



# Research Repository

## **Beyond Access: A Bourdieusian Perspective on Widening Participation in South African Higher Education**

Accepted for publication in International Sociology.

Research Repository link: <https://repository.essex.ac.uk/40649/>

### **Please note:**

Changes made as a result of publishing processes such as copy-editing, formatting and page numbers may not be reflected in this version. For the definitive version of this publication, please refer to the published source. You are advised to consult the published version if you wish to cite this paper.

<https://journals.sagepub.com/home/ISS>

# **Beyond Access: A Bourdieusian Perspective on Widening Participation in South African Higher Education**

## **Abstract:**

In South Africa, children of single-headed households (70% of whom are Black) have significantly worse educational outcomes than any other demographic. While the impact of family structures has been scrutinised in pre-18 education, it remains understudied in relation to access and success in Higher Education. Based on semi-structured interviews with students and alumni raised in single-headed households, this article explores the interplay of family milieu and Higher Education. Using a Bourdieusian framework, authors identify three key configurations between family and Higher Education fields (aligned, misaligned and parallel fields), which have a long-lasting impact on individual educational trajectories and the fabric of South African society. Black women remain disproportionately disadvantaged in the post-apartheid university, and the family milieu as a key site of intersectional inequalities remains under-researched. This article reveals the structural impact of transgenerational social reproduction in post-colonial societies and argues for a policy shift away from discourses of individual resilience.

**Key words:** Bourdieu, Higher Education, Post-apartheid, Single-headed households, South Africa, Widening participation.

## Introduction

Forty-two percent of youth in South Africa (70% of whom are Black<sup>1</sup>) grow up in single headed households (SHH); 90% are headed by Black African<sup>2</sup> women (Dawood and Seedat-Khan, 2023), of which 82% live in poverty (Statistics South Africa, 2018). South Africa's adoption of the National Development Plan: Vision 2030 to raise living standards, provide public services and reduce poverty and inequality (LaFramboise, 2019) recognises the scope and seriousness of poverty in lone-mother households (LMH). Lone mothers (LM) face interlocking gender, race and class inequalities underpinned by unequal socio-economic structures. Poverty and low levels of education impact women, who remain the poorest of the poor globally. These impediments also directly impact the life prospects of children living in these contexts. Children from SHH in South Africa (SA) are disproportionately affected by poverty, poor educational attainment, substance abuse, criminality, ill health, and premature death (Barnard, 2018; Mulia, 2017). They have significantly worse educational outcomes than any other demographic (Statistics South Africa, 2018). Low educational attainment, therefore, is an issue beyond schooling and needs to be considered in relation to the structural conditions of the family. While the impact of family structures has been scrutinised in the context of pre-primary, primary and secondary education, it remains understudied in relation to access and success in South African Higher Education (SAHE) (Morley, 2012; Nkosi, 2021). This knowledge

---

<sup>1</sup> According to the South African Broadbased Black Economic Empowerment Act 53 of 2003 "black people" is a generic term which refers to Africans, Coloureds and Indians (a) who are citizens of the Republic of South Africa by birth or descent; or (b) who became citizens of the Republic of South Africa by naturalisation (i) before 27 April 1994; or (ii) on or after 27 April 1994"

The racial project of the apartheid state created and entrenched structural inequities between 'races'/ethnic groups which still profoundly shape contemporary South African society. For this reason, a broader representation of 'Black' cannot capture some of the racial complexities at play. In this paper, we opted to use the racial/ethnic categories/constructs used in the South African government censuses which are widely used in data collection exercises. These categories are as follows: Black African, Coloured, Indian/Asian, White. Other. While this categorisation was core to the now abolished apartheid racial state project, they remain in use by the South African government to inform and support the redress of racial inequalities. As Posel (2001) notes, this racial classification is rooted in and derived from common sense. While it harbours a growing amount of criticism, this classification remains widely used by the state and in everyday life in SA. 'Black Africans' is typically used for/by individuals who can exclusively trace their lineage to Sub-Saharan Africa; 'Indian/Asian' is typically used for/by descendants of Indian/South-Asian migrants; 'Coloured' is typically used for/by individuals of 'mixed heritage'; 'White' is typically used for/by individuals of European descent. 'Other' is used by/for individuals who do not identify with these categories.

gap has implications for HE widening participation initiatives, which have yielded mixed results - only five per cent of Black or Coloured youth have a degree (versus 25% of white youth) (Nkosi, 2021).

The research explores how growing up in a SHH affects access and success in HE. Based on a series of interviews with students and alumni from Universities X and Y who grew up in SHH, this article uses a Bourdieusian framework of analysis to identify critical configurations between SHH and SAHE. These configurations are framed by intersecting race, class and gender inequalities, which influence education and reproduce systemic inequality in SA.

### **Widening Participation in South African HE: Access Needs Success**

SA's unequal, unique education system provides a unique case for considering widening participation in HE policy. The apartheid (1948-1994) legacy is sustained in HE. Addressing the 'inequitable distribution of access and opportunity for students (...) along the lines of race, gender, class and geography' (DoE, 1997: 8) has been central to the HE Act 101 of 1997 (online) and the Education White Paper 3 of 1997 (online) promoting transformation, redress, and access for historically marginalised Black, female, disabled and mature students. Targeted redistribution of public funding was identified as the key lever to achieve these goals (Wangenge-Ouma, 2013) with the means-tested National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) being established in 1996. The NSFAS, while a critical resource, has been under pressure with increasing demand. In 2023, around 800,000 students were funded through NSFAS, yet many others still face challenges accessing financial support (NSFAS, 2023). This financial gap disproportionately affects Black students, particularly those from rural and working-class backgrounds, and limits their participation in HE (PMG, 2024).

Access to HE from an inclusive and funding perspective is inadequate for success within a SA HE context. While there has been an increase in participation and in the number of Black university entrants, success (measured in terms of progression and/or graduation) remains elusive. 2021 saw over a million students enrolled at public universities and universities of technology, 76.4% African and 11.4% white (80% of SA population is African and 7.9% White) (Statista, 2023). White students remain over-represented, these figures indicate a shift in the number of African students accessing HE compared to 2014, where 66.4% were African and 22.3% were White (Stats SA, 2014). In relation to success, the Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) (2024) statistics show that in 2020, Coloured males and White males had the highest dropout to graduation rates for completion within 3 years (24.9:19.6 and 28.2:21.4 respectively), whereas African females who had previously held this position switched the narrative in 2020, with more than half the amount of dropouts to graduates (11.1:25.6) compared to 2010 where there were significantly more dropouts to graduates (23.7:15.9). However, research shows that fewer than 50% of students who enrol in SA HE graduate within the expected time frame, with attrition rates particularly high among Black and first-generation students (DHET, 2021). This suggests that access to HE alone is insufficient; institutions must focus on retention strategies, including academic support, mentorship, and fostering a sense of belonging for diverse student populations (Swartz et al., 2018; Case et al., 2017). categorised

The complexities of some ethnic and gendered groups attending HE exemplifies 'how the massification of HE can mask the maldistribution of opportunity structures' (Morley, 2012: 353) and highlights the need for intersectionally-informed research. Research shows that Black students may be challenged as a result of academic unpreparedness, coming from under-resourced schools (Higher Education News South Africa, 2024). Gore (2021) found that

a lack of English as a first language, alongside a lack of self-confidence and having to work, meant that Black students were less likely to complete their studies in the expected amount of time. Heyes et al. (2023) found that African females from SHHs had additional pressures that were not well understood by HEIs. While attending university was a way out of poverty, it did not negate the challenges that were still evident within the household affecting the lone-parent/carer and other children, including sexual abuse, lack of food, and insecure housing (Heyes et al., 2023). In response, programmes like the University Capacity Development Programme (UCDP) and the Teaching Development Grant (TDG) aim to support students and institutions in overcoming challenges. However, systemic issues such as the overcrowding of universities and underfunding of institutions remain significant barriers to widening participation (Boughey & McKenna, 2022; Swartz, 2018). South African universities struggle with outdated facilities, limited teaching staff, and increasing student numbers, all of which can detract from the quality of education and hinder successful outcomes for students (Walker et al., 2022).

Intersectional race, class and gender inequalities underpin opportunities as highlighted by the matric (final high-school examination) results. 2021, statistics indicate 'over 88% White students completed matric, followed by 74% Indians/Asians, 42% Black Africans and 39% Coloureds' (Khuluvhe and Ganyaupfu, 2022: 8) with research indicating that growing up in a SHH and/or poverty negatively affected educational outcomes (De Lange et al., 2014; Hendricks, 2018). A potential limitation of means-tested financial aid such as NSFAS is the failure to consider the non-financial socio-emotional support from the lowest quartile households need to function on par with unqualified NSFAS students. The 2022 report of the Commission of Inquiry into Allegations of Racism at Stellenbosch University revealed

accessibility issues for students whose first language was not Afrikaans, ultimately excluding lower quartile households (Khampepe, 2022).

Building on Bourdieu's analysis of material inequalities, for scholars such as Vally (2007; 2022), education in South Africa is embedded in social class relations, and largely reflects and reinforces the inequalities in a racial capitalist society. He pinpoints how the social class nature of the post-apartheid state is often overlooked in the political economy of the transition from apartheid to democracy and key for achieving social justice in education (Vally, 2022). Thus, issues of race and racism in education are inextricably linked to power relations and reproduced in conjunction with class, gender, and other inequalities. In order to recognise the complexities of power and subjectivity in postcolonial contexts such as South Africa, some authors have situated the contribution of Bourdieu alongside poststructuralism perspective to unravel the structural, embodied and symbolic nature of postcolonial experiences (Botsis, 2017). We then see how the micropolitics of power are constitutive of ideological categories such as language, race and class in post-colonial contexts.

As forcefully argued, many South African scholars in the post-apartheid context point to the lacunae of democratic structures, policies and regulations that hinder equal access to both citizenship and social justice denying unfettered access to many rights including quality education (Badat, 2014; Vally 2022). Despite a range on interventions to improve educational access, an important question raised by Lewin, 2007 (in Badat and Sayed, 2014) relates to how educational experiences is shaped by cultural capital and microlevel affordances at the household level, where gender concerns for learner achievement are critical. However, the effect on gender is not elaborated in the context of the household and social inequality and

taken up in this paper through a Bourdieusian lens, framed through an intersectional approach.

### **Theoretical Framework: Thinking of the 'in-between'**

The following theoretical insights guide the interpretation of data on access, student retention, and academic success in marginalized communities, providing a more nuanced understanding of the context. This theoretical framework seeks to explore the interconnections between family milieu and education in the post-colonial, post-apartheid SA context. Bourdieu and Passeron (1964, 1970) systematically explored the interplay of the family milieu and the educational field on individual educational trajectories, particularly in HE. Their analysis revolves around three key concepts (central to Bourdieusian sociology): habitus, capital, and field (which informs practice).

### **Habitus and Social Trajectories: Data and Theoretical Insights**

Understood as 'the social structures of our subjectivity' (Corcuff, 2007: 43), habitus shapes individuals' ways of being, thinking, perceiving, acting and forms the principles of action. Habitus is continuously evolving as its constitutive dispositions operate spontaneously with everyday structures. Bourdieu (1979: vii) defines the concept of habitus as 'a system of durable, transposable dispositions which function as the generative basis of structured, objectively unified practices. Bourdieu (1979) further conceptualizes habitus as a set of internalized dispositions shaped by early socialization, which influences how individuals engage with institutions and environments, often reproducing socio-economic hierarchies. Empirical data on South African students from working-class or rural backgrounds reveal significant challenges in adapting to university life. Research by Cloete and Maassen (2015)



demonstrate that students often feel disconnected from institutional norms and academic expectations, a phenomenon that is best understood through cleft habitus (Bourdieu, 1999). For example, students report feeling alienated from middle-class values and cultural expectations embedded within university structures, which prioritize behaviours, communication, and academic knowledge that is unfamiliar. This dissonance leads to increased psychological stress, lower confidence, and academic withdrawal. Pather et al. (2017) documents that students from single-headed households face financial instability, work-life balance, and emotional stress, which further exacerbates tension between family habitus and institutional demands. However, Abrahams and Ingram (2013) highlight opportunities for reflexivity and personal growth among students experiencing cleft habitus. Abrahams and Ingram (2013) found that students who learn to navigate conflicting cultural expectations can develop "double vision" an enhanced capacity to adapt to multiple social contexts. This adaptability, while achieved at a high personal cost, can empower students to create new identities and strategies for academic success, challenging systemic inequalities and limitations that can widen participation policies.

### **Fields of Power and Educational Inequality: Structural Context and Empirical Evidence**

Bourdieu's concept of **field** refers to a structured space where individuals compete for status, resources, and legitimacy. Each field has its own rules and norms, which reflect the interests of dominant positions. In SAHEs, data indicates that universities remain influenced by systemic colonial and apartheid legacies, with structural and cultural practices that favour students with high levels of cultural capital (Cloete & Maassen, 2015). Students from marginalized backgrounds lack familiarity with institutional norms, making it difficult to compete academically. Calitz (2018) found that students from low-income households

struggle with academic writing, class discussions, and networking, implicitly required for success. These challenges align with Bourdieu's assertion that access to cultural capital is crucial for navigating and succeeding in competitive fields. Decoteau's (2013) notion of hybrid habitus explains how some students develop innovative strategies to bridge the gap between family and the academy. Data from interviews with Black female students highlight how these strategies are used to challenge systemic barriers, often experiencing emotional exhaustion and limited institutional support (Heyes et al., 2023). The empirical evidence underscores the importance of transforming institutional cultures to accommodate diverse cultural capital, rather than perpetuating exclusion. Closely connected to habitus, which is both the product and the producer (Jenkins, 1992), the field concept is defined as 'a social arena within which struggles or manoeuvres take place over resources, stakes and accesses. (Jenkins, 1992: 84). Fields have references, histories and stakes; they are the product and producer of specific and appropriate habitus. The concept of capital is intricately connected to the notions of field and habitus.

### **Capital and the Reproduction of Inequality: Linking Data to Theory**

Bourdieu distinguishes between four forms of capital economic, cultural, social, and **symbolic**, all of which shape individuals' opportunities and trajectories. The four types of capital can be understood as 'the totality of material goods (wealth, income, class, education) as well as symbolic notions (reputation, consideration, culture), which are unevenly distributed. Capital has considerable value in social games, at a given time in a given society' (Champagne and Christin, 2004: 220). Data on SAHE outcomes illustrate unequal access to capital perpetuates educational disparities. Students from lone-mother households face financial constraints that limit access to academic resources, textbooks, technology and transportation (Cloete &

Maassen, 2015). Material disadvantages hinder academic performance and influence high dropout rates. The role of cultural capital is significant, middle-class students benefit from parental support networks and extracurricular activities that prepare them for university. In contrast, marginalized students enter HE with limited preparation and confront precipitous learning curves. Pather et al. (2017) established that marginalized students struggle to achieve academic outcomes, which impacts their confidence and increases the risk of academic exclusion. Limited social capital, i.e., mentorship, academic advisors, and professional networks further restricts access to career opportunities after graduation. The data revealed a cyclical pattern, where marginalized students were less likely to secure employment in their fields, perpetuating generational inequality. Agents use different types of capital in their field with specific forms to navigate social fields and establish positions. The nature and volume of individuals' capital ultimately inform structures of domination. The dynamic relations between habitus, capital, and field (all in a state of becoming) shape and determine agents' practices. Arguing the education system participates in both the reproduction and legitimation of social order, Bourdieu and Passeron's (1964, 1970) work shed light on the importance of the family milieu (of which race and class is a structuring factor) in these social phenomena. Academic success is linked to families' investment in students' cultural capital. Investing in students' education, the elite pass on favourable positions via an educational system (instituted by the elite) that legitimises both cultural capital and dominance. The massification of HE has brought new publics to universities, which, under the joint pressures of democratisation and neo liberalisation, have transformed themselves slowly, if not reluctantly. In the global south, this increase in the number of students has not been the great leveller of inequalities that governing elites promised as part of their duplicitous social mobility agenda (Ingram and Gamsu, 2022). In Britain, class

positions tend to be fixed between generations (Bukodi, 2019). Democratising HE has propelled social race and class mixing, and the experience of cleft habitus is becoming more common among students. Bourdieu (1999: 511) defines a cleft habitus as 'a habitus divided against itself, in constant negotiation with itself and its ambivalences, and therefore doomed to a kind of duplication, to a double perception of the self, to successive allegiance and multiple identities'. While a cleft habitus may be riddled with anxieties and suffering, Abrahams and Ingram (2013) argue that 'a chameleon habitus' fosters individuals' reflexivity and ability to adapt to new fields and develop multiple belongings, envisaging the possibility of creating new and third social spaces (Bhandari, 2022; Al-Khalili and Baker, 2021). Decoteau (2013) highlights the strategy-generating and innovative streak of 'the hybrid habitus incorporated by subjects of post-apartheid SA which enable and shape their ability to traverse boundaries that circumscribe their lives' (Decoteau, 2013: 280). Class, gender, race, nationality, educational-level, and place of residence inform and structure hybrid habitus. Decoteau (2013) argues that beyond innovating individual biographies, hybrid habitus stimulates social change for 'practising hybridity, in this way, is onto-formative it constantly (re)constitutes social reality in a processual and additive fashion' (Decoteau, 2013: 285). As explored in this paper, the onus of hybridisation of one's habitus (conscious and unconscious) befalls unevenly on individuals who are in dominant positions within a field; race, gender and class are vital determinants of perceptions of value and impact pressures to comply to dominant cultural values. In SA, Black women are likely to feel the need to change the strongest but face the most significant barriers to change and being recognised as legitimate in new roles and contexts (Heyes et al., 2023).

### **The Intersectionality of Class, Race, and Gender: Empirical Insights**

Educational inequality in SA is profoundly shaped by the intersection of class, race, and gender. Empirical studies (Seedat-Khan, 2020) highlight how intersecting factors compound challenges faced by marginalized students. Pather et al. (2017) and Heyes et al. (2023) indicate that Black women from lone-mother households experience higher levels of stress and discrimination compared to other women. SA students report feeling invisible in academic spaces and face significant barriers accessing support services. The data revealed how widening participation policies have been insufficient in addressing structural disadvantages. While increased access has brought marginalised and diverse students into universities, retention and success rates remain low. This highlights the limitations of policy interventions that focus solely on enrolment without considering deeper systemic institutional inequality, culture and support. The relationship between the family and HE outcomes in SA is shaped by a complex integration of socio-economic status, parental education, and historical inequality is critical to student access and HE success. Students from lone-mother households are disproportionately financially insecure, relegating them to a low socio-economic status. The absence of a two-parent support system intensifies challenges accessing HE and graduating successfully (Cloete & Maassen, 2015). Despite efforts to increase HE access, students struggle with academic demands based on parental education levels, limited funds for tuition costs, this alongside absent social capital impedes career development and job security after graduation (Calitz, 2018). Pather et al., 2017, indicates that even though students from lone-mother households are more likely to be enrolled in HE, they face significant challenges with academic success, citing emotional stress, work-life balance and limited career access and opportunities (Pather et al., 2017). The intersection of gender, race, and class in SA intensifies challenges, with students from lone-mother households facing multiple disadvantages.

### **Implications for Widening Participation: Bridging Theory and Data**

This paper explores how the relationship between family milieu and HE outcomes in SA is shaped by the complex interplay of habitus, capital, and field. Analysing data on students from single-headed families, it becomes evident that structural inequalities continue to undermine the effectiveness of widening participation policies. Bourdieu's theoretical framework emphasizes that increasing access alone is not enough to achieve educational equity. Instead, policies must address both the socio-economic and cultural barriers that hinder academic success. Empirical data supports the need for interventions that provide financial assistance, enhance academic preparation, and foster inclusive institutional cultures. Without these measures, the promise of social mobility through HE will remain out of reach for many marginalized students in SA. Linking empirical data to Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, capital, and field offers a comprehensive understanding of the factors shaping educational inequality. This theoretical foundation provides critical insights for developing policies that not only widen access but also promote sustained success and upward mobility for marginalized students.

### **Theoretical framework: thinking of the 'in-between'**

This section outlines a theoretical framework to explore the interconnections between family milieu and education in the post-colonial, post-apartheid SA context. Bourdieu and Passeron (1964, 1970) systematically explored the interplay of the family milieu and the educational field on individual educational trajectories, particularly in HE. Their analysis revolves around three key concepts (central to Bourdieusian sociology): habitus, capital, and field (which informs practice). Bourdieu (1979: vii, author's translation) defines the concept of habitus as

‘a system of durable, transposable dispositions which function as the generative basis of structured, objectively unified practices. Understood as ‘the social structures of our subjectivity’ (Corcuff, 2007: 43, author's translation), the habitus shapes individuals' ways of being, thinking, perceiving, and acting and forms the principles of action. Habitus is continuously evolving as its constitutive dispositions operate spontaneously in concert with everyday structures. Closely connected to habitus, which is both the product and the producer (Jenkins, 1992), the field concept is defined as ‘a social arena within which struggles or manoeuvres take place over specific resources or stakes and access to them’. (Jenkins, 1992: 84).

Different fields have their references, histories, and stakes; they are the product and producer of their specific and appropriate habitus. The concept of capital is intricately connected to the notions of field and habitus. Bourdieu distinguishes four types of capital (economic, social, cultural, and symbolic), which can be understood as ‘the totality of material goods (wealth, income, etc.) as well as symbolic ones (reputation, consideration, culture), unevenly distributed and which are socially considered to have value in social games, at a given time in a given society’ (Champagne and Christin, 2004: 220, author's translation). Agents use different types of capital in their field-specific forms to navigate social fields and establish their positions. The nature and volume of individuals' capital ultimately inform structures of domination. The dynamic relations between habitus, capital, and field (all in a state of becoming) shape/determine agents' practices.

Arguing the education system participates in both the reproduction and legitimation of social order, Bourdieu and Passeron's (1964, 1970) work shed light on the importance of the family milieu (of which class is a structuring factor) in these social phenomena. Academic success is

linked to families' investment in their children's cultural capital. Investing in their children's education, the elite pass on their favourable position via an educational system (instituted by the elite) that legitimises both their cultural capital and their dominance.

The massification of HE has brought new publics to universities, which, under the joint pressures of democratisation and neo liberalisation, have transformed themselves slowly, if not reluctantly. In many countries, this increase in the number of students has not been the great leveller of inequalities that governing elites promised as part of their duplicitous social mobility agenda (Ingram and Gamsu, 2022). In Britain, for example, class positions tend not to change between generations (Bukodi, 2019). Democratising HE has meant increased social mixing, and the experience of cleft habitus is becoming more common among students. Bourdieu (1999: 511) defines a cleft habitus as 'a habitus divided against itself, in constant negotiation with itself and its ambivalences, and therefore doomed to a kind of duplication, to a double perception of the self, to successive allegiance and multiple identities'. While a cleft habitus may be riddled with anxieties and suffering, Abrahams and Ingram (2013) argue that 'a chameleon habitus' fosters individuals' reflexivity and ability to adapt to new fields and develop multiple belongings, envisaging the possibility of creating new/third social spaces.

Incorporating Bhabha's work on hybridity and third spaces (Bhandari, 2022; Al-Khalili and Baker, 2021) into her re-reading of Bourdieusian theory in the context of post-apartheid SA, Decoteau (2013) highlights the strategy-generating and innovative streak of 'the hybrid habitus incorporated by the subjects of post-apartheid (which) enable and shape their ability to traverse the many boundaries that circumscribe their daily lives' (Decoteau, 2013: 280). Alongside class position, gender, race, nationality, educational level, and place of residence



inform and structure hybrid habitus. Going further, Decoteau (2013) argues that beyond innovating individual biographies, hybrid habitus stimulates social change for 'practising hybridity, in this way, is onto-formative – it constantly (re)constitutes social reality in a processual and additive fashion' (Decoteau, 2013: 285). However, as explored in this paper, the onus of hybridisation of one's habitus (conscious and unconscious) befalls unevenly on individuals who are in dominated positions within a given field; race, gender and class are vital determinants of perceptions of value and therefore impact pressures to comply to dominant cultural values. In other words, in SA, Black women are likely to feel the need to change the strongest but face the most significant barriers to setting change in motion and being recognised as legitimate in new roles/contexts they have accessed (Heyes et al., 2023).

The relationship between the family milieu and higher education outcomes in South Africa is shaped by a complex integration of socio-economic status, parental education, and historical legacies of inequality. Family background is critical to a student's access to and success in SAHE. Children from SHH are disproportionately affected by financial instability, lower socio-economic status, and the absence of a stable two-parent support system, all of which create significant challenges for accessing higher education and achieving graduate success (Cloete & Maassen, 2015). Despite widening participation efforts to increase access to higher education, these children often struggle with inadequate academic preparation due to lower parental educational attainment, limited financial resources for tuition and other academic costs, and the lack of familial networks to support career development post-graduation (Calitz, 2018). Research indicates that even though children from lone-mother households are more likely to be enrolled in higher education under widening participation policies, they still face significant challenges that hinder their academic success, such as emotional stress, work-

life balance issues, and limited access to opportunities for career advancement after graduation (Pather et al., 2017). The intersection of gender, race, and class in South Africa intensifies these challenges, with children from SHH often facing multiple layers of disadvantage.

Building on these discussions, this paper explores the interplay of family milieux and HE and its impact on the trajectories of students and alumni in single-headed families, exploring the implications for widening participation policies.

### **Research design**

This study is part of a research project that explores the impact of growing up in a single-headed household on access to and success in HE. Within a South African context, single-parent households are homes where the parent may be deceased, separated from a partner, or working away from the home. Where both parents are deceased, or the parent works away from home, the children are cared for by an aunt, grandparent, neighbour or the oldest child, who may still be a minor (Ahiaku and Ajani, 2022). To generate new insights as to why some of these inequalities persist and to identify factors supporting access to and success in HE, the research team sought to explore the lived experiences of individuals from single-headed households who had found success in HE (defined herein as access and progression or graduation) despite circumstances, and challenges. University X and Y students and alumni were selected using a non-probability snowball sampling method. Snowball sampling can allow researchers to access hard-to-reach groups through trusted networks, fostering a sense of safety and confidentiality (Cresswell, 2013). These participants may have felt stigmatised due to being from a lone-parent, household, and this method helps to build trust in the researcher and the team. Narrative analysis provides a novel perspective of participants

stories, not focusing on representation in terms of broadly applying to many people, but by understanding the broader social context, meaning and impact. This method emphasises political and power dynamics that are retold through the researchers and their audiences (Earthy and Cronin, 2008). This study was part of a larger study funded by the XXX (number) and ethically approved by University X (32183) University Y (HSSREC/00002538/2021) and University Z (SOC-2021-21662). All data have been anonymised.

Forty semi-structured interviews with participants from single-headed households were conducted. Ten participants at each university were students, and ten were alumni. Thirty participants identified as women, eight as men, and two did not specify. Thirty described themselves as Black/Black African (22 of whom were female), two as Indian (one of whom is female), two as coloured (both female), and six as white (five of whom are female). Their ages ranged from 20 to 49.

The interviews were conducted online, in English. The same female Durban-based South African researcher conducted and transcribed the interviews; this enhanced standardisation between interviews, as did the use of a semi-structured interview guide devised by the research team. Using a thematic interpretative method of analysis, our multi-ethnic all women research team identified core themes before collaboratively devised the coding strategy used to process the data with NVivo. The range of experiences, backgrounds and shared feminist sensibilities present in our team supported a collective and critical exploration of the data.

Pseudonym	Gender	Race	University	Family milieu characterisation (grew up with...)	Family-milieu HE configuration
Lisa	F	white	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	grandfather as on only child in university town - affluent middle-class	Alignment
Natasha	F	white	UKZN student	mother and sibling in large city - stable middle-class	Alignment
Danielle	F	white	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	father and sibling in large city - stable middle-class	Alignment
Elizabeth	F	white	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	grandmother and sibling in large city - stable middle-class	Alignment
Tebo	F	African	UKZN staff/alumni	mother as an only child, in small town - stable middle-class	Alignment
Willem	M	white	UKZN staff/alumni	mother as an only child in large city - affluent middle-class	Alignment
Musa	M	African	UKZN staff/alumni	migrant mother and siblings in various locations - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Anele	F	African	UKZN student	father and siblings in informal settlement near large city - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Atile	F	African	Stellenbosh student	grandmother/extended family in university town - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Batho	F	African	UKZN student	grandmother, siblings and cousin in informal settlement, rural area - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Bheki	M	African	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	mother as an only child in informal settlement in small town - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Bhokang	F	African	Stellenbosh student	grandmother/extended family in university town - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Brenda	F	white	UKZN staff/alumni	mother and siblings in small city - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Busi	F	African	UKZN student	mother, siblings and cousins in informal settlement, rural area - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Carissa	F	coloured	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	aunt, siblings and cousins in informal settlement - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Charmaine	F	coloured	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	mother and siblings in crime-ridden neighbourhood in large city - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Jabu	M	African	UKZN student	mother and extended family in informal settlement, rural area - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Kabelo	F	African	Stellenbosh student	aunt and siblings in informal settlement near large city - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Keti	F	African	UKZN student	mother and sibling in informal settlement, rural area - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Krish	M	Indian	UKZN student	mother as an only child, in large city, vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Lebone	F	African	Stellenbosh student	mother and siblings in university town - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Maleli	F	African	Stellenbosh student	mother and sibling in rural area - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Mombi	F	African	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	mother and siblings in rural area - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Palesa	F	African	Stellenbosh student	mother and siblings in informal settlement in town - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Reena	F	Indian	UKZN staff/alumni	mother and siblings in town - abuse, stable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Sifiso	M	African	UKZN staff/alumni	father and siblings in town - stable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Sibu	F	African	UKZN staff/alumni	grandmother and cousins in small town - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Thloko	F	African	Stellenbosh student	mother and siblings in small town - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Tlali	F	African	Stellenbosh student	grandmother and siblings in village - transient poor	Fraught (mis)alignment
Yiba	F	African	UKZN staff/alumni	mother and one sibling in town - vulnerable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Zodwa	F	African	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	father (abusive) and siblings in small town - stable middle-class	Fraught (mis)alignment
Bena	ND	African	Stellenbosh student	mother (abuse) before heading family in crime-ridden township near large city - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Kgomomo	ND	African	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	aunt away from siblings (abuse), in large city - vulnerable middle-class	Parallel fields
Lihle	F	African	UKZN student	mother (abuse) and siblings in informal settlement, rural area - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Lindelani	F	African	Stellenbosh student	father then extended family (abuse) as only child in informal settlement near large city - vulnerable middle-class	Parallel fields
Mbali	F	African	UKZN staff/alumni	father (abuse) and siblings in informal settlement rural area - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Minnie	F	African	UKZN staff/alumni	mother (abuse) and one sibling in informal settlement rural area and safe house - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Noma	F	African	UKZN student	mother (neglect) and siblings in informal settlement, rural area - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Thando	F	African	UKZN student	aunt (neglect) before heading family in informal settlement, rural area - chronically poor	Parallel fields
Tulo	M	African	Stellenbosh staff/alumni	father (substance abuse) and one sibling in informal settlement near large city - transient poor	Parallel fields

Table 1: table of participants and their social characteristics.

NB: This table lists the family member/carer participants declared to have grown up with in the first phase of the interview process; however, it is important to note that participants may have 'grown up'/lived with a series of family members and/or carers over the years.

## Findings and discussion

Based on the interviews conducted with research participants, this section explores fundamental dynamics between the family milieu/home environment and the education field. This paper identifies three broad configurations to characterise the relationship between the family milieu and the education field (alignment, fraught (mis)alignment, and parallel fields), which play out and can have a long-lasting impact on individuals' educational trajectories and academic success.

## Configuration 1: Alignment

The first configuration identified sees a strong alignment between the family milieu and the education field. Individuals report transitioning between both environments with seamless ease. Not only was academic success a likely and *naturalised* outcome and expectation for individuals operating in this configuration, but the alignment between the two fields of family and education reinforced their habitus, accruing its legitimacy through conferring their degree.

When reflecting on their family milieu and how it shaped their educational trajectories, participants in this configuration all describe a home environment in which their material needs were met. In that sense, material needs were neither a hurdle nor a constraint, with some respondents acknowledging the advantages derived from their access to material resources regarding their educational success. As indicated in the following quotations, white respondents were over-represented in this category, highlighting the deep-seated maldistribution of affluence and access to resources across racial groups.

‘I had everything at my disposal to succeed. Whatever I needed whatever book I wanted, my grandfather would get it for me or give me the money to order it online.’  
(Lisa, white, female).

‘I had everything. I would go to the library. We had a computer at home with a printer at home and we have the Internet so I could research stuff for assignments’ (Danielle, white, female).

These examples highlight the importance of economic capital in shaping habitus and, consequently, dispositions and orientations towards education. In the examples above, we

can see the conversion of economic capital into cultural capital in the form of space to study, books, and computers. This facilitated an alignment between the original habitus (as formed through the family milieu) and the habitus as it evolved through exposure to the field of education.

This alignment was facilitated by economic capital and the generation of a habitus where educational success and HE participation were the taken-for-granted norm. Respondents in this configuration referenced close family members who had graduated from university or were studying for a degree/ qualification; this contributed to normalising expectations around HE. Some highlighted how, as individuals, they had little interest in studying and getting a university qualification but were pushed by their families to do so.

‘I matriculated and applied to University X. My granddad went there, and many family members went to University X so that was the university to go to. There was a lot of prestige.’ (Lisa, white, female)

‘Because my sister went to university, she told me I had to. (...). My grandad had huge respect for education. He had an honours degree. I really wanted to make him proud.’ (Natasha, white, female)

‘I did not even care to go to uni. My mum insisted and both my grandparents. (...) I had and have every available resource. I am the Elon Musk of Durban. (...) I didn't even apply. I never wanted to go. Dad knew someone who knew someone, and I got in.’ (Willem, white, male).

Interestingly, regardless of their level of motivation to pursue their studies in HE, respondents in this configuration build on the familiarity and (sometimes personal) connections with HE

relayed by close family members to ease their transition from secondary to HE. This suggests a strong alignment between their family milieu and the education field, with individuals navigating between the two (aligned codes and practices) with relative ease and the often-unnoticed comfort of the unchallenged habitus. In short, in Bourdieusian terms, they were like fish in water.

Respondents in this *aligned* configuration were white, except for one participant – highlighting the long-lasting impact of apartheid with colonial legacies still structuring the education field. The white participants did not refer to privilege in their accounts and certainly did not connect their success to the intergenerational reproduction of racialised power dynamics that play out through habitus. In fact, in an evolving society where white privilege was starting to be challenged, all the participants felt aggrieved that their perceived entitlement to domination in education and work was under threat. The racial undertones and sense of lost privilege were expressed more directly by two respondents reflecting on their transition into the world of work.

‘Being white it was hard to find work’ (Danielle, white, female)

‘I applied for work and, as a white person in SA, it is very difficult to find work. Everything is about affirmative action and even though I did really well at university I struggled to get work.’ (Lisa, white, female).

As shown in this section, alignment between the family milieu and the educational field is a configuration that operates to the advantage of whiteness. Our data shows how whiteness preconfigures educational success, and the education system is set up to recognise, validate and reproduce white privilege. The perceptions of injustice by white participants in relation to reforms only reinforce the taken-for-granted expectations of the intergenerational

reproduction of educational advantage for white South Africans. This advantage is all the more powerful for its unquestionability.

Tebo (female, African) was the only Black respondent for whom there was a strong alignment between her family milieu and the education field. She put her adequate access to material resources down to the fact that she was an only child raised by her mum (a trained nurse) and her maternal grandparents who also gave her sustained emotional and academic support.

‘They always put me first and made sure that I was always provided for. Many of my friends had to do chores growing up but I only did chores in school holidays. I only studied. (...) I felt like a privileged child when I saw some of my cousins. I had my own room. I would study in quiet. No chores. I achieved good grades. (...) She (Tebo’s mum) studied so I wanted to study like her. (...) My mum used to sit up and do homework and projects when she was home.’

Read in conjunction with white respondents’ testimonies (all in this configuration) Tebo’s story bears witness to the fact that access and success in HE may be opening up, however the fact that Tebo herself felt privileged in comparison to her cousins highlights how alignment between family milieu and the education field predominantly remains a white experience.

### **Configuration 2: Fraught (mis)alignment**

The second configuration identified sees a fraught (mis)alignment between the family milieu and the education field. Despite the family milieu and the education field making competing demands on individuals, particularly girls, academic success is highly regarded and seen as a legitimate and desirable goal by individuals in this configuration and their respective families. In this regard there is a degree of alignment between the shaping of orientations towards



education in both fields. However, individuals in this configuration demonstrate a habitus *in flux*, detailing their fraught strategies to navigate and succeed in education.

Individuals in this configuration identify material hardship as the main disabling factor in their educational journey, which was in tension with their desires for success. Being raised in a single-headed household often meant households (which varied greatly in size) relied on a single income/wage, which typically meant limited money and parental presence at home. This was contrasted against the white participants' accounts of adequate money and resources despite reduced parental presence.

'Things were hard. The house was full. Mum took all her grant and earnings for us. She would borrow money for clothes- and food and to fix our shoes when it was torn. Mum got sick. No money for paraffin or candles. No electricity and most days no food (...)

The hardest part of growing up was that feeling of being hungry.' (Jabu, male, African).

Charmaine (female, coloured) highlights how gendered roles and expectations meant girls (and particularly oldest female siblings) were at a further disadvantage than their male counterparts (see also *anonymised publication*, 2023).

'Girls had to wake up first, so the earliest and you make something to eat, make breakfast, finish in the bathroom to leave time for the boys to go in. The boys would wake up much later and be ready for school and have everything ready to go to school. It was hard doing homework; it was hard studying (...), I would have to cook and clean and neaten and organise and have to wash the uniform'.

This hardship and lack of economic capital structured orientations towards education in both positive and negative ways. The lack of material resources shaped family perspectives on

education as a potential solution to poverty. Moreover, most individuals in this configuration tended to describe growing up in an environment where they were emotionally sustained.

'There were too much of us in the house. There was only a six-seater sofa – no place to do work. We used to take the icansi (Zulu mat) and do homework under the avocado tree. There was love, harmony and happiness.' (Busi, female, African).

Whilst many describe longing for an estranged parent (often their father) or an absent carer (typically mothers in full-time work), individuals in this configuration sometimes drew emotional fulfilment from their connection with an aunt, a grandmother, a female neighbour and/or siblings. Many of these relationships had a positive impact on their schooling and their educational trajectory. By holding education in high regard, these relations directly encouraged respondents to study and/or siblings creating a form of emulation conducive to wanting to study.

'She (respondent's mother) believed in university' (Musa, female, African).

'Because mum and aunt grew up so poor, they were persistent about school.' (Yiba, female, African).

'Mum kept saying don't end up like me, educate yourself.' (Reena, female, Indian).

The combination of poverty and emotional support/encouragement from others shaped the habitus of those within this configuration towards a perception of education as something to be valued and worth struggling for, and in this way it there are echoes of the alignment we see in the previous configuration. However, in this fraught (mis)alignment configuration, parental desire for their children to gain an education was borne out of different structural conditions and perceptions to respondents and families in the first 'aligned' configuration.

While the former wish their children study to be like them, the latter want their children to study precisely so they don't become like them.

Whilst respondents in this group may have benefitted from a positive family orientation towards education in addition to supportive and encouraging relationships, there were still significant obstacles to realising success, which creates a tension between alignment and misalignment. For example, family encouragement was often limited to emotional support rather than assistance in navigating processes.

'To me, my caregiver had no role in helping me. They didn't know or understand about universities themselves. And so, they did not know how to help me. (...) I applied for university myself. You know, although my mum was supportive emotionally, she did not know how to help me through all the processes, and I had to struggle through that myself.' (Atile, female, African).

The struggle was featured heavily in the transcripts of the respondents in this configuration, and the battle for education that started within the family milieu continued as they moved from the material difficulties of their home environment to the cultural strangeness of the new environment of HE.

'There are six of us and, yes, it's a two-bedroom place. It really affects us. It's always noisy, people fighting and throwing things and the neighbours are throwing bottles out of the windows so yeah, it was noisy and then you hear gunshots all the time, you hear people fighting and swearing all the time. This, for growing up, for us is normal. (...) The noise is normal and, when I went to university, it felt strange. It feels very strange to be in a space where there is quiet and how normal people live' (Carissa, female, coloured)

Respondents who were students during the interview described some of the struggles associated with their transition into HE. Misalignment manifests in various material and cultural challenges, from social unease and loneliness to difficulty accessing university and its systems and language barriers.

‘There were no people that we knew of that (university), so it was difficult when I got to campus but expected that I struggled initially. I had to align myself with mentors at the campus, that were in campus life in general, you know the social life, the academic life, the academic expectations. I really struggled with all that because I had no one to guide me.’ (Atile, female, African).

‘It was hard in the first year. The language I struggled with. University Y was the best school. I travelled from Inanda. Transport was a problem. I always missed the early lectures. I had to wake up in the dark and leave. It costs me R60 per day by bus. I took 2 buses and a taxi. (...) I got residence in 2<sup>nd</sup> year. I struggled at home. It was hard to work at home or at night. There was no computer or internet.’ (Anele, female, African).

‘It's tough. My boyfriend left me. There is no time to socialise or go to parties. (...) I felt alone here. My English is poor ok, it's a bit better now but I struggled with the language barrier to write in English. I went to Zulu schools.’ (Keti, female, African).

These excerpts point to the struggle to meet the expectations of university life. In some cases, these struggles were material, as in the case of navigating public transport and lack of home resources whilst studying. In other cases, we see the cultural struggle to fit within the HE fields and its expectations for ways of being. This is most acutely felt through the use of language and accent, which are a form of embodied cultural capital.

‘When I went to university it was a privilege for me when I got space to be at University X because everyone speaks about University X. I mean it was the top university, and it was difficult to get into. People wonder why they wouldn't get into University X but for me to get that letter to say that I got into University X. I was very, very happy but really when I was there it wasn't all it was cracked up to be. It still felt like apartheid. I'm not sure if I'm allowed to say that about the university but you said it's going to be anonymous? It's tough being a non-white person at University X because they treat you different, they look at you different, they look at your clothes different, they look at you funny when you speak because you not speaking their white language or the Afrikaans accent. It's hard it's really, really hard I mean even the lecturers will take time to spend with the white students but not the other students, so we were very much on our own and we had to manage on our own through university. Even though there were jobs available at University X I didn't even bother applying for it because it's not a place I want to be around when people look at you funny and you only get a job because they need people of colour on their statistics.’ (Carissa, female, coloured).

Respondents in this configuration came from various ethnic backgrounds, with Black African and ‘coloured’ individuals featuring heavily. Black and coloured students struggled to feel recognised by the institutions as responses to their ways of being, speaking and acting rendered them as different and outside of expected norms. The excerpt above powerfully illustrates the viscosity of the misalignment between habitus and field for racialised students. The students are caught up in a tension between their field aligned orientations towards success and their experiences of economic and cultural capital misalignment in their encounters with the higher education field.

**Configuration 3: Parallel Fields**

The third configuration identified sees the family milieu and the education field as co-existing in parallel, with incompatible demands and little (if any) points of connection or conversion between the two. Individuals in this configuration face incommensurable challenges in their family milieu and the field, which leaves them in a place of displacement, neither in nor between the fields. Respondents in this configuration – who, despite the difficulties, have been successful in their educational trajectories as defined above – have found a way to survive, not to belong. This third configuration sees the family milieu and the education field as co-existing in parallel with each other but neither offering refuge and comfort through an alignment with the habitus of the respondents. Those in this configuration remain a minority (as they acknowledge it themselves). Many remain trapped in adverse circumstances throughout their lives or worse, as Minnie (female, African) points out: ‘Mine is a happy ending but what about those girls who don't survive’.

All respondents in this configuration endured a range of deeply adverse material and emotional circumstances, which were often compounded by traumatic events which prevented them from accessing and/or succeeding in school. Like several other respondents, Bena (gender not disclosed, African) – as the oldest sibling - found themselves heading their family after the death of her mother:

‘At 11, I was a mum to 7 kids (*her orphaned siblings and cousins*). I matured very quickly. I missed a lot of school. I don't know who was receiving our grants, but it wasn't me. If I reported it, we would have been taken to the welfare and we all would all be separated. So, I kept quiet. The kids needed me. We lived in a one room shack. I used to go to all the neighbours to get food most days. So, I was raped by my mum's boyfriend when I was 7. After months of it happening, my mum caught him, and she

gave me a beating. I used to get blisters, and only now did I realise that this man gave me STDs. He also gave me HIV, but I collected all the two rands he gave me, and I could buy smarties whenever I wanted. That's how I made money now when we didn't have food. So, I would prostitute myself so I could feed my siblings. It's not like anyone would give an 11-year-old work. Every time there was rain, the shack would wash away. I really struggled. (...) My goal was survival and protect my brothers and sisters'.

Bena's testimony echoes that of other participants in this configuration. Growing up with abuse and with hardly anyone to turn to, these participants struggled for basic survival. The contexts and traumas they wrestled with profoundly impacted their education.

Fleeing their house and carer to find refuge with a family member, a neighbour or in a safe house or living independently - as Bena (see above) or Thando, a female, African who chased her abusive aunt from her family's home - often constitutes the first step beyond survival and towards the reconstruction of their lives (as children/youth ), part of which involves a re-alignment with the education field. Minnie (female, African) stresses the significance of the safe house, its staff, and volunteers in rebuilding her life and enabling her to access education:

'I never went to school. I used to teach myself reading with the neighbourhood children who went to school back home. I only went to school from the place of safety. I was a bit behind, but I worked hard. I was so happy to be able to get an education. I used to clean and cook too and used to do domestic work in other areas on weekends. I was only 2 years behind school because I worked very hard and studied. The teachers worked extra hours with me and helped me catch up. Some teachers volunteered at the safe home, so they brought me books too. I couldn't work with male teachers. The social worker was helping me with my traumas. (...). I only survived because of my new

family. They tried to get me to embrace Jesus, but you tell me if there is a God, would he or she allow me to go through this and my innocent baby F. (her brother) to take his life. No there is no God. We make our own way’.

It is important to note here the extent to which gender shaped individual outcomes (which was compounded by age and birth order). In his interview, Tulo (male, African) extensively discussed how he 'owned' the opportunities to study to the sacrifice of his older sister:

‘Because of my sister, I could go and study at university while she is alone taking care of my dad, she didn't study, she's now got a kid and work part-time as a domestic to earn some extra money for the child.’

For some, the education field became an escape route from traumatic lived experiences, often facilitated by a significant individual. Several respondents highlighted the role specific teachers played in their lives, showing an interest in them and their studies, caring for them in that sense and supporting their transition to university (sharing information about the application processes for a university place, accommodation, and funding).

‘Mrs L. in high school really believed in me. She was like a mother to me. She heard my story and comforted me. I used to struggle in maths and English, but she gave me extra sheets and really helped me. God bless her. She used to take me to expos and tell me about life and how to be successful.’ (Lihle, female, African).

The teachers' attitudes contrasted sharply with the carer's/parent's attitude towards education, who often did not know about the education field (perhaps they had received no or limited schooling) and/or did not support their children with their schooling, either



showing no interest in their studies and/or discouraging them from studying to prioritise household chores, childcare or paid child work.

While respondents celebrated their success against the odds in the educational field, many described how this newfound equilibrium often felt precarious. Fear for their safety remained a lingering concern for many, from Mbali (female, African), who lived for many years in the same neighbourhood as her aggressors, dreading an encounter with them, to Kgomo (gender nondisclosed, African), fearing homophobic attacks. Moving out of their childhood neighbourhood was often regarded as a major emancipatory step for these respondents and a tangible sign of their success. Many expressed a desire to give back to their communities of origin to bring opportunities (derived from their success) to others. Beyond the hard work required to catch up with their studies and enter university, many respondents acknowledged that navigating between social fields (family milieu and education field) required sustained efforts on their part with a sense that education providers (institutions, their staff and student communities) – and universities in particular – made little effort to be inclusive. ‘University is hard. Lecturers don't understand my English. I got Zulu and Xhosa and then English. You can hear my English is bad.’ (Thando, female, African). ‘I sound like Black people. You hear me. I practiced very hard to speak this way so I can be respected. [...] I had to learn to speak English properly, so I am respected. That's how I got into University X. Black people have to use their bodies to survive and there is no shame in it, but it's sad.’ (Bena, gender not disclosed, African).

Notwithstanding this, several current students in this configuration reported they had joined a support group for abuse survivors. They noted the importance of peer-to-peer support and solidarity in their educational and personal trajectories. Whilst respondents in the other two

configurations identified had access to pre-existing support networks, participants in this configuration had to initiate and build their own support networks. Despite the personal toll and sense of inadequacy experienced by respondents in this configuration (all Black Africans) when accessing and succeeding in HE and, despite some denouncing its colonial/apartheid legacies, many were accepting of its exclusionary practices, with some regarding mastery of these codes and practices as a sign of success. 'She (daughter) writes like British white people. Her English is too good! I am so proud of her'. (Minnie, female, African).

In the third configuration identified, the family milieu and education field co-exist in parallel (with no interactions between the two) in individuals' social worlds. In this configuration, individuals navigating between these two realms of experience find each of them hostile and unwelcoming – albeit in different ways. For individuals in this configuration, their family milieu is hostile, violent, and abusive; it inflicts trauma on them and surviving it is the focus of their efforts and consumes their energies. Most respondents navigating this configuration experience rejection from their family milieu and become displaced from their family of origin, which, despite the upheaval this causes, often resulted in providing them with renewed opportunities to engage with education. Away from their family milieu, sites and relations of trauma, individuals encountered fellow individuals who in a personal and/or professional capacity, empowered them to pursue their education trajectory. Education was often perceived as a radical alternative, a refuge from the family milieu, and a path to a better life away from the family of origin and neighbourhood. However, accounts of lived experiences of HE from individuals in this configuration suggest they experience high levels of symbolic violence (Bourdieu, 1979) in the education fields, where they are left to feel inadequate, with their traumas silenced and invisibilised. In this particular configuration, family milieu and education fields reject each other (reject each other's logics, norms, and

values), with individuals navigating between experiencing rejection on both sides. Black/racialised women were over-represented in this configuration in which only a few individuals seem to break away from the gendered cycle of delegitimisation and misrecognition black women experience in the post-apartheid neoliberalised South African society. Furthering Bhabha's and Decoteau's (2013) work, it is essential to note here that for individuals stuck in this configuration, many of whom are racialised women, the third space produced is not as generative as through their position in post-apartheid society, their contribution/presence/role are delegitimised and devalued. For these women, the third space that is borne out of the dislocation from both home and education fields is a space of desolation and disconnection.

<b>Configuration 1: Alignment</b>	
<b>Key manifestations</b>	Alignment between family milieu and education field in terms of values, practices, individual, family, and sectoral/institutional habituses. Family milieu and education field make complementary demands on individuals.
<b>Interplay of family milieu and HE.</b>	Access to at least two forms of capitals (economic, social, cultural, or symbolic) supporting educational success. Individuals' material needs are met. Individuals also benefit from emotional and/or academic support from family/carer during their educational journey.  Family/carer is likely to have some experience of HE, recognises the value of university education as well as the material and time investment it requires. Obtaining a university degree is regarded as a legitimate goal.  Transition to HE is experienced is mostly seamless. Success is presumed. Individuals' habitus is reinforced by their university experience.
<b>Social characteristics of individuals</b>	White respondents are over-represented in this configuration.  Individuals brought up in households in the 'affluent middle-class' or 'stable middle-class'.
<b>Configuration 2: Fraught (mis)alignment</b>	
<b>Key manifestations</b>	Fraught (mis)alignment between family milieu and education fields which make competing demands on individuals.
<b>Interplay of family milieu and HE.</b>	Limited access to forms of capitals (economic, social, cultural, or symbolic) supporting educational success.  The family milieu has limited experience of HE however values university education, often regarding it as one of the enablers of social mobility. <sup>4</sup>  Typically, family/ carer provides emotional support, but ever-present material struggles lead elder girls to take on reproductive labour for the household (depleting them of the energy and time required to engage with their studies).  Transition to HE is marked by material, social and cultural challenges leading to a cleft habitus/ a habitus in flux through which individuals oscillate between feeling out of place and glimpses of belonging in HE.
<b>Social characteristics of individuals</b>	Most individuals describe themselves as either Black African or 'coloured'.  Fraught (mis)alignment entrenches gendered inequalities with elder girls performing reproductive labour/care work for the households.  Most households among the 'vulnerable middle-class' or the 'transient poor'.
<b>Configuration 3: Parallel fields</b>	
<b>Key manifestations</b>	Family milieu and education field co-exist in parallel and make incompatible demands on individuals.
<b>Interplay of family milieu and HE.</b>	Family milieu is adverse, individuals endure persistent hardship, harm, and trauma; they lack sense of connection, safety and belonging.  Family members/carers have no experience of HE, typically assuming it is not open to them/for them and would not be beneficial to them.  Connection with HE and support to pursue education comes from outside the household, with mentors (often teachers and/or neighbours) offering moral and practical support to apply for university studies.  Transition to HE is marked by material, social, cultural, and economic challenges. The sense of displacement experienced in the family milieu also characterises individuals' experiences of HE in which their trauma is often invisibilised.  Connections can be hard to establish with staff and peers. Loneliness and exhaustion feature heavily in their experiences of HE.
<b>Social characteristics of individuals</b>	Most identify as Black and female.  Individuals grew up in 'chronically poor' households. High prevalence of abuse, neglect, and trauma.

Table 2: Configurations of family milieu and Higher Education field in South Africa

## Conclusion

This article casts light on the critical yet understudied interplay between family milieu and HE in the educational trajectories of individuals brought up in single-headed households in SA, many of whom are marginalised based on their race and gender. Using a Bourdieusian

framework, authors identify three key configurations between family and HE fields (aligned, fraught (mis)aligned and parallel fields), which have a long-lasting impact on individual educational trajectories and contribute to the intergenerational reproduction of inequalities in post-apartheid South African society. From a theoretical perspective, the first two configurations support an orthodox Bourdieusian approach to considering alignment and misalignment between habitus and field for the dominant and dominated fractions of society. In the aligned configuration, we see how white privilege is seamlessly supported to reproduce in the field of education, a field that has itself been structured through historical white dominance. In the fraught (mis)aligned configuration, we see tensions between positive orientations towards education and experiences of economic and cultural misalignment with the field of higher education. This is commensurate with Bourdieusian analyses of higher education inequalities in other contexts which show tensions and struggles for those from dominated groups (e.g. Bathmaker et al 2016). Our third configuration offers a departure from conventional Bourdieusian analysis of field alignment/misalignment to show a dislocation from both fields for actors who have been traumatised in each. Bhabha's concept of third space is useful here but again we depart from the conceptualisation of the third space as something that is generative (see Abrahams and Ingram 2013 for a discussion of Bourdieu's fields and Bhabha's third space as generative). Instead, we show the third space to be a place of desolation and disconnection. Without an orientation to be anchored in either field the women in this study are cast into void like space. Here, the concept of field is useful for thinking about the significance of safe field anchor points of connection.

These configurations highlight the complexity of the interplay between family milieu and HE and how, in some instances, family and HE fields can be competing fields, making incompatible demands on individuals, with Black women remaining disproportionately

disadvantaged (and their struggles often invisibilised) in the post-apartheid neoliberal university (and beyond). Whilst changes are slowly taking place, success stories for Black African women in HE remains individualised and anecdotal, with the heroisation of those who succeed. Their achievements are heralded as examples of a changing structure whilst they promote a neoliberal narrative of the need for individual resilience. This turns the focus away from the need for costly state-level intervention and policy changes.

Thirty years after the abolition of apartheid and the apparent success of the so-called democratisation of HE in SA, these findings have important implications for widening participation initiatives, which have yielded mixed results. Usher and Burroughs' (2018) report on targeted free tuition professes that countries such as SA may have chosen the best route to increasing the participation of the lowest-income households in HE. However, our research has shown that many factors beyond finances mean people from the lowest quartiles of income struggle to succeed and feel a sense of belonging when they get to university. The idea of widening access is to be welcomed; however, access does not equal successful participation, and further work is needed within the sector to understand and support the needs of different students when they make it to university. This study has exposed some of the socio-economic and emotional challenges experienced by Black female students, both in their journey to and through university. Our data highlights the past and present traumas that some students carry whilst engaging in education and exposes the lack of institutional support beyond access.

Primarily focusing on financial subsidies and using personal characteristics, widening participation initiatives (shaped by neoliberal individualistic values and problematic conceptions of social mobility) have overlooked – and to an extent invisibilised – the role

family milieu plays in individuals' HE trajectories. This article demonstrates the need for HE policy at state and institutional levels to be cognisant of the family field/structures in the space of widening participation in the post-colonial world. This article argues for the consideration of the family field/family structures in widening participation as a key site of intersectional inequalities and social reproduction. Deconstructing the neoliberal discourse of individual resilience to reveal the structural impact of transgenerational social reproduction in post-colonial societies is a necessary step to design policies able to deliver social justice. We argue that in addition to critical financial subsidies, widening participation policies ought to consider qualitative/lived experiences of individuals by considering intergenerational contexts (as well as individual characteristics) on learners' terms, so they are supported to exert their agency in carving out their own trajectory and success. In other words, on the basis of this research, we advocate for a qualitative and participatory turn in widening participation initiatives in which students and HEIs co-produce support interventions beyond access.

### **Ethics statement**

The research project on which this article is based received ethical approval from Institution X, Institution Y, and Institution Z. All data have been anonymised.

## References

- Abrahams J, and Ingram N (2013) The chameleon habitus: Exploring local students' negotiations of multiple fields. *Sociological Research Online* 18(4):213-226.
- Ahiaku P, and Ajani OA (2022) Single parenting in South African context: causes and effects on child welfare and development. *e-BANGI*,19(4):171-183.
- Al-Khalili RK and Baker RA (2021) "Hybrids" in the "Third Space": A Post-Colonial Reading of Anthony Burgess's "The Right to an Answer". *The International Journal of Literary Humanities* 19(2): 29.
- Badat, S., & Sayed, Y. (2014). Post-1994 South African education: The challenge of social justice. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 652(1), 127-148
- Barnard H (2018) *The wellbeing of families in a South African resource-constrained community*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University of Pretoria, Pretoria.
- Bhandari NB (2022) Homi K. Bhabha's Third Space Theory and Cultural Identity Today: A Critical Review. *Prithvi Academic Journal*, 171-181.
- Botsis, H. (2017). *Subjectivity, language and the postcolonial: Beyond Bourdieu in South Africa*. Routledge
- Boughey, C., & McKenna, S. (2021). *Understanding higher education: Alternative perspectives* (p. 172). African Minds.
- Bourdieu P (1979) Symbolic power. *Critique of Anthropology* 4(13-14):77-85.
- Bourdieu P (1999) The contradictions of inheritance. In: Bourdieu P et al. (eds.) *Weight of the World: Social Suffering in Contemporary Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 517–551.
- Bourdieu P, and Passeron JC (1964) *Heirs: Students and Culture*. Paris, France: Les Editions de Minuit.



Bourdieu P, and Passeron JC (1970) *Reproduction: Elements for a theory of the educational system*. Paris, France: Les Editions de Minuit.

Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment Act 53 (2003). Available at:  
<https://www.thedtic.gov.za/financial-and-non-financial-support/b-bbee/broad-based-black-economic-empowerment/>

Bukodi E (2019) Britain's social mobility problem has been misunderstood – education is not the great leveller. *The Conversation*, 8 January. Available at: <https://theconversation.com/britains-social-mobility-problem-has-been-misunderstood-education-is-not-the-great-leveller-109125>

Calitz, T. M. (2018). *Enhancing the freedom to flourish in higher education: Participation, equality and capabilities*. Routledge.

Case, J.M., Marshall, D., McKenna, S. & Mogashana, D. (2017). *Going to University: The Influence of Higher Education on the Lives of Young South Africans*. Cape Town: African Minds

Champagne P, and Christin O (2004) *Pierre Bourdieu : Mouvements d'une pensée*. Paris: Bordas.

Cloete, N., & Maassen, P. (2015). Roles of universities and the African context. *Knowledge production and contradictory functions in African higher education*, 1-17.

Corcuff P (2007) *The New Sociologies* (2<sup>nd</sup> recast edition). Paris: Armand Colin.

Cowling N (2023) Distribution of female-headed households in South Africa 2022, by province. *Statista*, 15 September. Available at: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/1114301/distribution-of-female-headed-households-in-south-africa-by-province/>

Creswell, J. W., 2013. *Qualitative inquiry and research design, choosing among five approaches*. 3rd edition. London: Sage Publications.

Dawood Q, and Seedat-Khan M (2023) The unforgiving work environment of black African women domestic workers in a post-apartheid South Africa. *Development in Practice* 33(2):68-179.

Decoteau CL (2013) Hybrid habitus: toward a post-colonial theory of practice. *Post-colonial Sociology* 24: 263-293.

De Lange M, Dronkers, and Wolbers MH (2014) Single-parent family forms and children's educational performance in a comparative perspective: Effects of school's share of single-parent families. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement* 25(3): 329-350.

Department of Education (DoE). (1997) Education White Paper 3. Available at:

<https://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=jc97Bom2utk%3d&tabid=191&portalid=0&mid=484>

Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) (2024). 2000 to 2021 First time entering undergraduate cohort studies for public higher education institutions. Available at:

<https://www.dhet.gov.za/HEMIS/2000%20TO%202021%20FIRST%20TIME%20ENTERING%20UNDERGRADUATE%20COHORT%20STUDIES%20FOR%20PUBLIC%20HEIs.pdf>

Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) (2021) Statistics on Post-School Education and Training in South Africa: 2019. Available at:

<https://www.dhet.gov.za/DHET%20Statistics%20Publication/Statistics%20on%20Post-School%20Education%20and%20Training%20in%20South%20Africa%202019.pdf>

Earthy, S., & Cronin, A. (2008). Narrative analysis. *Researching social life*, 3, 420-439.

Gore, O.T. (2021) 'Gender Inequality and Intersectional Disadvantage among Students in South African Universities', *African Journal of Gender, Society and Development*, 10(1), 147+, available: <http://dx.doi.org.mmu.idm.oclc.org/10.31920/2634-3622/2021/v10n1a7> [accessed 07 Dec 2024].

Hendricks C (2018) Decolonising Universities in South Africa: Rigged Spaces? *International Journal of African Renaissance Studies-Multi, Inter-and Transdisciplinarity* 13(1):16-38.

Heyes, K., Brahic, B., Ramnund-Mansingh, A., Ingram, N., Arun, S., and Seedat-Khan, M. (2023). "I Cannot Fall Pregnant!": Unequal Bodies in South African Higher Education. *Girlhood Studies*, 16 (1). pp. 71-86. ISSN 1938-8209.

Higher Education News South Africa (2024) SA continues to struggle with university dropout rates.

BizCommunity, 8 May. Available at: <https://www.bizcommunity.com/article/sa-continues-to-struggle-with-university-dropout-rates-451059a>

Ingram N, and Gamsu S (2022) Talking the talk of social mobility: The political performance of a misguided agenda. *Sociological Research Online* 27(1):189-206.

Jenkins, R. (2013) *Pierre Bourdieu*. United Kingdom: Routledge.

Khampepe, S (2022) Commission of Inquiry into allegations of racism at Stellenbosch University final report. Available at: [Microsoft Word - Final Report.docx \(sun.ac.za\)](#)

Khuluvhe M, and Ganyaupfu EM (2022) Highest Level of Educational Attainment in South Africa.

Pretoria: Department of Higher Education and Training. Available at:

[https://www.dhet.gov.za/Planning%20Monitoring%20and%20Evaluation%20Coordination/Fact%20Sheet\\_Highest%20Level%20of%20Educational%20Attainment%20in%20South%20Africa%20-%20June%202022.pdf](https://www.dhet.gov.za/Planning%20Monitoring%20and%20Evaluation%20Coordination/Fact%20Sheet_Highest%20Level%20of%20Educational%20Attainment%20in%20South%20Africa%20-%20June%202022.pdf)

Lewin, K. (2007). The limits to growth of non-government private schooling in sub-Saharan Africa (pp. 67-87). Research Monograph No. 5. Brighton: Consortium for Research on Educational Access, Transitions and Equity.

LaFramboise N (2019) Single motherhood in South Africa. *Borgen Project*, 6 September. Available at: <https://borgenproject.org/single-motherhood-in-south-africa/>

Lewin, T., & Mawoyo, M. (2014). *Student access and success: Issues and interventions in South African universities. Report published by Inyathelo: The South African Institute for Advancement, with the support of The Kresge Foundation.*

<https://kresge.org/sites/default/files/Issues%20and%20Interventions%20in%20South%20African%20Universities.pdf>

Morley L (2012) Researching absences and silences in HE: Data for democratisation. *Higher Education Research and Development* 31(3):353-368.

Mseleku, Z. (2022). Beyond hard barriers: lack of aspiration as a soft barrier to access higher education amongst youth living in low-income housing estate. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 36(6), 252-269.

Mulia DS (2017) Survival strategies of single mothers among indigenous ethnics in rural areas: Case study in Kota Belud, Sabah. *Jurnal Kinabalu* 23.

Nkosi B (2021) Only 6% of South Africans have University degrees. *Cornerstone*, 11 June. Available at: <https://cornerstone.ac.za/only-6-of-south-africans-have-university-degrees-report-says/>

NSFAS (2023) Annual Report 2021/2022

<https://www.nsfas.org.za/content/annual-reports.html>

Ntema R P (2022) Profiling students at risk of dropout at a university in South Africa. *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa* 10(2): 179-194.

Parliamentary Monitoring Group (PMG) (2024, Feb 7) NSFAS SCOPA Presentation. [https://pmg.org.za/files/240207NSFAS SCOPA Presentation 07.02.2024.pptx](https://pmg.org.za/files/240207NSFAS_SCOPA_Presentation_07.02.2024.pptx)

Pather, S., Norodien-Fataar, N., Cupido, X., & Mkonto, N. (2017). First year students' experience of access and engagement at a University of Technology. *Journal of Education (University of KwaZulu-Natal)*, (69), 161-184.

Political Analysis (2022) Percentage of single mothers in South Africa. 30 August. Available at: <https://www.politicalanalysis.co.za/percentage-of-single-mothers-in-south-africa/>

Posel, D. (2001). Race as Common Sense: Racial Classification in Twentieth-Century South Africa. *African Studies Review*, 44(2), 87–113. <https://doi.org/10.2307/525576>

South African Government (1997) Higher Education Act 101 of 1997. Available at: <https://www.gov.za/documents/higher-education-act>

Statista Research (2023) Share of student participation in South Africa 2022, by population group. 21 September. Available at: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/1115545/student-participation-rates-in-south-africa-by-population->

[group/#:~:text=The%20source%20noted%20the%20following,%2C%20and%206.5%25%20were%20colored](#)

Statistics South Africa (2024), Census dissemination. Available at: [Statistics South Africa |](#)

[Census Dissemination](#) Statistics South Africa (2014) StatsSA General Household Survey

2013. Available at: <https://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0318/P03182013.pdf>

Statistics South Africa (2018) Mbalo Brief: the missing piece of the puzzle. Pretoria. Available at:

<http://www.statssa.gov.za/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/Mbalo-Brief-June-2018-web-edition.pdf>

Swartz, S., Mahali, A., Moletsane, R., Arogundade, E., Khalema, NE., Cooper, A & Groenwald, C (2018) Studying while black – race, education and emancipation in South African Universities. HSRC Press

Usher, A., Burroughs, R. (2018). Targeted Free Tuition: A Global Analysis. Toronto: Higher Education Strategy Associates

Vally, S. (2007). From people's education to neo-liberalism in South Africa. Review of African Political Economy, 34(111), 39-56.

Walker, M., McLean, M., Mathebula, M. and Mukwambo, P. (2022). Low-income students, human development and higher education in South Africa: Opportunities, obstacles and outcomes by Cape Town, South Africa: African Minds.

Wangenge-Ouma G (2013) Widening participation in South African higher education. *Bristol: Higher Education Funding Council for England*.