictatorship. The second exception was the work of psychiatrist and psychoanalyst Panagiotis Sakellaropoulos, first at the Daou Penteli Psychiatric Hospital for Children and the Theotokos Foundation, and later at the Psychiatric Clinic of the Aeginiteion Hospital. Sakellaropoulos, encouraged by D. Kouretas, promoted new treatment and patient rehabilitation programs, inspired by the principles of psychoanalysis and social psychiatry. During that period, Sakellaropoulos was surrounded by a group of young professionals, most of whom were later trained as psychoanalysts. This work was interrupted by the military coup in 1967. Kouretas was forced to retire, while Sakellaropoulos resigned and left for France.' Mental pain, the authors draw their conclusion, was expelled from the social body, against the background of

- 'decades of unbearable collective trauma', Talfanidis and Maniadakis 2014, p. 129.
- 1031 Sandler 1960, p. 354 on 'safety-signals'; p. 355 on the 'safety-principle'; Sandler 1985 takes a look back, years later and p. 227 reports a letter by Anna Freud from 1 March 1959, in which she links the need for reassurance with a particularly intense connection to inanimate objects: 'It always reminded me very vividly of an experience with a former patient of mine, a severe alcoholic who lost all control of reality and himself when drunk, or after a drunken bout. A psychiatrist in whose care he had been before analysis had taught him to recover control by merely Verbalizing his perceptions of reality, for example: 'this is a table', 'this is a stone in the pavement', etc. He reported that this had been a real help to him. I believe many patients do similar things spontaneously when under alcohol, drugs, or in fever states: they test the correctness of their perceptions for reassurance about their own intactness. And, like all defences, this can become greatly over-emphasized'. For a useful sketch of Sandler's thought on the feeling of security and mental pain, from outside the English speaking world: Pelanda 1995, pp. 316ff. [*Il sentimento di sicurezza e il dolore psichico*] and p. 327f. Lopez and Zorzi Meneguzzo 1989, pp. 474-476, in their sketch of Sandler's position discuss something later developed by Potamianou: '*attesa magica*', magical waiting (p. 475).
- 1032 Potamianou 2001, p. 85f. [also see Potamianou 2000a, p. 122], discusses Anna Freud's concept of 'Icheinschränkung', the restriction of the Me; see Freud A. 1936, chapter 8, pp. 279-289; p. 286: the difference between inhibition and ego-restriction: inhibition defends against what comes from inside, ego-restriction defends against what comes from outside. Brakel 2004, pp. 269-273 provides a literature review on the term. Of the contribution she surveys, McCarthy 1990 in her article reflects on the consequences of family abuse (physical or psychological) and character formation and on p. 184 states: 'As their families devalue the children by attacking them physically or psychologically, they tend to withdraw into the family rather than take advantage of emotional opportunities for reparation provided by their peers or by substitute parent figures', an observation which comes close to some of the clinical territory Potamianou repeatedly visits. On Anna Freud's importance for the history of the psychoanalytic society in Greece: Potamianou 1988b.
- 1033 Potamianou 2006b; Abraham and Torok 1987; also see: Potamianou 1977a, p. 207. In Potamianou 1977a, p. 210 suggests we might have to consider a reversal of Freud's famous formula of the shadow of the object falling on the Me (Freud 1917[1915], p. 435): it is the shadow of the Me, rather than the other way round, that is falling on the object.
- 1034 Potamianou 2006b. In Potamianou 2017b, p. 155 she writes '*... on peut suivant le vers de Neruda finir par "percevoir dans l'immobile une palpitation immense"*'. The line she quotes has an interesting context in Neruda's poem '*Galope muerto*', 'That's why, in what's immobile, holding still, to perceive/ then, like great wingbeats, overhead, /like dead bees or numbers, /oh all that my spent heart can't embrace, /in crowds, in half-shed tears, /and human toiling, turbulence, /black actions suddenly disclosed /like ice, immense disorder, /oceanfold, for me who goes in singing, /as with a sword among defenseless me'. (I am quoting the translation provided in Felstiner 1978, p. 187).
- 1035 Potamianou refers to the work of Henry Krystal as to the necessary evaluation of the link between outside factors and inner potential: Potamianou 2000a, p. 123fn.43. Interestingly Krystal 1985, p. 153f. (not mentioned by Potamianou) refers to French work on *pensée opératoire*, which, he suggests, could be seen as a stimulus barrier protecting the individual against the aftermaths of trauma.
- 1036 Midweek 2014, at 13:25ff.
- 1037 Grady 2013, p. 2.; Duerden 2013. The interview does not appear in Potamianou's writings.
- 1038 Grady 2013, p. 415. In Midweek 2013 Stephen Grady gave an explanation that focused on practicalities: 'I am getting older and stupider and tripping myself up'.
- 1039 Potamianou 2016, p. 216. To put it into polar opposites: is a workable frame being vandalised from sheer spite or has it been a sorry shambles to start with.
- 1040 An attack on figuration: Potamianou 2016, p. 220 quotes from clinical literature a patient with the statement: 'Every form is a menace against my existence. At the moment when I accept a definite form I am lost'. Potamianou 1988, p. 932 recalls a personal communication from Michel Fain, who on one occasion, spoke of a 'figuration of defiguration'.
- 1041 Potamianou 2004a, p. 152; Potamianou 2001, pp. 10. 127. 132; Potamianou 2000a, p. 124; Potamianou, 1999b, p. 54, also see: de Mijolla-Mellor 1996b, p. 367f.; Troisier 1998, p. 20f.
- 1042 Potamianou 2015, p. 955; in her contribution to the volume mentioned Marion M. Oliner, covering among other authors, the work of Piera Aulagnier (Oliner 2013a, pp. 165-168) concludes that in some early modes of representation problems interlock: 'Its failure to establish a pleasurable contact with the world is also not accessible to introspection, since it is based on the destruction of certain functions, which could potentially lead to the missing contact.' (p. 168).
- 1043 Potamianou 2010, p. 173; Potamianou 2016, pp. 212. 215.
- 1044 Potamianou, 1999b, p. 56.
- 1045 Alexandridis 2012, p. 29, in partial reference to Potamianou 1992a, probably thinking of p. 154. A translator's note in Potamianou 2006b points out that '*Veilleuse*' usually means a sidelight or a dim nightlight, a light that

- is constant (hence 'watchful' mother').
- 1046 See her reminiscences in Potamianou 2010a.
- 1047 See, in a slightly different context: Potamianou 2002a, p. 525; cf. Potamianou 2001, p. 85f.; for differences with the *opératoire* see Potamianou 2008b, p. 14f.; Potamianou 2001, p. 95 and also Potamianou 2006b; Potamianou 1990c, p. 51. When Marion Michel Oliner, quite correctly, points out, that [the French] 'In their relative neglect of the ego, one gains the impression that they are Kleinians' (Oliner 1988, p. 12), she would not primarily look to Potamianou for evidence, a corpus of writing where this emphasis would be difficult to find.
- 1048 Stora 2013, p. 11; back cover.
- 1049 I use 'imaginary' in a way not intended to imply an opposition to 'symbolic'. The Oxford English Dictionary under the heading shows as a first denotation: 'existing only in imagination or fancy; having no real existence. (Opposed to *real, actual*).' It is the opposition to real and actual I would like to stress in my use of the word without committing to a classification as either symbolic or imaginary in a Lacanian sense.
- 1050 Cf. Stora 1999, pp. 196-202; cf. Stora 2013, pp. 29ff.
- 1051 Stora 1999, p. 23f.
- 1052 Stora 1999, p. 12; the line in Psalm 1:2, which in the King James Version, is rendered as 'in his law doth he meditate day and night' would in the Hebrew original be closer to 'His teaching he murmurs day and night'. As Alter 2007, p. 3 points out, the 'verb *hagah* means to make a low muttering sound'. Delitzsch 1887, p. 112 makes the following point: 'hagah, said of a deep ... dull mode of utterance, hovering, as it were, between within and without'. For the use of the *tehillim* in Jewish life see the brief introduction in Magonet 2004, pp. 3ff.
- 1053 Stora 1999, p. 12. 24.
- 1054 Stora 1999, pp. 44ff.
- 1055 Kabat-Zinn 1990, pp. 188-190.
- 1056 Kabat-Zinn 1990, p. 190; apparently the original - non-quoted - source is Bernard Lown's preface to Cousins 1983, p. xiv f.; also see: Harvey and Levine 1952.
- 1057 Stora 1999, p. 25; Stora 2005, pp. 47. 263.
- 1058 Stora 1999, p. 45.
- 1059 Bion 1970, p. 12. This is not a reference provided by Stora.
- 1060 Cf. Stora 1999, p. 18; Stora 2005, pp. 199. 215f.
- 1061 Stora 1999, p. 246; Stora 1999, p. 253f.; Alexandridis 2010 takes a different stance. It should be noted, however, that the patients he refers to are all rooted in European cultures. Kristeva 2000, p. 119 includes in her reflections experience with a patient from Taiwan. She finds that French does not permit him to get into contact with the traumatizations that led him to leave Taiwan. He tries to resort to a third language: images. It should also be said that Kristeva is not unfamiliar with Chinese culture, Kristeva 2009. Potamianou 1993b, p. 47 from personal experience reflects that the desire to enter analysis in some cases necessitates a change of country and an analysis in another language than one's mother tongue and considers the effects this may have on both analyst and analysand. Yet, this does not seem to cover the cases Stora was thinking of, in which the difference is much more radical than language.
- 1062 Stora 1999, p. 221f. p. 247; p. 209.
- 1063 Stora 1999, p. 247.
- 1064 Stora 1999, pp. 9. 70. 198f. 216f. 237ff. 246. 248. 254, Stora 2005, p. 232.
- 1065 Cf. Stora 1999, pp. 197. 213. 222. 240. 248.
- 1066 Stora 2005, p. 129f.
- 1067 Cf. Stora 1999, p. 95f. p. 203f.
- 1068 Stora 1999, p. 202f.; Stora 2013, p. 129.
- 1069 Stora 1999, pp. 210ff., 222ff., p. 226; cf. Stora 1999, p. 233; also cf. Stora 2013, pp. 129-139.
- 1070 Stora 2005, pp. 50ff.; Stora 2005, p. 52. p. 174.
- 1071 Stora 2005, pp. 54. 85. 125. 164. 196; Stora 2013, p. 53.
- 1072 Stora 2005, p. 62; pp. 35; 181f., 208f.
- 1073 Stora 2013, p. 93; cf. p. 157 and p. 197; Stora 2013, p. 160, Stora 2005, p. 190f.
- 1074 Stora 2005, p. 83.
- 1075 Pouchelle 2003, p. 16.
- 1076 Stora 2010, p. 31 shows that Stora is familiar with Christophe Dejours' work.
- 1077 Stora 2005, p. 207f.; Stora 2013, p. 137, cf. the analogous problem for organ donors, Stora 2005, p. 119. Stora 2010, p. 31 in a brief remark throws light on why people might want to stick to facts: everything else might be considered a figment of their imagination.
- 1078 Stora 2013, p. 99f.
- 1079 Stora 1999, p. 118f. 121. Correale 2007, p. 30 writes: 'The institution, in fact, also contributes towards offering to the individual a mental grid in evaluating reality, a way to think and to feel, in short, a sort of

- collective mind, which can carry out a function in place [*una funzione vicariante*] of an individual's mental functions.' One can easily imagine that a collision between what is on offer and what the individual needs would be highly problematic.
- 1080 Stora 2005, pp. 182ff.
- 1081 See for instance: Psalm 42:6: *Ma tishtokhakhki nafshi va'tehemi alai*: ... (In the King James Version it is 42:5: Why art thou cast down, O my soul? And why art thou disquieted in me?) The hitpa'el form of the root *shakhakh*, rare in the Bible, according to Delitzsch 1880, p. 57f. 'signifies to bow one's self very low, to sit down upon the ground like a mourner, and to bend oneself downward', the root *hamah*, used in the next verb, signifies 'to utter a deep groan, to speak quietly and mumbling to one's self', Delitzsch 1880, p. 58.
- 1082 Stora 1991/2005, p. 98f. cf. also Stora 2013, p. 24f.; p. 196.
- 1083 Stora 1999, p. 155f.; Anzieu 1990, pp. 32ff.
- 1084 Anzieu 1990, p. 71f.
- 1085 Also see Nathan 1994, pp. 300ff.
- 1086 Stora 2005, p. 207f.
- 1087 Stora 1991/2005, p. 46.
- 1088 Stora 1991/2005, p. 47.
- 1089 Cf. table Stora 1991/2005, p. 57
- 1090 On stolidity under extreme circumstances as represented in film see the following extract from a film scene in which a Lieutenant talks to a frightened soldier: 'We're all scared. You hid in that ditch because you think there's still hope. But, Blithe, the only hope you have is to accept the fact that you're already dead. And the sooner you accept that, the sooner you'll be able to function as a soldier is supposed to function.', Donald and MacDonald 2011, p. 171. The passage is from the film 'Band of Brothers', HBO miniseries, episode 'Carentan', 2002.
- 1091 Cf. Nussbaum 1994, Sherman 2005. There is a comparable delicate balancing act in traditional Japanese culture between *giri* and *ninjo*, the obligations inherent in one's social role as opposed to individual desires, Newcomer 1993.
- 1092 Cf. Stora 2013, p. 136. As Thomas Hardy put it in his poem 'Old Furniture', 'I see the hands of the generations/ That owned each shiny familiar thing/ In play on its knobs and indentations/ ...', Hardy 1917, p. 485. Paulin 1975, p. 35 based on older research, points out that a passage of Thomas Hardy's in his personal writings is an echo of Carlyle 1837, p. 5: 'For indeed it is well said, 'in every object there is inexhaustible meaning; the eye sees in it what the eye brings means of seeing'. Seeing seems to be tied to memories as emerges, for instance, from 'The Self-Unseeing': 'Here is the ancient floor,/ Footworn and hollowed and thin,/ Here was the former door/ Where the dead feet walked in', Hardy 1901, p. 166.
- 1093 Stora 2005, pp. 100-103; 137f.; Weber 2007, p. 25 describes his project as a veritable '*ethnographie des transactions*'.
- 1094 Stora 2005, p. 78; Stora 2013, p. 151.
- 1095 Cf. Stora 2013, pp. 139. 130.
- 1096 Cf. Stora 2013, p. 132.
- 1097 Stora 2005, p. 159, citing Green 1983, p. 278; cf. Stora 2011, p. 30.
- 1098 Stora 2005, p. 269. On p. 288 Stora refers to the French translation of Damasio 1994, which is not accessible to me at this moment. What he probably thinks of is Damasio 1994, p. 104: 'Dispositional representations exist in potential state, subject to activation, like the town of Brigadoon.'
- 1099 Stora 2013, pp. 149ff.; Stora 2005, p. 76; p. 207; cf. p. 86.
- 1100 Stora 2013, p. 105; Stora 2005, p. 152.
- 1101 Stora 2013, p. 154; cf. also Stora 2005, p. 197. 208.
- 1102 Stora 2005, p. 219.
- 1103 Stora 2013, pp. 11f. 26f.; see: <http://www.psychosomatique-integrative.net/>
- 1104 Stora 2013, p. 143; Stora 2005, pp. 69. 75. 147. 202; Stora 2005, p. 189f. There are times when the perceived position of an analyst in the world outside the consulting room seems to affect what comes afterwards. Aisenstein 2013, p. 184 remembers finding out about the prequel of her psychoanalytic work with a lady of mixed Japanese and Korean parentage, 'She asked me if I was going to my country, since she had always known, she said, that I, too, was a foreigner. As I showed my astonishment, she added: "Doctor Fain told me: 'I am going to refer you to a colleague who is also a foreigner like you, but who has always practiced in Paris." ', cf. p. 186.
- 1105 Stora 2013, p. 35f.; Stora 2013, p. 34f.
- 1106 E.g. Northern Africa Stora 1999, pp. 68ff.; 94ff.; 193ff.; Stora 2013, pp. 143, cf. Stora 2005, pp. 75ff.; 129ff.; 143ff.; Italy: Stora 1999, pp. 118ff.; Guyana: Stora 1999, pp. 176ff.; Stora 2013, pp. 121ff.; Africa: Stora 2005, pp. 189ff., cf. Stora 2013, 159ff.
- 1107 Stora 2013, p. 72: '*J'essaie dans le cadre des séances d'injecter de l'imaginaire*'; Stora 2013, p. 82; Stora 2011, pp. 78. 81f.; Stora 2013, p. 71; cf. Stora 2005, p. 152f.

- 1108 Stora 2013, p. 151; Stora 2005, p. 177f.
- 1109 Stora 2005, pp. 55f. 197. 204, Stora 2013, p. 163. 171.
- 1110 Stora 2013, pp. 131. 167; cf. Stora 2005, pp. 130. 199. 209; Stora 2013, p. 175.
- 1111 Stora 1999, p. 61; Stora 1999, p. 220.
- 1112 Cf. Stora 2005, p. 131f.; Stora 2005, pp. 189ff.; Stora 2013, p. 143; cf. Stora 2011, p. 77.
- 1113 Stora 2005, p. 193.
- 1114 Cf. Uexküll 1963, p. 227; Stora 2013, pp. 19-21; cf. Kull and Hoffmeyer 2005, p. 491.
- 1115 Cf. Stora 2013, p. 45; cf. Stora 2005, p. 145.
- 1116 Stora 1999, p. 83; Stora 2005, p. 267; Stora 1999, p. 46f.
- 1117 Stora 2005, p. 263.
- 1118 Stora 2011, p. 27; Stora 2005, p. 145: '*une vie où la vie semble s'être retirée*'; Stora 2013, p. 96f.; cf. Stora 2011, p. 78f.
- 1119 Stora 1999, p. 67; Stora 1999, p. 52f.
- 1120 Stora 1999, p. 52; cf. p. 66f.
- 1121 Stora 2013, p. 202; cf. also Stora 2006, p. 80.
- 1122 Stora 2013, p. 202.
- 1123 Stora 1999, p. 63, with reference to Ruelle 1991, p. 70.
- 1124 Stora 2013, p. 202f.; Stora 2011, pp. 90ff.
- 1125 Stora 2011, p. 92; Stora 2006, p. 74.
- 1126 On Thom, whose work is also referred to by Potamianou, see Chapter 8.
- 1127 Stora 2005, p. 265; Stora 1991/2005, p. 3.
- 1128 Stora 1999, p. 190f.; Stora 2005, p. 182; Stora 2013, p. 180.
- 1129 Stora 2005, p. 265. In Stora 2005, p. 82 he says, talking about work with transplant patients'... I do not always investigate the psychic dimension of somatic complaints, and I use 'dimension' rather than 'cause' advisedly, ...
- 1130 Szwec 2017b, p. 14 relates that when he and Claude Smadja went to Pierre Marty to present to him the table of contents of the very first issue of *La Revue française de psychosomatique* in 1991, entitled 'Psychoanalysis and Psychosomatics'. Marty was in agreement with the project but asked for the title to be changed to 'Psychosomatics and Psychoanalysis'.
- 1131 Cf. Ferenczi 1909, pp. 21-23; Ferenczi 1912, pp. 58-61.
- 1132 Cf. Turner 2002, Colman 2006, Cassullo 2010, Foehl 2010.
- 1133 Cf. 'Colour Blindness and Camouflage', *Nature* 146, 17 August 1940, p. 226.
- 1134 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 64; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 121fn.7; Botella C. 2014a, p. 85fn.7; Botella C. 1999, p. 239; see also, recently, on Marty, Botella S. 2014a, cf. also Botella S. 2004, p. 1299f.; Parsons 2005, p. xviii.
- 1135 Green 2001, p. 1303.
- 1136 Freud 1900, p. 344. see Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 61f.; Botella and Botella 2007, p. 15fn.13; cf. Rose 2007, p. 83; a similar critique, from a different tradition, is voiced by Oliner 2012, p. 48.
- 1137 Cf. Botella and Botella 2007, p. 37; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 57.
- 1138 Or of a pastry chef (*pâtissier*) mixing and blending ingredients to create flavours, Botella and Botella 2007, p. 25; cf. 29f.
- 1139 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 62ff; Botella C. 2015a, p. 228f.; cf. Musalek 2006.
- 1140 Scholem 1957, pp. 285ff.; Goodman 2002, p. 81fn.28 links this with the Gaia - Kronos myth, which, as we have seen, is also a point of reference for Nicolaïdis; Mittelman 2012, p. 57f. sees connections to the trauma of exile from Spain and the need to come to terms with the immensity of loss.
- 1141 from Voltaire 1733, Letter XIV and XV; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 19. For the translation I have consulted Voltaire 1909-14 [1733].
- 1142 Cf. Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 118. In Botella, C. 2018b, p. 723 makes a connection to the situation of psychoanalysis, which threatens to be imprisoned in regional certainties and their established networks of understanding.
- 1143 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 19f.; Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 40 refer to Pascal's fragment 397 (édition Brunshvicg): '*Par l'espace, l'univers me comprend et m'engloutit comme un point; par la pensée, je le comprends*'.
- 1144 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 20.
- 1145 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 22.
- 1146 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 26; Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1464.
- 1147 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 22f.
- 1148 Cf. Botella C. 2011a, p. 121.
- 1149 Botella and Botella 2001a, 22; p. 211; cf. Parsons 2005, p. xixf. Botella C. 1997b, p. 130 juxtaposes the concept of process, inherent in the Second Topography to the concept of representation central to the First Topography. Botella and Botella 1995b, p. 356, point out: 'The Me of the Second Topography is movement

- and permanent process under the influence of the drives [*il est processus permanent sous l'effet du pulsionnel*]; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 70 emphasise: 'the Me of the Second Topography cannot be represented apart from its articulation with and separation from the object'.
- 1150 Cf. Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 59.
- 1151 Botella and Botella 2001a, 29; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 66f.
- 1152 Rather than Gilles Deleuze's critique of it, cf. Pagès 2015, p. 811; Magun 2013, p. 115; Shaviro, 2007.
- 1153 Cf. Kaufmann 1966, pp. 25.180f.
- 1154 Asmuth 2007, p. 31; Hegel 1807, p. 46: '*Das Wahre ist so der bacchantische Taumel, an dem kein Glied nicht trunken ist, und weil jedes, indem es sich absondert, ebenso unmittelbar auflöst, ist er ebenso die durchsichtige und einfache Ruhe*'. (in my translation I am indebted to Wellbery 2013).
- 1155 Cf. Magee 2010, p. 248; cf. pp. 145. 215; Botella S. 2003a, p. 197: '*quelque chose d'autre d'aussi impensable, violent et vrai que l'élan: un négatif*'.
- 1156 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 58f.; cf. Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1466; Botella, C. 1997a, p. 68f.; for the relationship between Koyré and Kojève see Bonchino 2003, pp. 7ff.
- 1157 Freud 1910.
- 1158 Cf. Ali 1997, pp. 65-77, and in particular his lists pp. 70-72; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 30f.; cf. p. 78fn.12.
- 1159 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 30f.; cf. Faure 1991, p. 29. Koan as a word or concept is not used by the Botellas.
- 1160 Cf. Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 205; Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 27 on Bion's 'O'.
- 1161 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 35 cf. pp. 53. 32; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 110fn.1; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 73; Botella S. 2003a, p. 199; see also Green 1993a, p. 283; for a discussion of Hegel's concept see Sparby 2014, p. 250f.; cf. pp. 14. 173f.; also see Hegel 1816, p. 296.
- 1162 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 34.
- 1163 Cf. Pasche 1965; Bertrand 1997, pp. 33-42; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 33; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 71.
- 1164 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 33; cf. p. 41; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 72.
- 1165 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 38.
- 1166 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 39, cf. pp. 42. 44. 72; on the dangers of disinvestment p. 46; on states of tension that implode into hallucination: Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 34.
- 1167 Freud 1920, pp. 12f.
- 1168 Also see Botella and Botella 1997b, p. 181f.
- 1169 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 34.
- 1170 Botella C. 2008, p. 405; Botella C. 2005a, p. 21; cf. Botella C. 1991, p. 125, on the implicit reference to Green: Botella C. 2014b, p. 35; Botella C. 2011a, p. 123 writes: 'There could exist a series of alternating moments, at one point acknowledgement of the object – and the pleasure will become dependent on its presence – at another point, dispensing with it in moments of hallucinatory satisfaction; an alternation that is the equivalent that leads from successive 'murders' of the object to its idealisation.' For somewhat comparable material from India see Botella C. 2005a, p. 16; cf. also Green's and Sára Botella's statements in the discussion summed up in Botella S. 2005b, p. 359.
- 1171 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 46f.
- 1172 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 47; 42-44; cf. Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 29f.; Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1468; Botella S. 2013a, p. 168; Pasche 1988, p. 13.
- 1173 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 51. 53f. 123. Where they differ from Thom is in the degree of emphasis on the concept of motherly *empreint* (imprint) to explain the inner world of the baby, Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 52. Psychic reality does not replicate reality discerned by the sense organs but adds indispensable complications, cf. Botella and Botella 2006, pp. 722. 724; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 229; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 72; Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 37; Gammelgaard 2006, p. 98.
- 1174 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 53.
- 1175 Cf. Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 54, cf. p. 80.
- 1176 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 54.
- 1177 Cf. Botella and Botella 1992a, pp. 32ff. 37.
- 1178 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 225f.; cf. p. 55; '*Tu ne me chercherais pas si tu ne m'avais trouvé*', <http://www.penseesdepascal.fr/Hors/Hors16-moderne.php>.
- 1179 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 229; Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1157.
- 1180 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 229; cf. Botella and Botella 2006, p. 722. Botella C. 2011b, p. 3 writes, 'It takes a lot of time for the newborn child to create-replace his/her hallucinatory paradise with an other who is quite real, in the contact with the skin, the breasts, and the arms of the mother. And to find in her a place of refuge [*une terre d'asile*]'.
- 1181 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 229f.; cf. Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 34; Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1162.
- 1182 Botella and Botella 2001a p. 230; Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 35.

- 1183 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 230.
- 1184 Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 66.
- 1185 Cf. Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 30; cf. Botella and Botella 1996, p. 120.
- 1186 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 231, cf. p. 133; Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 75f.
- 1187 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 231f.; 83.
- 1188 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 233.
- 1189 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 234, in evident, tacit echo of Descartes, *Principes de la philosophie*, Quatrième Partie, article 145, 7th and 8th quality; cf. article 156; see Descartes 1659, pp. 467f.; 482; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 121 use the same image for the tension between narcissistic libido and object libido; cf. also Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 75.
- 1190 'Un "tout" instable se faisant et se défaisant sans cesse', Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 234f.; compare with this the Botellas' remarks about successfully finished analysis as something the non-accomplishment of which is source of a permanent push to transform what existed before: Botella and Botella 1997a, p. 1128.
- 1191 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 235.
- 1192 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 236. 156; cf. Botella and Botella 1996, p. 109f.; Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1468f.; cf. Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 76: 'the primal scene is the positive face, the configurable outcome and [explanatory] cause capable of being put into thoughts that emerges from the negative [of the absence of the mother]'. A certain 'hallucinatory nomadism' becomes 'sedentary' by investing (mental) territory and slowing down the need of immediate discharge (Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1157); also see: Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 230; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 78.
- 1193 Cf. Botella S. 2013b, p. 143; Botella S. 2003b, p. 1173; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 115.
- 1194 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 26. 66f. 151. 199f.; cf. Botella C. 2011a, pp. 121. 125ff.; Botella S. 2005a, p. 728; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 116; Botella and Botella 1995c, p. 1609.
- 1195 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 237; cf. Botella and Botella 1995c, p. 1610.
- 1196 Freud 1914, p. 166.
- 1197 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 237fn.1; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 123.
- 1198 Botella and Botella 1996, p. 123f.
- 1199 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 241, Balestriere 2007, p. 416, referring to Piera Aulagnier's thoughts about early pictograms, argues that the link may be very rudimentary: 'the sensory trace might preserve the mark of a primordial encounter in the raw, i.e. is unfashioned by loss'.
- 1200 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 241; cf. Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 34; Botella and Botella 1990, p. 71; in Botella and Botella 1990, p. 69 the authors refer to previous work by Piera Aulagnier, Nicos Nicolaïdis and Francis Pasche on perception beyond representation.
- 1201 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 242f.; cf. Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1180; Botella, C. 2006, p. 189.
- 1202 Koestler 1954, Position 6294ff.
- 1203 Koestler 1954, Positions 6313ff., quoted and discussed in Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 142f.
- 1204 Music 1995, quoted Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 194; for a fuller discussion see Stroczan 2002; cf. also Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1198.
- 1205 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 196.
- 1206 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 197.
- 1207 Cf. Botella and Botella 1996, p. 109.
- 1208 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 26; cf. Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1469.
- 1209 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 26f.; cf. Botella and Botella 2007, p. 33.
- 1210 Botella S. 2010, suggested the possibility of a 'memory of the id', an idea supported by Green 2012, pp. 1246. 1248.
- 1211 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 28.
- 1212 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 29f.; cf. Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 37f.
- 1213 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 31ff. 29.
- 1214 Cf. Botella C. 2003, p. 36 'Charged with an anti-traumatic vocation, the act of rendering comprehensible, mistaken as it may be, could be the other primordial tendency in psychic life, alongside to and as a complement of the quest for pleasure'. On the vicissitudes of this venture: Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 26f. For possible echoes of Cornelius Castoriadis in this: Urribarri 1999, p. 381fn.9.
- 1215 Cf. Botella and Botella 1992b, pp. 34; 25.31; Botella and Botella 1996, pp. 115f.124; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 76; cf. Botella C. 2015a, p. 203.
- 1216 Botella and Botella 1992b, p. 32; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 116; cf. Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1464f. 1469; Botella C. 2011a, p. 128f. Botella, S. 1997, p. 78 on coherence as an element not reducible to language. Parsons 2005, p. xvii observes: 'One of the hardest things to think clearly about in psychoanalysis,, is the question of experience that will not go into words.'
- 1217 'Le processuel', Botella and Botella 1995c, p. 1609; Botella C 2011a, p. 128f. Levine 2008, p. 641 puts it like this: 'the Botellas describe a second, more elusive layer of the mind, which they describe as always being in a

- potential state, a state of becoming'.
- 1218 See Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 65 for part of the publishing history, p. 81 for influences on their concept. For a discussion of the Botellas's position in the context of other clinical takes on the double see Jung 2012, in particular pp. 96f. 160ff. 366ff. 378. 403. 424. 435f.
- 1219 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 85; cf. Botella and Botella 1996, p. 119.
- 1220 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 86; Botella and Botella 1996, p. 119, Belliard 2012, chapter 6.3, location 3444, puts it succinctly: 'César and Sára Botella believe that without the acquisition of this internal auto-reflexivity, born of auto-erotism the regard carries traits of a persecutory character', on this also see Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 71ff.
- 1221 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 92ff.
- 1222 Freud 1919, p. 248; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 105; Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 73.
- 1223 Botella and Botella pp. 105f. 121.
- 1224 Cf. Botella and Botella 1997a, p. 1143.
- 1225 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 106f. 39; cf. Bokanowski 2012, p. 290.
- 1226 Botella and Botella 2005, p. 131; the passage is in italics in the original [= Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 177].
- 1227 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 77.81.83.86; Botella C. 1991, p. 121f.; Botella, Botella and Haag 1977; p. 985; cf. Gammelgaard and Zeuthen 2010, p. 9.
- 1228 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 107; cf. pp. 33f.; 81ff.
- 1229 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 107; p. 75fn.8; p. 86; cf. Pasche 1988, pp. 27ff.; Bertrand 1997, pp. 66ff.
- 1230 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 107f.; the work of the double, the Botellas emphasise, should not be reduced to identification, be it projective or primary: it is rather linked to primitive perception and to be compared to the endopsychic perception in a dream, Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 82.
- 1231 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 109.
- 1232 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 110ff. Roche 2004, p. 167 comment on the work of the double: it is the instrument to get closer to the semi-intuitive capturing [*captación*] of the most primitive aspects of psychic life, which have not found access to figurability, and which as such, are potentially pathogenic'.
- 1233 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 114f.101.165; cf. p. 43; cf. Botella C. 2015a, p. 212ff. 218; on the almost toxic quality of the strangeness see the observations by Sirois 1992, p. 66f. Levine 2008, p. 647 points to affinities in Antonino Ferro's work. As Hebbrecht 2005, p. 293 points out the analyst is rendered spectator [*toeschouwer van een visioen, een visuele flash*].
- 1234 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 165.
- 1235 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 98.101; cf. Botella and Botella 1995c, p. 1612; Botella S. 2003a, p. 197; Botella C. 2015a, p. 221. An unconscious homosexual complicity, may in analytic work, at times, obscure more disturbing elements in the analytic relationship that have remained unrepresented (Botella and Botella 2001, p. 91f. = Botella and Botella 1984, p. 687; also see Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 66, taken up and commented upon in Gibeault 2010, p. 265; on the 'hook' of homosexuality: Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 93; commented upon by Rose pp. 232ff.)
- 1236 Botella C. [1999] quoted in 'Discusion a la conferencia de Cesar Botella', Salamanca, May 2005, [p. 3].
- 1237 Botella C. 2015a, p. 222.
- 1238 Botella C. 2005a, p. 22; Botella 2003a, p. 198; Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 157f.; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 78, cf. Deloumel 2003, p. 189.
- 1239 Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1466.
- 1240 Cf. Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1469.
- 1241 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 118-122. 164f.; cf. Botella and Botella 2006, p. 715f. 721; not even as part of a traumatic neurosis: Bokanowski 2012, p. 290; Botella C. 2005b: 'It does not reveal a repressed content that is already there, but it gives form; it attempts to name what is a negative of trauma, an experience prior to language which it has never been possible to think about and which, consequently, disorganises psychic life'; on negative trauma without memory and without a compulsion of repetition: Botella, C. 2016, p. 187; for the attempt to understand the pre-psychic Zubiri 2011, p. 134f.
- 1242 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 161f.; Botella and Botella 1995a, p. 81.
- 1243 As Levine 2008, p. 643 reflects, 'Ultimately, what the Botellas are proposing is a complex theory of the mind - and of two minds in intersubjective communion - in which phenomena determined by the two domains, that of the represented and that of the unrepresented, coexist and intersect'.
- 1244 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 119.
- 1245 Also see Botella C. 2015b, p. 78 on conviction on matters that belong to the register of memory without remembrance [*mémoire sans souvenirs*].
- 1246 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 122.
- 1247 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 123; cf. Botella C. 1991, p. 125; Roche 2004, p. 168 observes that this act of 'primordial operational dissociation' – a foundational split of the psyche (p. 169) – works as a negation without a total withdrawal of investment.

- 1248 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 123f.
- 1249 Cf. Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 37.
- 1250 Botella and Botella 2001a, pp. 135-138; cf. p. 142f.; Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1220; Botella and Botella 1999, pp. 121-132, an instance of 'regredience', working on traces of the perceptive, which, according to the picture by Sanchez-Cardenas 2002, p. 58, compares to 'progredience' as impressionism does to figurative painting: 'a grasp for emotion in its raw state, before it is fixed in a circumscribed form'. Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1179 state that the metaphor that comes closest to the working of 'regredience' is to be found in the lines of Goethe's in Faust I (Goethe 1808): 'In truth the subtle web of thought/Is like the weaver's fabric wrought:/ One treadle moves a thousand lines,/ Swift dart the shuttles to and fro,/ Unseen the threads together flow,/ A thousand knots one stroke combines', lines 1599-1604 [quoted according to the English translation by Anna Swanwick. The passage in the German original is quoted Freud 1900, p. 289.
- 1251 Freud 1950 [1895], p. 382; = '*ungebändigte Erinnerung*'.
- 1252 *Niederschlag*: effect, also used as a meteorological term for precipitation; Botella and Botella 2006, pp. 712-720; Sára Botella 2010 speaks of a memory of the id, underlining its lack of content and non-dynamic nature [*sans répétition*], cf. p. 162; on *Niederschlag*, Botella S. 2013a, p. 165; Botella S. 2010, p. 163fn.1; Botella S. 2007, p. 30; Botella S. 2005a, p. 727f.; see also Zilkha 2004, p. 228.
- 1253 Botella and Botella 2006, pp. 727f.; 731; 722ff.; cf. the comment by Donnet 2005, pp. 102ff. taken up in Botella and Botella 2006, p. 729; cf. also Botella C. 2015a, p. 206f.; on Lacan and regression see also: Botella C. 2007, p. 27.
- 1254 Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 112; Botella S. 2002, p. 86; cf. Botella and Botella 2006, 727; Botella C. 1991, p. 124f.
- 1255 Botella and Botella 1992a, p. 28.
- 1256 Botella C. 2015a, p. 212; cf. Habermas 2015, p. 243ff.; but also see Botella C. 2014a, p. 96f.; Botella C, 2005b; Botella C. 2006, p. 187 points out that within a single session processes of different nature can occur, some of them non-represented. In Botella and Botella 2013, p. 101 the authors write, 'In short, the encounter between two psyches in the conditions that are obtained in the analytic setting is at the origin - providing the two partners abandon the representational world of secondary processes - of a very particular mode of psychic functioning that we study under the term *regredience*. It possesses certain qualities specific to the mode of functioning of the night dream, and, like the latter, is more suited than daytime functioning to approaching the memory of the forgotten experiences of early childhood.' Botella C. 2018a, p. 35f. stresses the momentary access to what is important to the session on the whole, 'introducing' - according to a passage from Henri Poincaré 1908, p. 30 Sára and César Botella quote - 'order where the appearance of disorder reigned', Botella and Botella 2013, p. 105.
- 1257 Botella S. 2003b, p. 1178.
- 1258 Cf. Botella and Botella 1996, pp. 112.114; on the importance of what can be perceived both with children and borderline patients Botella C. 2014a, p. 93.
- 1259 Cf. Botella and Botella 1996, p. 113f.; Botella S. 2003b, p. 1179f.; Botella S. 2010, p. 169; 'Rencontre à la librairie Tschann' 2013; on French resistances to the negative: Botella and Botella 2001a, p. 39; French non-Lacanian creative thought and thorough reading of Freud as a defence against Lacan: Botella C. 2007, p. 27.
- 1260 Botella C. 2007, p. 20.
- 1261 He drily adds: 'Sára is of Hungarian origin and in Hungary there are many wolves. It is the same in Spain.' Botella C. 2007, p. 19f.
- 1262 Botella C. 2007, p. 20; on the move from the concept of projective identification to a shared creation emerging from the session with the analyst's role as a transformational object: Baranes 2002, pp. 1839. 1840.
- 1263 Stern 2010.
- 1264 Stern 2015a, p. 86; Stern 2015b, p. 493f.; cf. Habermas 2015, p. 236f., who compares and contrasts this with the Botellas' approach p. 238f. Stern 2013, p. 632 writes, '... in both *IRP* dissociation theory and in the *BFT* [Bionian Field Theory] theory of the transformation of mental contents (i.e., Bion's theory), symbolic experience has yet to be constructed.'
- 1265 Ferro and Civitarese, on their part (2015, p. 92).
- 1266 Botella and Botella 2001b, p. 361; cf. Botella C. 2007, p. 22; on the term of regredience: Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1178f. and, most recently: Botella C. 2015a, pp. 227ff.
- 1267 Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 80; see Green 1974, pp. 102f. 107; also Green 2005, p. 21: '*retour sur soi par le détour de l'autre semblable*.' As Botella and Botella 1997a, p. 1128f. write, 'what counts above all is to understand that these "processes of spontaneous reorganisation" [*processus de remaniement spontanés*] and "meaning newly acquired" [*sens nouvellement acquis*] represent access to a quality of mind [*qualité psychique*], the existence of which does not solely depend on the patient's structure, nor only on the analyst's competence, but on a larger whole, which includes them both. [It is] As vast as the encounter between two minds [*psychismes*], a relational space defined not only in accordance with their structure and their respective

- history, but also in accordance with the present moment at which they meet, each on his/her part, confronted with the vicissitudes of their own life [*aléas de leur vie*], without the articulations of transference-countertransference as a possible explanation for everything [*sans que l'articulation transfertcontre-transfert puisse ici tout expliquer*]. Unforeseeable at the outset, nobody can predict with which analyst or which patient such a processual quality will come to fruition with any certainty.' Botella, C. 2016, p. 193 argues, '*La relation de deux psychismes en régrédience simultanée rendrait accessible ce qui individuellement serait inaccessible.*' [in italics in the original].
- 1268 Cf. Rose 2007b, p. 71; Rose 2007a, p. 10; 'starting a communication in an individual's non-communicating core that has never happened before', Rose 2014, p. 184, in reflection on Winnicott 1963, p. 192 and the Botellas.
- 1269 Milton [1674] Paradise Lost, Book III, lines 52ff. in Bush 1966, p. 258; see Bion 1992, p. 366; Bion 1991[1975-1981], pp. 225. 244. 255. 383; Bion 1965, p. 102fn.1; Bion 2005[1985]), pp. 38. 62. 94. 98; Botella and Botella 2001c, p. 1195fn.5 remind the reader of Freud's use of '*inneres Auge*' [inne eye].
- 1270 Rose 2014, p. 176.
- 1271 Winnicott 1963, p. 192. Compare with this Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1466 'a coherence at work in silent fashion, but with an extraordinary potential, which meets the eye only in case it is ruptured. The most spectacular clinical manifestation of this is the hallucinatory discharge of trauma'.
- 1272 Fohn and Heenen-Wolff 2011, p. 9 and Moore 2009, pp. 1379.
- 1273 Devoto 2006, p. 3.
- 1274 Moore 2009, p. 1390.
- 1275 Priel 2009, pp. 390. 392f.; cf. Parsons 2005, p. xvii; Baranes 2002, p. 1841.
- 1276 On a presence that is favouring regredience see César Botella's participation in the panel discussion reported by Smith 2002, pp. 217. 221.
- 1277 Botella C. 2014a, p. 84.
- 1278 Cf. Botella C. 2014a, p. 85.
- 1279 Cf. Botella 2014a, p. 87f.; Botella C. 2011a, p. 109f.; Botella and Botella 2006, p. 717.
- 1280 Botella C. 2014a, p. 97.
- 1281 Botella C. 2014a, p. 90; Sára Botella (2014a, p. 77) still remembers Marty's powerful attention ('*La puissance de l'investissement de son attention*', italics in the original) that fed into his quasi metabolic work on every detail (p. 78).
- 1282 Botella C. 2014a, p. 99. The analyst enlarges his/her perceptive receptivity to the patient drawing on his/her own identificatory potential in processing the stimuli, in this creating a projective identification of his/her own, which provides a sketch the patient can latch on to find him/herself, Botella C. 2014a, p. 97ff.
- 1283 Botella and Botella 1999, p. 131.
- 1284 Botella and Botella 1999, p. 132.
- 1285 Botella and Botella 1998, p. 1484; also see Botella C. 2002, p. 24 on the tension between the pragmatism of research and the spirit of discovery; Botella and Botella 1995d, p. 79 on theories "*prêt-à-porter*", ready-to-wear.
- 1286 Also see Botella C. 2002 p. 31.
- 1287 Pagès 2015, p. 810.
- 1288 Pagès 2015, p. 811.
- 1289 Pagès 2015, p. 819.
- 1290 Pagès 2015, p. 816.
- 1291 Cf. Pagès, p. 814.
- 1292 Botella C. 2014b, p. 36.
- 1293 Botella S. 2014b, p. 41.
- 1294 Botella 2014b, p. 41f.
- 1295 Goethe 1808, lines 1335f.: '*Ein Teil von jener Kraft, die stets das Böse will und stets das Gute schafft.*' The translation by Anna Swanwick lines 1005ff, renders it as 'Part of that power which still/ Produceth good, whilst scheming ill.'
- 1296 Botella S. 2014a, p. 80.
- 1297 Cf. Botella and Botella 1988, p. 1470.
- 1298 Cf. Priel 2009.
- 1299 Erikson 1950, p. 130f.
- 1300 Gammelgaard 2006, p. 103 connecting lines of Proust's to Winnicott.
- 1301 Botella C. 2001, pp. 182ff.
- 1302 Fernand Braudel once pointedly remarked, 'A structure is a body removed from gravity, removed from the acceleration in history', Braudel 1982, p. 76, and raises a question, which though belonging to a different context, is also germane to the Botellas' reflections: 'Outside the rigid envelope of structures, are there free, unorganized zones of reality?' (p. 72). On a similar vein in Castoriadis' psychoanalytic thinking, see Urribarri

- 1999, pp. 382ff. It remains to be seen what, if any, connections can be made to the newly emerging phenomenon of 'aphantasia', for which a neurological basis is currently under investigation, 'The Eye's Mind' 2015.
- 1303 He has served as a European delegate on the *IPA's* 'Committee on Practice and Scientific Activities' (*CAPSA*) and has a such promoted possibilities for a meeting of minds between different regions, Botella C. 2007, p. 26; Botella C. 2002, p. 29 on the spirit of *mélanges*.
- 1304 Botella C. 2007, p. 25.
- 1305 Barros 2007, pp. 33ff. 'In this sense, we [in Latin America] are practicing cultural cannibalism', p. 34.
- 1306 Barros 2007, p. 44. It may be a coincidence, but probably is not, that a noticeable number of psychoanalysts working on the *opératoire* and related topics have been straddling different cultures and languages: in the Botellas' case Spanish and Hungarian, they grew up with, in addition to the French they are writing in.
- 1307 Botella, C. 2018b, p. 732. Also see Botella, C. 2006, p. 192.
- 1308 Bouchet-Kervella 2001, p. 443; Szewc 2017a, p. 4f.; Szewc 2017b, p. 35; Aisenstein and Smadja 2017; Delourmel 2010, p. 835; cf. Smadja 2004b, p. 25; Smadja 2002a, p. 31; Smadja 1996b, p. 42f.
- 1309 For an overview and assessment of Marty's work: Smadja 2007a, pp. 73-75; Smadja 1998c; Smadja 1996b, pp. 39f. 42; Smadja 1995b; Smadja 1994b; Smadja 1991; on Smadja's approach see Speth-Lepetitcolin 2010, p. 178; Press 2010, pp. 183. 185ff.; Fine 2001, p. 171f.
- 1310 http://www.cairn.info/resume.php?ID_ARTICLE=RFPS_045_0011; https://www.puf.com/collections/Revue_francaise_de_psychosomatique; cf. Press 1998d, p. 7, who emphasises Smadja's ability to put Freud's and Marty's legacies into a productive dialectical relationship without sacrificing either.
- 1311 Green 2001 as used in his title; Smadja followed his congress paper up in Smadja 2001a; for a review in English see: Fine 2002.
- 1312 Also see Szewc 2017b, pp. 7ff. 13.
- 1313 Cf. Smadja 2016c, p. 13; Smadja 2001a, p. 33; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1390. 1395.
- 1314 Smadja 2001a, p. 31f.; Smadja 2008a, pp. 130ff.; Smadja 2002c, p. 15.
- 1315 Smadja 2008a, p. 136.
- 1316 Smadja 2008a, p. 130f.
- 1317 Smadja 2008a, p. 135f.
- 1318 Smadja 2008a, p. 139.
- 1319 In contrast to Freud and Ferenczi, who put more emphasis on individual structure; Smadja 2008a, pp. 146. 157. 158f.; cf. p. 149 and Smadja 2002c, p. 17; Smadja 2001a, pp. 32. 34; for early American echoes of this see Hale 1995, p. 180; Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 624 on Valabrega.
- 1320 Smadja 2008a, p. 161: 'The organism becomes one vast keyboard, which the psychic system [*le psychisme*] can use at will to express ideas and affects every time that an external or internal obstacle obstructs direct or behavioural expression.'; cf. Edwards 2013, p. 728 and on more recent developments on somatoform symptoms as a culturally coded expression of distress: Geyen 2013, p. 726.
- 1321 Cf. Smadja 2009, p. 9; Smadja 2001a, p. 125; Smadja 1998a, p. 1373.
- 1322 Smadja 2008a, pp. 170ff. 174f.; cf. Lipsitt 2000, p. 157f.; Hale 1995, pp. 180ff.
- 1323 Smadja 2008a, pp. 163f.181; Smadja 2001a, p. 32; cf. Kamieniecki 1994, p. 47; in the succinct words of an exhibition organised by the [US] National Institutes of Health 2000/2011: 'According to Alexander, Groddeck and others had erased a boundary that needed to be carefully redrawn. They had interpreted everything too psychologically and had ignored the automatic physiological mechanisms that substantially controlled the expression of emotion as the body responded to stressful stimuli'.
- 1324 Cf. Smadja 2010b, p. 150; Smadja 2008a, pp. 166. 168f. 170. 178. 196f.; Smadja 2003b, p. 15; Smadja 2001a, p. 129; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1375f. 1377f. 1384. 1388. 1391. 1393.
- 1325 Smadja 2008a, pp. 181ff. 185f. 191f.; Hale 1995, p. 181
- 1326 Cf. Smadja 2008a, pp. 180. 192; Smadja 1998a, p. 1389f.
- 1327 Smadja 2001a, pp. 126f. 147; Lipsitt 2000, p. 158; Hale 1995, p. 180.
- 1328 Smadja 2008a, p. 176f.; cf. p. 188.
- 1329 Cf. Smadja 2008a, p. 192f. in apparent modification of Smadja 1998a, p. 1389f.; also see Hale 1995, p. 181.
- 1330 On the influence of Alexander's work on him: Fain 1990b, p. 626.
- 1331 Smadja 2002c, p. 18f.; Aisenstein and Smadja 2010a, p. 343.
- 1332 Aisenstein and Smadja 2010a, p. 345; Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 625; Smadja 2009, p. 9; Smadja 2002c, p. 20; Marty 1952.
- 1333 Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 625; Smadja 2001a, p. 149f. and Smadja 1998a, p. 1391, mentions, in particular, the contribution of René Held, also see Cahn 1992, p. 632 and Paul Denis on René Held in Braconnier 2007, p. 49; the passage Smadja quotes, without providing a reference, can be found in Held 1968/1960, p. 457.

- 1334 Smadja 2001a, pp. 133. 150f. 154. 156. 159.; Smadja 2008a, p. 205; Smadja 2006c, p. 117; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1378f. 1391. 1394f. 1397.
- 1335 Smadja 2001a, p. 149; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1390. 1411.
- 1336 Smadja 2001a, p. 154; cf, Smadja 1998a, pp. 1392. 1407; Szajnberg 2010, p. 1523.
- 1337 Smadja 2001a, p. 151; cf. Smadja 2008a, p. 206; Smadja 1998a, p. 1392.
- 1338 Cf. Smadja 1998a, p. 1381.
- 1339 For an illustration of this see Smadja 1994a, p. 1063; Aisenstein 2006, p. 668f. describes the situation as follows: ‘Pierre Marty and his team came to the view that ill patients whom they were treating in their role as doctors, surgeons, gastroenterologists, etc. should also be considered from a psychoanalytical perspective. They had been struck by an absence of a demand and of anxiety in these patients, and had noticed that most of those who were hospitalised seemed ‘sensible, rational ... unemotional’ - as if their affective lives were either frozen or repressed’.
- 1340 Smadja 2008a, pp. 202ff.
- 1341 Cf. Smadja 2001a, p. 162f.; Smadja 1998a, p. 1395. Psychoanalysts investigating in psychosomatics felt they were on to something new - as Smadja in 2001a, p. 152 and 1998a, p. 1393 points out, the word is in *‘L’investigation psychosomatique’*, for the first time, used independently as a noun. In contradistinction to Alexander’s approach, there was no claim of specific links between a given disease and a certain type of personality: Smadja 2003b, p. 16. Also see de M’Uzan 2008b, p. 27f.
- 1342 Cf. Smadja 2006b, p. 645f.; also see Szwec 2017b, pp. 18ff. 27. 37. Although Green for a time followed Lacan’s teaching, whose echoes in consent and dissent, as Aisenstein 2010a, p. 464 points out, are pervasive in French psychoanalysis, there is also the long term effect of Bouvet’s object relations approach on both Green and Marty. For Green, see Green 1994, pp. 69. 72-75; fns. 1-6 on pp. 195-197. For Marty, see Marty’s recollections in Marty and Nicolaïdis 1996, p. 62f. Claude Smadja, in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 7 recalls Green’s reflection that Marty and he had a difficult relationship because they both applied Bouvet’s thought to new zones of interest: Marty to psychosomatics and he himself to borderline states. Marty himself, as Aisenstein 2006, p. 677 says, remained ‘within the terms of the First Topography’; cf. Fine 2001, p. 172; Smadja 2011b, p. 225 speaks of ‘different theoretical sensibilities’. On the divergence between the *EPP/IPSO* and Lacanism: Aisenstein 2010a, p. 466.
- 1343 *‘Une maladie du Moi, 2e topique’*, Smadja 1998a, pp. 1367. 1440 and *passim*; Smadja 1998b, p. 1443; cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 107. 111. 118; Smadja 2006b, p. 633; in Smadja 2000a, p. 88 we can see how this adds to Marty’s thinking in practice: whereas Marty considered a person’s mentalisation as good if it showed traits of fluidity, disponibility and permanence, Smadja thinks it has only a functional and protective value, if it follows the pleasure-displeasure principle and is not subjugated to imperatives beyond the pleasure principle; in Smadja 2016b, p. 1522 the author emphasises that the Second Topography places perceptions from the external world at the core of the Me, which also draws on perceptions stemming from the body.
- 1344 Also see the survey conducted by the two authors among general practitioners for views held on psychosomatics by a larger professional public: Smadja and Szwec 1993. A comment on widespread simplifications is also offered by Ulnik 2000 in his concluding remarks.
- 1345 Smadja 2001a, p. 173.
- 1346 Smadja 2001a, p. 174; Smadja 1998a, p. 1409.
- 1347 *‘Le sujet se met en repos, en convalescence d’être’*, Smadja 2001a, p. 175; cf. p. 244; Smadja 1998a, p. 1409.
- 1348 Smadja 2001a, p. 175; Smadja 1998a, p. 1409.
- 1349 Smadja 2001a, p. 175f; Smadja 1998a, p. 1409f.
- 1350 Smadja 2001a, p. 176f.; Smadja 1998a, p. 1410; also see Wilson 2012, p. 525.
- 1351 Smadja 2001a, p. 177; Smadja 1998a, p. 1410f.; Smadja 2006a, p. 67 speaks of a *portrait-robot*, an identikit likeness.
- 1352 Smadja 2001a, p. 177; Smadja 1998a, p. 1411; Marty, de M’Uzan and David, C. 2003/1963, p. 180.
- 1353 Smadja 2001a, p. 197; Smadja 1998a, p. 1425; Freud 1917[1915], p. 440: *‘An diese Erörterungen schließt die Frage an, ob nicht Ichverlust ohne Rücksicht auf das Objekt (rein narzißtische Ichkränkung) hinreicht, das Bild der Melancholie zu erzeugen, und ob direkt toxische Verarmung an Ichlibido gewisse Formen der Affektion ergeben kann’*. In Strachey’s translation: ‘These considerations bring up the question whether a loss in the ego irrespectively of the object - a purely narcissistic blow to the ego - may not suffice to produce the picture of melancholia and whether an impoverishment of ego-libido directly due to toxins may not be able to produce certain forms of the disease’.
- 1354 Smadja 2001a, pp. 51ff.; Smadja 2001b, p. 13; the main outlines of which have been delineated in Chapter Four.
- 1355 Smadja 2001a, pp. 56. 71f. 76f. 80. 85; Smadja 2001a, p. 65 in reference to Michel Fain’s position: Fain 1990b, p. 630; Kreisler, Fain and Soulé 1974, p. 535; cf. Fain in Duparc 1999, p. 166; in negation of the default situation envisaged by Freud: Smadja 2001a, p. 92. Szwec 2000b, p. 28 emphasises that a level of symbolisation previously in existence, can get lost in an ‘essential depression’, according to Marty and links

- this, p. 32, to early childhood trauma reactualised by current events.
- 1356 Smadja 2001a, pp. 56. 67f.; cf. p. 46; Smadja 2001b, p. 12; also see Smadja in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 25f.
- 1357 They seem to be involved in a case Smadja himself presents in a vignette, ‘*en creux*’, by virtue of the hollows they leave. Smadja 2001a, pp. 186. 208; cf. 55f.; Smadja 2008c, p. 77f.; Smadja 1998a, p. 1417f. 1433; see the contribution of Lebovici 1998, pp. 1470. 1475. Smadja 1999a, p. 35f., building on Fain and Braunschweig affirms that the lack in expressivity is due to a lack in hysteria.
- 1358 Smadja 2001a, p. 71f.
- 1359 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 70. 171; Smadja 1998a, p. 1406.
- 1360 Smadja 2001a, pp. 206f. 214; Smadja 1998a, p. 1432f.
- 1361 Smadja 2001a, pp. 52. 193; Smadja 1998a, p. 1422f.; Smadja in Botella, Botella and Smadja 1998b, p. 58.
- 1362 Smadja 2001a, p. 217; Smadja 1998a, p. 1440.
- 1363 Cf. Smadja 2001a, p. 213; cf. p. 69; Smadja 1998a, p. 1437; Smadja 2014b, p. 19 speaks of ‘*autoportage*’, an attempt to carry oneself on one own’s back as it were; for extreme cases in which the object seems to be dispensed with altogether, see the remarks of de M’Uzan 2011, p. 86; Aisenstein and Smadja 2001, p. 349f. speak of the hyper-investment of the factual as an anti-traumatic countermeasure.
- 1364 Smadja 2001a, p. 115; Smadja 1998b, p. 1449.
- 1365 Cf. Smadja 2004a, p. 1249; Smadja 2001a, pp. 179. 185. 188. 213; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1412. 1419. 1437; cf. Smadja 2004b, p. 34; on the importance of established recipes: Smadja 2001a, p. 216; Smadja 1998b, p. 1449; as Jacques Press keeps reminding us, see Chapter 14, the perspective from which we encounter this is part of the picture. This can be quite multi-layered, as Judd 1981, p. 85, the fictionalised, at that time quasi-contemporary, experience of a British soldier in Northern Ireland, shows: ‘The Loyalist areas were more reassuring because of their insistence upon identification with the rest of Britain, but it was a fierce and un-British insistence, which made it difficult to ignore the differences’.
- 1366 Smadja 2001a, p. 187; Smadja 1998a, p. 1418.
- 1367 Smadja 2001a, pp. 188. 212; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1418f. 1436.
- 1368 Freud 1921; in German *Massenpsychologie*, which refers to larger masses of people rather than to groups.
- 1369 Smadja 2001a, pp. 188ff.; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1419ff.
- 1370 Freud 1914, p. 169; Smadja 2001a, p. 191; Smadja 1998a, p. 1421.
- 1371 Freud 1921, p. 104; Smadja 2001a, p. 190; Smadja 1998a, p. 1420. Keegan 2014/1991, pp. 153f. 168f. in his lines on the Battle of Waterloo, reflects upon the disintegration that follows the perception that the Imperial Guard has stopped its advance. ‘The Revolution had made itself manifest by the Parisian crowd’s defeat or subversion of the royal army in July, 1789; the metamorphosis of the Guard into a crowd, its spirit crushed, its solidarity broken, its militancy extinct, its only motive self-preservation, its only purpose flight, marked, as effectively as anything else we can point to, the restitution of power to its former owners.’ For some people Smadja thinks of, it seems, *opératoire* behaviour is a line of defence that stands between them and the possibility of total rout.
- 1372 Smadja 2001a, p. 193; Smadja 1998a, p. 1422f.; Smadja 2001a, p. 115; Smadja 1998b, p. 1448; Smadja 2001a, p. 192.
- 1373 Cf. Aisenstein 2010a, p. 466 on the importance of identification as a concept in the *EPP/IPSO*.
- 1374 Smadja 2001a, pp. 85ff.
- 1375 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 87. 189. 190; Smadja 1998a, p. 1420.
- 1376 Smadja 2001a, p. 198f.; Smadja 1998a, p. 1426f.; also see Smadja 2013a, pp. 10ff.
- 1377 Smadja 2001a, p. 199; cf p. 214; Smadja 1998a, p. 1427; cf. p. 1438.
- 1378 Smadja 2009, p. 25; Smadja 2001a, pp. 200. 202. 214; Smadja 2001b, p. 14; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1428f. 1438; for a very useful outline of the nuances within the French discussion on the differences between *Surmoi* and *Moi Idéal* see Diatkine 2000, pp. 1571ff.; also see Smadja 2008b, p. 358f.; Smadja 2014b, p. 16f. returns to body-superego relations in the way a particular illness is experienced by the patient, also see Smadja 2016b, p. 1524.
- 1379 Smadja 2001a, p. 200; Smadja 1998a, p. 1428. Conforming to the ideals of a social group shores up a self-esteem that would be difficult to maintain without it, Smadja 2001a, pp. 189. 216; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1420. 1439.
- 1380 Smadja 2014b, p. 19.
- 1381 Smadja 2001b, p. 15; sometimes there is a dependence on particular conditions in the patient’s personal environment that safeguard continued functioning, as Rueff-Escoubès 2009, p. 6 reminds us, cf. Smadja 2011b, p. 228; Smadja 2009, p. 17.
- 1382 Smadja 2001a, p. 87.
- 1383 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 89. 184. 199; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1416. 1427. See also Smadja 2001a, pp. 104. 186. 216, Smadja 1998a, pp. 1418, 1439: it is sign of relative progress that the patient can think of the analyst as a persecutor; cf. Smadja 2013a, p. 23; when the body falls sick, pressure is taken off the mind and vice versa:

- Smadja 2011c, pp. 148ff.
- 1384 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 89. 97; Smadja 2014b, p. 29: somatisation, like delirium an attempt at self-healing; see also Smadja 2013a, p. 22.
- 1385 Freud 1916-17 [1915-17], p. 404.
- 1386 Smadja 2001a, pp. 107. 145; cf. Smadja 1998a, p. 1367. 1388. 1402; Wilson 2012, p. 509f.; see also Aisenstein and Smadja 2001, p. 348; Smadja 1990, p. 794.
- 1387 Smadja 2001a, p. 164; cf. p. 153; Smadja 1998a, p. 1401; cf. p. 1393; bringing a new balance of forces to the realms of excitement, of drive, and of repetition Papageorgiou 2009, p. 184, basing herself on Smadja 2008a.
- 1388 Smadja 2001a, pp. 101. 251; cf. Smadja 2007a, p. 78.
- 1389 Smadja 1990, p. 788; cf. Smadja 2010a, p. 12: 'Mentalisation is defined as a continuous process of drive transformation resulting in different figures of psychic expressivity'; Smadja 2011c, p. 159: 'For Fain and Marty, the fantasy cannot accomplish its function of protecting the subject against somatic disorganisation, if it is not in charge of all the heritage of body and soma of which it is both the custodian and the smuggler'.
- 1390 Cf. Smadja 2001a, p. 64; cf. pp. 168. 236.
- 1391 Smadja 2001a, pp. 101. 170f. 211. 216.; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1406. 1436. 1439; cf. Smadja 1990, p. 790.
- 1392 Smadja 2009, p. 19f.; cf. Aisenstein 2014, p. 34.
- 1393 Cf. Smadja 2001a, p. 113; Fine 2001, p. 185.
- 1394 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 215f. 250, Smadja 1998a, p. 1438f.: in the grip of a process of '*dénarcissisation*', in which it is being bled white of its narcissistic resources; see also Smadja 2001a, p. 238, Smadja 2006a, p. 69.
- 1395 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 67. 116f. 203f. 207. 217. 244. 250; Smadja 1998a, pp. 1430. 1433. 1440; Smadja 2004b, p. 27; Smadja 1997b, p. 104.
- 1396 Smadja 2001a, p. 192f., cf. pp. 161. 177; Smadja 1998a, p. 1422; cf. pp. 1399. 1411.
- 1397 Smadja 2006a, p. 76f.; cf. Smadja 2012b, p. 25; Smadja 2011a, p. 81; not every state of mental disorganisation leads to a state *opératoire*; Smadja 2003b, p. 23; Smadja 2012d, p. 174 identical with Smadja 2004b, p. 26, acknowledges the divergence with Marty, for whom the *opératoire* is a defect and not a defence; on this, also see Aisenstein in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 11; Fine 2001, p. 179f.; Porte 1998, p. 1519.
- 1398 Cf. Smadja 2001a, p. 228; Smadja 2006b, p. 643f.; also see Smadja 2004c, p. 21; in Smadja 2011a, pp. 80ff. the author, in agreement with Michel de M'Uzan, sees links between a *opératoire* behaviour and an insufficiently seductive mother but points out the additional importance of early trauma; cf. also Smadja 2012b, p. 25; Smadja 2009, p. 14; Smadja 2001b, p. 12; this view takes up contributions by Ferenczi: Smadja 2009, p. 21f.; Smadja 2006b, pp. 635ff.; Smadja 2004a, p. 1251f.; see also Smadja 2005b, p. 175; de M'Uzan 2011, p. 85 shows possible nuances in the understanding of the messages *not* transmitted by the mother. 'Ice Queen', it has to be said, is not a word found in either Smadja or Fain but goes some way towards addressing the substance of the argument Fain makes.
- 1399 For the 'killall' signal to terminate processes, see for instance, Powers 2003, p. 476. I am using the analogy to illustrate that it makes a difference whether one works within a process or whether one wants to get rid of it altogether because one cannot interface with it.
- 1400 Smadja 2001a, p. 224; cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 25; Smadja 1994a, p. 1074.
- 1401 Cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 28: resorting to the *pulsion de mort* to extinguish excitement: winding down as much as possible, if there is not any object connection that does not hurt; also see Smadja 2006b, p. 648; Smadja 2001c, p. 179; Aisenstein and Smadja 2001, p. 346 see the *pulsion de mort* as something that within mental life pushes towards psychic death, killing off thought in its course; on a 'clinic of silence': Smadja 2012d, pp. 176ff.; Smadja 2005b, p. 178f.; Smadja 2004b, pp. 28f. 33; cf. Smadja 2012b, p. 29; Smadja 2010b, p. 156: silence as 'the failure to represent oneself psychically'.
- 1402 Smadja 1997b, p. 101; cf. Smadja 2004a, p. 1246.
- 1403 Fine 2001, p. 186.
- 1404 Smadja 1995a, Smadja 1993a, both reprinted in Smadja 2001a; Smadja 1994, p. 1070; cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 27f.
- 1405 Smadja 2001a, p. 223.
- 1406 Smadja 2001a, pp. 225. 233f.; Smadja 2001b, p. 15; Smadja 2005b, p. 176f.; Smadja 2004b, p. 26.
- 1407 Smadja 2001a, p. 265f. cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 23f.
- 1408 Smadja 2001a, p. 239.
- 1409 Smadja 2001a, p. 245; cf. pp. 248. 254; cf. Smadja 2014b, pp. 24. 27f.; Smadja 2004c, p. 20f.; Smadja in Botella, Botella and Smadja 1998a, p. 39; a reminder of the infernal couple of a baby unable to regress in the presence of a mother fighting excitement: cf. Kaswin-Bonnefond 2004b, p. 1335. On the role of masochism Smadja 2000b, pp. 79-82.
- 1410 Smadja 2006a, p. 77.
- 1411 Smadja 2006a, p. 78; cf. Smadja 2012b, p. 26.
- 1412 Smadja 2012b, p. 26f.; Smadja 2006a, p. 78; cf. Roussillon 2006, p. 61f.

- 1413 Smadja 2006a, p. 78; Roussillon 2006, p. 62, also see Roussillon 2005, p. 129f. and, more recently, Roussillon 2008a, pp. 93. 97. 101. 128.
- 1414 Cf. Smadja 2012b, p. 26f.
- 1415 Smadja 2006a, p. 78f.; cf. Smadja 2012b, pp. 26f. 28. 32; Smadja 2012d, p. 178; Smadja 2010b, p. 158f.; Smadja 2005a, p. 75; Smadja 2005b, p. 175; Smadja 2004b, p. 29f.; Smadja 2012b, p. 23: the contribution of Ferenczi on understanding deformations of the Me; and of Winnicott: Smadja 2012a, p. 235; Smadja 2011d, p. 52; also see Rueff-Escoubès 2001, p. 173 on the crucial importance of being able to say 'no'. As for attempts at self-healing, Sylvia Zwettler-Otte, in paying close attention to French psychoanalytic thinking, has shown a repeated interest in how individuals try to find ways to come up with more beneficial equilibria making use of 'means on board', as it were; see, e.g. Zwettler-Otte 2011, p. 103.
- 1416 Smadja 2015c, p. 146f.; Smadja 2012b, p. 32; cf. Aisenstein 2006, p. 678; Smadja 2011a, p. 82 emphasises the early dangers for the patient's subjectivity and identity, who feels threatened by imminent catastrophe if he/she were to venture into more subjective modes; under such conditions the statement 'I do not feel anything' may be the result of a negative hallucination editing what is present out of the picture: Smadja 2012d, p. 179; Smadja 2005b, p. 176; Smadja 2004b, p. 31f.
- 1417 Smadja 2015c, p. 147; see Smadja 2011a, p. 79 on de M'Uzan's suggestions of the necessity of constant negotiations between the *vital-identital* and the *sexual*.
- 1418 Cf. Aisenstein and Smadja 2001, p. 352.
- 1419 Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 638; cf. Smadja 2015e, pp. 69ff.; also see Smadja 2017, p. 49, albeit without reference to Ameisen: 'We can thus establish a metapsychological relationship between a psychic process of disentanglement of the *pulsion* [*désintrication pulsionnelle*] and the change in a somatic function.' and Smadja 2012e, p. 5: 'At the higher level of psychic order, mental disorganisation results from a *bilan pulsionnel* [a balance within the disposition of the *pulsions*] in favour of destructivity.'
- 1420 Ameisen 2007, p. 20f.
- 1421 Ameisen 2007, p. 22; cf. Ameisen 2003/1999, p. 93.
- 1422 Smadja 2004c, p. 18. There is some indication that psychoanalysis developed not only at congresses and official meetings but one dinner at a time. For the pre-war period Kurzweil 1989, p. 58, based on Roudinesco 1982, p. 354; also see de Mijolla 2012b, p. 39 about meetings held around a good meal. Anne Berman writes to Marie Bonaparte on January 4th, 1955: 'These gentlemen of the Psychoanalytic Society of Paris, finding that they cannot sufficiently hold forth on things [*dissserter*] during the meetings of the society, organise a dinner at Prunier on the 7th.'
- 1423 Smadja 2001a, pp. 251. 256f. 265; cf. Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 626.
- 1424 Cf. Smadja 2002a, p. 36; Smadja 2001b, p. 14.
- 1425 Cf. Smadja 2001a, pp. 257. 263f.; cf. Marty's terse formulation '*l'inconscient reçoit mais n'émet pas*' often repeated and reaffirmed in late strata of his work, e.g. Marty 1990a, p. 30; Aisenstein 2010b, p. 228 observes that Freud never presented an explicit theory of unconscious perception.
- 1426 Smadja 2002a, p. 36; cf. Smadja 2004a, p. 1246.
- 1427 Compare, for instance Smadja's example of having dinner with friends with André Green's personal recollections of the years in Paris after his arrival from Cairo, Green 1994, p. 28: 'Apart from the material conditions, what was the toughest was the feeling of being culturally and emotionally isolated [*le plus dur était le sentiment d'isolement culturel et affectif*]; I had left my family and I did not have family in France. European habits were very different from Mediterranean customs. In Egypt I did not only have one family, I had several. That of my friends was a bit also my own: I came and went like a son of the house. I had to wait several years before making it into a Paris interior, before being received in the house of friends, considered like a member of the family. I believe that despite the extraordinary pleasure which I felt about being able to participate in the cultural life of Paris, which, above all, left a mark on me, there was also an uprootedness.'
- 1428 In the 1972 Italian film *San Michele aveva un gallo*, by the Taviani brothers, an Italian anarchist is held in solitary confinement. Whenever he is dished up one of the abominable prison meals, his mind imagines it as opulent haute cuisine worthy of a revolutionary of his standing in world history. Then Marxists arrive at his prison with whom, during one of the prison breaks, he has a conversation in which they let him know that he belongs on the dung heap of history. His understanding of the role he felt privileged to fulfil exploded, his imagination gone, he withers and dies.
- 1429 Cf. Smadja 2007b, p. 31: there is illness before illness; Smadja 1997b, p. 101.
- 1430 Cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 22: 'the erotic disinvestment of the Me is one of the conditions fundamental [*conditions primordiales*] to the development of a somatisation' and Smadja 2014b, p. 27: 'the work of somatisation always starts with a situation of conflict that, more or less, creates a narcissistic wound, which then, most often, re-activates an ancient woe'; also see Smadja 2013a, p. 8f.; Smadja 2006c, p. 117.
- 1431 Smadja 2001a, p. 167; Smadja 1998a, p. 1404; Smadja 1993a; Szwec 1993c.
- 1432 Szwec 1998b, pp. 1505. 1508f.; taken up by de M'Uzan 1998, p. 1461; a similar point is raised by Speth-Lepetitcolin 2010, p. 182 and by Fine 2001, p. 182; conceded as important by Smadja, who, however, insists

- on the likelihood of narcissistic disbalances preceding an illness, Smadja 2004a, pp. 1240. 1245. 1252; if illness comes, it may, at any rate re-activate earlier traumatic traces: Smadja 1994a, p. 1059; there is a zone of opacity constituting the necessary limits of any psychosomatic approach: Smadja 2003b, p. 13.
- 1433 Roussillon 1998, p. 1812: '*un manque à être*'.
- 1434 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1477f.; cf. Smadja 2006a, p. 67.
- 1435 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1478.
- 1436 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1478.
- 1437 As Smadja 1994a, p. 1060 well illustrates that the psychoanalyst may be regarded by the patient as a technician who knows how to handle matters of the soul.
- 1438 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1479f.
- 1439 Aisenstein 2006, p. 669: 'When regression is impossible, it is replaced by disorganisation' has to be understood in the context of what has been said elsewhere, e.g. Aisenstein 1996, p. 15.
- 1440 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1480f.; cf. Smadja 2014b, p. 17f. on 'falling sick' as an experience pertaining to oneself but somehow extraneous to oneself; also see Smadja 2006c, p. 117.
- 1441 Smadja 2014a, p. 1503; cf. Smadja 1996b, p. 44f.
- 1442 A round opening admitting air and light at the top of a building, cf. Sanjania 2010, the quote is from Mauger 2014, p. 1501; the image in the quoted passage is taken from Scarfone 2014, p. 1358f.
- 1443 Smadja 2014a, p. 1504 in reference to Balsamo 2014, p. 1495.
- 1444 Smadja 2014a, p. 1504.
- 1445 Smadja 2014a, p. 1505.
- 1446 Smadja 2011c, p. 150.
- 1447 Smadja 2014a, p. 1505f.; cf. Smadja 2011b, p. 229; Smadja 2006c, p. 119; Smadja 2005a, p. 74; cf. p. 76; Aisenstein and Smadja 2010b, p. 630 and Smadja 2001b, p. 17: cultivating a psychoanalytically informed 'art of conversation' that encourages, and even seduces, the patient to take an interest in his own subjective life, also see Smadja 2009, p. 24; Smadja 2001c, p. 182 and Aisenstein 2006, p. 670; Smadja 2012c, p. 51 speaks of a *microbouleversement*, a microdisruption or mini-upset needed to help along the process.
- 1448 Cf. Smadja 1994a, p. 1066f.
- 1449 Smadja 2012c, p. 44f.; on the shock in more detail: Smadja 2001c, p. 175.
- 1450 Cf. Smadja 2012c, p. 46; Smadja 2012b, p. 31.
- 1451 Smadja 2014a, p. 1506; in its French psychoanalytic usage the *actuel* in this context is close to the lines in Macbeth Act 5, Scene 5, lines 26-28: 'it is a tale/ Told by an idiot, full of sound and fury,/ Signifying nothing'.
- 1452 Smadja 2005a, pp. 72ff.; cf. Smadja 2011b, p. 229; Smadja 2002b, p. 364f.; also: Smadja 2003a, p. 35f.; Smadja 1994a, p. 1067.
- 1453 Smadja 2006b, p. 640f.; on p. 640 he defines economy as 'the whole [*l'ensemble*] of the processes of transformation, including those of deconstruction, within [*au sein*] mental functioning'
- 1454 Smadja 2006b, pp. 641ff. 647.
- 1455 Smadja 2002a, p. 37.
- 1456 Smadja 2001b, p. 16.
- 1457 Cf. Smadja 2012c, p. 48.
- 1458 Smadja 2012c, pp. 48. 51; Smadja 2013b, p. 170f.
- 1459 Smadja 2001c, p. 180.
- 1460 Smadja 2001c, p. 181; an example to the contrary: Smadja 2012a, p. 237f.
- 1461 Smadja 1994a, p. 1076; as Aisenstein 2008, p. 121 points out, a subjective meaning of the illness may appear in retrospect without having been there, as root cause, to begin with; Fine 2001, p. 178 observes that turning the somatic disease into a mental object could open up new hopes and mobilise energies and a desire to live.
- 1462 Ody and Smadja 2004; also see Smadja 2012c, p. 47 and Smadja 2002a, p. 35 for the father's role in particular patient vignettes.
- 1463 Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2609.
- 1464 Ody and Smadja 2004, pp. 2606. 2610; cf. Smadja 2009, p. 12f.
- 1465 Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2610f.
- 1466 Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2611f. Unconscious identifications, as Alain de Mijolla has shown, may lead to extraordinarily uncanny inter-generational repetitions and constraints, Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2614; Alain de Mijolla's contribution is accessible in de Mijolla 1981/2003; for an outline see: Lassmann 2013, pp. 88-91.
- 1467 Smadja in Botella, Botella, Nicolaidis and Smadja 1998, p. 95.
- 1468 Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2615.
- 1469 Ody and Smadja 2004, p. 2616.
- 1470 Cf. Ody and Smadja 2004, pp. 2615. 2605.
- 1471 Rueff-Escoubès 1995, pp. 196ff. 206; cf. Rueff-Escoubès 2004, p. 39; on fatigue as a loss of a sense of auto-determination and the *opérateur*: Rueff-Escoubès 2003, pp. 161f. 165.
- 1472 Ribas 2014, pp. 1532ff.

- 1473 Ribas 2014, p. 1534, in reflection on a passage in Ameisen 2007, p. 17.
- 1474 Gottlieb 2010a, p. 369.
- 1475 Aisenstein 1998, p. 18f.; there is an interesting counterpoint to this passage in Smadja 2004c, p. 18: 'Each of you knows among his/her acquaintances [*dans son entourage*] curious individuals who work like slaves without ever feeling fatigued. On looking closer, you will find that they are invested in an activity suffused with sublimatory pleasure'. In this instance the observer moves in an environment he/she is familiar with and thus finds it easy to get a take on what is happening.
- 1476 Aisenstein 1998, p. 19; also see Aisenstein in Aisenstein and Smadja 2017, p. 7.
- 1477 Smadja 1985, pp. 93. 98. 99.
- 1478 Smadja 1985, p. 101. This is a different angle from the one expressed in Smadja 2016a, p. 91: 'Now, as we know, the work of the preconscious is based upon *des sources pulsionnelles*.'
- 1479 Although Smadja does not refer to this, many of these concerns are illustrated in a short piece written by Robert Musil in 1913: A local lord, scion of a noble family dominant in the area for many generations, had fought the feudal might of the bishop as had his father, his grandfather, and his great-grandfather, before him with both wile and force - and had finally won after many years of war against considerable odds. The fight which had been with him for so long was now over. Nothing great remained to be done. Then, on the way home, he was bitten by an insect and fell into a fever, which did not leave him. He returned to his beautiful wife a sick man. Hovering between life and death he perceived a cat that was as sick as he felt. As he watched, an idea took hold of him which yet seemed meaningless to him. He wanted to climb the steep rock face on which his castle stood, something that seemed impossible to a sane mind. Having ventured out in an almost mindless state, he came to himself one third up, pinned against the sheer cliff, with no chance safely to retreat down and precious little chance to make it up to the top. As he struggled onwards, wrestling with imminent death, he sensed his lost strength flow back into him. He reached the castle walls, climbed them, made it into his chamber, and back to his wife, a cured man, after a transitory spell of a behavioural detour from his usual self. Compare to this Smadja 2017, p. 65: 'The work of somatisation includes two stages: one first stage, which bears the hallmark of destructivity, bearing witness to a work of the negative, and a second stage, bearing the hallmark of the erotic, which represents a time of healing. When the complete cycle of somatisation has been accomplished, one can say, paradoxically, that the somatic illness represents an attempt of healing for the mental woes [*la maladie psychique*].'; cf. Smadja 2015d, p. 11.
- 1480 Guillaumin 1998, p. 1479. 1482 suggests a more general category of *opérativité* akin to the *opératoire* but not necessarily as severe; somewhat similarly Porte 1998, p. 1524f., with reference to Smadja 1998b, p. 1447, but proposing different defence mechanisms behind the facade of the *opératoire*.
- 1481 Marty 2010[1952], p. 355.
- 1482 Bion 1978[1976], p. 317.
- 1483 For graphic reminiscences on the stark post-war situation in hospitals see, for instance, Lebovici 2003, p. 1133; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 140; on the appearance of neuroleptics in France: Pichot 1996, pp. 205ff.; cf. p. 209.
- 1484 Henckes 2009a, p. 87; for an early example of the approach see Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 195; Harrison 2000; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 107. Among the early admirers of what had been happening in the UK was Lacan, who drew attention to what was happening in *L'Évolution Psychiatrique*, Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 249-252; de Mijolla 1982, p. 41.
- 1485 Cf. Fantel 1945; for the psychoanalytic version see: Amar 2002, p. 1380; Hayat 2008, pp. 26. 34; Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 198f.
- 1486 Torrente 2004, p. 4; Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 176; for the state of affairs under the Occupation: von Buelzingsloewen 2008, p. 52f.
- 1487 Gourevitch 2012, p. 178; Quétel 2012a, p. 184; Torrente 2004, p. 4f.; Billiard 2001a, p. 107; Quétel 2012b, pp. 327ff.
- 1488 Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 177f.
- 1489 Torrente 2004, pp. 5. 7; Billiard 2001a, p. 107, see also fn.17; Torrente 2004, pp. 8. 66. 70. Since the ward depended for its maintenance on the manual labour of its patients, chronicity in their mental states was not a problem the administration had reason to be particularly worried about: Billiard 2001a, p. 100; cf. von Buelzingsloewen 2007, p. 415.
- 1490 Billiard 2001a, p. 99fn.1; Trillat 2012, p. 351; cf. von Buelzingsloewen 2010, p. 18; Billiard 2001a, p. 99f.
- 1491 Billiard 2001a, p. 100; Torrente 2004, p. 14; for some of the complexities see von Buelzingsloewen 2002; von Buelzingsloewen 2008; von Buelzingsloewen 2009.
- 1492 Billiard 2001a, p. 101f.; also see: Ellenberger 1949, p. 550.
- 1493 Billiard 2001a, pp. 117. 267; von Buelzingsloewen 2010, p. 17.
- 1494 Cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 50f.
- 1495 Billiard 2001a, p. 149f.; cf. p. 103fn.11; p. 121fn.52. The example of British pioneer work, mediated via the United States and northern European countries, played an important role, but Sivadon also never seems to

- have forgotten the war-time lesson that an asylum can only fulfil its true vocation if it reconnects its patients to worlds that might absorb them in re-energising ways: Veil 1996, p. 331f.; cf. Torrente 2004, p. 70; Billiard 2001a, p. 121; Billiard 2002a, p. 15; cf. Santiago-Delefosse 2002, p. 206. More generally on the post war efforts to place psychiatry on a new footing: Dejours and Duarte 2018, p. 9f.
- 1496 Cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 117; Torrente 2004, pp. 53ff.; Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 126f. 130; Sivadon and Amiel 1969, p. 124f.
- 1497 Cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 103 on the genesis of interest; on necessary adaptations for the mentally handicapped: Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 142f.
- 1498 Billiard 2001a, p. 121; Torrente 2004, p. 56; cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 33f. 142f.
- 1499 Torrente 2004, p. 62.
- 1500 Torrente 2004, pp. 48. 62. 71. 73.
- 1501 Sivadon 1952, p. 457 quoted in Torrente 2004, p. 60; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 179; Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 60; cf. p. 71.
- 1502 Torrente 2004, p. 48; cf. p. 57.
- 1503 Torrente 2004, p. 58; Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 17. 31f. 94f. 133. 170. 253; Sivadon and Amiel 1969, p. 62f.
- 1504 Sivadon 1977, p. 63; on the offer of relaxation therapy: Siksou 2012, p. 14.
- 1505 Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 134; Torrente 2004, p. 59f.; cf. p. 56.
- 1506 Cf. Billiard 2001a, pp. 172. 178; another glance at the magnitude of the transition involved: Billiard 2002b, p. 213.
- 1507 Torrente 2004, pp. 17.43; Billiard 2001a, pp. 131. 149; Billiard 2001b, p. 178; Henckes 2009b, p. 30.
- 1508 Billiard 2001a, p. 131.
- 1509 Sivadon 1952; Torrente 2004, pp. 43f.; Billiard 2002a, p. 11.
- 1510 Torrente 2004, p. 45.
- 1511 Billiard 2001a, p. 122; Torrente 2004, p. 73; Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 123f.
- 1512 Cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 60. 73. 80f.
- 1513 Torrente 2004, p. 45; '*une vie rétrécie*'; Torrente 2004, p. 169.
- 1514 Torrente 2004, p. 73; cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 84f.; cf. p. 174f.
- 1515 Torrente 2004, p. 73; cf. p. 63; Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 35.
- 1516 Sivadon and Fernandez-Zoila 1983, p. 145f.; p. 103;
- 1517 Cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 224; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 154. There was considerable post-war legal support for the social protection of the workforce, which provided Sivadon with a basis from which he could argue: Billiard 2002a, p. 23; Billiard 2001a, p. 120; cf. Billiard 2001b, p. 176. Yet he and his colleagues were only an active minority in psychiatry, and were very much aware of this, Billiard 2001a, pp. 12. 52f. 133. 171; Billiard 2001b, p. 175f.; cf. Billiard 2002a, p. 13f; Henckes 2009a, p. 88.
- 1518 Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 131f. 136; Sivadon and Amiel 1969, pp. 15.17; Amiel 1973, p. 38; cf., however, also the admonition to caution as regards the estimates: Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 225.
- 1519 Torrente 2004, p. 66; Veil 1972, p. 262.
- 1520 Sivadon 1952, p. 469, quoted in Torrente 2004, p. 66.
- 1521 Cf. Torrente 2004, pp. 14. 16. 35. 39. 120f.; cf. Tosquelles 1972, p. 31; for recent work on resonance see Gaignard 2001.
- 1522 Torrente 2004, cf. p. 49 with p. 57f.
- 1523 Torrente 2004, p. 71. 113; cf. Lhuillier 2012, p. 34.
- 1524 Cf. Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 9; Billiard 2001a, pp. 48f.; 180f.; Billiard 2001b, p. 180; Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 85f. 89f.; Henckes 2009b, p. 28f.; Billiard 2001a, p. 140f.
- 1525 Cf. Billiard 2001a, pp. 141. 151. 179ff; Billiard 2001b, p. 176; Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 159-167; Sivadon and Amiel, p. 125.
- 1526 Billiard 2001a, p. 148. 153fn. 32; 194. 53; Billiard 2001b, p. 178.
- 1527 'Mental health league'; Billiard 2001b, pp. 177-180; Torrente 2004, pp. 46. 113; on work medicine: Billiard 2001a, p. 53. Founded by Edouard Toulouse in 1921, it was recognised as an association in the public interest in 1922 and was reconstituted in 1946, see: <http://www.lfsm.org/presentation/historique/>; Billiard 2001a, pp. 24-29; on Edouard Toulouse see: Schneider 2002, pp. 182ff.; Ohayon 2006/1999, pp. 26ff.
- 1528 From 1949 it had membership in the World Federation For Mental Health, which held its 1950 annual world congress in Paris; Billiard 2001a, pp. 140-146; p. 268.
- 1529 Cf. Pichot 1996, p. 180f.; for the development of the percentage of psychiatrists within the medical community Pichot 1996, p. 177f.
- 1530 Billiard 2001a, p. 268.
- 1531 Billiard 2001a, pp. 122. 181f.; Billiard 2001b, p. 182; for Sivadon's study visits in Great Britain, the Netherlands and the United States see Billiard 2001a, pp. 118. 268; for a review of the relevant literature at the time see Ling, Purser and Rees 1950.

- 1532 Henckes 2009b, p. 31f.; Torrente 2004, p. 74; Billiard 2001a, p. 186.
- 1533 Billiard 2001a, p. 54f.; on the bivalence of psychiatric action cf. Veil 1985, p. 288 and Veil 1957b, p. 108; Torrente 2004, p. 2. 16.
- 1534 Cf. Billiard 2001a, pp. 70-74; cf. Buisson 2002, p. 204.
- 1535 Billiard 2001a, p. 180.
- 1536 Sharing the reform agenda of the post war years, Le Guillant, specialising early on in problems of difficult and inadapted childhood, became in 1944 a technical adviser to the then Communist minister for Public Health, and joined the Communist Party the very year it left government in the wake of a hardening of ideological positions in the beginning cold war, see Billiard 2001a, p. 269.
- 1537 Billiard 2001a, p. 269.
- 1538 Billiard 2001a, p. 131.
- 1539 Billiard 2001a, pp. 95-97; on Wallon: Billiard 2001a, p. 38f.; on *La Raison*: Billiard 2001a, pp. 125f. 270-273; Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 350f. differentiates an earlier more pluralist approach of the journal from a later more sectarian one and identifies a further change after 1956. Jalley 1981, pp. 66f. 256f. points out the considerable influence of Wallon on Lacan.
- 1540 Le Guillant 1956; Le Guillant 1963; Billiard 2001a, p. 269.
- 1541 Clot 2006a, p. 18f.; Billiard 2001a, p. 211; cf. Begoin and Le Guillant 1957, p. 124.
- 1542 Torrente 2004, p. 96; cf. Billiard 2002a, pp. 13. 17; Billiard 2001a, pp. 219. 223.
- 1543 Billiard 2001a, p. 208.
- 1544 Torrente 2004, pp. 99. 104;
- 1545 Le Guillant 1957, in Le Guillant 2006, p. 185f.; see Torrente 2004, p. 103f.
- 1546 Torrente 2004, p. 105.
- 1547 Billiard 2001a, p. 219.
- 1548 Billiard 2001a, pp. 210. 225. 220.
- 1549 Billiard 2002a, p. 16 suggests he belonged to an anarchist tradition, which does not seem to be borne out by the active part he took in the *POUM*, a militia with closer links to the Trotskyite Left rather than to the *CGT-FAI*. See Delion 2014, p. xiif.; Tosquelles 1992 (2014), pp. 200ff, 225; Oury and Gabarron-Garcia 2010, pp. 12ff. Before the Civil War Tosquelles had undertaken a psychoanalysis with Sandor Eiminder, a Hungarian refugee and psychoanalyst in the Ferenczi tradition, cf. Delion 2014, p. xii; Moreau Ricaud 2004, p. 99; Garcia Siso 1993, pp. 197ff.
- 1550 Cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 110.; pp. 115ff.; p. 256; Delion 2009, p. 10.
- 1551 Tosquelles 1972, pp. 20.26; Tosquelles 2003, p. 111 =§75ff, cf. Clot 2009, p. 159f., see also Clot 2009, p. 157.
- 1552 Tosquelles 2003, §3f.
- 1553 Tosquelles 2003, §8.
- 1554 Tosquelles 2003, §9f.
- 1555 Cf. Billiard 2002a, p. 16; Lhuilier 2010, p. 21; Clot 2009, p. 144; Ganem, Gernet and Dejours 2008, p. 803; Clot 2006a, p. 26f.
- 1556 Clot 2009, p. 150.
- 1557 Tosquelles 1967/1972, p. 83; cf. p. 106.
- 1558 Cf. Torrente 2004, p. 105f.; Billiard 2001a, pp. 34. 54. 156f. 163. 209; cf. Billiard 2001b, p. 179; Veil 1957b, p. 94.
- 1559 Billiard 2001a, pp. 34. 36; cf. Sivadon and Amiel 1969, p. 115.
- 1560 Billiard 2001a, pp. 54. 261.
- 1561 Billiard 2001a, p. 57, Cottureau 1983, p. 4.
- 1562 Billiard 2001a, pp. 39-43; 83. 7. 260. Ohayon 2006/1999, p. 279f.
- 1563 Cottureau 1983, p. 5; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 263.
- 1564 Sivadon and Duron 1979, p. 159.
- 1565 Sivadon and Amiel 1969, p. 117.
- 1566 Le Guillant 1966, p. 161; Billiard 2001a, pp. 216f. 254f.
- 1567 Billiard 2001b, p. 182f.; Billiard 2001a, pp. 132f.; p. 149f.; pp. 189ff.; Lhuilier 2012, pp. 11. 30; Lhuilier 2010, p. 19; his medical dissertation in 1952 was on the physiological coefficients of fatigue: Billiard 2001a, p. 189fn.22.
- 1568 Billiard 2001a, pp. 191. 200; Billiard 2001b, p. 184; Veil 1959, p. 180, cf. Veil 1957a, p. 67; Lhuilier 2012, p. 11; Billiard 2001a, pp. 143. 201.
- 1569 Veil 1973, p. 82; Billiard 2001b, p. 187; cf. the vignette on forest workers in Brazil Veil 1996, p. 342.
- 1570 Cf. Veil 1959, p. 179.
- 1571 Cf. Veil 1957a, p. 66f.
- 1572 Veil 1959, p. 185f.
- 1573 Veil 1964, p. 336; see also Lhuilier 2012, pp. 19. 47f.; cf. Henckes 2009b, p. 34.

- 1574 Lhuilier 2012, p. 20; cf. Veil 1972, p. 249f.
- 1575 Le Blanc 2007, pp. 25. 181ff.; cf. Lhuilier 2010, p. 24; cf. Veil 1994, p. 306; Veil 1972, p. 257: a fight against dust in which all motivation is sucked into an abyss; cf. p. 272.
- 1576 Cf. Lhuilier 2012, p. 29.
- 1577 Devereux 1966; Lhuilier 2012, p. 31f.
- 1578 Lhuilier 2012, pp. 16-19.
- 1579 Billiard 2001a, p. 251; Billiard 2001b, p. 187; cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 11.
- 1580 Trillat 2012, p. 359; Antoine 2010, p. 102; Billiard 2001a, pp. 227f.; 269; Sivadon and Duron 1979, pp. 217ff.; Henckes 2009a, p. 93f.; Henckes 2009b, pp. 33ff.; Henckes 2005, pp. 20-22; 80-89; Pichot 1996, p. 181f.; Quartier-Frings 1997, 22; Hochmann 2006, p. 1046f.; Delion 2009, pp. 7ff.; <http://www.asml3.org/article23.html>; http://www.serpsy.org/psy_levons_voile/hopital/secteur.html.
- 1581 Veil 1996, pp. 334. 339.
- 1582 Veil 1996, p. 334; Lhuilier 2012, p. 32.
- 1583 Veil 1996, p. 334.
- 1584 Billiard 2001a, pp. 232ff.
- 1585 cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 8; cf. also Billiard 2002a, p. 13.
- 1586 Cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 230f.
- 1587 Billiard 2001, p. 234.
- 1588 I am indebted to the useful discussion of possibilities of translation at <http://forum.wordreference.com/threads/sous-les-pavés-la-plage.37487/>.
- 1589 Cousin 2008.
- 1590 As with French psychoanalysis, there are many currents involved. For important links between students and workers, see Dejours and Duarte 2018, p. 2f.
- 1591 Cf. Veil 1996, p. 334; cf. p. 338; Billiard 2001a, pp. 29. 172; cf. pp. 11ff.
- 1592 Dejours 2008d, p. 14; Torrente 2004, p. 143.
- 1593 Cf. Picard 2006, p. 207ff.
- 1594 Billiard 2001a, p. 8f.; Billiard 2002a, p. 11.
- 1595 Clot 2010, p. 6.
- 1596 Cf. Lhuilier 2012, p. 17; Veil 1996, pp. 332-334; Billiard 2001a, pp. 169. 176.
- 1597 Billiard 2002a, p. 17; Billiard 2001a, pp. 181. 254f. 258. 263; cf. Lhuilier 2010, pp. 21. 24.
- 1598 Veil 1996, p. 334; Veil 1985, p. 292; Lhuilier 2012, pp. 13. 18; cf. Billiard 2001a, pp. 55. 58. 168.
- 1599 Billiard 2001a, p. 8.
- 1600 '*Psychodynamique du travail*'; Dejours 1980; cf. Cleach 2014, §1; Molinier and Flottes 2012, p. 52; Torrente 2004, pp. 70. 111. 148; Billiard 2001a, p. 9. For a brief look back on the earlier stages of the 1950s see Dejours 2012c[1993], p. 210.
- 1601 It is the activity thwarted that is detrimental to health: Molinier and Flottes 2012, p. 58; Lhuilier 2010, p. 15. On the approach see: Clot 1995, p. 258; Billiard 2001a, pp. 9. 262; Clot 2015, p. 192 and Torrente 2004, p. 144: in continuation of efforts by ergonomists; cf. Clot 2006b, pp. 171-175 on the premises of this critical dialogue; cf. Clot 2010, pp. 155-164; Clot 1995, pp. 240-259.
- 1602 Cf. eg Billiard 2001a, p. 48.
- 1603 Billiard 2001a, p. 255.
- 1604 Cf. Billiard 2001a, p. 257; Torrente 2004, p. 73.
- 1605 Shorter 1992, pp. 295-323; for a perspective from a General Practitioner, Barraclough 2004; for the embeddedness of a concept in social reality see also Summerfield 2001.
- 1606 Clot 2010, pp. 11-17; cf. Davoine and Méda 2008, p. 43: 'Work is more often an emotional investment in France..... Compared to the European average, the French acclaim the notions of accomplishment and pride.... [in comparison] the British are, together with the Danes, accord the least place to work in their liveswe can observe a detachment in relation to work ... a relationship placed at some distance, more pragmatic and less affective'. I owe the reference to this study to Clot 2010, pp. 11f.
- 1607 Cf. Clot 2010, p. 16; Clot 1995, pp. 102-118.
- 1608 Cf. e.g. Veil 1972, p. 246f.
- 1609 The closest precedent was perhaps offered in the disturbing 'neuroses of war' encountered in and after World War I. by the psychoanalytic movement, cf. Demaegd 2012, pp. 50ff.
- 1610 In the difficulties to learn from preceding efforts, psychoanalysts apparently reproduced a phenomenon that beset the American military presence in Vietnam. What Howard R. Simpson writes about Saigon in the early 1960's describes well what may happen when a new outfit takes over and personnel is being replaced: 'Search as I might, I didn't see a single old Saigon hand from the French period. I soon learned that the lessons of recent history were not on the agenda. The French had lost. We were going to win. Sifting through the errors of the past was obviously considered a waste of time', Simpson 1992, p. 164, cf. p. 189. In a similar vein, Gentry 2011, p. 207 states: 'U.S troops in Vietnam refused to study the lessons of the French in 1946-1954

- because they thought the French were incompetent'. Dejours and Duarte 2018, p. 9f. have recently emphasised the importance of the immense investigative effort into work related mental conditions undertaken in France after the Liberation.
- 1611 In recent work Dejours speaks of 'situations' as 'the sum total of concrete relationships which bind a person to the environment and to circumstances', Dejours 2016a, p. 16.
- 1612 Cf. 'Christoph Dejours' (a) a and 'Christoph Dejours' (b). Also see Dejours 2012c[1993], p. 217: 'From the outset, the psychopathology of work of the 1970s developed within a double dialogue: with the health sciences (through psychoanalysis), on the one hand, and with the work sciences (through ergonomics) on the other. The research which led to the 1980 essay got underway around 1976 in the ergonomics laboratory at the National Conservatory of Arts and Engineering (*CNAM*) under the direction of Alain Wisner'. Dejours 2016a, pp. 13ff. stresses the same point but includes sociologists, historians, linguists and ethnologists in the list. 'The list may seem long', Dejours writes, 'This is so, but it was those encounters that set the pace for the development of the *psychodynamique du travail*', Dejours 2016a, p. 15. Also see: Dejours 1988b[1986] in Dejours 2016a, p. 19f. In 1997 an international conference on the psychodynamics and the psychopathology of work held in Paris resulted in the founding of a new scientific journal dedicated to the discipline: *Travailler*, Dejours 1998b, p. 220. In an interview, he emphasises his encounter with Pierre Marty as fundamental for further interrogations, 'I started at *IPSO* in 1978, and I was very close to Marty. I would not have done all I have done without this encounter.', Dejours 2009f, p. 41; also see Dejours 1994, p. 95f. The length of Dejours' cooperation with Marty is also remarked upon by Nicolaïdis and Vadi Lathon 2005, p. 2.
- 1613 Dejours and Tessier 2018, back cover.
- 1614 In Dejours 2012c[1993], p. 209 he states: 'The broadening of the question has undoubtedly resulted from interdisciplinary comparisons within clinical approaches to suffering, as well as in the social sciences. This comparative effort, organised with support from the French *CNRS* (National Centre for Scientific Research), took the form of a seminar entitled "*Plaisir et souffrance dans le travail*", which took place in Paris between 1986 and 1988.'
- 1615 Dejours 2012a, p. 53f. From what he writes, it seems that still in training, he also attended to inmates of a prison, an experience which apparently has stood him in good stead, see Dejours 2009c, 1: pp. 33ff.; Dejours 2012a, p. 105.
- 1616 Berthou and Guislain 2005, p. 54f.; Dejours 2012a, pp. 60. 62. 64. 65. 68. 139. 152; Dejours 1992a.
- 1617 Dejours 1998a, p. 57; Dejours 2012a, pp. 38. 57; Dejours 2015b, p. 13ff. In neglecting questions they did not find to their liking the unions left ground unoccupied that was later turned against them by a perspective more focused on the needs of the employers.
- 1618 Dejours 2012a, p. 18f.; cf. some of the background in *Le Monde*, July 4th, 2012; cf. also Dejours 2011b; Dejours 2015d, p. 290. Dejours and Bègue 2009, pp. 57-105 describe one of the interventions in some detail. In a conclusion, p. 124f. they list the principles that form the framework of the intervention. Also see: Dejours and Duarte 2018, pp. 6ff. 8f.
- 1619 CDFT France Télécom-Orange and Dejours 2012a.
- 1620 Torrente 2004, p. 111; cf. Alderson 2004, p. 243; Dejours 2012a, p. 74. On antecedents in the Fifties: Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 73. Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 71 define the psychopathology of work as follows: 'it is the dynamic analysis of psychic processes mobilised by the subject's confrontation with the reality of work.' Dashtipour and Vidaillet 2017, p. 25f. make the valid point that Dejours' reality is not the Lacanian real.
- 1621 Dejours 2016a, p. 15; also see Dejours 1992a, p. 109. The discipline, Dejours 1993a, p. 151 affirms is clinically orientated [*une clinique*], works with the psychoanalytic model but is more than just applied psychoanalysis in that it has its own frame and works with its own social theory: 'What is at stake is to envisage, as it were, the consequences of the psychoanalytic theory of the subject when it is propelled into a world that wants to know nothing about the subject....'
- 1622 'Prix Pierre Mâle et Prix Maurice Bouvet', p. 109; Jung-Rozenfarb 2003, p. 707.
- 1623 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 13; p. 157; p. 166f.; Dejours 2009a, p. 13, p. 79fn.; Dejours 2016a, p. 17; cf. his prefaces to the 2008, the 2000 and the 1993 editions of Dejours 2008a; for a discussion of previous stages of his work see Obadia 1986 and Couvreur 1990; also see: Deiahaye, p. 98. Dejours' repeated insistence on following the various stages in which thought develops, and offering a large range of contributions, has clear advantages in guarding against too reductive perspectives. Sievers 1995 finds much to appreciate in Dejours but believes (p. 204) that 'Dejours mainly emphasizes the discrimination and interrelatedness of the drama of one's childhood and the drama at work, and almost completely neglects the surrounding context of the larger organization or enterprise', which, in the context of Dejours' corpus of work, is a most curious misunderstanding.
- 1624 Cf. for instance, Willsher 2007; Rau 2009; Steinberg 2002. In an interview (Dejours 2009f, p. 39) Dejours says, 'I started my research thirty years ago on the basis of a double training background, on the one hand, psychiatry and psychoanalysis, on the other hand, the sciences of work [*les sciences du travail*]..... In fact,

- for years, I have worked in both fields, taking part in different social and institutional frameworks, with difficulties on both sides. To concern oneself with [the world of] work was considered bad style [*était mal vu*] for a full-blooded psychoanalyst [*un "pur" psychanalyste*]; likewise, during the 1970s, in a work environment [*dans les milieux du travail*] there was a hostility towards psychiatry and even more so against psychoanalysis, as much on the part of the unions as on the part of research institutions focusing on [the world of] work.'
- 1625 As is also suggested by the interest shown in Delaunoy 2005. More recently: Dashtipour and Vidaillet 2017, p. 19. Dashtipour and Vidaillet, which is one of the first studies of its kind in the English language, show that Dejours' perspective adds important dimensions to existing Kleinian and Lacanian studies.
- 1626 See, for instance, Dejours 2002c, p. 67; Dejours 2006d, p. 41f.; cf. Dejours 2017a, p. 192.
- 1627 For subversion libidinal' as a key concept with Christophe Dejours: Kamieniecki 1994, pp. 92ff.
- 1628 Dejours 2001a, p. 11.
- 1629 Provided with patterns of behaviour shaped in a prolonged relation of attachment essential to self-preservation, Dejours 2001a p. 156, cf. pp. 12. 73; Dejours 2009a, p. 159; cf. also Dejours 2005a, p. 100; Dejours 2002c, p. 85.
- 1630 Dejours 2001a, p. 9f.; cf. p. 149; cf., in a different context, Dejours 2012a, p. 64.
- 1631 Dejours 2013a, p. 38.
- 1632 Dejours 2001a, p. 125; Dejours 2001a, p. 12; cf. Dejours 2001a, p.169. Dejours reminds us that there are two words for body in German, *Leib* and *Körper*, a choice of terms, in which *Leib* is closer to expressing an experiential body lived, whereas *Körper* is closer to designing the spatial dimensions of the biological entity, Dejours 2005a, p. 106. Dejours 1987a, pp. 54. 58 underlines and defends the centrality of the concept of the 'erotic body'.
- 1633 Dejours 2001a, p. 171; Dejours 2009a, p. 17. In expounding his views, Dejours puts to use Jean Laplanche's 'Theory of General Seduction' - which in turn takes up the confusion of languages postulated by Ferenczi - and his concept of *l'étayage* (a 'leaning against'), Laplanche 1987; Laplanche 1970; Dejours 2009a, p. 136. p. 13; Dejours 2001a, p. 168; Pirlot 2010, p. 124: '*Les conceptions de Dejours situées au croisement de celles de Laplanche et de Marty...*'
- 1634 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 86fn.; Dejours 2010e; cf. Dejours 1987a, p. 69. Being able to take pleasure in one's own thinking is helped by observing the manifestation of this pleasure in others: 'There is some small chance for each and every one of us to go down this route because someone has shown this to you or has made it enviable for you', Dejours 2009e, p. 297.
- 1635 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 90; Dejours 2006d, p. 44f.
- 1636 Not just language but also '*l'agir expressif*' of the adult, behaviour expressive of yet to be discovered significance, leaves its effects, Dejours 2001a, p. 73, defined p. 26.
- 1637 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 92; Dejours 2010e;
- 1638 Dejours 2001a, p. 11; Dejours 2001a, pp. 162-164; p. 27; p. 191; Dejours 2009a, p. 127; Dejours 2005a, p. 92; Dejours 2009c, 1, p. 93f. Dejours 1987a, p. 59f. points to the corporal interplay between parents, which forms part of a dialogue that is not only verbal.
- 1639 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 88.
- 1640 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 93; cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 73.
- 1641 Dejours 2001a, p. 173, p. 150; Dejours 2009a, p. 194; cf. Dejours 2005a, p. 90f.; p. 101.
- 1642 Dejours 2009a, p. 154; p. 177; cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 31f.
- 1643 Cf. Dejours 2009c 1, p. 112; Dejours 2004a, p. 776. In a somewhat puzzling statement, Alain Fine writes, 'Not to believe any longer in any psychic causality in order to understand the [psychosomatic] phenomenon leads to the repudiation of the notion of somatisation, as does Christophe Dejours, who replaces it by an existential dimension due to a possible transformation of suffering; the somatic disturbance would in this way be one result of this suffering, an experience which would be that of a subject caught in a history and in intersubjective relationships which the illness has disturbed', Fine 1997, p. 123. Fine belongs to a different psychoanalytic association from Dejours. He would, one might assume, be in occasional, but not regular, contact with the development of Dejours' thinking, rendering his interpretation of select passages in a limited selection of writings somewhat conjectural. A more grounded attack on Dejours, as a voice from outside the *SPP*, would have to attack him for reading Michel Fain in the light of Jean Laplanche, which, I believe, is not the point Alain Fine is making. For an early statement of Dejours on the role of the body see, for instance, Dejours 1984a, p. 1289.
- 1644 Dejours 2001a, p. 16; cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 74 about the interminable contradiction between instinctual and drive forces; see also Dejours 2001a, p. 121f.; 171.
- 1645 Dejours 2009a, pp. 161-168; Dejours 2001a pp. 19-21. Dejours spells out the far-reaching consequences: 'the mill represents the psychic apparatus; the rural landscape surrounding the river represents the body, the riverbed and the irrigation canals which it feeds into, its branches and bifurcations represent the central nervous system; the current of the river and the energy of the water represent the excitement which is

- transmitted into the central nervous system and which in the end reaches the organs. Not only is one part of the mechanical energy of the river channelled off and syphoned off (literally 'subverted') to fabricate energy, but downstream ecological conditions are transformed, This means that in some way a process which is essentially functional at its starting point – the subversive *étayage* – produces consequences which turn into something material. The physical geography as such undergoes transformation. Libidinal subversion, in the long run, leads to modifications of the body', Dejours 2009a, p. 163.
- 1646 Dejours 2001a, p. 74; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 128.
- 1647 Dejours 2001a, p. 18; Dejours 2009a, p. 161.
- 1648 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 80.
- 1649 Dejours 2002c, p. 102: '*la pulsion, pour advenir, a besoin de l'autre.*' Earlier on, Dejours affirms that *pulsion* does not have the biological body as an origin.
- 1650 Dejours 2001a, p. 81.
- 1651 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 125; Dejours 2009c 1, p. 102.
- 1652 Dejours 2001a, p. 73; Dejours 2001a, pp. 122-125; Dejours 2009a, p. 83, p. 173, p. 184; Tessier 2003, p. 220f. observes that there is a relationship of continuity in Dejours between attachment and '*pulsion de mort*'.
- 1653 Cf. Dejours 2011a, p. 32; Dejours 2001a, p. 174. 156. 164. As Fernández 2002, p. 152 puts it in his summary of Dejours' position, 'human sexuality, to some extent, liberates itself from its endocrinometabolical rhythms, in a kind of 'colonisation', which remains forever unfinished [*en una suerte de "colonización" siempre inconclusa*].
- 1654 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 102; Dejours 2001a, p. 76; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 159; Dejours 2005a, p. 88. Also see Dejours 2007b, p. 126.
- 1655 Dejours 2010e; cf. Dejours 2002c, p. 88.
- 1656 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 103; Dejours 2001a, p. 17; Dejours 2005a, p. 84.
- 1657 Dejours 2001a, p. 152. 164.
- 1658 Dejours 2001a, pp. 27. 164.
- 1659 Dejours 2001a p. 40.
- 1660 Dejours 2001a, pp. 28. 163f.; Dejours 2009c 1, p. 110; Dejours 2005b, p. 18f.; Dejours 1993c, p. 114; Dejours 2005a, p. 105: the psychic event throws itself into the abyss of the bodily flaw.
- 1661 Cf. Dejours 2009a p. 46ff; Dejours 2001a, p. 24; the quip is documented in de M'Uzan 1965, p. 33; more recently de M'Uzan 2007, p. 1521.
- 1662 Dejours 2005a, p. 94; Dejours 2003, p. 233.
- 1663 Dejours 2005b, pp. 16. 19; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 169f.
- 1664 Dejours 2001a, p. 27; Dejours 2009a, p. 132; Dejours 2009c 1, p. 108.
- 1665 See Couvreur 1990, p. 875; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 128. Dejours 2000a, p. 17: 'The illness seems to strike a recognisable zone of fragility in the architecture of the erotic body'. This, according to Dejours, is one possibility for the occurrence of a somatic disease. It is also possible that it is an accidental disease without a link to the subjective history of the patient, Dejours 2000a, p. 16.; also see Dejours 2005b, p. 18; Dejours 1997, p. 49f. In this case, however, it may acquire a secondary meaning, Dejours 1997, pp. 60f. 64.
- 1666 'In these families one cannot be three, and by this I mean, three at places different one from the other', Dejours 2009a, p. 125.
- 1667 '*La censure de l'amante*', as suggested by Braunschweig and Fain, Dejours 2001a, p. 17f., Dejours 2009a, p. 123f.; cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 60.
- 1668 Cf. Dejours 2004d, p. 69; Dejours 1995a, p. 66f.
- 1669 Dejours 2009a, p. 192; cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 73; Dejours 2004a, p. 782: '*l'avversione, il disgusto, la repulsione e l'odio*'; Dejours 2010e: 'uncontrollable aversion'.
- 1670 Dejours 2009a, p. 125; also see Dejours 1993b, p. 186.
- 1671 Dejours 2009a, p. 126f.; cf. however for other possibilities Dejours 2009d, p. 232.
- 1672 Dejours 2009a, p. 127f.
- 1673 Dejours 2001a, p. 117f.; Dejours 1993a, p. 155f.; also see Dejours 2002c, p. 93.
- 1674 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 110.
- 1675 Dejours 2001a, p. 162. p. 165; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 126f.; p. 170.
- 1676 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 75.
- 1677 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 87; Dejours 2009a, p. 154.
- 1678 Green 1973, p. 221: the glance on the body stirred, cf. with this Dejours 2001a, p. 153.
- 1679 Dejours 2001a, p. 170; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 101.
- 1680 The only way for nascent excitement to be discharged is into the endocrino-metabolical system, Dejours 2001a, p. 109, cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 128. This is not material that lends itself easily to perlaboration in dreaming, Dejours 2001a, p. 57.
- 1681 Dejours 2001a, p. 97; Dejours 2009a, p. 177.
- 1682 Cf. Dejours 2002c, p. 96; Dejours 2004d, p. 64.

- 1683 Dejours 2001a, p. 164; Dejours 2009a, p. 82; Dejours 2009d, p. 233. In some ways, Dejours suggests, this experience might be closer to psychosis than to a '*névrose actuelle*', Dejours 2002c, p. 101. Psychosis as an alternative to body zones gone 'cold': Dejours 2013a, p. 39.
- 1684 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 31f.
- 1685 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 109.
- 1686 Although the drama exists, there is no meaningful access to any dramaturgy and an effacement of pertinent thought, Dejours 2001a, p. 36; Dejours 2001a, p. 177.
- 1687 Dejours 2001a, p. 38; Dejours 2001a, p. 26; Dejours 2001a, pp. 156. 158.
- 1688 Dejours 2001a, p. 32; Dejours 2001a, p. 131f.
- 1689 Dejours 2009a, p. 85; Dejours 2001a, p. 30; p. 98f.; p. 123f., p. 166.
- 1690 Dejours 2000a, p. 17f.; Dejours 2005b, p. 21; Dejours 2004d, p. 63; Dejours 1997, p. 56: 'The *agir expressif* is the way the body rallies to put oneself at the service of *signification* [word emphasised in the original]...'. This putting at the service of expressivity sweeps up and moulds into shape what was previously without special meaning. Dejours uses a political analogy to explain. In French politics there is the term *récupération*: an act of giving, in a new context, to something whose initial intention was different, Dejours 1997, p. 57f. Van Wyck Brooks in 1918 used the expression 'usable past' to convey a similar idea, Brooks 1918, see p. 339: 'The past that Carlyle put together for England would never have existed if Carlyle had been an American professor. And what about the past that Michelet, groping about in the depths of his own temperament, picked out for the France of his generation?' In private life there are important unintentional elements to this process, Dejours 1997, p. 59.
- 1691 Dejours 2002a, p. 126: 'Basing ourselves on the theory of the erogenous body in psychoanalytic practice means tracking the body's representations, their transformations and their impasses. The theory of the erogenous body and the third topic suggest hypotheses that help us to go and discover what precisely has been proscribed from any engagement of the body in an expressive turning towards the other [*le rapport expressif à l'autre*]. In Dejours 2009f, p. 45f. he emphasises that health is fundamentally an intersubjective phenomenon.
- 1692 Dejours 2001a, pp. 32-42.
- 1693 Dejours 2001a, pp 32-34. For another vignette of aggression blocked off from being channelled into expressive behaviour: Dejours 2005b, p. 21.
- 1694 Dejours 2001a, pp. 36-40.
- 1695 Dejours 2001a, p. 109f.; Dejours 2009c 2: p. 60.
- 1696 Dejours 2009a, p. 40. Nipping affect in the bud by disconnecting it radically from any energy source, cf. Dejours 2009a, pp. 139-141.
- 1697 Dejours 2009a, p. 77; Dejours 2009a, p. 80; Dejours 1999a, p. 17.
- 1698 Dejours 2001a, p. 110.
- 1699 Haraszti 1976.
- 1700 Boyadjian 1978.
- 1701 Cf. also Dejours 2009c 2, p. 58.
- 1702 Dejours 2017a, p. 179f.; Dejours 2008a, p. 81; Dejours 2009c 2: pp. 58-59; Dejours 2008a, p. 148; also see Torrente 2004, p. 123.
- 1703 Dejours 2009c 2: p. 59; cf. Dejours 2008a, p. 148. As Dejours points out, there is the paradox that in psychiatric epidemiology the assembly line is not considered at fault; the people there are considered normal; and when they finally break up there is still no mental illness that can be found in them, Dejours 2017a, p. 180.
- 1704 Dejours 2008a, p. 94 with reference to Leplat 1972.
- 1705 As to the case of child minders watching over the sleep of young infants staying adequately attentive by resorting to knitting, regarded as a possibly illicit activity: Dejours 2009c, 1: p. 35f.; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 122; also see Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 31.
- 1706 Cf. Dejours 2008a, pp. 142ff: the employees at the telephone company.
- 1707 Dejours 2008a, p. 84; Dejours 2012a, p. 28f.; p. 63 – for the unsettling social repercussions of being sick for those on the margins of society cf. Dejours 2008a, pp. 63ff.; on the shame of being vulnerable Dejours 1998a, p. 55.
- 1708 Dejours 2012a, p. 82. Dejours 1993a, p. 158 asks: 'Is *opératoire* functioning the result of the childhood history of the subject or of his/her inclusion in the social relationships of work? Everything depends on the context one holds on to to make sense of the experience'.
- 1709 Dejours 2004b, p. 245.
- 1710 Dejours 2004b, pp. 245. 253. 255. Dejours 1996, p. 24 warns against the temptation to regard behavioural neuroses in too schematic a way as something beyond personal meaning and affect. As he has often shown in his work, context has to be taken into account and does matter.
- 1711 Dejours 2006a, p. 202.

- 1712 Dejours 2010a, pp. 31-44. Dejours 1993a, pp. 159-163. Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 84 point out that the subject, in participating in a collective strategy of defence has to 'bring about a harmonisation of his/her other resources of individual defence in order to ensure the coherence of his individual mental [*psychique*] economy.' For Mr. A, this was apparently possible at the new job but not the old one. For the painful clash between public and private truth: Dejours 1992a, p. 130.
- 1713 Cf. Dejours 2010a, p. 39f.; Dejours 2009c, 2, pp. 59-60; Dejours 1993a, pp. 154f. 158. For confusing uncertainties see Dejours 2001a, p. 138; for a comparable problem with highly qualified fighter pilots see, besides Dejours 2010a, p. 39, more fully Dejours 2008a, pp. 123-139; in particular p. 133; on defensive strategies: Dejours 2007a, p. 59. defensive strategies turned ideologies: Dejours 1987a, p. 63: all the members of the family are involved in keeping up the shield of the person employed.
- 1714 Dejours 2009a, p. 121f.
- 1715 Dejours 2009a, p. 73, p. 75, p. 117.
- 1716 Dejours 2017a, p. 181; in his contribution he sets out with a reference to the work of Alain Ehrenberg (Dejours 2004c, p. 27) and goes on to consider the concrete work conditions under which fatigue becomes an issue. In contradistinction to Ehrenberg, who speaks of a fatigue of being oneself, he points to a defeat of subjectivity at certain jobs that no longer link to a person's sense of self. (p. 33f.).
- 1717 Dejours 2017a, p. 181.
- 1718 Dejours 1997.
- 1719 Dejours 2017a, p. 182f.
- 1720 Dejours 2001a, p. 126. In Dejours 2002c, p. 104 he argues that patients he has seen have shown symptoms that the early protagonists of the *EPP* would have considered mutually incompatible; cf. Dejours 2004d, p. 83.
- 1721 Dejours 2001a, p. 79f.; Dejours 2009a, p. 47.
- 1722 Dejours 2001a, p. 80.
- 1723 Dejours 2001a, p. 84.
- 1724 Dejours 2004d, p. 71f. In Dejours 1994, pp. 97ff. 120 explains that his thought developed, tentatively at first, as he tried to understand the results of his therapeutic actions: sometimes there was a healing that was only apparent, and sometimes there was failure that was difficult to understand, both of which was difficult to account for on the basis of Marty's theory he was working with.
- 1725 Dejours 2000a, p. 18f.; Dejours 1997, p. 52.
- 1726 Dejours 2001a, p. 85.
- 1727 'amental unconscious' Dejours 2001a, p. 86; see also 2007, p. 6f.; Gernet and Dejours 2016; Pirlot 2010, p. 135. Hock 2013, p. 957 establishes a connection between Dejours' '*inconscient amental*' and the Botellas' '*mémoire sans souvenir*'. Hock writes, 'What therefore is at stake is the creation of a space, in which signifiers and the representative can arise, with the help of which predominantly traumatic experiences can be processed' [*Es geht folglich darum, einen Raum zu schaffen, in dem es zur Bildung von Signifikanten oder auch Repräsentanzen kommt, mit deren Hilfe eine Bearbeitung offensichtlich vorwiegend traumatischer Erfahrungen möglich ist*].
- 1728 Dejours 2001a, p. 86; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 85. It is instructive to compare this to the observation in Oliner 1988, p. 209 that the French *psychosomaticiens* 'are interested in the problem of a deficient rather than a conflicted internalization'. In Dejours there are two clearly demarcated zones within the unconscious, a legacy of early interactions, which can only enter into conflict with each other if external reality makes this unavoidable.
- 1729 Dejours 2009a, p. 94, p. 121; Dejours 2001a, p. 87. Being able to do so is the result of social apprenticeship, an inculcation process, not fantasmatically engendered by the subject, Dejours 2001a, p. 88.
- 1730 Dejours 2001a, p. 90; Dejours 2001a, p. 92.
- 1731 Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 28f. argue that the intelligence of the body, if the subject is faced with an impasse, may be in advance of symbolisation, conceptualisation and verbalisation.
- 1732 Fain 1981a, p. 283.
- 1733 Dejours 2001a, p. 97; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 67f.
- 1734 Dejours 2001a, p. 93.
- 1735 Dejours 2001a, p. 91; cf. Dejours 2009c 2: p. 61.
- 1736 Dejours 2001a, pp. 93f. 109.
- 1737 Dejours 2001a, p. 95
- 1738 There is a connection to Maine de Biran's thought, Dejours 2006d, p. 48f.: 'If the Me does not perceive the modifications which get produced in the physiological body ..., then memorisation is not possible and it follows that there cannot occur thought based on sensations which rest at a physiological level.'
- 1739 Dejours 2001a, p. 96; cf. p. 126. Dejours is making a related argument about the possible aftermath of an organic disease that is 'accidental', i.e. unrelated to the psyche in its origin. After it has occurred it may be tied to personal meaning and thus be processed, Dejours 2000a, p. 16f. Dejours, in general, is less interested in possible failures in mentalisation that may have led to a disease than in the mental processes it is leading to,

- Dejours 2000a, p. 15. There is a similar emphasis on the effects and vicissitudes of the amental.
- 1740 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 103; Dejours 2009a, p. 109.
- 1741 Dejours 2001a, p. 99; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 77.
- 1742 Dejours 2001a, p. 100.
- 1743 Dejours 2001a, p. 102.
- 1744 Dejours 2001a, p. 106f.
- 1745 Dejours 2001a, p. 107; one is reminded of Bion's graphic description of the danger, in a somewhat different context, for the patient to 'bleed to death in his own tissues' Bion 1970, p. 12, cf. Bion 1965, p. 9fn.1.
- 1746 Dejours 2001a, p. 108.
- 1747 Dejours 2001a, p. 116f.; Dejours 2005b, p. 21.
- 1748 Dejours 2001a, p. 111.
- 1749 Dejours 2001a, p. 112.
- 1750 Dejours 2009a, p. 47; cf. p. 115f; Dejours 2005a, p. 104; Dejours 1995a, p. 66; see also, very instructively, Dejours 2012a, p. 82.
- 1751 Dejours 2008b, p. 38; '*passage à l'acte*', for possible differences to 'acting out' see Dejours 2001a, p. 98; Dejours 2001a, p. 113 p. 115; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 77.
- 1752 Dejours 2001a, p. 118f. Both the inheritance of violence and the worlds of desire and will contribute to the shaping of structure, Dejours 2009a, p. 79; cf. p. 43.
- 1753 Dejours 1988b[1986] in Dejours 2016a, pp. 24ff.; cf. p. 35f. Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 89 point out that some repetitive tasks require a suppression of mental activity and fantasy life, which, if indulged in, would not be compatible with the job at hand deprived of all personal meaning for the subject engaged in it; cf. p. 101. Also see Dejours 1993a, p. 153f.
- 1754 Dejours 1988c[1986] in Dejours 2016a, pp. 42f. 46. For resonances: Dejours 1993b, p. 188f.
- 1755 Dejours 1987a, p. 64.
- 1756 Dejours 2005a, p. 97fn.1.
- 1757 Dejours 2001a, p. 121f.
- 1758 Dejours 2001a, p. 124.
- 1759 Dejours 2001a, p. 129; Dejours 2009a, p. 120, p. 137
- 1760 Dejours 2001a, p. 130f.; Dejours 2009a, p. 105f.; Dejours 2009a, p. 129. There is a veritable bulimia of perception which differs from sublimation: sublimation has to generate the satisfying form not previously available in a process struggling with, but also acknowledging, lack, Dejours 2009a, p. 106; Dejours 2001a, p. 131f. Dejours accords to sublimation a much more robust status in protecting the individual than Marty did, Dejours 2009f, p. 50. On a prevalence of perception Dejours 1987b, pp. 429ff.
- 1761 Cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 133; Dejours 2009a, p. 127.
- 1762 For the aptitude to regress into a crowd: Dejours 2012b, p. 14. For Dejours' take on the imaginary, pp. 271ff.
- 1763 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 113f., Dejours 2001a, p. 186f.; cf. Dejours 2009a, p. 120; p. 76f.; Dejours 2009c 1, p. 116f.
- 1764 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 117f.
- 1765 Dejours 2009a, p. 85. In Dejours 2009f, p. 40 he states that he believes psychosomatics core concern is to deal with crises, not with illnesses, a divergence, he says, to positions held by *IPSO*. The flip side of this perspective would be another question, also present in Dejours' work: why do people not have crises more often?; cf. Dejours 2009f, pp. 42. 44.
- 1766 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 113fn.
- 1767 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 122.
- 1768 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 126, cf. Dejours 2001a, p. 124
- 1769 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 127
- 1770 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 135; p. 112; p. 118f.
- 1771 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 148; p. 131.
- 1772 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 143; Dejours 2009c 1: p. 150.
- 1773 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 147f.; Dejours 2004d, p. 72f.
- 1774 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 143; Dejours 2009c 1: p. 150. Also see Dejours 2010e.
- 1775 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 151.
- 1776 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 148f.
- 1777 Dejours 2010e; cf Dejours 2011a, p. 36.
- 1778 Dejours 2009c 1, p. 186; Dejours 2001a, pp. 183ff.; Freud's *Bemächtigungstrieb*, commonly translated into English as the 'instinct of mastery'.
- 1779 Dejours 2001a, p. 134; Dejours 2001a, p. 184
- 1780 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 140; p. 143; Dejours 2004d, p. 76; Dejours 1988a, p. 167f.; cf. Dejours 2009c 1: p. 140f.
- 1781 Dejours 2001a, p. 156; Dejours 2001a, p. 186; p. 192.
- 1782 Dejours 2001a, p. 181; Dejours 2001a, p. 121f.

- 1783 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 151.
- 1784 Cf. Dejours 2010e; Dejours 2006a, p. 193 'What is missing in the text Freud's [on the psychology of the masses] is a theory of domination, the men's domination of other men and men's domination of women'.
- 1785 Dejours 2002b, p. 37.
- 1786 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 154.
- 1787 Dejours 2015a, p. 159; Dejours 2004d, p. 74.
- 1788 Dejours 2015a, p. 160f.
- 1789 Dejours 2015a, p. 163: 'the translation made by the infant depends fundamentally on his/her own genius'; cf. Dejours 2010e;
- 1790 Dejours 2015a, p. 166; p. 165: it is not society, in the abstract, that assigns but a concrete environment. The assignation of gender, registered as a civic act, precedes the experience of his/her sex by the child, Dejours 2016c, p. 21f.
- 1791 Dejours 2015a, p. 167. Messer 2013 speaks of 'maternal work'.
- 1792 Dejours 2015a, p. 169; Messer 2013, p. 15.
- 1793 Dejours 2015a, p. 170.
- 1794 Dejours 2010b, p. 82: '*l'irréductibilité du social au sexuel*'.
- 1795 Dejours 2010b, p. 84f.; cf. p. 88.
- 1796 Dejours 2010b, pp. 74. 83. 96ff.; Dejours 2015c, p. 283: social recognition is gendered.
- 1797 Dejours 2010b, pp. 103. 106. 'Listening', Dejours writes, 'is an acquired disposition, which has to go through an oscillation between elaboration and a confrontation with concept and theory, between interpretation and construction.' (p. 106). Cf. Dejours 2012a, p. 83f; Ganem, Gernet and Dejours 2008, p. 802; Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 77; Dejours 1988a, pp. 173-175; Hirata in Hirata and Kergoat 1988, pp. 161ff.; Dejours 1987a, p. 63.
- 1798 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 143; Dejours 1988a, p. 167. Dejours 1987a, p. 65f. relates that in France, at the time, practically all women who have a third child, whatever their social station, exit the labour market. The decision to do so is often connected to gender relations at the workplace. Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 32 emphasise the importance of an acceptable identity, shored up by work as '*l'armature de la santé mentale*'.
- 1799 Dejours 2015c, p. 277.
- 1800 Dejours 2015c, p. 278; also see Dejours 2000b, p. 34 work is a central mediator between the unconscious and the social sphere.
- 1801 Dejours 2015c, p. 279: '*Le réel c'est ce qui se fait connaître à celui qui travaille par sa résistance à la maîtrise.*'
- 1802 Dejours 2016b, p. 130.
- 1803 Dejours 2016b, p. 127; cf. p. 131.
- 1804 Dejours 2016b, p. 135.
- 1805 Dejours 2015c, p. 279; Dejours 2016b, p. 135.
- 1806 Dejours 2015c, p. 281. Dejours 2012c[1993], p. 223: 'As a consequence of the primordial gap between prescription and reality, cooperation is inherently impossible to define beforehand. ... For this reason, any attempts to dictate it results in a paradoxical command.' Work cannot be understood if the intersubjective dimension is neglected: Dejours 1993a, p. 148. Dejours 2013b, p. 17 points out that two (or more) heads are better than one in finding out what needs to be done: '*la supériorité des regards croisés sur le procès de travail par comparaison avec le travail dans la solitude est incommensurable.*'
- 1807 Dejours 2017a, pp. 188. 191; Dejours 2009c 1: p. 164; Dejours 2015c, p. 283; Dejours 2015d, p. 289; Gernet and Dejours 2009, pp. 28. 30. 32; Dejours 2003, p. 236; Dejours 1993a, p. 167; Dejours 1987a, p. 67; Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 103f.; cf. Dejours 2006a, p. 202: 'Finding solutions, inventing new ways involves a self-transformation in depth.' Dejours 1987a, p. 61 points to the importance of the community to which one belongs by virtue of one's work.
- 1808 Dejours 1999b; cf. Dejours 2007a, p. 25; cf. Tweedie 2011, p. 340.
- 1809 Cf. Dejours 2015c, p. 285; Dejours 2017a, p. 176f.
- 1810 Cf. Dejours 2006d, p. 54.
- 1811 Dejours refers to cases in point from among those employed in the slaughterhouse or in the mortuary, but also in law enforcement. Their jobs permit them to channel sadism without having to take cognizance of it and to live at peace with this in the other compartments of their lives, Dejours 2001a, p. 127f. Not always there is a strong personal proclivity to begin with. In Dejours 2017b, the author opens his reflections with the question what it takes to turn an ordinary human being into a torturer (p. 42). He concludes that in the daily social life of ordinary individual, reservoirs of destructivity lodged in the amental unconscious rest dormant and invisible (p. 47). It can be activated by certain conjunctures in public life (p. 43f.).
- 1812 Cf. Dejours 2010d, p. 39.
- 1813 Dejours 2010d, p. 32.

- 1814 Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, pp. 82-84 point out that a defensive strategy usually transforms the perception of constraints experienced at work by making light of them. Individual and collective strategies of defence share the feature of producing denial of the perception of what it is that causes suffering, Dejours 2009e, p. 291.
- 1815 Dejours 2009c 2: pp. 60-62; Dejours 2000b, p. 38; Dejours 1998a, pp. 42-44; 148-150.
- 1816 Rolo and Dejours 2015, p. 246: '...the worker does not show pain, he does not stop because there is a wound, or something hit him and left a bruise, or he fell but did not break anything; he takes it on the chin with grand gesture, or by staying silent without protest, without a pause or in self-pity, and, in the end, without complaint. Faced with risks, he displays unconcern, disdain and indifference'. 'There is [also] a veritable coercion to drink, imposed by the collective of defence and the duty of solidarity in the face of adversity or the harshness of work or the mission.' Rolo and Dejours 2015, p. 247. Defensive strategies are not a prerogative of the working classes. Rolo and Dejours 2015, pp. 250f. 252 point out that studies show that strategies of collective defence privileging affective impoverishment and the inhibition of imaginative thought form part of the education of the higher cadres in the preparatory classes for the *Grandes Écoles*. There is, Dejours 2013b, p. 11f. points out, a difference between a collective and a group. A collective, to simplify his argument, entails more permanent arrangements and procedures than a group; cf. Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 29.
- 1817 Dejours 2010c, p. 146; cf. Dejours 1998a, p. 149f.; Dejours 2009c 2: p. 62; cf. Dejours 2012a, p. 30.
- 1818 Cf. Dejours 1998a, p. 123; Dejours 2008a(2000), p. 29. Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 72 speak of a possible psychopathology of normality; Dejours 1993a, p. 150: the concept of "suffering normality". Dejours 2005b, p. 27f. argues that the task of psychosomatics is not so much why we succumb to illness but rather how we manage not to fall sick, or fallen sick, stabilise a lot of the time in spite of sub-optimal conditions. In Dejours 2006b, an interview, he recalls early memories. At the age of ten he had the opportunity to visit a sugar refinery in Belgium: 'The first thing I noticed upon entering was the smell. And then I got a look at the guys who were working. There were a number of older people, and, in particular, a man whose task it was to put the sugar into bags. He was pinned to his machine, receiving [all the time] jute sacks, a window behind him, and it went on like this all day. There I came up against the shock of repetitive work. And more: I saw his head, his face: a masque of suffering. The question which I asked myself then, in a few words, was: how does he manage to hold out? And we looked at each other. I remember this very well.'
- 1819 Dejours 2012a, p. 143f.
- 1820 Cf. Dejours 1998a, p. 57; Dejours 2007a, p. 23; p. 75; also Dejours 2008c, p. 51f.; p. 54.
- 1821 Cf. Dejours 2010c, p. 155; Dejours 2012a, p. 177; Dejours 1998a, p. 58; Dejours 2008a, p. 91f. The trajectories of aggression that will not liaison with desire, one has to conclude, are regularly affected by the organisation of labour, the implications of gender and the vicissitudes of domestic arrangements.
- 1822 Dejours 2010c, p. 149; Rau 2009, p. 72; cf. Dejours 1992a, p. 137; also see the comment on Dejours' thought in: Messer 2010, p. 77f.; cf. Dejours 1999, p. 24f. Enforced solitude renders fragile; conversely, if people do not fall sick frequently, it is others who help them not to, Dejours 2015d, p. 287; Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 33. As Van Belleghem, de Gasparo and Gaillard 2014, p. 35 put it: 'psychosocial disorders emerge precisely when the psychosocial dimension is not – or is no longer – recognised in its positive aspects by the work organization'
- 1823 Dejours 2017a, p. 177f.; Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 81; Dejours 1993a, p. 154; Dejours 2003, p. 231. Dejours 1994, p. 94: what is it that permits some people to stay in health in the face of health hazards to which others succumb?, a question also raised in Dejours 2009f, p. 42.
- 1824 See Dejours 2004b, pp. 244f. 253.
- 1825 Cf. Dejours 2008a, p. 139; p. 149.
- 1826 Torrente 2004, p. 117.
- 1827 Reminiscent of Giulio Andreotti's quip '*Il potere logora chi non ce l'ha*' [Power wears out those who do not have it]. Andreotti 2011, sets this phrase into a 1951 political context.
- 1828 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 186; Dejours 2000b, p. 36f.: this is leading to '*la souffrance éthique*' an injury to one's well being expressed in the integrity of one's convictions. Becoming complicit in what is fundamentally unjust is different from perversion or paranoia (p. 37; also see Dejours 2001b, p. 23). What strikes an outside observer as madness, we may conclude, does not automatically equal psychosis. Dejours underlines that harassment [*le harcèlement*], if it happens, is often a public spectacle turning those who do not interfere into accessories to the scene, see Dejours 2017b, pp. 42f. 44. What makes things worse is the sense of betrayal and isolation felt by the victims, Dejours and Bègue 2009, p. 45f.; Dejours 2014, p. 31; Dejours 2007c, p. 270 '*les pathologies du harcèlement sont, avant tout, des pathologies de la solitude.*'; Dejours 2001b, p. 21.
- 1829 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 186f; cf. Dejours 2009e, p. 294; Dejours 2000b, p. 39. On harassment at the job plain for all to see: Dejours 2006a, p. 194f. Also see the illuminating contribution Oksenberg Rorty 1986/1980 on 'Self-deception, akrasia and irrationality', [not mentioned by Dejours] an essay in which, in one passage, she addresses something close to the *opérateur* (p. 122f.): 'When the agent is conflicted or debilitated, he lacks a reigning occurrent desire. So he turns himself into what we might call the lower gear of standard operating

- procedures, of a large variety of psychological processes, which can all roughly be characterized as habitual because they operate without the intervention of a current desire.'
- 1830 Dejours 2009c 1: p. 187; cf. Dejours 2009f, p. 41. This strategy may be pursued with zeal: Dejours 2000b, p. 36; also see: Demaegdt and Dejours 2016b, pp. 511ff. Defensive strategies are embedded into communities of belonging: 'It should be stressed that the denial of perception is in this case carried out collectively and that the new reality so constructed is the doing of a collective or rather of a whole community', Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 84. It is in keeping with the rest of his thought that Dejours does not believe that character neuroses - as Marty believed - predispose to somatic disease. Some of them seem to be very well protected against somatic disease, Dejours 1997, p. 65; Dejours 2009f, p. 42. We have seen Dejours ask the question 'How do people manage to hold out in the face of adversity?'. There is another one running through major parts of his work, underlined by Hélène Tessier 2003, p. 217: 'How do people manage to be bystanders to evil imposed on others without going insane?'; cf. Dejours 2001b, p. 25.
- 1831 De Bandt, Dejours, and Dubar 1995, p. 176 connect the loss of transformative hope on the part of the parents as regards to their job to cognitive problems of their children at school resulting from this.
- 1832 Dejours 2004d, p. 75: stability is bought at the price of an impoverishment of experience.
- 1833 Dejours 2007a, p. 119; Dejours 1998a, pp. 114; 119; 147.
- 1834 Dejours 2010e;
- 1835 Cf. Dejours and Gernet 2016, p. 68f.; Dejours 1988a, p. 168.
- 1836 Dejours 2012a, p. 84.
- 1837 Cf. Alderson, p. 248.
- 1838 Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 90. The reference is to Detienne and Vernant 1974.
- 1839 Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 91. In Dejours 2013b, p. 12 he writes: '*Pour surmonter les difficultés occasionnées par le réel, pour prévenir la déconvenue de leur irruption dans le cours de l'activité, les travailleurs inventent des ficelles, des bricolages, des bidouillages, des trucs, des coups de main, des ruses et des astuces grâce auxquels ils s'efforcent d'être en avance sur le réel ou, lorsque le réel s'impose, pour en surmonter, contourner, résoudre les impasses. Ce faisant, ils commettent des infractions aux prescriptions; ils trichent... pour bien faire, pour mieux faire, certes! Mais la tricherie pour cette raison doit être faite discrètement, voire secrètement*'. This is best done in cooperation in a team and there will be different styles in different collectives, Dejours 2013b, p. 13. For this to work the external stage of work and the internal stage of fantasy have to find points of contact, Dejours 2013b, pp. 14ff.; Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 92. It also helps if there is the right kind of public space inside a company, with management not in denial of the real challenges involved in the tasks to be accomplished, Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 93; cf. Ganem, Gernet and Dejours 2008, pp. 804. 806. If this space is destroyed, it turns people against each other, Dejours 2015d, p. 287; Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 34.
- 1840 Gernet and Dejours 2009, p. 29 put it like this: '*L'activité déontique repose toujours sur une activité normative et conduit à la formulation d'un compromis instable entre le respect des règles et leur possibilité de "subversion" par chacun des membres du collectif*'.
- 1841 Cf. Dejours 2015b, pp. 109. 111; Dejours 2014, p. 23; Dejours 1987a, p. 67: work as a force potentially subversive of the stationary weight of things; the antithesis of normopathy, Dejours 1987a, p. 66. Also see Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 71.
- 1842 Cf. Dejours 2009c 1: pp. 29-31; p. 165; Dejours and Deranty 2010, p. 171; Dejours 2012a, pp. 41. 68. 71f.; pp. 126-128. On ambiguity as a stimulus to the imagination: Dejours 1993b, p. 188. In one of his books Dejours uses an illustration concerning childminders [*assistantes maternelles*] employed to watch over around twenty very young children, some of them babies, to prevent any untoward event, including serious respiratory problems. There is always the fear among them to overlook a serious incident and the danger to fall asleep over the task. What they ought to do is to focus entirely on watching. What they are in fact doing is knitting: it is silent and it helps them to stay awake. The trick they invented helps them to be more mobile in their attention. Yet it may not be in keeping with official rules and has to be kept almost a secret among the personnel concerned, Dejours 2009c 1: p. 35. For a somewhat comparable practice of playing scrabble while 'listening' to the process in a petrochemical industrial plant: Dejours 1993b, pp. 179ff.
- 1843 Dejours 2012a, p. 69f.; Dejours 2006a, pp. 198. 200f.; Bokanowski 1997, p. 38f.
- 1844 Angella 2016, p. 10 [online] summing up Dejours' position writes, 'In other words, through engagement in this effort to tackle the "material" resistance of reality to our action – the adjective "material" referring precisely to this opposition of exteriority to our effort – subjectivity is able to enrich itself and flourish'.
- 1845 Cf. Dejours 1993b, 174.
- 1846 Dejours and Abdoucheli 1990, p. 95. cf. pp. 101. 103; Dejours 2007c, p. 275; Dejours 1993b, p. 192; Dejours 1992a, p. 132. In Dejours' view, suffering is a starting point of a potential movement towards the world, Dejours 1998b, p. 224; cf. Dejours 2002c, p. 82. The way Dejours describes work has resemblances to the extreme sportsmen and women delineated by Szwec except for the different register of expression and social links they employ: '... if working consists at first - - in a relationship of the subject to itself in the search for

- situations where it can experience and accomplish itself, concrete work is only accessible in a relationship where domination is exercised.', Dejours 1998b, p. 225. The psychodynamics of work attempts to assess which kind of organisation of work is beneficial to the development of the subject and which is conducive to alienation, Dejours 1998b, p. 226.
- 1847 At the time Jacques Press, member of the Swiss Society, member of *IPSO*, was also president of *AGEPSO* (*l'Association genevoise de psychosomatique*), cf. 'Les auteurs', p. 170. For some of the antecedents see Nicolaïdis and Press 2004. These days Jacques Press is chair of the working party on psychosomatics within the European Federation of Psychoanalysis, Press 2016b, p. 792.
- 1848 Press 2008b.
- 1849 Press 2010a.
- 1850 Press 2008b, p. 1307/08; Press 2010a, p. 225; cf. Press 2014a, p. 86; Press 2016b, p. 799; Press 2000f, p. 93. Press is aware of and agrees with Robert Stoller's position on the use of sexual excitement in the service of the retroactive mastery of traumatic impressions Press 2012b, p. 1473; Press 2005b, [no pagination]; Press 1999b, pp. 176. 198; cf. p. 74; Press 1998a, p. 125.
- 1851 Press 2005a, pp. 57-59; Press 2010a, pp. 93. 244; Press 2005c, p. 70; cf. Press 2008b, p. 1293; Press 2006b, p. 17fn.1; Press 2001b, p. 53f.; Press 1999a, p. 43; cf. Ferenczi 1985, pp. 307ff. 329; Press 1999b, p. 83 points out the consequences of this position: 'This is to say that deep within and underlying every activity of representation, there is, within its folds, a traumatic element, but conversely, there would not be representative activity, no thought activity, without this traumatic element. Hatred of displeasure inflicted assists at the birth of object perception', Ferenczi 1926, p. 84fn.1; p. 89f.
- 1852 Press 2005a, p. 57; Ferenczi 1926, p. 96.
- 1853 Ferenczi 1926, p. 95 suggests that, in analogy to the healing of organic injuries, libido rushes towards the areas in which the autotomy has left a wound; cf. Press 2005a, p. 58; Ferenczi 1926, p. 97; for another angle: Press 1999b, pp. 19f. 91. 93.
- 1854 Press 2008b, p. 1293; Ferenczi 1926, p. 97: 'the strange thing about this self-destruction is, however, that in this instance.....destruction really sets into motion becoming [*die Destruktion tatsächlich "Ursache des Werdens" wird*]; cf. Ferenczi 1985, p. 107f.; Ferenczi 1930, p. 219.
- 1855 Press 2010a, p. 93; Press 2005a, p. 58; Press 2001b, p. 50; Ferenczi 1932, p. 518f.
- 1856 Press 2005a, p. 59; Ferenczi 1932, pp. 517f. 520f. 523.
- 1857 Press 2010a, p. 91; Press 2005a, p. 59f.; Ferenczi 1932, p. 520; Ferenczi 1931c, p. 251; Ferenczi 1985, p. 328.
- 1858 Press 2005a, p. 59f.; cf. Ferenczi 1934, p. 9; Ferenczi 1932, p. 522f.; Ferenczi 1931a, pp. 501ff.; Ferenczi 1931c, p. 251; Ferenczi 1923. In this mode of functioning what is traumatic entertains intimate links to the *pulsionnelle* in a raw form, see: Press 2010a, p. 194; Press 2008b, pp. 1297. 1319; Press 2005a, p. 62; Press 2003b, p. 1628; Press reminds us of Fain's concept of the *sensorialité primaire* that continues to irradiate if not transformed by the *censure de l'amante*, Press 2008b, p. 1294; cf. 2011d, p. 667.
- 1859 Press 2010a, pp. 42. 91. 194f.; Press 2005a, p. 60; Press 2007b, p. 789; Ferenczi 1985, pp. 330. 360ff. A repetition of traumas may lead to further splintering and even atomisation, Press 2005a, p. 59; Ferenczi 1932, p. 523; Ferenczi 1985, pp. 107ff.
- 1860 Press 2003b, p. 1628.
- 1861 Press 2003b, p. 1628.
- 1862 Press 2005a, p. 60: '*le trauma se pulsionnalise*'.
- 1863 Press 2005a, p. 60; Press 2003a, p. 152.
- 1864 Press 2005a, p. 63f.
- 1865 Press 2011d, p. 667; this has to be tackled before the content of fantasies can be tackled in a meaningful way: Press 2011c, p. 181; on the role of secrets in the family: Press 1997e, p. 112, and Press 1999c, p. 73, where on p. 75 he stresses transgenerational influences; also see Press 2016b, p. 797. Nigolian and Press 2018, p. 9 remind the reader that a baby is also '*enfant-fantôme*', object of the transgenerational transmission of beliefs, of secrets, of crypts, of delirious states, or of denials of the past...'
- 1866 Press 2010a, pp. 92. 105; Press 2005a, p. 60f.; on patients practically ingested in phagocytosis by dead objects: Press 1999b, pp. 161. 162f.; Press 1998g, p. 122 speaks of a construction that carries in itself the germs of disorganisation. Press 1997e, p. 117 stresses the difference between a situation where everything seems to be built on sand to the grain of sand around which form coalesces.
- 1867 Press 2010a, p. 78; Press 2007b, p. 789.
- 1868 In Freud's letter to Arnold Zweig from December 20, 1937 he writes about Austria, '*Die Regierung hier ist eine andere, aber das Volk ist dasselbe, in der Anbetung des Antisemitismus durchaus einig mit den Brüdern im Reich.*' [The government here is a different one, but the people is the same, quite in agreement in its adoration of antisemitism with its brethren in the *Reich*] (Freud E.L. 1968, p. 163); cf. Grubrich-Simitis 1991/1994, pp. 35f.41f. Also see Botella, S. 2018, p. 503f.
- 1869 Press 2010a, pp. 30ff.; Press 2007b, p. 783f.; cf. Grubrich-Simitis 1991/1994, p. 67f.; as Press 2010a, p. 29 observes, the ebb in productivity is easier to follow in the French edition of Freud's work, because it is made

- available in strictly chronological order there, which is not the procedure followed by either the *Standard Edition* or the *Gesammelte Werke*.
- 1870 See letters from 30.9.1934, 16.12.1934, 13.2.1935, 14.3.1935, 2.5.1935, 13.6.1935, 20.1.1936, 2.4.1937, 28.6.1938, 5.3.1939 in Freud, E.L. 1968, pp. 102, 108f. 112f. 114f. 117f. 129f. 150. 172. 186.
- 1871 Press 2007b, pp. 784. 790. 798; Press 2003b, p. 1626.
- 1872 Cf. Press 2007b, pp. 790. 798.
- 1873 Press 2007b, p. 791.
- 1874 Press 2007b, p. 791f.; Press 2006a, p. 526.
- 1875 Press 2007b, p. 792.
- 1876 To which he himself responds in Assmann 2010 [2003], pp. 5-7 and *passim*. It is worth noting that Assmann in 2010, p. 86 explicitly stated that he no longer held the view - expressed in Assmann 1997, the work on which Press bases his reflections - that Freud wanted to abolish the "Mosaic distinction", see the remark in Press 2006a, p. 527, which expresses assent to Assmann's earlier positions; cf. Press 2010a, p. 46f. Assmann explains this rethinking: '...a view that I no longer believe to be tenable today, especially since reading Richard Bernstein's *Freud and the Legacy of Moses*' [Bernstein 1998] I now think that Freud was trying, on the contrary, to present the Mosaic distinction (in the form of the ban on graven images) as a seminal, immensely valuable, and profoundly Jewish achievement, which ought on no account to be relinquished, and that his own psychoanalysis could credit itself precisely with taking this specifically Jewish type of progress a step further', Assmann 2010 [2003], p. 86, a development to which Bernstein responds in Bernstein 2013, see in particular fns.13 and 14, p. 208.
- 1877 Cf., in a somewhat similar vein, Press 2010a, p. 23: 'Without doubt this partition is at the same time constitutive of our being. Equally without doubt, the work which permits us to "become who we [already] are" is one by which we approach, as far as is possible, the rims of this split, thus finding a creative solution for it'.
- 1878 Ferenczi 1931c, p. 250.
- 1879 Press 2007b, p. 794; Press 2006a, p. 528; Assmann 1997, p. 26; cf. Assmann 1997, p. 63.
- 1880 Cf. Assmann 1997, p. 25.
- 1881 Cf. Assmann 1997, pp. 14f. 25. 27f.
- 1882 Assmann 1997, p. 28.
- 1883 Assmann 2001, p. 56; Assmann explains the French edition is based on the German book published in modified form one year after the English version: Assmann 2001, p. 13.
- 1884 Cf. Assmann 2006, p. 67f.; Assmann 1988, pp. 9-13; also see: Olick 2008, pp. 1. 5. 14ff.
- 1885 Press 2010a, pp. 1ff.
- 1886 Press 2010a, pp. 1-7; pp. 118ff.; Press 2007b, p. 795; Press 2006a, p. 529: 'to extrapolate from the collective to the individual and to transpose the reflections of Assmann on collective memory to our daily psychoanalytic practice.'
- 1887 Press 2010a, pp. 49ff.; Press 2007b, p. 795.
- 1888 Cf. Press 2010a, pp. 51ff.; also see Press 1999b, p. 64f.
- 1889 Press 2007b, p. 796. It is worth noting, in passing, that - in Assmann's account, at least - this attack on linking is initiated by society and not by the individual. The processes by which the individual becomes englobed in this collective movement deserve to be elucidated. Cultural upheaval that attacks the means of representation may not always provide a personalised field, comparable to early childhood, in which an identification with an aggressor can be thought to flourish. There may not be a clear sense who the subject is mistreated by if things fall apart in a major way, nor who is going to be top dog in the ensuing mayhem.
- 1890 Press 2010a, p. 197, cf. p. 72; Press 2008b, p. 1297f.
- 1891 Press 1999b, pp. 105.227; cf. Press 2010a, p. 201; Press 2010c, p. 39; Press 1997c, pp. 56f. 58f.
- 1892 Press 2007b, p. 796; Press 2006a, p. 530; Press 1999b, p. 208; Winnicott 1965, Winnicott 1974.
- 1893 Press 2008b, p. 1283. cf. Freud 1916-1917, p. 445: 'Now, however, you will ask whether it is possible that we shall succeed in subsuming all the disturbances of the narcissistic illnesses and of the psychoses under the libido theory, whether we look upon the libidinal factor in mental life as universally guilty of the causation of illness, and need never attribute the responsibility for it to changes in the functioning of the self-preservative instinct. Well, Ladies and Gentlemen, this question seems to me to call for no urgent reply, and, above all, not to be ripe for judgement. We can confidently leave it over in expectation of the progress of our scientific work.' (quoted according to the Standard Edition, volume 16, p. 429). There are indications of second thoughts in Freud 1940 [1938], p. 106: 'There are some neurotics in whom, to judge by all their reactions, the instinct of self-preservation has actually been reversed....Patients of this kind are not able to tolerate recovery through our treatment and fight against it with all their strength. But we must confess that this is a case which we have not yet succeeded in completely explaining' (quoted according to the Standard Edition, volume 23, p. 180).
- 1894 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 80.

- 1895 Press 2008b, p. 1283; cf. Press 2010a, p. 87; see the crossroads referred to in Press 2000e, p. 21 and Press 1999b, p. 54f.
- 1896 Press 2012b, p. 1472f.; Press 2004c, p. 59; Freud 1924, p. 376; Freud 1913, p. 451.
- 1897 Press 2008a, p. 34; Press 1999b, p. 37: changes of emphasis against a changed conceptual background: while the unconscious of the First Topography works under the constancy principle, the id of the Second Topography obeys the principle of inertia; cf. Press 1997b, p. 1712fn.1.
- 1898 Press 2004c, p. 59; cf. Press 2010e, p. 136.
- 1899 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 211; Press 2004c, p. 59; cf. Press 2013b, p. 193f.
- 1900 Press 2008b, p. 1313; Press 2005a, p. 52; cf. Press 2010a, pp. 82. 84; Press 1999b, p. 52f.
- 1901 Press 2010a, p. 145; Press 2008c, p. 164f.
- 1902 Press 2011b, p. 59; Winnicott 1962, p. 61.
- 1903 Press 2010a, p. 179; cf. p. 198f.; Winnicott 1965 [1962], p. 61.
- 1904 Press 2010a, p. 180, in reference to Winnicott 1955 [1954]b, first published in French in the *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* Winnicott 1955 [1954]c. This may be linked to a sterile activity of fantasising carefully kept apart from real life, Press 2010b, p. 174; Press 2001c, pp. 19ff.
- 1905 Press 2010a, p. 180f. Press is intrigued by Winnicott's 'Metapsychological and clinical aspects of regression within the psychoanalytical set-up', Winnicott 1955 [1954]a, which Press regards as one of the most important contributions of post-Freudian psychoanalytic literature, Press 2010a, p. 168; Press 2008b, p. 1285; Press 2003a, p. 149f.; 2001b, p. 45.
- 1906 Whom he regards as his *maîtres*, Press 2014c, pp. 453ff. 457; Press 2008b, pp. 1272. 1312; Press 2005a, p. 51; Press 1999b, p. 15f.
- 1907 Press 2015a, p. 74; Press 2010a, p. 242; Press 2008b, p. 1313; cf. Press 2000f, p. 97.
- 1908 Press 2015a, p. 74; cf. Press 2016b, p. 800.
- 1909 Winnicott 1974; Press 2010a, p. 242; Press 2008b, p. 1313; cf. Press 2015a, p. 74. Reading Winnicott, Press confesses in one of his recent papers, has profoundly changed the way he thinks about some of the concepts established by Marty and Fain, Press 2015a, p. 65; cf. Press 2002b, p. 15.
- 1910 Press 2008b, p. 1285f.; cf. Press 2010c, p. 46f.; Press 1999b, p. 55; Fain 1995a.
- 1911 Press 2004a, p. 160; cf. also Press 2015c, p. 1598; Press 2012b, pp. 1471. 1474; Press 2010a, p. 266; Press 2009a, p. 147; Press 2008b, p. 1322; see also Press 2015c, p. 1600 and Press 2015a, p. 68: at times not far removed from behaviour reminiscent of the exhibitionism of an alms seeking supplicant.
- 1912 Winnicott 1955 [1954]a, p. 281: 'One has to include in one's theory of the development of a human being the idea that it is normal and healthy for the individual to be able to defend the self against specific environmental failure by a freezing of the failure situation. Along with this goes an unconscious assumption (which can become a conscious hope) that opportunity will occur at a later date for a renewed experience in which the failure situation will be able to be unfrozen and re-experienced, with the individual in a regressed state, in an environment that is making adequate adaptation'; cf. Press 2000f, p. 93.
- 1913 Cf. Press 2015a, p. 69f.
- 1914 Press 2015a, p. 71f.; Winnicott 1989[1968].
- 1915 Winnicott 1989[1969]; Press 2015a, p. 72, cf. p. 66.
- 1916 Cf. also Press 2007c, p. 56.
- 1917 Cf. Press 2015b, p. 1132.
- 1918 Press 2015a, p. 73.
- 1919 Press 2015a, p. 73, cf p. 76; Winnicott 1971, p. 123.
- 1920 Press 2010a, p. 188; cf. p. 47; in reference to Freud 1920, p. 52; also see Press 2008b, p. 1294; Press 2007a, p. 1530; Press 2007b, p. 793; Press 2006b, p. 9.
- 1921 Press 2008a, p. 13, emphasising the importance of a book of de M'Uzan's in this decision; in Press 1998d, p. 5 he acknowledges the importance of the seminar organised by Nicos Nicolaïdis in Geneva.
- 1922 Press 2012a.
- 1923 Press 2012a, p. 35f.; a full biography of Ferenczi is still waiting to be written, as Press, citing a personal communication from André Haynal, reminds us 2012a, p. 36.
- 1924 Press 2012a, p. 39.
- 1925 Press 2012a, p. 39.
- 1926 Press 2012a, pp. 36. 43f. 47f. Press sees signs of what Marty termed a *dépression essentielle* (see Chapter 4), a French concept which in Old English would have been rendered like this: '*Ne mæg werig mod/wyrde wiðstondan/ne se hreo hyge/helpe gefremman*': No weary mind may stand against Weird [Fate, Destiny, etymologically linked to Becoming]/Nor may a wrecked will work new hope'. The Wanderer, second half of the first millenium C.E, line 15ff. translation by Michael Alexander: The Wanderer Project, also see: Malone 1967/1948, pp. 83ff. On the difficulties presented by the word *wyrd* see Trahern 1991, pp. 162ff.
- 1927 Press 2012a, p. 48, echoing Dupont 2000, p. xxv [English edition, p. xxx]; see Press 2010a, p. 63; cf. also Ferenczi 1931b, p. 249; Ferenczi 1931d, p. 256; Ferenczi 1985, p. 309ff.

- 1928 Press 2012, p. 48; cf. Press 2007c, pp. 56.58; In a paradoxical effort to conserve whatever hope is available: Many patients, who present with severe somatisations, - instances of disorganisation in Marty's terminology – have lost hope, or have not [ever] really come up with it, and they have not been able to constitute a zone of withdrawal where they can at least be alone with themselves, Press 2007c, p. 61.
- 1929 A merely virile understanding of the libido, following in Freud's tracks, Press says, would be in conflictual neglect of this, Press 2010c, p. 43f.; Fain 1992b, p. 1111f.
- 1930 Fain 1992b, p. 1112; cf. Press 1999b, p. 232f.: turning the inchoate into something enigmatic: Press 1999b, pp. 82. 96. 197. 200.
- 1931 Cf. Fain 1992b, p. 1112f. When something is not there in shallow mental functioning, is it that it does not exist or rather that the conditions necessary for its advent have never been assembled?, Press 2015a, p. 67.
- 1932 Press 2010b, p. 165f.
- 1933 Press 2010b, p. 166.
- 1934 Press 2010b, pp. 170ff.; cf. Press 2013c; also see Press 2010a, p. 39 on manifest dream trappings liable to carry traumatic material; as Charbonnier 2008, p. 1356 puts it: the analyst constructs the past starting with the grain of sand of reality the analysand gives to see him in the actuality of transference.
- 1935 Cf. Press 2003a, p. 148.
- 1936 Cf. Press 2016b, p. 793; Press 2016d, pp. 203ff on the '*présence sensible*' - the manifest and responsive presence - needed; Press 2012b, p. 1476; Press 2010b, p. 176; Press 2010a, pp. 14. 265; Press 1999b, p. 166 on early hurt 'body to body'; on the difference to mere projective identification see Press 2010a, p. 96f.; cf. Press 2015a, p. 69; there is 'projective duplication' on the part of the analyst as well: Press 2016c, p. 120.
- 1937 Cf. Press 2016b, p. 794.
- 1938 Press 2011c, p. 179; Press 2010a, pp. 270ff.
- 1939 Press 2015b, p. 1125, in contrast to what Freud still believed to be a clear cut distinction between psychoanalytic technique, on the one hand, and hypnotic treatment by suggestion, on the other hand, see Freud 1905a, p. 17.
- 1940 Cf. Press 1999b, pp. 86f. 182.
- 1941 Cf. Press 2014c, p. 462; Press 2012b, p. 1475f.; Press 2010a, pp. 20. 270ff.; Press 2010b, p. 173.
- 1942 Cf. Press 2009a, pp. 145. 147; Press 2008b, p. 1311f.; Press 2004a, p. 162; Press 2001b, p. 40; Press 2000f, p. 95; cf. Press 2000e, p. 25, recognising a debt to Green.
- 1943 Press 2010b, pp. 175. 176. 179; cf. 2012b, p. 1475; cf. Press 2015a, p. 74; Press 2015c, p. 1600; Press 2016b, p. 800f.
- 1944 Press 2011c, p. 178; Press 2000e, p. 21; Press 1999b, pp. 22.141; Press 1997b, p. 1709f.; Press 1996, pp. 142f. 145. 153f.; see, more recently, Baruch 2009.
- 1945 Press 1999b, p. 29.
- 1946 Freud 1925 [1924], p. 8; quoted according to the Standard Edition; the French *OCF* translates the German '*verkostet haben*' as '*ont dégusté*', which comes much closer to the original than the English 'sampled' and appreciably informs Press 1999b, pp. 32. 106. 224.
- 1947 Cf. Press 2010b, p. 178; cf. p. 173: '*non un quelconque fonctionnaire de l'analyse*'.
- 1948 Press 2015a, p. 67f.; Press 2010a, pp. 23.69; cf. Press 2000f, p. 98. 99. See the subtitle Press 2015a, p. 66: '*patient déficitaire ou analyste défaillant?*'
- 1949 Press 2014c, p. 463; Press 2010a, pp. 10. 134. 141f.; Press 2009b, p. 1591f.; Press 2009a, p. 145; Press 2008c, p. 151f.; Press 2004b, p. 1682; Press 1999b, p. 9f.; despite his evident sympathies cf. Press 2011a, p. 16f.; Press 2009a, p. 148; Press 1998f, pp. 108ff.; Marty and Winnicott start from different angles: Winnicott was preoccupied with the psychic survival, Marty with the somatic survival of the patient: Press 2003a, p. 149; 'one could say that Pierre Marty's developments concentrated on patients that fled into psychic 'healing' but fell somatically sick in the pursuit of this project', Press 2003a, p. 151; cf. Press 2011c, p. 187.
- 1950 Press 2004c, p. 51; cf. Press 2006c, p. 83f.; not shying away from an active stance - Press 1999b, p. 234 – while at the same time aspiring to the prudence of the mine-clearer: Press 2000e, p. 25.
- 1951 Cf. Press 2010b, p. 178; Press 2009a, pp. 144f. 147; Press 2004a, p. 161; cf. Press 2006c, p. 86; see also Press 2010a, p. 64. Press' view seems to share some common territory with Ian Hacking's argument, condensed, for instance, in Hacking 2007, p. 293fn.21 of a looping effect created by 'interactions among classifications, people, institutions, knowledge and experts', to which he adds on p. 298 that 'it might be wise to replace 'experts' by Ludwik Fleck's *thought collective*, and the 'knowledge' by his *thought styles*'. On his position of 'dynamic nominalism', Hacking 2004, p. 279f.
- 1952 Press 2004a, p. 163; cf. Press 2013a, p. 33; Press 2011c, p. 173; Press 2010a, p. 166; Press 2009b, p. 1592; Press 2000e, p. 29: a sop to the lazy practitioner [*un oreiller de paresse*]; Press 1999b, p. 12: thoughtless assent as a subtle form of resistance, granting but specious solace to the practitioner when faced with patients who are massively disintegrating in their bodily states whilst in treatment (cf. Press 2001b, p. 40f; cf. Press 2010a, p. 161; Press 2004a, pp. 158f.160f. Press 2016c, p. 118 suggests that psychosomatic theory, as a whole, has stopped at K [in Bion's terms].

- 1953 Press 2004c, p. 47; de M'Uzan 2004, p. 61; a similar position was held by Green: Szwec 2015b, p. 10 in implicit reference to Green 1998, p. 31.
- 1954 Cf. Press 2004a, p. 161; denial, too, Press reminds us, is linked to modalities of perception: Press 1997b, p. 1710; cf. Press 2010c, p. 39.
- 1955 Press 2015c, p. 1600, in reference to Michel Fain's concept of a *pure culture d'instinct de mort*, Fain 1992d, p. 5, detrimental to the insomniac infant, cf. Press 2016b, p. 801; Press 2015a, p. 74; Press 2014c, pp. 454. 458; Press 2012b, p. 1472; Press 2010c, pp. 40.47; Press 1999b, p. 131f.; see also: Press 2005b, [no pagination] 'It is.... a lack of meaning and making sense involving the two partners in the relationship:Constructingis a matter of constructing a shared language which enables us to go beyond this inevitable and ineluctable misunderstanding which makes us strange and hostile to each other'.
- 1956 Press 2010a, p. 203f.; Parsons 1992, pp. 105. 109. 110f.
- 1957 Press 2012b, p. 1474; Press 2010a, p. 160f. refers to a passage from Winnicott 1955 [1954]a, p. 280: 'The treatment and management of this case has called on everything that I possess as a human being, as a psychoanalyst, and as a paediatrician. I have had to make personal growth in the course of this treatment which was painful and which I would gladly have avoided. In particular I have had to learn to examine my own technique whenever difficulties arose, and it has always turned out in the dozen or so resistance phases that the cause was in a counter-transference phenomenon which necessitated further self-analysis in the analyst'.
- 1958 Press 2001d, p. 137; for some of Press earlier clinical work presented in discussion with André Green see Press 1995c, in a slightly different version: Press 1998c, with Green's response Green 1995a, Green 1998/1995.
- 1959 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 137.
- 1960 Press 2008c, p. 153f.
- 1961 Press 2010a, pp. 11.137; Press 2009a, p. 148; Press 2008c, p. 160f.; Press 1999b, p. 12; Press 1998b, p. 1599; Press 2011a, pp. 16.18.
- 1962 Press 2010a, p. 138; Press 2008c, p. 154; Press 2009a, p. 149; cf. Press 1997a, p. 362. One of the consequences of this approach is that Marty does not use 'affect' as a point of reference: Press 1999b, p. 153.
- 1963 Cf. Press 2012b, p. 1473; Press 1999b, pp. 220ff.
- 1964 Press 2008c, p. 163.
- 1965 Press 2010a, p. 141f.; Press 2008c, p. 157.
- 1966 Press 2000e, p. 19; Press 1997b, p. 1718; cf. Press 1998b, p. 1591; Press 1998f, p. 115.
- 1967 Press 2000e, p. 19f.; cf. Press 2000f p. 95fn.1. External social norms can be of paramount importance leaving little room for a personal sense of culpability: Press 1999b, p. 157.
- 1968 Cf. Press 2008c, p. 161.
- 1969 Press 2008b, p. 1321; Press 2006c, p. 82.
- 1970 Press 2010a, p. 64f.; Press 2009a, p. 143; Press 2008b, p. 1272.
- 1971 Press 2010a, pp. 103. 109f; cf. p. 106f.; cf. Press 2011c, p. 174; Press uses the term '*générativité*' to refer to the dormant seeds of thought inherent in a situation or a teaching, Press 2010a, pp. 14f. 65. 183; Press 1998e, p. 84; cf. Goody 2003, pp. 29f. 97. 279, for the English version: Goody 1997, pp. 29. 84. 257.
- 1972 In a recent article Press pays tribute to the many different ways in which patients taught him to find paths in their treatment, Press 2018; cf. Press 2015a, p. 75; Press 2010a, p. 13: 'ten years previously I would, without doubt, not have been touched in the same way...!'
- 1973 Press 1995a, p. 180; Press 1995c, p. 31.
- 1974 Press 2001a, p. 91f.: '*dédouaner l'analyste des difficultés qu'il rencontre dans son contre-transfert*'; on the forces of disruption, whether conceptualised as *pulsion de mort* or not: Press 1999b, pp. 139f.140fn.10; also see Press 2000e, p. 25; Press 1997b, pp. 1712. 1717; Press 2010c, p. 43; Press 2010a, p. 66 agrees with Jean Guillaumin's (1989) skeptical look at the *pulsion de mort* as a possible prosthesis of theory (see p. 609f.) to deal with what is not turned into thought in countertransference; Press 2008b, p. 1321 an impasse may lead to a *dépression essentielle* and a *vie opératoire*, but this may not be a constant conjunction, see also Press 1999b, p. 13.
- 1975 Press 2008b, p. 1313; cf. Press 2010a, p. 165f.; Press 2008b, p. 1284; Press 2000f, p. 93; Press 1999b, p. 233; making place for what does not exist: Press 2010a, p. 10.
- 1976 Press 2010a, p. 256; Press 2008b, p. 1315.
- 1977 Cf. Press 2006b, p. 19; Press 2010c, p. 47; Press 2000e, p. 20.
- 1978 Press 2010a, p. 26.
- 1979 Press 2000f, p. 92f.
- 1980 Press 2000f, p. 92f.; Green 2004, who offers a different reading of the novella, p. 37 emphasises the dialectical relationship between the two protagonist: May, who has intuited the secret of John Mercer - his affective disability - becomes the depository of the enigma that is in him and which he cannot penetrate. 'Not understanding is his safest refuge', Green 2009, p. 24.
- 1981 Press 2000f, p. 97; cf. p. 96.

- 1982 Press 2000f, p. 98f. 101. 103. Also see Parsons 2014, pp. 99ff. in his account of the debate between John Steiner and Gregorio Kohon: withdrawing into a retreat may at time be needful, p. 100; cf. Kohon 2015, pp. 25ff.;
- 1983 Press 2000f, p. 97.
- 1984 Press 2018, p. 81.
- 1985 Press 1999b, pp. 71ff. 96; cf. pp. 55. 58. 60f. 141. 224f.; Press 2006b, p. 17: for a lack of the enigmatic in early interactions; also see Press 1997c, pp. 57. 60, and similarly Press 1998g, p. 125, where he emphasises that auto-theorising in the subject is contingent on the right kind of conditions; Press 2010e, p. 142 muses that in Winnicott's dictum '*d'être seul en presence de l'autre*' he would introduce a comma: '*être, seul en presence de l'autre*'. Press reflects that masochism is an unfortunate, misleading term which psychoanalysts apply to describe the ability of the child to digest potentially unsettling early experience while not cutting itself loose from early liaison, Press 1999b, p. 239, in implicit reference to Benno Rosenberg's seminal thought on '*masochisme gardien de vie*'; cf. Botella 2001, p. 189.
- 1986 Press 2003b, p. 1628; cf. Press 2010a, p. 253; Press 2008b, pp. 1315.1319; Press 2000e, p. 20; Press 1999b, p. 174fn.5: '*réprimer, c'est ... se parexciter soi-même*' [to suppress, is to provide a defensive shield against too much stimuli all on one's own].
- 1987 Press 2008c, p. 163; cf. Press 2015b, p. 1131; Press 2010a, pp. 260ff.; Press 2000e, p. 19; Press 1999b, p. 192; demand to gain psychoanalytic hearing may therefore be weak or non-existent: Press and Nigolian 2016, p. 8. Yet, as they add: a body apparently silent may in some kind of way "learn" to speak, Press and Nigolian 2016, p. 9.
- 1988 Press 1999b, p. 49 quotes Malcolm's words to Macduff: 'Give sorrow words. The grief that does not speak/Whispers the o'erfraught heart and bids it break', Macbeth, Act 4, Scene 3, 212-214.
- 1989 Press 1997e, pp. 105. 108.
- 1990 Press 1997e, pp. 112. 107; Press' term for the condition is '*manie essentielle*', in reference to Marty's *dépression essentielle* defined by behaviour bypassing mental representation, Press 1997e, p. 103.
- 1991 Press 1997e, p. 104. Press 1997e, p. 107 says, 'One could say that my patient exhausts herself by trying to maintain - and even more so to find again and establish again - favourable conditions [*des "conditions fastes"*] and that the elation is closely related to the sense of having been successful.' In the childhood and adolescence of those patients Press is thinking of there is often a sense of unbearable boredom together with something approaching inner fragmentation, Press 1997e, p. 113.
- 1992 Press 1997e, p. 105: 'I was, she said, like a machine that had no more petrol but that went on functioning regardless'; Press 1997e, p. 116: there is a manic *élan* 'en quête de forme', in search of form; p. 118fn.1: representation does not contribute to replenishing narcissistic resources; Press 1997c, p. 49 mentions Heraclitus' dictum: *Ethos anthropoi daimon* and Marcel Conche's translation: character, for the human being, is his/her destiny. Bernstein 1992 p. 87f. points out that Heidegger understood *ethos* as dwelling place, an interpretation that would be even closer to Press' concern for holding structures or the lack thereof.
- 1993 Sahlins 1985, p. 125; cf. p. xiv and p. 126: "'the intersection of two independent chains of causation'". Press p. 129 also points to a passage in Sahlins 1985, p. 152, where he explains that the "structure of the conjuncture" leads to a 'situational sociology of cultural categories, with the motivations it affords to risks of reference and innovations of sense'. Sahlins goes on saying 'The event is a happening interpreted - and interpretations vary' (p. 153) and 'What is for some people a radical event may appear to others as a date for lunch.'
- 1994 Press 2010a, p. 128f.; also see Sahlins 1982, p. 289ff.. Hacking 1999, pp. 207-223 discusses some of the controversies surrounding Sahlins' work on Cook's meeting with natives - to which Press refers - but emphasises, as Press does, that 'Interactions do not just happen. They happen within matrices, which include many obvious social elements and many obvious material ones', Hacking 1999, p. 31. Biersack 1989, pp. 84ff. provides further context to the debate, and explains (p. 86f.) that Sahlins' focus of interest is in how novelty arises from perturbations brought about by the 'structure of the conjuncture', which, as she points out (p. 89), finds a prolongation in the work of the British sociologist Anthony Giddens. Press 2016b, p. 798, although the passage does not contain a reference to him, shows how Sahlins fits into what Press learns from Winnicott: transformation does not come without a disruptive shock [*ébranlement*].
- 1995 Press 2010a, p. 130.
- 1996 Sahlins 1985, p. 149: 'The gamble is that referential action, by placing *a priori* concepts in correspondence with external objects, will imply some *unforeseen* effects that cannot be ignored' [emphasis in the original]....'One meaning is foregrounded, made salient by relation to all possible meanings.'
- 1997 Press 2010a, pp. 11.107; Press 2008b, p. 1276; cf. Press 2012b, p. 1475; Press 2010a, pp. 8; 127ff.; Press 2010f, p. 187; Press 2007a, p. 1531.
- 1998 Cf. Press 2002a, pp. 62f. 66; on the different dimensions of the frame: Press 2016b, p. 800; for this process derailed see Press 1999b, pp. 60. 63f. 65. 78. Where there is pain there may still be hope; where there is only behavioural defense against the impossibilities of regression, hyperactivity can only be regulated by alternating with total exhaustion, in a movement impervious to both pain and hope, cf. Press 2002a, p. 64f.; in

- the words of a patient: 'I was like a car that has no more petrol and keeps on running all the same', also see Press 1999b, p. 155.
- 1999 With a different emphasis from Marty, according more weight to the Second Topography, Press 1999b, p. 228. For a similar approach to Freud's theories of anxiety: Press 2011a, p. 12; also, more recently, Press 2013b, p. 194.
- 2000 Press 1999b, p. 37.
- 2001 Press 1999b, p. 105f.; Press 1996, p. 146f. Also see Press 2011c, p. 186: 'What we tend to consider as a default of symbolisation, as an obliteration [*un abrasement*] of affect, would equally have to be envisaged as the persistence, modified little or not at all, of a state of affairs which constantly articulates a situation of being overcharged to excess [*la situation de débordement*], without ever giving us the least indication of what this consists.'
- 2002 Cf. Scarfone 2013, p. 560f.; Scarfone 1997, pp. 63ff.; also see Hock 2007, p. 80f.
- 2003 Cf. Press 2005d, p. 128f.; Press 2016b, p. 796: if the id is a place of chaos beyond representation, psychoanalytic work entails a process of transformation.
- 2004 Press 1997c, p. 67 speaks of marks left [*le terme de marque ou de marquage*]. It is, in Press' view, the Second Topography that provides resources to think about this, in giving both the body and the role of the object their due in early development, Press 1999b, p. 45; Press 1999b, pp. 14. 24. 40; Press 1997c, p. 68.
- 2005 Press 1999b, p. 55; Press 1996, p. 140.
- 2006 the graphic image, which also serves as title to Press 1999b, is from Freud 1916-17 [1915-17], p. 406; see Press 1999b, pp. 7.72; cf. Press 2010a, p. 98; Press 2008b, p. 1294; Press 2005a, p. 61; Press 2003b, p. 1625; Press 1998b, p. 1594; Press 1997b, p. 1719.
- 2007 Cf. Press 2006b, p. 14.
- 2008 Press 1999b, pp. 69ff.; cf. pp. 74.183ff.208, also see Botella 2001, p. 186 - in review of Press 1999b - 'one does not flee from meaning, one tries to escape the noise - or the silence - that bursts the head', Press 1999b, p. 104; cf. Press 1998b, p. 1593.
- 2009 Press 2007b, pp. 791ff.; Press 2006a, p. 527f.; Press 2003b, p. 1631.
- 2010 Press 2006b, p. 19; Press 2005a, p. 60f.; if this grain of sand is not there it has to be constituted in psychoanalytic work: Press 2010a, p. 25.
- 2011 Freud 1934, p. 569.
- 2012 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 120.
- 2013 Cf. Press 2010a, pp. 35.56.120; Freud, E.L. 1968, pp. 102.108; Freud 1939 [1934-38], p. 190f. The necessity of construction is returned to in Freud 1937b when Freud discusses it as a tool when memory is not available and interpretation does not suffice to address the core of truth linked to early trauma, Press 2010a, pp. 66f.70ff.; Press 2007b, p. 798f.; Freud 1937b, pp. 45ff; also see Freud 1937a, p. 84 '*Deutungen und Konstruktionen*' [interpretations and constructions; emphasis mine].
- 2014 Press 2010a, p. 3 in reference to Didi-Hubermann 2002, p. 332f. but also in tacit accordance with Assmann's studies.
- 2015 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 73; Press 2007b, p. 799 moving on a narrow ridge between truth and delirium, historical truth and internal truth: Press 2010a, p. 7, as threatened in its epistemological status, one has to presume, as the account Freud gave of the historical Moses - Press 2010a, p. 124 - because, among other reasons, it has to include subjectively valid truth about what did not take place: Press 2010a, p. 169.
- 2016 Press 2015a, p. 66f. J.-B. Pontalis, in his preface to the French edition of Winnicott's *Playing and Reality* draws attention to the frequent use of -ing forms in the book, which do not lend themselves easily to adequate translation and lose their original flavour in French, thus 'playing' becomes '*jeu*' in the French title; Pontalis 1975, pp. 7-10. Pontalis also pertinently points out that the Freudian topography describes stages of development at which something very essential may - or may not - have previously come into being in the child, Pontalis 1975, p. 13; cf. also Press 2011c, p. 182. Press takes up Winnicott's words 'After being doing and being done to. But first, being', Winnicott 1971, p. 114, cf. p. 176; Press 2009b, p. 1597.
- 2017 Whom he mentions, not for the first time; previous references show awareness of Bollas' work. Press 2007a, pp. 1532. 1535 refers to *Forces of Destiny* (Bollas 1989) - appreciably germane to Press line of thought in 2013, see Abram 2007, p. 279; Press 1998a, p. 124 points to *Being a Character*, Bollas 1992.
- 2018 Press 2013c, [no pagination].
- 2019 Cf. Press 2011c, pp. 180ff.
- 2020 Cf. Press 2016c, p. 123; Press 2013b, p. 192f.; on formlessness also see Press 2010a, pp. 179ff.; Press 2016b, p. 798, where he quotes Winnicott 1974, p. 107: 'Only out of non-existence can existence start', a remark of Press' further down the page, taken up again the following page, may or may not be in reference to a well known dictum by Dōgen 1233, 'To study the self is to forget the self', or in Press' words: '*on peut aussi prendre le risque de se perdre pour avoir une chance de se trouver*'; Press 2016c, p. 116: what is formless should not be seen as merely disorganised but in quest of form, pointing to a future that has yet to come.
- 2021 Press 2011c, p. 191f.; Press 2009b, p. 1594f.

- 2022 '*Fait reste*', Press 2010a, p. 111; cf. Benjamin 1923 [1921], p. 15; cf. p. 18 pertinent to the change of style observable in Press 2013c: translation, instead of merely rendering the original, has to recreate its way of going about things within the flow of the new language.
- 2023 Benjamin 1923 [1921], p. 12. Trying to come to terms with the past, Press points out - finding rich food for thought in Didi-Hubermann's studies on the connections between Aby Warburg's thought and Freud - inevitably interferes with its *Nachleben*, 'afterlife' in the sense of continuing legacy; Press 2010a, p. 2fn.1 on Didi-Huberman 2002, p. 326; 7f. 118ff.; Press 2008b, pp. 1270. 1274; cf. Press 2005c, p. 74. While this has obvious connections to Freud's idea of *Nachträglichkeit* (*après coup*, although usually translated as 'afterwardsness' in Freud's German is closer to the colloquial 'on second thought'), it also tallies with Freud's reflections on latency in *Moses and Monotheism*, (Press 2010a, p. 54; Press 2007b, p. 796; Freud 1939 [1934-38], pp. 171ff.; cf. Didi-Hubermann 2002, p. 333f.) and Braunschweig and Fain's arguments in *La Nuit, le Jour* (Press 2010c, p. 41f.; cf. Press 2015c, p. 1596; Press 2014c, p. 453; Press 2012b, pp. 1471. 1475f.; Braunschweig and Fain 1975).
- 2024 Press 2009b, p. 1595; cf. Press 2014c, pp. 454.459; Press 2011d, p. 673.
- 2025 Press 2014c, p. 460.
- 2026 Press points to Walter Benjamin's words to the effect that every insight has to contain within itself a dram of the absurd to carry its own hallmark, Benjamin 1933b, p. 425; cf. Press 2011c, p. 188. Press 1997e, p. 120 emphasises something similar about descriptions of patients: in the light of the complexities of life and character they have to remain incomplete.
- 2027 Press 2010c, p. 47; cf. Press 2014c, p. 456; Press 2013b, p. 183.
- 2028 Press 2014c, p. 456; cf. Press 2010a, p. 149.
- 2029 Cf. Press 2014b, p. 173f.
- 2030 Press 2011c, p. 191.
- 2031 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 145; Press 2009a, p. 146; Press 2004a, p. 155ff.; Press 2001b, p. 48f.; Press 1998a, p. 123.
- 2032 Ribas 2008, p. 1343. Also see Nicolaïdis 2000b, p. 116 and Groarke 2010, p. 419: 'Disagreements notwithstanding, there is important common ground between Winnicott and these French analysts with respect to the nonrepresented experience of early trauma ("traumatic transference") and the concomitant emphasis on the analyst's "work of figurability" in amending and augmenting the associative field'.
- 2033 Press 2016c, p. 115, repeated p. 119 refers the reader to a passage in Bouvier 2014/1963, at the very end, p. 375: 'That day, I really thought to hold fast to something and that my life thereby would change. But nothing of this sort is ever definitely attained. Like water, the world passes through us and, for a time, lends us its colours. Then it withdraws, and places us again in front of this emptiness which we carry in us, in front of this kind of insufficiency right at the centre of the soul [*cette espèce d'insuffisance centrale de l'âme*] which we must learn to stay with, to fight, and which, paradoxically, may be our most reliable driving force'.
- 2034 Press 2011c, p. 171; Press 2010a, p. 59; Press 1999b, p. 72; Freud 1937a, pp. 64. 79.
- 2035 See Press 2017b, p. 17: [in reference to Winnicott, D.W. (1989 [1965])] '*Etat X qui est à la fois un état de détresse complète et qui, selon lui, contient en même temps l'essence de la vérité du sujet naissant.*'
- 2036 See also Press 2010d, p. 47 where he is quoting Ferenczi 1934, p. 8: '*Ein Eindruck der nicht wahrgenommen wird, kann auch nicht abgewehrt werden*' - 'An impression that has not been perceived, can by virtue of this not be defended against'.
- 2037 Press 1997c, p. 62; cf. p. 66; this point is also made by Botella, C. 2016, p. 187. An example from dystopian literature would be found in Aldous Huxley's *Brave New World*, in which downward differentiation is produced by a dosage of engineered deprivation at birth so that the subject can be cheated out of his or her full potential, Huxley 1932, chapters one and two. Also see Press 2016c, p. 118: how to know what is missing? Mellier 2017 looks at the concept of a '*niche de développement*' needed for the development of the child, in which various factors have to come together to make possible a satisfactory quality of life.
- 2038 Nicolaïdis and Nicolaïdis 1989, p. 77 offer the following word that does not exist but should: '*psychophthore*', for which they provide the definition: '*qui use ou corrompt l'âme*' and for which they provide the following example sentence: '*une ambiance particulièrement psychophthore pour les jeunes*'. This will provide an effect but may not be accompanied with a sensation. Mellier 2014, discusses the various concepts of psychic envelopes in early infancy. Although it does not directly address his article, it seems that a certain psychic envelope is required in relation to which a nocive event can then be experienced as a breach. Without this, what occurs may be toxic, and yet bypass the perception.
- 2039 Cf. Press 2003a, p. 149.
- 2040 Marc Slonim sums up provincial life, as portrayed by Chekhov, in the following words, 'They play cards, gossip, philander, drink vodka, and go to their offices without ever being able to overcome their ennui. The monotony of routine is a law of their existence: the same stupid parties, the same old jokes, the same compliments paid by the officers of the garrison to the pretty girls who will lose their prettiness after marriage, the same useless discussions about education and municipal affairs among the local intellectuals - the doctor, the druggist, the teacher and the judge. All are sick of their own emptiness, of their words and

- gestures, but they resume them again and again with exasperating regularity', Slonim 1962, p. 63. George Eliot [Mary Ann Evans] puts it like this: '... and it seemed to him as if he were beholding in a magic panorama a future where he himself was sliding into that pleasureless yielding to the small solicitations of circumstance, which is a commoner history of perdition than any single momentous bargain', Eliot 1965 [1871-72], p. 840f. cf. p. 174. Interestingly, Fain once mentioned that more than one *opérateur* patient he had met was an ex-militant who had given up on his previous commitment, lost his group of reference, and one would assume, thereby any vestige of transformatory hope he had previously possessed (Fain 2001b, p. 16).
- 2041 Fain 1982, p. 132; for the *opérateur* as a sign of a non-hope, rather than despair Press 2001a, p. 92: 'an impossibility to think that things could happen in any other way'.
- 2042 Cf. Press 1998g, p. 116, with a reference to Fain's prelude to the development of fantasy but without mentioning his quip on the 'evil fairy' in a passage which links Marty's demoralisation to the effect of repetition compulsion further down the line.
- 2043 Cf. Press 2016c, pp. 123. 124f. Press 2018, p. 81 writes, 'my [personal] journey has led me to throw a different glance at the question of the negative and to envisage it not only as the product of a work [of the negative; as Green suggested] but also as the trace *'d'un non advenu'* [of what did not happen]'. Damage control with means available may add to the problem: Picard 2009, p. 82 applying to the study of Nicolas de Staël a thought taken from Jacques Press, writes, 'is he not in the process of fighting desperately so as to provide borders to [*pour délimiter*] that which Jacques Press calls the "core" of what we cannot live'.
- 2044 de M'Uzan 1994, p. 115; Raymond 1816 [1757].
- 2045 Cf. Press 2003a, p. 151.
- 2046 Cf. Press 2010a, p. 145; Press 2016b, p. 802 gives a new turn to the concept of projective reduplication: If the *opérateur* patient, as Marty and his colleagues pointed out, appears to assume others are exactly the same as him/her: what is the difficulty of the analyst to come to terms with and bear the inner echo of this lack of differentiation? also see Press 2000f, p. 91: on *"tordre le bâton dans l'autre sens"*, taking an idea and spinning it into the opposite direction. When Press (2010a, p. 100; cf. p. 130) suggests that every analysis that does not change the analyst is wasted, he also seems to worry that psychoanalysis could become a perfunctory 'business as usual' devoid of any deeper impact.
- 2047 Press 2000f, p. 91.
- 2048 See for instance Press 2000f, p. 103: 'The point that I am defending here shifts the emphasis and places it on the relational play which we maintain with the patient'. Press 2013d, p. 8 draws attention to the relational epistemology of Michel Bitbol (an *épistémologie de l' "entre-deux"*, Bitbol 1998, p. 18). Bitbol 1998, p. 107 pertinently states *'le sujet n'est pas face au réel, mais il est impliqué en lui de telle sorte que le réel ne se laisse pas décrire'*. What used to be described as a veil on reality or as an excessive separation from reality, Bitbol argues, is rather a blinding excess of proximity to reality. Press 2013, p. 8 quotes a long passage from an interview Michel Bitbol gave in 2009: *'Une fois que l'on a compris que des axiomes portant sur des entités "interfaciales" (plutôt que sur des entités qui soient ou bien objectives ou bien subjectives) permettent de faire tant de choses, on se convainc plus facilement que la physique quantique est peut-être non une théorie du monde que l'on explore, mais une théorie du domaine d'interaction, de la surface qui sépare sujet et objet. L'interface serait alors première par rapport au couple sujet-objet, si bien qu'à partir d'elle on pourrait dans certaines circonstances (et on ne pourrait pas dans d'autres circonstances) distinguer entre le quelque chose qui revient au sujet et le quelque chose qui revient à l'objet.'*
- 2049 Press 2013c; cf. Press 2015b, pp. 1130. 1134; Press 2013b, p. 184 in reference to Winnicott 1989[1965], p. 127 cited by him in the French edition.
- 2050 Gramsci 1917, p. 29 reflects on the reluctance to break an existing shell to arrive at something new: 'The present order presents itself as something harmoniously coordinated, coordinated in a stable way; and the vast majority of citizens hesitate and take fright at the uncertainty of what radical change might bring. Common sense, extremely foolish common sense, usually preaches that it is better to have an egg today than a hen tomorrow. Common sense is a terrible slave driver of souls [*degli spiriti*]. All the more so when to have the hen you have to break the egg shell.'
- 2051 Press 1998g, p. 125.
- 2052 Press 2006c, p. 88f.; cf. Press 2010a, p. 259; Press 2008c, p. 151; Press 2006b, p. 23; for one variant in an institutional context see Ciavaldini 2007, p. 63.
- 2053 Sometimes in explicit demarcation to phylogenetic assumptions: Assmann 1988, p. 9.
- 2054 Press 1999b, p. 141.
- 2055 According to 'Asylum statistics', 1.26 million and 1.20 million asylum application were registered in the EU in 2015 and 2016 respectively. Also see <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-34131911> with a somewhat different figure, which confirms, however, the general picture. Not a few of the refugees, we have to assume, will have experienced various degrees of severe trauma with unknown consequences for the way they find and maintain inner leeway.

- 2056 Psychoanalysis holds out an experiential offer offering a potential of transformation, Press 2016c, pp. 119. 121, rivalling in its intensity that of Szewc solitary rowers, a point, which Press, however, does not specifically make.
- 2057 Kurzweil 1989, p. 120f.
- 2058 There is the further divergence that Lacan emphatically rejected the economic viewpoint psychoanalysts belonging to the *EPP* made use of, Diatkine G. 1997, p. 56f. See, however, developments for the later Lacan, that, arguably, go beyond earlier positions, Diatkine G. 2017, pp. 164-166.
- 2059 In a letter to Joan Riviere from February 3rd, 1956 Winnicott writes: 'My trouble when I start to speak to Melanie about her statement of early infancy is that I feel as if I were talking about colour to the colour-blind. She simply says that she has not forgotten the mother and the part the mother plays, but in fact I find that she has shown no evidence of understanding the part the mother plays at the very beginning. Unless she can identify very closely with her infant at the beginning, she cannot "have a good breast", because just having the thing means nothing whatever to the infant'... It is a matter of great grief to me that I cannot get Melanie to take up this point or to see that there is a point here to be discussed', Winnicott 1987, pp. 95ff. I am indebted for this passage, which I checked out in the original publication, to Hughes 1989, p. 174.
- 2060 Parsons 2014, p. 137; Abrams 1987, p. 443. Also see Levine 2012b, p. 626.
- 2061 Freud 1930, p. 443.
- 2062 Wachowski and Wachowski 1998, p. 29.
- 2063 Castoriadis 1975, p. 488 describes as a negative what to the persons concerned may appear a liberating positive: 'A subject that would have *only* perception would have *none*: he/she would be completely swallowed up by "things", flattened against them, crushed against the world, incapable of turning his/her gaze, and therefore also incapable of fixing it on it.'
- 2064 Marty was inclined to conceptualise it as a fragility built into personal structure, while later practitioners adopted a more prudent stance on this. See Bronstein 2011, p. 181; for a brief summary of Marty's position; a similar viewpoint to Marty's is articulated by Verhaeghe and Vanheule 2005, p. 502f. and Verhaeghe, Vanheule and De Rick 2007, p. 1339f.; from a more skeptical angle: Gottlieb 2013, p. 146; Dumet 2002, p. 54 points out that Marty's thinking takes a somewhat different turn in the 1980s.
- 2065 Dejours 2008a I, p. 49; Dejours 2006a, p. 193; Smadja 2001a, p. 27.
- 2066 Proust 1925, p. 408; Schneider 1973, p. 46f. The passage in the original is: '*C'est dans la maladie que nous nous rendons compte que nous ne vivons pas seuls, mais enchaînés à un être d'un règne différent, dont des abîmes nous séparent, qui ne nous connaît pas et duquel il est impossible de nous faire comprendre: notre corps. Quelque brigand que nous rencontrons sur une route, peut-être pourrions-nous arriver à le rendre sensible à son intérêt personnel sinon à notre malheur. Mais demander pitié à notre corps, c'est discourir devant une pieuvre, pour qui nos paroles ne peuvent pas avoir plus de sens que le bruit de l'eau, et avec laquelle nous serions épouvantés d'être condamnés à vivre.*' Proust 1920-21, p. 146f. Dejours 1984b, p. x, in more general terms, points out the difficulties in addressing zones that lack a proper interface: 'The psychoanalyst finds him/herself sometimes in a rather uncomfortable position because he/she works in a region of the psyche which the patient does not know and for which he does not have words.'
- 2067 There was early criticism from outside the *EPP* on the lack of consideration of social characteristics of the patient group surveyed: Cremerius 1977, p. 295f.; Cremerius, Hoffmann, Hoffmeister and Trimborn 1979, p. 801, Zepf und Gattig 1981, p. 122. 130; Overbeck 1977, p. 344;
- 2068 Bion 1994[1978], p. 204, provides a graphic image of 'ways and means' under the pressure of the moment, while integrating into the picture past experience available before need arose: 'if you are the captain of a sailing ship on a stormy sea, you have to know at once what sails to carry or what sails to strike. That is why the experienced captain has an advantage; he doesn't have to think too much because he has done the thinking beforehand.'
- 2069 I am following Donnet's use of the word, who has made use of it, to design something that is being constructed, bringing together both the spatial and temporal dimensions of the enterprise, Donnet 2005, p. xii.
- 2070 Britton 1993, p. 83 has some affinity to this perspective.
- 2071 Kamieniak 2015, p. 895.
- 2072 Cf. Danon-Boileau 2002, p. 1141; also see: Davoine and Gaudillière 2004, pp. 231ff. on 'dreams that say no'; Kohon 2015, pp. 45. 148 likewise stresses the importance for a young child to be able to say 'no'; for the need of 'ruthless' translation: Kohon 2015, p. 4 in comment on Eco 2003, p. 5.
- 2073 Ignorance may be defended by various degrees of scotomisation that filters out unwelcome information in an act of tacit complicity, cf. Cohen 2001, pp. 64-68.
- 2074 It is by consenting to the denial and loyally sharing the burden of the resulting impingement in a community of belonging that identity is attained in exchange for restraints on mental processing. For a sketch of related preoccupations from an attachment theory perspective: Gubb 2013, p. 123.
- 2075 Cf. Dumet 2002, p. 48f.

- 2076 This then, would be an effective defence against the state of things described in Bion's image of the surgical shock, in which capillaries are dilated to an extent that the patient may bleed to death in his own tissue (Bion 1970, p. 12f.; Bion 1989[1971], p. 24): a cold shock, in which blood vessels contract. In physical life, if a person is exposed to a very cold environment, the body core temperature will be protected as much as possible, while extremities begin to freeze off: all emergency measures are time sensitive: what protects in the short run, eventually leads to death.
- 2077 Bronstein 2016, p. 117 pertinently asks: 'What enables a move towards creativity instead of a move towards disorganisation?'. Lear 2000, p. 73 puts the question at stake thus, 'It is ironic that it took such a destructive phenomenon as a traumatic neurosis for Freud to recognize that he had overlooked the most creative capacity of the mind: the capacity to create a field of mental functioning. Once the mind is, as it were, up and running, it can be described as functioning according to the pleasure principle. But the pleasure principle cannot itself explain how the conditions for its own functioning are created.'
- 2078 As often in debates in French psychoanalysis there are echoes of what has been proposed in other branches of the ongoing discussion. Here, in the context just delineated, René Roussillon's suggestions on early intersubjectivity are of obvious relevance: 'meaning is not a given to start with, and is not independent of the 'response' of the object, the other subject, but it is being built depending on the manner in which the object receives it and, and by its 'response' permits the latent potentialities of the initial message to be deployed', Roussillon 2008a, p. 9.
- 2079 '*Le sujet se met en repos, en convalescence d'être*', Smadja 2001a, p. 175; cf. p. 244; Smadja 1998a, p. 1409. This is a situation similar to the one addressed by Parsons 2014, pp. 99ff. - already mentioned in Chapter 14 - in his account of the debate between John Steiner and Gregorio Kohon: withdrawing into a retreat may at time be needful, p. 100; see Kohon 2015, pp. 25ff.; Browne 2018, p. 220.
- 2080 For the 'dementor's kiss' see Schwabach 2006, 329ff. The image is not being used by Dejours.
- 2081 Shay 2002, p. 90f.; cf. Altounian 2005, p. xv: 'To survive is the fruit of obstinate work that requires from the survivor qualities particularly of craftsmanship, which is to say, a know how to deal with the rests of what remains [*avec des restes*]'. It appears, there are times when it is important to know about the material culture of *opérateur* patients and the way it shapes the way they handle and experience themselves in what they do not express. A related point, with regard to cross-cultural therapies is urged by Tummala-Narra 2015, pp. 278f. 284.
- 2082 Shay 1994, p. xiii; Shay 2002, p. 164f.
- 2083 Fine 1997, p. 138: '*Les psychosomaticiens seraient-ils les "légendaires" de la population des malades?*'. The passage comes after a quote from Freud: 'If we do not wish to go astray in our judgement of their historical reality, we must above all bear in mind that people's 'childhood memories' are only consolidated at a later period, usually at the age of puberty; and that this involves a complicated process of remodelling, analogous in every way to the process by which a nation constructs legends about its early history', Freud 1909, p. 427 (I quote the passage in Strachey's translation).
- 2084 I understand Shay's use of Homer like this: He did not have to claim he truly understood what his patients had been through. He had not been there, after all. But when he listened to them it apparently made him feel and think about stories built into the very basement of an accessible cultural heritage, which, together with his patients' words, reverberated through him. Also see: Marin 2009. Potamianou 2017b, p. 159 writes, '.... I thought it was necessary for the analyst - at just the right time - to suggest *imageries* tying up again the somatic symptoms to the libidinal body and to relational experience, and by doing so attaching surplus meaning to the somatic manifestations.'
- 2085 Oliner 1996, p. 297f.; Oliner 1988, p. 234; Wurmser 2014, p. 1026 writes, 'All these questions [regarding trauma and/or conflict] have assumed great, even imperative urgency in the work with survivors of the Holocaust and their descendants. Except for Henry Krystal in Detroit, there is probably nobody alive today who has more personal qualifications in experience, penetrating insight, and knowledge than Marion Oliner..'. Gottlieb 2003, p. 858 states: 'For reasons that make some theoretical sense, the history of psychosomatic thought and its controversies, disagreements, divergent postulates and assumptions, is highly reminiscent of discussions about the understanding of the effects of psychic trauma over the same period of time, sharing with those discussions many terms and explanatory constructs'; Bohleber 2010, p. 89 points out that Henry Krystal described post-traumatic alexithymia at about the time Marty and de M'Uzan presented their findings on *opérateur* thought in psychosomatic patients; also see Taylor 1990, p. 773f. For one attempt at convergence with the alexithymia concept: Pirlot and Corcos 2012; Gottlieb 2003, p. 868 stresses the differences, as does Fortier 1988, p. 30. Dodds points out that psychosomatic thinking in France took up Freud's thinking on war trauma, so, the reader might conclude, that a development has come full circle.
- 2086 Oliner 1996, p. 294.
- 2087 Cf. Oliner, 1996, p. 288; encapsulated: Bohleber 2010, p. 82.
- 2088 Barrois 1998/1988, p. 209f.; also see Barrois 1993, p. 241; cf. Shay 1994, p. 53; Becker 1998, p. 144, in his advocacy of philosophical neo-Stoicism, speaks of the necessity to preserve 'maximal fixity in the boot sector

- of agency'; there are cultures in which various types of Stoicism, some of them working on a deliberate shutting off, have an enduring appeal, Sherman 2005, pp. 2f., 96. 109, for the possible complexities of the situation also see Bion 1997, p. 209: 'Bion: Then perhaps you will not be surprised that I would have been shocked had I known what I should become if I survived the war / Myself: What upsets you most? Bion: Your success, I think. I hesitate to say it, because it sounds ungrateful. I cannot imagine what was wrong, but I never recovered from the survival of the Battle of Amiens. Most of what I do not like about you seemed to start then'.
- 2089 Smadja 1997b, p. 182f. Smadja, reflecting on 'unthinkable pain' finds in Primo Levi's account *Se questo è un uomo* (1947) witness of the relative weight of personal resources and the defensive organisation as developed over time against the onslaught of exceptional circumstances, Smadja 1997b, p. 182. Grubrich-Simitis 1981, p. 423 speaks, with regard to survivors of severe trauma of 'the armoring of the ego'.
- 2090 Jonathan Lear, in recent work, offered reflections that go some way to explain the lack of a narrative: 'What is it like for life to seep out of a way of life? We are familiar with abrupt moments of cultural trauma, but there are times when a form of life is hollowed out from the inside, with people barely noticing', Lear 2017, p. 269.
- 2091 Corcos 2011, p. 190 points to similar developments within the alexithymia concept: 'The numerous definitions introduced over the years so as to take into account the distinction between primary alexithymia (linked to neurobiological deficits) and secondary alexithymia (as a protective strategy against intense and prolonged traumatic situations) or between alexithymia as a trait and alexithymia as a stage have increasingly left the field open for a developmental and adaptive concept of alexithymia considered as a *dimension clinique transnosographique* (a clinical dimension beyond nosographic classification), which exists along a continuum extending from the normal to the pathological.' On the unsettled nosological status of alexithymia also see Pedinielli 1992, p. 28f.
- 2092 Written in a very different context: Kromhout 2018.
- 2093 Bollas 2009/2000, p. 63; on the context: Nettleton 2017, p. 52f.
- 2094 Garland, Hume and Majid have proposed the useful notion of 'emotional capital' to describe the inner means available to the individual to deal with external circumstances, Garland, Hume and Majid 2002, p. 201. Bohleber *et al.* 2015, p. 728 in their comparative discussion of the concept of fantasy propose to focus on the elaborative capacity of the subject. Going *opératoire* would then mean a significant drop in any such capacity of elaboration in a given setting, at a given moment.
- 2095 Bollas 1995, p. 119.
- 2096 In very loose analogy to the Giffen good theory: an impoverished household has to invest even more heavily in basic staples the more painfully their price rises: Jensen and Miller 2008, p. 1553f; clinging to maintenance is everything, cf. Ehrenberg 1998, p. 261.
- 2097 Cushman 1995, p. 259 argues that Winnicott's self is at first empty: 'Without introjection, the process by which external "objects" are consumed and stored interiorly, and a kernel of the romantic true self there would be little inside the individual.' He then goes on to conclude (p. 259f.) 'In Winnicott's theory, growing up and learning to become a contributing member of one's society has come to feature the taking in and consuming of the proper parental objects.' Cushman's intention is to show how much Winnicott's thinking is a reflection of the conditions of post WW II society. There is a point to be made beyond that specific argument: if the Winnicottian self depends on the right kind of processes for its nourishment, ambient society and culture has to contain sufficient elements for this to happen.
- 2098 Ffytche 2012, pp. 5. 34. 275. 281. Robert Snell in his study emphasises a similar point: in his view the Romantic poets provided an 'area of historical underpinning' and a 'field of critically important cultural precedence' for the analytic attitude, Snell 2013, p. 2.
- 2099 Ohnuki-Tierney 2010, pp. 37ff.; Suzuki 1959, p. 392.
- 2100 Bion and Green 2005, p. 235.
- 2101 Fine 1995a, p. 174f.
- 2102 In much quoted, unreferenced words, usually attributed to Pablo Neruda, Julio Cortazar's work is supposed to have such quality that 'Anyone who does not read Cortázar is doomed. Not to read him is a serious invisible disease, which, in time, can have terrible consequences. Something similar to a man who has never tasted peaches, he would quietly become sadder, noticeably paler, and probably, little by little, he would lose all his hair.', Manguel 1998, p. 75. Though the passage is tongue in cheek, it points to a serious problem: how can a person tricked out of an experience that might open up new worlds can feel outrage at the loss of a potential he/she has not accessed? cf. Fain 1989a, p. 1272; Fain 1998a, p. 28; Fain 1984a, p. 1209f; unless, we were to hold, with Thomas Traherne (1637-1674) that all childhood is replete with early splendour: see 'Wonder', Traherne 1991[1903], pp. 4ff.; cf. Dodd 2016, pp. 2f. 68.
- 2103 Cf. Ogden 1992a, p. 520; Ogden 1992b, p. 622.
- 2104 Cf. Dumet 2002, p. 47f. on restricted mental space in family life.
- 2105 Ameisen has received international recognition for his work on apoptosis in cells [programmed suicide]. His ideas have been taken up in French psychoanalysis without ever moving to centre stage. In a series of radio

- broadcasts he has since used the concept in metaphorical ways, see '*Sur les épaules de Darwin*' on Radio France Inter, a feature of around one hour, every Saturday 11am.
- 2106 Ameisen 2007, p. 17; cf. p. 20. Faure-Pragier 2015, p. 331 comments on this: 'What is the metaphorical significance of these new notions for psychoanalysis? The most suggestive one is *the importance attributed to the other....*' [emphasis in the original].
- 2107 Ameisen 2007, p. 18f.
- 2108 Ameisen 2007, p. 25f.; cf. Ameisen 2003/1999, p. 418f.
- 2109 A person may be fully tied into structures that determine much of his life - a reality not static but dynamic, as Oliner has emphasised [Oliner 2012, p. 47; Oliner 2008, p. 1140, following a lead by Loewald 1952/1980, p. 32] - and yet have great difficulty to wrap his/her brain around the effect it is having on him/her.
- 2110 On the other end of a complementary series, as it were. Freud used the expression of *Ergänzungsreihen* [complementary series] to take into consideration factors that vary from case to case in their intensity but complement each other in the development of a neurosis, Freud 1905b, p. 141f.
- 2111 [A war neurosis sprung up on the battlegrounds of the economy]; italics in the original; Donnet 2005/1995, p. 198; cf. Dejours 2014, p. 22; Pirlot 2009, p. 145; Ehrenberg 1998, pp. 161ff. 259ff.; Dejours 1987, p. 52.
- 2112 Gérard Pirlot has argued that faced with a decapitation of symbolic, political and narrative structure, the 'actual' in more and more cases is all one is left with, which means that ritual gestures and corporal compulsions have to provide whatever containing function they can. Pirlot 2009, pp. 13f.; for Kristeva 1993, p. 17 a common denominator of many new symptomatologies is the difficulty to represent; also see the report on an *IPA* panel in Teusch 2015; Widlöcher 1984, p. 145 speaks of a no man's land [English in the original] of classical nosology, that of the pathology of character and the difficulties of life'. Anna Katharina Schaffner, in a recent monograph, has focused on the many guises of exhaustion, past and present, and shown that it is a phenomenon that is spreading, is known to have connections to cultural and social conditions, but tends 'to be embedded in more complex symptom clusters, the constellations and names of which, and of course their accompanying etiological narratives, are prone to change', Schaffner 2016, p. 6.
- 2113 Bion 1965, p. 148 puts it like this: 'It is impossible to know reality for the same reason that makes it impossible to sing potatoes; they may be grown, or pulled, or eaten, but not sung'.
- 2114 Kennedy 2002, p. 142 and *passim*.
- 2115 Parsons 2014, p. 19 uses the term *avant-coup*, 'which includes a 'future' counterpart of creative apperception; Nettleton 2017, p. 24 on Bollas' suggestion that there can be not only a repression of memories but also of 'futures'.
- 2116 Whitehead 1933, p. 191. In the concentration camps, Agamben says, one of the reasons that kept a deported person alive was that he urgently might want to be able to become someone who can give testimony in the future, '*diventare un testimone*'; Agamben 1998, p. 13. The passage he refers to is from Simon Laks and René Coudy 'Musik aus einer anderen Welt', pp. 179ff. regarding André's testimony, p. 186: '*Ich hatte den festen Entschluß gefaßt, nicht freiwillig in den Tod zu gehen, was auch immer geschehen möge.....Einfach deshalb, weil ich mich nicht ausschalten wollte, nicht den Zeugen ausschalten, der ich sein konnte. Ich wurde verschont. Das Fieber verließ mich ohne jeden Grund, wie es gekommen war, ohne daß ich eine einzige Tablette genommen hätte oder nur ein einziges der Medikamente, die nur einige Auserwählte besaßen*'; also see Tal 1996, p. 126 on the need for a community to which one can testify.
- 2117 Of whom he had been the editor of the Italian translation, Kohon 2015, p. 133. In a small piece published in 1933, Benjamin suggests that after the catastrophes of World War I people try to find an environment that supports their poverty of experience. Benjamin 1933a, p. 218: '*....sie sehnen sich von Erfahrungen freizukommen, sie sehnen sich nach einer Umwelt, in der sie ihre Armut, die äußere und schließlich auch die innere, so rein und deutlich zur Geltung bringen können, daß etwas Anständiges dabei herauskommt*'. Agamben adds, 'Today we know, however, that for the destruction of experience a catastrophe is no longer in any way required: the peaceful everyday existence in a big city, to that end, perfectly suffices', Agamben 2001/1978, p. 5. Also see Kesten 1942, p. 457: 'Strangely enough, most people do not have any stories to tell. They are extras to world history, who roast their bread in the hot ashes of burning Rome' ('*Sonderbarerweise haben die meisten Menschen nichts zu erzählen. Sie sind Statisten der Welthistorie, die in der heißen Asche vom brennenden Rom ihre Scheibe Brot rösten*').
- 2118 Berlant 2011, p. 24.
- 2119 Berlant 2011, p. 28; Berlant includes the new precariat in her considerations - see p. 192; there is some overlap of concern in this with Recalcati 2010, p. xiv, who refers to Zygmunt Bauman's concept of 'liquid society', also see Palese 2013.
- 2120 See Winnicott 1965 [1960], p. 145f.; Abram 2007, pp. 200-216; Turner 2002, pp. 1064. 1072. 1075. In the story of Moses, which plays a role in both Fain's and Press's writings, the mother places her child in a wicker basket [*tevah*, ark, the same word used for Noah's vessel, see Alter 2004, p. 312] and sets it afloat in a reasonably safe environment, in the reeds by the banks of the Nile, when he is three months old. Behind the rhythms of proximity and distance built into the narrative, there is a mother's hopeful action in the face of

- unbearable circumstances before the child set afloat can become the bearer of hope for a people enslaved; cf. Parsons' use of the Noah story in Parsons 2000, p. 197f. André Green emphasises the importance of a future in the psychoanalytic enterprise, 'The third condition for the possibility of analysis is the confidence in the hope of a pleasure to come in the future. Pleasure out of reach at the moment the cure is undertaken, but one the horizon of which is pushed into an indeterminate future.' (Green 2005, p. 23).
- 2121 Cf. Abram 2007, p. 211: 'the magic of desire is related to illusion'; Abram 2007, p. 30f.; Des Pres 1976, p. 21 points out that the survivor has lost his/her sheltering illusions. I owe this reference to Boulanger 2002a, p. 35; also see Boulanger 2002b, p. 50: 'catastrophe simultaneously calls into question past certainties and future possibilities'.
- 2122 In a famous Haiku referred to by Jorge Canestri, three pre-eminent Japanese warlords of the 16th century sit together and look at a bird: 'If a bird does not sing, kill it', says Oda Nobunaga; 'If a bird does not sing, make it sing', says Toyotomi Hideyoshi; 'If a bird does not sing, wait for it', says Tokugawa Ieyasu. Only one of the three approaches prevailed in the end: It was Ieyasu who unified the country, Canestri 1982, p. 538; 'The Three Major Daimyō'.
- 2123 de Gaulle 1954, p. 87 reflects on the long term consequences of a rallying call not undertaken: 'I thought, in effect, that it would be the end of honour, of unity, of independence, if people were to hear that, in this world war, only France would have capitulated and things would have ended there [just like that]. For, in that case, no matter what the outcome of the conflict, whether the country, decisively beaten, would one day have disencumbered itself of the invader by the strength of foreign arms, or whether it would have remained subjugated, the disgust of itself that would have filled it and that it would have instilled in others would poison its soul and its life for long generations'.
- 2124 Duthoit 1999 offers a collection of very useful material and p. 48 points out that the borderline between different phenomena remains fluid.
- 2125 On cultures of pain see Pirlot 2009, p. 131.
- 2126 See Chekhov's short story 'Typhus' (1887), before the revelation at the end; Winnicott on babies in pain: Abram 2007, pp. 200ff; on the response of the environment: Gauvain-Piquard 1985, p. 503f.; past generations sometimes expected fever to take care of a critical state: Hamlin 2014, pp. 2ff. Hailed as an adaptive response, it seemed something that might help to pull through a disease - with quite questionable results: Hamlin 2014, pp. 287ff.; such fickle hopes would not be available for sufferers of *opératoire* states. As Chekhov (1894) shows in his short story 'Rothschild's Fiddle,' if it happens, processing of the collateral costs of a deeply ingrained habitus might set on with the sense of a sharp loss.
- 2127 As Joseph Fernando graphically puts it, denied realities do not come half way to meet the analyst; Fernando 2009, p. 98; I am drawing together two separate statements in successive sentences. As Agamben pointed out, a lacuna may be the central piece in an encounter: it is exactly what cannot be expressed that has to be listened to, Agamben 1998, p. 9; cf. Reisner 2003, p. 411 puts it as follows: 'Trauma, like psychoanalysis, gives us the opportunity to face the limitations of belief, to experience the gap in the truth'. What Kenneth Tynan wrote about theatre clearly has a wider relevance: 'A good drama critic is one who perceives what is happening in the theatre of his time. A great drama critic also perceives what is *not* happening.' [emphasis in the original], Tynan 1967, p. viii. I am indebted to Dr Harald Leupold-Löwenthal for having drawn, many years ago, my attention to this idea, although he used an example unrelated to Kenneth Tynan's lines.
- 2128 Kipling in 'The Stranger' seems to suggest that home is where you do not have to leave your mental comfort zone when you are being lied to: 'The men of my own stock, /They may do ill or well, /But they tell the lies I am wanted to, /They are used to the lies I tell; /And we do not need interpreters /When we go to buy or sell.' Kipling 1908, p. 100f.
- 2129 Cf. Oliner 2012, p. 45f.; Oliner, 2008, p. 1123f.; Oliner 2013b, pp. 169ff.
- 2130 This is not, it seems, how Enid Balint might have wanted to approach matters: 'For me the core of psychoanalysis is, in brief, the understanding of intrapsychic processes and states, and of their relationship, or lack of it, with external reality'. Balint 1993, p. 121; Parsons 2014, p. 195 stresses that the appreciation of a patient's external reality is an important hallmark of the British Independent tradition in psychoanalysis; I was made aware of Enid Balint's lines by Parsons 2014, p. 196f.; Christopher Bollas puts it this way: 'In my view, psychoanalysis errs if it turns away permanently from the presentation of the real, taking refuge either in a theory of narrative or in a misplaced empiricism, where the only facts recognized are those enacted in the transference', Bollas 1995, p. 113, also see p. 104.
- 2131 Urribarri 1999, p. 374; also see de Mijolla's remarks on the very pronounced lack of interest he encountered in his own association when presenting his massive work on psychoanalysis in France, de Mijolla 2012, p. viii. In earlier work (de Mijolla 2002, p. 299), he points to ambivalences among psychoanalysts as regards their own history and suspects that there might be the suspicion that it could inflict a narcissistic wound on those who concern themselves with it (p. 301). Marty probably was not the only psychoanalyst of renown who would have wanted to see the emphasis put on what his current positions were: 'Why go looking for all these old texts? Tell your readers that what is important is what I think now' he told Madeleine Aderhold, who had

- taken it upon herself to put together a bibliography of his work, Aderhold 1994, p. 209.
- 2132 For Marty's *épaisseur* [depths] of the preconscious; Marty 1976, p. 141f. Marty 1980, p. 9; Marty 1990a, p. 39; Marty 1991/2013, p. 16f.
- 2133 Bion [1977], p. 31.
- 2134 Parsons 2014, p. 188; Parsons 2002, p. 70f.; Raphael-Leff 2012, p. 109f. Borgogno 2007, p. 228 points out, for both Winnicott and Ferenczi, 'trauma is not the result of phantasy, but a gradual accumulation of experiences that really occurred and that were "recorded in the flesh"'. Both 'fought against "normothetic thinking and behavior"' and 'the "obvious" and, stating that "it is the relational context that makes things intelligible"' (p. 229); Oliner 1988, p. 132 observes that 'They [French analysts] admired and studied Ferenczi to a much greater extent than is the custom here [the US].' For a brief take from a French perspective see Bokanowski 2014, stressing what did not happen.
- 2135 Cavell 2006, p. 71 has argued that this space has to have a common frame that is not just psychological.
- 2136 Fraser 1997, p. 155 points to the dangers of theories built on Saussurean linguistics: the abstraction from practice and context. What she terms 'symbolicism' leads to assumptions about a "'symbolic order" whose power to shape identities dwarfs to the point of extinction that of mere historical institutions and practices.', (p. 157). McNay 2008, p. 32 contends, 'In the Lacanian triad of the Real, the unconscious [sic] and the Symbolic, a perspective on social practices and experience is explicitly redundant. For Lacanians, the presence of the actual father is superfluous....'.
- 2137 McNay 2000, p. 135 argues the merits of taking into consideration Cornelius Castoriadis' work, who 'extends his notion of the imaginary to incorporate an explanation of the underpinnings of the realm of the socio-historical in the psychic makeup of individuals. That is, the social imaginary has a structural homology in the radical imagination of the individual which has the capacity to posit or represent that which does not as yet exist'. Although the authors I have studied do not establish such a link to Castoriadis, it would sit well with the body of work they have produced.
- 2138 Gramsci 1975, p. 311: [1930: Miscellanea] § 34 *Passato e presente:....La crisi consiste appunto nel fatto che il vecchio muore e il nuovo non può nascere: in questo interregno si verificano i fenomeni morbosi più svariati.* - Ehrenberg 1998, p. 61 derives, via Pierre Janet, a statement attributed to Joseph Jules Dejerine, according to whom it is neurasthenia that is a public square placed at an intersection [*carrefour*] 'from which can emerge all possible illnesses'. Quite possibly, the morbid symptoms Gramsci speaks of encompass a waiting for radical change that cannot be brought about by anything one can muster by one's own forces. In Dino Buzzati's *Il deserto dei tartari* excruciatingly boring garrison duty spent in guarding a frontier fortress against a looming Tartar invasion, sucks life out in waiting for something that when it comes may well be cataclysmic, Buzzati 1940, p. 216: '*Di giorno in giorno Drog sentiva aumentare questa misteriosa rovina, e invano cercava di trattenerla. Nella vita uniforme della Fortezza gli mancavano punti di riferimento e le ore gli sfuggivano di sorte prima che lui riuscisse a contarle.*'
- 2139 These morbid symptoms, as far as psychoanalysis is concerned, are embedded in cultures of pain and denial, leaving it for pain to stand in where *pulsion* has lost cohesion and force. For cultures of pain see Bourke 2014, pp. 17; 46-52; denial in this context in particular in the version 'everything is under control'; for pain, work on pain and denial: Perron-Borelli 1997, p. 164f.; for the degradation of *pulsion*: Pirlot 2009, pp. 128-139; Pirlot reminds the reader that Freud spoke of pain as a *Pseudotrieb*, a *pseudo-pulsion*, Pirlot 2009, p. 136; Freud 1915, p. 249.
- 2140 In this, once again, it shares in what Claude Le Guen described as the difficulties of thinking about trauma in psychoanalysis, 'Trauma is no doubt one of the most uncertain [*indécises*], one might even say ambiguous, notions in psychoanalysis, and it is without doubt the most enigmatic one. This follows from the ambiguity of its confluences placed at the point of encounter between inside and outside. Agent of a reality the force and source of which remain uncertain, trauma is an occasion to get a sense of what is beyond pleasure and its principle....', Le Guen 1996, p. vii. I owe the reference, which I checked in the original, to Bokanowski 2014.
- 2141 Some of this is well caught in lines of J.R.R Tolkien's [not mentioned by Marty]: 'What do you fear, lady?' he asked. 'A cage', she said, 'To stay behind bars, until use and old age accept them, and all chance of doing great deeds is gone beyond recall or desire', Tolkien 1954, p. 816 [Part III: The Return of the King; chapter: The Passing of the Grey Company]. The person speaking about it is able to do so because she knows she has not reached this point. Having reached it, not much remains to be said.
- 2142 Dejours 1987, p. 51f. points out that interdisciplinary dialogue is necessary for psychoanalysis to demonstrate its continuing vitality and relevance. Despite her fundamental reservations on psychoanalysis, Wetherell 2012 shows that styles and patterns of affective practice is something psychoanalysis could engage with, without losing its own profile. As Press 2013d, p. 8 points out, 'In other words, although they may not have direct links with psychoanalysis, the input of other disciplines can, in favourable cases, influence both our way to conceive theory and our way to be present in the session'.
- 2143 Dejours and Abdoucheli 1992, p. 275 write: 'The private space to which he [the psychoanalyst] has access is very limited: [it is limited] precisely to those subjects who invite the psychoanalyst to enter their private

- space'. It is doubtful all of the patients presented in *L'Investigation Psychosomatique* were aware they were being taken to have pronounced such an invitation. In an interview Dejours graphically describes the resistances sometimes encountered in work outside the private consulting rooms: '*Quand on est psychologue et clinicien, qu'on va sur le terrain, en entreprise, et qu'on se heurte aux rapports sociaux, à la domination, à l'injustice, et que, finalement, les gens vous lâchent en cours de route et que votre investigation se heurte à de vraies difficultés qu'on n'arrive pas à comprendre, que peut être, aussi, les gens qui se défendent font un effort pour que vous ne compreniez pas, ce n'est pas amusant.*', Dejours 2015d, p. 286. Jacques Press takes care to differentiate between the remit of the psychoanalyst and those areas in which he/she may not automatically enjoy a privileged point of view by virtue of his/her analytic training, Press 2010g, p. 44.
- 2144 'Elephant in the room': Zerubavel 2006, p. 24f.; Fischbein 2016, p. 128 states: 'Unlike a psychoanalytic patient, an 'operative' patient seen in a hospital department will usually lack any possibility of self-questioning'. The author does not offer, despite his evident interest in cultural context (see p. 127), further comment on potential differences in the factors at work within the respective frames.
- 2145 Szwec 2017b, p. 17.
- 2146 Cf. Hounkpatin, Wexler-Cztróm, Perez and Courbin 2011, p. 98; also see the short outline of some of the problems involved: Pirlot and Cupa 2012a, p. 230f. Tal 1996, p. 115, in discussing text based Vietnam narratives, highlights difficulties in understanding accounts that have to be inaccessible because they refer to a reality both alien and repugnant to the reader. Her chapter title borrows from Umberto Eco's *The Name of the Rose*, Eco 1983, p. 483: 'There was no plot', William said, 'and I discovered it by mistake' [Seventh Day], playing with the ambiguity around the word plot, which might well be a narrative lost for the inability of means to get across what happened. Altounian 1993, p. 904f. highlights the difficulties of Armenians to find words and sustain their language in the face of the pact of silence and denial that suppressed public memory of the genocide in 1915, obliterating possible representations.
- 2147 Altounian 2005, p. 126f.
- 2148 Moro 2009, p. 40; Press 2016a, p. 108 would like to see 'a theory that can draw profitably on contributions from other disciplines'. Brackelaire 2002, p. 155 bluntly states: 'A psychoanalysis without anthropology is monstrous'.
- 2149 De Bandt, Dejours, and Dubar 1995, p. 177f. in a brief passage refer to the comparatively positive experience of immigrant workers in the mining regions of the Cévennes, who were made to feel welcome in traditional Protestant families of the region putting a premium on hospitality and the work ethic. Cabanel 1998, chapter 6 traces the very particular profile of the region, which had seen the Camisard rising in the early eighteenth century, throughout Resistance and decades of immigration.
- 2150 Having found refuge in France, some mothers are left adrift. Dozio, Feldman, El Husseini and Moro 2015, p. 232, focusing on one particular case story write: 'She grew up without mother and without family who might have provided her with a *'berceau culturel'* [a cultural cradle], which gets transmitted from generation to generation. The lack of parental support and guidance during that critical period has left Mme G. in a state of solitude, and with the impossibility to reproduce gestures and postures specific to her culture of origin'; also see Moro 2015, p. 39f. Moro 2002, p. 119. De Micco 2016, p. 1 emphasises, 'In the course of experiences of transit in migration genuine fractures in the identificatory processes might occur. In particular, children and adolescents belonging to the so-called second generations have to come to terms with an acute instability of their own symbolical and cultural points of reference and their profound transgenerational ruptures, the impact of which make themselves felt with regard to the possibility of recognising oneself in a genealogy and something one belongs to [*in una genealogia e in una appartenenza*].' There is nothing that provides links to what goes beyond 'the actual', leading to a two-dimensional image of themselves (p. 6). Only if the pieces come together enough to form wounds can there eventually perhaps be a skin which one may inhabit: '*O forse quei pezzi dovranno cominciare a trasformarsi in ferite, ferite che solo a patto di cominciare a scongelarsi, a sanguinare, potranno essere dolorosamente pensate, potranno trovare una pelle in cui abitare*' (p. 7).
- 2151 de Micco 2018, p. 118; cf. p. 120: 'Many women had lost their children at sea, had not been able to keep them beside them, saw them "disappear", not die; and they seemed to be waiting for the sea to bring them back. The tragic news of recent years has made this experience almost "familiar" and everyday; but losing, mislaying, one's own children in the sea, has for a long time remained a piece of "evidence" at the limit of the thinkable for many immigrant mothers and for those who have aided them. The therapist's work often translates into staying by them, waiting, without ever being able to speak about what has happened: what has happened cannot have happened. Indeed, can one really speak about what is simply unimaginable?' The conclusions she draws from this, p. 123, seem to be close to the Botellas' and to Press': 'Maybe only when one is able to start seeing one's own wound in the wounded gaze of another - another who has been left wounded in his humanity by the inhumane - maybe only then can the mind that has crossed the desert of the inhumane begin to be populated, crowded with nightmares.'
- 2152 Culture, de Micco 2014 argues, is not a vest but fulfils the functions Anzieu recognises in the mental skin. She goes on to say, '*Questa funzione si rende particolarmente evidente proprio nei diffusi disagi psichici connessi*

- all'esperienza migratoria in cui questa 'pellicola' culturale protettiva e contenitiva diviene particolarmente fragile'* (Manuscript transmitted as a Microsoft word document by the author, p. 3). An interface that is usually there, as a consequence of forced migration, is rendered conspicuous by its absence.
- 2153 Press 2016a, p. 95fn.4 regards Marty's preconscious closer to Bion's thinking apparatus than to the Freudian preconscious. Groarke 2018, p. 144 emphasises the relevance of French thought to the English Independents, and vice versa.
- 2154 Fitzgerald and Ryan 2014, p. 135; see Bion's own experience: Bion 1997, p. 245. 249; Bion 1982, p. 131. There is a variant of the idea to be found in La Rochefoucauld's *Maximes et réflexions diverses*, maxime no 458: '*Nos ennemis approchent plus de la vérité dans le jugement qu'ils font de nous que nous n'en approchons nous-mêmes*' (in the edition curated by Jean Lafond, p. 118). cf. Fischbein 2016, p. 125: 'Each new clinical obstacle and the manner in which it is confronted lead to an investigation of this phenomenon'. Dejours has pointed out that work means coming to terms with a reality that resists one's best efforts, Dejours 2015c, p. 279: '*Le réel c'est ce qui se fait connaître à celui qui travaille par sa résistance à la maîtrise.*'
- 2155 Gottlieb 2003, pp. 857f; 863; 866f.; 876; Ehrenberg 1998, pp. 19f. 52ff.
- 2156 Tisseron 2007, p. 120f. and *passim*.
- 2157 Busch 2018, p. 569 describes developments in the Bionian understanding of reverie that point to comparable dynamics: appropriation of a concept leads to a number of new discoveries, these discoveries lead to a spread in the understanding of the original concept, which does not become an issue because the concept, on the face of it, appears deeply familiar. The varieties in understanding he writes about concern underrepresented mental states.
- 2158 For Lacan and the other: Assoun 2003, pp. 63ff. For the importance of the other in Green's thinking, Green 2002, p. 267; Pirlot and Cupa 2012b, pp. 187ff. There seems to be a certain proximity between French positions and central concerns of American relational psychoanalysis, which has been of some interest to American authors, among them Donnel B. Stern, a curiosity that he feels has not been reciprocated, see Stern 2018, pp. 41ff., in sustained controversy with Howard B. Levine (Levine 2010; also see Levine 2013; Stern 2015b, p. 498). As far as asymmetries go, there is one to be observed between French and British psychoanalysis: Winnicott and Bion have been of massive importance to major French authors over the past 40 years, with reciprocal interest so far, though present, on a much more limited scale. One has to assume that the ground on which an animated, invigorating argument can be had, has not been constituted yet.
- 2159 Botella, C. 2018 b, p. 735, in a slightly different context, speaks of thinking '*se complexifiant d'un autre à un autre*', a statement, in which complexification is seen as a positive development and not a detriment.
- 2160 Reed, Levine, and Scarfone 2013, p. 3 permit to place this in a wider context. Not thinking, in particular, of the discussions on the *opérateur*, they write, 'In the last several decades, the analytic field has widened considerably in scope. The therapeutic task is now seen by an increasing number of analysts to require that patient and analyst work together to strengthen, or to create, psychic structure that was previously weak, missing, or functionally inoperative. This view, which may apply to all patients but is especially relevant to the treatment of non-neurotic patients and states of mind, stands in stark contrast to the more traditional assumption that the therapeutic task involves the uncovering of the unconscious dimension of a present pathological compromise formation that holds a potentially healthy ego in thrall.' Dodds [no year, no pagination] observes, 'The French Group is now attempting to describe that picture from a variety of angles, opening up new vistas for the psychoanalytic 'microscope' of Sigmund Freud'.
- 2161 Mancía 2004, p. 1285 points out that the Botellas' propositions raise the question whether it is justified to expand the territory to which Freudian concepts are applied, modifying their original conceptual remit. Paying attention to what kind of problems are being addressed with which ecosystem of conceptual tools may be a very useful intermediary stage before arriving at further clarification, see Dreher 2000, p. 161; Hock 2013, p. 955f. Widlöcher 1984, p. 155: 'it is perhaps the characteristic of such a venture to be subject to continuous recasting in the light of our theoretical and practical knowledge. The critical study of these alterations teaches us more than an established nosology'; 'conceptual kernel shock': Fain 1982, p. 26f. points out that the introduction of an economy to which the Me is linked '*fut vécue par les psychanalystes, Freud y compris, comme traumatique...*'
- 2162 This would be a very different criterion of evaluation from what Verhaeghe and Willemsen have described (and provided a critique of) as a self-sustaining system in which each contributor tries to conform to the rules of the academic excellence game for the sake of the game ['*Binnen de academische wereld gaat iedereen gebukt onder het juk van een anonieme, globale Evaluator die zich geïncarneerd heeft in de toptijdschriften...*'], Verhaeghe and Willemsen 2015, p. 28.], a situation for the study of which the concept of the *opérateur* in the variant used by Christoph Dejours offers powerful tools.
- 2163 'Auguries of Innocence' [1803?], lines 37-38, in Blake 1977, p. 507.
- 2164 Bion 1977[1971], p. 10.

References:

- 'Anna Potamianou. Publications', available at:
http://www.psychanalysis.gr/el/documents/Dhmosieymata_A_Potamianou.pdf, last accessed 21st December 2017.
- 'Anna Potamianou', http://www.psychanalytikerinnen.de/griechenland_biografien.html, accessed 1st October 2013.
- 'Association de Santé Mentale du 13e arrondissement de Paris: Son histoire', available at:
<http://www.asm13.org/article23.html>, accessed 29th September 2015.
- 'Asylum statistics', eurostat, available at: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Asylum_statistics, accessed 9th February 2018.
- 'Christoph Dejours' (a), available under: <http://psychologiedutravail.chez.com/Dejours-chaire.html>, accessed 24th November 2012.
- 'Christoph Dejours' (b), available under: http://www.puf.com/Auteur:Christophe_Dejours, accessed 24th November 2012.
- 'Colour blindness and camouflage', *Nature* 146, 17 August 1940, p. 226.
- 'Discusion a la conferencia de Cesar Botella' ("Consideraciones sobre verdad, memoria, e interpretación en la practica psicoanalitica"), Jornada Anual de S.E.P.I.A, Salamanca, 21 May 2005, available at: <http://www.sepia-psicosomatica.org/%20Revistas%20SEPIA/R5-4.pdf>, accessed 28th November 2015.
- 'En savoir plus', on: collections: *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, at https://www.puf.com/collections/Revue_française_de_psychosomatique, accessed 25th March 2016.
- 'Graziella Nicolaidis', obituaries from 26th May 2012 and 31st May 2012, available at:
http://www.hommages.ch/Defunt/69388/Graziella_Nicolaidis, accessed 12th February 2018.
- 'Hellenic Psychoanalytic Society', available at:
www.psychanalysis.gr/el/documents/HPS_History.pdf, accessed 21st December 2017.
- 'Historique', available at: <http://www.lfsm.org/presentation/historique/>, accessed 12th September 2015.
- 'Le Centre de psychosomatique pour adultes Pierre Marty', available at:
<http://www.asm13.org/Le-Centre-de-psychosomatique-pour-adultes-Pierre-Marty>, accessed 26th March 2016.
- 'Le Centre de psychosomatique pour bébés, enfants et adolescents', available at:
<http://www.asm13.org/Le-Centre-de-psychosomatique-pour-bebes-enfants-et-adolescents-Leon-Kreisler>, accessed 2nd January 2017.
- 'Le Département CCTP Jean Favreau. Centre de consultations et de traitements psychanalytiques', available at: <http://www.asm13.org/le-departement-cctp-jean-favreau>, accessed 22nd August 2017.
- 'Le département Institut de psychosomatique', available at: <http://www.asm13.org/Le-departement-Institut-de-psychosomatique>, accessed 21st March 2016.

- 'Le secteur de psychiatrie', available at: http://www.serpsy.org/psy_levons_voile/hopital/secteur.html, accessed 29th September 2015.
- 'Les associations psychanalytiques n'appartenant pas à l'A.P.I.', [unattributed editorial comment], in: Chiland, C., ed. (1981), *Les ecoles psychanalytiques. La psychanalyse en mouvement*, Paris: Tchou, pp. 193-199.
- 'Les auteurs', in: de M'Uzan, M., ed. (2008), *La chimère des inconscients*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 169-170.
- 'Les ordonnances de 1945', <http://www.securite-sociale.fr/IMG/pdf/ordon45.pdf>, accessed 8th September 2015.
- 'Migrant crisis: Migration to Europe explained in seven charts', 4 March 2016, available at: <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-34131911>, accessed 15th March 2016.
- 'Nicolas "Nicos" Nicolaidis', obituaries from July 9, 2016, July 11, 2016 and July 12, 2016, available at: 'http://www.hommages.ch/Defunt/69388/Graziella_Nicolaidis', accessed 12th February 2018.
- 'Prix Pierre Mâle et Prix Maurice Bouvet '(2001), *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 38, p.109.
- 'Psychanalyse' [terme de recherche], Éditions Universitaires Européennes, available under http://www.editions-ue.com/catalog/search?page=3&search_query=Psychanalyse.
- 'Rencontre à la librairie Tschann mai 2013': "Penser la psychanalyse", d'André Green – (26th June 2013, Ithaquesmedia), available at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bPKamQKEMsM>, accessed 25th November 2015.
- 'Résumé of Claude Smadja, 'Le modèle pulsionnel de la psychosomatique' ', available at: http://www.cairn.info/resume.php?ID_ARTICLE=RFPS_045_0011, accessed 3rd April 2016.
- 'Sous les pavés la plage', <http://forum.wordreference.com/threads/sous-les-pavés-la-plage.37487/>, accessed 6th September 2015.
- 'Suicides à France Télécom: l'entreprise mise en examen pour harcèlement moral', *Le Monde*, July 4th, 2012, available under: http://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2012/07/04/suicides-a-france-telecom-didier-lombard-mis-en-examen-pour-harcelement-moral_1729208_3234.html, accessed 4th March 2012.
- 'Sur les épaules de Darwin', available at: <https://www.franceinter.fr/emissions/sur-les-epaules-de-darwin>, accessed 18th August 2018.
- 'The Eye's Mind' (2015), available at: <http://medicine.exeter.ac.uk/research/neuroscience/theeyesmind/aboutthestudy/>, accessed 9th December 2015.
- 'The Three Major Daimyō', available at: <https://blogs.transparent.com/japanese/the-three-major-daimy/>, accessed 16th September 2017.
- 'The Wanderer Project' [manuscript, transcript, alternative translations and glossary of 'The Wanderer'], available at: <http://research.uvu.edu/mcdonald/wanderweb/>, accessed 22nd February 2016.
- 'Un regard sur le parcours de l'AGEPSO', available at: <http://www.agepso.ch/agepso/>, accessed 25th January 2016.

- ‘Lire les prix Bouvet dans la Rfp’, available at: http://www.spp.asso.fr/wp/?page_id=7794, accessed 7th May 2016.
- (2007), 'L'association: La psychanalyse en Grèce', *Psychanalyse* 9(2), pp. 45-59.
- Abraham, N. and Torok, M. (1987), *L'écorce et le noyau*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Abram, J. (2007), *The language of Winnicott. A dictionary of Winnicott's use of words*, 2nd edition, London: Karnac Books.
- Abrams, S. (1987) 'The psychoanalytic process: A schematic model', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 68, pp. 441-452.
- Aderhold, M. (1994), 'Bibliographie complète des œuvres de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 209-217.
- Adler, H.G, Langbein, H. and Lingens-Reiner, E. (1994), *Auschwitz. Zeugnisse und Berichte*. 5th edition, Hamburg: Europäische Verlagsanstalt EVA.
- Adorno, T.W. (1951), *Minima moralia*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp Verlag.
- Agamben, G. (1993), 'Bartleby, or on contingency', in: Agamben, G. (1999), *Potentialities. Collected essays in philosophy*, ed. Heller-Roazen, D., Stanford: Stanford University Press, pp. 243-271.
- Agamben, G. (1998), *Quel che resta di Auschwitz. L'archivio e il testimone*, Torino: Bollati Boringhieri editore.
- Agamben, G. (2001/1978), *Infanzia e storia. Distruzione dell'esperienza e origine della storia*, 2nd edition, Torino: Einaudi.
- Aguirre Oar, J.M and Guimon Ugartechea, J. (1992), 'Julian de Ajuriaguerra. Esbozo biografico,' in: Aguirre Oar, J.M and Guimon Ugartechea, J. eds., *Vida y obra de Julián de Ajuriaguerra*, Madrid: Arán, pp. 11-36.
- Aisenstein, M. (1994), 'Plaidoyer pour un certain inachèvement', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 71-74.
- Aisenstein, M. (1996), 'Pour introduire la névrose de comportement dans une théorie des pulsions', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 7-16.
- Aisenstein, M. (1998), 'Pensée opératoire et traitement de la réalité', in: Duparc, F., ed., *L'art du psychanalyste: autour de l'oeuvre de Michel de M'Uzan*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 15-25.
- Aisenstein, M. (1999), 'Valeur économique et texture de la vie fantasmatique', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 25-33.
- Aisenstein, M. (2000), *Michel Fain (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 28)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Aisenstein, M. (2006), 'The indissociable unity of psyche and soma', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 87, pp. 667-680.
- Aisenstein, M. (2008). 'Beyond the Dualism of Psyche and Soma', *Journal of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis and Dynamic Psychiatry* 36, pp. 103-123.
- Aisenstein, M. (2010a), 'Letter from Paris', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91, pp. 463-468.

- Aisenstein, M. (2010b), ‘“L’inconscient reçoit mais n’émet pas”’, in: Bayle, G., ed., *L’inconscient freudien. Recherche, écoute, métapsychologie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 227-231.
- Aisenstein, M. (2013), 'Drive, representation, and the demands of representation', in: Levine, H.B, Reed, G.S and Scarfone, D. eds., *Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning. Clinical and theoretical contributions*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 175-188.
- Aisenstein, M. (2014), Brève discussion du texte: "Le modèle pulsionnel de la psychosomatique" par Claude Smadja', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 45, pp. 30-40.
- Aisenstein, M. (2018), 'An introduction to Michel Fain's thought', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(2), pp. 495-509.
- Aisenstein, M. and de Aisemberg, E.R. eds. (2010), *Psychosomatics today. A psychoanalytic perspective*, London: Karnac Books.
- Aisenstein, M. and Papageorgiou, M. (2018), 'Mentalisation and passivity by Michel Fain', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(2), pp. 468-478.
- Aisenstein, M. and Smadja, C. (1997), 'Interview [avec] Jacques Chassigneux', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. 201-213.
- Aisenstein, M. and Smadja, C. (2001), 'De la psychosomatique comme courant essentiel de la psychanalyse contemporain', in: Green, A., ed., *Courants de la psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 343-353.
- Aisenstein, M. and Smadja, C. (2010a), 'Introduction to the paper by Pierre Marty: The narcissistic difficulties presented to the observer by the psychosomatic problem', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91(2), pp. 343-346.
- Aisenstein, M. and Smadja, C. (2010b), 'Conceptual framework from the Paris Psychosomatic School: A clinical psychoanalytic approach to oncology', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91(3), pp. 621-640.
- Aisenstein, M. and Smadja, C. (2017), 'Destins d'une rencontre', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 52, pp. 5-28.
- Alderson, M. (2004), 'La psychodynamique du travail: objet, considérations épistémologiques, concepts et prémisses théoriques', *Santé Mentale au Québec* 29(1), pp. 243-260.
- Alexandridis, A. (2010), 'Désignification et analyse polyglotte', *Annuel de l'APF*, pp. 95-97.
- Alexandridis, A. (2012), 'Aspects du maternel dans le travail avec des enfants polytraumatisés (à partir de l'exposé de Claire Rojas)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 41, pp. 27-35.
- Ali, S. (1997), *Le rêve et l'affect. Une théorie du somatique*, Paris: Dunod.
- Alter, R. (2004), *The Five Books of Moses. A translation with commentary*, New York. W.W. Norton & Company.
- Alter, R. (2007), *The book of Psalms. A translation with commentary*, New York: W.W. Norton & Company.
- Altounian, J. (1993), ' "Transferts" déculturants et inconvenance culturelle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 57(3), pp. 899-915.
- Altounian, J. (2005), *L'intraduisible. Deuil, mémoire, transmission*, Paris: Dunod.

- Alvarez, J. (1994), 'Disappeared does not take a helping verb in English', *Syracuse University Magazine* 10 (4), Article 9, available at: <https://surface.syr.edu/sumagazine/vol10/iss4/9>, accessed 15th May 2018.
- Amar, N. (2002), 'psychodrame analytique', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 2, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 1380-1381.
- Ameisen J.-C. (2007), 'La mort au cœur du vivant', *Revue française de psychosomatique* 32, pp. 11-44.
- Ameisen, J.-C. (2003/1999), *La sculpture du vivant. Le suicide cellulaire ou la mort créatrice*, 2nd edition, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Amiel, R. (1973), 'Psychopathologie du travail', in: Sivadon, P. (1973), *Traité de psychologie médicale*, volume 3: *La pathologie émotionnelle*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 35-44.
- André, J. (2000), 'La séparation', in: Widlöcher, D., ed., *Sexualité infantile et attachement*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 185-196.
- Andréoli, A. (1996), [intervention], in: Marty, P. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1996), *Psychosomatique. Pensée vivante*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps, pp. 131-132.
- Andreotti, G. (2011), *Il potere logora ... ma è meglio non perderlo*, Milan: Biblioteca Universale Rizzoli.
- Angelergues, J. (2006), 'Le psychanalyste, consultant de service public?', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes qui êtes vous?* Paris: Dunod, pp. 63-68.
- Angella, M. (2016), 'Work, recognition and subjectivity: Relocating the connection between work and social pathologies', *European Journal of Social Theory* 19(3), pp.340-354.
- Angulo, F. (1994), 'Pierre Marty, Barcelone et la psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 167-172.
- Antoine, J.-M. (2010), 'Une histoire des “lieux de vie”. Influences et prémices.' *VST – Vie sociale et traitements* 107, pp.100-105.
- Anzieu, D. (1976), 'Devenir psychanalyste aujourd'hui', in: Favez, G., Anzieu, D., Anzieu, A., Berry, N., Pontalis, J.-B., and Smirnoff, V.N, *Être psychanalyste*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 117-147.
- Anzieu, D. (1985/1995), *Le moi peau*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod.
- Anzieu, D. (1990) *A skin for thought. Interviews with Gilbert Tarab*, London: Karnac.
- Anzieu, D. (1990), *L'Épiderme nomade et la peau psychique*, Paris: Editions Apsygée.
- Anzieu, D., Carapanos, F., Gillibert, J., Green, A., Nicolaïdis, N., and Potamianou, A. (1980), *Psychanalyse et culture Grecque*, Paris: Société d'Édition des Belles Lettres.
- Arnold, J. J. (2014), *Theoderic and the Roman imperial restoration*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Asmuth, C. (2007), Negativität. Hegels Lösung der Systemfrage in der Vorrede der *Phänomenologie des Geistes*, *Synthesis philosophica* 22/1, pp. 19-32.
- Asséo, R. (1994), 'L'allergie, un concept psychosomatique. Allergie et Moi-idéal, deux concepts en rapport avec la notion de “caractère“ chez Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 53-62.

- Asséo, R. (2002), 'allergique (relation d'objet -)', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 1, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 55-56.
- Asséo, R. (2005), 'Le traumatisme dans ses fonctions organisatrices et désorganisatrices', in: Brette, F. and Emmanuelli, M. and Pragier, G., *Le traumatisme dans ses fonctions organisatrices et désorganisatrices*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 57-68.
- Asséo, R. (2009), 'La prudence du démineur', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp. 113-120.
- Assmann, J. (1988), 'Kollektives Gedächtnis und kulturelle Identität', in: Assmann, J. and Hölscher, T. (1988) eds., *Kultur und Gedächtnis*, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp Verlag - http://archiv.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/propylaeumdok/1895/1/Assmann_Kollektives_Gedaechtnis_1988.pdf, accessed 8th February 2016.
- Assmann, J. (1997), *Moses the Egyptian: the memory of Egypt in western monotheism*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Assmann, J. (2001), *Moïse L'Égyptien. Un essai d'histoire de la mémoire*, Paris: Aubier.
- Assmann, J. (2006), 'Form as a mnemonic device: cultural texts and cultural memory', in: Horsley, R.A., Draper, J.A. and Foley, J.M. (2006) eds., *Performing the gospel. Orality, memory, and mark. Essays dedicated to Werner Kelber*, Minneapolis: Fortress, pp. 67-82.
- Assmann, J. (2010 [2003]), *The price of monotheism*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Assoun, P-L. (2003), *Lacan*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Atkinson, R. (2002), *An army at dawn. The war in North Africa 1942-1943*, New York: Henry Holt and Company.
- Aulagnier, P. (1974), 'À propos de la réalité: savoir ou certitude', in: Aulagnier, P. (1986/2001), *Un interprète en quête de sens*, Paris: Payot, pp. 271-297.
- Baldacci, J-L. (2006), 'La psychanalyse dans la cité', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes qui êtes vous?* Paris: Dunod, pp. 49-55.
- Balestriere, L. (2007), 'The work of the psychoanalyst in the field of psychosis', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 88(2), pp. 407-421.
- Balint, E. (1963), 'On being empty of oneself', in: Balint, E. (1993), *Before I was I. Psychoanalysis and the imagination*, ed. Mitchell J. and Parsons M., London: Free Association Books, pp. 39-55.
- Balint, E. (1989), 'Creative life', in: Balint, E. (1993), *Before I was I. Psychoanalysis and the imagination*, ed. Mitchell J. and Parsons M., London: Free Association Books, pp. 100-108.
- Balint, E. (1993), 'One analyst's technique', in: Balint, E. (1993), *Before I was I. Psychoanalysis and the imagination*, ed. Mitchell J. and Parsons M., London: Free Association Books, pp. 120-129.
- Balsamo, M. (2014), 'La rencontre avec l'oculus', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 78(5), pp. 1493-1498.
- Barande, I. and R. (1975), *Histoire de la psychanalyse en France*, Toulouse: Editeur Edouard Privat.
- Baranes, J.J. (2002), 'Penser le double', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 66(5), pp. 1837-1843.

- Baranes, J.J. (2002), 'Transgénérationnel et adolescence', available at: <http://www.spp.asso.fr/transgenerationnel-et-adolescence/>, accessed August 16th, 2018.
- Barney, S.A., Lewis, W.J., Beach, J.A. and Berghof, O. (2006), *The etymologies of Isidore of Seville*, Cambridge University Press.
- Barraclough, K. (2004), 'Diagnosis and Wittgenstein's theories of language', *The British Journal of General Practice* 54(503), pp. 480-481.
- Barrois, C. (1993), *Psychanalyse du guerrier*, Paris: Hachette.
- Barrois, C. (1998/1988), *Les névroses traumatiques. Le psychothérapeute face aux détresses des chocs psychiques*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod.
- Barros, E. M. da Rocha (2007), 'Botella, Ogden, Green, Ferro, Bion: comentário à entrevista de César Botella', *Revista Brasileira de Psicanálise* 41(1), pp. 33-45.
- Baruch C. (2009), 'Les pulsations de l'inconscient', *Champ Psychosomatique* 54, pp.63-70.
- Bass, A. (1992), 'Cultivating Freud's garden in France. Marion Oliner. North vale, NJ: Aronson, 1988, xvii + 332 pp.', *The Psychoanalytic Review* 79, pp. 147-149.
- Becker, L.C. (1998), *A new Stoicism*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Begoin J. and Le Guillant, L. (1957), 'Quelques remarques méthodologiques à propos de la névrose des téléphonistes', in: Le Guillant (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y. ,Toulouse: Érès, pp. 91-129.
- Belliard, S. (2012), *La couleur dans la peau: Ce que voit l'inconscient*, Paris: Albin-Michel.
- Benjamin, W. (1923 [1921], 'Die Aufgabe des Übersetzers', in: Rexroth, T., ed. (1991), *Walter Benjamin. Gesammelte Schriften*, volume 4.1, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, pp. 9-21.
- Benjamin, W. (1933a), 'Erfahrung und Armut', 'Metaphysisch-geschichtsphilosophische Studien', in: Benjamin, W. (1991), *Gesammelte Schriften* II.1, ed. Tiedemann, R. and Schweppenhäuser H., Suhrkamp: Frankfurt am Main, pp. 213-219.
- Benjamin, W. (1933b), 'Kurze Schatten II', in: Rexroth, T., ed. (1991), *Walter Benjamin. Gesammelte Schriften*, volume 4.1, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, pp. 425-428.
- Bennani, J. (2008), *Psychanalyse en terre d'islam. Introduction à la psychanalyse au Maghreb*, 2nd edition, Toulouse: Éditions érès.
- Benvenuto, S. and Green, A. (1994), 'Against Lacanism. A conversation of André Green with Sergio Benvenuto', *Journal of European Psychoanalysis. Humanities, Philosophy, Psychotherapies* 2.
- Bergson, H. (1907), *L'évolution créatrice*, 5th edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France [in English translation: Bergson, H. (1911), *Creative evolution*, translated by Mitchell, A., London: Macmillan.
- Berlant, L. (2011), *Cruel optimism*, Durham, N.C: Duke University Press.
- Bernier, M.-C. (1994), 'Pierre Marty et la naissance de l'IPSO. Quelques souvenirs', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 163-166.
- Bernstein, R.J. (1992), *The new constellation: The ethical-political horizons of modernity/postmodernity*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press.
- Bernstein, R.J. (1998), *Freud and the legacy of Moses*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Bernstein, R.J. (2013), 'Jan Assmann: The mosaic distinction and religious violence', in: *Violence: thinking without banisters*, Cambridge: Polity Press, pp. 128-158.
- Berthou, B. and Guislain, G. (2005), *Les grands auteurs contemporains*, Paris: Jeunes Éditions.
- Berthoz, A. (1993), 'Julian de Ajuriaguerra (1911-1993)', available at: http://www.college-de-france.fr/media/professeurs-disparus/UPL31747_necrodeajuriaguerra.pdf, accessed 1st January 2017.
- Bertrand, M. (1997), *Francis Pasche (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 13)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Biersack, A. (1989), 'Local knowledge, local history: Geertz and beyond', in: Hunt, L., ed., *The new cultural history*, Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 72-96.
- Billiard, I. (2001a), *Santé mentale et travail. L'émergence de la psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: La Dispute/SNÉDIT.
- Billiard, I. (2001b), 'Claude Veil, un pionnier de la psychopathologie du travail', *Travailler* 5, pp. 175-188.
- Billiard, I. (2002a), 'Les pères fondateurs de la psychopathologie du travail en butte à l'énigme du travail', *Cliniques Méditerranéennes* 66, pp. 11-29.
- Billiard, I. (2002b), 'Lettre à la rédaction: réponse à l'article de S.Buisson "Les origines de la psychopathologie du travail: mythe ou légende?"', *Travailler* 8, pp. 211-214.
- Bion, J-F. (1708), *Relation des tourments qu'on fait souffrir aux protestants qui sont sur les galères de France*, new edition 1881, Paris: Grassart.
- Bion, W. R. (1965), *Transformations*, [reprint] London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W. R. (1967), 'Notes on memory and desire', *The Psychoanalytic Forum* 2(3), pp. 271-280.
- Bion, W.R. (1970) *Attention and interpretation*, London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W.R. (1977[1971]), 'The grid', in: Bion, W.R (1989/1977), *Two papers: The grid and caesura*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 2-33.
- Bion, W.R [1977], 'New York', in: Bion, F., ed. (1980), *Bion in New York and Sao Paulo*, Perthshire: Clunie Press, pp. 9-74.
- Bion, W. R. (1978[1976]), 'Evidence', in: Bion, F., ed. (1994), *Clinical seminars and other work*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 312-320.
- Bion, W. R., (1982), *The long week-end 1897-1919. Part of a life*, ed. Bion, F., London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W. R. (1985), *All my sins remembered*, ed. Bion F., London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W. R.(1990), *Brazilian lectures (1973-74)*, London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W. R. (1994[1978], [Seminar in] 'São Paulo', in: Bion, W. R. (1994), *Clinical seminars and other works*, ed. Bion, F., London: Karnac Books, pp. 141-240.
- Bion, W. R. (1991[1975-1981]), *A memoir of the future*, London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W.R. (1992), *Cogitations*, London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W.R. (1994), *Clinical seminars and other works*, ed. Bion, F., London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W.R. (1997), *War memoirs 1917-19*, ed. Bion, F., London: Karnac Books.

- Bion, W.R. (2005[1985]), *The Italian seminars of Wilfred R. Bion*, London: Karnac Books.
- Bion, W.R. and Green, A. (2005). 'Cogitations', *L'Année Psychanalytique Internationale* 2005, pp. 233-241.
- Birksted-Breen, D., Gibeault, A. and Flanders, S. eds. (2010), *Reading French psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge.
- Birksted-Breen, D. and Flanders, S. (2010), 'General introduction', in Birksted-Breen, D., Gibeault, A. and Flanders, S. eds. (2010), *Reading French psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge, pp. 1-59.
- Birraux, A. (1996), 'Le sujet et l'autre', in: de Mijolla, A. and de Mijolla-Mellor, S. *Psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 379-431.
- Bitbol, M. (1998), *L'aveuglante proximité du réel*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Blake, W. (1977), *The complete poems*, ed. Ostriker, A., Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books.
- Bohleber, W. (2010), *Destructiveness, intersubjectivity and trauma. The identity crisis of modern psychoanalysis*, London:Karnac Books.
- Bohleber, W. (2012/2010), *Was Psychoanalyse heute leistet*, Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta [German language edition of 2010 with text variants].
- Bohleber, W., Jiménez, J.P., Scarfone, D., Varvin, S. and Zysman, S. (2015), 'Unconscious phantasy and its conceptualizations: An attempt at conceptual integration', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 96(3), pp. 705-730.
- Bokanowski, T. (1997), *Sándor Ferenczi (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 9)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Bokanowski, T. (2012), 'Le concept de traumatisme en psychanalyse', in: Marty, F., ed., *Les grands concepts de la psychologie clinique*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod, pp. 283-298.
- Bokanowski, T. (2014), 'Trauma et crise de la représentation', available at: <https://www.spp.asso.fr/textes/textes-et-conferences/reflexions-de-psychanalystes-2/trauma-et-crise-de-la-representation/>, accessed 23rd August 2018.
- Bollas, C. (1987), *The shadow of the object. Psychoanalysis of the unthought known*, London: Free Association Books.
- Bollas, C. (1989), *Forces of destiny. Psychoanalysis and human idiom*, London: Free Association Books.
- Bollas, C. (1992), *Being a character. Psychoanalysis and self experience*, London: Routledge.
- Bollas, C. (1995), 'The functions of history', in: Bollas, C. (1995), *Cracking up. The work of unconscious experience*, London: Routledge, pp. 103-145.
- Bollas, C. (2000), 'Architecture and the unconscious', *International Forum of Psychoanalysis* 9(1-2), pp. 28-42.
- Bollas, C. (2009/2000), 'Architecture and the unconscious', in: Bollas, C. (2009), *The evocative object world*, London: Routledge, pp. 47-77. [=Bollas 2000, with emendations].
- Bonaparte, M. (1955[1954]), 'Intervention' on Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a), 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 285-286.

- Bonchino, A. (2003), 'Sulle letture francesi di Hegel', *Intersezioni. Rivista di storia delle idee* 1/2003, pp. 103-129.
- Borgogno, F. (2007), 'Ferenczi and Winnicott: Searching for a "missing link" (of the soul)', *The American Journal of Psychoanalysis* 67(3), pp. 221-234.
- Botella, C. (1991), 'La memoire sans souvenirs', in: *Avancés metapsychologique. L'enfant. La famille*, Paris: Apsygée, pp. 121-126.
- Botella, C. (1997a), [contribution to 'Discussion de la conférence d'André Green'], in: Piñol-Douriez, M., ed., *Pulsions. Représentations. Langage*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 67-70.
- Botella, C. (1997b), [contribution to 'Discussion de l'exposé de G.Gimenez'], in: Piñol-Douriez, M., ed., *Pulsions. Représentations. Langage*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 128-132.
- Botella, C. (1999), 'Entrevista con César Botella', *Revista Uruguaya de Psicoanálisis* 90, pp. 238-253.
- Botella, C. (2001), 'À propos du livre de Jacques Press. La perle et le grain de sable (Traumatisme et fonctionnement mental): Essai psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 181-190.
- Botella, C. (2002), 'Motifs et raisons: la pensée psychanalytique en question', in: Botella, C., ed., *Penser les limites. Écrits en l'honneur d'André Green*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 21-32.
- Botella, C. (2003), 'Propositions pour une recherche psychanalytique fondamentale', in: Green, A., ed., *Le travail psychanalytique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 27-41.
- Botella, C. (2005a), 'Enjeux pour une psychanalyse de demain', in: Richard F. and Urribarri F. eds., *Autour de l'œuvre d'André Green. Enjeux pour une psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 11-31.
- Botella, C. (2005b), 'Levels of memory and truth: Their interpretation' [= 'Les niveaux de mémoire et de vérité: leur interprétation'], *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 59, pp. 36-43.
- Botella, C. (2006), 'Reflexion conclusive', in: Green, A., ed., *Unité et diversité des pratiques du psychanalyste*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 185-192.
- Botella, C. (2007), 'Entrevista', *Revista Brasileira de Psicanálise* 41(1), pp. 19-29.
- Botella, C. (2008), 'Œdipe et Don Juan. À propos de l'image du père chez quelques fils célèbres', in: Cupa, D., ed., *Image du père dans la culture contemporaine. Hommages à André Green*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 396-406.
- Botella, C. (2011a), 'Sur les "limitations" de la méthode freudienne', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 40, pp. 109-132.
- Botella, C. (2011b), 'Préface. Nous sommes tous des exilés', in: Lussier, M., *Terre d'asile, terre de deuil. Le travail psychique d'exil*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 1-5.
- Botella, C. (2014a), 'De l' "attention flottante" de Freud à l' "expression associative" de Marty. Une nouvelle perspective dans la méthode psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 45, pp. 83-102.
- Botella, C. (2014b), 'L'œuvre de Green et l'évolution de la pensée analytique', in: Chervet, B., ed., *Hommage à André Green*, Paris: Société Psychanalytique de Paris, pp. 31-37.

- Botella, C. (2015a), 'Sur la remémoration: la notion de mémoire sans souvenirs', *L'Année psychanalytique internationale 2015*, Paris: Éditions in Press, pp. 197-231 [= Botella C. (2014), 'On remembering: The notion of memory without recollection', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 95, pp. 911-936].
- Botella, C. (2015b), 'Meutre et transmission. Préhistoire et psychanalyse. Quelle rencontre?', in: Chervet, B., ed., *Le meurtre fondateur. L'acte psychique par excellence*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 75-79.
- Botella, C. (2016), 'Mémoire sans souvenirs. Cas limites et psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 50, pp. 183-206.
- Botella, C. (2018a), 'Simultanéité en séance/Diachronie du processus', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 82(1), pp. 26-38.
- Botella, C. (2018b), 'L'évolutivité primordiale de la psychanalyse. Diversification théorique et tendance unificatrice - Dialogue avec Jorge Canestri', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 82(3), pp. 719-739.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1984), 'L'homosexualité inconsciente et la dynamique du double en séance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(3), pp. 687-708. [in English available as: Botella, C. (2010/1995), 'Working as a double', in: Birksted-Breen, D., Gibeault, A. and Flanders, S. eds. (2010), *Reading French psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge, pp. 367-387.]
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1988), 'Trauma et topique (Aspects techniques de l'abord du trauma en séance)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 52(6), pp. 1461-1477.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1990), 'La problématique de la régression formelle de la pensée et de l'hallucinatoire', in: Le Guen, C., ed., *La psychanalyse: questions pour demain*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 63-90.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1992a), 'Le statut métapsychologique de la perception et l'irreprésentable', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(1), pp. 23-41.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1992b), 'Névrose traumatique et cohérence psychique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 2, pp. 25-36.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1995a), 'La dualité négative du psychisme', in: Green, A., Favarel-Garrigues, B., Guillaumin, J. and Fédida, P., *Le négatif. Travail et pensée*, Le Bouscat: Édition L'Esprit du temps, pp. 63-82.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1995b), 'Sur le processus analytique: du perceptif aux causalités psychiques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(2), pp. 349-366.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1995c), 'A propos du processuel: automate ou sexuel infantile?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(5-6), pp. 1609-1615.
- Botella, C. and Botella S. (1995d), 'La dynamique du double: animique, auto-érotique, narcissique: le travail en double', in: Couvreur, C., Fine A. and Le Guen, A. eds., *Le double*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 65-82.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1996), 'La tendance convergente de la régression narcissique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 109-125.
- Botella, C and Botella, S. (1997a), 'L'inachèvement de toute analyse: le processuel: introduction à la notion d'irréversibilité psychique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 61(4), pp. 1125-1144.

- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (1997b), 'Pulsions, représentations, langage', in: Piñol-Douriez, M., ed., *Pulsions. Représentations. Langage*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 179-194.
- Botella, C. and Botella S. (1998), 'Pour un monisme sexuel psyché-soma', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1483-1492.
- Botella, C. and Botella S. (1999), 'La thérapie de Jasmine, une communauté dans la régression de la pensée', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 2, pp. 121-132.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2001a), *La figurabilité psychique*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2001b), 'De la recherche en psychanalyse', in: Green, A., ed., *Courants de la psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 355-372.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2001c), 'Figurabilité et régrédience', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 65(4), pp. 1149-1239.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2005), *The work of psychic figurability. Mental states without representation*, London: Routledge.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2006), 'Pour une métapsychologie de la remémoration', in: Green, A., ed., *Les voies nouvelles de la thérapie psychanalytique. Le dedans et le dehors*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 709-731.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2007), 'Préface à la deuxième édition: "Figurabilité", embarras du traducteur et du psychanalyste', in: Botella, C. and Botella S., *La figurabilité psychique*, 2nd edition, Paris: Éditions In Press.
- Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2013), 'Psychic figurability and unrepresented states', in: Levine, H.B, Reed, G.S and Scarfone, D. eds., *Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning. Clinical and theoretical contributions*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 95-121.
- Botella, C., Botella, S. and Haag, G. (1977), 'En deça du suçotement', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(5-6), pp. 985-992.
- Botella, S. (1997), [contribution to 'Discussion de la conférence d'André Green'], in: Piñol-Douriez, M., ed., *Pulsions. Représentations. Langage*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 73-78.
- Botella, S. (2002), 'Une approche psychanalytique de la langue maternelle', in: Botella, C., ed., *Penser les limites. Écrits en l'honneur d'André Green*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 79-86.
- Botella, S. (2003a), 'L'élaboration autour de l'objet perdu', in: Green, A., ed., *Le travail psychanalytique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 195-201.
- Botella, S. (2003b), 'Une "théorie implicite" de la pratique analytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 67(4), pp. 1173-1184.
- Botella, S. (2004), 'Quelques réflexions après le Colloque: "Autour du champ dépressif" ', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 68(4), pp. 1299-1304.
- Botella, S. (2005a), 'L'Œdipe du ça ou Œdipe sans complexe', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 69(3), pp. 717-729.
- Botella, S. (2005b), 'Racines traumatiques du complexe d'Œdipe', in: Richard F. and Urribarri F. eds., *Autour de l'œuvre d'André Green. Enjeux pour une psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 343-359.

- Botella, S. (2007), 'La naissance de la pulsion. Les processus originaires et la pratique analytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 71(1), pp. 27-39.
- Botella, S. (2010), 'De la mémoire du Ça', in: Bayle, G., ed., *L'inconscient freudien. Recherche, écoute, métapsychologie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 161-170.
- Botella, S. (2013a), 'La mémoire du rêve. Un conflit épistémique dans la théorie freudienne', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 77(1), pp. 160-169.
- Botella, S. (2013b), 'À propos des processus transformationnels dans la théorie freudienne', in: Press, J., ed., *Rêver, transformer, somatiser*, Chêne-Bourg: Georg Editeur, pp. 141-147.
- Botella, S. (2014a), 'La valeur psychanalytique du "procédé d'investigation" de Pierre Marty. Notes en marge de la relecture aujourd'hui d'une investigation psychosomatique publiée en 1963', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 45, pp. 77-81.
- Botella, S. (2014b), 'Sur le négatif psychique dans l'œuvre d'André Green', in: Chervet, B., ed., *Hommage à André Green*, Paris: Société Psychanalytique de Paris, pp. 39-43.
- Botella, S. (2018), 'De 'L'Interprétation du rêve' à 'L'Homme Moïse' : La liberté de penser chez Freud', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 82(2), pp. 499-508.
- Botella, S., Botella C. and Smadja, C. 'Discussion' (1998a), *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 27-42.
- Botella, S., Botella C. and Smadja, C. 'Discussion' (1998b), *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 55-71.
- Botella, S., Botella C., Nicolaïdis, N. and Smadja, C. 'Discussion' (1998), *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 91-106.
- Bouchet-Kervella, D. (2001), 'L'évolution des courants de pensée au sein de l'École de psychosomatique de Paris à travers la "Revue française de psychosomatique"', in: Green, A., ed., *Courants de la psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 442-444.
- Boulanger, G. (2002a), 'The cost of survival: Psychoanalysis and adult onset trauma', *Contemporary Psychoanalysis* 38(1), pp. 17-44.
- Boulanger, G. (2002b), 'Wounded by reality: The collapse of the self in adult onset trauma', *Contemporary Psychoanalysis* 38(1), pp. 45-76.
- Bourdin, D. (2007), *La psychanalyse de Freud à aujourd'hui*, Rosny: Editions Bréal.
- Bourke, J. (2014), *The story of pain. From prayer to painkillers*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bouvier, N. (2014/1963), *L'usage du monde*, Paris: La Découverte.
- Braconnier, A. (2003), 'Entretien avec Michel de M'Uzan', *Le Carnet PSY* 84, pp. 28-33.
- Braconnier, A. (2007), 'Entretien avec Paul Denis', *Le Carnet PSY* 122, pp. 40-49.
- Braconnier, A., Musiol, M. and Advenier, F. (2008), 'La controverse entre Daniel Widlöcher, Jean Laplanche et Peter Fonagy: Avez-vous lu Freud? Avez-vous lu Bowlby?', in: Widlöcher, D., ed., *Les psychanalystes savent-ils débattre?* Paris: Odile Jacob, pp. 151-170.
- Brakel, L.A. (2004), 'Ego constriction', *American Journal of Psychoanalysis* 64(3), pp. 267-277.
- Braudel, F. (1982), *On history*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- Braunschweig, D. (1967), 'Intervention' [on Luquet-Parat, C.-J. 'L'organisation œdipienne du stade génital'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(5-6), pp. 853-857.
- Braunschweig, D. (1982), 'Introduction', in: Fain, M. (1982), *Le désir de l'interprète*, Paris: Éditions Aubier Montaigne, pp. 7-13.
- Braunschweig, D. (1984), 'Psychosomatique et psychanalyse', in Fain, M. and Dejours, C. eds., *Corps malade et corps érotique*, Paris: Masson, pp. 116-122.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1970), [Intervention] [on Green, A., 'L'affect'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 34(5-6), pp. 1175-1182.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1971), *Éros et Antéros*, Paris: Payot.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1974), 'A propos du rêve symptôme', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 38(5-6), pp. 1041-1046.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1975a), *La nuit, le jour. Essai psychanalytique sur le fonctionnement mental*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1975b), 'Le messianisme en psychanalyse', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 39(1-2), pp. 195-224.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1976), 'Réflexions introductives à l'étude de quelques facteurs actifs dans le contre-transfert', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 40(3), pp. 483-540.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1977), 'Des mécanismes communs à l'auto-érotisme et à l'interprétation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(5-6), pp. 993-1002.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1979), 'Quelques réflexions à propos du livre de Michel Neyraut "Les logiques de l'inconscient"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 43(2), pp. 343-348.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1981a[1976]), 'Un aspect de la constitution de la source pulsionnelle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(1), pp. 205-226.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1981b), 'Bloc-notes et lanterne magiques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(5), pp. 1221-1242.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1983), 'Symptôme névrotique, symptôme de transfert : commentaire basé sur les conférences réunies sous le nom "Introduction à la psychanalyse"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 47(2), pp. 567-590.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1983[1975]), *I ritmi della vita mentale* [= *La nuit, le jour: Essai psychanalytique sur le fonctionnement mental*], translated by Pavan G., Rome: Edizione Borla.
- Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (2010/1974), 'Du démon du bien et des infortunes de la vertu', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 151-171; first published in: *Nouvelle Revue de psychanalyse* 10, pp. 161-178.
- Brede, K., ed., (1974), *Einführung in die psychosomatische Medizin*, reprint 1980, Frankfurt am Main: Syndikat Verlag.
- Bridge, M. (2013), 'Moving out - disruption and repair to the internal setting', *British Journal of Psychotherapy* 29(4), pp. 481-493.
- Britton, R. (1993), 'The missing link: parental sexuality in the Oedipus complex', in: Breen, D., ed., *The gender conundrum. Contemporary psychoanalytic perspectives on femininity and masculinity*, London: Routledge, pp. 82-94.

- Bromberg, P. (1998), *Standing in the spaces. Essays on clinical process, trauma, and dissociation*, New York: The Analytic Press.
- Bronstein, C. (2011), 'On psychosomatics: The search for meaning', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 92(1), pp. 173-195.
- Bronstein, C. (2016), 'Formlessness and countertransference: Discussion of J. Press, 'Metapsychological and clinical issues in psychosomatics research', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 97(1), pp. 115-122.
- Brooks, V.W. (1918), 'On creating a usable past', *The Dial* 64(11), pp.337-41.
- Brown, T. M. (2000), 'The rise and fall of American psychosomatic medicine', available at: <http://www.human-nature.com/free-associations/riseandfall.html>, accessed 11th January 2017.
- Browne, H. (2018), 'Regression. Allowing the future to be re-imagined', in: Kohon, G., ed., *British psychoanalysis. New perspectives in the Independent tradition*, Abingdon-on-Thames: Routledge, pp. 209-223.
- Buchan, J. (1919), *Mr Standfast*, new edition 1998, London: Wordsworth Editions.
- Buisson, S. (2002), 'Les origines de la psychopathologie du travail: mythe fondateur ou légende?' *Travailler* 8, pp. 199-210.
- Busch, F. (2018), 'Searching for the analyst's reveries', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(3), pp. 569-589.
- Bush, D., ed., (1966), *Milton. Poetical works*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Buzzati, D. (1940), *Il deserto dei tartari*, edition 1989, Milano: Oscar Mondadori Editore.
- Cabanel, P. (1998), *Histoire des Cevennes*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Cahn, R. (1992), 'In memoriam: René Held (1896-1992)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(2), pp. 631-633.
- Canestri, J. (1982), 'Un'alternativa inesistente: terapia e conoscenza in psicoanalisi', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 28(4), pp. 526-539.
- Capaldi, N. (2004), *John Stuart Mill. A biography*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Carapanos, F. and Potamianou A. (1980), 'Langage, désir', in: Anzieu, D., Carapanos, F., Gillibert, J., Green, A., Nicolaïdis, N., and Potamianou, A. (1980), *Psychanalyse et culture Grecque*, Paris: Société d'Édition des Belles Lettres, pp. 53-100.
- Carlyle, T. (1837), *The French Revolution. A history*, London: Chapman & Hall.
- Carton, S. (2011), 'Silence des émotions, silence des affects dans les dépression', in: Carton, S., Chabert, C. and Corcos, M., *Le silence des émotions. Clinique psychanalytique des états vides d'affects*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 9-76.
- Carton, S., Chabert, C. and Corcos, M. (2011), *Le silence des émotions. Clinique psychanalytique des états vides d'affects*, Paris: Dunod.
- Cassullo, G. (2010), 'Recognizing Charles Rycroft', *The American Journal of Psychoanalysis* 70(2), pp. 193-206.
- Castoriadis, C. (1975), *L'institution imaginaire de la société*, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Cavell, M. (2006), *Becoming a subject. Reflections in philosophy and psychoanalysis*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- CDFT France Télécom-Orange and Dejours, C. (2012), *Souffrance au travail. Regards croisés sur des cas concrets. Comprendre, prévenir, agir*, Lyon: Chronique Sociale.
- Chabane, M. (1984), 'Virilité et paternité. A propos des plaintes somatiques des hommes du Maghreb', *Psychanalystes. Revue du Collège de Psychanalystes* 12, pp. 19-38.
- Chabert, C. (1994), 'Les approches structurales', in: Widlöcher, D., ed., *Traité de psychopathologie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 105-157.
- Chagnon, J-Y. (2012), *45 commentaires de textes en psychopathologie psychanalytique*, Paris: Dunod.
- Chamcham, R. (1998), 'Les babouches sur le divan ou le parole inaffective', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp.1659-1666.
- Chapman, A. (2012), 'Robert Browning's homesickness', *Victorian Poetry* 50(4), pp. 469-484
- Chapman, L. (2016), 'Father, don't you see I'm burning?', available at: http://www.therapeia.org.uk/wp/touching-the-real-2/father-dont-you-see-im-burning/#identifieur_1_2988, accessed 13th May 2017.
- Charbonnier, G. (2008), 'Construire autour d'un grain de sable; intervention sur le rapport de Jacques Press', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 72(5), pp. 1351-1358.
- Chasseguet-Smirgel, J. (1973), 'Essai sur l'idéal du Moi'. Contribution à l'étude de "la maladie d'idéalité" ', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 37(5-6), pp. 735-929.
- Chazaud, J. (2004), 'Place et influence des conceptions de Pierre Janet dans l'élaboration de l'œuvre d'Henri Ey', *L'Information Psychiatrique* 80, pp. 403-406.
- Chekhov, A. P. (1887), *Typhus*, available at: <http://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/13413/pg13413-images.html>, accessed 4th September 2017.
- Chekhov, A. P. (1894), *Rothschild's fiddle*, in: Chekhov, A. P. (1917), *Rothschild's fiddle and other stories*, New York: The Modern Library, pp. 1-12.
- Chemouni, J. (1991), *Histoire de la psychanalyse en France*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Chemouni, J. (2010), *Psychosomatique de l'enfant et de l'adulte*, 3rd edition, Paris: Editions in Press.
- Chiland, C., ed. (1981), *Les ecoles psychanalytiques. La psychanalyse en mouvement*, Paris: Tchou.
- Chiland, C. (1990), *Homo psychanalyticus*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Chiland, C. (1992[1988]), 'Quelques réflexions sur les concepts d'identité et d'identification', in: Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds., *L'enfant dans sa famille, volume 8: Le développement en péril* [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1988), *The child in his family, volume 8: Perilous development: child raising and identity formation under stress*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 57-71.
- Chiland, C. (2015), 'Dialogue avec Colette Chiland (interlocuteur: Alain Casanova)', in: Quartier F. and Casanova A. eds. (2015), *L'héritage vivant de René Diatkine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 201-208.
- Ciavaldini, A. (2007), 'L'hallucinatoire: de l'espoir à l'émerveillement. Discussion du texte de Jacques Press', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 10, pp. 63-69.

- Clair, M. A. (2003), 'Le traumatique, répétition et élaboration', *Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis* 11, pp. 229-233.
- Clarke, G.S. (2006), *Personal Relations Theory. Fairbairn, MacMurray and Suttie*, Hove, East Sussex: Routledge.
- Cleach, O. (2014), 'Claude Veil, Vulnérabilités au travail. Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail. Recueil de textes présentés par Dominique Lhuilier, Toulouse: Érès, 2012' *La nouvelle revue du travail* [Online: <http://nrt.revues.org/1765>] 4, accessed 26th September 2015.
- Clervoy, P. (1997), *Henri Ey 1900-1977. Cinquante ans de psychiatrie en France*, Le Plessis-Robinson: Institut Synthélabo.
- Clot, Y. (1995), *Le travail sans l'homme? Pour une psychologie des milieux de travail et de vie*, Paris: La Découverte.
- Clot, Y. (2006a), 'Après Le Guillant: quelle clinique du travail?', *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 7-36.
- Clot, Y. (2006b), 'Clinique du travail et clinique de l'activité', *Nouvelle Revue de Psychosociologie* 1, pp. 165-177.
- Clot, Y. (2009), 'Postface. L'apport de François Tosquelles à la clinique du travail', Tosquelles, F. (1967), *Le travail thérapeutique à l'hôpital psychiatrique*, 2nd edition, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 143-162.
- Clot, Y. (2010/2015), *Le travail à coeur. Pour en finir avec les risques psychosociaux*, new edition 2015, Paris: La Découverte.
- Clot, Y. (2015), 'Postface à l'édition de 2015', in: Clot, Y. (2010/2015), *Le travail à coeur. Pour en finir avec les risques psychosociaux*, new edition 2015, Paris: La Découverte, pp. 189-196.
- Coddens, M. (2008), 'La Belgique et la psychanalyse. Un rendez-vous manqué?', *Le Bulletin Freudien* 51-52, pp. 17-51.
- Cohen, S. (1984), *Vietnam. Anthology and guide to a television history*, New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Cohen, S. (2001), *States of denial. Knowing about atrocities and suffering*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Colman, W. (2006), 'Imagination and the imaginary', *Journal of Analytical Psychology* 51, pp.21-41.
- Coltart, N. (1993), *How to survive as a psychotherapist*, London: Sheldon Press.
- Conrotto, F. (2014), 'Introduction', in: Valdre, R., *On sublimation. A path to the destiny of desire, theory and treatment*, London: Karnac Books, pp. xiii-xvi.
- Conté, C. (1993/2003), 'Métaphore paternelle', in: Kaufmann, P., ed., *L'apport freudien. Éléments pour une encyclopédie de la psychanalyse*, pp. 314-319.
- Conze, E. (1951), *Buddhism: Its essence and development*, reprint, New York: Dover publications.
- Corcos, M. (2011), 'Alexithymie: une émotion sans qualité', in: Carton, S., Chabert, C. and Corcos, M., *Le silence des émotions. Clinique psychanalytique des états vides d'affects*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 141-241.

- Correale, A. (2007), *Il campo istituzionale*, 3rd edition, *Prospettiva della Ricerca Psicoanalitica*, Roma: Edizione Borla.
- Cosnier, J. (1978), 'Analyse de: Braunschweig D., Fain M., La nuit, je jour. Essai psychanalytique sur le fonctionnement mental. Paris, PUF, 1975', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 42(1), pp. 123-146.
- Cottureau, A. (1983), 'L'usure au travail: interrogations et refoulements', *Le Mouvement Social* 124, pp. 3-9.
- Cournut, J. (1983), 'D'un reste qui fait lien', *Nouvelle Revue de Psychanalyse* 28, pp. 129-149.
- Cournut, J., Israël, P., Jeanneau, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds. (1997), *Le mal-être (angoisse et violence). Débats de psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Cousin, B. (2008), 'Sous le pavés la plage. Quarante ans après', at: <http://users.skynet.be/ddz/mai68/temoignages/souslespaves.html>, accessed 6th September 2015.
- Cousins, N. (1983), *The healing heart*, New York: W.W. Norton.
- Couvreur, C. (1990), Notes de lecture: "Le corps entre biologie et psychanalyse" de Christophe Dejours, *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(3), pp. 875-882.
- Cramer, B., Denis P., Henny, R., Nicolaïdis, N., and Szewc, G. (1999), 'Discussion', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 2, pp. 13-19.
- Cremerius, J. (1977), 'Ist die „psychosomatische Struktur“ der französischen Schule krankheitsspezifisch?', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 31(4), pp. 293-317.
- Cremerius, J., Hoffmann, S.O., Hoffmeister, W. and Trimborn, W. (1979), 'Die manipulierten Objekte: Ein kritischer Beitrag zur Untersuchungsmethode der französischen Schule der Psychosomatik', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 33(9-10), pp. 801-828.
- Cushman, P. (1995), *Constructing the self, constructing America. A cultural history of psychotherapy*, Reading, Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley.
- d'Aboville, G. (1992), *Seul*, Paris: Éditions Robert Laffont.
- Damasio, A. (1994), *Descartes' error. Emotion, reason and the human brain*, London: Vintage Books.
- Damasio, A. (1999), *The feeling of what happens. Body and emotion in the making of consciousness*, New York: Harcourt Inc.
- Danon-Boileau, L. (1998), *Christian David (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 19)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Danon-Boileau, L. (2002), 'négation', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 2, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 1140-1142.
- Dashtipour, P. and Vidaillet, B. (2017), 'Work as affective experience: The contribution of Christophe Dejours' 'psychodynamics of work' ', *Organization* 24(1), pp.18-35.
- David, C. (1967), 'Intervention', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(5-6), pp. 1127-1128.
- David, C. and de M'Uzan, M. (1994), 'Origine et travaux initiaux', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 13-22.

- Davoine, F. and Gaudillière, J.-M. (2004), *History beyond trauma. Whereof one cannot speak, thereof one cannot stay silent*, New York: The Other Press.
- Davoine, L and Méda, D. (2008), 'Place et sens du travail en Europe. Une singularité française?'. *Document de Travail pour le Centre d'Étude de l'Emploi* 96(1), available at: <http://www.cce-recherche.fr/publications/document-de-travail/place-et-sens-du-travail-en-europe-une-singularite-francaise>, accessed 16th Octobre 2015.
- de Ajuriaguerra, J. (1955[1954]), 'Intervention' [on Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a), 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 295-299.
- de Balzac, H. (1834), *Eugénie Grandet*, Paris: Madame-Béchet.
- De Bandt, J., Dejours, C. and Dubar, C. (1995), *La France malade du travail*, Paris: Bayard Éditions.
- de Calatroni, M.T., ed., (1998), *Pierre Marty y la psicósomática*, Buenos Aires: Amorrortu/editores.
- de Gaulle, C. (1954), *Mémoires de guerre*, volume 1: *L'appel 1940-1942*, Paris: Plon.
- de M'Uzan, M. (1965), 'Intervention de M. de M'Uzan', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 28, pp.28-34.
- de M'Uzan, M. (1994), *La bouche de l'inconscient. Essais sur l'interprétation*, Paris: Éditions Gallimard.
- de M'Uzan, M. (1998), 'Impasses de la théorie, théories indispensables', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1459-1463.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2004), 'Nosographie et auto-conservation', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 61-70.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2007), 'Au-delà des frontières', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 71(5), pp. 1521-1527.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2008a), 'Réponse à Jacques Press', in: de M'Uzan, M., ed., *La chimère des inconscients*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 39-48.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2008b), 'L'École psychosomatique de Paris', in: Denis, P., ed., *Avancées de la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 25-29.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2009), 'Cinquante ans après...', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp.9-15.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2010), 'Aux origines d'une pensée', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 17-20.
- de M'Uzan, M. (2011), 'Réponse à Claude Smadja', in: Baruch, C., ed., *Nouveaux développements en psychanalyse. Autour de la pensée de Michel de M'Uzan*, Sèvres: Éditions EDK, pp. 83-87.
- De Micco, V. (2014), 'Trapiantare/tramandare. Legami e identificazioni nei transiti migratori', in De Micco V. and Grassi L. eds., *Soggetti in transito. Etnopsicoanalisi e migrazioni, Interazioni. Clinica e ricerca psicoanalitica su individuo-coppia-famiglia* 39, Milano: F. Angeli.
- De Micco, V. (2016), 'La pelle che abito, il nome che porto: Fratture culturali e legami transgenerazionali nei bambini migranti', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 62(1), pp. 231-240.

- De Micco, V. (2018), 'Migration: Surviving the inhumane', *The Italian Psychoanalytic Annual* 12, pp. 117-125.
- de Mijolla-Mellor, S. (1995), 'Potentialité des scissions dans la théorie psychanalytique elle-même', *Topique* 57, pp. 291-305.
- de Mijolla-Mellor, S. (1996a), 'L'interprétable et la pratique de l'interprétation', in: de Mijolla, A. and de Mijolla-Mellor, S. *Psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 87-166.
- de Mijolla-Mellor, S. (1996b), 'Le statut de la représentation', in: de Mijolla, A. and de Mijolla-Mellor, S. *Psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 359-378.
- de Mijolla, A. (1981/2003), *Les visiteurs du moi*, Paris: Les Belles Lettres.
- de Mijolla, A. (1982), 'La psychanalyse en France (1893-1965)', in: Jaccard, R., ed., *Histoire de la psychanalyse*, volume 2, Paris: Hachard.
- de Mijolla, A. (1989), 'Documents inédits. Les psychanalystes en France durant l'occupation allemande, Paris, novembre 1943', *Revue Internationale d'Histoire de la Psychanalyse* 2, pp. 463-473.
- de Mijolla, A. (1995), 'Les scissions dans le mouvement psychanalytique français de 1953 à 1964', *Topique* 57, pp. 271-290.
- de Mijolla, A. (1996), 'La scission de la Société Psychanalytique de Paris en 1953, quelques notes pour un rappel historique', *Cliniques méditerranéennes* 49-50, pp. 9-30, also available at: <http://www.spp.asso.fr/textes/la-scission-de-la-societe-psychanalytique-de-paris-en-1953-quelques-notes-pour-un-rappel-historique/?print=pdf>, last accessed 23rd August 2018.
- de Mijolla, A. (2002), 'Psychanalyse et histoire: leur "intérêt" commun', in: Botella, C., ed., *Penser les limites. Écrits en l'honneur d'André Green*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 294-304.
- de Mijolla, A. (2003), 'Psychoanalysis and Psychoanalysts in France between 1939 and 1945', *International Forum of Psychoanalysis* 12, pp. 136-156.
- de Mijolla, A. (2007), 'Petite histoire d'une histoire de la psychanalyse en France', *Topique* 98, pp. 37-47.
- de Mijolla, A. (2010a), *Freud et la France, 1885-1945*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- de Mijolla, A. (2010b), 'Some distinctive features of the history of psychoanalysis in France', in: Birksted-Breen, D., Gibeault A. and Flanders, S. eds. (2010), *Reading French Psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge, pp. 60-72.
- de Mijolla, A. (2010b), Interview in: 'Tout arrive' (Radio France Culture), broadcast 8th March 2010.
- de Mijolla, A. (2012a), *La France et Freud*, volume 1: 1946-1953. *Une pénible renaissance*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- de Mijolla, A. (2012b), *La France et Freud*, volume 2: 1954-1964. *D'une scission à l'autre*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- de Tychev, C. (2010), 'Alexithymie et pensée opératoire: Approche comparative clinique projective franco-américaine', *Psychologie Clinique et Projective* 16, pp. 177-207.
- De Viti de Marco, A. (1929), *Un trentennio di lotte politiche*, Roma: Collezione meridionale.

- Debray, R. (1994), 'L'influence et le rayonnement des conceptions de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 105-109.
- Debray, R. (1996), *Clinique de l'expression somatique*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Debray, R. (1998), *Pierre Marty (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 16)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Debray, R. (2002), 'Pierre Marty', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 2, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 1020-1021.
- Debray, R., Dejours, C. and Fédida, P. (2005), *Psychopathologie de l'expérience du corps*, Paris: Dunod.
- Dechaud-Ferbus, M. (2011), 'Ajuriaguerra et la relaxation', in: Dechaud-Ferbus, *Cet autre divan. Psychanalyse de la mémoire du corps*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 25-45.
- Declerck, P. (2001), *Les naufragés. Avec les clochards de Paris*. Paris: Plon.
- Deiahaye, B. (1987), 'Notes de lecture: Christophe Dejours "Le corps entre biologie et psychanalyse. Essai d'interprétation comparée"', Paris, Payot 1986', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 10, pp. 97-99.
- Dejours, C. (1980), *Travail, usure mentale. Essai de psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: Bayard Éditions.
- Dejours, C. (1984a), 'Le corps de la psychosomatique: A propos de "Corps malade et corps érotique" sous la direction de M. Fain, Éditions Masson', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(5), pp. 1289-1295.
- Dejours, C. (1984b), 'Avant-propos', in Fain, M. and Dejours, C. eds., *Corps malade et corps érotique*, Paris: Masson, pp. vii-xiv.
- Dejours, C. (1987a), 'La théorie psychanalytique du sujet face au développement scientifique (sciences biologiques et sciences sociales)', in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 51-70. Originally published as Dejours, C. (1987), 'La théorie psychanalytique du sujet face à l'interdisciplinarité', *Cahiers de l'Institut de Psychopathologie Clinique* 7, pp. 67-84.
- Dejours, C. (1987b), 'Economie de la perception et processus de somatisation', *Psychanalyse à l'Université* 12 (47), pp. 417-435.
- Dejours, C. (1988a), 'Commentaire' [on the report by Hirata H. and Kergoat, D. summing up the discussion], in: Dejours, C. ed., *Plaisir et souffrance dans le travail*, volume 2, Paris: Laboratoire de psychologie du travail et de l'action, CNAM, pp. 165-176.
- Dejours, C. (1988b[1986]), 'Souffrance et plaisir au travail: l'approche par la psychopathologie du travail', in: Dejours, C., ed., *Souffrance et plaisir dans le travail. Séminaire interdisciplinaire de psychopathologie du travail*, volume 1: Orsay: AOCIP, pp. 15-24, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 19-37.
- Dejours, C. (1988c[1986]), 'Note de travail sur la notion de souffrance', in: Dejours, C., ed., *Souffrance et plaisir dans le travail. Séminaire interdisciplinaire de psychopathologie du travail*, volume 1: Orsay: AOCIP, pp. 115-124, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 39-50.

- Dejours, C. (1989), *Recherches psychanalytiques sur le corps*, Paris: Payot. [new augmented edition published under a new title as: Dejours, C. (2009a), *Les dissidences du corps. Répression et subversion en psychosomatique*, Paris: Payot].
- Dejours, C. (1992a), 'Pathologie de la communication. Situation de travail et espace public: le cas du nucléaire', *Raisons Pratiques* 3, pp. 177-201, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 109-141.
- Dejours, C. (1993a), 'Pour une clinique de la médiation entre psychanalyse et politique: la psychodynamique du travail', *Revue TRANS*, pp. 131-156, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 143-172.
- Dejours, C. (1993b), 'Intelligence pratique et sagesse pratique: deux dimensions méconnues du travail réel', *Éducation permanente* 116, pp. 47-70, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 173-193.
- Dejours, C. (1993c), 'Le corps dans l'interprétation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 3, pp. 109-119.
- Dejours, C. (1994), 'La corporéité entre psychosomatique et sciences du vivant', in: Billard, I., ed., *Somatisation, psychanalyse et sciences du vivant*, Paris: Editions Eshel, pp. 93-122.
- Dejours, C. (1995a), 'Doctrine et théorie en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 7, pp. 59-80.
- Dejours, C. (1995b), 'Comment formuler une problématique de la santé en ergonomie et en médecine du travail', in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 195-217. Originally published as Dejours, C. (1995), 'Problématiser la santé en ergonomie et en médecine du travail', *Le Travail Humain* 58/1, pp. 1-16.
- Dejours, C. (1996), 'Sens et destructivité dans la névrose de comportement', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 17-27.
- Dejours, C. (1997), 'Causalité psychique et psychosomatique: de la clinique à la théorie', in: Le Goues, G. and Pragier, G. eds., *Cliniques psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 47-65.
- Dejours, C. (1998a), *Souffrance en France. La banalisation de l'injustice sociale*, 2nd edition 2009, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Dejours, C. (1998b), 'Travailler n'est pas déroger', *Travailler* 1, pp. 5-12, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 219-228.
- Dejours, C. (1999a), 'Violence ou domination?', *Travailler* 3, pp. 11-29.
- Dejours, C. (1999b), 'Neues Leiden an der Arbeit'. Interview with Pasche, C and Streckeisen, P., in: WoZ-Online, 11.3.1999, available at: <http://archiv.labournet.de/diskussion/arbeit/arb10.html>, accessed 22nd February 2013.
- Dejours, C. (2000a), 'Choix de l'organe et indication "thérapeutique"', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 17, pp. 15-24.
- Dejours, C. (2000b), 'Travail, modernité et psychanalyse', in: Boukobza, C., ed., *Où en est la psychanalyse? Psychanalyse et figures de la modernité*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 32-40.
- Dejours, C. (2001a), *Le corps, d'abord. Corps biologique corps érotique et sens moral*, Paris: Payot.

- Dejours C. (2001b), 'Le travail entre banalisation du mal et émancipation', in: Bass, H.-P., Dimon, M.-L., and Ferrières-Pestureau, S. eds., *D'un siècle à l'autre, la violence en héritage: Perspectives psychanalytiques et anthropologiques*, Paris: In Press Editions, pp. 19-34.
- Dejours, C. (2002a), 'Technique psychanalytique et référence au corps érogène en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 21, pp. 119-131.
- Dejours, C. (2002b), 'Les rapports domestiques entre amour et domination', *Travailler* 8(2), pp. 27-43.
- Dejours, C. (2002c), 'Le corps, comme "exigence de travail" pour la pensée', in: Debray, R., Dejours, C. and Fédida, P., *Psychopathologie de l'expérience du corps*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 63-10.
- Dejours, C. (2003), 'Réhabiliter la normalité?', *Le Passant ordinaire*, pp. 56-59, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 229-238.
- Dejours, C. (2004a), 'Il corpo tra seduzione e scissione', *Rivista di Psicolanalisi* 50(3), pp. 773-798.
- Dejours, C. (2004b), 'Activisme professionnel: masochisme, compulsivité ou aliénation?' *Travailler* 11, pp.25-40; also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 239-256.
- Dejours, C. (2004c), 'La fatigue d'être soi: revers de l'émancipation ou signe d'aliénation?', in: *Vivre fatigué*, numéro spécial de la *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, pp. 27-36, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 257-268.
- Dejours, C. (2004d), 'Le corps entre séduction et clivage', in: Aïn, J., ed., *Résonances*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 59-83.
- Dejours, C. (2005a), 'Le corps, comme "exigence de travail" pour la pensée', in: Debray, R., Dejours, C. and Fédida, P. (2005), *Psychopathologie de l'expérience du corps*, Paris: Dunod.
- Dejours, C. (2005b), 'Corps érotique et sens du symptôme en psychosomatique', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 8, pp. 13-28.
- Dejours, C. (2006a), 'Entre désir de travailler et psychopathologie du travail: le piège de l'évaluation', in: Boukobza, C., ed., *La psychanalyse encore*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 193-204.
- Dejours, C. (2006b), 'Entretien', temporel. revue littéraire & artistique, available under: <http://temporel.fr/Christophe-Dejours-Entretien>, accessed 3rd March 2013.
- Dejours, C. (2006c), 'Évaluation et institution en psychanalyse. Revendications d'autonomie et critique de l'institution', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 70(4), pp. 947-959, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 269-285.
- Dejours, C. (2006d), 'Travail du rêve et enrichissement de la mémoire', in: Chouvier, B. and Roussillon, R. eds., *La temporalité psychique*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 41-59.
- Dejours, C., ed., (2007a), *Conjurer la violence. Travail, violence et santé*. Paris: Payot.
- Dejours, C. (2007b), 'Le travail entre corps et âme', *Libres Cahiers Pour La Psychanalyse* 15, pp. 115-127.

- Dejours, C. (2007c), 'Vulnérabilité psychopathologique et nouvelles formes d'organisation du travail: approche étiologique', *L'Information Psychiatrique* 83(4), pp. 269-275.
- Dejours, C. (2008a), *Travail, usure mentale. Essai de psychopathologie du travail*, 4th edition, Paris: Bayard Éditions.
- Dejours, C. (2008b), 'Psychosomatique et troisième topique', *Le Carnet PSY* 126, pp. 38-40.
- Dejours, C. (2008c), 'Suizid am Arbeitsplatz'. Zur Psychopathologie der modernen Arbeitswelt, *Polar. Zeitschrift für politische Philosophie und Kultur* 4, pp. 51-54, also available under: http://www.polar-zeitschrift.de/polar_04.php?id=185, accessed 22nd February 2013.
- Dejours, C. (2008d), 'Clinique du travail et psychiatrie: itinéraire interdisciplinaire', *Travailler* 20, pp. 9-17.
- Dejours, C. (2009a), *Les dissidences du corps. Répression et subversion en psychosomatique*, Paris: Payot [new augmented edition of Dejours, C. (1989), *Recherches psychanalytiques sur le corps*, Paris: Payot].
- Dejours, C. (2009b), *Souffrance en France. La banalisation de l'injustice sociale*, 2nd edition, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Dejours, C. (2009c), *Travail vivant, volume 1: Sexualité et travail, volume 2: Travail et émancipation*, Paris: Éditions Payot & Rivages.
- Dejours, C. (2009d), 'Corps et psychanalyse', *L'Information Psychiatrique* 85, pp. 227-234.
- Dejours, C. (2009e), 'La résistance', in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 287-300, originally published as Dejours, C. (2009), 'Résistance et défense', *Nouvelle Revue de Psychosociologie* 7, pp. 211-224.
- Dejours, C. (2009f), 'Propos sur la santé: entretien de Christophe Dejours par Jean-Jacques Pailler', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 36, pp. 39-53.
- Dejours, C. (2010a), 'Folie et travail: de l'analyse étiologique aux contradictions théoriques', in: Dejours, C., ed., *Observations cliniques en psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 17-45.
- Dejours, C. (2010b), "'Centralité du travail" et théorie de la sexualité', in: Dejours, C., ed., *Observations cliniques en psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 73-108.
- Dejours, C. (2010c), 'Nouvelles formes de servitude et suicide', in: Dejours, C., ed., *Observations cliniques en psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 131-162.
- Dejours, C. (2010d), *Le facteur humain*, 5th edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Dejours, C. (2010e), 'Corps et sexualité', *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 64, pp. 201-212.
- Dejours, C. (2011a), 'Le corps entre "courant tendre" et "courant sensuel"', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 40, pp. 21-42.
- Dejours, C. (2011b), 'Sortir de la souffrance au travail', *Le Monde*, 21st February 2011, available under: http://www.lemonde.fr/idees/article/2011/02/21/sortir-de-la-souffrance-au-travail_1483153_3232.html, accessed 6th March 2013.
- Dejours, C. (2012a), *La panne. Repenser le travail et changer la vie. Entretien avec Béatrice Bouniol*, Montrouge: Bayard.

- Dejours, C. (2012b), 'Préface. La théorie sociale de Freud', in: Freud, S., *Psychologie des foules et analyse du moi*, Paris: Éditions Payot & Rivages, pp. 7-15.
- Dejours, C. (2012c[1993]), 'From the psychopathology to the psychodynamics of work', in: Smith, N.H. and Deranty, J.-P. eds., *New philosophies of labour - Work and the social bond*, Leiden: Brill, pp. 209-250. [originally published in the 1993 (second) edition of Dejours, C. (2008b), *Travail, usure mentale. Essai de psychopathologie du travail*, 4th edition, Paris: Bayard Éditions. It can be found in the 4th edition pp. 215-259.]
- Dejours, C. (2013a), 'L'inné et l'acquis. La cohabitation entre l'infantile (pulsionnel) et le pubertaire (instinctuel)', *Le Carnet PSY* 173, pp. 37-41.
- Dejours, C. (2013b), 'Effets de la désorganisation des collectifs sur le lien à la tâche et à l'organisation', *Revue de psychothérapie psychanalytique de groupe* 61, pp. 11-18.
- Dejours, C. (2014), 'La sublimation: entre clinique du travail et psychanalyse', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 46, pp. 21-37.
- Dejours, C. (2015a), 'Genre et théorie de la sexualité', in: *Association Psychanalytique de France: Annuel 2015: La conviction*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 159-170.
- Dejours, C. (2015b), *Le Choix. Souffrir au travail n'est pas une fatalité*, Montrouge: Bayard Éditions.
- Dejours, C. (2015c), 'Freud et le travail', in: Perron, R. and Missonier, S. eds., *Sigmund Freud*, Paris: Éditions de L'Herne, pp. 277-285.
- Dejours, C. (2015d), 'Pour une clinique de la souffrance au travail. Entretien avec Benoît Schneider', *Bulletin de Psychologie* 538, pp. 285-291.
- Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Dejours, C. (2016b), 'Corps, narcissisme et travail', in: Joly, F., ed., *Corps et narcissisme*, Paris: Éditions in Press.
- Dejours, C. (2016c), 'Bisexualité, genre et corps érogène ?' *Le Carnet PSY* 197, pp. 20-25.
- Dejours, C. (2017a), 'Clinique du travail et psychosomatique', in: Nayrou, F. and Szweck, G. eds. *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 175-192.
- Dejours, C. (2017b), 'Troisième topique et analyse de la destructivité', *Le Carnet PSY* 206, pp. 42-49.
- Dejours, C. (2018), 'Entre séduction et aide à la traduction: le mytho-symbolique, l'imaginaire social et la question de la liaison', in: Dejours, C. and Tessier, H. eds., *Laplanche et la traduction: une théorie inachevée. Le mytho-symbolique: aide ou obstacle à la traduction?*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 263-278.
- Dejours, C. and Abdoucheli, E. (1990), 'Itinéraire théorique en psychopathologie du travail', *Prévenir* 20, pp. 127-149, also available in: Dejours, C. (2016a), *Situations du travail*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 71-107.
- Dejours, C. and Abdoucheli E. (1992), 'Biologie et psychanalyse: les enjeux', in: Gros, F. and Huber, G. eds, *Vers un anti-destin? Patrimoine génétique et droits de l'humanité*, Paris: Odile Jacob, pp. 267-276.
- Dejours, C. and Bègue, F. (2009), *Suicide et travail: Que faire?*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

- Dejours, C. and Deranty, J-P. (2010), 'The centrality of work', *Critical Horizons* 11(2), pp. 167-180.
- Dejours, C. and Duarte, A. (2018), 'La souffrance au travail: révélateur des transformations de la société française', *Modern & Contemporary France*, pp.1-12.
- Dejours, C. and Gernet, I. (2016), *Psychopathologie du travail*, 2nd edition, Issy-les-Moulineaux: Elsevier Masson SAS.
- Dejours, C. and Tessier, H. (2018) eds., *Laplanche et la traduction: une théorie inachevée. Le mytho-symbolique: aide ou obstacle à la traduction?*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Delaunoy, J. (2005), 'D'un siècle à l'autre: la violence en héritage. Editions In Press', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 47, pp. 100-104.
- Delion, P. (2009), 'Préface', in: Tosquelles, F. (1967/1972), *Le travail thérapeutique à l'hôpital psychiatrique*, new edition, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 7-15.
- Delion, P. (2014), 'Préface', in: Tosquelles, F. (1992), *L'enseignement de la folie*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod, pp. vii-xvii.
- Delitzsch, F. (1880), *Biblical commentary on the Psalms*, volume 2, [translation from the second German edition], Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark.
- Delitzsch, F. (1887 [1883]), *Biblical commentary on the Psalms*, volume 1 [translation from the German edition], London: Hodder and Stoughton.
- Delourmel, C. (2003), ' "La Figurabilité psychique" de César et Sara Botella', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp. 183-190.
- Delourmel, C. (2010), ' "Les modèles psychanalytiques de la psychosomatique" de Claude Smadja', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 74(3), pp. 825-836.
- Demaegdt, C. (2012), *Apport de la clinique du travail à l'anthropologie psychanalytique du sens moral. Vers une théorie psychanalytique de l'action*, doctoral thesis, Conservatoire National de Arts et Métiers, available at: <https://tel.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-00742986/>, accessed 4th December, 2012.
- Demaegdt, C. and Dejours, C. (2016), 'La souffrance éthique', in: Danon-Boileau, L. and Tamet, J-Y. eds., *Des psychanalystes en séance. Glossaire clinique de psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 511-514.
- Denis, P. (1971), 'Les sociétés françaises affiliées à l'association psychanalytique internationale', in: Chiland, C. (1981), ed., *Les écoles psychanalytiques. La psychanalyse en mouvement*, Paris: Tchou, pp. 179-191.
- Des Pres, T. (1976), *The survivor: An anatomy of life in the death camps*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Descartes, R. (1659 [for the Latin: 1644]), *Les Principes de la philosophie. Ecrits en Latin par René Descartes. Et traduits en François par un de ses amis*, Paris: Henry & Nicolas Le Gras.
- Descotes D. and Proust G. (2011ff.), 'L'édition électronique des Pensées de Blaise Pascal', available at: <http://www.penseesdepascal.fr/index.php>, accessed 26th Octobre 2015.
- Detienne, M. and Vernant, J.-P. (1974), *Les ruses de l'intelligence. La mètis des Grecs*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Devereux, G. (1966), 'Dedans et dehors: la nature du stress', *Revue de Medecine Psychosomatique* 8, pp. 103-113.

- Devereux, G. (1975a), 'Ethnic identity: its logical foundations and its dysfunctions', in: Sollors, W., ed., (1996), *Theories of ethnicity. A classical reader*, New York: New York University Press, pp. 385-414.
- Devereux, G. (1975b), *Tragédie et poésie grecques. Études ethnopsychanalytiques*. Paris: Flammarion.
- Devereux, G. (1998), 'La psychanalyse et l'histoire: une application à l'histoire de Sparte', in: Le Beuf, D., Perron, R. and Pragier, G. eds., *Construire l'histoire*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 27-52.
- Devereux, G. and Loeb, E.M., (1943), 'Antagonistic acculturation', *American Sociological Review* 8(2), pp. 133-147.
- Devoto, T. (2006), 'El desarrollo del espacio transicional en la técnica analítica con pacientes psicossomáticos', *Psicología y Psicopedagogía, Revista Virtual del Instituto de Investigaciones Psicológicas. Facultad de Psicología y Psicopedagogía*, available at: <http://p3.usal.edu.ar/index.php/psico/article/view/1285/1646>, accessed 28th November 2015.
- Di Benedetto, A. (1993), 'La sublimazione nella prospettiva di Bion e Matte Blanco: La sublimazione come arte della "trasformazione" e della "formalizzazione"', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 39(1), pp. 65-82.
- Diatkine, G. (1994), 'Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 159-161.
- Diatkine, G. (1997), *Jacques Lacan (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 11)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Diatkine, G. (2000), 'Surmoi culturel', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 64(5), pp. 1523-1588.
- Diatkine, G. (2006), 'Que doit le succès de la psychanalyse française à Lacan?', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes qui êtes vous?* Paris: Dunod, pp. 245-250.
- Diatkine, G. (2017), 'Lacan et la psychosomatique', in: Nayrou, F. and Szewc, G., eds., *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 155-173.
- Diatkine, R. (1955[1954]), 'Intervention' [on Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a)], 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 305-307.
- Diatkine, R. (1974), 'Rêve, illusion et connaissance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 38(5-6), pp. 769-820.
- Didi-Huberman, G. (2002), *L'image survivante. Histoire de l'art et temps des fantômes selon Aby Warburg*, Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit.
- Diener, Y. (2002a), *La psychanalyse*, volume. 1, Paris: adpf.
- Diener, Y. (2002b), *La psychanalyse*, volume. 2, Paris: adpf.
- Dodd, E.S. (2016), *Boundless innocence in Thomas Traherne's poetic theology: 'Were all men wise and innocent...'* London: Routledge.
- Dodds, J. (2008). 'Od psychosomatiky k neuropsychoanalýze: Přínos pařížské školy' *Revue Psychoanalytická Psychotherapie* 10.2 available at: <http://www.npsa.cz/Revue%20article%20Czech%20version.pdf>, accessed 25th April 2013.
- Dodds, J. (no date), 'From Psychosomatics to Neuropsychoanalysis: Contributions of the Paris School', available at: <http://www.npsa.cz/Revue%20Article%20Paris%20School11.pdf>, accessed 26th May 2011.

- Dōgen (1233), *Genjōkōan*, available at: http://www.thezensite.com/ZenTeachings/Dogen_Teachings/GenjoKoan8.htm, accessed 27th February 2018.
- Dolgopolski, S. (2009), *What is Talmud? The art of disagreement*, New York: Fordham University Press.
- Donabédian, D. (1994), 'Motricité, comportement et névrose psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 111-117.
- Donabédian, D. (2010), 'Du prélude à la symphonie achevée ou inachevée', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 109-114.
- Donabédian, D. (2012), *L'adolescent et son corps*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Donabédian, D. and Fain, M. (1995/1993), 'Psychosomatique et pulsions', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 7, pp. 141-152, previously published in 1993 in *Cahiers du Centre de Psychanalyse et de Psychothérapie* 26, pp. 11-21.
- Donald, R. and MacDonald, K. (2011), *Reel men at war: Masculinity and the American war film*, Plymouth: Scarecrow Press.
- Donna, L. and Bradford, E.P. (2008), 'Thinking of André Green: Early ideas', *Fort Da* 14(1), pp. 36-67.
- Donnet, J.-L. (1995), *Le divan bien tempéré*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Donnet, J.-L. (2005), *La situation analysante*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Donnet, J.-L. (2005/1995), 'Sur l'évolution de la demande', in: Donnet, J.-L. (2005), *La situation analysante*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 195-206.
- Douglas, M. (1986), *How institutions think*, Syracuse/New York: Syracuse University Press.
- Doucet, C. (2000), *La psychosomatique. Théorie et clinique*, Paris: Armand Colin.
- Dozio, E., Feldman, M., El Husseini, M. and Moro, M.R. (2015), 'L'approche transculturelle, une mère sans berceau culturel', in: Mellier, D., Delion, P. and Missonier, S. eds., *Le bébé dans sa famille. Nouvelles solitudes des parents, nouveaux soins*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 219-233.
- Dreher, A.U. (2000), *Foundations for conceptual research in psychoanalysis*, London: Karnac Books.
- Dreyfus, S. (1999), *Michel Neyraut (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 22)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Duerden, N. (2013), 'My father's secret wartime. Francis Grady knew very little of his father's wartime experiences until he persuaded him to write a book', *The Guardian*, 16th March 2013, available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2013/mar/16/fathers-secret-wartime-exploits>, accessed 1st January 2018.
- Dufour, J. (1999), 'Les variables de l'interprétation', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 119-137.
- Dufour, J. (2008), 'Un legs de Michel Fain: entre négation hystérique et déni traumatique', *Bulletin du Groupe Lyonnais de Psychanalyse* 63, pp. 27-31.
- Dumet, N. (2002), *Clinique des troubles psychosomatiques. Approche psychanalytique*, Paris: Dunod.

- Duparc, F. (1995), *Une théorie vivante. L'oeuvre d'André Green*, Neuchâtel and Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Duparc, F. (1996), *André Green (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 2)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Duparc, F. (1999a), 'Préface', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 11-12.
- Duparc, F. (1999b), 'Un style qui a du caractère', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 17-23.
- Duparc, F. (1999c), 'L'enfant et son corps: les lignées psychosomatiques', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 73-86.
- Dupont, J. (2000), 'Introduction: un trauma précoce du mouvement psychanalytique', in: Brabant, E. and Falzeder, E. (2000) eds., *Sigmund Freud – Sándor Ferenczi Correspondance, Volume 3: 1920-1933. Les années douloureuses*, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. xiii-xxxviii (available in English in: Brabant, E. and Falzeder, E. (2000), *The Correspondence of Sigmund Freud and Sándor Ferenczi, volume 3: 1920-1933*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, pp. xvii-xliv.
- Duthoit, J.-P. (1999), *Essai sur les phénomènes transgénérationnels. Les dents de fils*, Paris: L'Harmattan.
- Eco, U. (1983), *The name of the rose*, New York: Vintage Books.
- Eco, U. (2003), *Mouse or rat? Negotiation as translation*, London: Weidenfeld & Nicholson. [essays from Eco, U. (2003b), *Dire quasi la stessa cosa. Esperienze di traduzione*, Milano: Bompiani].
- Edwards, C.L. (2013), 'Psychosomatic illness, history and sociology of', in: Scull, A., ed., *Cultural sociology of mental illness: An A-to-Z guide*, Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications, pp.726-729.
- Ehrenberg, A. (1998), *La fatigue d'être soi. Dépression et société*, Paris: Odile Jacob.
- Eliot, G. [Evans, M.A] (1965 [1871-72]), *Middlemarch*, ed. Harvey, W.J., Penguin Books: Harmondsworth, Middlesex.
- Ellenberger, H. (1949), 'Über die Anstaltsreform in Frankreich', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und Ihre Anwendungen* 3(7), pp. 49-556.
- Elliott, A. (1992), *Social theory & psychoanalysis in transition. Self and society from Freud to Kristeva*, Oxford: Blackwell.
- Erikson, E.H. (1965[1950]), *Childhood and society*, Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Evans, D. (1996), *An introductory dictionary of Lacanian psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge.
- Ey, H. (1950), *Études psychiatriques*, volume 2, Paris: Desclée de Brouwer.
- Fages, J.-B. (1996), *Histoire de la psychanalyse après Freud*, Paris: Éditions Odile Jacob.
- Fain, M. (1962), Intervention [on Grunberger, B., 'Considérations sur le clivage entre le narcissisme et la maturation pulsionnelle'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 26(2-3), pp. 204-205.
- Fain, M. (1965), 'Le dialogue de sourds', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 29(1), pp. 105-108.

- Fain, M. (1965[1964]), 'Intervention' [on 'Aperçus sur le processus de la création littéraire' de M. de M'Uzan], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 29(1), pp. 71-72.
- Fain, M. (1966a), 'Régression et psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 30(4), pp. 451-456; also in: *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 197-202.
- Fain, M. (1966b), 'Intervention' [on Kestemberg, E. and Kestemberg, J, 'Contribution à la perspective génétique en psychanalyse'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 30(5-6), pp. 720-728.
- Fain, M. (1967), 'Intervention' [on Marty, P., 'Régression et instinct de mort: hypothèses à propos de l'observation psychosomatique'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(5-6), pp. 1129-1133.
- Fain, M. (1968), 'Intervention' [on Barande, I., 'Le vu et l'entendu dans la cure'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 32(1), pp. 86-88.
- Fain, M. (1969a), 'Laurence ou le labeur statufié. Commentaire sur le cas exposé par Mme Loriod', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 33(2), pp. 273-284.
- Fain, M. (1969b), 'Intervention' [on 'Une observation d'agoraphobie "pour raisons de famille"'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 33(4), pp. 599-606.
- Fain, M. (1969c), 'Ébauche d'une recherche concernant l'existence d'activités mentales pouvant être considérées comme prototypiques du processus psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 33(5-6), pp. 929-962.
- Fain, M. (1970), "'A partir de Freud" par Francis Pasche. Un modèle de réflexion psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 34(4), pp. 709-719.
- Fain, M. (1971a), 'Prélude à la vie fantasmatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 35(2-3), pp. 291-364, translated and reprinted as 'The Prelude to fantasmatic life', in: Birksted-Breen, D., Flanders S. and Gibeault, A. eds. (2010), *Reading French Psychoanalysis*, Hove, East Sussex: Routledge, pp. 338-354.
- Fain, M. (1971b), 'A propos du processus psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 35(5-6), pp. 1087-1095.
- Fain, M. (1973), 'Quelques remarques sur l'humour', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 37(4), pp. 529-538.
- Fain, M. (1974a), 'Avant-propos', in: Fenichel, O. (1945/1953), *La théorie psychanalytique des névroses*, volume 1, 2nd edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. vii-xiii.
- Fain, M. (1974b), 'A propos d'un "Souvenir d'enfance de Léonard de Vinci"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 38(2-3), pp. 315-322.
- Fain, M. (1976), 'Une conquête de la psychanalyse: "Les mouvements individuels de vie et de mort" de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 40(4), pp. 741-755,
- Fain, M. (1977), 'A propos de l'exposé introductif de L. Kreisler', in: Kestemberg, E., ed., *Le devenir de la prématurité*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 79-84.
- Fain, M. (1981a), 'Vers une conception psychosomatique de l'inconscient', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(2), pp. 281-292.
- Fain, M. (1981b), 'Diachronie, structure, conflit oedipien: quelques réflexions', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(4), pp. 985-998.
- Fain, M. (1982), *Le désir de l'interprète*, Paris: Éditions Aubier Montaigne.

- Fain, M. (1982[1980]), 'Biphassisme et après-coup', in: Guillaumin, J., ed., *Quinze études psychanalytiques sur le temps. Traumatisme et après-coup*, Toulouse: Privat, pp. 103-124.
- Fain, M. (1983), 'Réalité du fétiche, réalité de la castration', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 47(1), pp. 325-332.
- Fain, M. (1984a), 'Des complexités de la consultation en matière psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(5), pp. 1209-1227.
- Fain, M. (1984b), 'Ouverture du congrès', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48 (special number), pp. 7-10.
- Fain, M. (1986[1983]), 'Rôle de la sexualité des parents', in: Sztulman, H., Barbier, A. and Caïn, J. eds., *Les fantasmes originaires: les origines du commencement*, Toulouse: Privat, pp. 99-103.
- Fain, M. (1986), 'A propos des réflexions de M. Ody sur noyau dépressif, noyau hystérique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 50(3), pp. 973-978.
- Fain, M. (1987[1986]), 'Psychanalyste, un métier impossible? Rome et Londres', in: Fain, M., Cournot, J., Enriquez, E., Cifali, M. and de Mijolla, A., *Les trois métiers impossibles*, Paris: Les Belles Lettres, pp. 9-39.
- Fain, M. (1988), 'Les "ouatères" et leurs verrous', in: Soulé, M., ed., *L'enfant et sa maison*, Paris: Les éditions ESF, pp. 113-117.
- Fain, M. (1989a), 'Lettre de Michel Fain à Jean Bégoin', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(5), pp. 1271-1275.
- Fain, M. (1989b), 'Symbolisation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(6), pp. 1999-2001.
- Fain, M. (1990a), 'Virilité et antihystérie. Les rouleurs de mécaniques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(5) pp.1283-1291.
- Fain, M. (1990b), 'Psychanalyse et Psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(3), pp. 625-637.
- Fain, M. (1991a), 'Lettre aux rapporteurs', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 55(1), pp. 193-196.
- Fain, M. (1991b), 'A propos des fantasmes originaires', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 55(5), pp. 1131-1134.
- Fain, M. (1991c), 'A propos du sujet, du soi et du self', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 55(6), pp. 1721-1723.
- Fain, M. (1991d), 'Préambule à une étude métapsychologique de la vie opératoire', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 1, pp. 59-79.
- Fain, M. (1992a), 'Le schibboleth', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(2), pp. 329-333.
- Fain, M. (1992b), 'Banalités à propos de certains facteurs poussant à la régression au cours des cures', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(4), pp. 1109-1113.
- Fain, M. (1992c), 'Emprise et pensée animique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(5), pp. 1445-1447.
- Fain, M. (1992d), 'La vie opératoire et les potentialités de névrose traumatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 2, pp. 5-24.
- Fain, M. (1993a), 'Nécessité d'un référent au cours de l'étude de l'interprétation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 57(2), pp. 157-160.

- Fain, M. (1993b), 'Maladies de la civilisation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 57(4), pp. 1087-1094.
- Fain, M. (1993c), 'Face à face', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 3, pp. 121-125.
- Fain, M. (1993d), 'Spéculations métapsychologiques hasardeuses à partir de l'étude des procédés autocalmants', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 59-67.
- Fain, M. (1993e), 'Théorie de la technique de la cure psychanalytique de la névrose obsessionnelle', in: Brusset, B. and Couvreur, C. eds. *La névrose obsessionnelle*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 127-142.
- Fain, M. (1993f), 'Le pénis-emblème', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 57 (special number), pp. 1703-1708.
- Fain, M. (1994a), 'Premiers pas en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 7-11.
- Fain, M. (1994b), 'La névrose de comportement selon Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 151-158.
- Fain, M. (1994c), 'Tout analyser ?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 58(4), pp. 1041-1046.
- Fain, M. (1994d), 'Troubles somatiques et remaniements psychiques. Introduction', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 5, pp. 7-16.
- Fain, M. (1995a), 'Régession ou distorsion?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(3), pp. 737-743.
- Fain, M. (1995b), 'A propos de la transitionnalité', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(5), pp. 1547-1549.
- Fain, M. (1996a), 'Quelle pure culture ?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 60(1), pp. 55-63.
- Fain, M. (1996b), 'Intervention' [on 'L'enfant et son corps, vingt ans après la publication du livre], *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 35-43.
- Fain, M. (1996c), 'Lettre à Marta Calatroni', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 135-138.
- Fain, M. (1997a), 'Névrose de caractère et mentalisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 11, pp. 7-17.
- Fain, M. (1997b), 'La goutte d'eau', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. pp. 69-76.
- Fain, M. (1997c), 'La machine à remonter le temps', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 61(5), pp. 1685-1687.
- Fain, M. (1997d), 'Entretien avec Diane L'Heureux Le Beuf et Georges Pragier (à partir de questions élaborées par les rédacteurs)', in: Le Goues, G. and Pragier, G. eds., *Cliniques psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 137-146.
- Fain, M. (1998a), 'Réflexions sur la rencontre et son histoire', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(1), pp. 25-29.
- Fain, M. (1998b), 'Quelques réflexions sur la masculinité et le monothéisme', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(2), pp. 425-428.
- Fain, M. (1998c), 'Commentaire sur l'opérateur', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1493-1497.

- Fain, M. (1998d), 'Brève introduction à une discussion sur le système sommeil-rêve', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 14, pp. 7-13.
- Fain, M. (1998e), 'Commentaire de "La vie onirique chez l'enfant" de Gérard Szvec', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 14, pp. 107-111.
- Fain, M. (1998f), 'Vie et impératif de désinvestissement', in: Schaeffer, J., Cournut-Janin, M., Faure-Pragier, S. and Guignard, F. eds., *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 145-149.
- Fain, M. (1998g), 'À propos de son itinéraire personnel et de sa pensée', available at: <http://www.spp.asso.fr/wp/?vimeo-video=michel-fain-a-propos-de-son-itineraire-personnel-et-de-sa-pensee>.
- Fain, M. (1999[1980]), 'Introduction à la régression dans la cure', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 191-214.
- Fain, M. (1999[1987]), 'Psychopathologie de la vie quotidienne et délire', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 215-227; also available in: *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 43, pp. 87-94.
- Fain, M. (1999[1989]), 'Une sémiologie du rêve?', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 229-251.
- Fain, M. (1999[1990]), 'À propos de l'hypocondrie', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 253-264, also available as Fain M, (2010/1999[1990], 'À propos de l'hypocondrie', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 177-184.
- Fain, M. (1999[1992]), 'Le message', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 265-275.
- Fain, M. (1999a), 'Réponse aux exposés de M. Aisenstein et J. Press. Discussion', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 51-61.
- Fain, M. (1999b), 'Réponse aux exposés de M. Ody et F. Duparc. Discussion', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 87-97.
- Fain, M. (1999c), 'Réponse aux exposés de B. Chervet et J. Dufour. Discussion', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 139-154.
- Fain, M. (1999d), 'Table ronde', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 155-187.
- Fain, M. (1999e), 'Autour de l'enfant battu', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 63(5), pp. 1737-1740.
- Fain, M. (1999f), 'La fonction maternelle selon Pierre Marty', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 2, pp. 97-103, also available in: *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 20, pp. 47-52.
- Fain, M. (1999g), 'Interview de Michel Fain par Claude Smadja et Gérard Szvec', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 16, p. 185-193.

- Fain, M. (1999h), 'Un avatar du pénis', in: Schaeffer, J., Cournut-Janin, M., Faure-Pragier, S. and Guignard, F. eds., *Clés pour le féminin. Femme, mère, amante et fille*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 163-167.
- Fain, M. (2000a), 'Transfert négatif et faillite du cadre', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 64(2), pp. 419-423.
- Fain, M. (2000b), 'À propos du masochisme érogène primaire, dialogue imaginaire avec Benno Rosenberg', in: Aisenstein, M., *Michel Fain (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 28)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 65-71.
- Fain, M. (2000c), 'Quelques réflexions sur le rêve et le clivage à la lumière de l'École psychosomatique de Paris', in: Aisenstein, M., *Michel Fain (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 28)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 72-80.
- Fain, M. (2001a), 'Mentalisation et passivité', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 29-37.
- Fain, M. (2001b), 'Préface', in: Smadja, C., *La vie opératoire. Études psychanalytiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 11-21.
- Fain, M. (2001c), 'La fonction maternelle selon Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 20, pp. 47-52.
- Fain, M. and David, C. (1963 [1962]), 'Aspects fonctionnels de la vie onirique', [23e Congrès de psychanalystes de langues romanes, Barcelona 1962], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 27, special number, pp. 241-343.
- Fain, M. and Guignard, F. (1984), 'Identification hystérique et identification projective', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(2), pp. 515-528.
- Fain, M. and Kreisler, L. (1970), 'Discussion sur la genèse des fonctions représentatives à propos de deux observations pédiatriques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 34(2), pp. 285-306.
- Fain M. and Marty P. (1965[1964]), 'A propos du narcissisme et de sa genèse', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 29(5-6), pp. 561-572.
- Fain, M. and Marty, P. (1959), 'Aspects fonctionnels et rôle structurant de l'investissement homosexuel au cours des traitements psychanalytiques d'adultes', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 23(5), pp. 607-617.
- Fansten, M. (2006), *Le divan insoumis. La formation du psychanalyste: enjeux et idéologies*, Paris: Hermann Éditeurs.
- Fansten, M. (2013), 'Présences et absences de la psychanalyse à Cerisy', *Histoire @ Politique* 20, pp. 59-71.
- Fantel, E. (1945), 'Psychodrama in an evacuation hospital', *Sociometry* 8 (3-4), pp. 125-145.
- Faure-Pragier, S. (2015), 'Freud précurseur. Apoptose et pulsion de mort', in: Perron, R. and Missonier, S., eds., *Sigmund Freud*, Paris: Éditions de L'Herne, pp. 327-333.
- Faure, B. (1991), *The rhetoric of immediacy. A cultural critique of Chan/Zen Buddhism*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Felstiner, J. (1978), 'Translating Pablo Neruda's "Galope muerto" ', *PMLA* 93(2), pp. 185-195.
- Ferenczi, S. (1909), 'Introjektion und Übertragung', *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 1: *Theorie*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 9-57.

- Ferenczi, S. (1912), 'Zur Begriffsbestimmung der Introjektion', *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 1: *Theorie*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 58-61.
- Ferenczi, S. (1923), 'Der Traum vom "gelehrten" Säugling', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 3: *Arbeiten aus den Jahren 1908-1933*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 218-219.
- Ferenczi, S. (1926), 'Das Problem der Unlustbejahung. Fortschritte in der Erkenntnis des Wirklichkeitssinns', in: Ferenczi, S. (1927/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 1: *Theorie*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 84-100.
- Ferenczi, S. (1930), 'Jeder Anpassung geht ein gehemmter Zersplitterungsversuch voraus', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 4: *Gedenkartikel, Kritiken und Referate, Fragmente*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 219-220.
- Ferenczi, S. (1931a), 'Kinderanalysen mit Erwachsenen', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 3: *Arbeiten aus den Jahren 1908-1933*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 490-510.
- Ferenczi, S. (1931b), 'Aphoristisches zum Thema Totsein-Weibsein', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 3: *Arbeiten aus den Jahren 1908-1933*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 248-249.
- Ferenczi, S. (1931c), 'Geburt des Intellekts', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 4: *Gedenkartikel, Kritiken und Referate, Fragmente*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 250-252.
- Ferenczi, S. (1931d), 'Trauma und Angst', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 4: *Gedenkartikel, Kritiken und Referate, Fragmente*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 256-257.
- Ferenczi, S. (1932), 'Sprachverwirrung zwischen den Erwachsenen und dem Kind (Die Sprache der Zärtlichkeit und der Leidenschaft)', in: Ferenczi, S. (1938/1984), *Bausteine zur Psychoanalyse*, volume 3: *Arbeiten aus den Jahren 1908-1933*, Frankfurt/Main: Ullstein, pp. 511-525.
- Ferenczi, S. (1934), 'Gedanken über das Trauma', *Internationale Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse* 20, pp. 5-12.
- Ferenczi, S. (1949), 'Confusion of the Tongues Between the Adults and the Child – (The Language of Tenderness and of Passion)' [paper read at the Twelfth International Psycho-Analytical Congress, Wiesbaden, September, 1932], *The International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 30, pp. 225-230.
- Ferenczi, S. (1985), *Journal clinique. Janvier-octobre 1932*, Paris: Payot.
- Fernández, R. (2002), *El psicoanálisis y lo psicósomático*, Madrid: Editorial Síntesis.
- Fernando, J. (2009), *The processes of defense. Trauma, drives, and reality - a new synthesis*, Lanham, Maryland: Jason Aronson.
- Ferro, A. and Civitarese, G. (2015), *The analytic field and its transformations*, London: Karnac.
- Ffytche, M. (2012), *The foundation of the unconscious. Schelling, Freud and the birth of the modern psyche*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Fine, A. (1994), 'Quelques points clés de l'oeuvre de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 39-52.

- Fine, A. (1995a), 'L'opérateur comme négatif de la réalité psychique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(1), pp. 173-186.
- Fine, A. (1995b), 'Interrogations sur le défaut de symbolisation primaire comme paramètre du phénomène psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59, special number, pp. 1699-1704.
- Fine, A. (1995c), ' "Un bouclier dans l'économie des états limites" d'Anna Potamianou', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(3), pp. 922-927.
- Fine, A. (1995d), ' "La psychosomatique de l'enfant asthmatique" de Gérard Szvec', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(3), pp. 935-939.
- Fine, A. (1997), 'Le phénomène psychosomatique au regard de réalités supposées', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. 121-142.
- Fine, A. (2001), ' "La vie opératoire. Études psychanalytiques, de Claude Smadja" ', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 20, pp. 171-187.
- Fine, A. (2002), 'La vie opératoire [Operative life]: Claude Smadja. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. 2001. Pp. 272', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 83(5), pp. 1217-1220.
- Fine, A. (2004), 'Enjeux du "caractère" et vicissitudes de la "névrose de caractère" dans l'oeuvre de Pierre Marty', in: Bouhsira, J., Dreyfus-Asséo, S. and Fine, A. eds., *Caractères*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 109-128.
- Fine A. (2009), 'Le psychosoma en tant que paradigme et méthode d'investigation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp. 43-54.
- Fine, A. (2011), 'Variations à partir de M. Fain', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 35-43.
- Fine, A. and Smadja, C. (2000), 'Interview [avec] André Green', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 17, pp. 149-171.
- Fischbein, J.E. (2011), 'Psychosomatics: A current overview', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 92, pp.197-219.
- Fischbein, J.E. (2016), 'Commentary on 'Metapsychological and clinical issues in psychosomatics research' by Jacques Press', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 97(1), pp. 123-141.
- Fitzgerald, D. and Ryan, D. (2014), *Obama, US Foreign Policy and the Dilemmas of Intervention*, London: Palgrave Macmillan,
- Fitzgerald, R. transl. (1992), *Homer: The Odyssey*, New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Flanders, S. (2018), 'French psychoanalysis and Lacan', in Bailly, L., Lichtenstein, D. and Bailly, S. eds., *The Lacan tradition. Lines of development. Evolution of theory and practice over the decades*, Abingdon-on-Thames: Routledge, pp. 53-71.
- Fleck, L. (1927-1960), *Erfahrung und Tatsache. Gesammelte Aufsätze*, eds. Schäfer, L. and Schnelle, T. (1983), Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp.
- Fleck, L. (1935), *Entstehung und Entwicklung einer wissenschaftlichen Tatsache. Einführung in die Lehre vom Denkstil und Denkkollektiv*, eds. Schäfer, L. and Schnelle, T. (1980), Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp.
- Fletcher, J. (2013), *Freud and the scene of Trauma*, New York: Fordham University Press.

- Florence, J. (2006), 'Remarques psychanalytiques sur l'imaginaire chez Castoriadis', in: Klimis, S. and Van Eynde, L., *L'imaginaire selon Castoriadis. Thèmes et enjeux*, Brussels: Facultés universitaires Saint-Louis, pp. 111-117.
- Florence, J., ed., (2002), *La psychanalyse et l'université. L'expérience de Louvain*, Louvain-la-Neuve: Academia Bruylant.
- Foehl, J.C. (2010), 'The necessity of shared illusion in the creation of 'reality': commentary on paper by Christopher Bonovitz', *Psychoanalytic Dialogues* 20, pp. 642-653.
- Fohn, A. and Heenen-Wolff, S. (2011), 'The destiny of an unacknowledged trauma: The deferred retroactive effect of après-coup in the hidden Jewish children of wartime Belgium', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 92(1), pp. 5-20.
- Fonagy, P. (2000), 'L'origine de la sexualité infantile. Réflexions autour de l'article de Daniel Widlöcher *Amour primaire et sexualité infantile*', in: Widlöcher, D., ed., *Sexualité infantile et attachement*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 83-96.
- Forrester, J. (1997), *Dispatches from the Freud wars. Psychoanalysis and its passions*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Forster, E.M. (1924), *A passage to India*, Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin.
- Forster, M. (1988), *Elizabeth Barrett Browning. A biography*, New York: Doubleday.
- Fortier, C. (1988), 'À propos de l'école de Paris: quelques repères pour la consultation psychosomatique', *Santé Mentale au Québec* 13(1), pp.18-33.
- Fraschina, B. (2001). 'De la "perception" au "perceptif" dans l'œuvre de Freud', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 39, pp. 77-123.
- Fraser, N. (1997), 'Structuralism or pragmatics? On discourse theory and feminist politics', in: Fraser, N., *Justice interruptus. Critical reflections on the "postsocialist" condition*, New York: Routledge, pp. 151-170.
- French, P. (2013), 'Bataille, Georges', in: Murray, C.J., ed., *Encyclopedia of modern French thought*, London: Routledge, pp. 55-59.
- French, T.M. (1941), 'Physiology of behavior and choice of neurosis', *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, 10, pp. 561-572.
- French, T. M. (1952), *The integration of behavior*, volume 1: *Basic postulates*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Fressard, O. (2006), 'Castoriadis, le symbolique et l'imaginaire', in: Klimis, S. and Van Eynde, L., *L'imaginaire selon Castoriadis. Thèmes et enjeux*, Brussels: Facultés universitaires Saint-Louis, pp. 119-150.
- Freud, A. (1936), *Das Ich und die Abwehrmechanismen*, in: *Die Schriften der Anna Freud* (1980), volume 1, München: Kindler Verlag, pp. 193-355.
- Freud, E.L. (1968), ed., *Sigmund Freud – Arnold Zweig Briefwechsel*, Frankfurt/Main: Fischer Verlag.
- Freud, S. (1900), *Die Traumdeutung*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 2/3, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52].
- Freud, S. (1905a), 'Über Psychotherapie', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 5, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 13-26.

- Freud, S. (1905b), *Drei Abhandlungen zur Sexualtheorie*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 5, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 33-145.
- Freud, S. (1909), 'Bemerkungen über einen Fall von Zwangsneurose', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 7, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 379-463.
- Freud, S. (1910), 'Über den Gegensinn der Urworte', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 8, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 214-221.
- Freud, S. (1913), 'Die Disposition zur Zwangsneurose', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 8, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 442-452.
- Freud, S. (1914), 'Zur Einführung des Narzissmus', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 10, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 137-170.
- Freud, S. (1915), 'Die Verdrängung', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 10, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 248-261.
- Freud, S. (1916-17 [1915-17]), *Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die Psychoanalyse*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 11, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 3-484.
- Freud, S. (1917[1915]), 'Trauer und Melancholie', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 10, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 428-446.
- Freud, S. (1919), 'Das Unheimliche', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 12, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 229-268.
- Freud, S. (1920), *Jenseits des Lustprinzips*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 13, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 3-69.
- Freud, S. (1921), 'Massenpsychologie und Ich-Analyse', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 13, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 73-161.
- Freud, S. (1924), 'Das ökonomische Prinzip des Masochismus', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 13, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 371-383.
- Freud, S. (1925 [1924]), 'Notiz über den Wunderblock', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 14, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 3-8.
- Freud, S. (1927), 'Der Humor', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 14, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 383-389.
- Freud, S. (1930), 'Das Unbehagen in der Kultur', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 14, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 421-506.
- Freud, S. (1934), 'Vorrede' [zur hebräischen Ausgabe von 'Totem und Tabu', Jerusalem, Stybel Verlag], *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 14, p. 569.
- Freud, S. (1937a), 'Die endliche und die unendliche Analyse', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 16, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 59-99.
- Freud, S. (1937b), 'Konstruktionen in der Analyse', in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 16, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 43-56.
- Freud, S. (1939 [1934-38]), *Der Mann Moses und die monotheistische Religion*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 16, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 103-246.
- Freud, S. (1940 [1938]), *Abriß der Psychoanalyse*, in: *Gesammelte Werke*, volume 17, London: Imago Publishing [1940-52], pp. 63-138.

- Freud, S. (1950 [1895]), 'Project for a scientific psychology', in: *The Standard edition of the complete psychological works of Sigmund Freud*, volume 1 (1886-1899): Pre-psycho-analytic publications and unpublished drafts, London: Hogarth Press, pp. 281-391.
- Gagnebin, M. (1996), *Michel de M'Uzan (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 4)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Gaignard, L. (2001), 'Resonance symbolique entre les idéologies managériales et la sphère privée: questions pour une psychanalyste en ville', *Travailler* 6, pp. 115-128.
- Gallant, M. (1985), 'Limpid pessimist', *New York Review of Books* 32(19), pp. 19-24.
- Gallop, J. (1985), 'Psychoanalysis in France', available at: <http://sfonline.barnard.edu/sfxxx/documents/gallop.pdf>, accessed April 25th, 2013.
- Gálvez, M.J. (2002), '"Alphabet et psychanalyse" de Nicos Nicolaïdis', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 22, pp. 175-181.
- Gammelgaard, J. (2006), 'Primary process in metapsychology and cognitive psychology', *The Scandinavian Psychoanalytic Review* 29, pp. 93-105.
- Gammelgaard, J. and Zeuthen, K. (2010), 'Infantile sexuality', *The Scandinavian Psychoanalytic Review* 33, pp. 3-12.
- Ganem, V., Gernet, I. and Dejours, C. (2008), 'Le travail: que signifie ce terme en clinique et psychopathologie du travail ?', *L'Information Psychiatrique* 84, pp. 801-807.
- Garcia Pazos, M. (2001), *Die Moralphilosophie John Stuart Mills. Utilitarismus*, Marburg: Tectum Verlag.
- García Siso, A. (1993) 'El Dr. Francesc Tosquelles i Llauredó: Posición del autor dentro de la Psiquiatría catalana anterior a la Guerra Civil y la proyección de esta posición en su obra posterior' *Revista de la Asociación Española de Neuropsiquiatría* 13(46), 195-202.
- Garland, C., Hume, F. and Majid, S. (2002), 'Remaking connections: Refugees and the development of 'emotional capital' in therapy groups', *Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy. Applications, theory and research* 16(3), pp. 197-214.
- Garrabé, J. (1997), *Henri Ey et la pensée psychiatrique contemporaine*, Le Plessis-Robinson: Institut Synthélabo.
- Gauvain-Piquard, A. (1985), 'La douleur chez l'enfant', in: Lebovici, S., Diatkine, R. and Soulé, M. (2004/1985), *Nouveau traité de psychiatrie de l'enfant et de l'adolescent*, volume 1, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 495-506.
- Gedo J. (1999), 'French Psychoanalysis', in: Gedo, J., *The evolution of psychoanalysis. Contemporary theory and practice*, New York: Other Press, pp. 147-155.
- Geissmann, C. and Geissmann, P. (2004), *Histoire de la psychanalyse de l'enfant. Mouvements, idées, perspectives*, 2nd edition, Paris: Bayard.
- Gentry, J.A (2011), *How wars are won and lost: Vulnerability and military power*, New York Praeger Publishers.
- Gernet, I. and Dejours, C. (2009), 'Evaluation du travail et reconnaissance', *Nouvelle revue de psychosociologie* 8, pp. 27-36.
- Gernet, I. and Dejours, C. (2016), 'L'inconscient amential', in: Danon-Boileau, L. and Tamet, J-Y. eds., *Des psychanalystes en séance. Glossaire clinique de psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 365-368.

- Geyen, D. (2013), 'Psychosomatic Illness, cultural comparisons of', in: Scull, A., ed., *Cultural sociology of mental illness: An A-to-Z guide*, Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications, pp.725-726.
- Gibeault, A. (2006), 'Le centre de psychanalyse et de psychothérapie E. et J. Kestemberg', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes qui êtes vous?* Paris: Dunod, pp. 57-62.
- Gibeault, A. (2010), *Chemins de la symbolisation*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Gillibert, J. (1983), 'Le désir de l'interprète de Michel Fain, Aubier-Montaigne, La psychanalyse prise au mot', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 47(3), pp. 860-867.
- Giust-Desprairies, F. (2009/2003), *L'imaginaire collectif*, Toulouse: Érès.
- Glover, N. (2009), *Psychoanalytic aesthetics. An introduction to the British School*, London: Karnac Books.
- Goethe, J.W. (1971 [1808], *Faust. Der Tragödie erster Teil*, Stuttgart: Philipp Reclam. English translation: Goethe, J.W. (1808), *Faust. Der Tragödie erster Teil*, translated by Swanwick, A. (1909-14), New York: P.F.Collier&Son Company, available at: <http://www.bartleby.com/19/1/>, accessed 13th December 2015.
- Goldenberg, R. (1984), 'Talmud', in: Holtz, B.W., ed., *Back to the sources. Reading the classic Jewish texts*, New York: Summit Books, pp. 129-175.
- Golse, B. (2012), 'Michel Soulé (1922-2012)', in: 'Notices nécrologiques', *Journal de la Psychanalyse de L'enfant* 2, pp. 358-366.
- Goodman, L. E. (2002), 'What does Spinoza's *Ethics* contribute to Jewish Philosophy?', in: Ravven, H.M. and Goodman, L.E. (2002) eds., *Jewish Themes in Spinoza's Philosophy*, New York: State University of New York Press, pp.17-89.
- Goody, J. (2003), *La peur des représentations. L'ambivalence à l'égard des images, du théâtre, de la fiction, es reliques et de la sexualité*, Paris: La Découverte [= Goody, J. (1997), *Representations and contradictions. Ambivalence towards images, theatre, fiction, relics and sexuality*, Oxford: Blackwell].
- Gottlieb, R.M. (2003), 'Psychosomatic medicine: The divergent legacies of Freud and Janet', *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 51(3), pp. 857-881.
- Gottlieb, R.M. (2010a), 'Commentary on Pierre Marty's "The narcissistic difficulties presented to the observer by the psychosomatic problem"', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91, pp. 365-370.
- Gottlieb, R.M. (2010b), 'Coke or Pepsi?: Reflections on Freudian and Relational Psychoanalysis in dialogue', *Contemporary Psychoanalysis* 46, pp. 87-100.
- Gottlieb, R.M. (2013), 'On our need to move beyond folk medicine: A commentary on Karen Gubb's Paper, "Psychosomatics Today: A Review of Contemporary Theory and Practice"', *Psychoanalytic Review* 100(1), pp. 143-154.
- Gould, T. (1990), *The ancient quarrel between poetry and philosophy*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Gourevitch, M. (2012), 'La législation sur les aliénés en France de la Révolution à la Monarchie de Juillet', in: Postel, J. and Quételet, C. eds., *Nouvelle histoire de la psychiatrie*, 2nd edition, pp. 172-179.

- Grady, S. (2013), *Gardens of stone: My boyhood in the French Resistance*, London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Gramsci, A. (1917), 'Tre principi, tre ordini', in: Spriano, P., ed. (1973), *Scritti politici*, Roma: Editori Riuniti, pp. 29-32.
- Gramsci, A. (1975), *Quaderni del carcere, Edizione critica dell'Istituto Gramsci*, volume 1, ed. Gerratana, V., Torino: Einaudi.
- Grayling, A.C (2000), *The quarrel of the age. The life and times of William Hazlitt*, London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.
- Green, A. (1966), 'L'objet (a) de J.Lacan, sa logique, et la theorie freudienne', *Cahiers Pour L'analyse* 3, pp. 15-37, republished in: Green, A. (1995), *Propédeutique. La métapsychologie revisitée*, Seyssel: Champ Vallon, pp. 159-183.
- Green, A. (1973), *Le discours vivant. La conception psychanalytique de l'affect*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Green, A. (1974), 'L'analyste, la symbolisation et l'absence dans le cadre analytique', in: Green, A. (1990), *La folie privée. Psychanalyse des cas-limites*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 73-119.
- Green, A. (1983), *Narcissisme de vie, narcissisme de mort*, Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit.
- Green, A. (1983[1980]), 'La mère morte', in: Green, A. (1983), *Narcissisme de vie, narcissisme de mort*, Paris: Les éditions de minuit, pp. 222-253.
- Green, A. (1986), *On private madness*, London: Karnac.
- Green, A. (1993a), *Le travail du négatif*, Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit.
- Green, A. (1993b), 'L'analité primaire dans la relation anale', in: Brusset, B. and Couvreur, C. eds. *La névrose obsessionnelle*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 61-86.
- Green, A. (1994), *Un psychanalyste engagé. Conversations avec Manuel Macias*, Paris: Calmann-Lévy.
- Green, A. (1995a), 'Commentaire de l'observation de Jacques Press', *Revue française de psychosomatique* 8, pp. 41-48.
- Green, A. (1995b), 'Préface. L'ancien et le nouveau', in: Roussillon, R. (1995), *Logiques et archéologiques du cadre psychanalytique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 7-12.
- Green, A. (1998), 'La notion de crise en psychosomatique. Discussion de la présentation de Diane L'Heureux-Le Beuf', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 13, pp. 31-48.
- Green, A. (1998[1994]), 'Théorie', in: Fine, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., (1998), *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 17-53, available in English translation as: Green, A. (2010/1998[1994]), 'Thoughts on the Paris School of Psychosomatics', in: Aisenstein, M. and Rappoport de Aisemberg, E. eds. (2010), *Psychosomatics today. A psychoanalytic perspective*, London: Karnac Books.
- Green, A. (1998/1995), 'Commentaire de l'observation de Jacques Press', in: Fine, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 105-113 [slightly modified from Green 1995].
- Green, A. (2001), 'Reculer pour mieux sauter', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 65(4), pp. 1303-1314.

- Green, A. (2002a), *Idées directrices pour une psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Green, A. (2002b), *La pensée clinique*, Paris: Éditions Odile Jacob.
- Green, A. (2004), *La lettre et la mort. Entretiens avec Dominique Eddé*, Paris: Éditions Denoël.
- Green, A. (2005), 'Le syndrome de désertification psychique', in: Richard, F., ed., *Le travail du psychanalyste en psychothérapie*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 17-34.
- Green, A. (2006), *Associations (presque) libres d'un psychanalyste. Entretiens avec Maurice Corcos*, Paris: Albin Michel.
- Green, A. (2007a), 'Négatif et négation en psychanalyse', in: Héritier, F., Nancy, J.-L., Green, A., Régy, C. and Ameisen, J.-C., *Le corps, le sens*, Paris: Seuil, pp. 119-162.
- Green, A. (2007b), 'La psychosomatique de Marty', in: Green, A. (2007), *Pourquoi les pulsions de destruction ou de mort?*, Paris: Éditions du Panama, pp. 125-130.
- Green, A. (2009), *L'aventure négative. Lecture psychanalytique d'Henry James*, Paris: Hermann Éditeurs.
- Green, A. (2010a), 'Thoughts on the Paris School of Psychosomatics', in: Aisenstein, M. and de Aisemberg, E.R., eds., *Psychosomatics today. A psychoanalytic perspective*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 1-45.
- Green, A. (2010b), 'Rencontre avec Michel Fain', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 115-117.
- Green, A. (2012), 'On construction in Freud's work', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 93(5), pp. 1238-1248.
- Green, A. (2013), *Penser la psychanalyse avec Bion, Lacan, Winnicott, Laplanche, Aulagnier, Anzieu, Rosolato*, ed. L. Gutierrez-Green, Paris: Les Éditions d'Ithaque.
- Groarke, S. (2010), 'Unthinkable experience: Winnicott's ontology of disaster and hope', *American Imago* 67(3), pp. 399-429.
- Groarke, S. (2018), 'Making sense together. New directions in Independent clinical thinking', in: Kohon, G., ed., *British psychoanalysis. New perspectives in the Independent tradition*, Abingdon-on-Thames: Routledge, pp. 133-147.
- Grubrich-Simitis I. (1991/1994), *Freuds Moses-Studie als Tagtraum*, 2nd edition, Frankfurt/Main: Fischer Verlag.
- Grubrich-Simitis, I. (1981), 'Extreme traumatization as cumulative trauma—psychoanalytic investigations of the effects of concentration camp experiences on survivors and their children', *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child* 36, pp. 415-450.
- Gubb, K. (2013), 'Psychosomatics today: A review of contemporary theory and practice', *Psychoanalytic Review* 100(1), pp. 103-142.
- Guédeney, A. (2009), 'Léon Kreisler †', *Devenir* 21, pp. 5-6.
- Guignard, F. (1998), 'Anna Potamianou, Processus de répétition et offrandes du Moi', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(4), pp. 1297-1303.
- Guillaumin, J. (1989), 'La pulsion de mort, prothèse de l'impensé du contre-transfert dans la psychanalyse?', *Revue française de psychanalyse* 53(2), pp. 593-618.

- Guillaumin, J. (1992), 'Jugement de non-représentabilité et renoncement à la maîtrise de la pensée', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(1), pp. 9-21.
- Guillaumin, J. (1998), 'L'opérativité et le corps dans le "monisme" freudien', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1477-1482.
- Habermas, T. (2015), 'Rêver le passé d'autrui: Pourquoi le travail de remémoration reste encore pertinent en thérapie psychanalytique, du moins dans certaines traditions', *L'Année psychanalytique internationale 2015*, Paris: Éditions in Press, pp. 233-249 [= Habermas T. (2014), 'Dreaming the other's past: Why remembering may still be relevant to psychoanalytic therapy, at least in some traditions', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 95(5), pp. 951-963].
- Hacking, I. (1998), *Mad Travelers. Reflections on the reality of transient mental illnesses*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press. [published in French as Hacking, I. (2002), *Les Fous voyageurs*, Paris: Les Empêcheurs de penser en rond].
- Hacking, I. (1999), *The social construction of what?* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Hacking, I. (2004), 'Between Michel Foucault and Erving Goffman: between discourse in the abstract and face-to-face interaction', *Economy and Society* 33(3), pp. 277-302.
- Hacking, I. (2007), 'Kinds of people: Moving targets', *Proceedings-British Academy* 151, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 285–318.
- Halbwachs, M. (1925/1994), *Les cadres sociaux de la mémoire*, new edition with a Postface by Gérard Namer, Paris: Éditions Albin Michel.
- Hale, N.G. (1995), *The rise and crisis of psychoanalysis in the United States. Freud and the Americans 1917-1985*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hamlin, C. (2014), *More than hot. A short history of fever*, Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Hardy, T. (1901), *Poems of the past and the present*, in: Gibson, J., ed., (1976), *The complete poems*, London: Macmillan, pp. 84-187.
- Hardy, T. (1917), *Moments of vision*, in: Gibson, J., ed., (1976), *The complete poems*, London: Macmillan, pp. 427-553.
- Harrison, T. (2000), *Bion, Rickman, Foulkes and the Northfield Experiments. Advancing on a different front*, London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
- Harvey, W.P. and Levine, S.A., (1952), 'Paroxysmal ventricular tachycardia due to emotion; possible mechanism of death from fright', *Journal of the American Medical Association* 150(5), pp.479-480.
- Hayat, M. (2008), 'Le psychodrame analytique, ses origines, son évolution, son aire d'application', in: Calevoi N., Darge, G., Gossart, R., Hayat, M., Kockelmeyer, S., Scandariato, R. and Sferrazza, R., *Le psychodrame psychanalytique métathérapeutique: Supervision, relance et dégagement*, Paris: De Boeck Supérieur, pp. 23-36.
- Hebbrecht, M. (2005), 'Het onvoorstelbare verbeelden: Bespreking van: César Botella & Sára Botella (2005). The work of psychic figurability. Hove: Brunner-Routledge. ISBN 1-58391-815-9, 212', *Tijdschrift voor Psychanalyse* 11(4), pp. 293-294.
- Heenen-Wolff, S. (2007), 'Wichtige Strömungen in der französischen Psychoanalyse', *Forum der Psychoanalyse* 23(4), pp. 364-378.

- Hegel, G.W.F. (1807), *Vorrede zur Phänomenologie des Geistes*, eds. Moldenhauer, E. and Michel, K.M.] [1970]. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Hegel, G.W.F. (1816), *Die Wissenschaft der Logik*, volume 2: *Die subjective Logik oder Lehre vom Begriff*, Nürnberg: Johann Leonhard Schrag.
- Held, R. (1968/1960), 'Maladies psychosomatiques ou malades psychosomatiques', in: Held, R. (1968), *De la psychanalyse à la médecine psychosomatique*, Paris: Payot, pp. 449-457.
- Henckes, N. (2005), 'Réformer la psychiatrie, organiser les pratiques de secteur. La construction de la psychiatrie de secteur dans "l'expérience du treizième arrondissement"'. [Research Report] Centre de Recherche Médecine, Sciences, Société, Santé, available at: <https://hal-univ-bourgogne.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-01163556/document>, accessed 22nd July 2015.
- Henckes, N. (2009a), 'Un tournant dans les régulations de l'institution psychiatrique: la trajectoire de la réforme des hôpitaux aux psychiatriques en France de l'avant-guerre aux années 1950', *Genèses* 76, pp. 76-98.
- Henckes, N. (2009b), 'Les psychiatres et le handicap psychique. De l'après guerre aux années 1980', *Revue française des affaires sociales*, pp. 25-40.
- Hirata H. and Kergoat, D. (1988), 'Rapports sociaux de sexe et psychopathologie du travail, in: Dejours, C., ed., (1988), *Plaisir et souffrance dans le travail*, volume 2, Paris: Laboratoire de psychologie du travail et de l'action, CNAM, pp. 131-163.
- Hochmann, J. (2006), 'Soigner, éduquer, instituer, raconter. Histoire et actualité des traitements institutionnels des enfants psychologiquement troublés', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 70(4), pp. 1043-1063.
- Hock, U. (2007), 'Laplanches Trieb', *Libres Cahiers Pour La Psychanalyse* 15, pp. 73-84.
- Hock, U. (2013), 'Einblicke aus Frankreich. Eine metapsychologische Studie zum Unbewussten und seinen Repräsentanzen', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 67(9-10), pp. 931-961.
- Holmes, J. (2005), 'Notes on mentalizing – old hat, or new wine?', *British Journal of Psychotherapy* 22(2), pp. 179-197.
- Houkpatin, L., Wexler-Czitrom H., Perez, A. and Courbin, L. (2011), 'Vers un nouveau paradigme: la clinique de la multiplicité et la fabrique de "l'intime collectif"', in: Guerraoui, Z. and Pirlot, G. eds. (2011), *Comprendre et traiter les situations interculturelles. Approches psychodynamiques et psychanalytiques*, Brussels: Éditions De Boeck, pp. 55-107.
- <http://www.theses.fr> under the framework of abes. *agence bibliographique de l'enseignement supérieur* (<http://www.abes.fr>).
- Hughes, J.M. (1989), *Reshaping the psycho-analytic domain. The work of Melanie Klein, W.R.D. Fairbairn & D.W. Winnicott*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Huxley, A. (1932), *Brave new world*, Harmondsworth: Penguin books.
- Indepsi, ed., (2013), 'Pierre Marty (1918-1993)', Newsletter Indepsi 27, available at: <http://www.indepsi.cl/newsletter/News-27/terapeutas-27.html>, accessed 31st December 2016,
- Jackson, J.E. (1991), *De l'affect à la pensée. Introduction à l'oeuvre d'André Green*, Paris: Mercure de France.
- Jacobs, D. (1992), 'Cultivating Freud's garden in France', *The Psychoanal. Quarterly* 61, pp. 120-122.

- Jaeger, P. (2008), 'Excitation et pulsion de mort dans l'oeuvre de Michel Fain: un parcours de l'excitation à partir de l'insomnie précoce du nourrisson', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 38, pp. 45-66.
- Jaeger, P. (2015), 'Winnicott et l'École psychosomatique de Paris, convergences?', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 47, pp. 13-36.
- Jaeger, P. and Szvec, G. (2005), 'Interview de Paulette Letarte', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 28, pp. 13-26.
- Jalley, E. (1981), *Wallon lecteur de Freud & Piaget*, Paris: Editions sociales.
- Jalley, É. (2006), *La psychanalyse et la psychologie aujourd'hui en France*, Paris: Vuibert.
- Jalley, E. (2008), *La guerre de la psychanalyse*, volume 1: *Hier, aujourd'hui, demain*, Paris: L'Harmattan.
- Jay, M. (1973), *The dialectical imagination. A history of the Frankfurt School and the Institute of Social Research 1923-1950*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Jensen, R.T., and Miller, N.H. (2008), 'Giffen behavior and subsistence consumption', *The American Economic Review* 98(4), pp. 1553-1577.
- Jervis, G. (1988), 'Il mito del teorema psicoanalitico', *Psicoterapia e Scienze Umane* 22(4), pp. 73-96.
- Jorda, P. (1994), 'Hommage à Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 173-177.
- Judd, A. (1981), *Breed of heroes*, London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Jung-Rozenfarb, M. (2003), ' "Le corps d'abord" de Christophe Dejours', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 67(2), pp. 703-707.
- Jung, J. (2012), *Le double transitionnel. Trajectoire identitaire et organisation réflexive*, Thèse de doctorat de Psychologie, Université Lumière Lyon 2, available at: http://theses.univ-lyon2.fr/documents/lyon2/2012/jung_ja/pdfAmont/jung_ja_these.pdf.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. (1990), *Full catastrophe living. Using the wisdom of your body and mind to face stress, pain and illness*, New York: Random House.
- Kamieniak, I. (2015), 'Les Galériens volontaires de Gérard Szvec', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 79(3), pp. 895-901.
- Kamieniak, I.M. (2017), 'Éros et Antéros - Réflexions psychanalytiques sur la sexualité [Eros and Anteros - Psychoanalytic Reflections on Sexuality] by Denise Braunschweig and Michel Fain, Éditions In Press, Paris, 2013', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 98(1), pp. 277-282.
- Kamieniecki, H. (1992), 'Quelques sources historiques du mouvement de psychosomatique de l'Ecole de Paris', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 2, pp. 187-197.
- Kamieniecki, H. (1994), *Histoire de la psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Kapfhammer, H.-P. (1985), *Psychoanalytische Psychosomatik. Neuere Ansätze der psychoanalytischen Entwicklungspsychologie und Objektbeziehungstheorie*, Berlin: Springer Verlag.

- Kapfhammer, H.-P. (2010), 'Psychosomatische Medizin – Einleitung und Übersicht', in: Möller, H.-J., Laux, G. and Kapfhammer, H.-P. eds. (2010), *Psychiatrie. Psychosomatik. Psychotherapie*, volume 2, Berlin: Springer Verlag, pp. 1273-1295.
- Karlin, D. (1985), *The courtship of Robert Browning and Elizabeth Barrett*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Kaswin-Bonnefond, D. (2004a), 'Le traumatique, répétition et élaboration d'Anna Potamianou', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 68(1), pp. 273-278.
- Kaswin-Bonnefond, D. (2004b), "La vie opératoire: études psychanalytiques" de Claude Smadja', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 68(4), pp. 1327-1336.
- Kaufmann, W. A. (1966), *Hegel, a reinterpretation*, Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Keegan, J. (2014/1991), *The face of battle. A study of Agincourt, Waterloo and the Somme*, London: The Bodley Head.
- Kellner, D. (1991), 'Introduction to the second edition', in: Marcuse, H. (1964), *One-dimensional man. Studies in the ideology of advanced industrial society*, 2nd edition 1991, Boston: Beacon Press, pp. xi-xxxix.
- Kennedy, R. (2002) *Psychoanalysis, history, and subjectivity: Now of the past, Hove, East Sussex: Brunner-Routledge*.
- Kernberg, O. (1995), *Love relations. Normality and pathology*, New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Kernberg, O. (1996), 'Differences: psychoanalytic theory and culture in France and the United States, in: Baruch, E.H and Serrano, L.J, eds., *She speaks, he listens. Women on the French analyst's couch*, New York and London: Routledge, pp. 157-189.
- Kesten, H. (1942), 'Oberst Kock', reprinted in: Reich-Ranicki, M., ed., (1980), *Notwendige Geschichten 1933-1945*, München: DTV, pp. 456-473.
- Kipling, R. (1908), 'The stranger', in: Kipling, R. (1918 [1912]), *Songs from books*, London: Macmillan & Co.
- Klein, M. (1995), 'On identification', in: *Envy and gratitude and other works 1946-1963*, London [1988]: Virago Press, pp.141-175.
- Koestler, A. (1954), *The invisible writing*, London: Collins, accessed as Kindle e-book edition from 15th September 2015.
- Kohon, G. (1999), *The dead mother. The work of André Green*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Kohon, G. (2015), *Reflections on the aesthetic experience. Psychoanalysis and the uncanny*, London: Routledge.
- Kohon, G. (2018), 'Thirty years later. Looking back into the future', in: Kohon, G., ed., *British psychoanalysis. New perspectives in the Independent tradition*, Abingdon-on-Thames: Routledge, pp. 3-13.
- Korczynski, M., Pickering, M. and Robertson E. (2013), *Rhythms of labour: Music at work in Britain*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Koyré, A.(1968), *Études Newtoniennes*, Paris: Gallimard.

- Kreisler, L. (1974), 'Avant-propos', in: Kreisler, L., Fain, M. and Soulé (1974), *L'enfant et son corps. Etudes sur la clinique psychosomatique du premier âge*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 15-16.
- Kreisler, L. (1984), 'De la pédiatrie à l'économie psychosomatique de l'enfant', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(5), pp. 1243-1258.
- Kreisler, L., Fain, M. and Soulé (1974), *L'enfant et son corps. Etudes sur la clinique psychosomatique du premier âge*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Kristeva, J. (1993), *Les nouvelles maladies de l'âme*, Paris: Fayard.
- Kristeva, J. (2000), 'Les migrants, ou peut-on analyser l'autre langue?', in: Cournut, J. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Pratiques de la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 115-122.
- Kristeva, J. (2000), *Le génie féminin*, volume 2: Melanie Klein, Paris: Gallimard.
- Kristeva, J. (2009), 'Une Européenne en Chine', available at: http://www.kristeva.fr/en_chine.html, accessed 20th May 2018.
- Kromhout, B. (2018), 'Containers will not fix your broken culture (and other hard truths)', *Communications of the ACM* 61 (4), pp. 40-43.
- Krystal, H. (1985), 'Trauma and the stimulus barrier', *Psychoanalytic Inquiry* 5(1), pp. 131-161.
- Krzysztof, F. (2009), 'Le dialogue tonique dans la psychothérapie analytique de relaxation', *Psychothérapies* 29, pp. 33-38.
- Kull, K. and Hoffmeyer, J. (2005), 'Thure von Uexküll 1908-2004', *Sign System Studies* 33(2), pp.487-491.
- Kurzweil, E. (1989), *The Freudians. A comparative perspective*, New Haven: Yale University Press.
- L'Heureux-Le Beuf, D. (1998), 'Interruptions et reprises ', *Revue française de psychosomatique* 13, pp. 11-29.
- La Rochefoucauld, F. (1678), *Maximes et réflexions diverses*, Lafond, J., ed., (1976), Paris: Gallimard.
- Lacan, J. [1955], 'L'introduction à la question des psychoses', in: Miller, J.-A., ed., (1981), *Le séminaire de Jacques Lacan III, Les psychoses, 1955-1956*, Paris: Éditions du Seuil, pp. 11-24.
- Lacan, J., [1956], 'De l'analyse comme *bundling*, et ses conséquences' (19. December 1956), in: Miller, J.-A., ed., (1994), *Le séminaire de Jacques Lacan IV, La relation d'objet*, Paris: Éditions du Seuil, pp. 77-92.
- Lacan, J. (1966), *Écrits*, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Lacan, J. (1973[1964]), *Les quatre concepts fondamentaux de la psychanalyse*, ed. Miller, J.-A., Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- Langlitz, N. (2005), *Die Zeit in der Psychoanalyse. Lacan und das Problem der Sitzungsdauer*, Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp.
- Laplanche, J. (1970), *Vie et mort en psychanalyse*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Laplanche, J. (1987), *Nouveaux fondements pour la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

- Laplanche, J. (1997/1992), *Le primat de l'autre en psychanalyse. Travaux 1967-1992*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Laplanche, J. (2008), 'L'objet entre pulsion et instinct', in: *Annuel 2008 Association Psychanalytique de France 'L'objet, la réalité'*, pp. 13-25.
- Laplanche, J. and Pontalis, J.-B. (1985), *Fantasme originaire. Fantasme des origines. Origines du fantasme*, Paris: Hachette Littératures.
- Lassmann, W. (2009), 'Context and significance of Green's break with Lacan over the implicit question of affects in psychoanalytic theory and the subsequent presentation of his own position on the issue', unpublished module paper, University of Sheffield.
- Lassmann, W. (2013), 'Intergenerational transmission of influence and family pattern: Some French perspectives', *British Journal of Psychotherapy* 29(1), pp. 75–97.
- Lazar, R. (2001), 'Subject in first person – subject in third person: Subject, subjectivity and intersubjectivity', *American Journal of Psychoanalysis* 61(3), pp. 271-291.
- Le Blanc, G. (2007), *Les maladies de l'homme normal*, Paris: Vrin.
- Le Guen, A., Oppenheimer, A. and Perron, R. eds. (1991), *Angoisse et complexe de castration*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Le Guen, C. (1974), *L'œdipe originaire*, Paris: Payot.
- Le Guen, C. (1996), 'Préface', in: Janin, C., *Figures et destins du traumatisme*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Le Guillant, L. (1956), 'La névrose des téléphonistes', in: Le Guillant, L. (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 131-148.
- Le Guillant, L. (1957), 'Histoire de Madame L.', *La Raison* 18, pp. 82-94, also available in: Le Guillant, L. (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 173-195.
- Le Guillant, L. (1963), 'Incidences psychopathologiques de la condition de “bonne à tout faire”', in: Le Guillant, L. (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 37-90.
- Le Guillant, L. (1966), 'Réflexions sur une condition de travail particulièrement pénible: la VACMA', in: Le Guillant, L. (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 149-171.
- Le Guillant, L. (2006), *Le drame humain du travail. Essais de psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Clot, Y., Toulouse: Érès.
- Lê, M.G. (1994), 'Statistique et psychosomatique: incompatibilité absolue ou approche cohérente', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 99-103.
- Lear, J. (2000), *Happiness, death, and the remainder of life*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Lear, J. (2017), *Wisdom from illness. Essays in philosophy and psychoanalysis*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Lebovici, S. (1984[1980]), 'La psychiatrie de l'enfant et la communauté', in: Anthony, E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. *L'enfant dans sa famille*, volume 6: *Prévention en psychiatrie de l'enfant en un temps de transition*, [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1980), *The*

- child in his family*, volume 6: *Preventive child psychiatry in an age of transitions*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 359-376.
- Lebovici, S. (1988), 'Les enfants de la folie: By Anna Potamianou. Toulouse: Privat. 1984', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 69, pp. 564-565.
- Lebovici, S. (1989), 'Les liens intergénérationnels (transmission, conflits). Les interactions fantasmatiques', in: Lebovici, S. and Weil-Halpern F. eds., *Psychopathologie du bébé*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 141-146.
- Lebovici, S. (1996), 'Intervention', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 79-87.
- Lebovici, S. (1998), 'La psychosomatique et la recherche', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1465-1476.
- Lebovici, S. (2003), 'Développement de la psychanalyse de l'enfant et de l'adolescent en France après la Seconde Guerre mondiale', in: Geissmann C. and Houzel D. eds., *Psychothérapies de l'enfant et de l'adolescent*, Paris: Bayard Compact, pp. 1131-1137.
- Lebovici, S. and Castarède, M.-F. (1992), *L'enfance retrouvée*, Paris: Flammarion.
- Lebovici, S. and Soulé, M. (1970), *La connaissance de l'enfant par la psychanalyse*, augmented edition 2003, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Lebovici, S. and Widlöcher, D. (1980), 'Introduction. Psychoanalytic publications in France', in: Lebovici, S. and Widlöcher, D. eds., *Psychoanalysis in France*, New York: International Universities Press, pp. vii-xiv.
- Lechat, F. (1955[1954]), 'Intervention' [on Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a), 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 289-295.
- Leighton, A. (1986), *Elizabeth Barrett Browning*, Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Lenarduzzi, H. (2005), *Entre biología y cultura. Un estudio de la psicósomática en la infancia y la adolescencia*, Buenos Aires: Editorial Biblos.
- Levine, H.B, Reed, G.S and Scarfone, D. eds. (2013), *Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning. Clinical and theoretical contributions*, London: Karnac Books.
- Levine, H.B. (2008), 'The work of psychic figurability: Mental states without representation. By César Botella Sara Botella. Hove, England/New York Brunner-Routledge, 2005. 212 pp.' *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 77(2), pp. 639-648.
- Levine, H.B. (2010), 'Partners in thought: working with unformulated experience, dissociation, and enactment. By Donnel B. Stern. New York/London: Routledge, 2010, 229 pp.' *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 79(4), pp. 1166-1177.
- Levine, H.B (2011), 'Precious ambiguities: The analyzing situation. By Jean-Luc Donnet, translated by Andrew Weller. London: Karnac, 2009. 199 pp.', *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 80(3), pp. 727-740.
- Levine, H.B. (2012a), 'Review of Psychosomatics Today: A psychoanalytic perspective, eds. Aisenstein, M. and Rappoport de Aisemberg, E., *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 60(1), pp. 207-216.
- Levine, H.B. (2012b), 'The Colourless canvas: Representation, therapeutic action and the creation of mind', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 93(3), pp. 607-629.
- Levine, H.B. (2013), 'Comparing field theories', *Psychoanalytic Dialogues* 23(6), pp. 667-673.

- Levine, H. (2018), 'The Greening of psychoanalysis. Andre Green's new paradigm in contemporary theory and praxis, edited by R.J. Perelberg and G. Kohon', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(2), pp. 535-538.
- Lézé, S. (2010), *L'autorité des psychanalystes*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Lhuilier, D. (2010), 'Les "risques psychosociaux": entre rémanence et méconnaissance', *Nouvelle Revue de Psychosociologie* 10, pp. 11-28.
- Lhuilier, D. (2012), 'Introduction à l'œuvre de Claude Veil', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 9-51.
- Lichtenberg, J.D. and Slap, J.W. (1971), 'On the defensive organization', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 52, pp. 451-457.
- Ling, T.M., Purser, J.A and Rees, E.W. (1950), 'Incidence and treatment of neurosis in industry', *British Medical Journal* 2(4671), pp. 131-148.
- Lipsitt, D.R. (2000), 'Psyche and soma: struggles to close the gap', in: Menninger, R.W. and Nemiah, J.C. eds., *American psychiatry after World War II*, Washington, D.C.: American Psychiatric Press, pp. 152-186.
- Livingstone, D.N. (2014), *Dealing with Darwin. Place, politics, and rhetoric in religious engagements with evolution*, Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Loewald, H.W. (1952/1980) 'The problem of defense and the neurotic interpretation of reality', in: Loewald, H.W. (1980), *Papers on psychoanalysis*, New Haven: Yale University Press, pp. 21-32.
- Loewald, H.W. (1988), *Sublimation: inquiries into theoretical psychoanalysis*, London: Yale University Press.
- Logevall, F. (2012), *Embers of war: The fall of an empire and the making of America's Vietnam*, New York: Random House.
- Lopez, D. and Zorzi Meneguzzo, L. (1989), 'Dal carattere alla persona', in: Semi, A. A., ed., *Trattato di psicoanalisi*, Milano: Raffaello Cortina Editore, pp. 371-514.
- Lown, B. (1983), 'Introduction', in: Cousins, N. (1983), *The healing heart*, New York: W.W. Norton, p.xi ff.
- Lucas, G. (2010), 'À propos du "Désir de l'interprète"', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 139-149.
- Magee, G.A. (2010), *The Hegel dictionary*, London: A&C Black.
- Magonet, J. (2004), *A rabbi reads the psalms*, 2nd edition, London: SCM Press.
- Magun, A. (2013), *Negative revolution: Modern political subject and its fate after the Cold War*, London: Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Malone, K. (1967/1948), 'The Old English Period (to 1100)', in: Baugh, A.C., ed., *A literary history of England*, volume 1: *The Middle Ages*, New York: Appleton Century Crofts, pp. 3-105.
- Mancia, M. (2004), 'Cesar e Sara Botella (2004) La raffigurabilità psichica Roma, Borla, pagine 239, euro 19,50', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 50(4), pp. 1285-1291.
- Manguel, A. (1998), *Into the looking-glass. Essays on books, reading and the world*, Toronto: Knopf.

- Marcuse, H. (1964), *One-dimensional man. Studies in the ideology of advanced industrial society*, 2nd edition 1991, Boston: Beacon Press.
- Marin, C. (2009), 'Au-delà de l'ennui: l'effort pour rendre l'autre intéressant', *Revue Médicale Suisse* 2009(5), pp. 351-353.
- Marini, M. (1992), *Jacques Lacan. The French context*, New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Marty, P. (1951), 'Aspect psychodynamique de l'étude clinique de quelques cas de céphalalgies', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 15(2), pp. 216-52.
- Marty, P. (1952), 'Les difficultés narcissiques de l'observateur devant le problème psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 16, pp. 339-362; in English translation: Marty, P. (2010[1952]), 'The narcissistic difficulties presented to the observer by the psychosomatic problem', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91, pp. 463-468.
- Marty, P. (1955), 'Intervention' [on 'A propos de musique' de H. Racker], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(3), pp. 402-405
- Marty, P. (1956), 'Clinique et pratique psychosomatiques', in: Nacht, S., ed., *La psychanalyse d'aujourd'hui*, volume 2, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 532-573.
- Marty, P. (1957[1956]a), 'Intervention' [on 'Essai sur la situation analytique et le processus de guérison (la dynamique)' de B. Grunberger], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 21(3), pp. 448-452.
- Marty, P. (1957[1956]b), 'Intervention' [on 'A propos d'un cas d'hypertension artérielle' de M.Fain], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 21(4), pp. 479-481.
- Marty, P. (1958[1957]), 'La relation d'objet allergique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 22(1), pp. 5-29. [in English: 'The allergic object relation', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 39, pp. 98-103].
- Marty, P. (1960), 'Maurice Bouvet familial', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 24(6), pp. 709-710.
- Marty, P. (1962[1961]), 'Intervention' [on 'Les identifications précoces dans la structuration et la restructuration du moi' de P.Luquet], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 26, special number, pp. 293-300.
- Marty, P. (1967), 'Régression et instinct de mort: hypothèses à propos de l'observation psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(5-6), pp. 1113-1126.
- Marty, P. (1967[1965]), 'Intervention' [on 'A propos de la sublimation' de Sandler, J. and Joffe, W.G.], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(1), pp. 22-25.
- Marty P. (1967/2003), 'Aspects psychosomatiques de la fatigue (1967)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp.9-32.
- Marty, P. (1968[1966]), 'La dépression essentielle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 32(3), pp. 595-598.
- Marty, P. (1968[1967]), 'A major process of somatization: The progressive disorganization', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 49, pp. 246-249.
- Marty, P. (1969), 'Intervention sur l'exposé de Sami Ali suivi de Notes cliniques et hypothèses à propos de l'économie de l'allergie', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 33(2), pp. 243-253.
- Marty, P. (1970), 'Allocution', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 34(5-6), pp. 751-752.

- Marty, P. (1972), Intervention, *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 36(5-6), pp. 805-816.
- Marty, P. (1976), *Les mouvements individuels de vie et de mort. Essai d'économie psychosomatique*, volume 1, Paris: Payot.
- Marty, P. (1980), *L'ordre psychosomatique* [= *Les mouvements individuels de vie et de mort. Essai d'économie psychosomatique*, volume 2], Paris: Payot.
- Marty, P. (1981[1980]), 'Intervention', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(2), pp. 293-294.
- Marty, P. (1984a), 'Des processus de somatisation', in: Fain, M. and Dejours, C. eds., *Corps malade et corps érotique*, Paris: Masson, pp. 101-115.
- Marty, P. (1984b), 'A propos des rêves chez les malades somatiques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(5), pp. 1143-1162.
- Marty, P. (1990a), *La psychosomatique de l'adulte*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Marty, P. (1990b), 'Psychosomatique et psychanalyse', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(3), pp. 615-624.
- Marty, P. (1991[1990]), 'Genèse des maladies graves et critères de gravité en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 1, pp. 5-21, also available in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Press, J. (1995), *La psychosomatique hier et aujourd'hui*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 155-178.
- Marty, P. (1991/2013), *Mentalisation et psychosomatique*, Le Plessis-Robinson : Institut Synthélabo, reprinted in: Press, J., ed., (2013), *Rêver, transformer, somatiser*, Geneva: Georg, pp. 13-31. [original edition Marty, P. (1991), *Mentalisation et psychosomatique*, Paris: Les Empêcheurs de penser en rond]
- Marty, P. (1996[1991]), 'Entretiens avec Pierre Marty', in: Marty, P. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1996), *Psychosomatique. Pensée vivante*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps, pp. 15-81.
- Marty P. (2001[1981]), 'La psychosomatique en 1981. Les processus de somatisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 161-171.
- Marty, P. (2006[1987]), 'Introduction à la psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 30, pp.165-167.
- Marty, P. and de M'Uzan, M. (1963 [1962]), 'La pensée opératoire. Intervention sur le rapport de M. Fain et Ch. David: Aspects fonctionnels de la vie onirique' [23e Congrès de psychanalystes de langues romanes, Barcelona 1962], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 27, special number, pp. 345-356.
- Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1954[1953]), 'Notes sur certains aspects psychosomatiques de la tuberculose pulmonaire', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 18(2), pp. 244-275.
- Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a), 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 205-284.
- Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]b), 'Réponse de Pierre Marty et Michel Fain', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 318-322.
- Marty, P. and Fain, M. (1964), 'Perspectives psychosomatiques sur la fonction des fantasmes', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 28(4), pp. 609-622.
- Marty, P. and Marty S. (1962), *L'art tauromachie et la psychanalyse*, typed and bound manuscript of the radio feature broadcast in December 1962, unpublished, in possession of the author of this thesis.

- Marty, P. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1996), *Psychosomatique. Pensée vivante*, Bordeaux: L'Esprit du Temps.
- Marty, P. and Parat, C. (1974), 'De l'utilisation des rêves et du matériel onirique dans certains types de psychothérapie d'adultes', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 38(5-6), pp. 1069-1076.
- Marty, P., de M'Uzan, M. and David C. (2003/1963), *L'investigation psychosomatique. Sept observations cliniques*, 2nd edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Marty, P., Fain, M., de M'Uzan M. and David, C. (1968[1967]), 'Le cas Dora et le point de vue psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 32(4), pp. 679-714.
- Masciangelo, P.M. and Racalbutto, A. (1987), 'Nicolaïdis sulla rappresentazione: l'evoluzione freudiana', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 33, pp. 529-540.
- Mauger, J. (2014), 'Le futur actuel', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 78(5), pp. 1499-1502.
- Maupas, A. and Prudent-Bayle, A. (2016), 'La censure de l'amante', in: Danon-Boileau, L. and Tamet, J-Y. eds., *Des psychanalystes en séance. Glossaire clinique de psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 497-501.
- Mauss, M. (1923/24), *Essai sur le don. Forme et raison de l'échange dans les sociétés archaïques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- McCarthy, J.B. (1990), 'Abusive families and character formation', *American Journal of Psychoanalysis* 50(2), pp. 181-186.
- McDougall, J. (1972), 'Plaidoyer pour une certaine anormalité', *Revue française de psychanalyse* 36(3), pp. 345-358.
- McDougall, J. (1980), 'The anti-analysand in analysis', in: Lebovici, S. and Widlöcher, D. eds., *Psychoanalysis in France*, New York: International Universities Press, pp. 333-354 [= English version of McDougall, J. (1972), 'L'anti-analysant en analyse: un portrait clinique et une notion théorique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 36(2), pp. 167-184, translated by Joyce McDougall].
- McDougall, J. (1994), "'Un bouclier dans l'économie des états limites: l'espoir: Anna Potamianou. Collection Le fait psychanalytique. Presses Universitaires de France, Paris, 1992'", *Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis* 2, pp. 271-273.
- McDougall, J. (1996), "'Un bouclier dans l'économie des états limites: l'espoir: By Anna Potamianou. Collection Le fait psychanalytique. Presses Universitaires de France, Paris, 1992, 160pp., FF. 128" ', *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 44, pp. 1295-1298.
- McNay, L. (2000), 'Psyche and society: Castoriadis and the creativity of action', in: McNay, L., *Gender and agency. Reconfiguring the subject in feminist and social theory*, Cambridge: Polity Press, pp. 117-154.
- McNay, L. (2008), *Against recognition*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- McRae, J.R. (2014), 'The hagiography of Bodhidharma: Reconstructing the point of origin of Chinese Chan Buddhism', in: Kieschnik, J. and Shahar, M. eds., *India in the Chinese imagination: myth, religion and thought*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, pp. 125-138.
- Mellier, D. (2014), 'The psychic envelopes in psychoanalytic theories of infancy', *Frontiers in Psychology* 5, article 734, pp. 1-9.

- Mellier, D. (2017), 'Après propos. La qualité de vie: une constituante de la niche de développement?' *Enfance* 1(1), pp. 143-149.
- Melville, H. (1853), 'Bartleby the Scrivener'. A Story of Wall Street'. *Putnam's Monthly* 2(11), pp. 546-557, and 2(12), pp. 609-615.
- Messer, J. (2010), Churned and spurned in the flexible world of work. A corporative narrative, *Cultural Studies Review* 16(2), pp.75-101.
- Messer, J. (2013), 'Reconceptualizing maternal work: Dejours, Ruddick and Lionel Shriver's We Need to Talk About Kevin', *Women's Studies International Forum* 38, pp. 11-20.
- Midweek: Owen Sheers, Stephen Grady, Michael Ball, Ffion Jones, broadcast on BBC Radio 4, 20th February 2013.
- Mill, J.S. (1859), *On Liberty*, 3rd edition 1864, London: Longmans, Green, Reader and Dyer.
- Mill, J.S. (1873), *Autobiography*, 3rd edition 1874, London: Longmans, Green, Reader and Dyer.
- Mittleman, A.L (2012), *Between Kant and Kabbalah. An introduction to Isaac Breuer's Philosophy of Judaism*, New York: State University of New York Press.
- Molinier, P. and Flottes, A. (2012), 'Travail et santé mentale: approches cliniques.' *Travail et emploi* 129, pp. 51-66.
- Moore, Y. (2009), 'Thoughts on representation in therapy of Holocaust survivors', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 90, pp. 1373-1391.
- Moreau Ricaud, M. (2004), 'Une "utopie" à la croisée de la psychiatrie et de la psychanalyse: la psychothérapie institutionnelle', *Topique* 88, pp.95-108.
- Moreau, F. (1998), *Écoute psychosomatique. Deux situations cliniques de Pierre Marty*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps.
- Moro, M.R. (2002), *Enfants d'ici venus d'ailleurs. Naître et grandir en France*, Paris: La Découverte.
- Moro, M.R. (2009), 'Les débats autour de la question culturelle en clinique', in: Baubet, T. and Moro, M.R (2009), *Psychopathologie transculturelle*, 2nd edition 2013, Paris: Elsevier Masson, pp. 31-48.
- Moro, M.R. (2015), *La violence envers les enfants, approche transculturelle*, Bruxelles: éditions fabert.
- Murakami, H. (2009), *Autoportrait de l'auteur en coureur de fond [= What I Talk About When I Talk About Running]*, Paris: Belfond.
- Murray, C.J., ed., (2013), *Encyclopedia of Modern French Thought*, London: Routledge.
- Musalek, S. (2006), *Sigmund Freud in deutsch-französischer Übersetzung. Eine deskriptiv-historische Studie aus übersetzungswissenschaftlicher Sicht*, Wien/Berlin: Lit Verlag.
- Music, Z. (1995), *Rétroperspective*. Catalogue de l'exposition du Grand Palais en 1995.
- Musil, R. (1913), 'Die Portugiesin', *Drei Frauen. Novellen* (1914), in: Musil, R. (1978), *Gesammelte Werke*, ed. Frisé, A., volume 6, Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt Verlag, pp. 252-270.

- Müürsepp, P. (no date), 'Semiophysics as a theoretical basis for scientific creativity', http://www.academia.edu/715209/Semiophysics_as_a_Theoretical_Basis_for_Scientific_Creativity, accessed 22nd November 2013.
- Nacht, S. (1955[1954]), 'Intervention'[on Martyr, P. and Fain, M. (1955[1954]a), 'Importance du rôle de la motricité dans la relation d'objet'], *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19(1-2), pp. 286-289.
- Nacht, S., ed., (1956), *La psychanalyse d'aujourd'hui*, 2 volumes, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Nathan, T. (1994), *L'influence qui guérit*, Paris: Odile Jacob.
- Nathan, T., Tobie Nathan, brève biographie, available under <http://www.ethnopsychiatrie.net/TobieNathan.html>, accessed 11th July 2010.
- National Institutes of Health (2000/2011), 'Psychosomatic medicine: "The puzzling leap"', available at: <https://www.nlm.nih.gov/exhibition/emotions/psychosomatic.html>, accessed 2nd April 2016.
- Nayrou, F. (2014), 'Les galériens volontaires de Gérard Szwec', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 46, pp. 173-180.
- Nettleton, S. (2017), *The metapsychology of Christopher Bollas. An introduction*, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.
- Newcomer, B. (1993), 'The zephyr and Japanese literature', *Language Arts Journal of Michigan* 9(2), article 6, available at: <https://doi.org/10.9707/2168-149X.1593>, accessed 11th August 2018.
- Neyraut, M. (1974), *Le transfert*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Neyraut, M. (1997), *Les raisons de l'irrationnel*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Nicolaïdis, A. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1989), *Dictionnaire des mots inexistantes*, Genève: Éditions Metropolis.
- Nicolaïdis, G. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1977), 'Jeu d'ombre et sujet-objet mélancolique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(1-2), pp. 281-286.
- Nicolaïdis, G. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1994), *Mythologie Grecque et Psychanalyse*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Nicolaïdis, G. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1997), 'La mythologie la plus proche de la fantasmatisation symbolique', in: Clancier, A. and Athanassiou Popesco, C. eds., *Mythes et psychanalyse*, Paris: In Press, pp. 23-31.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1971), 'La réalité du "mythe" dans la cure psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 35(5-6), pp.1011-1013.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1972), 'Intervention', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 36(5-6), p. 973.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1973), 'Proto-Oedipe et Oedipe oedipifié. Une "mutation" sur-moïque. A propos de Oedipe sans complexe de J.P.Vernant', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 37(3), pp. 473-490.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1975), 'La psychanalyse survivra-t-elle en "1984"? L'Hybris kleinienne (du côté de Clytemnestre)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 39(1-2), pp. 247-272.

- Nicolaïdis, N. (1977), 'L'auto-érotisme instantané: dédoublement phallique: une aventure apollinienne', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(5-6), pp. 1107-1112.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1979a), 'Oedipe: Le message de la différence', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 43(3), pp. 409-419.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1979b), 'Aspects de représentation psychanalytique (De l'objet référent à l'axe phallique de la représentation significative)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 43(5-6), pp. 1031-1064.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1980a), 'Proto-Oedipe et Oedipe oedipisé. Une "mutation" sur-moiïque. A propos de Oedipe sans complexe de J.P.Vernant', in: Anzieu, D., Carapanos, F., Gillibert, J., Green, A., Nicolaïdis, N., and Potamianou, A. (1980), *Psychanalyse et culture Grecque*, Paris: Société d'Édition des Belles Lettres, pp. 159-182.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1980b), 'Mythes et écriture, moyens d'approche de l'appareil psychique', in: Anzieu, D., Carapanos, F., Gillibert, J., Green, A., Nicolaïdis, N., and Potamianou, A. (1980), *Psychanalyse et culture Grecque*, Paris: Société d'Édition des Belles Lettres, pp. 197-214.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1981), 'Le côté "hieroglyphique" de la langue maternelle résistance aux changements du processus psychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(4), pp. 1029-1033.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1982a), 'Du meutre du savoir et de l'inceste (Questionnements et ambiguïtés)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 46(4), pp. 857-865.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1982b), 'La créativité à l'intérieur de la langue', in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Schmid-Kitsikis, E., eds. *Créativité et/ou symptôme*, Paris: Éditions Clancier-Guénaud, pp. 199-206.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1984a), *La représentation. Essai psychanalytique. De l'objet referent a la représentation symbolique*, Paris: Bordas.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1984b), 'Homosexualité, culpabilité inconsciente ou préconsciente?: du "cratylisme" avec Freud' *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 48(3), pp. 731-744.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1985), 'Fixations synchroniques et négations diachroniques: à propos de René Girard', in: Flournoy, O., ed., *Psychanalyse 1985*, Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Psychoanalyse, pp. 197-214.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1987), 'Un préconscient extra-territorial (L'historien objectif doit mourir)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 51(2), pp. 775-780.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1988), *La théophagie. Oralité primaire et métaphorique*, Paris: Dunod
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1989a), 'Le sujet perdant', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(2), pp. 231-234.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1989b), 'Le fonction symbolique dans le processus dissociatif et les désorganisation contre-évolutives', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(6), pp. 1871-1877.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1989c), 'Hésiode et Freud, chemins parallèles: l'infrastructure mythique inaugurale', *Topique* 43, pp. 101-114.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1990), 'Le langage, élément neg-entropique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(6), pp. 1635-1638.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1991), 'Fantasmes originaires et fantasmes "historico-mythologiques"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 55(5), pp. 1185-1188.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1992), 'De la "mère symbiotique" à la renonciation pulsionnelle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(5), pp. 1639-1642.

- Nicolaïdis, N. (1993), *La force perceptive de la représentation de la pulsion*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995a), 'Perception et reconnaissance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(4), pp. 565-569.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995b), 'Temps cyclique et temps linéaire', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(4), pp. 1189-1196.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995c), 'Le langage, appareil d'action', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(5), pp. 1695-1698.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995d), 'Introduction', in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Press, J. eds., *La psychosomatique hier et aujourd'hui*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 9-30.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995e), 'Psychosomatique un concept limite', in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Press, J. eds., *La psychosomatique hier et aujourd'hui*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 259-293.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1995f), 'Analyse de : Green, A. - Le travail du négatif. Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit, 1993', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 7, pp. 211-217.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1996a), 'Introduction', in: Marty, P. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1996), *Psychosomatique. Pensée vivante*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps, pp. 7-14.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1996b), 'Complément aux entretiens', in: Marty, P. and Nicolaïdis, N. (1996), *Psychosomatique. Pensée vivante*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps, pp. 137-164.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1996c), 'Préface', in: Athanassiou-Popesco, C., *Penser le mythe*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 9-17.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1997a), 'La crise "solution de continuité" de l'organisation défensive', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. 143-149.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1997b), 'De la perception au moi-idéal', in: Schmid-Kitsikis, E. and Sanzana A. eds., *Concepts limites en psychanalyse*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 329-341.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1998a), 'Argument: L'unité fondamentale de l'être humain', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 11-19.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1998b), 'Argument', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 73-78.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1998c), 'Le cheminement de l'AGEPSO', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 151-154.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1998d), 'La "poupée" de Pierre Marty et les Barbies de notre époque', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1579-1581.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1998e), 'Le "modèle Marty": pré-psychique ou près-psychique?', in: Fine, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 125-135.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1999a), 'Introduction', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 2, pp. 3-11.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1999b), 'Le langage rend "l'amour plus fort que la mort"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 63(5), pp. 1899-1904.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (1999c), 'Le langage infraverbal: une "transfusion" olfacto-gustative', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 16, pp. 173-178.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2000a), 'Questionnement et apories', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 3, pp. 3-8.

- Nicolaïdis, N. (2000b), 'Esquisse d'une réponse à René Roussillon', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 3, pp. 115-117.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2001a), *Alphabet et psychanalyse. Suivi de Une séance de supervision avec Jaques Lacan*, Bordeaux-Le-Bouscat: L'Esprit du Temps.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2001b), 'Esquisse du travail du rêve', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 4, pp. 3-6.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2003a), *Angoisse, dépression, dépression essentielle*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2003b), 'Surmoi et religions (Une mutation surmoïque)', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 6, pp. 159-173.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2004), 'Aux confins de la représentation', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 9-22.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2005), 'Réflexions à propos de la dépersonnalisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 27, pp. 163-176.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2006), 'Modes de défenses qui protègent le fonctionnement mental: hypothèses de travail', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 9, pp. 5-9.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2009a), 'Mes réflexions sur le petit-a de J. Lacan', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 12, pp. 139-159.
- Nicolaïdis, N. (2009b), 'Réflexions sur le livre d'André Green: Le Premier Commandement de J. Conrad', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp. 183-190.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Abraham, G. (1989), 'Sur l'économie du désir', *Evolution Psychiatrique* 54(4), pp. 787-801.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Andréoli, A. (1986), 'Discutants', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 50(1), pp. 337-370.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Cornu, F. (1976), 'Etude du signifiant psychanalytique à travers les "Cinq psychanalyses" de S. Freud', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 40(2), pp. 325-350.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Papilloud, J. (1988), 'Une langue privée pour combler le manque', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 52(2), pp.523-531.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Press J. (2004), 'Un regard sur le parcours de l'AGEPSO', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 5-7.
- Nicolaïdis, N. and Vadi Lathon, P. (2005), 'Présentation', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 8, pp. 1-4.
- Nigolian, I. (2012), 'Le maternel chez l'adolescent', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 41, pp. 43-55.
- Nigolian, I. and Press, J. (2018), 'Préface', in: Press, J. and Nigolian, I. eds., *Enfances: mémoire sans temps, corps orphelin*, Paris: Éditions In Press, pp. 7-13.
- Nougaret, C. and Lacousse, M. (2004), Fonds de la Société Psychanalytique de Paris (SPP). Répertoire numérique détaillé, Archives nationales, available at: <http://www.archivesnationales.culture.gouv.fr/chan/chan/AP-pdf/101-AS.pdf>, accessed 31st December 2016.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (1994), *The therapy of desire. Theory and practice in Hellenistic ethics*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- O'Neill, B. (2011), 'Response to Christophe Dejours "Body and sexuality"', *EPF Bulletin* 64, pp. 204-210.
- Obadia, J.-P. (1986), 'Le corps entre biologie et psychanalyse de Christophe Dejours', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 50(5), pp. 1509-1514.
- Ody, M. (1999), 'L'apport de la théorie de Michel Fain à la pratique de l'analyse d'enfants', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 63-71.
- Ody, M. (2000), *Denise Braunschweig (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 30)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Ody, M. (2008), 'Modernité du préconscient', *Libres Cahiers Pour La Psychanalyse* 18, pp. 57-74.
- Ody, M. and Danon-Boileau, L. (2002), 'censure de l'amante', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 1, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 303-304.
- Ody, M. and Smadja, C. (2004), 'Carence paternelle. Importance du père et de la fonction paternelle dans le développement du fonctionnement mental', in: Lebovici, S., Diatkine, R. and Soulé M. eds., *Nouveau traité de psychiatrie de l'enfant et de l'adolescent*, volume 4, 2nd edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 2603-2620.
- Ogden, T. H. (1992a), 'The dialectically constituted/decentred subject of psychoanalysis I: The Freudian subject', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 73, pp. 517-526.
- Ogden, T.H. (1992b), 'The dialectically constituted/decentred subject of psychoanalysis II: The contributions of Klein and Winnicott', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 73, pp. 613-626.
- Ohayon, A. (2006/1999), *Psychologie et psychanalyse en France. L'impossible rencontre (1919-1969)*, 2nd edition, Paris: Éditions La Découverte.
- Ohayon, A. (2015), 'Psychanalyse et sciences humaines dans les années 1950, débats ouverts, débats clos', in: Perron, R. and Missonier, S. eds., *Sigmund Freud*, Paris: Éditions de L'Herne, pp. 320-326.
- Ohnuki-Tierney, E. (2010), *Kamikaze, cherry blossoms, and nationalisms: The militarization of aesthetics in Japanese history*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Oksenberg Rorty, A. (1986/1980), 'Self-deception, akrasia and irrationality', in: Elster, J., ed., *The multiple self*, Cambridge/New York: Cambridge University Press, pp. 115-131.
- Olick, J.K. (2008), 'The ciphered transits of collective memory: Neo-Freudian impressions' *Social Research*, pp. 1-22, available at: <http://sociology.virginia.edu/sites/sociology.virginia.edu/files/cipheredtransits.pdf>, accessed 8th February 2016.
- Oliner, M.M. (1988), *Cultivating Freud's garden in France*, Northvale, New Jersey: Jason Aronson.
- Oliner, M.M. (1996), 'External Reality: The elusive dimension of psychoanalysis', *Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 65, pp. 267-300.
- Oliner, M.M. (2008), 'Die Psychoanalyse: ein Zimmer ohne Aussicht?' *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 62(11), pp. 1122-1147.

- Oliner, M.M. (2010), 'Die zufällige Analytikerin', in: Hermanns, L.M., ed., *Psychoanalyse in Selbstdarstellungen*, volume 8, Frankfurt/Main: Brandes&Apsel, pp. 187-243.
- Oliner, M.M. (2012), 'The elusive dimension of external reality in psychoanalytic theory', in: Oliner, M.M. (2012), *Psychic reality in context. Perspectives on psychoanalysis, personal history, and trauma*, London: Karnac, pp. 39-51.
- Oliner, M.M. (2013a), '"Non-represented" mental states', in: Levine, H.B, Reed, G.S and Scarfone, D. (2013), *Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning. Clinical and theoretical contributions*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 152-171.
- Oliner, M.M. (2013b), 'An essay on Bion's beta function', *Psychoanalytic Review* 100(1), pp. 167-183.
- Oury, J. and Gabarron-Garcia, F. (2010), 'Psychothérapie institutionnelle et Guerre d'Espagne', *Chimères* 72, pp. 11-20.
- Overbeck, G. (1977), 'Das psychosomatische Symptom: Psychische Defizienzerscheinung oder generative Ichleistung?' *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 31(4), pp. 333-354.
- Pagès, C. (2015), 'Le travail du négatif: Freud avec Hegel?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 79(3), pp. 809-823.
- Palacio Espasa, F. (2002), 'répression', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Dictionnaire international de la psychanalyse*, volume 2, Paris: Calmann-Lévy, pp. 1537-1538.
- Palese, E. (2013), 'Zygmunt Bauman. Individual and society in the liquid modernity'. *SpringerPlus* 2(1), 191. <http://doi.org/10.1186/2193-1801-2-191>.
- Papageorgiou, M. (1996), 'La force perceptive de la représentation de la pulsion [The perceptual force of the drive representation]', *International Journal of Psycho-Analysis* 77(1), p.165.
- Papageorgiou, M. (2009), "'Les modèles psychanalytiques de la psychosomatique" de Claude Smadja", *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 36, pp. 181-187.
- Parat, C. (1991), 'A propos de la répression', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 1, pp. 93-113.
- Parat, C. (1994), 'Pour dissiper quelques malentendus....', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 23-28.
- Parsons, M. (1992), 'The refinding of theory in clinical practice', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 73(1), pp. 103-115.
- Parsons, M. (2000), *The dove that returns, The dove that vanishes: Paradox and creativity in psychoanalysis*, London: Routledge.
- Parsons, M. (2002), 'Le cadre. Utilisation et invention', in: André, J. and Thompson, C. eds., *Transfert et états limites*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 69-84.
- Parsons, M. (2005), 'Introduction', in: Botella, C. and Botella, S. (2005), *The work of psychic figurability. Mental states without representation*, London: Routledge, pp. xvii-xxiii.
- Parsons, M. (2014), *Living Psychoanalysis. From theory to experience*, London: Routledge.
- Pasche, F. (1960), 'Le symbol personnel', in: Pasche, F. (1969), *A partir de Freud*, Paris: Payot, pp. 157-179.
- Pasche, F. (1965), 'L'anti-narcissisme', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 29(5-6), pp. 503-518.

- Pasche, F. (1988), *Le sens de la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Patrick, M. (1999), "' Hope: A shield in the economy of borderline states. By Anna Potamianou. Translated by Philip Slotkin New Library of Psychoanalysis 26. Routledge. Pp. vii + 120. £45 (h/b) £14 (p/b)'" *Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy* 13, pp. 91-93.
- Paul, P.I. (1997), 'Processes of repetition and offerings of the ego', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 78, pp. 1037-1039.
- Paulin, T. (1975), *Thomas Hardy. The poetry of perception*, London: The Macmillan Press.
- Pedinielli, J-L. (1992), *Psychosomatique et alexithymie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Pelanda, E. (1995), 'La centralità dei sentimenti nella psicologia psicoanalitica di Sandler', in: Pelanda, E., ed., *Modelli di sviluppo in psicoanalisi*, Milano: Raffaello Cortina Editore, pp. 309-329.
- Perelberg, R.J. (2013), 'Revue Française de Psychanalyse 2011, Vols 1-5: On some of the current themes in French psychoanalysis edited by Denys Ribas, Françoise Coblence, Chantal Lechartier-Atlan PUF, Paris, 2011; 1820 pp', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 94(3), pp. 589-617.
- Perelberg, R.J. and Kohon, G. (2017), *The Greening of psychoanalysis: André Green's new paradigm in contemporary theory and practice*, Abingdon-on-Thames: Routledge.
- Perron-Borelli, M. (1997), 'Au-delà de la douleur: le travail du deuil', in: Cournot, J., Israël, P., Jeanneau, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Le mal-être (angoisse et violence). Débats de psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 163-169.
- Petacchi, G. (1978), '38° Congresso degli Psicoanalisti di Lingue Romanze', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi*, 24, pp. 456-472.
- Picard, D. (2006), 'Difficultés de la prévention des pathologies psychosociales liées au travail', *Management & Avenir* 8, pp. 199-217.
- Picard, P.V. (2009), 'De Staël entre figuration et abstraction, une vertigineuse quête d'objet', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 54(1), pp. 67-93.
- Pichot, P. (1996), *Un siècle de psychiatrie*, Paris: Collection Synthélabo.
- Piret, B. (2011), 'Le corps de l'étranger dans le discours psychiatrique et psychopathologique du Xxe siècle', available at: <http://www.parole-sans-frontiere.org/spip.php?article308#nh11>, accessed 15th January 2017.
- Pirlot, G. (2007), 'Modèles actuels en psychosomatique', *Encyclopédie Médico-Chirurgicale*, 37-40981, available under <http://www.polycopenligne.com/docs/M1S2/M1S2-DO-modeles-actuels-psychosomatique.pdf>, accessed 4th December 2012.
- Pirlot, G. (2009), *Déserts intérieurs. Le vide négatif dans la clinique contemporaine, le vide positif de "l'appareil d'ame"*, Toulouse: Éditions Érès.
- Pirlot, G. (2010), *La Psychosomatique. Entre psychanalyse et biologie*, Paris: Armand Colin.
- Pirlot, G. (2011), 'Psychopathologie et psychosomatique psychanalytiques et interculturelles', in: Guerraoui, Z. and Pirlot, G. (2011), *Comprendre et traiter les situations interculturelles. Approches psychodynamiques et psychanalytiques*, Brussels: Éditions De Boeck Université, pp. 145-192.
- Pirlot, G. (2013), *Classifications et nosologies des troubles psychiques. Approches psychiatrique et psychanalytique*. Paris: Armand Colin.

- Pirlot, G. and Corcos, M. (2012), 'Understanding Alexithymia within a Psychoanalytical Framework', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 93(6), pp. 1403-1425.
- Pirlot, G. and Cupa, D. (2012a), *Approche psychanalytique des troubles psychiques*, Paris: Armand Colin.
- Pirlot, G. and Cupa, D. (2012b), *André Green. Les grands concepts psychanalytiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Poincaré, H. (1908), *Science and method*, 1952 edition, New York: Dover.
- Plotkin, M.B. (2010), *Histoire de la psychanalyse en Argentine. Une réussite singulière*, Paris: CampagnePremière [sic].
- Pontalis, J.-B. (1975), 'Trouver, accueillir, reconnaître l'absent [Préface]', in: Winnicott, D.W. (1975/71), *Jeu et réalité*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 7-17.
- Pontalis, J.-B. (1986), *L'amour des commencements*, Paris: Gallimard.
- Porot, A. (1918), 'Notes de psychiatrie musulmane', *Annales médico-psychologiques* 74(9), pp. 377-384, available at: <http://ldh-toulon.net/la-psychiatrie-coloniale-au.html>, accessed 15th January 2017.
- Porte, J.-M. (1998), 'La pensée opératoire peut-elle se décliner au pluriel?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1519-1526.
- Postel, J. and Quétel, C. eds. (2012), *Nouvelle histoire de la psychiatrie*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod.
- Potamianou, A. (1973), 'A propos du développement de l'idéal du Moi', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 37(5-6), pp. 1169-1174.
- Potamianou, A. (1974), 'Illusion du rêve et de la connaissance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 38(5-6), pp. 1127-1132.
- Potamianou, A. (1975), 'Réflexions sur le transsexualisme féminin', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 39(5-6), pp. 1053-1064.
- Potamianou, A. (1977a), 'Le deuil de Prométhée', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(1-2), pp. 205-216.
- Potamianou, A. (1977b), 'Mouvement auto-érotique de la pensée', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 41(5-6), pp. 1117-1124.
- Potamianou, A. (1978), '"Comme on l'utilisera..." : sur la fonction de l'analyste', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 42(1), pp. 111-122.
- Potamianou, A. (1979), 'Réflexions psychanalytiques sur la "Promethia" d'Eschyle: rapports entre l'omnipotence et la dépression', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 43(3), pp. 375-400.
- Potamianou, A. (1980), 'Vécu de l'enfance, défenses du moi et rencontre avec le psychanalyste', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 44(5-6), pp. 990-998.
- Potamianou, A. (1982a), 'On ego defenses', *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child* 37, pp. 421-432.
- Potamianou, A. (1982b), 'Sur le travail analytique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 46(2), pp. 371-376.
- Potamianou, A. (1983a[1978]), 'Discussion' [of Hersh, S.P., 'Les enfants et leurs familles aux Etats-Unis: trois profils de changement avec un commentaire sur le stress, l'aptitude à faire face et les vulnérabilités relatives'], in: Anthony, E.J. and Chiland, C. eds., *L'enfant dans sa*

- famille*, volume 5: *Parents et enfants dans un monde en changement* [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1978), *The child in his family*, volume 5: *Children and their parents in a changing world*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 104-107.
- Potamianou, A. (1983b[1978]), 'Quelques commentaires sur le changement social en Grèce', in: Anthony, E.J. and Chiland, C. eds., *L'enfant dans sa famille*, volume 5: *Parents et enfants dans un monde en changement* [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1978), *The child in his family*, volume 5: *Children and their parents in a changing world*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 179-185.
- Potamianou, A. (1983c[1978]), [untitled, separate contribution to] 'Visites sur le terrain en Israël: juillet 1976', in: Anthony, E.J. and Chiland, C. eds., *L'enfant dans sa famille*, volume 5: *Parents et enfants dans un monde en changement* [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1978), *The child in his family*, volume 5: *Children and their parents in a changing world*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 308-310.
- Potamianou A. (1983d), 'Propos sur quelques modalités de la régression', *Topique* 31, pp. 91-104.
- Potamianou, A. (1984a), *Les enfants de la folie. Violence dans les identifications*, Toulouse: Edition Privat.
- Potamianou, A. (1984b [1980]), ' "Une bonne pluie connaît sa saison..." ', in: Anthony. E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. *L'enfant dans sa famille*, volume 6: *Prévention en psychiatrie de l'enfant en un temps de transition*, [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1980), *The child in his family*, volume 6: *Preventive child psychiatry in an age of transitions*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 529-531.
- Potamianou, A. (1985a), 'Concerning the second drive movement', [= 'Propos sur l'autre courant...'], *Bulletin of the European Psychoanalytic Federation* 25, pp. 97-102.
- Potamianou, A. (1985b), 'The personal myth: points and counterpoints', *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child* 40, pp. 285-296.
- Potamianou, A. (1986), 'Des origines du refoulement et de l'agencement des défenses', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 50(1-2), pp. 521-524.
- Potamianou, A. (1987), 'De vortex et de volcans. Toujours sur le parcours des identifications', *Topique* 39, pp. 49-61.
- Potamianou, A. (1988a), 'Figurations du Nirvâna et réaction thérapeutique négative', *Revue française de psychanalyse* 52(4), pp. 917-935.
- Potamianou, A. (1988b), '"Episkepsis": pensées autour de la visite d'Anna Freud à Athènes', *Revue Internationale d'Histoire de la Psychanalyse* 1, pp. 247-254.
- Potamianou, A. (1990a), 'Somatization and dream work', *Psychoanalytic Study of the Child* 45, pp. 273-292.
- Potamianou, A. (1990b), 'Réflexions et hypothèses sur la problématique des états limites', in: Le Guen, C., ed., *La psychanalyse: questions pour demain*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 171-179.
- Potamianou A. (1990c) 'Rêves et somatisation', *Topique* 45, pp. 49-62.
- Potamianou, A. (1991), 'D'un reste irréductible', *Topique* 47, pp. 57-67.

- Potamianou, A. (1992a), *Un bouclier dans l'économie des états-limites*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Potamianou, A. (1992b), 'Inquiétudes au sujet d'une étrange familiarité', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(2), pp. 121-129 [also available in: Denis, P. and Schaeffer, J. eds. (2001), *Devenir psychanalyste?*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 121-129].
- Potamianou, A. (1992c), 'Note sur un avant-coup', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(4), pp. 1101-1104.
- Potamianou, A. (1992d), 'Emprise et dé-prise: une combinatoire', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 56(5), pp. 1519-1525.
- Potamianou, A. (1992e[1988]), 'Le processus d'identification chez les enfants soumis à un stress causé par la psychose de la mère', in: Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds., *L'enfant dans sa famille, volume 8: Le développement en péril* [French version of Anthony E.J. and Chiland, C. eds. (1988), *The child in his family, volume 8: Perilous development: child raising and identity formation under stress*, New York: John Wiley & Sons], Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 73-79.
- Potamianou, A. (1992f), 'Etre par procuration', in: Gros, F. and Huber, G. eds., *Vers un anti-destin? Patrimoine génétique et droits de l'humanité*, Paris: Odile Jacob, pp. 309-315.
- Potamianou, A. (1992g), 'Approche psychanalytique de la tragédie grecque', *Psychanalyse dans la civilisation* 7, pp. 29-40.
- Potamianou, A. (1993a), 'Insuffisance des procédés autocalmants', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 87-95.
- Potamianou, A. (1993b), 'En exil de langue maternelle', *Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis* 1(2), pp. 47-59.
- Potamianou, A. (1994a), 'Réflexions sur le processus désinvestissants', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 5, pp. 101-105.
- Potamianou, A. (1994b), 'Sur le thème du "tout analyser"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 58(4), pp. 983-987.
- Potamianou, A. (1995), *Processus de répétition et offrandes du Moi*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Potamianou, A. (1997a), 'De crises et de maladies', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. 7-22.
- Potamianou, A. (1997b), 'Faits mythiques, événements historiques, réalité psychique', in: Clancier, A. and Athanassiou Popesco, C. eds., *Mythes et psychanalyse*, Paris: In Press, pp. 33-39.
- Potamianou, A. (1997c), 'Working the borders', *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 48, pp. 32-38.
- Potamianou, A. (1997d), 'L'angoisse de mort', in: Cournut, J., Israël, P., Jeanneau, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Le mal-être (angoisse et violence). Débats de psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 45-56.
- Potamianou, A. (1998a), 'Les contraintes de l'opérateur', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 13, pp. 49-62.

- Potamianou, A. (1998b), 'En dehors du temps...dans les figures du mythe: Hélène: brillance et éblouissement du désir', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(3), pp. 947-955.
- Potamianou, A. (1998c), 'Parricide et inceste : la solution de Sparte', in: Le Beuf, D., Perron, R. and Pragier, G. eds., *Construire l'histoire*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 53-61.
- Potamianou, A. (1999a), 'Avoir la douleur', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 15, pp. 51-63.
- Potamianou, A. (1999b), 'Le temps de l'interprétation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 16, pp. 49-57.
- Potamianou, A. (1999c), 'Croisements', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 63(5), pp. 1703-1709.
- Potamianou, A. (2000a), 'Dans les sillons du traumatique', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 3, pp. 119-138.
- Potamianou, A. (2000b), 'En contre-ordre de la mort', in: Guillaumin, J., Potamianou, A., Roussillon, R., Kaës, R., Lamothe, C., Vasseur, C., Vermorel, M. and Vermorel, H., *L'invention de la pulsion de mort*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 55-69.
- Potamianou, A. (2001), *Le traumatique. Répétition et élaboration*, Paris: Dunod.
- Potamianou, A. (2002a), 'Mouvoir. En revenant sur l'analité primaire', *Penser les limites. Écrits en l'honneur d'André Green*, ed. Botella, C., Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 523-529.
- Potamianou, A. (2002b), 'Fixations psychiques, liages somatiques', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 22, pp. 151-174.
- Potamianou, A. (2002c), 'Pathways of pleasure: The channel of primary anality', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 83(3), pp. 609-621.
- Potamianou, A. (2003), 'Attaches métapsychologiques de la fatigue', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp. 45-60.
- Potamianou, A. (2004a), 'Ouverture psychique - souffrance somatique', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 141-158.
- Potamianou, A. (2004b), 'Discussion of Robert Asséo's Report' [= 'Discussion du rapport de Robert Asséo'], *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 58, pp. 118-123.
- Potamianou, A. (2005), 'Excitante hybris', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 69(1), pp. 169-186.
- Potamianou, A. (2006a), 'Violence dans la vie opératoire et dans les somatisations', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 9, pp. 37-47.
- Potamianou, A. (2006b), 'In the space of the lost footsteps' [= 'Dans l'espace des pas perdus'], *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 60, pp. 51-60.
- Potamianou, A. (2007), 'Témoignages et questionnements', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 32, pp. 89-105.
- Potamianou, A. (2008a), 'Épimythion au négatif', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 72(1), pp. 63-74.
- Potamianou, A. (2008b), 'Frappes et battements d'excitation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 33, pp. 8-29.
- Potamianou, A. (2008c), 'The part of the shadows' [= 'La part des ombres; réflexions sur la névrose de destinée'], *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 62, no page numbers.

- Potamianou, A. (2010a), 'Calmer, s'abstenir, veiller', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 97-108.
- Potamianou, A. (2010b), 'De flux et de reflux. En discutant le rapport de Françoise Coblence', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 74(5), pp. 1357-1366.
- Potamianou, A. (2010c), 'En poursuivant', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 163-175.
- Potamianou, A. (2011a), 'Aux carrefours des passions et de la toute-puissance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 75(2), pp. 501-515.
- Potamianou, A. (2011b), 'Une fois de plus... la culpabilité', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 39, pp. 77-90.
- Potamianou, A. (2013), 'Destins et carillons de la culpabilité', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 44, pp. 93-109.
- Potamianou, A. (2015), 'Amnemonic traces: traumatic after-effects', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 96(4), pp. 945-966.
- Potamianou, A. (2016), 'Donner forme, figurer, représenter. Quelques réflexions', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 50, pp. 207-223.
- Potamianou, A. (2017a), 'Revisiting the destiny compulsion', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 98(1), pp. 55-69.
- Potamianou, A. (2017b), 'Pour le temps d'une amitié', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 52(2), pp. 151-162.
- Pouchelle, M-C. (2003), *L'hôpital corps et âme. Essais d'anthropologie hospitalière*, Paris: Éditions Seli Arslan.
- Powers, S., Peek, J., O'Reilly, T., and Loukides, M., (2003), *Unix power tools*, 3rd edition, Sebastopol, California: O'Reilly.
- Pragier, G. and Faure-Pragier, S. (1990), 'Un siècle après l' "Esquisse": nouvelles métaphores?: Métaphores du nouveau', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(6), pp. 1395-1500.
- Press, J. (1995a), 'La répression, refoulement du pauvre?', in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Press, J. eds., *La psychosomatique hier et aujourd'hui*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 179-206.
- Press, J. (1995b), 'La répression, refoulement du pauvre ?' *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 7, pp. 121-139 [identical with Press 1995a].
- Press, J. (1995c), 'Une observation clinique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 8, pp. 25-39.
- Press, J. (1996), 'Discontinuité, rythme, temps, (a)temporalité: atemporalité de l'inconscient et perception du temps', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 139-155.
- Press, J. (1997a), 'Culture, mesure et démesure', in: Schmid-Kitsikis, E. and Sanzana A. eds., *Concepts limites en psychanalyse*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 343-362.
- Press, J. (1997b), 'Temps et pulsion', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 61(5), pp. 1707-1720.
- Press, J. (1997c), 'Caractère(s), traumatisme(s), somatisation(s)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 11, pp. 49-70.
- Press, J. (1997d), 'A propos du livre de Nicos Nicolaïdis: La force perceptive de la représentation de la pulsion', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 11, pp. 211-217.
- Press, J. (1997e), 'Note sur la manie essentielle', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 12, pp. 103-120.

- Press, J. (1998a), 'Rencontres', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(1), pp. 121-134.
- Press, J. (1998b), 'Le bruit de la rue: des mécanismes de maîtrise aux processus de somatisation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1591-1600.
- Press, J. (1998c), 'Une observation clinique', in: Fine, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 91-104. [largely identical with: Press 1995b].
- Press, J. (1998d), 'Introduction', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 5-9.
- Press, J. (1998e), 'Commentaire. Ecriture et inscription psychique', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 79-89.
- Press, J. (1998f), 'Valeur heuristique du modèle psychosomatique de Pierre Marty: quelques éléments de réflexion', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 1, pp. 107-124.
- Press, J. (1998g), 'Brèves remarques sur l'activité du facteur traumatique dans le système sommeil-rêve', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 14, pp. 113-126.
- Press, J. (1999a), 'Le système sommeil-rêve et l'équilibre psychosomatique', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante et autres préludes à l'oeuvre de Michel Fain*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 35-49.
- Press, J. (1999a), 'Le système sommeil-rêve et l'équilibre psychosomatique', in: Duparc, F., ed., *La censure de l'amante*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 35-49.
- Press, J. (1999b), *La perle et le grain de sable. Traumatisme et fonctionnement mental. Essai psychanalytique*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé.
- Press, J. (1999c), 'A propos de l'article d'Anna Potamianou' [Potamianou 1999a], *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 15, pp. 65-77.
- Press, J. (2000e), 'Traumatisme et mécanismes de défense', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 3, pp. 17-30.
- Press, J. (2000f), 'La bête dans la jungle: somatisation, contre-transfert et enclaves psychiques', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 17, pp. 91-105.
- Press, J. (2001a), 'Mécanismes de répression, travail de contre-transfert et processus de somatisation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 65(1) pp. 85-100.
- Press, J. (2001b), 'Mouvements de mentalisation-démantisation, présence de l'analyste et processus de somatisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 39-55.
- Press, J. (2001c), 'Rêver, fantasmer, somatiser', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 4, pp. 17-25.
- Press, J. (2001d), 'A propos de l'article de Marta Calatroni', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 4, pp. 137-42.
- Press, J. (2002a), 'Entre l'espoir et la douleur', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 5, pp. 55-69.
- Press, J. (2002b), 'Le travail de membre: acte de candidature et/ou acte de passage?', *Bulletin de la Société Suisse de Psychanalyse* 54, pp. 12-16.
- Press, J. (2003a), 'Fixations somatiques et fonctionnement mental', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 23, pp. 145-162.
- Press, J. (2003b), 'De quelques sources du sentiment inconscient de culpabilité', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 67(5), pp. 1623-1632.

- Press, J. (2004a), 'Narcissisme de l'analyste et fonction de la théorie dans le champ psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 25, pp. 155-164.
- Press, J. (2004b), 'Modèles, sens et processus en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 68(5), pp. 1681-1687.
- Press, J. (2004c), 'La psychosomatique est-elle soluble dans la psychanalyse?' *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 45-60.
- Press, J. (2005a), 'Acquisition du sens de la réalité, folie et somatisation: un regard psychosomatique sur l'oeuvre de Sandor Ferenczi', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 27, pp. 49-66.
- Press, J. (2005b), 'Construction, interprétation et confusion de langues', *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 59, pp. 55-63.
- Press, J. (2005c), 'La construction du sens en psychosomatique', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 8, pp. 59-75.
- Press, J. (2005d), [contribution], in: 'Discussion sur les deux présentations, par Colette Combe, les orateurs et le public, in: Duparc, F. ed., *Winnicott en 4 squiggles*, Paris: In Press Éditions, p. 128f.
- Press, J. (2006a), 'Constructing the truth: from "Confusion of tongues" to "Constructions in analysis"', *International Journal of Psycho-Analysis* 87(2), pp. 519-536.
- Press, J. (2006b), 'Les sédiments de deuil: deuil, impasses psychiques et somatisations', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 30, pp. 9-25.
- Press, J. (2006c), 'Des théories du déficit au déficit des théories... et à leur nécessité', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 9, pp. 81-91.
- Press, J. (2007a), 'Entre le monde et le soma: le langage', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 71(5), pp. 1529-1535.
- Press, J. (2007b), 'La construction de la vérité; de "Confusion de langue" à "Construction dans l'analyse"', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 71(3) pp. 783-802.
- Press, J. (2007c), 'Somatiser, agir...espérer peut-être', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 10, pp. 45-62.
- Press, J. (2008a), 'Avatars du spectre d'identité en psychosomatique', in: de M'Uzan, M., ed., *La chimère des inconscients*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 13-37.
- Press, J. (2008b), 'Construction avec fin, sans fin', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 72(5), pp. 1269-1337.
- Press, J. (2008c), 'La construction de la théorie en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 34, pp. 151-168.
- Press, J. (2009a), 'Investiguer "L'investigation psychosomatique": quelques pistes', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp. 143-153.
- Press, J. (2009b), 'Inachèvement et après-coup dans le processus théorisant', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 73(5), pp. 1591-1598.
- Press, J. (2010), 'A propos du livre de Claude Smadja', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 183-187.
- Press, J. (2010a), *La construction du sens*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Press, J. (2010b), 'L'analyste femelle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 74(1), pp. 165-180.

- Press, J. (2010c), 'L'équilibre psychosomatique, une si fragile conquête', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 39-49.
- Press, J. (2010d), 'Trauma et pulsion', *Libres Cahiers Pour La Psychanalyse* 21, pp. 35-51.
- Press, J. (2010e), 'Être psychosomaticien aujourd'hui', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 133-145.
- Press, J. (2010f), 'A propos du livre de Claude Smadja', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 183-187.
- Press, J. (2010g), 'Un mal nécessaire', *Bulletin de la Société Suisse de Psychanalyse* 70, pp. 43-45.
- Press, J. (2011a), 'Angoisse et processus de somatisation', *Psychologie clinique et projective* 17, pp. 9-28.
- Press, J. (2011b), 'Culpabilité primaire, défense maniaque de comportement et rêverie diurne', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 39, pp. 51-65.
- Press, J. (2011c), 'L'inoubliable, limite de l'analysable', in: Manzano J. and Abella A. eds., *La construction en psychanalyse: Récupérer le passé ou le réinventer?* Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. pp. 171-193.
- Press, J. (2011d), 'La projection inachevée', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 75(3), pp. 665-679.
- Press, J. (2012a), 'Ferenczi, patient somatisant, homosexualité latente et équilibre psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 42, pp. 35-49.
- Press, J. (2012b), 'La sexualité impure ou l'hystérie primaire à l'épreuve du contre-transfert', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 76(5), pp. 1471-1478.
- Press, J. (2013a), 'Capacité de rêverie et fonction maternelle', in: Press, J., ed., *Rêver, transformer, somatiser*, Chêne-Bourg: Georg Editeur, pp. 33-43.
- Press, J. (2013b), 'Régression et transformation', in: Press, J., ed., *Rêver, transformer, somatiser*, Chêne-Bourg: Georg Editeur, pp. 181-198.
- Press, J. (2013c), 'L'informe, l'intime, l'inconnu, les processus de transformation et l'objet', *Bulletin de la Fédération Européenne de Psychanalyse* 67, pp. 32-41.
- Press, J. (2013d), 'Nous et "les autres" ', *Bulletin de la Société Suisse de Psychanalyse* 75, pp. 5-9.
- Press, J. (2014a), 'Un contre-transfert bardé d'éclats: états traumatiques et travail de contre-transfert', in: Tovmassian, L.T. and Bentata, H. eds, *Quels traitements pour l'effraction traumatique ? Apports de la clinique et de la pratique psychanalytiques*, Paris: In Press, pp. 83-93.
- Press, J. (2014b), 'La psychosomatique, une invention occidentale? Travail clinique, processus théorisant et détour par l'autre', in: Press, J., ed., *Corps culturel, corps malade*, Chêne-Bourg: Georg Editeur, pp. 159-177.
- Press, J. (2014c), 'La transmission de la théorie: transmission de vie, transmission de mort', *Revue française de psychanalyse* 78(2), pp. 453-464.
- Press, J. (2015a), 'Lire Winnicott', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 47, pp. 65-78.

- Press, J. (2015b), 'Le transfert du négatif. Histoire d'une possession blanche', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 79(4), pp. 1123-1135.
- Press, J. (2015c), 'Masochisme et organisation de la sexualité infantile: une théorie à démanteler', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 79(5), pp. 1596-1601.
- Press, J. (2016a), 'Metapsychological and clinical issues in psychosomatics research', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 97(1), pp. 89-113.
- Press, J. (2016b), 'L'analyse, expérience corporelle, et l'informe. Réflexions libres sur le fonctionnement du couple analytique en séance', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 80(3), pp. 792-804.
- Press, J. (2016c), 'Le psychosomatique et l'expérience de l'informe', in: Press, J. and Nigolian, I. eds., *Corps parlant, corps parlé, corps muet*, Paris: Éditions In Press, pp. 115-130.
- Press, J. (2016d), 'La présence sensible de l'analyste', in: Danon-Boileau, L. and Tamet, J-Y, eds., *Des psychanalystes en séance. Glossaire clinique de psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 202-205.
- Press, J. (2017a), 'Enjeux épistémologiques et cliniques de la recherche en psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 81(2), pp. 541-570 [= French version of Press 2016a].
- Press, J. (2017b), 'L'écriture, l'analyse et la vie', *Bulletin de la Société Suisse de Psychanalyse* 83, pp. 15-19.
- Press, J. (2018), 'Séances', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 82(1), pp. 76-88.
- Press, J. and Nigolian, I. (2016), 'Préface', in: Press, J. and Nigolian, I. eds., *Corps parlant, corps parlé, corps muet*, Paris: Éditions In Press, pp. 7-10.
- Priel, B. (2009), 'The transformation of sociogenic autistic defences in the lives of others', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 90(2), pp. 387-393.
- Proust, M. (1920-21), *Le côté de Guermantes*, part 2: *A la recherche du temps perdu*, volume 7, Paris: Gallimard.
- Proust, M. (1925), *The Guermantes way*, part 1: *Remembrance of things past*, translated by Scott-Moncrieff, C. K., New York: Random House.
- Quartier-Frings, F. (1997), *René Diatkine (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 15)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Quétel, C. (2012a), 'Le vote de la loi de 1838', in: Postel, J. and Quétel, C. eds., *Nouvelle histoire de la psychiatrie*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod, pp. 180-186.
- Quétel, C. (2012b), 'La vie quotidienne d'un asile d'aliénés à la fin du XIX siècle', Postel, J. and Quétel, C. eds., *Nouvelle histoire de la psychiatrie*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod, pp. 327-333.
- Raphael-Leff, J. (2007), 'Freud's prehistoric matrix - owing 'nature' a death', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 88(6), pp. 1345-1373.
- Raphael-Leff, J. (2012), 'The intersubjective matrix: influences on the Independents' growth from "objects relations" to "subject relations" ', in: Williams, P., Keene, J. and Dermen S. (2012), *Independent psychoanalysis today*, London: Karnac, pp. 87-162.
- Rau, A. (2009), 'Suizid und neue Leiden am Arbeitsplatz', *Widerspruch. Beiträge zu sozialistischer Politik* 56, pp. 67-77, available under www.schattenblick.de/infopool/medien/altern/wider024.html, accessed 22nd February 2013.

- and under <http://archiv.labournet.de/diskussion/arbeitsalltag/gh/rau.pdf>, accessed 3rd March 2013.
- Raymond, D. (1816 [1757]), *Traité des maladies qu'il est dangereux de guérir*, new edition, Paris: Brunot-Labbe available at: <http://www.biusante.parisdescartes.fr/histoire/medica/resultats/index.php?do=livre&cote=32918>, accessed 15th March 2016.
- Recalcati, M. (2010), *L'uomo senza inconscio. Figure della nuova clinica psicoanalitica*, Milan: Raffaello Cortina Editore.
- Reisner, S. (2003), 'Trauma: the seductive hypothesis', *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 51(2), pp. 381-414.
- Rheinberger, H. (2014), 'Histoire récente Ian Hacking: le caractère expérimental du savoir', in: *Introduction à la philosophie des sciences*, Paris: La Découverte, pp. 103-114.
- Ribas, D. (1998), 'Le lieu perdu des traces retrouvées', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1607-1612.
- Ribas, D. (2008), 'Traumatisme précoce restreint ou généralisé? discussion du rapport de Jacques Press', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 72(5), pp. 1339-1349.
- Ribas, D. (2014), 'La contrainte au désinvestissement de soi', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 78(5), pp. 1531-1537.
- Reed, G.S, Levine, H.B and Scarfone, D. (2013), 'Introduction: from a universe of presences to a universe of absences', in Levine, H.B, Reed, G.S and Scarfone, D. (2013), *Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning. Clinical and theoretical contributions*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 3-17.
- Richard, F. and Urribarri, F. (2005), *Autour de l'oeuvre d'André Green. Enjeux pour une psychanalyse conemporain*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Riolo, F. (2018), 'Comment on 'Mentalisation et passivité' by Michel Fain', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(2), pp. 485-486.
- Rivals Fotaki, G. (2011), 'Les dissidences du corps de Christophe Dejours', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 39, pp. 173-179.
- Roche, R.C. (2004), 'Presentación del libro "La figurabilidad psíquica" César y Sara Botella', *Revista de Psicoanálisis, Madrid* 42, pp. 165-171.
- Rolo, D. and Dejours, C. (2015), 'Travail et usage de substances psychoactives: évolution de la clinique', *Psychologie Clinique et Projective* 21, pp. 243-256.
- Rose, J. (2007a), 'Symbols: on their formation and use', in: Rose, J., ed., *Symbolization. representation and communication*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 1-17.
- Rose, J. (2007b), 'Symbols and their function in managing the anxiety of change: an intersubjective approach', in: Rose, J., ed., *Symbolization. representation and communication*, London: Karnac Books, pp. 51-81.
- Rose, J. (2011), 'Couples, doubles, and absence: some thoughts on the psychoanalytic process considered as a learning process', in: Rose, J., ed., *Mapping psychic reality: Triangulation, communication, and insight*, London: Karnac, pp. 227-247.
- Rose, J. (2014), 'The isolate and the stranger: Winnicott's model of subjectivity and its implications for theory and technique', in: Spelman, M.B. and Thomson-Salo, F. eds., *The*

- Winnicott tradition: Lines of development – Evolution of theory and practice over the decades*, London: Karnac, pp. 175-184.
- Rosenberg, B. (1991), *Masochisme mortifère et masochisme gardien de la vie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Rouart, J. (1981), "'L'ordre psychosomatique" par Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 45(2), pp. 417-427.
- Roudinesco, E. (1982), *Histoire de la psychanalyse en France 1: 1885-1939*, 2nd edition 1994, Paris: Fayard.
- Roudinesco, E. (1986), *Histoire de la psychanalyse en France 2: 1925-1985*, 2nd edition 1994 Paris: Fayard.
- Roudinesco, E. (1993), *Jacques Lacan. Esquisse d'une vie, histoire d'un système de pensée*, Paris: Fayard.
- Roussillon, R. (1991), '“Épreuve d'actualité“ et “épreuve de réalité“ dans le face à face “psychanalytique“', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 55(2), p. 581-596.
- Roussillon, R. (1998), 'Le psychique et le représentable (une réflexion d'ensemble à partir de textes prépubliés)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1811-1820.
- Roussillon, R. (1999), *Agonie, clivage et symbolisation*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Roussillon, R. (2005), 'Affect inconscient, affect-passion et affect-signal', in: Bouhsira, J. and Parat, H. eds., *L'affect*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 117-135.
- Roussillon, R. (2006), 'Neutralisation énergétique et affects extrêmes', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 9, pp. 55-65.
- Roussillon, R. (2008a), *Le je et l'entre-je(u)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Roussillon, R. (2008b), 'Le “langage“ du cadre et le transfert sur le cadre, in: Denis, P., ed., *Avancées de la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 105-117.
- Roux, M-L. (1985), 'La représentation, essai psychanalytique de Nicos Nicolaïdis', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 49(6), pp. 1594-1597.
- Rudhardt, J. (1977), 'La fonction du mythe dans la pensée religieuse de la Grèce', in: Gentili, B. and Paione, G., *Il mito Greco*, Atti de Convegno Internazionale, Rome: Edizioni dell'Ateneo & Bizzarri, pp. 307-320.
- Rueff-Escoubès, C. (1995), 'Allons-nous vers une société “normalement opératoire”?', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 8, pp. 193-207.
- Rueff-Escoubès, C. (2001), "'Dire non'", *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 173-180.
- Rueff-Escoubès, C. (2003), "'On nous demande de ne pas penser": fatigues et conditions de travail, le point de vue sociopsychanalytique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp. 157-169.
- Rueff-Escoubès, C. (2004), 'Fatigues et valeurs sociales', in: *Vivre fatigué*, numéro spécial de la *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, pp. 37-39.
- Rueff-Escoubès, C. (2009), 'Avant-propos', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 36, pp. 5-8.
- Ruelle, D. (1991), *Hasard et chaos*, Paris: Odile Jacob.
- Ruth, R. and Kahn, I. (2011), 'The other French psychoanalysis (Book Review)' [=Review of *Reading French Psychoanalysis*, ed. by Dana Birksted-Breen, Sara Flanders and Alain

- Gibeault] , *Division. A Quarterly Psychoanalytic Forum* 1(1), available at: <http://www.apadivisions.org/division-39/publications/reviews/french-psychoanalysis.aspx>, accessed 23rd April 2011.
- Saada, D. (1972), *S. Nacht*, Paris: Payot.
- Safouan, M. (2001), *Lacania. Les séminaires de Jacques Lacan*, volume 1: 1953-1963, Paris: Fayard.
- Sahlins, M. (1982), 'Individual experience and cultural order', in: Sahlins, M. (2000), *Culture in practice. Selected essays*, New York: Zone Books, pp. 277-291.
- Sahlins, M. (1985), *Islands of history*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Samely, A. (2007), *Forms of Rabbinic literature and thought: An introduction*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- San Michele aveva un gallo* (1972), directed by Taviani, P. and Taviani, V., Italy: Ager Film, Rai.
- Sanchez-Cardenas, M. (2002), 'Un Déjà Vu proustien revisité', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 41, pp. 55-71.
- Sandler, A. (1975), 'Comments on the significance of Piaget's work for psychoanalysis', *International Review of Psychoanalysis* 2(4), pp. 365-37.
- Sandler, J. (1960), 'The background of safety', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 41, pp. 352-356.
- Sandler, J. (1967[1965]), 'Réponse du Dr. J. Sandler', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 31(1), pp. 27-28.
- Sandler, J. (1980), 'The negative therapeutical reaction: An introduction', *Bulletin of the European Psychoanalytic Federation* 15, pp. 13-18.
- Sandler, J. (1985), 'Towards a reconsideration of the psychoanalytic theory of motivation', *Bulletin of the Anna Freud Centre* 8(4), pp. 223-244.
- Sandler, J. and Freud, A. (1981), 'Discussions in the Hampstead index on 'The ego and the mechanisms of defence': V. The mechanisms of defence, part 2', *Bulletin of the Anna Freud Centre* 4(4), pp. 231-277.
- Sandler, J., Dare, C. and Holder, A. (1992/1973), *The patient and the analyst. The basis of the psychoanalytic process*, London: Karnac Books.
- Sandler, P.C. (2005), *The language of Bion. A dictionary of concepts*, London: Karnac Books.
- Sanjania, Z. (2010), 'The significance of the oculus in architecture', available at: <https://zeynasanjania.files.wordpress.com/2011/12/final-oculus-essay.pdf>, accessed 28th April 2016.
- Sansom, G.B. (1952), *Japan. A short cultural history*, 2nd revised edition, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Santiago-Delefosse, M. (2002), 'Notes de lecture: "Isabelle Billiard, Santé mentale et travail. L'émergence de la psychopathologie du travail, La Dispute, 2001, 283p."' *Travailler* 7, pp. 205-207.
- Scarfone, D. (2013), 'A brief introduction to the work of Jean Laplanche', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 94(3), pp. 545-566.

- Scarfone, D. (1997), *Jean Laplanche (Psychanalysten d'aujourd'hui 8)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Scarfone, D. (2014), 'L'impassé, actualité de l'inconscient', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 78(5), pp. 1357-1428.
- Schäfer, L. and Schnelle T. (1983), 'Die Aktualität Ludwik Flecks in Wissenschaftssoziologie und Erkenntnistheorie', in: Fleck, L., *Erfahrung und Tatsache. Gesammelte Aufsätze*, eds. Schäfer, L. and Schnelle, T. (1983), Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, pp. 9-34.
- Schaffner, A. K. (2016), *Exhaustion: A history*, New York: Columbia University Press.
- Scheidt, C.E. (2006), 'Alexithymie und Narzissmus in der Entstehung psychosomatischer Krankheiten', in: Kernberg, O.F and Hartmann, H.-P. (2006), *Narzissmus. Grundlagen – Störungsbilder – Therapie*, Stuttgart: Schattauer, pp. 556-569.
- Schneider, P. (1973), 'Zum Verhältnis von Psychoanalyse und psychosomatischer Medizin', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen*, 27(1), pp. 21-49.
- Schneider, W. H. (2002), *Quality and quantity: The quest for biological regeneration in Twentieth-Century France*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Scholem, G. (1957), *Die jüdische Mystik in ihren Hauptströmungen*, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp.
- Sears, R. (2017), *The beautiful poetry of Donald Trump. Strictly unauthorised*, Edinburgh: Canongate.
- Sechaud, E. (2008), 'The handling of the transference in French psychoanalysis', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 89(5), pp. 1011-1028.
- Serrat, C. and Rédaction de France Info (2014), 'Le sport peut devenir une addiction dangereuse', broadcast on *Radio France Info*, 19 mai 2014, 14:15.
- Shaviro, S. (2007), 'The Pinocchio theory. More on 'negation, affirmation, and desire'', available from: <http://www.shaviro.com/Blog/?p=576>, accessed 13th May 2015.
- Shay, J. (1994), *Achilles in Vietnam. Combat trauma and the undoing of character*, New York: Scribner.
- Shay, J. (2002), *Odysseus in America. Combat trauma and the trials of homecoming*, New York: Scribner.
- Sherman, N. (2005), *Stoic warriors. The ancient philosophy behind the military mind*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Short, H.L. (1968), 'Presbyterians under a new name', in: Bolam, C.G., Goring, J., Short, H.L. and Thomas, R., *The English Presbyterians. From Elizabethan Puritanism to modern Unitarianism*, London: George Allen & Unwin, pp. 219-286.
- Shorter, E. (1975), *The making of the modern family*, Glasgow: William Collins Sons & Co.
- Shorter, E. (1992), *From paralysis to fatigue. A history of psychosomatic illness in the modern era*, New York: The Free Press.
- Sievers, B. (1995), 'Characters in search of a theatre', *Free Associations* 5(2), pp. 196-220.
- Siksou, M. (2012), 'Corps, médiations et thérapies', *Le Journal des Psychologues* 298, p. 14.
- Simpson, H.R. (1992), *Tiger in the barbed wire. An American in Vietnam 1952-1991*, McLean, Virginia: Brassey's.

- Simpson, R. (2018), 'On being consoled: Engaging with Michel Fain's paper 'Mentalization and passivity', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 99(2), pp. 487-494.
- Sirjacq, M. (2017), 'La psychosomatique de l'enfant', in: Nayrou, F. and Szvec, G. eds., *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 133-154.
- Sirois, F. (1992), 'L'analyste mâle et le transfert maternel', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 20, pp. 55-73.
- Sitbon, A. (2002), "'Les galériens volontaires" de Gérard Szvec', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 66 (1), pp. 283-289.
- Sivadon, P. (1952), 'Psychopathologie du travail', *Évolution Psychiatrique* 1952 (3), pp. 441-474.
- Sivadon, P. (1977), 'La reéducation des fonctions mentales', in: Sivadon, P. and Gantheret, F. (1977), *La rééducation corporelle des fonctions mentales*, Paris: Les Éditions ESF, pp. 25-46.
- Sivadon, P. and Amiel, R. (1969), *Psychopathologie du travail*, Paris: Les éditions sociales françaises.
- Sivadon, P. and Duron, J. (1979), *La santé mentale. La recherche de l'équilibre personnel et social dans la vie quotidienne*, Toulouse: Editeur Privat.
- Sivadon, P. and Fernandez-Zoila, A. (1983), *Temps de travail, temps de vivre*, Brussels: Pierre Mardaga éditeur.
- Slonim, M. (1962), *From Chekhov to the revolution. Russian literature 1900-1917*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Smadja, C. (1985), 'Les attitudes psychiques d'un thérapeute face à une famille de migrants', *Textes du Centre Alfred Binet* 7, pp. 93-104.
- Smadja, C. (1990), 'La notion de mentalisation et l'opposition névroses actuelles/névroses de défense', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(3), pp. 787-796.
- Smadja, C. (1991), 'Le concept de pulsion: essai d'étude comparative chez Freud et P. Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 1, pp. 149-168.
- Smadja, C. (1993a), 'A propos des procédés autocalmants du Moi', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 9-26, reprinted in: Smadja 2001a, pp. 219-240.
- Smadja, C. (1994a), 'Préliminaires techniques à l'analysabilité de patients atteints d'affections somatiques', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 58(4), pp. 1059-1076.
- Smadja, C. (1994b), 'Pierre Marty, une brève histoire de son oeuvre', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 29-37.
- Smadja, C. (1995a), 'Les autocalmants ou le destin inachevé du sadomasochisme', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 8, pp. 57-68, reprinted in: Smadja 2001a, pp. 241-254.
- Smadja, C. (1995b), 'Le modèle psychosomatique de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 7, pp. 7-25.
- Smadja, C. (1995c), 'A propos des procédés autocalmants du moi', in: Nicolaïdis, N. and Press, J. eds., *La psychosomatique hier et aujourd'hui*, Lausanne: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 231-258 [a reprint of Smadja 1993a].

- Smadja, C. (1996a), 'Destins de la sensorialité et des affects dans la reconstruction du temps vécu', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 60(4), pp. 1073-1081, reprinted in: Smadja 2001a, pp. 255-266.
- Smadja, C. (1996b), 'Le processus de dédifférenciation du Moi: hypothèse à propos du fonctionnement des états opératoires', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 39-46.
- Smadja, C. (1997a), 'Angoisse et psychosomatique', in: Amar, N., Le Guen, A. and Oppenheimer, A., *Angoisses: pluralité d'approches*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 91-104.
- Smadja, C. (1997b), 'Impensable douleur', in: Cournut, J., Israël, P., Jeanneau, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Le mal-être (angoisse et violence). Débats de psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 181-187.
- Smadja, C. (1998a), 'Le fonctionnement opératoire dans la pratique psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1367-1440.
- Smadja, C. (1998b), 'Après coup', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1441-1450.
- Smadja, C. (1998c), 'Logique freudienne, logique martyenne', in: Fine, A. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Interrogations psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 55-69.
- Smadja, C. (1999a), 'L'énigme de la douleur dans la dépression essentielle', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 15, pp. 25-37.
- Smadja, C. (1999b), 'Les galériens volontaires de Gérard Szwec', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 16, pp. 211-218.
- Smadja, C. (2000a), 'Le déni de l'inachèvement pulsionnel: quelques remarques au sujet de l'observation de Jean-Paul Obadia', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 17, pp. 85-90.
- Smadja, C. (2000b), 'Discussion des observations de Jean-Paul Obadia', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 18, pp. 79-86.
- Smadja, C. (2001a), *La vie opératoire. Études psychanalytiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Smadja, C. (2001b), 'Clinique d'un état de démentalisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 11-27.
- Smadja, C. (2001c), 'L'évolution de la pratique psychanalytique avec les patients somatiques', in: de Mijolla, A., ed., *Evolution de la clinique psychanalytique*, Bordeaux: L'Esprit du Temps, pp. 167-182.
- Smadja, C. (2002a), 'La perte de l'espoir', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 5, pp. 29-40.
- Smadja, C. (2002b), 'Cadre actuel, cadre névrotique', in: Botella, C., ed., *Penser les limites. Écrits en l'honneur d'André Green*, Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé, pp. 362-365.
- Smadja, C. (2002c), 'Une histoire critique du symbolisme organique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 21, pp. 7-25.
- Smadja, C. (2003a), 'La fatigue: symptôme et signe de la négativité psychique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp. 33-36.
- Smadja, C. (2003b), 'Quelques remarques préliminaires à l'étude psychosomatique des maladies auto-immunes', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 23, pp. 11-24.

- Smadja, C. (2004a), 'La dépression inachevée', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 68(4), pp. 1239-1252.
- Smadja, C. (2004b), 'Introduction à une clinique du silence', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 7, pp. 23-34.
- Smadja, C. (2004c), 'La fatigue: symptôme de l'économie psychosomatique', in: *Vivre fatigué*, numéro spécial de la *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, pp. 15-22.
- Smadja, C. (2005a), 'Transformations contemporaines de la méthode et du cadre analytiques', in: Richard F. and Urribarri, F. eds., *Autour de l'oeuvre d'André Green*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 67-77.
- Smadja, C. (2005b), 'La place de l'affect dans l'économie psychosomatique', Bouhsira, J. and Parat, H. eds., *L'affect. Monographies de psychanalyse de la revue Française de Psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 163-179.
- Smadja, C. (2006a), 'Les deux vies de l'opérateur', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 9, pp. 67-79.
- Smadja, C. (2006b), 'La solution somatique', in: Green, A., ed., *Les voies nouvelles de la thérapie psychanalytique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 629-650.
- Smadja, C. (2006c), 'Le travail du psychanalyste avec les malades somatiques', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes, qui êtes-vous?*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 115-119.
- Smadja, C. (2007a), 'L'impératif de retour au calme', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 32, pp. 71-79.
- Smadja, C. (2007b), 'La maladie avant la maladie', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 31, pp. 29-40.
- Smadja, C. (2008a), *Les modèles psychanalytiques de la psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Smadja, C. (2008b), 'Construction et déconstruction de l'image du père', in: Cupa, D., ed., *Image du père dans la culture contemporaine. Hommages à André Green*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 356-359.
- Smadja, C. (2008c), 'La dépression essentielle, trace négative de la mémoire psychosomatique', in: Chouvier B. and Roussillon, R. eds., *Corps, acte et symbolisation. Psychanalyse aux frontières*, Louvain-la-Neuve: De Boeck, pp. 73-78.
- Smadja, C. (2009), 'La maladie somatique, une dimension de la santé psychique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 36, pp. 9-26.
- Smadja, C. (2010a), 'Introduction au concept d'économie psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 9-15.
- Smadja, C. (2010b), 'The place of affect in the psychosomatic economy', Aisenstein, M. and Rappoport de Aisemberg, E. eds., *Psychosomatics today. A psychoanalytic perspective*, London: Karnac, pp. 145-161.
- Smadja, C. (2011a), 'Des avatars de la séduction aux figures de l'opérateur', in: Baruch, C., ed., *Nouveaux développements en psychanalyse. Autour de la pensée de Michel de M'Uzan*, Sèvres: Éditions EDK, pp. 77-82.
- Smadja, C. (2011b), 'Psychoanalytic psychosomatics', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 92, pp. 221-230.

- Smadja, C. (2011c), 'Le travail de psychisation du corps', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 39, pp. 147-161.
- Smadja, C. (2011d), 'Discussion', *Le Carnet PSY* 151, pp. 51-53.
- Smadja, C. (2012a), 'Winnicott face aux psychosomaticiens de l'école de Paris', in: Braconnier, A. and Golse, B. eds., *Winnicott et la création humaine*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 233-239.
- Smadja, C. (2012b), 'Ferenczi, un précurseur de la psychosomatique contemporaine', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 42, pp. 23-34.
- Smadja, C. (2012c), 'L'usage de l'expression dramatique dans l'interprétation', in: Chervet, B., ed., *L'interprétation*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 43-51.
- Smadja, C. (2012d), 'Introduction à une clinique du silence', in: Cabrol G., Durieux, M. and Parat, H., *La dépression: Éclipse d'Éros ou triomphe de Thanatos?* Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 169-183.
- Smadja, C. (2012e), 'Préface', in: Donabédian, D., *L'adolescent et son corps*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 1-6.
- Smadja, C. (2012f), 'Introduction à la psychosomatique', in: Kapsambelis, V., ed., (2012), *Manuel de psychiatrie clinique et psychopathologique de l'adulte*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 197-212.
- Smadja, C. (2013a), 'Deuil, mélancolie et somatisation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 44, pp. 7-24.
- Smadja, C. (2013b), 'Un préconscient saturé', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 43, pp. 165-171.
- Smadja, C. (2014a), 'Le psychanalyste face à la menace de l'actuel', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 78(5), pp. 1503-1506.
- Smadja, C. (2014b), 'Le modèle pulsionnel de la psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 45, pp. 11-30.
- Smadja, C. (2015c), 'Introduction à la notion de régression intra-narcissique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 47, pp. 141-149.
- Smadja, C. (2015d), 'Au revoir Diane', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 47, pp. 11-12.
- Smadja, C. (2015e), 'De la mort et des pulsions', in: Chervet, B., ed., *Le meurtre fondateur. L'acte psychique par excellence*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 67-74.
- Smadja, C. (2016a), 'Principe de plaisir et mentalisation', in: Angelergues, J. and Cointot, F. eds., *Le principe de plaisir*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 83-94.
- Smadja, C. (2016b), 'Le surmoi-corps', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 80(5), pp. 1521-1525.
- Smadja, C. (2016c), 'Une découverte de la psychanalyse: la psychosomatique', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 49, pp. 11-17.
- Smadja, C. (2017), 'Le travail de somatisation', in: Nayrou, F. and Szvec, G. eds., *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 47-68.
- Smadja, C. (2018), 'Corps malade et surmoi', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 53, pp. 167-179.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (1993), 'A propos du questionnaire "médecine et psychosomatique"', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 211-214.

- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (1993), 'Argument', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 5-6.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (1994), 'Argument', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 5-6.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2001a), 'Présentation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 5-6.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2001b), 'Argument', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 19, pp. 7-9.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2001c), 'Présentation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 20, pp. 5-6.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2003), 'Michel Hauteouverture. Interview', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 23, pp. 163-176.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2005), 'Présentation', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 27, pp. 5-6.
- Smadja, C. and Szvec, G. (2015), 'Hommage à Catherine Parat', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 48, pp. 5-6.
- Smith, H.F. (2002), 'Creating the psychoanalytical process incorporating three panel reports', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 83(1), pp. 211-227.
- Snell, R. (2013), *Uncertainties, mysteries, doubts: Romanticism and the analytic attitude*, London: Routledge.
- Société Psychanalytique de Paris, 'Histoire de la SPP', available at: http://www.spp.asso.fr/wp/?page_id=38, accessed 1st January 2017.
- Sparer, E.A. (2010), 'The French model at work: Indication and the Jean Favreau Centre for Consultation and Treatment', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91(5), pp. 1179-1199.
- Sparby, T. (2014), *Hegel's conception of the determinate negation*, Leiden: Brill
- Speth-Lepetitcolin, O. (2010), 'Les modèles psychanalytiques de la psychosomatique de Claude Smadja', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 13, pp. 177-183.
- Stein, C. (1971), *L'enfant imaginaire*, 2nd edition 1987, Paris: Denoël.
- Steinberg, T.I. (2002), 'Leid ohne Gegenwehr. Einige Erklärungsansätze', available under: <http://www.steinbergrecherche.com/asleid.htm>, accessed 22nd February 2013.
- Steiner, J. (1993), ' "Un bouclier dans l'économie des états limites l'espoir" ', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 74, pp. 846-849.
- Stephan, J.J. (2002,) *Hawaii under the Rising Sun. Japan's plans for conquest after Pearl Harbor*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
- Stephanos, S. and Auhagen, U. (1979), 'Objektpsychologisches Modell auf der Basis der französischen psychoanalytisch-psychosomatischen Konzepte', in: Hahn, P., ed., *Psychosomatik (= Die Psychologie des 20. Jahrhunderts, volume 9: Ergebnisse für die Medizin 1)*, Zürich: Kindler Verlag, pp. 162-181.
- Stephenson, N. (2002/1999), *Cryptonomicon*, New York: Avon Books.
- Stern, D.B. (2010), *Partners in thought. Working with unformulated experience, dissociation, and enactment*, London: Routledge.

- Stern, D.B. (2013), 'Field theory in psychoanalysis, part 2: Bionian Field Theory and contemporary Interpersonal/Relational Psychoanalysis', *Psychoanalytic Dialogues* 23(6), pp. 630-645.
- Stern, D.B. (2015a), *Relational freedom: Emergent properties of the interpersonal field*, London: Routledge.
- Stern, D.B. (2015b), 'Unrepresented states and the construction of meaning: Clinical and theoretical Contributions by Howard B. Levine, (2015)', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 96(2), pp. 493-498.
- Stern, D.B. (2018), 'Decentering relational psychotherapy', in: Aron, L., Grand, S. and Slochower, J.A. eds., *Decentering Relational Theory: A comparative critique*. Abingdon-Thames: Routledge, pp. 41-62.
- Stone, L. (1954), 'The widening scope of indications for psychoanalysis', *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 2, pp. 567-594.
- Stone, M. (2004), 'Browning, Elizabeth Barrett (1806-1861)', Matthew, H.C.G and Harrison, B. eds., *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, Online Edition 2008, accessed 5th May 2018.
- Stora, J.B. (1991/2005), *Le stress*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Stora, J.B. (1999), *Quand le corps prend la relève. Stress, traumatismes et maladies somatiques*, Paris: Odile Jacob.
- Stora, J.B. (2004), 'The French group of psychoanalysis, medicine, and psychosomatics: Nouveaux horizons psychosomatiques', *Neuropsychanalyse* 6, pp.123-124.
- Stora, J.B. (2005), *Vivre avec une greffe. Accueillir l'autre*, Paris: Odile Jacob.
- Stora, J.B. (2006), *La neuro-psychanalyse*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Stora, J. (2010), 'Troubles psychosomatiques, des maladies imaginaires?' *Les Grands Dossiers des Sciences Humaines* 20, p. 31.
- Stora, J.B. (2011), *Neuropsychanalyse. Controverses et dialogues*, Paris: MJW Édition.
- Stora, J.B. (2013), *La nouvelle approche psychosomatique: 9 cas cliniques*, Paris: MJW Édition.
- Stora, J. B. (2018), 'Psychosomatique intégrative', at <http://www.psychosomatique-integrative.net/>, accessed 20th May 2018.
- Stroczan, K. (2002), 'Zoran Music: zwischen Abstraktion und Konkretismus', *Psyche. Zeitschrift für Psychoanalyse und ihre Anwendungen* 56, pp. 505-525.
- Summerfield, D. (2001), 'The invention of post-traumatic stress disorder and the social usefulness of a psychiatric category', *British Medical Journal* 322(7278), pp. 95-98, available at: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1119389/>, accessed 21st April 2014.
- Surprenant, C. (2013), 'Review of Freud et la France 1885-1945, by Alain de Mijolla', *Psychoanalysis and History* 15(1), pp. 111-116.
- Suzuki, D.T. (1949), *Essays in Zen Buddhism. First series*, New York: Grove Press.
- Suzuki, D.T. (1959), *Zen and Japanese culture*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- Szajnberg, N. (2010), 'On: The possibly narcissistic difficulties among scientific cultures: A response to Marty's 1952 key paper', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 91(6), pp. 1523-1524.
- Szwec, G. (1989a), 'Figure de l'étranger, langage et régression formelle', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(6), pp. 1977-1987.
- Szwec, G. (1989b), 'Les mots dans l'image', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 53(6), pp. 1989-1992.
- Szwec, G. (1991), 'De la crise d'asthme à la crise de fou rire', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 1, pp. 115-136.
- Szwec, G. (1992), 'Psychothérapie d'une enfant chauve au seuil de l'adolescence. Réflexions sur les relations entre la pelade et le traumatisme', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 2, pp. 43-67.
- Szwec, G. (1993a), *La psychosomatique de l'enfant asthmatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Szwec, G. (1993b), 'Faudra mieux surveiller les petits!', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 57(2), pp. 591-603.
- Szwec, G. (1993c), 'Les procédés autocalmants par la recherche répétitive de l'excitation. Les galériens volontaires', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 4, pp. 27-51.
- Szwec, G. (1994a), 'Adultes naufragés – nourissons en perdition. (Réflexions sur l'utilisation autocalmante du danger et de l'effroi)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 58(3), pp. 743-761.
- Szwec, G. (1994b), 'L'enfant dans l'adulte dans la théorie de Pierre Marty', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 63-70.
- Szwec, G. (1995a), 'Relation mère-enfant machinale et procédés autocalmants', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 8, pp. 69-89.
- Szwec, G. (1995b), 'Le retour de l'expérience traumatique', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 59(5), pp. 1629-1633.
- Szwec, G. (1996a), 'L'enfant et son corps, vingt ans après la publication du livre', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 7-13.
- Szwec, G. (1996b), 'Pathologie fonctionnelle néonatale, mosaïque première et comportement défensif prématuré', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 9, pp. 69-77.
- Szwec, G. (1996c), 'Subversion érotique et subversion autocalmante: une double potentialité pour les fonctions somatiques', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 10, pp. 47-58.
- Szwec, G. (1996d), 'La psychanalyse ne rend pas éternel (à propos de l'article de Natalie Zaltzman)', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 60(4), pp. 1137-1142.
- Szwec, G. (1997a), 'Devenir d'une dépression de la première enfance génératrice de somatisations et conséquences psychosomatiques de la maltraitance', in: Le Goues, G and Pragier, G. eds., *Cliniques psychosomatiques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 67-90.
- Szwec, G. (1997b), 'La vie onirique chez l'enfant', in: Decobert, S. and Sacco, F. eds., *L'enfant, le rêve et le psychanalyste*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 39-60.
- Szwec, G. (1998a), *Les galériens volontaires*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

- Szwec, G. (1998b), 'La vie, mode d'emploi', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 62(5), pp. 1505-1517.
- Szwec, G. (1999a), 'Présentation d'un cas clinique: conduites dangereuses à la suite d'une désorganisation somatique grave', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 2, pp. 21-41.
- Szwec, G. (1999b), 'La fonction maternelle du thérapeute, la mère morte, l'amante', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 16, pp. 7-18.
- Szwec, G. (2000a), 'A propos d'une situation extrême de la pratique psychanalytique', in: Cournot, J. and Schaeffer, J. eds., *Pratiques de la psychanalyse*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 87-94.
- Szwec, G. (2000b), 'A propos de l'observation d'une somatisation grave à la fin d'une psychanalyse', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 17, pp. 25-35.
- Szwec, G. (2000c), 'Sa Majesté, le bébé, et le bébé en non-majesté', in: Joly, F. ed., *Sa majesté, le bébé*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 119-135.
- Szwec, G. (2001), 'La désorganisation de l'état dépressif chez le bébé, à l'origine de la dépression essentielle', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 20, pp. 7-27 .
- Szwec, G. (2002a), 'L'enfant – organe hypocondriaque de sa mère', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 22, pp. 65-83.
- Szwec, G. (2002b), 'La mère "surintriquante" ', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 66(5), pp. 1789-1797.
- Szwec, G. (2003a), 'Argument', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 23, pp. 5-8.
- Szwec, G. (2003b), 'La fatigue qui ne joue plus son rôle de signal', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 24, pp. 37-43.
- Szwec, G. (2003c), 'À propos d'un petit insatiable', in: Blin, D., Soulé, M. and Thoueille, É., *L'allaitement maternel: une dynamique à bien comprendre*, Toulouse: Érès.
- Szwec, G. (2004), 'L'épuisement activement recherché', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique*, Hors-série, pp. 81-89.
- Szwec, G. (2005a), 'Plutôt fou que malade ?', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 27, pp. 7-16.
- Szwec, G. (2005b), 'Avant-propos', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 28, pp. 5-11.
- Szwec, G. (2006a), 'Les maladies de peau dans quelques modèles psychosomatiques', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 29, pp. 31-49.
- Szwec, G. (2006b), 'Une pratique psychanalytique avec de très jeunes enfants à risque somatique', in: Perron, R. ed., *Psychanalystes, qui êtes-vous?*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 153-160.
- Szwec, G. (2008a), 'Discussion d'un cas de céphalalgie', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 34, pp. 79-85.
- Szwec, G. (2008b), 'Le psychodrame avec des patients somatisants', *Le Carnet PSY* 127, pp. 24-29.
- Szwec G. (2008c), 'Je vais en parler à ton père', in: Cupa, D., ed., *Image du père dans la culture contemporaine. Hommages à André Green*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 141-144.
- Szwec, G. (2008d), 'La construction dans l'analyse avec des enfants , un passage à l'acte de l'analyste?', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 72(5), pp. 1661-1665.

- Szwec, G. (2009a), 'Capacité à dire "non" et désorganisations psychosomatiques', *Actualités Psychosomatiques* 12, pp. 3-19.
- Szwec, G. (2009b), 'Hommage à Léon Kreisler', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 35, pp. 7-8.
- Szwec, G. (2010a), '“L'enfant dormira bien vite.....”', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 37, pp. 81-95.
- Szwec, G. (2010b), 'Le symptôme psychosomatique est bête', in: Bayle, G., ed., *L'inconscient freudien. Recherche, écoute, métapsychologie*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 215-220.
- Szwec, G. (2010c), 'Defaillance de la psychisation du corps chez le bébé non-câlin', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 74(5), pp. 1687-1691.
- Szwec, G. (2012a), 'Grandir avec une rectocolite (commentaire de l'article de Claire Rojas)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 41, pp. 37-42.
- Szwec, G. (2012b), 'Une conduite anorexique après de graves somatisations chez un adolescent (commentaire de l'article d'Irène Nigolian)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 41, pp. 65-70.
- Szwec, G. (2012c), 'À propos d'une psychothérapie mère-bébé (commentaire de l'article de Pascale Blayau)', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 41, pp. 101-106.
- Szwec, G. (2013a), 'Sex machine. Néo- besoins et pseudo-pulsions', in: André J., Chabert C. and Coblence F. eds., *Le corps de Psyché*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 67-84.
- Szwec, G. (2013b), 'Preface', in: Szwec, G. (1998a), *Les galériens volontaires*, new edition, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. i-xx.
- Szwec, G. (2013c), 'Préface à la réédition d'*Éros et Antéros*', in: Braunschweig, D. and Fain, M. (1971), *Éros et Antéros*, new edition, Paris: Éditions in Press, pp. 5-21.
- Szwec, G. (2015a), 'Les travaux forcés de la répétition autocalmante', in: André, J. and Chabert, C. eds., *Les travaux forcés de la répétition: obsessions, addictions, compulsions*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 95-112.
- Szwec, G. (2015b), 'Hommage à Diane L'Heureux-Le Beuf', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 47, pp. 9-10.
- Szwec, G. (2016a), 'Enfoncer un trou plutôt que de le contempler...!', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 80(3), pp. 684-699.
- Szwec, G. (2016b), 'Perception et transfert dans la pensée de Pierre Marty. Réflexions sur le texte de Sara Botella', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 49, pp. 45-58.
- Szwec, G. (2016c), 'Les procédés autocalmants', in: Danon-Boileau, L. and Tamet, J-Y. eds., *Des psychanalystes en séance. Glossaire clinique de psychanalyse contemporaine*, Paris: Gallimard, pp. 413-419.
- Szwec, G. (2017a), 'Introduction', in: Nayrou, F. and Szwec, G. eds., *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 1-6.
- Szwec, G. (2017b), 'La psychosomatique, quelques débats après...!', in: Nayrou, F. and Szwec, G., eds., *La psychosomatique*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 7-45.
- Szwec, G. (2017c), 'Les identifications à l'œuvre dans l'interprétation', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 81(5), pp. 1445-1454.

- Tal, K. (1999), *Worlds of hurt. Reading the literatures of trauma*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Talfanidis, K. and Maniadakis, G. (2014), 'Studying the archives of the Hellenic Society of Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy: An outline of its historical course', *International Forum of Psychoanalysis* 23(2), pp. 127-132.
- Tassis, T. (2008), *Cornelius Castoriadis. Eine Disposition der Philosophie*, Saarbrücken: VDM.
- Taylor, J. G. (1990), 'La pensée opératoire et le concept d'alexithymie', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 54(3), pp.769-784.
- Taylor, J.G. (1995), 'Psychoanalysis and empirical research: The example of patients who lack psychological mindedness', *Journal of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis* 23, pp.263-281.
- Tello, N. (2003), *Cornelius Castoriadis y el imaginario radical*, Madrid: Campo de Ideas.
- Tessier, H. (2003), 'Le Corps, d'abord', *Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis* 11(1), pp. 217-222.
- Teusch, R. (2015), 'Panel Report, IPA Congress Boston 2015: Locating unrepresented thought: The relationship between trauma, disrupted object representations and evolving concepts of the unconscious', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 96(6), pp. 1667–1669.
- Thanopoulos, S. (1997), 'Il vuoto di rappresentazione e la destrutturazione del pensiero', *Rivista di Psicoanalisi* 43(3), pp. 385-411.
- Thomä, H. and Kächele H. (2006), *Psychoanalytische Theorie: Praxis*, Heidelberg: Springer Medizin Verlag.
- Tisseron, S. (2007), *La résilience*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Tolkien, J.R.R. (1954), *The Lord of the Rings*, paperback edition 1968, London: Unwin.
- Torrente, J. (2004), *Le psychiatre et le travailleur. Cheminement de la psychopathologie du travail d'hier à demain*, Paris: Doin éditeurs.
- Tosquelles, F. (1967/1972), *Le travail thérapeutique à l'hôpital psychiatrique*, new edition, Toulouse: Érès.
- Tosquelles, F. (1972), 'Introduction', *Le travail thérapeutique à l'hôpital psychiatrique*, new edition, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 7-15.
- Tosquelles, F. (2003), chapter 2: 'Du group aux sources de la personne', *De la personne au groupe. À propos des équipes soignantes*, Toulouse: Érès, pp. 91-147.
- Trahern, J.B. (1991), 'Fatalism and the millenium', in: Godden, M. and Lapidge, M. eds, *The Cambridge companion to Old English Literature*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 160-171.
- Traherne, T. (1991), *Selected poems and prose*, London: Penguin Books.
- Trillat, É. (2012), 'Une histoire de la psychiatrie au Xxe siècle', Postel, J. and Quéétel, C. eds., *Nouvelle histoire de la psychiatrie*, 2nd edition, Paris: Dunod, pp. 339-367.
- Troisier, H. (1998), *Piera Aulagnier (Psychanalystes d'aujourd'hui 17)*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Tummala-Narra, P. (2015), 'Cultural competence as a core emphasis of psychoanalytic psychotherapy', *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 32(2), pp. 275-292.

- Turkle, S. (1978/1992), *Psychoanalytic politics. Jacques Lacan and Freud's French Revolution*, New York: The Guilford Press.
- Turner, J.F. (2002), 'A brief history of illusion: Milner, Winnicott and Rycroft', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 83(5), pp. 1063-1082.
- Tweedie, D. (2011), 'A critical assessment of orthodox economic conceptions of work', in: Deranty, J.-P. and Smith, N. eds., *New philosophies of labour. Work and the social bond*, Leiden: Brill, pp. 327-346.
- Tynan, K. (1967), *Tynan Right & Left*, London: Longmans, Green and Co Ltd.
- Ulnik, J.R. (2000), 'Revisión crítica de la teoría psicosomática de Pierre Marty', *Aperturas Psiconalíticas. Revista internacional de psicoanálisis* 5, available at: <http://www.aperturas.org/articulos.php?id=121&a=Revision-critica-de-la-teoria-psicosomatica-de-Pierre-Marty>, accessed 9th April 2013.
- Urribarri, F. (1999), 'The psyche. Imagination and history. A general view of Cornelius Castoriadis's psychoanalytic ideas', *Free Associations* 7, pp. 374-396.
- Urribarri, F. (2008), 'Après Lacan: père, pacte fraternel et filiation analytique chez André Green', in: Cupa, D. (2008), *Image du père dans la culture contemporaine. Hommages à André Green*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 53-63.
- Urribarri, F. (2013), *Dialoguer avec André Green. La psychanalyse contemporaine, chemin faisant*, Paris: Les Éditions d'Ithaque.
- Vaillé, H. (2003), 'La psychopathologie du travail', *Sciences humaines* 144, pp. 29-29.
- Valdre, R. (2014), *On sublimation. A path to the destiny of desire, theory and treatment*, London: Karnac Books.
- Van Belleghem, L., de Gasparo, S. and Gaillard, I. (2014), 'The development of the psychosocial dimension of work', in: Falzon, P. ed., *Constructive ergonomics*, New York: Taylor and Francis, pp. 33-47.
- Vande Kemp, H. (2001), 'Helen Flanders Dunbar', *The Feminist Psychologist, Newsletter of the Society for the Psychology of Women*, Division 35 of the American Psychological Association 28(1), available at: <http://www.apadivisions.org/division-35/about/heritage/helen-dunbar-biography.aspx>; accessed 11th January 2017.
- Vaneck, L. (1985), 'Les enfants de la folie. Violence dans les identifications' par Anna Potamianou. Toulouse, Ed. Privat, 1984', *Revue Belge de Psychanalyse* 7, pp.127-130.
- Vargas, J. H. (2017), *Forms of dictatorship: Power, narrative and authoritarianism in the Latina/o novel*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Veil, C. (1957a), 'Phénoménologie du travail', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuillier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 53-85.
- Veil, C. (1957b), 'Aspects médico-psychologiques de l'industrialisation moderne', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuillier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 87-114.
- Veil, C. (1959), 'Les états d'épuisement', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuillier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 175-186.
- Veil, C. (1964), 'Le législateur peut-il prévenir la chronicité?', in: Aboulker, P, Chertok, L and Sapir, M. (1964), *Psychosomatique et chronicité*, Paris: Librairie Maloine, pp. 335-337.

- Veil, C. (1972), 'Fatigue et monotonie', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 235-286.
- Veil, C. (1973), 'Epidémiologie des troubles névrotiques psychosomatiques et comportementaux', in: Sivadon, P. (1973), *Traité de psychologie médicale*. Volume 3: *La pathologie émotionnelle*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, pp. 71-84.
- Veil, C. (1985), 'Où en est la psychopathologie du travail?', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 287-294.
- Veil, C. (1994), 'L'imaginaire au travail', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 295-318.
- Veil, C. (1996), 'Entretien avec Claude Veil', in: Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès, pp. 331-346.
- Veil, C. (2012), *Naissance et actualité de la psychopathologie du travail*, ed. Lhuilier, D., Toulouse: Érès.
- Verdenius, W.J. (1985), *A commentary on Hesiod: Works and days*, vv. 1-382, Leiden: E.J.Brill.
- Verhaeghe, P. and Vanheule, S. (2005), 'Actual neurosis and PTSD: The impact of the other' *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 22(4), pp. 493-507.
- Verhaeghe, P., Vanheule, S. and De Rick, A. (2007), 'Actual neurosis as the underlying psychic structure of panic disorder, somatization, and somatoform disorder: An integration of Freudian and Attachment perspectives', *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 76(4), pp. 1317-1350.
- Verhaeghe, P. and Willemsen, J., (2015), 'Concurreren voor de waarheid: neoliberalisme en wetenschapsfraude', *Tijdschrift over Cultuur & Criminaliteit* 5(1), pp. 22-37.
- Vigorous, F. (1993), *Le secret de famille*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Vlachakis, I. (2004), 'La tradition psychiatrique en Grèce et la transmission de la psychanalyse: La paradigme historique du Centre d'Hygiène Mentale à Athènes', *Topique* 89, pp. 103-109.
- Voltaire, F.M.A. de (1909-14 [1733]) 'Letters on the English'. volume 34, Part 2. The Harvard Classics. New York: P.F. Collier & Son.
- von Bultzingsloewen, I. (2002), 'Les "aliénés" morts de faim dans les hôpitaux psychiatriques français sur l'Occupation', *Vingtième Siècle. Revue d'Histoire* 76, pp. 99-115.
- von Bultzingsloewen, I. (2007), *L'hécatombe des fous. La famine dans les hôpitaux psychiatriques français sous l'Occupation*, Paris: Flammarion.
- von Bultzingsloewen, I. (2008), 'Une étape dans la mise en question du modèle asilaire?. La famine dans les hôpitaux psychiatriques français sous l'occupation', *Les Cahiers du Centre Georges Canguilhem* 2, pp. 47-61.
- von Bultzingsloewen, I. (2009), 'Histoire/Mémoire et transmission. Retour sur une enquête polémique: la famine dans les hôpitaux psychiatriques français sous l'occupation', in: Sassolas, M., ed., *Transmission et soins psychiques*, Toulouse: Érès.
- von Bultzingsloewen, I. (2010), 'Le militantisme en psychiatrie, de la libération à nos jours. Quelle histoire?!' *Sud/Nord* 25, pp. 13-26.
- von Uexküll, Th. (1963), *Grundfragen der psychosomatischen Medizin*, Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt.

- Wachowski, L. and Wachowski, A. (1998), *The Matrix* [film script], available at: http://www.dailyscript.com/scripts/the_matrix.pdf, accessed 26th August 2017.
- Wainrib, S. (2006), 'Subjectivation ou conditionnement?', in: Perron, R., ed., *Psychanalystes qui êtes-vous?*, Paris: Dunod, pp. 13-17.
- Waintrater, R. (2012), 'Intersubjectivity and French psychoanalysis: A misunderstanding?' *Studies in Gender and Sexuality* 13(4), pp.295-302.
- Warnock, M. (1976), *Imagination*, Berkely: University of California Press.
- Weber, F. (2007), 'Présentation', in: Mauss, M. (1923/24), *Essai sur le don. Forme et raison de l'échange dans les sociétés archaïques*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Weinryb, R.M. (1995), 'Alexithymia: Old wine in new bottles?', *Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Thought* 18, pp. 159-195.
- Wellbery, D.E. (2013), 'The imagination of freedom: Goethe and Hegel as contemporaries', in: Richter S. and Block R.A. (2013), *Goethe's ghosts: Reading and the persistence of literature*, Rochester, New York: Boydell and Brewer, pp.217-238.
- Wetherell, M. (2012), 'Personalising affect: Relational histories, subjectivities and the psychosocial', in: Wetherll, M., *Affect and emotion. A new social science understanding*, London: Sage Publications, pp. 120-139.
- Whelan, F. (2010), *Dissent into treason. Unitarians, king-killers and the Society of United Irishman*, Dublin: The O'Brien Press.
- Whitehead, A.N. (1933), *Adventures of ideas*, New York: The Free Press.
- Widlöcher, D. (1984), 'Le psychanalyste devant les problèmes de classification', *Confrontations Psychiatriques* 24, pp. 141-156.
- Widlöcher, D. (2004), 'Psychanalyse et psychiatrie française. 50 ans d'histoire', *Topique* 88, pp. 7-16.
- Widlöcher, D. (2008), 'L'objet: entre lieu et la figure', in: *Annuel 2008 Association Psychanalytique de France 'L'objet, la réalité'*, pp. 45-63.
- Widlöcher, D. (2010), 'What has become of the lines of advance in psychoanalysis? The evolution of practices in France', in Birksted-Breen, D., Gibeault, A. and Flanders, S. eds. (2010), *Reading French psychoanalysis*, London, pp. 73-85.
- Widlöcher, D., ed., (2000), *Sexualité infantile et attachement*, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.
- Wiener, P. (2011), 'La consultation psychosomatique avec Pierre Marty, rue Falguière', *Le Coq-héron* 207, pp. 147-149.
- Wilgowicz, P.(1996) 'Mythologie Grecque et psychanalyse [Greek mythology and psychoanalysis]', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 77, pp.1066-1068.
- Willsher, K., 'Heading for a breakdown', *The Guardian*, March 10, 2007, available under <http://www.guardian.co.uk/money/2007/mar/10/careers.workplacestress>, accessed 22nd February 2013.
- Wilson, E. (1941), *The wound and the bow. Seven studies in literature*, Cambridge, MA.: The Riverside Press.

- Wilson, E., Jr. (2012), "Revue Française de Psychanalyse" [review of volume 62(5) 1998: "Psychosomatics and instinctual drives"], *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 81, pp. 505-526.
- Wimpfheimer, B.S. (2011), *Narrating the law. A poetics of talmudic legal stories*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Winnicott D.W. (1974), 'Fear of breakdown', *International Review of Psychoanalysis* 1, pp. 103-7.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1955 [1954]a), 'Metapsychological and clinical aspects of regression within the psychoanalytical set-up', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 36, pp. 16-26, also available in: Winnicott, D.W (1975/1958), *Through paediatrics to psychoanalysis*, London: The Hogarth Press, pp. 278-294.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1955 [1954]b), 'Withdrawal and regression', in: Winnicott, D.W (1975/1958), *Through paediatrics to psychoanalysis*, London: The Hogarth Press, pp. 255-261.
- Winnicott, D. W. (1955 [1954]c), 'Regression et repli', *Revue Française de Psychanalyse* 19 (1-2), pp. 323-330.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1963), 'Communicating and not communicating leading to a study of certain opposites', in: Winnicott, D.W (1965), *The maturational processes and the facilitating environment*, London: Hogarth, pp. 179-192.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1965 [1960]), 'Ego distortion in terms of true and false self', in: Winnicott, D.W. (1965), *The maturational processes and the facilitating environment*, London: The Hogarth Press, pp. 140-152.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1965 [1962]), 'Ego integration in child development', in: Winnicott, D.W. (1965), *The maturational processes and the facilitating environment*, London: The Hogarth Press, pp. 56-63.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1967), 'The location of cultural experience', in: Winnicott, D.W. (1971), *Playing and reality*, London: Tavistock, pp. 128-139.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1971), *Playing and reality*, London: Routledge.
- Winnicott, D.W (1974), 'Fear of breakdown', *The International Review of Psychoanalysis* 1, pp. 103-107.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1987), *The spontaneous gesture. Selected letters of D.W. Winnicott*, ed. Rodman, F.R., Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1989 [1965]), 'The psychology of madness: A contribution from psychoanalysis', in: Winnicott D.W. (1989), *Psychoanalytic explorations*, eds. Winnicott, C., Shepherd, R. and Davis M., London: Karnac, pp. 119-129.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1989 [1968]), 'The use of the word "use"', in: Winnicott, D.W.(1989), *Psychoanalytic explorations*, eds., Winnicott, C., Shepherd, R. and Davis M., London: Karnac, pp. 233-235.
- Winnicott, D.W. (1989 [1969]), 'The use of an object in the context of Moses and Monotheism', in Winnicott D.W (1989), *Psychoanalytic explorations*, eds., Winnicott, C., Shepherd, R. and Davis M., London: Karnac, pp. 240-246.
- Winterson, J. (2011), 'The King James Bible's Language Lesson', available at: <http://www.jeanettewinterson.com/journalism/the-king-james-bibles-language-lesson/>, accessed 13th October 2014.

- Winterson, J. (2013), in: *Start the week*, BBC Radio 4 podcast, [online], 11th November 2013.
- Work Songs, available at
<http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/scotlandssongs/about/songs/worksongs/index.asp>,
 accessed 26th February 2015.
- Wu, D. (2008), *William Hazlitt. The first modern man*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wurmser, L. (2014), 'Psychic reality in context: Perspectives on psychoanalysis, personal history and trauma Marion M. Oliner Karnac, London, 2012; 192 pp; £22.99', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 95(5), pp. 1025-1029.
- Young, R.M. (1993). 'Psychoanalytic teaching and research', *Free Associations* 4A, pp. 129-137.
- Zaretsky, E. (2004), *Secrets of the soul. A social and cultural history of psychoanalysis*, New York: Vintage Books.
- Zepf, S. (2000), *Allgemeine psychoanalytische Neurosenlehre, Psychosomatik und Sozialpsychologie: Ein kritisches Lehrbuch*, Gießen: Psychosozial-Verlag.
- Zepf, S. und Gattig, E. (1981), 'Kritik der theoretischen Ansätze: "Pensée Opératoire" und andere Konzepte', in: Zepf, S. (1981), *Psychosomatische Medizin auf dem Weg zur Wissenschaft*, Frankfurt/Main: Campus Verlag, pp. 111-144.
- Zerubavel, E. (1997), *Social mindscapes. An invitation to cognitive sociology*, Cambridge, Massachusetts/London: Harvard University Press.
- Zerubavel, E. (2006), *The elephant in the room. Silence and denial in everyday life*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Zilkha, N. (2004), '*La figurabilité psychique* [Psychic figurability] By César and Sára Botella, Lausanne-Paris: Delachaux et Niestlé. 2001. 261 pp.', *International Journal of Psychoanalysis* 85, pp. 225-228.
- Zimmer, R.B. (1992), 'Cultivating Freud's garden in France', *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association* 40, pp. 896-902.
- Zubiri, M. (1994), 'L'usage de la classification psychosomatique à l'Institut Pierre Marty de médecine psychosomatique de Bilbao', *Revue Française de Psychosomatique* 6, pp. 179-183.
- Zubiri, M. (2011), 'Discusión', *Revista de Psicoanálisis, Madrid* 64, pp. 133-137.
- Zwettler-Otte, S. (2011), *Ebbe und Flut - Gezeiten des Eros. Psychoanalytische Gedanken und Fallstudien über die Liebe*, Stuttgart: W. Kohlhammer.